Projects Evaluation under Regional Programme for Arab States

Mosharaka

Evaluation Report

October 2017

Contents

Acknowledgements

The consultant would like to express her sincere and warm gratitude and appreciation to the project and RBAS staff for their kindness, availability and efficiency in providing information and all kinds of support.

Acronyms

ADP	Arab Development Portal
AHDR	Arab Human Development Report
AKP	Arab Knowledge Project
AWP	Annual Work Plan
BPPS	Bureau for Programme and Policy Studies (UNDP)
CAWTAR	Centre of Arab Women for Training and Research
CO	Country Office (UNDP)
CPAP	Country Programme Action Plan
CSO	Civil Society Organization
DRF	Development Results Framework
EQs	Evaluation Questions
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization
GCC	Gulf Cooperation Council
GEWE	Gender Equality and Women Empowerment
HQ	Headquarters
HRBA	Human Rights-based Approach
IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural Development
ILO	International Labour Organization
IO	International Organisation
LAS	League of Arab States
LCP	Legal Country Profile
MDG	Millennium Development Goal
NGO	Non-governmental Organization
ProDoc	Project Document
PSCAR	Promoting Social Cohesion in the Arab Region
ROAR	Results Oriented Annual Report
RPAS	Regional Programme for Arab States
SDG	Sustainable Development Goal

5

TRAC	Target resource assignment from the core
UN	United Nations
UNCDF	United Nations Capital Development Fund
UNCT	United Nations Country Team
UNCTAD	United Nations Conference on Trade and Development
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
UNDESA	United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs
UNDG	United Nations Development Group
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNESCWA	United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Western Asia
UNEG	United Nations Review Group
UNEP	United Nations Environment Programme
UNFPA	United Nations Population Fund
UNICEF	United Nations Children Fund
UNIDO	United Nations Industrial Development Organization
UN OHCHR	United Nations Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
UNPFD	United Nations Partnership Framework for Development
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
UNW	UN Women
YLP	Youth Leadership Programme

Executive Summary

"Fostering the Inclusive Participation and Effective Contribution of Women in the Public Sphere" -Mosharaka is a threeyear regional project that aims to address the deficits in the public participation and citizenship rights of women in the Arab Region, especially in transition, fragile and post conflict societies. The overall outcome of the project reflects UNDP's Regional Program for Arab States - Outcome 3, namely, "faster progress is achieved in reducing gender inequality and promoting women's empowerment", and is also related to Outcome 4, namely "Early recovery and rapid return to sustainable development pathways are achieved in post-conflict and post-disaster settings" (UNDP Strategic Plan Outcome 4 and Outcome 6).

Relevance. The initiative is highly relevant to the priorities set up in the RPAS. It has been developed following principles of inclusiveness and right-based approaches, and fully reflects the needs and gaps identified in the region. The project design was based on thorough analysis and research, and on a broad consultative process which has seen the participation of all relevant stakeholders, which include national and regional levels and range from state entities, civil society organizations to individuals. This multidimensional approach allowed the project for maximum outreach. At project design level, indicators are not always SMART and are often activity-based; also, the project lacks an exit strategy.

Efficiency. The project suffered from initial lack of sufficient funding (of the estimated needs, less than 50% was actually funded). This brought about the need for continuous readjustments and downsizing of activities. Management arrangements were also affected, as Mosharaka is led by a smaller team compared to the envisaged option. The main challenge to date remains insufficient funding.

Effectiveness. Interventions at regional level to boost the discourse on gender equality themes are deeply needed and are key from an inclusive development perspective, in a region where gender equality and women's empowerment are generally assessed lower than elsewhere. Mosharaka has broadly and successfully contributed to a more open and inclusive discussion on gender themes. Through its activities, regional and national actors are supported in the establishment of measures to advance gender equality and women's political, social and economic participation. The project's collaboration with regional platforms of governmental entities, NGOs and women activists/advocates networks contributes to advance efforts in constitution making and legislative reforms. The focus on SDGs also fosters effective and gender sensitive measures at the national level. The knowledge sharing via the e-platform that was created with more than 3,600 laws and 20 legal profiles from 20 Arab Countries assisted policymakers, women machineries and concerned civil society organizations in assessing, analysing and understanding the legal status of women across the region.

Finally, the Youth Leadership Programme (YLP), one of the flagship initiatives of RPAS, has proven to be highly effective in developing a sensitized and knowledgeable new generation, which is capable of providing innovative solutions to GEWE issues, from community to regional levels.

Sustainability. The support provided to platforms and the large involvement of the civil society leaves good hopes about the capacity of such networks to further carry out the discourse on women equality themes. However, the achievement of GEWE is a long-term goal, and is subject to many challenges in this region,

particularly affected by conflicts and political risks. It is strongly encouraged that the project be continued, and that appropriate efforts be put in place for this purpose at high management level.

1. Background and Context

The present evaluation covers Mosharaka, one of the three projects analysed under the present evaluation exercise, and implemented under the UNDP Regional Programme for Arab States (2014-2017).

The UNDP Regional Programme for Arab States (2014-2017) was endorsed by the UNDP Executive Board during the First Regular Session of the Executive Board at the end of January 2014.

The Programme covers 4 out of 7 development outcome areas of the UNDP Strategic Plan, namely:

- **Inclusive growth**: Growth is inclusive and sustainable, incorporating productive capacities that create employment and livelihoods for the poor and excluded (SP Outcome 1)
- **Inclusive governance**: Citizen expectations for voice, effective development, the rule of law and accountability are met by stronger systems of democratic governance (SP Outcome 2)
- **Gender**: Faster progress is achieved in reducing gender inequality and promoting women's empowerment (SP Outcome 4)
- **Social cohesion and resilience**: Early recovery and rapid return to sustainable development pathways are achieved in post-conflict and post-disaster settings (SP Outcome 6).

The Mosharaka project responds to the Programme's outcomes as follows:

Outcomes	Project outputs
Gender: Faster progress is achieved in reducing gender inequality and promoting women's empowerment	- Output 1: Support regional and national actors and institutions to establish measures to advance gender equality, and women's political, social and economic participation
	- Output 2: Establish women peace and security frameworks to reinforce social cohesion and promote women's equal access to political and economic opportunities in early recovery and post-crisis settings.

In line with the Evaluation Plan, UNDP required independent consultancy services to undertake an evaluation of the implementation of the project. The evaluation was conducted to assess UNDP-RBAS contributions towards the progress made on achievements of the project as a tool to explain results.

2. Analysis of the subject of the evaluation

2.1. Purpose of the evaluation

The purpose of the evaluation – as per ToRs – is *to assess how the projects impacted the progress towards the achievement of the[se] objectives. Moreover, the contribution of the project in enabling a coherent development engagement, and to identify the factors that have affected its implementation will be assessed.*

The specific objectives – following the ToRs - are to:

1. Assess progress towards attaining the project's objectives;

2. Assess progress towards the achievement of the project's outcome;

3. Review the clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various agencies and stakeholders and the level of coordination between relevant actors in the project implementation;

4. Assess the likelihood of continuation of the project outcome and benefits;

5. Describe key factors that will require attention in order to improve prospects for sustainability of the project results;

6. Analyse the relevance of the project strategy and approaches;

7. Assess the potential for sustainability of the results and the feasibility of ongoing efforts and commitment to help advance the focus areas of the project;

8. Document key lessons learned, good practices, success stories and challenges to inform future work of various stakeholders in addressing the focus area of the project; and

9. Document and analyse possible weaknesses in order to improve next steps of project interventions in the focus areas.

2.2. Scope

As indicated in the ToRs, the overall results of the project will be evaluated since its start across its overall duration, which is from 1st of April 2014 till 31st of March of 2017.

3. Methodology

3.1. Evaluation approach

The guiding principle in conducting the evaluation exercise has been the use of participatory approaches, where relevant stakeholders are involved in the identification of main issues to be evaluated, which will constitute the evaluation *foci*. Most questions focused on: latest developments, main achievements and challenges, perspectives for impact and sustainability. This approach is of particular importance for the evaluation, since the objective of the exercise is to provide relevant inputs to the next programming phase and a shared consensus on lessons learnt, recommendations and ways forward is a key factor of success.

3.2. Data collection

Data were collected through:

> - Review of relevant documentation/desk review, which was timely and accurately provided by the RBAS Office. The documents reviewed include:
>   - o Programme and project documents and reports
>   - o AWPs and relevant reports

10

- o Annual ROARs
- o Financial data
- o UN Handbook on Monitoring and Evaluating for Results
- o UNEG Standards and Norms for Evaluation in the UN System
- o Other documents and materials related to the interventions to be evaluated (from the government, donors, platforms etc.)

➢ Regional Conference: The evaluator was offered the opportunity to participate at the UNDP Regional Conference on 'Development Challenges and Priorities in a Changing Arab Region', held in Amman on 22-23 May 2017. This permitted the consultant to hold several interviews with main partners and stakeholders of the project in the whole region.

➢ Field mission to Beirut: The mission was held from 20 to 21 June in Beirut. The consultant could complete interviews with stakeholders – essentially the RBAS Office staff and the project team – and finalized the Inception Report with a set of Evaluation Questions (EQs), reviewed by RBAS and the project staff to ascertain that questions are relevant.

