



# Evaluation Report

## Consulting Services:

### Final Evaluation

## “Enhancing the Capacities of the Palestinian Authority in Mainstreaming Environment and Climate Change” Project

*Submitted by:*



**GENERAL**  
Consulting & Training  
جنرال للاستشارات و التدريب

April 30<sup>th</sup>, 2017

## **Project Information Sheet**

### **Project Name:**

Enhancing the Capacities of the Palestinian Authority in Mainstreaming Environment and Climate Change

### **Implemented by:**

UNDP/PAPP

### **Project counterpart:**

Environment Quality Authority

### **In collaboration with:**

Ministry of Agriculture

Ministry of Transport

Palestinian Environment and Natural Resources Authority

Palestinian Water Authority

National NGOs

### **Funded by:**

Government of the Kingdom Belgium

### **Project implementation period:**

May 2013 – April 2017 (4 years)

### **Evaluation period:**

March - April 2017

### **Evaluators:**

Giacomo Morelli – International Expert / Team Leader

Samhan Samhan – National Expert

## Table of Contents

List of abbreviations.....	4
Executive summary.....	5
Brief project overview .....	7
Project background.....	7
Project objectives.....	7
Outputs and activities .....	8
Evaluation Methodology, Focus and Limitations .....	8
Evaluation findings.....	9
Relevance .....	9
Effectiveness .....	11
Efficiency .....	16
Impact.....	17
Sustainability.....	19
Conclusions and recommendations .....	20
Conclusions .....	20
Recommendations .....	22
Annex 1 - ToRs of the evaluation as per the Inception Report .....	24
Annex 2 - Work plan of the evaluation mission in Palestine.....	28
Annex 3 - List of the documents, reports & websites consulted .....	30

## List of abbreviations

---

ARIJ	The Applied Research Institute - Jerusalem
CBO	Community Based Organization
CTCN	Climate Technology Centre and Network
EIB	European Investment Bank
GCT	General Consulting and Training
GEF/SGP	Global Environment Facility / Small Grant Programme
GHGI	Green House Gases Inventory
INCR	Initial National Communication Report
IPCC	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
IUCN	International Union for Conservation of Nature
MENA	Middle East and North Africa
MoA	Ministry of Agriculture
MoFA	Ministry of Foreign Affairs
MoT	Ministry of Transportation
NAMA	Nationally Appropriate Mitigation Actions
NAP	National Adaptation Plan
NCCC	National Committee on Climate Change
NDA	National Designated Authority
NDE	National Designated Entity
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NIFCC	National Institutional Framework for Climate Change
PAPP	Programme of Assistance to the Palestinian People
PA	Palestinian Authority
PENRA	Palestinian Energy and Natural Resources Authority
PIBS	Palestine Institute of Biodiversity and Sustainability (PIBS) of Bethlehem University
PTSC	Project Technical Steering Committee
SGP	Small Grant Programme
ToR	Term of Reference
TWG	Thematic Working Group
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNFCCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
UNOPS	United Nations Office for Project Services
UNSCO	Office of the United Nations Special Coordinator for the Middle East Peace Process
V&A	Vulnerability Assessment and Adaptation Plan

## Executive summary

The purpose of the evaluation is to assess the performance of the project and to measure to what extent the objective/outputs/activities have been achieved against the results and resources framework, and identify factors that have hindered or facilitated the implementation and success of the project. It aims at critically reviewing the stages of the project implementation and its products through the application of a participatory approach.

The evaluation exercise answered five main evaluation questions: relevance; effectiveness; efficiency; impact; and sustainability.

Interviews; focus group discussions; site visits to pilot projects; review of relevant national publications and policies; review of relevant project documents/reports; and consultation of relevant websites were the tools utilized to gather the necessary data and information for the evaluation exercise.

The evaluation exercise was divided into three phases: inception phase (from 27/03 to 02/04/2017); data collection phase (from 04/04 to 13/04/2017) and synthesis and dissemination phase (from 14/04 to 30/04/2017).

The project design includes features related to: capacity building; provision of expert advice; support to implementation; and facilitation of experience/expertise exchange between different stakeholders. These features are typical of technical cooperation support projects and aim at improving the quality of aid effectiveness in the long term.

The project design is characterized by a realistic strategy: the outputs are linked to the achievement of the project outcomes, and activities are logically sequenced to achieve the outputs.

The formulation of the INCR and the NAP (output 1), and the capacity building component (outputs 1 and 2) are crucial for the Palestinian Government as prerequisites to mainstream climate change at institutional level and implement the different sectorial strategies. Outputs 3 and 4 are to be considered as elements which reinforce the overall capacity building effort put in place by the project.

The project acquired a higher level of relevance when Palestine officially became a State Party to UNFCCC on 17<sup>th</sup> March 2016, as well as a State Party to Paris Agreement on Climate Change later. It is furthermore aligned with five national strategies, with the UNDP global strategy and with the SDG 13 “Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts” in addition to other SDGs of relevance.

The four project outputs were successfully achieved in the course of the project implementation.

The achievement of outputs 1 and 2 also contributed to the achievement of all five objectives of the project. As a matter of fact, the activities were implemented and the deliverables of output 1 (INCR and NAP) and output 2 were achieved through a consultative approach that had a significant capacity building dimension and mainstreamed climate change adaptation and mitigation measures into national policies. Outputs 3 and 4 were achieved and contributed respectively to the achievement of objectives 4 and 5 of the project.

The project achieved its expected outputs within the established budget, which proved to be reasonable and realistic for the completion of activities.

The duration of the implementation, initially planned for 30 months, was extended to 48 months through no-cost extensions. This occurrence, however, did not constitute an obstacle to the successful implementation of the project.

The approach adopted during the implementation allowed for a continuous monitoring on the job for all stakeholders involved.

Consultants worked closely with many stakeholders, and the different timelines consultants had to respect represented the natural milestones to assess the implementation status of the project. The same approach allowed a sort of continuous learning by doing: consultants worked closely with many stakeholders and different perspectives could be included in all assessments and documents produced throughout the project.

The project contributed to the achievement of its five stated objectives.

The project had further significant impacts, which were not foreseen as objectives. Amongst others, it created the momentum and background to support the political decision for Palestine to become a State Party to UNFCCC and to sign and ratify Paris Agreement on Climate Change.

EQA was positioned as the leading organization for climate change issues and climate change is now well mainstreamed. An example is the fact that a coalition against climate change, formed by 15 Palestinian NGOs, was represented in the Palestinian Delegation at the COP 21 and a national workshop of Youth against Climate Change was held in Ramallah in November 2016.

It is undoubtedly that the project created a national momentum around the topic of climate change.

The formulation of the INCR and the NAP represents *per se* an element of sustainability, as they represent the groundwork for the actual implementation of climate change adaptation and mitigation measures. The two reports are the prerequisite for Palestine to access climate change related funds available at global level, especially those related to UNFCCC and GCF.

The evaluation exercise identified five main elements of sustainability: strong political support of the Palestinian government, stakeholder active participation, recognition of climate change importance, and participation of national NGOs and CBOs and international organizations.

The project undoubtedly produced sustainable outcomes; climate change is now part of the Palestinian development plan represented by National Policy Agenda (2017-2022). In May 2017 the First International Conference on Climate Change – Palestine, organized by Palestinian Engineers Association will be held in Al-Bireh with participants from 15 countries.

No major recommendations are drawn from the evaluation exercise as the project resulted to be successful. The evaluation exercise highlights the importance of UNDP/PAPP, EQA and other Palestinian ministries to continue to work on climate change related issues as the project outputs represent the groundwork for the actual implementation of climate change adaptation and mitigation measures in Palestine. Furthermore, abilities to access available climate change financing mechanisms are not yet fully developed.

A dedicated session of the PTSC to evaluate in detail the achievements of the four pilot projects implemented by Palestinian institutions and the six GEF/SGP implemented by NGOs/CBOs is recommended. It may provide practical insights for fine-tuning the institutional perspective captured by the INCR, the NAP and the Capacity Development Program Report, and moving ahead with their actual implementation - the work and challenge of Palestinian institutions in relation to climate change in the next future.

## Brief project overview

### Project background

Palestine is negatively impacted by climate change: annual rainfall is expected to decline about 10% by 2020 and 20% by 2050, while temperature increase is expected to range between 2.2 and 5.1 °C according to the “Climate Change Adaptation Strategy and Programme of Action for the Palestinian Authority” (UNDP/PAPP, 2010).

