**Deepening linkages between formal/non-formal VET system and the labour market needs in the context of lifelong learning in Georgia**

**Evaluation Report**

An Independent Evaluation of the Project Results

Author: Thea Jamaspishvili

December 2017

**Table of Contents**

[**Executive Summary** 3](#_Toc505168978)

[**Introduction and Background Information** 5](#_Toc505168979)

[**Project Evaluation Methodology** 5](#_Toc505168980)

[**Key Findings of the Evaluation** 7](#_Toc505168981)

[**Assessment of the Project Results, Outputs, Outcomes and Impact** 7](#_Toc505168982)

[**Partnerships and Project Implementation Modality** 11](#_Toc505168983)

[**Sectors of Vocational Education Programmes and Target Groups** 11](#_Toc505168984)

[**Preparation period preceding the project start** 11](#_Toc505168985)

[**Target Beneficiaries Covered** 12](#_Toc505168986)

[**Quality Assurance** 12](#_Toc505168987)

[**National (macro) and local (micro) level work** 12](#_Toc505168988)

[**Public Private Partnership (PPP) in Agara Public School Vocational College** 14](#_Toc505168989)

[**Project Innovations / innovative concepts and approaches** 15](#_Toc505168990)

[**Evaluation of the Project Employment Schemes** 16](#_Toc505168991)

[**Project Achievements and Overcome Challenges** 17](#_Toc505168992)

[**Cross-cutting issues: Gender** 17](#_Toc505168993)

[**Cross-cutting issues: People with Disabilities** 18](#_Toc505168994)

[**Conclusions and Recommendations** 19](#_Toc505168995)

[**Sustainability of the Project** 20](#_Toc505168996)

[**Annexes** 20](#_Toc505168997)

# **Executive Summary**

The present report is an Independent Evaluation of the EU funded project “Deepening Linkages Between Formal / Non-Formal VET System and the Labour Market Needs in the Context of Lifelong Learning in Georgia” implemented by UNDP in Georgia in 2015-2017 that aimed to address the mismatch between the vocational education and labour market needs within a broader lifelong learning context in Georgia.

The project evaluation took place upon the end of the project in October-November 2017 and reviewed the project implementation since the beginning of the project until its end. Information on the relevance, timeliness, effectiveness and sustainability of the project and its results were collected and the results were incorporated in the present report.

The project evaluation process involved a combination of methods, including desk review and document analysis, field visits, and interviews with key stakeholders of the project, namely: visits to the project partner on their locations in Agara (Shida Kartli region) Public School Vocational College, Lakada Vocational Colleges in Jvari, Tsalenjikha, Samegrelo-Zemo Svaneti region and another visit to Tetnuldi Vocational College in Mestia, Samegrelo-Zemo Svaneti region; meetings were held with the UNDP Project team, The Ministry of Education and Science (MoES), The Ministry of Labour, Health and Social Affairs (MoLHSA), National Centre for Enhancing the Quality of Education (NCEQE), and the European Union Delegation monitoring group. As a result of these field visits and interviews a consolidated feedback in the form of the present Evaluation Report has been produced on whether and how the Project met the expectations, achieved targets in sustainable manner.

The following criteria where used to review the project, its impact and the results achieved: relevance, timeliness, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability. The following aspects were evaluated and the findings integrated in the present report: project concept and design; implementation; project outputs, outcomes and impact; cross cutting issues; visibility.

The main part of the present evaluation report discusses in a greater detail *the key findings of the project*, the progress made and results achieved by the project as a results of the conducted assessment of the project results, outputs, outcomes and impact. The key findings of the present evaluation report discuss the following aspects of evaluation:

1. partnerships and project implementation modality;
2. sectors of Vocational Education Programmes and target groups;
3. preparation period preceding the project start;
4. target beneficiaries covered;
5. quality assurance;
6. national (macro) and local (micro) level work;
7. Public Private Partnership (PPP) in Agara Public School Vocational College;
8. project innovations / innovative concepts and approaches;
9. evaluation of the project employment schemes;
10. achievements of the project and overcome challenges;
11. cross-cutting issues, such as gender and people with disabilities.

The present evaluation report also presents a developed *set of recommendations and next steps* to strengthen the achieved results and sustain the positive impact achieved by the project. More specifically, a continued partnership with the VET Colleges is recommended from the side of both the MoES and UNDP to ensure the sustainability of the implemented capacity-building efforts. Continued partnership with the VET Colleges is also recommended to sustain the positive impact created by the project on local level.

Participatory approaches to trainings and capacity development methodologies developed and tested by the project are recommended to be replicated on the national level. The project also developed, adopted and improved the quality of a selected group of four vocations only and it is recommended that the approaches similar to the selected four vocations are replicated to other vocations too.