3.3.   Evaluation Questions

To design the evaluation questions, the consultant used the tasks detailed in the ToRs and developed a first list of EQs, which were revised by RBAS and the project team. The passage from tasks to EQs is to be found under Annex 3.

3.4.   Evaluation matrix

On the basis of the EQs, the consultant has elaborated a detailed Evaluation Matrix, including questions, relevant sub-indicators, and method for collecting data. The matrix used for this exercise is to be found under Annex 4.

3.5.   Ethical considerations

The UN ethical standards in evaluations are based on the UNEG Ethical Guidelines and Code of Conduct[1]. The UNEG guidelines note the importance of ethical conduct for the following reasons:

1. *Responsible use of power*: All those engaged in evaluation processes are responsible for upholding the proper conduct of the evaluation.

2. *Ensuring credibility*: With a fair, impartial and complete assessment, stakeholders are more likely to have faith in the results of an evaluation and to take note of the recommendations.

3. *Responsible use of resources*: Ethical conduct in evaluation increases the chances of acceptance by the parties to the evaluation and therefore the likelihood that the investment in the evaluation will result in improved outcomes.

---

[1] UNEG, 'Ethical Guidelines for Evaluation', June 2008. Available at
http://www.uneval.org/search/index.jsp?q=ethical+guidelines.

The evaluator has carefully followed the above mentioned Guidelines.

3.6. Limitations

There have been no substantial limitations. More time might have been spent on contacting and interviewing final beneficiaries of the project, in order to assess the impact of actions and the changes produced in terms of mind-sets and attitudes.

4. Findings

This Chapter is structured in accordance with the OECD DAC requirements for evaluations. In Section 4.1, we discuss the project design and its relevance to national, regional and UNDP programme priorities and strategies. Section 4.2 discusses the project's efficiency, including the conversion of resources (financial and human) into results. Section 4.3 follows with a discussion on effectiveness, in particular the contribution of the results to achieving the immediate objectives (outcomes). Section 4.4 discusses the project's sustainability over time.

4.1. Relevance

DO THE PROJECT STRUCTURES AND OBJECTIVES ADDRESS KEY ISSUES, THEIR UNDERLYING CAUSES, AND CHALLENGES IDENTIFIED IN THE REGION?

4.1.1. Intervention logic

The project was correctly designed through both background research and an extensive consultative process that involved national and regional civil society organizations, NGOs, women machineries, think tanks, labour unions and professional associations, the League of Arab States, national governments, parliaments, local authorities and councils, political parties, UN Women, other UN agencies and donors, academic institutions/universities and the private sector.

Participatory design

A distinctive feature of the project was that it was originated through active involvement of partners, started with the 'Regional Training and Social Mobilization on Women Peace and Security' workshop that took place in October 2013 in Amman, Jordan. The workshop was led by Karama, and organized jointly by the UNDP and UN Women. The meeting convened over 80 participants from 14 countries (Egypt, Iraq, Jordan, Lebanon, Libya, Morocco, Palestine, Syria, Somalia, Sudan, South Sudan, Tunisia and Yemen) to discuss issues related to women, peace, and security in the Arab Region. The most important aspect of this meeting was that the participants announced the launch of a 'Regional Network on Women, Peace, and Security' and called for the development of a 'Regional Action Plan on Women, Peace and Security' that would focus on women's participation, protection, prevention of conflict, and peace building.

Consultation and participation has been largely encouraged in the project; in April 2014, a Regional consultation was organized by RBAS in Amman to present the initiative. The meeting brought together a broad spectrum of stakeholders including government, civil society, experts, activists, and donors from the

region and globally to deliberate on the challenges and opportunities that different national, regional and sub- regional contexts present for advocacy and action on behalf of women.[2]

Research

On the research side, the identification of the action is based on a broad number of studies and reports; these include World Bank reports, UN reports, reports and studies from international and regional agencies and networks, academic studies and articles. The ProDoc contains an accurate and grounded analysis of perceptions of women's domestic roles, education and employment in the region and main challenges.

Conclusions of this preliminary work seem to go in depth, through analysing all aspects of the problem. It is observed, among others, that *policies towards women empowerment that do not take into account women's greater burdens of unpaid work within the household, as per cultural norms, may have adverse impacts on women,* and that *focusing on education and job creation for women is not enough* since cultural attitudes can play negative roles.

It is recognised that the main issue in the region from a gender perspective is the limited participation of women in public life, and that women including young women's empowerment including political and social participation need to be addressed. The project therefore focused on enhancing these aspects as a vehicle towards GEWE.

A key feature of the project is the issue of women in crisis and post-conflict situations, based on real needs and demands, and highlighting in particular women participation in public/ national institutions as well as women's role in peace building and conflict mitigation processes.

In the best tradition of UNDP regional projects, Mosharaka pursued a <u>multi-dimensional approach</u>, targeting various sectors and stakeholders at all levels, from State to grassroots and even individuals. Initiatives were also multifaceted, and included knowledge management, capacity development, advocacy, networking, and alliance and coalition building between partners. In the same logic, approaches used were both top-down – with actions aimed at strengthening capacities of state actors – and bottom-up, based on the enhancement of networks.

WAS THE DESIGN OF THE PROJECT ADEQUATE TO EXPECTED OBJECTIVES, AND FLEXIBLE ENOUGH TO ADAPT TO POTENTIAL CHANGES?

The following table recapitulates outcomes, outputs and activities of Mosharaka.

Outcome: To address the deficits in the public participation and citizenship rights of women in the Arab Region, especially in transition, fragile and post-conflict countries		
Outputs	**Components**	**Sub-components**

---

[22] Regional Consultation - The Future We Want: Rights and Empowerment "Fostering the Inclusive Participation and Effective Contribution of Arab Women in the Public Sphere",

Output 1: Support regional and national actors and institutions to establish measures to advance gender equality, and women's political, social and economic participation (Strategic Plan Output #4.1; #4.3; #4.4) (RBAS Regional Programme Output 3.1)	1.1. *Enhance knowledge and evidence base in support of gender equality and women empowerment*	• Produce and share evidence-based and action-oriented analyses on the conditions of women in public life, and promote gender focus in research and statistics
	1.2 *Promote women's participation in critical institutions for law and policymaking, and support the implementation of gender commitments*	• Mainstream gender in parliamentary, legislative, and electoral institutions and processes • Support the drafting of women's charters and national observatories to monitor and react to discrimination against women • Establish/capacitate national machineries, gender equality units, committees, and caucuses
	1.3 *Expand opportunities for women's economic empowerment*	• Mainstream gender in macro-economic frameworks, national economic plans and processes • Establish/support "The Voices of Business Women" platform.
Output 2: Establish women peace and security frameworks to reinforce human security and advance women's economic opportunities in early recovery and post-crisis settings (Strategic Plan Output #6.4; #4.2 RBAS Output #4.1)	2.1. *Develop and capacitate the Regional Network for Women Peace and Security launched with Karama* 2.2. *Assist national and subnational actors towards the implementation of the Women, Peace and Security Framework (WSP)* 2.3. *Improve women's access to diversified livelihood opportunities in early recovery settings.*	

Outputs focus on strengthening participation, expanding opportunities and securing women's rights in the region. Output 1 is rather general, whereas output 2 is more specific on the issue of security which seems opportune in the post Arab spring period, witnessing political turmoil in several countries of the region. The concept of women as main actors or players for conflict prevention, resolution or as victims of conflict is highly relevant.

Coming to components, Component 1.1. *Enhance knowledge and evidence base in support of gender equality and women empowerment* might seem superfluous, given the huge number of studies and reports produced on GEWE in the last years and covering extensively the Arab region, as the documental research conducted for the project demonstrates. Yet, Mosharaka has contributed new knowledge on understudied

areas, such as launching an online database that compiled laws from 20 Arab countries related to gender and human rights. The e-platform, "Legal and Human Rights of Women and Men: between Equality and Gaps," presents information in Arabic through a searchable online portal (http://www.arabwomenlegal-emap.org/). The information in the database is widely used by lawyers, activists, NGOs and women's groups in policy meetings with national counterparts to push for the enactment of new legislation and amendments to existing articles that protect and promote women's rights.

With regard to the project structure, the explanation of the main headings of the project (outcome – outputs - components-activities) is confused; activities are confused with sub-activities, and components are called somewhere sub-components[3].These mistakes have been fine-tuned in the subsequent annual work plans, including indicators and targeted milestones. More attention should be however drawn to the structuring, as confusion might reflect on indicators and on the overall project arrangements.

Risks are accurately listed and mitigation measures are presented.

Outcome indicators are correct and comprehensive. On the other side, output indicators are activity-based and do not look at results. Output indicators were adjusted post initiation and they form the basis for the result-oriented reporting, quarterly & annual. However, such shortcomings should be avoided in the future, as it is now widely recognised that <u>activity based indicators do not allow for proper management, and provide a very limited view of the project's sense and significance</u>. When used in project reporting, they impede a full and informed overview of projects' real results and changes.

A major challenge in the project design was the excessive optimism in allocating the expected budget, as we will explore under the following section.