Climate change may lead to an increase in the frequency of natural disasters, resulting e.g. in extreme climate events including drought spells, storms, floods, sea level rise, and heat waves. These effects, along with the limitations imposed by the Israeli occupation to the Palestinian sovereignty over its own natural resources, exacerbate the problem of water availability and desertification, which ultimately compromise local agricultural production and endanger water and food security of the Palestinian population residing in the West Bank including East Jerusalem and Gaza Strip.

Furthermore, these impacts may have socioeconomic implications in terms of increased poverty and social instability leading to internal dislocation and migration to the urban areas and internal disputes on the use of the very limited natural resources.

Against this background, the United Nations Development Programme – Programme of Assistance to the Palestinian People (UNDP/PAPP) with funds from the Government of the Kingdom of Belgium and in cooperation with the Environment Quality Authority (EQA) implemented a project focusing on enhancing the capacity of Palestinian institutions in mainstreaming environment and climate change into national plans and strategies from May 2013 to April 2017.

The project aimed at enhancing capacities of the Palestinian government to mainstream and address the challenges of climate change into the government policy framework and plans.

It also intended to support the implementation of pilot projects on climate change adaptation and mitigation, and was designed to improve the Palestinian government capacities to access environmental multilateral financing resources and support its engagement with the three Rio Conventions, in particular with the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC).

### Project objectives

The project had five objectives:

1. To support PA, especially EQA and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MoFA) to engage in the International Environmental Conventions, including Rio Conventions, especially UNFCCC, in preparation for the state building;
2. To mainstream climate change into national plans and strategies as integral component for sustainable development and green economy;
3. To assess and strengthen the capacities of the related PA ministries and authorities in climate change mainstreaming, adaptation and mitigation according to the priorities identified;
4. To implement selected Pilot projects from the Palestinian Adaptation Program of Action (PAPA) in the most affected areas in Palestine including water resources and food security, efficient and sustainable use of energy and sea level rise;
5. To enable the PA to access environmental financing with focus on the GEF/SGP.

## Outputs and activities

### **Output 1: National Communication Report on climate change for oPt is developed**

#### **Activities**

- Prepare the Communication Report Management Plan and National endorsement;
- Recruit a consultant(s) to carry out documentation of national circumstances in reference to climate change in the oPt;
- Strengthen and enhance capacities and capabilities of the Thematic Working Groups (TWGs) through conducting a training workshop on the use of Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) technical guidelines;
- Conduct Vulnerability and Adaptation (V&A) to climate change assessment;
- Prepare National Greenhouse Gas Inventory (GHGI);
- Assess measures to mitigate the climate change;
- Organize four workshops to present and discuss the results obtained from V&A, GHGI, education /CD and draft national communication report;
- Preparation and submission of an Initial National Communication Report (INCR).

### **Output 2: Capacities of related PA institutions to mainstream climate change are assessed and enhanced**

#### **Activities**

- Existing policies assessed;
- Capacities for PA institutions developed and climate change adaptation policy framework for related sectors endorsed and adopted.

### **Output 3: Selected pilot projects in climate change mitigation/adaptation are implemented**

#### **Activities**

- Pilot projects implemented.

### **Output 4: PA Access to GEF/SGP financing is maintained and selected pilot projects are implemented through the GEF/SGP Modality**

#### **Activities**

- Use GEF/SGP modalities to identify, pilot and upscale innovative projects;
- Capacity Development for NGOs and CBOs activities.

## **Evaluation Methodology, Focus and Limitations**

The evaluation, carried out with a participatory methodology, represents a synthesis of facts, opinions and points of view collected by the evaluators. It draws its findings through the triangulation of the information obtained from the different information sources, which also represent the means of verification.

The evaluation took place in March and April 2017.



The evaluators of General Consulting and Training (GCT) used the following tools to gather the necessary data and information presented in this report:

- 29 Interviews;
- 3 Focus group discussions;
- 2 Site visits (selected pilot projects);
- Review of relevant national publications and policies;
- Review of relevant project documents/reports; and
- Consultation of relevant websites.

The evaluation recognizes that the project was largely about policy support and capacity development. Project beneficiaries (mainly government officers) were involved in the evaluation process and the use of the acquired knowledge was clarified, notably as the process of transferring the new capacities at institutional level to benefit broader purposes of engaging in the international environmental conventions.

The evaluation exercise was divided into three phases:

#### **Inception phase (from 27/03 to 02/04/2017)**

The evaluation exercise was led by the GCT International Team Leader with the support of the GCT National Expert and the institutional coordination of UNDP/PAPP. An inception report was delivered by GCT to UNDP/PAPP including the agreed evaluation methodology and a work plan for the mission to Palestine.

#### **Data collection phase (from 04/04 to 13/04/2017)**

During the mission to Palestine, the GCT International Team Leader and the GCT National Expert met the main stakeholders who took part in project activities. At the end of the mission, a de-briefing session was held with UNDP/PAPP and EQA officers.

The mission took only place in the West Bank, stakeholders from the Gaza Strip were interviewed remotely from West Bank.

The evaluators had the opportunity to visit two sites where pilot and GEF/SGP projects have been implemented. Further site visits were not possible due to time constraints.

The detailed work plan of the evaluation mission in Palestine is added in Annex 2.

#### **Synthesis and dissemination phase (from 14/04 to 30/04/2017)**

A report summarizing the evaluation findings was formulated by the GCT International Team Leader and shared with relevant UNDP officers for their comments, which were later incorporated in the report.

The GCT International Team Leader consulted a variety of documents and reports. A full list of the documents and reports consulted is presented in Annex 3.

## **Evaluation findings**

The key findings of the evaluation relate to the four evaluation questions to which the present exercise attempted to give pertinent and reasoned answers.

### **Relevance**

The project design includes features related to:

#### **Capacity building**

Capacity building was the main focus of the project. The feature is common to all four outputs, being at the core of outputs 1 and 2.

### **Provision of expert advice**

Expert advice was needed to complement local capacities on climate change financing and to draft relevant reports, especially in regard to outputs 1 and 2.

### **Support to implementation**

The whole project design aimed at setting the basis for future implementation of climate change related policies in Palestine. In addition, the project foresaw the implementation of pilot projects of which some were directly implemented by national ministries (output 3) and others by national NGOs and CBOs through the GEF/SGP programme (output 4). All projects were in line with relevant sectorial strategies.

### **Facilitation of experience/expertise exchange between different stakeholders**

The exchange of experience/expertise between stakeholders was an essential component of the project. Without this component, the climate change mainstreaming exercise could not take place.

The four aforementioned features are typical of technical cooperation support projects and aim at improving the quality of aid effectiveness in the long term. This dimension is easily verifiable in the project design: its objectives coincide with the Palestinian government institutional needs to tackle climate change with a coherent and coordinated approach; such an approach will necessarily guide the implementation of climate change adaptation and mitigation policies in the long term.

The project design is characterized by a realistic strategy: the outputs are linked to the achievement of the project outcomes, and activities are logically sequenced to achieve the outputs. Formally, it should be noted that the formulation of objectives 4 and 5 coincide with the formulation of outputs 3 and 4. This formal imprecision of the design, however, was not significant for the overall strategies the project aimed at putting in place: objectives 1, 2 and 3 constitute undoubtedly the main goals of the intervention, being objective 4 and 5 essential steps to achieve them.

The project is aligned with five strategies at national level:

1. The “Climate Change Adaptation Strategy and Programme of Action for the Palestinian Authority” (PA and UNDP/PAPP, 2010) represented the main institutional document upon which the project was conceived and designed.
2. The project contributed to the objectives of the “Palestinian National Development Plan 2011-2013 - Establishing the State, Building the Future” related to environmental and climate change issues.
3. Three of the six strategic objectives of the “Environment Sector Strategy 2011-2013” (PA and UNDP/PAPP, 2010) were pursued within the frame of the project:
  - The State of Palestine is committed to international conventions and treaties on environment.
  - All measures required to adapt to climate change, combat desertification and confront environmental and natural disasters are taken; and
  - The institutional and legal environmental framework is strong, effective and working in an integrated and concerted manner.

4. The project is aligned with the “UNDP Development for Freedom (2012-2014) strategy” that focuses on the following results:

- Strengthen environmental governance, including preparedness for global environmental agendas;
- Promoting adaptation to climate change;
- Mobilizing environmental financing; and
- Expanding access to environmental and energy services for the poor.

5. Finally, the project is also aligned with the “GEF/SGP PAL Country Programme Strategy - 5<sup>th</sup> Operational Phase (March 2011- Feb. 2014)”.