Georgia’s Vocational Colleges aspire to become high quality and renowned training providers. This requires significant investment in a range of approaches, quality control mechanisms and the subject expertise. The capacity building methods of Vocational Colleges developed by the project involving participatory approaches to the needs identification and training should be replicated by the national agencies and partners working with the Vocational Colleges. Additionally, further rigorous advocacy work is required to successfully replicate the models developed from the local level to the national level so that other Vocational Colleges adopt the similar teaching and assessment principles, capacity building approaches, similar vocational education and employment models.

The concept of student mobility and internationalisation was developed by the project, but its practical application and implementation is still premature in Georgia. Vocational Colleges throughout Georgia need to comply with the quality standards of teaching and professional practice cycles, without this precondition the concept of internationalisation is irrelevant.

The concept of Lifelong Learning (LLL) will become more relevant once the LLL concept is acknowledged on a national level and it becomes a part of the national strategy. The complex and practical approaches successfully developed and piloted by the project should be applied in other Vocational Colleges, be made a part of the national strategy and overall approach to the LLL Concept.

*The sustainability of the project* has been ensured through the high quality of the teaching and training programmes which ensures sustainability of the project results. Close engagement of private sector and potential employers who become interested in hiring the qualified graduates that are able to comply with the labour market demand is also a decisive factor in ensuring the sustainability of the implemented action.

To further ensure the long-term sustainability of the actions, it is recommended that the Vocational Colleges develop even closer partnerships with the private sector, become more flexible and labour market oriented to accelerate their pace at following this dynamism of the employment market.

# **Introduction and Background Information**

The UNDP in Georgia implemented EU funded project “Deepening Linkages Between Formal/non-formal VET System and the Labour Market Needs in the Context of Lifelong Learning in Georgia”, which addressed the mismatch between the vocational education and labour market needs within a broader lifelong learning context in Georgia.

The Overall Objective of the project was to improve the labour market responsiveness of the formal and non-formal VET system and promote the lifelong learning process in Georgia. The project concentrated on two specific objectives targeting continuous improvement of the capacity and quality of formal VET education on the one hand, and introduction and recognition of non-formal learning in the VET sphere on the other.

The action was implemented at both the national level (for conceptual work in the field of non-formal VET education) and regional, i.e. local level (in the selected pilot regions of mountainous areas of Samegrelo and Zemo Svaneti, and conflict-affected areas in Shida Kartli).

Activities carried out under the Objective 1 “Quality of the formal VET education is improved and it responds more effectively to labour market needs” aimed to result in increased employability and productivity of VET graduates, as well as in better transition from education to employment and reduced skill mismatch at the Georgian labour market.

Objective 2 “Non-formal VET learning is introduced and recognized in Georgia” aimed to introduce f life-long learning opportunities for adults in the VET segment through the provision of non-formal learning. The activities carried out under this objective should have resulted in established non-formal learning opportunities for adult population in VET, and in higher skills and productivity of workers in professions.

The project intended to benefit youth and long-term unemployed, self-employed persons in low-productivity / low paid employment, and IDPs. The target groups among the direct beneficiaries of the project included the Government Agencies Ministry of Education and Science (MoES), Ministry of Labour, Health and Social Affairs (MoLHSA), National Centre for Enhancing the Quality of Education (NCEQE), Employment Support Service (ESS), VET providers (public and private colleges), private employers and social partners.

The project implementation started on the 1st of November 2015 and completed on the 31st of October 2017.

The present report is an independent evaluation of the project and its results.

## **Project Evaluation Methodology**

The independent evaluation of the project involved reviewing the project implementation since the beginning of the project until its end and provides a comprehensive assessment of the project activities considering the existing context by collecting information for assessing the relevance, timeliness, effectiveness and sustainability of the project and its results.

The project evaluation process involved a combination of desk review and document analysis, field visits, and interviews with key stakeholders of the project, namely: European Union Delegation monitoring group, UNDP, Ministry of Education and Science (MoES), Ministry of Labour, Health and Social Affairs (MoLHSA), National Centre for Enhancing the Quality of Education (NCEQE), as a result of which a consolidated feedback in the form of the present Evaluation Report has been produced on whether and how the Project met the expectations, achieved targets in sustainable manner.

The evaluation process also involved 3 field missions to the project implementing partners: Agara Public School (Kareli municipality), Lakada Vocational College (Jvari, Tsalenjikha Municipality) and Tetnuldi Vocational College (Mestia Municipality) where necessary information and evidence for assessment of the Project vis-à-vis the set targets set in the Description of Action was collected and documented.

The following criteria where used to review the project, its impact and the results achieved:

1. Relevance – to what extent project has been responding to respond to the national context,
2. Timeliness – how much the activities were carried out in a responsive and timely manner,
3. Effectiveness - to what extent the project is on track to achieving the project outputs and outcomes,
4. Efficiency - to what extent the project has used least costly resources possible in order to achieve desired results,
5. Sustainability - national ownership and the prospects for further institutionalisation of capacity development efforts to strengthen the developed systems and services (primarily farmers and cooperatives support).