4.2. Efficiency

> **WAS MANAGEMENT ADEQUATE TO THE PLANNING AND EXECUTION REQUIREMENTS? (MANAGEMENT ARRANGEMENTS, WORK PLANNING, FINANCE, VALUE FOR MONEY, TIMING AND DELAYS, PROJECT-LEVEL MONITORING AND EVALUATION SYSTEMS, COORDINATION, STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT, REPORTING, COMMUNICATIONS)**

4.2.1. Management

The project was implemented under direct implementation modality (DIM). Management arrangements in the ProDoc foresee that the project would be supervised by the RBAS Regional Programme, in close coordination with the Gender Practice Team Leader/Gender Advisor in the Regional Centre, for quality assurance. The team should have comprised two gender specialists/analysts; in reality, a project manager and a gender advisor managed the project. This small team is responsible for: providing technical and strategic support to the project's national partners; monitoring progress achieved in partner aims; developing concept notes; finding donors; and supporting gender mainstreaming for other regional and national projects[4].

---

[33] See pages 11 – 15 of the ProDoc.
[4] Progress Reports.

To ensure that the project's results be owned by the regional and national partners, the establishment of a regional advisor group (RAG) and national focus groups (NFGs) was envisaged. Moreover, provisions were added recommending that Mosharaka be implemented in close coordination with the gender focal points and the governance team in ·the UNDP country offices.

4.2.2.   Expenditures

The following tables provide information about budget and expenditures of Mosharaka.

	Overall estimate	2015	2016	2017
Allocated resources	*11,746,000*	**1,147,743**	565,000	730,000
Source of funding				
TRAC	RBAS- TRAC: 1,000,000	UNDP-TRAC 300,000	TRAC 250,000	TRAC 300,000
Other	UNDP Elections Project 800,000 BPPS/BCPR 300,000 Japan 1,000,000 UN Women 200,000	UN Women 117,743 MBC[1] (tbc) 70,000 UNDP-Regional Elections Project 360,000 UNDP BPPS 300,000	UNDP-Regional Elections Project 265,000 UN Women 50,000	UNDP-Regional Elections Project 400,000 UN Women 30,000
Total allocated	USD 3,300,000	USD 1,147,743	565,000	730,000
Unfunded budget	*USD 8,46,000*	*USD 7,298,257*	*USD 5,6,733,257*	***USD 6,003,257***

The funding situation puts into evidence a clear gap between expectations and reality, with actual funding amounting at 48% of the projected budget. This can be considered as one of the major challenges of the project, and shows some lack of realism at project design and budget analysis/identification level. From an implementation perspective, this has led to the need for reorganizing outputs and activities around the actual budget received.

Shortage of funding was partially remedied through establishing partnerships with other UNDP regional initiatives in implementing mutual gender activities. In 2017, 54% of funds will be bestowed by the UNDP Regional Electoral Project. This considered, it can be concluded that the team and RBAS is making its best to optimize output delivery and to maximize results.

4.2.3.   Monitoring and Reporting

Original provisions foresee: Quarterly Progress Report (QPR); Issue Log, activated and updated by the Chief Technical Advisor (CTA); Risk log; Annual Project Progress Report (APPR); Project Lesson-learned log; Monitoring Schedule Plan[5].

In reality, reporting is essentially based on APPR, which are quite laconic. They contain – besides updates on activities and results - risk updates, main lessons learnt, and challenges. Although annual and quarterly progress reports include, as part of their standard template, sections on risks, issues, lessons learned and monitoring updates; they are not the only reporting instrument UNDP uses. These reports complement other corporate tools that update progress towards achieving results, such as the periodic monitoring update, the result-oriented annual report (ROAR), the transparency update, etc. Probably, a more articulated and in-depth reporting would be more useful in future for transparency, accountability and fundraising purposes, especially in case the project will in future have access to external funding, whose requirements are more demanding.

4.3.   Effectiveness

WHAT ARE THE MAIN CONTRIBUTIONS TO DEVELOPMENT FOR WHICH THE PROJECT IS RECOGNIZED IN THE REGION?

Documental review and interviews held with different stakeholders confirm that the project has represented a cornerstone for a broader and comprehensive discourse on gender equality and women's empowerment the Arab Region.

Main achievements - for which the project is renowned - are numerous. First of all Mosharaka has developed a regional database on legal rights of women and gender situation in Arab States. The Legal Country Profiles (LCPs) are consulted by a wide range of policy makers, civil society representatives and researchers. Moreover, the project has expanded and contributed to the consolidation of regional stakeholders, allowing different countries to jointly analyse and share best practices on women, peace and security, and on gender and elections.

It has contributed through training to build capacities of a core group of practitioners on advocacy and awareness tools. Another popular feature of Mosharaka is YLP, through which the project has built the capacity of youth to become leaders who disseminate awareness of GEWE and SDGs among their communities. All these results have contributed to the shaping up of effective networks that promote GEWE in a variety of areas, from constitution making to development. A stakeholders meeting held in May 2017 by Karama, AWO, and Cawtar discussed how their organizations are benefiting from Mosharaka to mobilize regional networks to promote the role of women in the Arab region. Karama presented the outcomes and progress of partnership with Mosharaka in building the capacities of women mediators to serve as advocates of the UNSC 1325 across the region. The AWO representative briefed the members on how AWO's partnership with Mosharaka on SDGs and gender equality provides a golden opportunity for gender mainstreaming across different sectors and areas. The stakeholders also commended Mosharaka's work on

---

[5] ProDoc.

the YLP and agreed to continue the programme's work with CAWTAR to develop an e-platform on the legal and human rights of women and men.

HOW HAS THE PROJECT ACHIEVED EXPECTED OUTCOMES?

The following table recapitulates the main achievements of Mosharaka towards indicators and expected outputs for 2015-2016. Data are taken from the annual progress reports; in red, data are taken from the Annexes of Progress Reports called *Progress Review: detailed matrix of activities and results.*

Project Output 1: Support regional and national actors and institutions to establish measures to advance gender equality, and women's political, social and economic participation.					
Output indicators	Targets	Progress against targets	Output indicators	Targets	Progress against targets
2015			**2016**		
Number of knowledge products on women legal profiles to fill gaps in legislations and laws published	Baseline: 0 AWP target: 20	Reporting period: 20 Cumulative total: the 20 Legal Country Profiles finalized (December) Arab Women development report and the e-platform	**Number of assessments and action-oriented analyses produced on the legal, social and economic conditions of women, and the degree of their circulation/ usage**	Baseline: 0 AWP target: 2	Reporting period: 1 Regional study, 1 global study
Number of consultations to enact meaningful/ practical legislative reforms to promote/ improve gender equality and women's empowerment held	Baseline: 3 AWP target: 4	Reporting period: 4 consultations Cumulative total: 4 consultations were held	**Number of meaningful/practical constitutional and legislative reform mechanisms adopted to improve women's access to decision making spaces**	Baseline: Not Adequately AWP target: Largely	Reporting period: Not Adequately
Level of support to regional networks on constitution, legislative reforms and judiciary to promote gender equality and women's empowerment	Baseline: Not Adequately AWP target: Largely	Reporting period: Largely	**Level of support to women as active agents in the electoral process**	Baseline: 0 AWP target: 1	Reporting period: 1 Cumulative total: 1 training workshop held for 40 participants
Number of gender sensitive initiatives on the role of women in elections held	Baseline: 0 AWP target: 1	Reporting period: 2 Cumulative total: 2 training workshop held for 40 participants	n.a.	n.a.	n.a

Number of initiatives by trained youth to promote leadership in the Arab Region with emphasis on gender equality and women's empowerment held	Baseline: 1 AWP target: 1	Reporting period: 1 Cumulative total: 1 workshop for 37 youth	Number of gender sensitive initiatives on social entrepreneurship among youth	Baseline: 0 AWP target: Largely	Reporting period: Largely

Project Output 2: Women peace and security frameworks to reinforce social cohesion and promote women's equal access to political and economic opportunities in early recovery and post-crisis settings established.					
Output indicators	**Targets**	**Progress against targets**	**Output indicators**	**Targets**	**Progress against targets**
2015			**2016**		
Number of women and men peace builders on conflict analysis, dialogue accompaniment, mediation and social mobilization trained	Baseline:0 AWP Target: 25	Reporting period: 25 Cumulative total: 25	Number trained of women and men peace builders on conflict analysis, dialogue accompaniment, mediation and social mobilization	Baseline:0 AWP Target: 25	Reporting period: 25 Cumulative total: 25
Number of documented stories, lessons learnt, best practices of women engaged in peace building activities prepared	Baseline: 0 AWP Target: 7	Reporting period: 7 Cumulative total: 7	Number prepared of documented stories, lessons learnt, best practices of women engaged in peace building activities	Baseline: 0 AWP Target: 7	Reporting period: 7 Cumulative total: 7

Good	
Partial	
Unsatisfactory	

4.3.1.   Output 1

One of the most evident and successful result of Mosharaka is the 20 <u>Legal Country Profiles</u> (LCPs), completed in the first year of the project. The LCPs provide an overview of the legal status of women in the different Arab countries and the available rights and opportunities, this providing a precious source of knowledge on main issues and lessons learnt.

The launching of the LCD was accompanied by capacity building training on the Legal Country Profiles as advocacy tool. Participants came from Sudan, Egypt, Lebanon, Jordan, Iraq, Palestine, Tunisia, Morocco, Oman, Kuwait, Somalia and Libya to discuss, debate and recommend possible strategies to policy makers.