The intervention is as well ascribable to two main areas of intervention of UNDP at global level, i.e. sustainable development and climate and disaster resilience.

The intervention was furthermore relevant for all the Palestinian ministries involved in its implementation: the need to mainstream climate change into the sectoral strategy of each ministry was widely recognized by all stakeholders met during the evaluation exercise. As a consequence, the ability of each institution to access climate change financing opportunities is a key factor to get the necessary resources to implement these strategies.

The capacity development and the provision of expert advice components represent the main focus of the project: the formulation of institutional publications, namely the INCR and the NAP, and the capacity building activities are extremely important as they are essential prerequisites to mainstream climate change at institutional level to implement the different national sectoral strategies. As a matter of fact, these features were deemed of importance by all the stakeholders met during the evaluation exercise.

Activities related to outputs 3 and 4 are to be considered as elements, which reinforce the overall capacity building effort put in place by the project, extending awareness about climate change to local NGOs and CBOs.

The project was also aligned with the development objectives that are pursued by other international agencies at country level: four accredited entities to the Green Climate Fund (GCF) are supporting the four project concepts developed through the support of the capacity building activities implemented in the frame of the project. These entities include: UNDP itself, the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), the International Union for the Conservation of Nature (IUCN) and the European Investment Bank (EIB). Joining the global challenge against climate change is one of the main priorities of multilateral organizations, with the Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) 13 of the 17 SDGs being “Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts” in addition to other SDGs of relevance.

Finally, it is important to highlight that the project acquired a higher level of relevance when Palestine became officially a State Party to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) on March 17<sup>th</sup>, 2016.

## Effectiveness

### **Output 1: Initial National Communication Report (INCR) on climate change for Palestine is prepared**

- The INCR, was prepared and submitted to the secretariat of United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) on 11/11/2016, during COP22 in Marrakesh, including the Green House Gases Inventory (GHGI) and the vulnerability assessment and the adaptation plan (V&A) and the National Adaptation Plan (NAP).

- 15 training workshops on GHGs and V&A were conducted involving professionals belonging to different organizations, i.e. governmental institutions, NGOs, research centres and universities. The National Committee for Climate Change and its members were deeply involved and active in the whole process.
- A national workshop was organized on 09/11/2015 to present the final results of the GHGI and mitigation chapters of the INCR.
- A national workshop to disseminate the V&A results and NAP was organized on 05/04/2016.

Output 1 was achieved.

This achievement contributed fully to the achievement of objective 1 of the project “to support the Palestinian Authority preparedness, especially EQA, and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs to engage in the International Environmental Conventions, including UNFCCC and Rio Conventions in preparation for the state building”.

The submission of the INCR and NAP represented a first important formal step of the engagement of the Palestinian government in the UNFCCC. Building on the contents of INCR and NAP, the Nationally Determined Contributions (NDC) Report was prepared and, at the time of the evaluation exercise, is in the process of getting the final approval by the government.

Activities related to output 1 were conducted in a participatory approach with the support of local and international consultants coordinated by an ad-hoc recruited UNDP coordinator and EQA project focal point, being the overall internal communication managed as follows:

- Project leadership: EQA Project Focal Point, local consultant (employed by Ricardo AEA Ltd) and UNDP project manager.
- Implementation and data collection team: local consultants (belonging respectively to Birzeit University in West Bank and to the Islamic University of Gaza in Gaza Strip) employed by Ricardo AEA Ltd), PCBS, EQA, ad-hoc recruited UNDP coordinator and the international consultants (Ricardo AEA Ltd).
- Stakeholders: national ministries and authorities, PCBS, NGOs and others.

The achievement of output 1 also contributed to the achievement of the other four objectives of the project. As a matter of fact, the activities were implemented and the deliverables of output 1 were achieved through a consultative approach that had a significant capacity building dimension and supported the mainstreaming of climate change into national plans and strategies.

## **Output 2: Capacities of related PA institutions to mainstream CC is assessed and enhanced**

- Seven national capacity development workshops were conducted;
- The “Capacity Assessment Report - Assessment of National Capacities for Implementing Adaptation and Mitigation Measures and Developing Needs for Capacity Development of Palestinian Authority Institutions regarding Climate Change Adaptation and Mitigation” was conducted and completed;
- The “Capacity Development Program Report - Assessment of National Capacities for Implementing Adaptation and Mitigation Measures and Developing Needs for Capacity Development of Palestinian Authority Institutions regarding Climate Change Adaptation and Mitigation” was prepared; and

- A National Committee on Climate Change headed by the Head of EQA, established in 2010, was extended from 21 to 27 members in 2017.

Furthermore, the first year of the action plan with highest priority interventions (phase I) was implemented: a multi-level model for climate change governance, i.e. National Institutional Framework for Climate Change (NIFCC), and a legislative amendment to the national environmental law was proposed aiming at creating a legally enabling environment to mainstreaming climate change related matters at the national level. In addition, a draft climate change financing report, to establish a climate finance readiness and steps to implement the UNFCCC, was prepared.

Moreover, five ministries and authorities (EQA, MoA, MoT, PWA, and PENRA) have drafted five concept papers for submission to the GCF in partnership with accredited GCF entities, being EQA the National Designated Authority (NDA) to GCF:

1. **Title:** “Increasing climate resilience of Palestinian smallholder farmers’ livelihoods”  
**Budget:** 20 million USD  
**Accredited entity:** FAO  
**Executing entities:** MoA, EQA, MoT (Meteorological Department)  
**NDA:** EQA  
**Climate impacts:** reduced greenhouse gas emissions; and increased resilience of Palestinian farmers.
2. **Title:** “Old refrigerators replacement as a tool for poverty and toxic emission reduction”  
**Budget:** 12 million USD  
**Accredited entity:** UNDP  
**Executing entities:** PENRA  
**NDA:** EQA  
**Climate impacts:** reduced greenhouse gas emission.
3. **Title:** “Developing climate change resilient communities, terrestrial ecosystems and habitat connectivity in the state of Palestine”  
**Budget:** 10-50 million USD  
**Accredited entity:** International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN)  
**Executing entities:** EQA, the Applied Research Institute - Jerusalem (ARIJ), Palestine Institute of Biodiversity and Sustainability (PIBS) of Bethlehem University  
**NDA:** EQA  
**Climate impacts:** reduced greenhouse gas emissions; and increased resilience of Palestinian communities.
4. **Title:** “Construction of the Al Salameyeh public transport terminal, Al-Bireh City, Palestine”  
**Budget:** 11 million USD  
**Accredited entity:** UNDP  
**Executing entities:** MoT, EQA, Al-Bireh Municipality or Joint Cooperation Unit of the Cities of Ramallah, Al-Bireh, and Beitunia  
**NDA:** EQA  
**Climate impacts:** reduced greenhouse gas emission.
5. **Title:** “Gaza central desalination plant and its associated works”  
**Budget:** 607 million USD  
**Accredited entity:** European Investment Bank (EIB)  
**Executing entities:** PWA, PENRA, EQA, Union for the Mediterranean, Office of the Quartet, World Bank, Office of the United Nations Special Coordinator for the Middle East Peace Process (UNSCO) and United Nations Office for Project Services (UNOPS)

**NDA: EQA**

**Climate impacts:** Reduced greenhouse gas emissions and increased resilience of Gaza Strip population.

Output 2 was achieved.

As per output 1, activities were implemented and deliverables were achieved through a consultative approach that had a significant capacity building dimension and supported the mainstreaming of climate change into national plans and strategies. As such, this achievement contributed significantly to the achievement of objective 2 “to mainstream climate change into national plans and strategies as integral component for sustainable development and green economy” and objective 3 “to assess and strengthen the capacities of the related Palestinian ministries and authorities in climate change mainstreaming, adaptation and mitigation according to the priorities identified”.

**Output 3: Selected pilot projects in climate change mitigation/adaptation are implemented**

Four pilot projects were financed through a rigorous selection process. Sixteen proposals were received in February 2016 and the PTSC selected four projects according to certain relevant criteria. The selected projects are the following:

- Title:** “Climate change adaptation through Soil Conservation and Water Harvesting within Soil Profile”  
**Budget:** 29,200 USD  
**Implementing organization:** MoA  
The project aimed at controlling soil erosion of wadis during the rainy season and at increasing water content within the soil profile in areas where rainfall is relatively low and tree cultivation may become not profitable.
- Title:** “Enhancing MoT’s capacities on testing on road vehicles’ exhaust emissions”  
**Budget:** 50,000 USD  
**Implementing organization:** MoT  
The project supported the MoT to carry out inspection of the road emission of vehicle exhausts.
- Title:** “Climate change adaptation through solar desalination in Marj Na’aja Village/Jericho”  
**Budget:** 68,700 USD  
**Implementing organization:** PENRA  
A solar system was installed in El-Uja village, as in Marj Na’aja the Israeli authorities did not allow the works as the village is located in area C. In El-Uja, the solar system operates an agricultural well allowing the cultivation of about 700 dunums of land. The solar system was installed in Al-Istiqlal University in Jericho.
- Title:** “Energy Auditing in Public Buildings in Gaza Strip”  
**Budget:** 51,300 USD  
**Implementing organization:** PENRA  
The pilot project supported the reduction of electricity consumption in 3 public buildings.