The following aspects were evaluated and the findings integrated in the present report: project concept and design; implementation; project outputs, outcomes and impact; cross cutting issues; visibility.

# **Key Findings of the Evaluation**

## **Assessment of the Project Results, Outputs, Outcomes and Impact**

The present evaluation focused on evaluating the overall impact under each project result area, its relevance, timeliness, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability rather than evaluating implementation of each activity under each result area.

Overall Objective of the project: Improving the labour market responsiveness of the formal and non-formal VET system and promoting the lifelong learning process in Georgia

Objective 1: Quality of the formal VET education is improved and it responds more effectively to labour market needs:

Result 1 (Specific Objective 1): Increased employability and productivity of VET graduates

Result 2 (Specific Objective 1): Better transition from education to employment and reduced skill mismatch at the Georgian labour market

Objective 2: Non-formal VET learning is introduced and recognised in Georgia:

Result 3 (Specific Objective 3): Established non-formal learning opportunities for adult population in VET

Result 4 (Specific Objective 4): Higher skills and productivity of workers in professions

Geographical area of project interventions: selected municipalities in high mountainous region in Samegrelo-Zemo Svaneti, Mestia; second location in Samegrelo-Zemo Svaneti region, Tsalenjikha, proximity to conflict-affected area and ABL (administrative borderline); and Agara community in Shida Kartli Region, with proximity to conflict-affected area and ABL.

**Evaluation of the achievement of Objective 1: Quality of the formal VET education is improved and it responds more effectively to labour market needs;**

**Evaluation of Result 1 (Specific Objective 1):** Increased employability and productivity of VET graduates

Activities under the Result One include:

**Activity 1.1:** Monitoring and introduction and effectiveness of modular teaching in VET

**Activity 1.2:** Elaborating and implementing the capacity-building programmes for the involved stakeholders

There has been observed positive impact under the Result (Specific Objective) One. This includes introduction of modular teaching in VET, its monitoring and effectiveness; increased capacity of college teachers and managers; developed guidelines, assessment tools and practical training materials; developed and implemented capacity building programmes for stakeholders from public and private sectors.

There has been observed positive impact of strengthened capacity of Vocational Colleges and the capacity of the local self-governments bodies in the issues related to labour market and in managing vocational education and employment programmes. This has been manifested especially strongly in the established Public Private Partnership on the example of Agara Public School Vocational College’s 5-party memorandum, with the significant involvement of Kareli local self-government body (Kareli Municipality) that made a significant financial contribution to the Agara Vocational College. Local self-government representatives in other project locations (Mestia and Jvari) were also involved in various capacity-building initiatives. Therefore, there has been coordination efforts taking place between the Vocational Colleges and the representatives of local self-government bodies. The improved coordination made contribution to an increased interest towards, positive image of and visibility of the VET education, the education process as well as effectiveness of modular teaching in VET.

The project provided technical assistance in the following directions (with the observed verified positive impact in all three of these):

Teaching elements and learning materials were developed. New learning modules were introduced with guidelines and assessment tools per each module. Learning materials, demonstration videos and movies, computer programmes, virtual labs, practical training manuals and other visual and technical tools and materials for learning have been developed for the selected following four vocations / professions: low-voltage electrician, plumber, receptionist and mountain guide.

Practical and participatory capacity building initiatives made a significant contribution to the improved capacity of VET teachers and administrative and managerial staff of the target colleges. Extensive participatory training courses were delivered to the teachers, administrative and managerial staff of the selected Vocational Colleges on how to deliver modular teaching programmes, including the methods of teaching, quality assurance, practical usage and application of guidelines, instructions and teaching and assessment instruments. The Vocational Colleges teachers, reserve teachers were trained to make practical use of innovative teaching and learning methods. Teachers and reserve teacher, administrative and managerial staff were trained in practical applications of management aspects of teaching and assessment processes.

The infrastructure and environment of the teaching classrooms were renovated by the project; workshop spaces created and equipped; new modernised tools and toolkits, equipment, hardware, instruments and materials were procured by the project which equipped the teaching and practice spaces. The newly equipped teaching and professional practice spaces created a modern environment conducive to the teaching and professional process in these Vocational Colleges.

The efficiency of the teaching and learning processes have improved through quality assurance that is ensured through a self-sustained mechanism of monitoring and quality control. The project provided necessary support to help establish a group of internal monitors in Lakada and Tetnuldi Vocational Colleges that were trained with the methodology developed within the project.

External monitoring has been ensured by the Georgian Employers’ Association, which created an external monitoring group per vocation that is comprised of sectorial experts and education experts. The group of external monitors collaborates with an internal monitoring groups of the selected Vocational Colleges, conducts regular analysis of the teaching and learning process, based on which they develop relevant recommendations to further improve the process of teaching and ensure high quality standard of the teaching and learning processes.