To complete the action, the online database "Legal and Human Rights of Women and Men: Between Equality and Gaps" supported by UNDP, UN Women and CAWTAR was launched in 2016, containing laws from 20 Arab countries related to gender and human rights. The database includes the 20 LCP, detailed information on women human rights in health, labour, penal and personal codes. It aims to assist policy makers, researchers, women machineries and the civil society to assess, analyse and understand the legal status of women across the region. Information is provided in Arabic through a searchable online portal[6].

The flagship initiative of the project is certainly the <u>Youth Leadership Programme</u> (YLP), aimed at building the capacity of well-informed young women and men to promote gender equality and women's empowerment. YLP is a cooperation between Mosharaka, The UN Office of the Special Youth Envoy and UN Women– and is aimed at promoting a culture of inclusiveness, creativity and gender equality among youth. Linkages between UNDP and the youth participating in the initiative continue after the end of the programme. Interviews held by the evaluator with two participants confirm the high value of the YSL in creating regional networks of youth committed to values of tolerance, participation, empowerment, democracy, as well as in supporting creative and innovative thinking to break stereotypes and prejudices. More concretely, participating youth worked on developing initiatives to help their local communities, especially women living in conflict contexts. *The 20 youth ideas touched on themes ranging from the environment, to people with special needs, green energy, working with displaced people, and gender equality in education[7].* Many of the initiatives promoted women's role in building peace in their communities, through active participation in decision-making and negotiations. After the development of projects, ideas and initiatives were discussed, followed up and elaborated at a regional workshop that brought together more than 60 young men and women from 11 Arab Countries; finalists attended the ECOSOC meeting in New York 2017.

YLP – especially starting from the second year- has generated great interest within the participating countries, with some countries receiving up to 200 youth applications. Currently, a network of more than 100 youth (more than half of which are women) from 18 Arab Countries is active and is discussing how to promote the notion of tolerant, equal and effective leadership.

---

[6] http://www.arabwomenlegal-emap.org/. the database is also available as a mobile application (womenlegalemap)
[7] Progress Report 2015.

In the final stage of YLP2, a regional workshop was held in Kuwait on "Youth Actions towards SDGs" at the end of 2016. The workshop gathered more than 60 young men and women from 11 Arab countries including Jordan, Iraq, Palestine, Syria, Somalia, Sudan, Lebanon, UAE, Kuwait, Tunisia, and Egypt. The event reportedly reached an online audience of 4 million.

Another effective output of Mosharaka is the support provided to various networks on women, especially to promote the implementation of UNSCR 1325 on women peace and security.

In 2015, the project conducted four consultations for the regional network on constitution making and legal reform, women judges and women, peace and security and gender and elections. Networks comprise more than 200 active women, who provided concrete examples and life experiences on the role of women in peace building and reconciliation efforts in Syria, Libya and Yemen.

With regard to capacity building of national actors to advocate for legal changes regarding women rights, activities were conducted for stakeholders from Sudan, Egypt, Lebanon, Jordan, Iraq, Palestine, Tunisia, Morocco, Oman, Kuwait, Somalia and Libya. The aim was to have a group of well-informed national partners to promote the discourse on legal amendments.

A very significant achievement is the establishment of the first regional platform for women in SDGs in the Arab Region. That was organized through a regional conference entitled "Women in the Arab region and the 2030 Sustainable Development Agenda", hosted by the Arab Women Organization in partnership with UNDP Regional Bureau of Arab States, UN Women, and league of Arab States. The focus of the conference was the implementation of the post 2015 SDGs with respect to issues of gender equality and women's empowerment. SDGs were examined from a gender perspective, to foster accountability and commitment at senior levels. The conference saw the participation of 18 Arab Countries, 350 participants, representatives of national statistics agencies in Arab Countries and more than 4 million social media feedback. Inclusive recommendations for each 17 goals were introduced along with a platform for action to implement the SDGs 2030 for women in the Arab Region.

On elections, funds provided by the UNDP Regional Election Initiative and allocated throughout the entire duration of the project (including 2017) led to various activities. In 2015, a Capacity development workshop on gender and elections was held for 40 participants from women machineries, League of Arab States, NGOs and academia. The training focused on different electoral systems, quota systems and the role of women as voters and candidates, as well as prevention to electoral violence. Another workshop held in 2016 was focused on gender and electoral management bodies and *brought together key representatives from Arab EMBs to provide a forum for peer-to-peer discussion on a) the role of EMBs in enhancing women's participation, b) successes and existing good practices in policies and practices in the region, and b) the experience of EMBs from other regions including those from Asia, South Africa, Europe and Latin America.*[8] It is expected that activities will continue in 2017, as the related AWP states.

An initiative which was expected to produce more results was the support to the network of women judges, launched in 2015 with around 150 women judges from different Arab Countries. The objective of the

---

[8] Progress Report 2016.

network was to promote the role of women in the judicial system through protecting and promoting the rights of women to equal access to courts and contributing to a more transparent, fair, strong and committed system. However, currently the network is not active. In 2017 Mosharaka renewed its commitment to supporting and working closely with AWO and a new MOU was signed at the highest level of both organizations.

4.3.2.   Output 2

Output 2 – realized with Karama - aimed at supporting the implementation of UNDP's *8-point Agenda for Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality in Crisis Prevention and Recovery*. Focus was given to strengthening women's security in crisis; advancing gender justice; expanding women's citizenship, participation and leadership; building peace with and for women; promoting gender equality in disaster risk reduction; ensuring gender-responsive recovery; transforming government to deliver more and better for women; and developing capacities for social change. 2015 was a preparatory year, where preliminary meetings for training on conflict analysis, mediation and peacebuilding were held via skype, to brainstorm on needs and content of the training. No information is available on 2016 activities, although the report highlights that a total of 25 women peacebuilders was trained to act as mediators and resources for peace building and reconstruction efforts.

With regard to the envisaged development of success stories about women engaged in peace building activities, 7 stories are reported for year 2015. In June 2017, an expert meeting was held with UN Women and UfM on "Role of women and young people in promoting peace and preventing violent extremism in the Euro-Mediterranean region."

WHICH WERE THE MAIN WEAKNESSES OF THE PROJECT?

Major challenges hindering the results of Mosharaka are linked to the insufficient availability of resources. Scarcity of funds was described in the previous section. As for technical resources, the Progress Reports state that the issue is related to the *availability of documentation mechanisms to ensure the role of women in areas like constitution making and legislative reform is adequately promoted*. To partially reduce gaps in documentation, Mosharaka developed a regional video to document the role of women in constitution making and legislative reforms. Reports highlight the need for *looking closely into donor opportunities to mobilize resources for the various components on political, economic and social participations;* however, to date it seems that the interest of development partners in funding Mosharaka remains low, as the main sources of funding for 2017 are still TRAC and UNDP Regional Elections project.

Other challenges are related to the political and security situation in the region, which created some obstacles in participants' attendance to regional activities; sometimes attendance was cancelled. The mitigation measures reportedly were relocating participants from those nationalities in other countries with easier access and mobility.

From a project perspective, each training and workshop was conducted with a major regional partner - AWO, LAS, Karama and Cawtar - to ensure sustainability. On the other side, these efforts were hindered by a lack

of sufficient resources from early space to support the follow ups, until these activities have full capacity to be independent and sustainable.

4.4.   Sustainability

> **HOW EFFECTIVE HAVE BEEN PRACTICES AND TOOLS USED IN THE PROJECT? (BEST PRACTICES, INSTITUTIONAL STRENGTHENING, PARTNERSHIPS)**

4.4.1.   Best Practices

The 'inclusive' design of Mosharaka has proven to be successful in spreading information and knowledge about successful initiatives put in place at regional, but also international, level on issues of gender equality and women empowerment. 'Inclusive' means in this case that all possible layers of stakeholders were involved in project activities, from committed individuals to institutions; it also means that the regional character of the initiative has stimulated discussion and allowed to share experiences and devise new perspectives.

An example of it is Mosharaka continued willingness to collaborate and brainstorm with partners on the project's next steps. Several consultative meetings have been held throughout the project implementation period to discuss Mosharaka's contributions to its four thematic areas (peace and security, SDGs, gender justice and political participation).

The YLP initiative is also proving to greatly contribute to public awareness on, and recognition of GEWE as a key issue for development in the region. *The process of engaging youth as agents of change has opened their eyes to the challenges facing their communities. They became more engaged and felt the responsibility to create change in areas such as leadership among young women, social entrepreneurial ideas and building resilience among host communities and refugees[9].* Success is very visible when participating youth originate from communities; the high commitment of participants and their rapid absorption of new ideas, combined with their deep knowledge of local needs, constraints and dynamics, allow for formulating actions which can be really effective at community level and can contribute to change mind-sets. As commented in one of the project reports*, youth have proposed initiatives to ensure replication and effective outreach to local communities.[10]*

YLP aimed exactly at building a core group of well-informed young men and women on how to become effective leaders in their communities. Interaction among the 40 young women and men created space for learning concepts of tolerance, co-existence, respect, teamwork and analytical thinking to launch new and innovative discourse on gender equality and women's empowerment among the younger generation. The continued support UNDP is still providing to those youth, through involvement in various initiatives; and the support of social media (there is a FB page where YLP members exchange information and discuss)   has highly contributed to create a network of committed youth with solid perspectives of engagement in

---

[9] Progress Report 2016.
[10] Progress Report 2016.

developmental issues in the future. It is hoped that this network will continue existing after the end of Mosharaka.