The total budget of the four pilot projects is USD 199,200.

Output 3 was achieved.

This achievement contributed fully to the achievement of the objective 4 of the project “to implement selected pilot projects from the Palestinian Adaptation Program of Action (PAPA) in the most affected areas in Palestine including water resources and food security, efficient and sustainable use of energy and sea level rise”.

#### **Output 4: PA Access to GEF financing is maintained and Selected Pilot Projects are implemented through the GEF/SGP Modality**

The project supported the implementation of six pilot projects in the area of climate change mitigation in the West Bank and Gaza Strip. The projects were implemented by local NGOs and CBOs and aimed at reducing greenhouse gas emissions through promoting the use of solar and green sources of energy. The six projects are:

1. **Title:** “Utilizing solar energy to empower vulnerable households in marginalized areas and improving their living conditions in Rawaeen community in Bethlehem governorate and Um Zaytoon in Hebron governorate”  
**Budget:** 34,830 USD  
**Implementing organization:** Hebron University
2. **Title:** “Contribute to solve the climate change problem in the area of Al-Masafer/Bani Naim in Hebron East through creating environmental and integrated ecosystems that depend on using solar energy, water harvesting and increasing the green area”  
**Value:** 35,000 USD  
**Implementing organization:** Bani Naim Charitable Society
3. **Title:** “Contribute to promote environmental awareness of rural women in the Deir Al-Balah Governorate and enable them to invest in production of alternative sources of energy from agricultural waste for the purpose of domestic use and promote income”  
**Budget:** 34,000 USD  
**Implementing organization:** Palestinian Association for Development and Reconstruction
4. **Title:** “Lighting Nuseirat Popular Market Using Alternative Energy - Solar Cells - for a Safe Environment”  
**Budget:** 50,000 USD  
**Implementing organization:** Al-Karmel Cultural & Social Development Association
5. **Title:** “Lighting El-Ashreen Street by using solar energy in Al Nuseirat”  
**Budget:** 50,000 USD  
**Implementing organization:** Al-Mustaqbal Association for Development and Environment
6. **Title:** “Towards a Sustainable and Environment Friendly Charcoal Production in Yabad Cluster”  
**Budget:** 80,000 USD  
**Implementing organization:** World Vision - JWG

The total budget of the six GEF/SGP pilot projects is USD 283,830.

43 proposals were submitted to UNDP/PAPP in response to two calls for proposals in the frame of the project, and screened by the GEF/SGP national focal group through a transparent process. Prior to the submission of the proposals, two workshops on GEF/SGP procedures open to NGOs and CBOs were conducted (one in the West Bank and one in the Gaza Strip).

Output 4 was achieved.

This achievement contributed fully to reach objective 5 of the project “To enable the PA to access environmental financing with focus on the GEF/SGP”. In fact, the project allocated USD 300,000 to GEF/SGP activities contributing to essential co-funding of the Fifth Operational Phase (March 2011 – February 2014) of the GEF/SGP PAL Country Programme Strategy. The total funding was divided as follows:

- USD 600,000 - UNDP GEF/SGP global core funds
- USD 300,000 - contribution of the project
- USD 200,000 - additional EU funds.

## Efficiency

The project achieved its expected outputs within the established budget, which proved to be reasonable and realistic for the completion of activities. Not all the budget was disbursed during the implementation, a balance of 49.282 USD remains.

The table below is the financial statement, shared by UNDP with the GCT International Team Leader. The table shows the allocated budget and disbursement per output:

	Allocated budget in USD	Disbursement in USD
Output 1	568,500	548,240
Output 2	157,704	150,000
Output 3	200,000	193,169
Output 4	300,000	285,513

The duration of the implementation, initially planned for 30 months, was extended to 48 months through a no-cost extensions requested to and approved by the donor, the Government of the Kingdom of Belgium. The extension was necessary as proved by this evaluation exercise.

The implementation of activities was well sequenced: the implementation of pilot projects by ministries and NGOs followed after a capacity building phase.

The identification of the budget and period of project implementation were difficult as the project had significant elements of novelty which could not fully be foreseen in the design phase. Climate change finance was a new topic introduced in the Palestinian development context. The adjustments to the novelty required time. Furthermore, it was decided to follow a logical and well sequenced order of activities, i.e. the implementation of pilot projects by ministries followed after a capacity building phase, and therefore more time was needed. This occurrence did not constitute an obstacle to the successful implementation of the project.

The project was implemented in a participatory way and all activities were carried out through a consultative process involving a variety of stakeholders.

The main stakeholders of the project were:

### UNDP/PAPP

UNDP/PAPP was in charge of the overall project management and procurement.

### EQA

EQA co-led the activities, being the main beneficiary of the project.

### National Committee for Climate Change (NCCC)

Almost all members of the NCCC including the 12 ministries, 4 NGOs, 3 Universities and 2 representatives of the private sector participated actively in workshops and supported the various consultants to carry out their tasks. Furthermore, MoA, PENRA, and MoT implemented pilot projects.

### Consultants

UNDP/PAPP selected international companies (Ricardo AEA Ltd, Climatekos and Triple E) who acted as consultants for outputs 1 and 2 and suggested Ricardo AEA Ltd to employ lecturers from national universities as national consultants. This choice was justified as there are no free-lance national consultants with the relevant technical background to support the international firm at country level. Building on and strengthening existing academic capacities revealed to be a strategic choice (see Impact section). Furthermore, UNDP/PAPP recruited an ad-hoc coordinator to support the drafting of the INCR.



## NGOs and CBOs

NGOs and CBOs implemented six pilot projects through the GEF/SGP programme.

The approach adopted during the implementation allowed a sort of continuous learning by doing: activities related to outputs 1 and 2 were implemented by international and national consultants belonging to international consultancy firms (Ricardo AEA Ltd, Climatekos, and Triple E). They worked closely with many stakeholders; different perspectives could be included in all assessments and documents produced throughout the project. The international consultants brought in their knowledge and expertise related to climate change adaptation and mitigation and climate change financing. The international consultants guided the work of the national consultants for the formulation of the INCR, the NAP, and the capacity assessment and capacity development programme on climate change and action plan. The national consultants belonged to national universities and were familiar with topics of climate change and environment, but had no specific knowledge on how to perform the project tasks. The interaction between the team of consultants, EQA staff, other Palestinian institutions staff and the project INCR coordinator constituted a learning by doing exercise. In fact, the various project deliverables included tasks that constituted an absolute novelty in Palestine, and for which there was specific expertise. Specific knowledge was transferred to key public officers (EQA and Palestinian universities) and, as such, constituted a main achievement in terms of capacity building of the project. A similar transfer of knowledge occurred with other ministries who participated in the process.

Activities related to output 3 were implemented by national ministries (MoA, PEnRA and MoT), activities related to output 4 by national NGOs and CBOs, who beforehand received training on climate change adaptation and mitigation. The project management ensured that projects on the ground were implemented by organizations equipped with proper capacities. The pilot projects were selected through appropriate selection procedures headed by the PTSC for output 3, and the GEF/SGP national focal group for output 4.

The PTSC did not make many decisions as the project run smoothly. Its main decision was related to the selection of the four pilot projects implemented by Palestinian governmental institutions.

The approach adopted during the implementation allowed for a continuous monitoring on the job for all stakeholders involved. Consultants worked closely with many stakeholders, different perspectives were included in all assessments and documents produced throughout the project. The different timelines consultants had to respect represented the natural milestones to assess the implementation status of the project.

The monitoring of the pilot projects was carried out by the implementing institutions and UNDP and EQA received relevant project reports. The evaluation exercise found that the monitoring mechanism of the pilot projects was appropriate.

## Impact

The project contributed to the achievement of its five stated objectives.