Thus, during the project implementation period and towards the end of the project, the target colleges of Agara Public School / Vocational Colleges, Tetnuli Vocational Colleges in Mestia and Lakada Vocational Colleges in Tsalenjikha, have been significantly transformed into modern well equipped Vocational Colleges with modern teaching, learning and professional practices spaces through capacity building actions, renovations and upgrading of infrastructure, the innovative approaches to teaching, learning and assessment.

Therefore, the project made a significant progress to achieve its first result to increase employability and productivity of VET graduates through monitoring and introduction and effectiveness of modular teaching in VET on the one hand; and through implemented elaborate capacity-building programmes for the involved stakeholders.

**Evaluation of Result** **2 (Specific Objective 2):** Better transition from education to employment and reduced skill mismatch at the Georgian labour market

Activities under the Result Two include:

**Activity 2.1:** Introducing innovative ways for accessing VET

**Activity 2.2:** Increasing institutional capacity of VET providers (introducing VET education in secondary schools of Shida Kartli, developing partnership with private sector; Introducing learning workshops in the private sector

Under this result, the project introduced innovative methodologies and approaches to the VET education. Specifically, a mobile VET unit was created under the vocational college Tetnuldi in Mestia. The mobile VET unit is an innovative approach to increase access to VET and information-consultation services for the population of Zemo Svaneti region. The achieved positive impact of this innovation was that 4 communities in Mestia were trained in ecotourism, family guesthouse and family type hotel management and agricultural tourism. Mobile VET centre provided on-site individual consultations on how to improve services for tourism. By the end of the project, up to 100 individuals, out of which 94 were female, were trained and consulted by Tetnuldi mobile VET Centre.

The project also developed e-learning courses for the vocational education programmes of a mountain guide and low-voltage electrician. Electronic study-registering system for vocational education programme Low-voltage electrician was developed and developed and introduced in the Vocational Colleges Lakada and Tetnuldi. Both Vocational Colleges use the e-course and the electronic systems for these two vocational education courses.

Technical assistance and capacity building activities were implemented by a developed web-conference platform (discussed in detail below) that was launched in all Vocational Colleges and functions independently, without the support of the project. Lakada, Agara and Tetnuldi Vocational Colleges engaged through the developed web-conference platform in consultations and trainings on electronic teaching / assessment methodology and practical applications of various software in teaching process via web platform (WebEx) from Georgian Technical University.

The project developed and introduced on-job training methodology that creates opportunities for students to acquire practical skillsthrough practical training in the private companies. The concept of on-job training was developed by the Georgian Employers’ Association and adapted to adapted to the Georgian context. The concept and the established practice underline the significance of engagement of Vocational Colleges with the private sector and potential employers with the aim of increasing the employability opportunities for their graduates.

One of the challenges of the project was introduction of VET Education in Agara Public School in Shida Kartli that increased access to VET in Shida Kartli and created a successful Private Public Partnership (PPP) model (discussed in detail below).

The project also assisted the Agara Public School to receive authorisation from National Centre for Educational Quality Enhancement in September 2016 for two vocational education programmes: low-voltage electrician and plumber. This is an unprecedented case of successful innovation, since no Public School of Georgia had authorised vocational education programmes. After successful authorisation, the programmes enlisted two groups of students, with a total number of 41 students for these two vocations in Agara Public School VET programme. This model can be replicated by other Public Schools in the region and throughout Georgia that are willing to adopt vocational education programmes. The role of Kareli municipality, a local self-government body, was also instrumental.

**Evaluation of the achievement of Objective 2: Non-formal VET learning is introduced and recognised in Georgia**

**Evaluation of Result** **3 (Specific Objective 3)**: Established non-formal learning opportunities for adult population in VET

Activities under the Result Three include:

**Activity 3.1:** Developing the concept of non-formal LLL (Life-long learning) in Georgia

**Activity 3.2:** Identification of legal, regulatory and institutional gaps

**Activity 3.3:** Creation of the action plan to tackle the most pressing problems

The achievements under the result three involves several innovative approaches (discussed in more detail under the Innovative Concepts and Approaches Section below), developed LLL (lifelong learning) Concept was developed with the aim to formalise lifelong learning opportunities for adult population of Georgia through increasing their access to non-formal VET learning in Georgia.

Another innovative concept was developed on International Student Mobility in VET in Georgia that aims to promote development of professional competencies and capacities of teachers as well as development of intercultural awareness and foreign language skills for students.