4.4.2.   Partnerships

One of the declared intentions of the project was since the beginning to strengthen existing partnerships with civil society organization, political parties and parliaments towards developing new channels for collaboration with national, regional and international partners and UN agencies.

Stakeholders include national and regional civil society organizations, NGOs, women machineries, think tanks, labour unions and professional associations, the League of Arab States, national governments, parliaments, local authorities and councils, political parties, UN agencies and donors, and the private sector.

Partnerships established with regional networks (CAWTAR and Karama) helped expanding networks on peace and security, constitution making and legislative reform. In particular, the partnership with CAWTAR on legal country profiles has generated important inputs on the legal status of each Arab country; the online database has increased the usage and accessibility of the Legal Country profiles among interested researchers.

The cooperation with Karama has been essential in monitoring the implementation of the UNSCR 1325, through building core of well trained and experienced regional experts. Karama has maintained its work with the network advocating at the highest levels. It is present in major platforms advocating for the role of women on Peace and Security.

Another fruitful partnership was established with the broadcasting network MBC on supporting the regional youth leadership programme. In particular, information diffused by MBC has achieved high outreach and has generated interest in the programme in the target countries.

> **HAVE COMPLEMENTARITIES, COLLABORATION AND / OR SYNERGIES FOSTERED BY THE PROJECT CONTRIBUTED TO GREATER SUSTAINABILITY OF RESULTS?**

In terms of cooperation with other UN agencies, Mosharaka cooperation with the UNDP Regional Election Project has ensured that collaborative - if not joint - activities on gender are implemented. The collaboration focuses on building initiatives to promote women's participation at the political and social levels including election assistance and capacity building. In 2017, activities will focus on constitutional making and legislative reforms networks; conducting studies on temporary special measures to increase inclusive political participation.

Funds provided by UN Women have allowed working on strategic interventions, including the legal database on women rights in the Arab region. The cooperation focused on strategizing the work on women's empowerment in the social, political and public domains. In 2017, focus will be given to continuation of YSL and conduction of a technical meeting to support regional action plan on women, peace and security.[11]

---

[11] AWP 2017.

The project has supported a number of civil society networks; most of them are now autonomous and there is no doubt that advocacy and information activities would continue after the end of the project duration.

On the institutional side, although many activities have been put in place to sensitise governments on GEWE, it seems that there is still a long path to go before reaching substantial results. Political turmoil, instability and changes in governments, along with – in some cases – the persistence of stereotypes in mind-sets, are still impeding a proper consolidation of gender based approaches in regional policymaking.

Probably those external constraint factors are affecting the interest and commitment of development partners, which to date seem very hesitant in funding the initiative.

Yet, real impact on societal behaviours can only be achieved through continuous and resilient efforts. Contribution and involvement from the international donors' community are key in this sense; and it is sad to see that no sufficient attention is being currently paid to Mosharaka. Opportunities for external funding should be further explored in order not to lose the results achieved to date.

The user-friendly design of relevant sites developed or supported by the project favours the utilisation of the knowledge developed under Mosharaka.

The legal country profiles website established in cooperation with CAWTAR[12] seems to be rich in information and reports. It is reportedly largely used by researchers, advocates, practitioners, CSOs and probably policy makers, at least for information purposes.

Less information is available on the web on the Arab Regional Network on Peace and Security, jointly developed with Karama.

The Youth Leadership Programme makes large use of social media networks for dissemination and exchange of information. On the basis of interviews held, it is supposed that such exchanges are still active and are contributing to spread knowledge about GEWE principles in the region.

Participants, once the encounter is over, return to their own countries (while still remaining in contact with the other regional participants through instant messaging applications and social networks), with stronger ideas and equipped to have a greater impact in their communities. YLP runs yearly, and regardless of if a Change Makers' time has ended, they are still invited to contribute to new phases, like the recent alliance between YLP and Hult International Business School for the course titled "Business and Social Innovation"[i]. While adding sustainability and impact to the project, this creates a peer-to-peer support network among young people, who can build upon the experiences of others in previous years. This also boosts young people's role as SDGs accelerators, creating the potential to pass on their know-how and expertise to future

---

[12] http://www.arabwomenlegal-emap.org/SitePages/Home.aspx.

Change Makers. Youth who participate in the regional workshop are expected to share their learnings with national-level YLP participants. In this way, the programme aims to create a snowball effect, as youth help other youth, their communities, and their nations, potentially impacting thousands of people in the Arab world. In addition, YLP laureates act as inspirational speakers and mentors to their peers of the following years. This adds to the sustainability of the project, ensuring that its impact continues well beyond the project's duration through the relationships built between young people in the community.

5. Conclusions and Recommendations

5.1.   Main findings

The table below provides a concise recapitulation of the answers to evaluation questions.

Criteria	Low				High
Relevance					
Effectiveness					
Efficiency					
Sustainability					

5.2.   Lessons Learnt

1. Mosharaka has effectively stimulated and expanded the discourse on gender equality and women empowerment in a region which continues to present major needs in such issues.

2. Although the intervention presents a wide range of themes, issues and activities, these have been well structured and aligned with priorities, and coherently responded to both regional and national needs.

3. Partnerships with civil society organisations have proven to be successful in maximising effects, increasing ownerships and achieving outreach.

4. Cooperation with other UN agencies has brought about positive results in the implementation of specific specialised components (i.e. electoral issues, women participation).

5. Focus on youth, as well innovative aspects and features of the YLP, have greatly contributed to Mosharaka's effectiveness and impact perspectives.

6. Monitoring was not carried out according to the original provisions; although The RP has a consolidated monitoring framework for all projects, it would be advisable to further strengthen the monitoring arrangements of Mosharaka (if funds allow).

7. Continuity is required in order to take advantage of results and outputs developed under the programme. These achievements need to be consolidated; further funding and commitment from the international donors' community is highly necessary to achieve impact.

8. Sustainability issues should be better streamlined, starting from design. Project team and partners should insist more on the sustainability part of the reports, and should reflect on sustainability of actions to be implemented from the beginning.

9. Finally, sustainability should be better addressed in UN/UNDP programming. Although UNDP has revised its corporate ProDoc template in 2015 to strengthen coherence and other RBM aspects, this seems still not entirely reflected in projects' arrangements.

5.3.   Conclusions and Recommendations

Conclusions and recommendations are provided for each of the evaluation criteria utilised in this exercise.

Criterion	Conclusions	Recommendations	To whom?
Relevance	The programme is highly relevant to UNDP, regional and national policies and strategies.	No recommendation needed.	
Effectiveness	Most activities have proven to be highly effective in stimulating and expanding the discourse on GEWE in the region.	No recommendation needed.	
	Main challenges to achievement of results have been political turmoil, consolidated stereotypes and unavailability of estimated funds.	Whereas external factors cannot be avoided, additional resource mobilization channels should be explored for the initiative.	UNDP
Efficiency	Reports are quite concise and do not entirely reflect achievements and results	No recommendation needed.	

Criterion	Conclusions	Recommendations	To whom?
Sustainability	Mosharaka needs to be continued and adequate funding should be provided	There were donors that couldn't be reached out for sufficient resource mobilization. To explore resource mobilization from other potential donors.	UNDP
	Sustainability should be better addressed	Although sustainability assessment is done through the annual Quality Assurance (QA) exercise, an exit plan/strategy should be developed.	UNDP

Annex 1. ToRs

Regional Programme for Arab States Terms of reference for Individual Contractor RPAS Projects Evaluation

A.   Project Title

Regional Programme for Arab States

B.   Project Description

UNDP Regional Programme for Arab States (2014-2017) was endorsed by the UNDP Executive Board during the First Regular Session of the Executive Board at the end of January 2014. It represents 4 out of 7 development outcome areas of the UNDP Strategic Plan, namely:

- **Inclusive growth:** Growth is inclusive and sustainable, incorporating productive capacities that create employment and livelihoods for the poor and excluded (SP Outcome 1)
- **Inclusive governance:** Citizen expectations for voice, effective development, the rule of law and accountability are met by stronger systems of democratic governance (SP Outcome 2)
- **Gender:** Faster progress is achieved in reducing gender inequality and promoting women's
- empowerment (SP Outcome 4)
- **Social cohesion and resilience:** Early recovery and rapid return to sustainable development pathways are achieved in post-conflict and post-disaster settings (SP Outcome 6)

Project 1. Aid for Trade Initiative for Arab State (AfTIAS)

AfTIAS contributes to outcome 1 of the Regional Programme for the Arab States:
- Growth is inclusive and sustainable, incorporating productive capacities that create employment and livelihoods for the poor and excluded (SP Outcome 1).

The Regional Programme for the Arab States launched the AfTIAS project in 2014 to work towards deepening Arab Economic Integration, through gradual modernization of trade and economic policy-making. It has two lines of work: trade facilitation through cross-border operations and provision of support to the League of Arab States (LAS) to revitalize the Pan-Arab Free Trade Agreement (PAFTA) and to modernize the Arab Customs Union.

The project has the following specific outputs:

-        Output 1: Arab connectivity and linkages through promotion of crossing borders operations and integrated management systems strengthened.