Objective 1 “To support PA, especially EQA and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MoFA) to engage in the International Environmental Conventions, including Rio Conventions, especially UNFCCC, in preparation for the state building” was undoubtedly achieved:

- The project created the momentum to support the political decision of Palestine to become a State party of UNFCCC (17/03/2017), and a party to Paris Agreement after signing and ratifying Paris agreement (22/04/2016). Palestine was the first country in

Middle East and North Africa (MENA) region and among the first 15 country worldwide, which signed and ratified it.

Objective 2 “to mainstream climate change into national plans and strategies as integral component for sustainable development and green economy” can be considered as substantially achieved:

- Climate change was indeed mainstreamed into national plans and strategies as integral component for sustainable development and green economy; and
- “Ensuring a Sustainable Environment and Adapting to Climate Change” is a national policy belonging to priority 10 of the National Policy Agenda (2017-2022).

Objective 3 “to assess and strengthen the capacities of the related PA ministries and authorities in climate change mainstreaming, adaptation and mitigation according to the priorities identified” was also achieved.

Objectives 4 and 5 can be regarded as achieved. However, it should be noted that the formulation of two objectives coincides with the formulation of the outputs 3 and 4 wherefore they should be considered formally as results of the project rather than as objectives (see relevance section).

The project produced other significant impacts, which were not foreseen as objectives.

- Palestine became a State Party of UNFCCC in March 2016. This is to be considered an important impact of the project having in mind that The General Assembly granted Palestine the non-member observer State status at the United Nations in November 2012. Obviously, the membership is a political decision of the PA, however, it can also be considered as an impact of the project. As aforementioned, the project created the momentum and prepared a solid technical background (namely the INCR and the NAP) to support the political decision.
- Through the project EQA was positioned as the main leading institutional organization for climate change issues. Its role is enhanced and well respected by all stakeholders met during the evaluation mission. EQA represents the national designated authority to the GCF. This means that EQA necessarily became the custodian of all information related to climate change projects which in the future may be implemented through the GCF mechanisms. The no objection procedure, which is requested by GCF, enforces such a role.
- With Palestine being a UNFCCC State Party, Palestinian institutions (MoA, PWA, PEnRA, EQA and MoT) could submit three proposals to the fourth NAMA Facility call for proposals in October 2016. None of the three proposals was funded. However, the MoA proposal received positive feedback and MoA will submit it to the next call, with appropriate modifications.
- Climate change is now well mainstreamed in Palestine, beyond the boundaries of the project: a coalition against climate change, formed by 15 Palestinian NGOs, was represented in the Palestinian Delegation at the Marrakech Climate Change Conference (November 2016).
- A National Committee on Climate Change, established in 2010 by a decision of the Cabinet, was extended from 21 to 27 members in 2017. Its members belonged to different governmental institutions (ministries and authorities), to private sector and to national universities.
- Furthermore, a national workshop of youth against climate change was held in Ramallah in November 2016 counting with more than 150 participants. It is undoubtedly that the project created a national momentum around the topic of climate change.

The project also had an impact on academic institutions in Palestine: lecturers and professors involved in the project implementation disseminated the knowledge acquired on climate change issues to their students. This is necessarily a slow on-going process, but it is undoubtedly that climate change issues are mainstreamed in and through academic institutions. This fact may constitute an important long-term impact of the project. The involvement of academics and the achievement of the related impact was possible due to the decision to hire academic lecturers as national consultants, through Ricardo-AEA Ltd, , i.e. professionals who have at the core of their job the dissemination of knowledge.

Finally, it is important to highlight that during the evaluation mission the impact of the 10 pilot projects (4 implemented by Palestinian ministries, and 6 by local NGOs/CBOs) could not be evaluated due to time constraints.

## Sustainability

The formulation of the INCR and the NAP represents *per se* an element of sustainability, as they represent the groundwork for the actual implementation of climate change adaptation and mitigation measures in Palestine in the coming years. It is the prerequisite for Palestine to access climate change related funds available at global level, especially those related to UNFCCC and GCF.

The evaluation exercise identified five main elements of sustainability:

### **The project was characterized by a strong political support of the PA**

Palestine became a State Party of UNFCCC in March 2016 and to Paris Agreement in April 2016.

### **Participation of stakeholders**

Stakeholders, namely the five Palestinian ministries and authorities EQA, PWA, MoA, PEnRA and MoT, accompanied the international and national consultants throughout all their work to produce the INCR and NAP. As a consequence, a high degree of ownership of all involved stakeholders was achieved.

### **Recognition of climate change importance**

Climate change is widely recognized as an obstacle to economic development in the oPt, and the role of EQA as leading institution is acknowledged by all stakeholders met during the evaluation exercise. In this regard, a study on the economics of climate change impacts on Palestine has been conducted in the frame of the “Clima-South Regional Project”, funded by EU, in February 2017. The study focused on three sectors selected on the basis of their importance to the Palestinian economy and their vulnerability to climate change: agriculture, water and the agri-food sector. The study aimed to:

- Conduct a qualitative assessment of the economic impacts of climate change in the State of Palestine in three inter-related sectors: agriculture, water and the agri-food sector;
- Analyse the current situation in relation to the assessment of costs and benefits of adaptation options, and identify data gaps and research needs; and
- Formulate recommendations for further research on the economic impacts of climate change in the three sectors and the assessment of adaptation costs and benefits.

### **Participation of local NGOs and CBOs**

NGOs and CBOs have good capacities at field level to implement a vast array of projects. They have the necessary experience and expertise to engage with local communities and to deliver results.

### **Involvement of international organizations**

UN agencies and other international organizations are aware of the possibilities offered by the GCF, to which they are accredited, and collaborate with the PA institutions. This collaboration represents an opportunity for the logical continuation of the groundwork done by the project.

It is important to highlight how the overall sustainability of the project is negatively impacted by the specific conditions that characterize the Palestinian context:

- Due to the Israeli occupation, the PA does not have the full control over its natural resources;
- The internal Palestinian political situation; and
- The Palestinian industry is not able to produce its own relevant green technologies and is obliged to import them from Israel. This element impacts the actual capacity of the PA to diversify its energy supply and, as a consequence, solar and biomass energy represent the only green energy alternative to fossil fuels.

The two first conditions render the implementation of policies at country level difficult, including those related to environment and climate change.

The third condition has serious implications for the development of the Palestinian economy, and therefore for its conversion to green technologies: the economy is characterized by few sources of GHGs as the development of industries is very much impeded by the Israeli occupation. The GHGs mostly derive from vehicle traffic and few industries as electricity is provided by Israel. Therefore, Palestinian efforts against climate change are oriented towards adaptation measures, being the capacity for mitigation measures relatively limited due to the political context.

The project undoubtedly produced sustainable outcomes. Climate change is now part of the Palestinian development agenda: in May 2017 the First International Conference on Climate Change – Palestine, organized by Palestinian Engineers Association, will be held in Al-Bireh with participants from 15 countries (<https://www.paleng.org/icccp>).

## **Conclusions and recommendations**

### **Conclusions**

#### **Relevance**

The project was relevant for the environmental and economic situation in Palestine and for its efforts in the preparation of state building. Climate change effects impact heavily the Palestinian population and adaptation and mitigation measures are needed.

The project design includes features related to capacity building, provision of expert advice, support to implementation, and facilitation of experience/expertise exchange between different stakeholders. These features, typical of technical cooperation support projects, aim at improving the quality of aid effectiveness in the long term.

#### **Effectiveness**

Expected outputs were substantially achieved:

- The Initial National Communication Report (INCR) on climate change for Palestine was prepared and been submitted;
- NAP was been prepared and submitted. It is among the first 7 NAPS prepared by countries who are parties to the convention;
- The capacities of relevant PA institutions to mainstream climate change were assessed and enhanced;
- Four pilot projects were implemented by PA institutions; and

Six projects were implemented by national NGOs/CBOs through GEF/SGP programme and the contribution of the project to the Fifth Operational Phase (March 2011 – February 2014) of the GEF/SGP PAL Country Programme Strategy proved to be strategic and approval of core funding for the very same phase.

The achievement of the outputs contributed to reach the main objectives of the project:

- To support the PA, especially EQA and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MoFA), to engage in the International Environmental Conventions, including Rio Conventions, especially UNFCCC, in the preparation for the state building; and
- To mainstream climate change into national plans and strategies as integral component for sustainable development and green economy.

In other words, the groundwork for the actual implementation of climate change adaptation and mitigation measures in Palestine has been accomplished.

### **Efficiency**

The identification of the budget and the period of project implementation (initially planned for 30 months, and extended to 48 months) was not an easy task during the design phase of the project: it had significant elements of novelty that could not fully be foreseen in the design phase. However, the occurrence did not constitute an obstacle to its successful implementation as the activities were implemented in a logical and well-sequenced order.