The project created a space for engaging various interested and relevant stakeholders working on these highlighted issues to increase their awareness towards these new concepts. A series of capacity building training cycles to build capacity of private and public-sector representatives in labour market related issues were organised by the Georgian Employers Association. Representatives of local self-government bodies from Tsalenjikha and Mestia municipalities were trained on vocational education and employment programmes; as well as for private companies, such as Agara Sugar Company and other private companies Tsalenjikha municipality on heath safety and security and labour safety regulations.

**Evaluation of Result** **4 (Strategic Objective 4):** Higher skills and productivity of workers in professions

Activities under the Result Four include:

Activity 4.1 Piloting the schemes for VET-based retraining of adults

Activity 4.2 Development of the related organisational approach and policy

Activity 4.3 Develop minimum standards for teaching environment

Activity 4.4 Adapt VET retraining programs in modular format

Activity 4.5 Pilot short-term VET training courses for adults leading to acknowledged (partial) qualifications

The result four established cooperation among various public and private institutions with an effort to increase employability of the training and re-training graduates. The guiding principle of the interventions under the result four was the developed PPP model that promotes strengthened partnership between the public players and potential employers in the face of private sector. The successful model of PPP partnership underlines significance of the involvement of employers in education and training as a contributing factor to reducing the skills mismatch at the labour market.

The project developed minimum standards for teaching environment, such as standards for workshops, teaching materials, equipment, instruments and materials per vocation that are quality assurance standards for modular VET training / retraining programmes. The project involved potential employers and education and vocational experts to develop courses and learning materials; encouraged the private sectors that expressed its commitment to upgrade learning infrastructure and purchase equipment for training workshops. As a result of the training / retraining courses customised to the needs to participants in Tetnuldi and Lakada Vocational Colleges and Agara Public School, a total of 210 adults were trained and retrained in the following vocational education programmes:

1. Specifically, 90 adults (males) were trained in 6 training-retraining vocational courses introduced in Vocational College Lakada, in Jvari in the vocations of: low voltage electrician; high voltage electrician; plumber; wastewater and water supply specialist; electrician - welder (combination of 2 vocations) and welder;
2. 70 adults (out of these 31 were female) were trained in 5 training-retraining vocational courses introduced in Vocational College Tetnuldi in Mestia: welder; electrician; reinforced concrete worker; pre-school manager; hotel manager;
3. 50 adults (out of which 14 were females) were trained in 4 training-retraining vocational courses introduced in Agara Public School: electrician; plumber food safety control specialist welder.

As a result of the employment schemes developed by the project, 252 job seekers participated in the employment scheme programme, out of which 204 completed the full training course. Among these, 172 were certified and 91 found employment, or 52.91% immediately after the completion of the training courses.

The employment schemes developed within the project, its impact and the required further actions and recommendations are discussed below.

## **Partnerships and Project Implementation Modality**

The project was implemented by the UNDP Office in Georgia (coordinator) in partnership with the Georgian Employers Association and Vocational Colleges Lakada in Jvari (Samegrelo Region). Further project partners included Vocational College Tetnuldi in Mestia, Agara Public School, Gori University, Municipality Representative Body in Tsalenjikha, Mestia and Kareli, local staff of the Employment Support Service, Secondary Schools in Khashuri and Agara village.

Project partners and beneficiaries at the national level included the Government agencies (MoES, MoLHSA, NCEQE, Employment Support Service), VET providers (public and private Colleges), private employers and social partners.

The project was implemented under NIM (National Implementation Modality), which implied involvement of the Ministry of Education and Science was not only national partner, but also a responsible partner; after which the MoES signed a special letter of second agreement with the UNDP, having delegated the project implementation responsibilities to UNDP.

## **Sectors of Vocational Education Programmes and Target Groups**

The project activities covered the following sectors: construction, energy and tourism sectors and were implemented in the rural mountainous regions (Svaneti, Mestia) and conflict affected regions in close proximity to the ABL (administrative borderline) of Georgia (Tsalenjikha, Jvari and Shida Kartli, Agara). The focus on energy and transport sector was secured through cooperation with private companies in these sectors (Energo-Pro, Agara Sugar producing company and broader cooperation with employers that was facilitated by the project and its partner Georgian Employers Association.

## **Preparation period preceding the project start**

Extensive preparation period prior to the start of the project is considered to have played a positive role in the design of the project, planning for the interventions, selection of target locations and types of activities. The project started on November 1st, 2015, but extensive 8 to 9 months preparation works period preceded the project start, during which the project directions, to establish precise aims and objectives of the project, selection and justification of the selection of project locations, planning for the relevant interventions to achieve the project aim and objectives.

Preparation period revealed the potential risks and challenges associated with the implementation of the project. The protect team reported to have visited the selected project locations several times prior to planning the interventions with the aim of studying the situation on the ground. Therefore, project needs were identified in a participatory manner.

## **Target Beneficiaries Covered**

The project focused on the following target groups and beneficiaries: youth and long-term unemployed, self-employed persons in low-productivity / low paid employment, and IDPs and people with disabilities.