-        Output 2: Capacity of Economic Sector of the LAS in trade policy reform enhanced and

31

monitoring of implementation progress of GAFTA enhanced in support of implementation of measures under decisions by the 2015 Arab Economic and Social Development Summit.

-        Output 3: Skills and abilities of key national partners to mainstream gender equality priorities into cross border trade policies in the AMU sub region strengthened.

Through the implementation phase, AfTIAS supported Egypt and Jordan in the adoption on National Single Windows, a facility that allows parties involved in trade and transport to lodge standardized information and documents with a single-entry point to fulfil all import, export, and transit-related regulatory requirements. The project also assisted the Government of Iraq to improve collection of customs revenues and tackle smuggling of goods.   On cross-border operations, the project worked on facilitating trade and transport corridors across the Askeit/Qustol border crossing, between Sudan and Egypt. The two countries adopted a Customs Declaration for exchange of data that facilitates cross-border trade operations and these interventions contributed to reduce transportation costs by 50 percent.

Thanks to the support AfTIAS provided to the Arab Economic Integration Department (AEID) of LAS, the negotiations on the PAFTA started again after 12 years of stalemate and concluded with the Beirut negotiations in February 2017, with an agreement reached on the liberalization of trade in services. AFTIAS also supported AEID to develop the capacity of its staff and increase the efficiency of its work, which resulted in the Department being the only ISO-certified department in LAS. Following consultations with LAS and its Arab Custom Union, a proposal for the modernization of customs-related policies was developed. Thanks to the support of the Swedish International Development Agency (SIDA), AFTIAS in
2017 will scale up the work carried out so far and expand its portfolio of activities, including support to the implementation of the Trade and Service agreement. AFTIAS, jointly with Arab Development Portal team, will also implement a project to further explore the linkages between Trade and the SDGs, with the objective to develop trade-related indicators for the Arab Region.

Project 2. Anti-Corruption and Integrity in the Arab Countries (ACIAC)

ACIAC contributes to outcome 2 of the Regional Programme for the Arab States:
•   Citizen expectations for voice, effective development, the rule of law and accountability are met by stronger systems of democratic governance (SP Outcome 2).

In response to demand from key stakeholders across the region and the findings of extensive consultations that were held in 2014, the Regional Programme for the Arab States extended the regional project on Anti-Corruption and Integrity in Arab Countries (ACIAC), which was launched in 2011. Having succeeded in producing specialized knowledge and supporting inclusive policy dialogues towards the implementation of the UN Convention against Corruption (UNCAC) in more than six Arab countries during its first phase (2011-2014), ACIAC seeks to build on the achievements made and the lessons learned to support deeper governance reforms for sustainable development.

The new phase (2015-2018) is focused on enabling institutions and systems to address corruption through awareness, prevention and enforcement across sectors and stakeholders (SP output 2.2) with the aim of contributing to the attainment of additional progress towards stronger systems of governance that meet citizens' expectations for accountability (SP outcome 2). To reach its goal, ACIAC strives to achieve three key outputs (i) national capacities enhanced to draft, implement and monitor laws that prevent and combat

corruption; (ii) specific initiatives supported to design, advocate and integrate measures that strengthen transparency and accountability in key vulnerable sectors; and (iii) participatory platforms fostered to promote, inform and review strategies that link anti-corruption to sustainable development.

A new line of work on youth and integrity is being initiated. Key partners in this project are the Arab Anti-Corruption and Integrity Network (ACINET), national anti-corruption bodies and Siemens Integrity Initiative.

Under the first output, it enhanced national capacities in Iraq, Egypt and Tunisia to draft, implement and monitor laws, in compliance with the UN Convention against Corruption (UNCAC) related to asset declarations, conflict of interest management, anti-illicit enrichment and whistle-blower protection. It also collaborated with the UN Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) to train practitioners from Palestine, Yemen and the countries of the Gulf Cooperation Council on reviewing the implementation of the UNCAC in preparation for the second cycle of the Review Mechanism.

Under the second output, ACIAC supported the anchoring of sectoral approaches in national anti- corruption policies and programmes in Egypt, Iraq, Jordan, Libya, Morocco and Tunisia. It also made important progress in developing specific tools and specialized training programmes that will help key stakeholders in the region to prevent corruption in the health, customs and justice sectors, while enabling the development of partnerships between Korea and each of Jordan and Tunisia to strengthen transparency and accountability in the construction sector of the first country and the health, customs, police and municipal sectors in the second country.

Under the third output, ACIAC fostered ten participatory regional and country-specific platforms to promote linkages between anti-corruption and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), reaching more than eight hundred persons, including more than two hundred women, in 18 Arab countries, with the biggest outreach achieved in Iraq Lebanon, Morocco and Tunisia. This was achieved mostly in the framework of the Arab Anti-Corruption and Integrity Network (ACINET), the university youth networks and the new platforms established to promote sectoral work and collective action across region.
In parallel, the ACIAC project enhanced its collaboration with other regional and international organizations and established synergies with related initiatives of the UNDP Regional Hub for the Arab States, while responding to related assistance requests from the UNDP Country Offices in Bahrain, Egypt, Iraq, Jordan, Lebanon, Palestine, Saudi Arabia, Sudan, Tunisia and the United Arab Emirates as well as the UN Country Team in Libya.

Project 3. Fostering Inclusive Participation and Effective Contribution of Women in the Public Sphere (Mosharaka)

Mosharaka contributes to Outcome 3 of the Regional Programme for the Arab States:
- Faster progress is achieved in reducing gender inequality and promoting women's empowerment (SP Outcome 4).

The Regional Programme for the Arab States launched the Mosharaka project in 2014 and is expected to conclude its first phase and start the second one in 2017. The project was developed to respond to the increasing demand for addressing the deficits in the public participation and citizenship rights of women in the Arab Region, especially in transition, fragile and post conflict societies.

It has been formulated through background research and a consultative process with regional stakeholders. Preliminary research for the project has concluded that while the Arab region is witness to a range of gender biases, the region particularly lags behind in terms of women's participation in public life. In effect, and realizing that gender inequality is indivisible, the project proposed to focus on women empowerment and fostering their participation in the public sphere as a vehicle towards promoting gender equality in both the public and the private sphere.

The project has the following specific outputs that focus on strengthening participation, expanding opportunities and securing women's rights in the region:

-        Output 1: Support regional and national actors and institutions to establish measures to advance gender equality, and women's political, social and economic participation (Strategic Plan Output #4.1, #4.3, #4.4) (RBAS Regional Program Output 3.1).

-        Output 2: Establish women peace and security frameworks to reinforce social cohesion and promote women's equal access to political and economic opportunities in early recovery and post-crisis settings (Strategic Plan Output #6.4; #4.2 RBAS Output #4.1).

These outputs have been realized through a multi-dimensional integrated approach and project/package of initiatives targeting various sectors and a multiplicity of regional and national stakeholders. These initiatives are primarily focused on knowledge management, capacity development, advocacy, networking, and alliance and coalition building between partners.

The project has been supporting regional and national actors to establish measures to advance gender equality and women's political, social and economic participation. It works through regional NGOs and women activists/advocates networks to advance efforts in constitution making and legislative reform. One of the key focuses is SDGs and gender equality to ensure effective and gender sensitive implementation at the national level.   The project also supports NGOs networks to reinforce social cohesion and promote women's role in the implementation of peace and security agenda.   Mosharaka also includes a Youth Leadership Programme (YLP) to support young women and men's empowerment. Key partnerships have been forged with UNWOMEN and the Centre of Arab Women for Training & Research (CAWTAR).

During the implementation phase, Mosharaka launched an online platform on legal and human rights and has supported national electoral bodies to integrate gender throughout the electoral cycle. A regional think-tank on SDGs and gender was established with the Arab Women Organization, UNFPA and UNWOMEN. Mosharaka also launched phase II of the YLP which convened a conference in mid-December in Kuwait. In 2017, the project will aim at further strengthening the partnerships with regional networks (Karama, CAWTAR, etc.) to advance gender equality and women's social/economic participation and to enhance women's role in peace and security. Also phase 3 of YLP will be implemented.

In line with the Evaluation Plan, an evaluation will be conducted to assess UNDP-RBAS contributions towards the progress made on achievements of selected projects contributing to the first three outcome areas respectively (described in the table below) as a tool to explain results.

Project title	Regional Programme Outcome	Project Outputs
Project 1. Aid for Trade Initiative for Arab State (AfTIAS)	RP Outcome 1. Growth is inclusive and sustainable, incorporating productive capacities that create employment and livelihoods for the poor and excluded.	**Output 1:** Arab connectivity and linkages through the promotion of crossing borders operations and integrated management systems strengthened; **Output 2:** Capacity of Economic Sector of the LAS in trade policy reform and monitoring of implementation progress of GAFTA enhanced in support of implementation of measures under decisions by the 2015 Arab Economic and Social Development Summit; **Output 3:** Skills and abilities of key national partners to mainstream gender equality priorities into cross border trade policies in the AMU sub region strengthened.
Project 2. Anti-Corruption and Integrity in the Arab Countries (ACIAC)	RP Outcome 2. Citizen expectations for voice, effective development, the rule of law and accountability are met by stronger systems of democratic governance.	**Output 1:** Number of countries having developed action-oriented reports identifying UNCAC compliance and capacity gaps, technical assistance needs and related priorities (2011-2014); **Output 2:** National capacities enhanced to draft, implement and monitor laws that prevent and combat corruption; **Output 3:** Specific initiatives supported to design, advocate and integrate measures that strengthen transparency and accountability in key vulnerable sectors; **Output 4:** Participatory platforms fostered to promote, inform and review strategies that link anti-corruption to sustainable development.
Project 3. Fostering Inclusive Participation and Effective Contribution of Women in the Public Sphere (Mosharaka)	RP Outcome 3. Faster progress is achieved in reducing gender inequality and promoting women's empowerment.	**Output 1:** Regional and national actors and institutions supported to establish measures to advance gender equality, and women's political, social and economic participation; **Output 2:** Women peace and security frameworks established to reinforce human security and advance women's economic opportunities in early recovery and post-crisis settings.