### **Impact**

The impact of the project is very high:

- The project achieved its stated objectives. The project design and the implementation modalities were undoubtedly realistic and conducive to the achievement of its objectives.
- Palestine is a UNFCCC and Paris Agreement State Party, which is considered as a very important step for Palestine on its way to achieve full international recognition as a State;
- The project positioned EQA as coordinating and leading organization within the government for all environmental and climate change matters, especially those related to climate change financing. It is now the National Designated Authority (NDA) to GCF and National Designated Entity (NDE) to Climate Technology Centre and Network (CTCN) as well; and
- Climate change is mainstreamed at various levels within the Palestinian society. This can be considered a direct impact of the 4 outputs of the project, which outreached a vast variety of institutions (government ministries and authorities, NGOs, CBOs, universities and private sector).

The impact of the ten pilot projects (4 implemented by PA ministries, and 6 by local NGOs/CBOs) could not be evaluated due to time constraints.

## Sustainability

The level of sustainability of the project can be regarded as very high. Climate change is now included in the Palestinian development agenda.

The main elements of sustainability are:

- Strong political support of the PA;
- Involvement of national institutions;
- Recognition of climate change importance;
- Participation of local NGOs and CBOs; and
- Involvement of international organizations.

## Recommendations

No major recommendations are drawn from the evaluation exercise as the project resulted to be successful and all stakeholders met have convergent opinions on its achievements in terms of effectiveness and impact.

Three lessons learned may, instead, be identified:

- The project set up a concerted and fruitful collaboration between different PA institutions. This was made possible by three elements:
  - I. A strong political backing, which supported the objectives, guided the level of engagement of all public officers involved in project activities. There was a clear political vision on the importance of climate change and adherence to international treaties as an effective way for the international recognition of Palestine as a State;
  - II. The role of UNDP/PAPP (project management) and EQA (institutional coordination) was effective and inclusive. Activities were led in a competent way and with the full respect of the roles and responsibilities of other national ministries and authorities. The message of the importance of climate change for the Palestinian economic development was conveyed clearly; and
  - III. The choice of competent international and national consultants.
- The project allowed the Palestinian delegation at COP 22 in Marrakesh to have full visibility due to the technical work accomplished throughout its implementation.
- A high degree of novelty characterized the implementation of activities related to outputs 1 and 2. Due to this fact there were no Palestinian free-lance consultants available to carry out the different tasks. The choice to hire as consultants national academic lecturers was appropriate, as it stretched the boundaries of the capacity building component.

The three aforementioned lessons learned may be repeated in other technical cooperation support projects in order to promote a better capacity development process: strong political backing, inclusive concertation with respect of roles and responsibilities of each stakeholder, visibility at international level and in-house development of capacities bestow and ensure a high level of ownership, which in turn is essential for the overall sustainability of the intervention.

The evaluation exercise highlights the importance of UNDP/PAPP, EQA and other PA ministries to continue to work on climate change related issues for two reasons:

- As mentioned, the project outputs represent the groundwork for the actual implementation of climate change adaptation and mitigation measures in Palestine. The

project contributed to the creation of interest on climate change at the political level. Squandering this wealth of knowledge, capacities and political momentum created by the project would represent a missed opportunity for EQA and UNDP;

- The project has enhanced PA capacities in mainstreaming environment and climate change topics. The need to enhance the capacities is, however, still relevant as the work accomplished by the project has a great degree of novelty. Abilities to access available climate change financing mechanisms are not yet fully developed.

Palestine is a UNFCCC State Party. As such, it has obligations, e.g. the submission of periodical reports (NCR each 4 years and BUR each 2 years), and enjoys certain opportunities, especially with regard to access to funds, technology transfer and capacity building. The project put in place the groundwork for future interventions on climate change in Palestine: adaptation and mitigation measures to climate change are widely recognized as an economic opportunity for Palestine, the institutional setting as well as plans and policies have been prepared, and capacities enhanced. Upon completion of the project EQA and other PA institutions have the tools, such as the NAP and the Capacity Development Program Report, available to negotiate and mobilize resources with donors and through global platforms such as the NAMA Facility and GCF. The negotiation and mobilization of resources represent the natural exit strategy of the project.

In actual fact, EQA has already put in place an exit strategy:

- It has developed the PA Nationally Determined Contributions (NDC) to UNFCCC with funds granted by the Government of the Kingdom Belgium;
- It is preparing a proposal to GCF with UNDP/PAPP on climate change financing readiness;
- It is preparing a Technology Road Map for National Climate Action Plan with support from CTCN,
- It is negotiating with the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA) a capacity development programme on climate change.

Finally, the evaluation exercise recommends to have a dedicated session of the PTSC to evaluate in detail the achievements of the four pilot projects implemented by PA institutions and the six GEF/SGP implemented by NGOs/CBOs. Prior to the PTSC the different organizations should be requested to carry out a self-assessment of their achievements. The self-assessment may include the following criteria:

- Relevance and impact of the pilot project – which were the needs of beneficiaries; how did the project respond to them; and which impact was generated;
- Sustainability of the project activities – what should be done by the beneficiaries to keep enjoying the benefits of the project in the long term; which are the costs and the revenues for the beneficiaries; and how can these costs be sustained;
- Others – to be identified by the implementing organizations.

Through this exercise, the PTSC members may gather ideas for future projects at field level, based on practical insights, for successful adaptation and mitigation activities. Furthermore, it could be a way to fine-tune the institutional perspective captured by the reports produced throughout the project, i.e. INCR, the NAP and the Capacity Development Program Report, and move to actual implementation - the work and challenge of PA institutions in relation to climate change in the next future.

## Annex 1 - ToRs of the evaluation as per the Inception Report

### Purpose of the evaluation

The purpose of the evaluation is to assess the performance of the project and to measure to what extent the objective/outputs/activities have been achieved against the results and resources framework, and identifying factors that have hindered or facilitated the success of the project. It is aimed at critically reviewing the stages of the project implementation and its products through the application of a participatory approach.

The evaluation exercise will answer to five main evaluation questions/criteria, i.e. relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, timeliness and sustainability, and five main aspects will be taken into consideration, i.e. project objective/outputs, processes, sustainability of results, monitoring and evaluation, and conclusions and lessons learned. For each aspect, a wide array of factors will be considered:

#### A. PROJECT OBJECTIVE/OUTPUTS

##### I. Objective, Output, Activities

1. Effectiveness and efficiency of project activities;
2. Progress in the achievement of outcomes/outputs, measured against the baselines; and
3. Indicators set at the outset of the project.

#### B. PROCESSES

##### I. Institutional arrangement

1. Formulation and implementation stages;
2. Consultative processes;
3. Technical support by global and regional teams during formulation and implementation;
4. Capacity building initiatives;
5. Assumptions and risks; and
6. Project related complementary activities.

##### II. Partnerships

1. Assessment of national level involvement and perception of partners;
2. Assessment of local partner ships and their involvement;
3. Assessment of collaboration between government, non- governmental organizations; and
4. The private sector and academic institutions.

##### III. Processes and Administration

1. Project administration procedures;
2. Milestones;
3. Key decision and outputs;
4. Project oversight and active engagement by UNDP and the project steering committee; and
5. Coordination between UNDP and the Environment Quality Authority.

##### IV. Disbursements

1. Overview of actual spending against budget expectations; and
2. Analyze disbursements to determine if funds have been applied effectively and efficiently.



#### V. Budget procedures

1. Effectiveness of project document to provide adequate guidance on how to allocate the budget;
2. Audits and any issues raised in audit and subsequent adjustments to accommodate review recommendations.
3. Review budget revisions and provide an opinion on the appropriateness and relevancy of such revisions.

#### VI. Coordination mechanisms

1. Appropriateness and efficiency of coordinating mechanisms and approaches.
2. Propose improved coordination mechanisms and approaches.

### C. SUSTAINABILITY OF RESULTS

- I. Identify evidence showing that the results/lessons of project have been replicated to other areas/communities; and
- II. Analyze risk to ensuring sustainability of the project outcomes and results (i.e country ownership, financial, institutional capacity).

### D. MONITORING AND EVALUATION

- I. Identify problems/constraints, which impacted on successful delivery of the project identified at the project design stage; and
- II. Identify threats/risks to project success that emerged during implementation and strategies implemented to overcome these threats/risks.