A group of people who benefitted from the project interventions include: VET students, graduates and job seekers. Women, youth, IDPs, and rural population in the conflict affected areas also benefitted by the project interventions.

## **Quality Assurance**

The project was co-financed by the UNPD with 10% contribution; and since the project was implemented by the UNDP, it complied with both the UNDP’s and EU’s regulations, which implied meeting reporting requirements for both agencies. This ensured quality assurance of the project.

The project created a Steering Committee, the main strategic decision-making body of the project, its implementation and quality assurance that was responsible for strategic directions of the project (not tactical ones). The members of the Steering Committee were MoES, UNDP, Co-applicant organisations, and partner organisations, such as Ministry of Health, Labour and Social Affairs (MoHLSA).

During the 2-years’s period of the project lifetime the Steering Committee took place only twice (instead of meeting at least 4 times, every 6 months), once at the start of the project, when the UNDP made the project presentation at the Ministry of Education and Science and the second time in summer 2017, during the final quarter of the project implementation, towards the very end of the project. There was an inefficient use of this supposedly powerful coordination and communication tool, which could explain the lack of coordination or rather information flow from the project to its partners and stakeholders. The project, which achieved profoundly spectacular results on the micro level through developing exemplary models at the local level at the examples of Lakada, Tetnuldi Vocational Colleges and Agara Public School Vocational College, did not effectively disseminate its results achieved on micro level to macro level for policy change and achieving institutional replication. This could have been done with closer coordination with its national partners and stakeholders, namely MoES and MoHLSA through using the Steering Committee mechanisms to coordinate work with them and replicate the successful models. Therefore, most of the positive results have been created on a local level rather than disseminated for replication on a national level.

The project also greatly benefitted from the UNDP Georgia’s extensive prior experience of implementing similar projects in previous years in the same field.

## **National (macro) and local (micro) level work**

On a micro level, the project aimed to contribute to the development of formal and non-formal vocational education; and to form employments schemes based on vocational education and retraining and to pilot them.

On a macro level, the project activities were viewed within the framework of Lifelong Learning (LLL) Concept in relation to the Vocational Education and Trainings. Although LLL concept is not included in the national legislation it is a recommended area for future policy work to continue working in this direction.

Two concepts were developed at the national level, one of which being the LLL concept that was discussed at a stakeholders meeting. A wide range of interested stakeholders were mobilised on a local and national levels to engage in the discussions around the LLL concept; the mobilisation and discussion activities were led by the Georgian Employers’ Association. Prior introducing the LLL concept to the interested stakeholders, they were first informed about the importance of vocational education and retraining programmes and their importance for employment, and then the concept of LLL was introduced to them. These stakeholders included Parliamentary Committee on Health; on Education; various ministries, such as MoES, MoHLSA, Ministry of Sports and Youth Affairs, Ministry of Rural Development. Representatives of various associations and non-governmental organisations, as well as private businesses and potential employers were also involved in these discussions.

A number of training cycles and discussions were held on introducing the concept of LLC, however, more work is required to make this issue a priority, since from interviews with various relevant stakeholders it is clear that the LLL concept is not properly acknowledged as being of sufficient significance. Therefore, more extensive advocacy at the national level on LLL concept is recommended.

The second concept developed was Students’ International Mobility concept, or the issues of students’ internationalisation that was developed with the assistance of an international expert. The project collaborated with another EU project on vocational education and employment that prioritised not only the concept of students’ international mobility but the concept of internationalisation in the sphere of vocational education.

Even though the work on local and national levels were closely interlinked, more attention was paid to the work on the local level.

The work on local level involved on working with the selected two Vocational Colleges, Lakada in Tsalenjikha, Jvari and Vocational College Tetnuldi in Mestia on the one hand and Agara Public School Vocational College.

The capacity of the teachers and management staff at both of these Vocational Colleges (Lakada and Tetnuldi) were extremely weak, but their desire and motivation to be included in the project was strong.

As a result of the capacity building initiatives, practical teaching staff at both of these colleges were significantly empowered. The existing practicing teachers were strong professionals in the chosen vocations that they taught but were considerably weaker in understanding the principles of teaching methods. Extensive 4-months training programmes were designed for the practicing teachers, during which they were trained in teaching methods, practical and professional skills. During the 4-months period they interacted extensively with education facilitators, potential employers, representatives of academic circles, and discussed issues in teaching methods. The trained teachers participated in the pilot groups for teaching and assessment. The training cycles involved close engagement of the management staff of these Vocational Colleges. The participatory systemic approach that these training cycles is based on is marked by its distinctive quality that enabled the teachers’ capacity to increase significantly.

Internal monitoring groups were created during the pilot process and later during the teaching process. An external monitoring group was also involved in assessing the teaching process; both of these groups worked closely together to come up with the way of improving the teaching and learning processes.