The evaluation is commissioned by UNDP as an internal requirement. It will be conducted by an independent consultant. It will assess the progress and challenges of the selected projects, taking the linkages to the broader contribution of the projects at the outcome level, with measurement of the output level achievements and gaps and in particular, what changes were achieved as a result of the projects contribution. The purpose of the evaluation is foremost to assess how the projects impacted the progress towards the achievement of these objectives. Moreover, the contribution of the project in enabling a coherent development engagement, and to identify the factors that have affected its implementation will be assessed.

The evaluation will consist of a desk review based research, two missions to meet with the projects teams and key stakeholders, and conduct in-depth interviews with key stakeholders and beneficiaries. It will document results achieved, the challenges faced, and how those challenges were addressed. It is also expected to identify success stories, good practices, challenges, constraints, and lessons learned, and to provide recommendations on substantive and process issues to inform the implementation

process for the upcoming phase of the projects.

C.   Scope of Work

This assignment will be based on a number of stakeholders' interviews and desk research, supplemented by meetings with key counterparts. The *Evaluator* will be responsible of:

1. Conducting **desk review based research**;
2. Conducting **two field visits** to meet with the project teams and stakeholders in the field; and
3. Providing **3 analytical reports**, each containing an executive summary (mandatory), be analytical in nature (both quantitative and qualitative), be structured around issues and related findings/lessons learned; and include conclusions and recommendations.

To achieve the above, the *Evaluator* will work with the project teams in Amman and Beirut under the supervision of the Regional Programme Coordinator, based on the workplan enclosed as Annex 1.

The overall results of the three key projects contributing to the three respective outcomes should be evaluated since the start of each project's current phase that falls within the present Regional Programme Document's period (2014-2017).

The below is the timeframe

-       AfTIAS (1st of April 2014 till 31st of March of 2017);
-       ACIAC (1st of October 2015 till 31st of March 2017);
-       Mosharaka (1st of April 2014 till 31st of March of 2017).

The specific objectives for each of the three projects are to:

1. Assess progress towards attaining the project's objectives;
2. Assess progress towards the achievement of the project's outcome;
3. Review the clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various agencies and stakeholders and the level of coordination between relevant actors in the project implementation;
4. Assess the likelihood of continuation of the project outcome and benefits;
5. Describe key factors that will require attention in order to improve prospects for sustainability of the project results;
6. Analyze the relevance of the project strategy and approaches;
7. Assess the potential for sustainability of the results and the feasibility of ongoing efforts and commitment to help advance the focus areas of the project;
8. Document key lessons learned, good practices, success stories and challenges to inform future work of various stakeholders in addressing the focus area of the project; and
9. Document and analyze possible weaknesses in order to improve next steps of project interventions in the focus areas.

D.   Expected Outputs and Deliverables

Expected Outputs and Deliverables	Target Due Dates	Review and Approvals Required
Output 1: Evaluation inception report structured into three sections for each project (including evaluation workplan and timeframe, and using the Sample Evaluation Matrix-Table A below)	6 working days from contract signature	Regional Programme Coordinator
Output 2: Draft three evaluation reports Draft evaluation findings. Documented records of interviews and observations with stakeholders. Presentation of findings to key stakeholders Draft report delivered to UNDP for consideration and comments.	18 days after the submission of the inception report	Regional Programme Coordinator
Output 3: Three reports of maximum 25 pages each in word document format with tables/graphs where appropriate will be submitted after the completion of the mission, incorporating comments made on the draft	3 days after receiving the comments of UNDP	Regional Programme Coordinator

E.   Institutional Arrangement

- o   The individual is required to exhibit his or her full-time commitment with UNDP-RBAS;
- o   S/He shall perform tasks under the general guidance and the direct supervision of the Regional Programme Coordinator. The supervision of the Regional Programme Coordinator will include approvals/acceptance of the outputs as identified in the previous section;
- o   The individual is expected to liaise and collaborate in the course of performing the work with other consultants, suppliers and UN colleagues;
- o   The individual is required to maintain close communication with the UNDP-RBAS on regular and needed basis at any period throughout the assignment in order to monitor progress. In the event of any delay, S/he will inform UNDP promptly so that decisions and remedial action may be taken accordingly;
- o   Should UNDP deem it necessary, it reserves the right to commission additional inputs, reviews or revisions, as needed to ensure the quality and relevance of the work.

F.   Duration of the Work

The duration of the work is expected to be 27 working days over period of two months from contract signature date.

G.   Duty Station

- ▪   This is a home-based assignment.

▪   Part of this assignment may require the individual to travel to different Arab and non-Arab Countries. In such cases, for unforeseen travel, and after seeking relevant approvals, all related travel and accommodation expenses will be arranged and covered by UNDP in line with applicable rules and regulations.

H.   Qualifications of the Individual Contractor

Master's degree in law, social sciences, management or other relevant fields.

II.   <u>Work Experience:</u>
- ▪ Minimum 7 years of experience in implementation / evaluation of projects/programmes on advancing development related issues; preferably some experience of these in the Arab countries;
- ▪ Proven work experience in use of participatory evaluation methods for identifying measurable target indicators and in particular for identifying outcome / impact – positive change of behavior, policy or law made;
- ▪ Experience in cooperation with multilateral agencies would be an asset;
- ▪ Experience in leading multi-disciplinary teams to deliver quality products in high stress and short deadline situations;
- ▪ Previous experience working for the UN is a plus.

III.   <u>Language Requirements</u>
- ▪ Language proficiency in both written and oral English is required. Knowledge of Arabic and/or French is an asset.

IV.   <u>Key Competencies</u>

o *Corporate*
- ▪ Demonstrates integrity and fairness, by modelling the UN/UNDP's values and ethical standards;
- ▪ Promotes the vision, mission and strategic goals of UNDP;
- ▪ Displays cultural, gender, religion, race, nationality and age sensitivity and adaptability.

o *Functional*
- ▪ Solid experience in facilitation high level meetings;
- ▪ Strong background experience including familiarity with UNDP systems, requirements, procedures, and rules & regulations;
- ▪ Solid understanding of international standards and experiences in programming on development issues;
- ▪ Demonstrated ability to assess complex situations in order to succinctly and clearly distil critical issues;
- ▪ Must be a self-starter and can work independently with excellent demonstrated teamwork, coordination and facilitation skills;
- ▪ Excellent analytical and report writing skills;
- ▪ Strong writing skills including technical reports, general reports, and proposals;
- ▪ Flexibility and ability to handle multiple tasks and work under pressure;
- ▪ Excellent computer skills especially Word, Excel and Power Point;

o *Leadership*
- Demonstrated ability to think strategically and to provide credible leadership;
- Demonstrated intellectual leadership and ability to integrate knowledge with broader strategic overview and corporate vision;
- Demonstrated flexibility in leadership by performing and/or overseeing the analysis/resolution of complex issues;
- Strong managerial/leadership experience and decision-making skills
- Ability to conceptualize and convey strategic vision from the spectrum of development experience;

o *Managing Relationships*
- Demonstrated well developed people management and organizational management skills;
- Excellent negotiating and networking skills with strong partnerships in academia, technical
- organizations and as a recognized expert in the practice area;

o *Managing Complexity*
- Ability to address global development issues;
- Substantive knowledge and understanding of development cooperation with the ability to support the practice architecture of UNDP and inter-disciplinary issues;
- Demonstrated substantive leadership and ability to integrate knowledge with broader
- strategic, policy and operational objectives;
- A sound global network of institutional and individual contacts.

o *Knowledge Management and Learning*
- Ability to strongly promote and build knowledge products;
- Promotes knowledge management in UNDP and a learning environment in the office through leadership and personal example;
- Seeks and applies knowledge, information and best practices from within and outside of UNDP;
- Provides constructive coaching and feedback;
- Demonstrates a strong capacity for innovation and creativity in providing strategic policy advice and direction.

o *Judgment/Decision-Making*
- Mature judgment and initiative;
- Proven ability to provide strategic direction to the project implementation process;
- Independent judgment and discretion in advising on handling major policy issues and challenges, uses diplomacy and tact to achieve result.

I.   Scope of Price Proposal and Schedule of Payments

All proposals must be expressed in a lump sum amount. This amount must be "all-inclusive". Please note that the terms "all-inclusive" implies that all costs (professional fees, travel costs, living allowances, communications, consumables, etc.) that could possibly be incurred are already factored into the final amounts submitted in the proposal. Also, please note that the contract price will be Deliverables/Outputs based - not fixed - subject to change in the cost components.