### E. CONCLUSION, LESSONS LEARNED

- I. Assess substantive reports (e.g. risk assessment, progress reports, lessons learned documents);
- II. Identify key lessons emerging; and
- III. Identify element hindering or promoting success.

## Evaluation Questions

### Relevance

- How relevant was the project concept: did it respond to stated priorities and needs concerning climate change and environment related issues? Did it correspond with the UNDP objectives in the oPt? Did it correspond with national priorities at country level? Were the project objectives relevant in the context of the oPt?
- How appropriate was the project for addressing the needs of Palestinian institutions and stakeholders, as well as their priorities in the field of mainstreaming environment and climate change?
- Were the project objectives and design relevant given the environmental, political, economic and social context of oPt, as well as consistent with national strategies and development plans?
- To what extent were the activities/interventions/factors implemented relevant for achieving the objectives defined by the project, and in consistent with the intended impacts?
- How well did the project complement and link to activities of other donors/development agencies at local level?

- Did it respond to the proper presentation of Palestine in the international community especially w/r to MEAs?

### **Effectiveness**

- To what extent were the project outcomes and outputs achieved/are likely to be achieved in a timely manner?
- Have the quantity and quality of outputs produced been satisfactory?
- What were the major factors (internal and external - foreseen or unforeseen) influencing the implementation of project, and achievement or non-achievement its planned outputs and outcomes?
- Which components of the project had the greatest/least achievements? What have been the supporting/constraining factors?
- What concrete improvements and changes have taken place as a direct result of the project?
- To what extent project’s staff supported effective implementation of project activities to achieve expected outputs and outcomes, in line with the original project’s documents?
- What other achievement were observed other than target set earlier.

### **Efficiency**

- Were the resources used to obtain the expected outputs and outcomes sufficient and pertinent? Has the project been efficiently managed given the available staffing and resources (financial, human and administrative)?
- Review budget revisions and provide an opinion on the appropriateness and relevancy of such revisions, besides overview of actual spending against budget expectations.
- Was the chosen management structure by UNDP/PAPP for implementation and oversight the project appropriate and feasible? What are the major strengths and weaknesses of this approach?
- To what extent did technical assistance by international and national teams during the formulation and implementation contribute to define and produce the planned results?
- To what extent the main stakeholders were participated in the project? Were they supported with needed and valued capacities and resources to support the project activities?
- To what extent has the project been able to develop strong and enabling partnerships?
- Assess the national level involvement and perception of partners, local partnerships and their involvement, as well as the collaboration between government, non- governmental organizations, the private sector, and academic institutions.
- Assess the appropriateness and efficiency of coordinating mechanisms and approaches,
- Have the project’s timeline and deadlines been followed as planned? Have plans been used, implemented and adapted as necessary?
- How effectively did the project management monitor project performance and results? Was the M&E Strategy systematically applied and was it appropriate to the project in terms of accuracy and flexibility?

### **Impact**

- How has the project contributed towards its goals? To what extent has the project contributed in developing the capacity of Palestinian institutions in mainstreaming environment and climate change?
- What were the overall impacts of project on beneficiaries? What difference did the project make to them?
- What are the mechanisms/activities that delivered the impact?
- To what extent is the project making a significant contribution to broader and longer – term impact?
- Is the project strategy and management steering towards impact?
- Can unforeseen positive and/or negative impact be observed?

### **Sustainability**

- To what extent do positive outputs & outcomes of the project hold after its completion? What are the major influencing factors? Which benefits are or aren’t intended to be continued?
- What external factors and their effects on project activities that may positively or negatively impact the sustainability of its interventions?
- What is the specific sustainability plan/strategy incorporating the needed actions to ensure the sustainability of project?
- Are local partners willing and committed to continue with the project? How effectively has the project built necessary capacity of people and institutions?
- Analyze risk to ensuring sustainability of the project outcomes and results (i.e country ownership, financial, institutional capacity).

## Annex 2 - Work plan of the evaluation mission in Palestine

DAY 1 Tuesday 04/04/2017	<b>Hala Othman</b> - <a href="mailto:hala.othman@undp.org">hala.othman@undp.org</a> (meeting held via Skype) UNDP/PAPP - Programme Manager
	<b>Eng. Fawzi Abdu</b> - <a href="mailto:fawziabdoh@yahoo.com">fawziabdoh@yahoo.com</a> Consultant
	<b>Husam Tubail</b> – <a href="mailto:husam.tubail@undp.org">husam.tubail@undp.org</a> UNDP/PAPP - Program analyst
	<b>Nadia Elkhodary</b> – <a href="mailto:nadia.elkhodary@undp.org">nadia.elkhodary@undp.org</a> UNDP/PAPP - Head of GEF /SGP
DAY 2 Wednesday 05/04/2017	<b>Eng. Ahmad Abu Thaher</b> – <a href="mailto:ahmadabuthater@yahoo.com">ahmadabuthater@yahoo.com</a> EQA – General Director of Projects and International Relations Department
	<b>Hadeel Ikhmais</b> – <a href="mailto:hadeelikhmais@gmail.com">hadeelikhmais@gmail.com</a> EQA - Head of Climate Change Unit
	<b>Samer Kalbounch</b> – <a href="mailto:s.kalbounch@yahoo.com">s.kalbounch@yahoo.com</a> EQA – Director of Project Implementation and Follow up Department
	<b>Issa Mousa</b> – <a href="mailto:issadwan@yahoo.com">issadwan@yahoo.com</a> EQA - General Director of Natural Resources Department
	<b>Ibrahim Alqouqa</b> – <a href="mailto:alqouqa@yahoo.com">alqouqa@yahoo.com</a> EQA – Director of Combating Desertification Department
	<b>Ibtisam Abu Haija</b> – <a href="mailto:abuhajjaibtisam@yahoo.com">abuhajjaibtisam@yahoo.com</a> MoA – Director of Climate Change and Drought Monitoring Department
	<b>Imad Ghanma</b> - <a href="mailto:imad_ghanma@yahoo.com">imad_ghanma@yahoo.com</a> MoA - Director of Land Classification Department
DAY 3 Thursday 06/04/2017	<b>Hanadi Al Shoubaki</b> – <a href="mailto:hanadi@shoubaki@yahoo.com">hanadi@shoubaki@yahoo.com</a> MoA – Agricultural Engineer
	<b>Asmahan Hassan</b> – <a href="mailto:asmahanhassan63@yahoo.com">asmahanhassan63@yahoo.com</a> MoA – Director of Crops Department
	<b>Hazem Yaseen</b> – <a href="mailto:hazemyaseen@gmail.com">hazemyaseen@gmail.com</a> MoA – Director of Fertilizers Department
	<b>Majdu Shaheen</b> – <a href="mailto:majdi_shaheen78@yahoo.com">majdi_shaheen78@yahoo.com</a> Chief of Hydrogeology Department
	<b>Eng. Basel Yaseen</b> – <a href="mailto:byaseen@menr.org">byaseen@menr.org</a> Director of Renewable Energy Directorate
	<b>Abdel Latif Kharouf</b> – <a href="mailto:akharouf@pec.com.ps">akharouf@pec.com.ps</a> Director of Sustainable Energy Department
DAY 4 Friday 07/04/2017	<b>Katelijin De Nijs</b> – <a href="mailto:katelijin.denijs@diplobel.fed.be">katelijin.denijs@diplobel.fed.be</a> Consul – Development Cooperation – Consulate General of the Kingdom of Belgium
	<b>Genia Helou-Radd</b> – <a href="mailto:genia.helou@diplobel.fed.be">genia.helou@diplobel.fed.be</a> Senior Advisor - International Cooperation – Consulate General of the Kingdom of Belgium
	<b>Dr. Azzam Saleh</b> – <a href="mailto:azzam.saleh@fao.org">azzam.saleh@fao.org</a> FAO – West Bank and Gaza Strip Programme Coordinator
	<b>Roberto Valent</b> – <a href="mailto:roberto.valent@undp.org">roberto.valent@undp.org</a> UNDP/PAPP – Special Representative to the Administrator
	<b>Narjess Saidane</b> – <a href="mailto:narjess.saidane@undp.org">narjess.saidane@undp.org</a> UNDP/PAPP – Deputy Special Representative to the Administrator
DAY 5 Sunday 09/04/2017	<b>Zahran Khaleef</b> – <a href="mailto:zahran@pcbs.gov.ps">zahran@pcbs.gov.ps</a> PCBS - Director of Environmental Statistics
	<b>Eman Taha</b> – <a href="mailto:eman_taha@windowslive.com">eman_taha@windowslive.com</a> MoT – Responsible for Energy & Environment, General Directorate of Planning and Studies