The project created the following elements for the development / establishment of the chosen vocations in these colleges:

**(1) Teaching materials** involve guidelines, assessment tools, teaching elements, teaching manuals;

**(2) Trained human capital, human resources** involve trained teachers, admin and management staff, other interested stakeholders, such as potential employers. Innovative approach of the project was engagement of the potential employers from the very beginning, such as Nenskra Hydro Power Plant or Kasleti 2 HPP (Hydro Power Plant), for the successful employment of the college graduates;

**(3) Teaching environment** involves the respective required infrastructure, equipment, tools and toolkits, instruments, other materials.

All of these elements play a significant role in the teaching and learning process and are required in order to receive authorisation. The success of the project lies in the fact that it created all of these elements in all of the three project locations.

## **Public Private Partnership (PPP) in Agara Public School Vocational College**

One of the major achievements of the project was establishing PPP (Public Private Partnership) in Agara Public School Vocational College. The PPP that involved 5 parties, resulted in specific tangible positive outcomes for the Agara Public School Vocational College. The local government of Kareli municipality, one of the signatories of the PPP memorandum, made a financial contribution to the amount of 100,000 GEL for the rehabilitation and equipment of the Agara Public School Vocational College. The success of the memorandum is largely attributed to the work of the UNDP Project Manager and the project team that worked tirelessly with various involved parties to agree on and create the PPP partnership and sign the PPP memorandum.

Another important signatory of the memorandum is a private sector in the face of Agara Sugar Factory. The remaining signatories are: the UNPD, Ministry of Education and Science, and Agara Public School Vocational College. Due to a factory malfunctioning and the ensuing renovations work, the functioning of Agara Sugar factory was stopped for a few months, therefore it could not fulfil its duties on time, but after a few months the factory resumed its operations and fully fulfilled its duties as envisaged by the signed PPP memorandum, which included:

1. cooperated with the Agara Public School Vocational College so that the students and graduates of the College vocational re-training and training programmes could take up professional practice / internship at the factory; and
2. equipped a welder’s workshop where the students could undergo professional practice.

Agara Public School Vocational College, one of the signatories of the PPP memorandum, on its part also fulfilled its functions, allocated its budget to purchase some computer equipment, as well as made some renovations works for the Vocational College teaching spaces; and created disability access.

The financial contribution made by Kareli municipality within the PPP was used to fully renovate and equip a dilapidated separate building on the territory of Agara Public School that is now used as a workshop for professional practice of the teaching process.

The UNDP project, one of the signatories of the PPP memorandum, fulfilled its functions within the PPP memorandum that involved the following:

1. prepared teaching materials and elements for Agara Public School Vocational College;
2. built capacity of the human capital (admin and managerial staff) of the Agara Public School Vocational College in the principles of management of vocational education institutions; planning cycles; financing and quality assurance;
3. developed teaching methodologies and assessment tools;
4. selected and trained teachers as well as reserve teachers; this was an especially challenging task, since Agara Public School had no previous experience of vocational education and training programmes, therefore everything was done from the scratch. Selection of qualified teachers and a roster of teachers, the so-called ‘reserve ‘pool of teachers was a lengthy and challenging process. The selected teachers were trained in the vocations and teaching and assessment methods;
5. provided all necessary assistance to the Agara Public School for preparation of receiving authorisation; this included preparation of all legal documentations necessary for the authorisation as well as training of personnel and teachers, creation of human capital;
6. created teaching environment necessary for receiving authorisation in the first place and then for the teaching process.

The UNDP also equipped a medical cabinet that was a requirement for receiving the authorisation for the VET College, purchased desks and tables for the classrooms.

Two directions were created in Agara Public School Vocational College: teaching direction and re-training direction. Four vocational education programmes were established to be of demand at the labour market: electrical, plumber, laboratory worker and welder. The project conducted vocational retraining in all of these vocations; and teaching was supported in 2 vocations: electrician and welder. Guidelines and professional modules for these vocational education programmes were prepared by the UNDP project, teachers trained and the vocational re-training courses were successfully implemented.

The Agara Public School Vocational College received authorisation for 2 vocational education programmes and from 2016 it received a first intake of students with the state funding. This is a major step towards ensuring financial sustainability of the results created by the project, since authorisation automatically implies financial sustainability.

## **Project Innovations / innovative concepts and approaches**

The project envisaged creation of innovative concepts and approaches on national level and piloting and testing them out on a local level. Therefore, the successful achievements of the project involved creation of innovations in electronic teaching. Development of Electronic teaching makes increases efficiency of the teaching process, both the theoretical and practical sides of teaching, and decreases the time and energy spent on assessment process, as well as diminishes paperwork which is also contributes to the environmental sustainability.