The contractor will be paid an all-inclusive Deliverables/Outputs based lump sum amounts over the assignment period, subject to the submission of Certification of Payment (CoP) duly certified and confirmation of satisfactory performance of achieved work (deliverables/outputs) in line with the schedule of payments table hereunder.

Milestone	Estimated due date	Payment
Milestone 1: Successful delivery of Output 1, 2, & 3 identified in section "D" above	Within 27 working days over period of two months from contract signature date	Up to 100% of total contract amount disbursed in USD and upon confirmation of satisfactory performance

Annex 2. Work plan

Deliverable	Task	Date
PRE-INCEPTION PHASE		
Contacts with UNDP RBAS	Contacts to touch base, clarify scope and purposes of the evaluation, collect the first set of documentation	First half of May 2017
INTERVIEWS PHASE (field)		
Participation at the UNDP Regional Conference in Amman	Interviews with project staff, partners and stakeholders	22-23 May 2017
Field mission in Beirut	Joint consultations with stakeholders, including interviews with key informants, to collect information and views on the three projects	20-21 June 2017
INCEPTION PHASE		
Work on available documentation, and interviews	Synthesize relevant information from documents	22-23 Jun 2017
Work on Inception report:	Prepare the Inception Report comprehensive of desk review, design of the evaluation, the matrix, a detailed work plan	24-26 Jun 2017
Delivery of the IR		**26 Jun 2017**
SYNTHESIS - REVIEW PHASE		
Draft evaluation reports	Reviewing all data and documents and stakeholders' inputs, prepare a draft evaluation report, each being structured around issues and related findings/lessons learned, and containing: - an executive summary (mandatory), - analytical data (both quantitative and qualitative), - conclusions and recommendations	23 Jun – 19 Jul 2017
Debriefing with UNDP RBAS	to validate and discuss findings, to improve the relevance of findings, conclusions and recommendations and to increase the relevance and ownership of the final document	As decided by UNDP RBAS

Submission of Draft Report		**20 Jul 2017**
FINAL PHASE		
Work on final report	Finalize final report incorporating comments of stakeholders	Upon receipt of comments
Submission of Final Evaluation report		**As ready**

▢ Phases

▢ Deliverables

Annex 3. From Tasks to EQs

Criterion	Tasks (as per ToRs)	Related EQ
Relevance	Analyse the relevance of the project strategy and approaches	**Do the projects' structures and objectives address key issues, their underlying causes, and challenges identified in the region?** **Was the design of the projects adequate to expected objectives, and flexible enough to adapt to potential changes?**
Efficiency	Review the clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various agencies and stakeholders and the level of coordination between relevant actors in the project implementation	**Was management adequate to the planning and execution requirements? (management Arrangements, work planning, finance, value for money, timing and delays, project-level monitoring and evaluation systems, coordination, stakeholder engagement, reporting, communications)**
Effectiveness	Assess progress towards attaining the project's objectives Assess progress towards the achievement of the project's outcome Document and analyse possible weaknesses in order to improve next steps of project interventions in the focus areas Document key lessons learned, good practices, success stories and challenges to inform future work of various stakeholders in addressing the focus area of the projects	**What are the main contributions to development for which the projects are recognized in the region?** **How have the projects achieved expected outcomes?** **What are the unexpected outcomes or consequences they yielded? What are their implications?** **Which were the main weaknesses of the projects?** **How effective have been practices and tools used in the projects? (best practices, institutional strengthening, partnerships)**
Sustainability	Review the clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various agencies and stakeholders and the level of coordination between relevant actors in the project implementation Assess the likelihood of continuation of the project outcome and benefits Describe key factors that will require attention in order to improve prospects for sustainability of the project results Assess the potential for sustainability of the results and the feasibility of ongoing efforts	**Have complementarities, collaboration and / or synergies fostered by the project contributed to greater sustainability of results?** **Have efforts produced durable results in the national capacities in government and civil society?** **Have any outcomes of the projects been translated into budgeted state programmes/policies?** **Are knowledge materials produced in the project being still used or disseminated?**

	and commitment to help advance the focus areas of the project	

Annex 4. Evaluation Matrix

Relevant Criteria	Key Questions	Sub Criteria	Sub Questions	Sources of information	Stakeholders	Methods for Data Analysis
Relevance	*The extent to which the Outcome activities are suited to the priorities and policies of the country at the time of formulation* **Are we doing the right things?**	Alignment	1.1. Do the projects' structures and objectives address key issues, their underlying causes, and challenges identified in the region?	Country policies and strategies, references, UN reports, media	UNDP	Desk review, interviews with partners
		Design	1.2. Was the design of the projects adequate to expected objectives, and flexible enough to adapt to potential changes?	UN reports, programme reports, portfolio analysis	UNDP	Desk review, interviews
Effectiveness	*The extent to which the Outcome activities attain its objectives* **Are the things we are doing working?**	Credibility	2.1. What are the main contributions to development for which the project is recognized in the region?	Programme reports, Comparison of reports to work plans; evaluation reports; ROAR	UNDP	Desk review, interviews
		Achievements	2.2 How have the projects achieved expected outcomes?	ROAR, progress reports	UNDP	Desk review, interviews

			2.3 What are the unexpected outcomes or consequences they yielded? What are their implications?	Project reports, workplans, ROARs, project beneficiaries	As above	Desk review, interviews
		Fallout effect				
		Challenges	2.4 Which were the main weaknesses of the projects?	Project reports, ROARs	UNDP ,	Desk review, interviews
		Best practices	2.5. How effective have been practices and tools used in the projects? (best practices, institutional strengthening, partnerships)	Evidence from project reports, ROARs	All stakeholders	Desk review, interviews
Efficiency	*Measurement of the outputs in relation to the inputs* **Are we doing things right?**	Organisational Efficiency	3.1 Was management adequate to the planning and execution requirements? (management arrangements, work planning, finance, value for money, timing and delays, project-level monitoring and evaluation systems, coordination, stakeholder engagement, reporting, communications)	Evidence of fund disbursement being appropriate to maximise utility Evidence of decision making, programme adjustment and learning Evidence of a performance management system having been established and utilised for decision making Evidence of coordination	UNDP	Desk review, interviews

Sustainability	*The benefits of the Programme related activities that are likely to continue after the Programme fund has been exhausted* **Will the changes last?**	Institutional sustainability	4.1 Have efforts produced durable results in the national capacities in governments and civil society?	Evidence of improvements in performances and progress in related sectors/areas	UNDP	Desk review Interviews
		Coordination	4.2 Have complementarities, collaboration and / or synergies fostered by the project contributed to greater sustainability of results?	Evidence of results from cooperation at regional level Cooperation between regional projects and COs Reports, ROARs	UNDP	Interviews Desk review
		Financial and policy sustainability	4.3 Have any outcomes of the projects been translated into budgeted state programmes/policies?	Integration of project outcomes into national planning, budgeting and monitoring systems Financial flows within institutions to maintain outcomes	Project reports, ROARs, national/regio nal reports	Interviews Desk review
		Knowledge sustainability	4.4 Are knowledge materials produced in the project being still used or disseminated?	Embedding of knowledge material into institutional practices, evidence of use of knowledge material	Project reports, ROARs, beneficiaries	Interviews Desk review

Annex 5. List of Meetings

1. Meetings held at the Regional Conference on "Development challenges and priorities in a changing Arab region"
Amman, 22-23 May 2017

	Interview	Partner	Contact Person	Contact Information	Address
Mosharaka	completed	Karama	Hibaaq Osman	hibaaq@el-karama.org	Egypt
Mosharaka	completed	Youth	Hayfa Sdiri		Tunisia
Mosharaka	completed	Youth	Moneera Yas		Sudan

2. Meetings held during the field mission to Beirut UNDP RBAS
20-21 June 2017

Day	Office	Contact Person	Contact Information	Address
20/6	UNDP RBAS Beirut	Maya Abi-Zeid	maya.abi-zeid@undp.org	Beirut
	Mosharaka Team	Kawtar Zerouali	kawtar.zerouali@undp.org	Amman
21/6	UNDP RBAS Amman	Yakup Beris	yakup.beris@undp.org	Amman
	UNDP RBAS Beirut	Abusabeeb Elsadig	abusabeeb.elsadig@undp.org	Beirut
	UNDP RBAS Beirut	Maya Abi-Zeid	maya.abi-zeid@undp.org	Beirut

Annex 6. Literature and documentation consulted

Document	Type	Year	No. of Documents
UNDP Strategic Plan (2014-2017)	General/Global	2014-2017	1
UNDP Strategic Plan - Integrated Results and Resources Framework (IRRF)	General/Global	2013	1
Regional Programme Document (2014-2017)	Regional	2014-2017	1
Results Oriented Annual Report (ROAR) 2014-2016	Regional	2014	3
Documents from Regional Consultation, Amman, May 2017	Regional	2017	7
Other RP documents	Regional (3 projects)	2017	13
RBAS Financial Table	3 projects	2017	1
ProDoc	Project Specific	2014	1
Progress Reports (Annual)	Project Specific	2015, 2016	2
Concept Note	Project Specific	2014	1
Regional Consultation Report	Project Specific	2014	
Annual Work Plans	Project Specific	2015, 2016, 2017	3

---

i More information (page 7): http://www.arabhumanrights.org/Helper/ExportPdf.ashx?iid=8