	<p><b>Nedal Katbeh</b> – <a href="mailto:n72065@hotmail.com">n72065@hotmail.com</a>          EQA – Minister’s Advisor for Climate Change and Focal Point UNFCCC  <b>Eng. Ahmad Abu Thaher</b> – <a href="mailto:ahmadabuthater@yahoo.com">ahmadabuthater@yahoo.com</a>          EQA – General Director of Projects and International Relations Department</p>
<p>DAY 6 Monday 10/04/2017</p>	<p><b>Hala Othman</b> - <a href="mailto:hala.othman@undp.org">hala.othman@undp.org</a> (meeting held via Skype)          UNDP/PAPP - Project manager</p>
	<p><b>Rima Abumiddain</b> – <a href="mailto:rima.abumiddain@undp.org">rima.abumiddain@undp.org</a>          UNDP/PAPP – Team Leader Environment and Natural Resources</p>
	<p><b>Yousef Abu Asad</b> - <a href="mailto:yabuasad@yahoo.com">yabuasad@yahoo.com</a>          MoT – Director General of the Palestinian Meteorological Office</p>
	<p><b>Isam Isa</b> – <a href="mailto:iasm_isa@yahoo.com">iasm_isa@yahoo.com</a>          MoT - Palestinian Meteorological Office, Director of Applied Meteorological Studies</p>
	<p><b>Mohammed Abu Baker</b> – <a href="mailto:mjyabubaker@yahoo.com">mjyabubaker@yahoo.com</a>          MoT - Palestinian Meteorological Office, Director of Meteorological Stations Department</p>
	<p><b>Ayman Elhour</b> (meeting held via Skype)          Karmel Cultural and Social Development Association</p>
	<p><b>Dr. Khaled Qahman</b> – <a href="mailto:kqahman@gmail.com">kqahman@gmail.com</a> (meeting held via Skype)          EQA – Gaza Strip</p>
	<p><b>Dr. Mohammad Al’Ailah</b> <a href="mailto:meila@gov.ps">meila@gov.ps</a> (meeting held via Skype)          EQA – Gaza Strip</p>
<p>DAY 7 Tuesday 11/04/2017</p>	<p><b>Eng. Ahmad Ali Ghayyaada</b> – <a href="mailto:aghayyada@hebron.edu">aghayyada@hebron.edu</a>          Hebron University -Renewable Energy Unit          Field visit in Um Zaytoon, Hebron - GEF/SGP project “Utilizing Solar Energy to Empower vulnerable households in marginalized areas and improving their living conditions in Rawaeen community in Bethlehem Governorate and Um Zaytoon in Hebron Governorate”.</p>
<p>DAY 8 Wednesday 12/04/2017</p>	<p><b>Eng. Adala Attirah</b>          H.E. Head of EQA</p>
	<p><b>Eng. Nedal Katbeh</b> – <a href="mailto:n72065@hotmail.com">n72065@hotmail.com</a>          EQA – Minister’s Advisor for Climate Change and Focal Point UNFCCC</p>
	<p><b>Dr. Mahmoud Musa Dodeen</b> – <a href="mailto:mdodeen@birzeit.edu">mdodeen@birzeit.edu</a>          Birzeit University – Assistant Professor, Faculty of Law and Public Administration</p>
	<p><b>Prof. Ziad Mimi</b> – <a href="mailto:zmimi@birzeit.edu">zmimi@birzeit.edu</a>          Birzeit University – Chairman, Civil Engineering Department</p>
	<p><b>Dr. Moham2med Abu Zayed</b> – <a href="mailto:mabuzayed@birzeit.edu">mabuzayed@birzeit.edu</a>          Birzeit University – Assistant Professor, Department of Public Administration</p>
<p>Day 9 Thursday 13/04/2017</p>	<p>Field visit in Lemghayer village, Ramallah to “Climate change adaptation through Soil Conservation and Water Harvesting within Soil Profile” – Pilot project implemented by MoA.</p>
	<p>Debriefing at UNDP/PAPP in Ramallah  <b>Hala Othman</b> - <a href="mailto:hala.othman@undp.org">hala.othman@undp.org</a> (meeting held via Skype)          UNDP/PAPP - Project manager  <b>Husam Tubail</b> – <a href="mailto:husam.tubail@undp.org">husam.tubail@undp.org</a>          UNDP/PAPP - Program analyst  <b>Nedal Katbeh</b> – <a href="mailto:n72065@hotmail.com">n72065@hotmail.com</a>          EQA – Minister’s Advisor for Climate Change and Focal Point UNFCCC  <b>Eng. Ahmad Abu Thaher</b> – <a href="mailto:ahmadabuthater@yahoo.com">ahmadabuthater@yahoo.com</a>          EQA – General Director of Projects and International Relations Department  <b>Sadiq Ahmed Abdelall</b> - <a href="mailto:sabdelall@iugaza.edu.ps">sabdelall@iugaza.edu.ps</a> (interviewed by Skype on April, 19<sup>th</sup>)          Islamic University of Gaza - Assistant Professor, Industrial Engineering Department</p>

## **Annex 3 - List of the documents, reports & websites consulted**

### **Published reports (policies and strategies)**

- Climate Change Adaptation Strategy and Programme of Action for the Palestinian Authority (PA and UNDP/PAPP, 2010)
- Environment Sector Strategy 2011-2013 (PA and UNDP/PAPP, 2010)
- GEF/SGP PAL Country Programme Strategy - 5th Operational Phase (March 2011-Feb. 2014)
- Palestinian National Development Plan 2011-2013 - Establishing the State, Building the Future
- State of Palestine - National Policy Agenda 2017-2022
- UNDP/PAPP Development for Freedom (2012-2014) strategy

### **Project deliverables**

- Initial National Communication Report to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (EQA 2016)
- National Adaptation Plan (NAP) to Climate Change (EQA 2016)
- Capacity Assessment Report - Assessment of National Capacities for Implementing Adaptation and Mitigation Measures and Developing Needs for Capacity Development of Palestinian Authority Institutions regarding Climate Change Adaptation and Mitigation (PA and UNDP/PAPP, 2014)
- Capacity Development Program Report Assessment of National Capacities for Implementing Adaptation and Mitigation Measures and Developing Needs for Capacity Development of Palestinian Authority Institutions regarding Climate Change Adaptation and Mitigation (PA and UNDP/PAPP, 2015)

### **Project reports and documents**

- Project Document “Enhancing the Capacities of the PA in Mainstreaming Environment and Climate Change in oPt”
- Annual Progress Report Enhancing the Capacities of the PA in Mainstreaming Environment and Climate Change in oPt” – May 2014
- Annual Progress Report Enhancing the Capacities of the PA in Mainstreaming Environment and Climate Change in oPt” – September 2015
- Annual Progress Report Enhancing the Capacities of the PA in Mainstreaming Environment and Climate Change in oPt” – April 2016

- Minutes of Meeting “2nd Project Technical Steering Committee”, Ramallah 19.08.2014
- Minutes of Meeting “3rd Project Technical Steering Committee”, Ramallah 13.07.2015
- TOR for Project Technical Steering Committee (PTSC), “Enhancing the capacities of the PA in mainstreaming environment and climate change in oPt” Project.
- Pilot projects with PA institutions
  - MoA pilot project
    - Letter of Agreement
    - Proposal
    - Progress report
  - PENRA pilot project in West Bank
    - Letter of Agreement
    - Proposal
    - Progress report
  - PENRA pilot project in Gaza Strip
    - Letter of Agreement
    - Proposal
    - Progress report
  - MoT pilot project
    - Letter of Agreement
    - Proposal
    - Progress report
- GEF/SGP projects
  - Bani Naim Charitable Society
    - Grant Agreement with UNDP
    - Project Final Report
  - Al-Mustaqbal Association for Development and Environment
    - Grant Agreement with UNDP
    - Project Final Report
  - Al-Karmel Cultural & Social Development Association
    - Grant Agreement with UNDP
    - Project Final Report
  - Hebron University
    - Grant Agreement with UNDP
    - Project Final Report
  - Palestinian Association for Development and Reconstruction
    - Grant Agreement with UNDP
    - Project Final Report
  - World Vision - JWG
    - Grant Agreement with UNDP
    - Project Final Report

## Websites

- <http://www.greenclimate.fund/home>
- <http://www.ipccc.org/>
- <http://www.nama-facility.org/>
- <https://www.paleng.org/icccp>
- <http://www.sustainabledevelopment.un.org>
- <http://www.undp.org>
- <http://unfccc.int/>