The project purchased tablets for the professional practice teachers that has installed application for assessment of the professional practice lessons., Therefore the assessment process of the students by their teachers is a straightforward and transparent process, which involves an electronic checklist of questions that appears on the tablet; once the teacher completes the checklist for individual students, both the teacher and the student sign the checklist electronically and the assessment is then uploaded to a student’s portfolio. The teachers in all three Vocational Colleges have been trained how to use these electronic teaching and assessment methods which they successfully demonstrated at the demo lessons during the project evaluation visit.

A software has been created within the project framework, a teaching webpage that includes all of these electronic tools. The software is a very user-friendly and both students and teacher have access to it; the software makes the teaching process very transparent, i.e. it indicated a set of minimum requirements that is needed to pass the assessment threshold. The webpage also contains all electronic teaching materials, including the teaching manual, teaching and vocational practice elements.

Another innovation created by the project is as web-conference platform, which is the first and unique in its kind in Georgia. This is a specialised programme through which various colleges connect to each other and to the web administrator in Tbilisi that leads the electronic teaching process and to Georgian Technical University that leads, for example, a course in the vocation of electrician. Thus, the web conference platform makes it possible to connect 5 locations to each other (3 colleges, web administrator in Tbilisi and GTU). The connected parties can see each other through web camera, each other’s computer desktop screens. Web conference is also used as a tool for distance learning, but this innovation also facilitates efficient communication between the involved parties. During the project lifetime seven such web conferences were organised with the participation of all three colleges.

Another innovation created by the project is a mobile VET Centre, which is practices mainly in Svaneti region. Tourism is developing rapidly in Svaneti and there is a demand on family-type guesthouses, therefore the mobile VET Centres are used for providing on-spot guidance to the families willing to engage in small-scale tourism. The project evaluation team that paid visit to Mestia in October 2017 visited several such family-type guesthouses that benefitted from the services provided by the mobile VET Centres. Standards for family guesthouses were established by the project and the respective programmes comprised of standards and norms on the one hand and recommendations for the owners of these guesthouses were created and delivered through mobile VET Centres.

Yet another innovation created by the project was established partnership with the company Georgian Electro System which trained and re-trained a group of teachers and then students for free in the high voltage vocation.

## **Evaluation of the Project Employment Schemes**

The employment scheme created by the project differs from the employment scheme piloted and established in 2014-2015 by the MoHLSA. The main advantage of the project’s approach was that the labour market surveys were conducted and updated on a regular rather than on a one-off basis. The second advantage of the project’s approach was that the programmes were based on a labour market needs, potential employers and the needs of the job seekers. Another advantage of the project’s employment scheme was that the programme was based on competition, i.e. the providers of training programmes were revealed as a result of a competitive process and not necessarily by the government institutions. Yet another distinctive feature of the project’s employment scheme was that the training programmes were linked to specific interested and potential employers; the project established networks with the private sectors as potential employers and adjusted the vocational re-training programmes to their needs with the aim of further boosting employment opportunities for the programme graduates.

For further success of the achieved project results, it is recommended to disseminate the best practices and the models created within the project, including the employment scheme model in order to replicate the successes achieved at a local level to a broader national level.

The employment scheme involved the following elements: employer – service / training provider and the education institution. Therefore, the project managed to have potential employers interested in this employment scheme, such as, for example, Anaklia Group, an Azerbaijani Private Company, Kasleti 2 HPP, etc.

One of the factors explaining this successful model lies in its approach, which means that the needs of private companies as potential employers were studied and the training programmes were adjusted to these needs in order to increase the employability chances of the trainees. Therefore, changes were made to the developed standard programmes and adapted to the revealed needs.

Another distinctive feature of the scheme is that it was oriented towards the needs of the potential employer, on the one hand, and the abilities of the job seekers on the other, abilities and not their desires or wishes. The abilities of the job-seekers were established first through a questionnaire given to them; this was followed by an interview and then a test in general skills. The scheme also developed a set of criteria that the job seeker should meet in order to go through the re-training programme. Groups of various levels of difficulties were established based on the abilities of the job seekers and the selection criteria that they met. The extensive outreach campaign for these re-training programmes conducted by the project partner, ABCO (Association of Business Consulting Organisations of Georgia) ensured high participation of people willing to be re-trained. Training courses in professional orientation and career planning were also conducted to these students.

After the completion of the training courses, the students were evaluated by both the training providers and the potential employers, after which, in case of positive validation from the potential employers the graduates are offered an employment that culminates in the work agreement. Since this is a newly-created scheme, it requires observation and adjustment in case there are certain areas revealed for potential improvement.

## **Project Achievements and Overcome Challenges**

The selected Vocational Colleges were chosen to replicate the work done at national level to the local level for practical applications. Both Vocational Colleges, Tetnuldi in Mestia and Lakada in Tsalenjikha were chosen because they are in geographically remote areas, and their capacity prior to the interventions were significantly lower compared to the capacity of other VET Colleges, especially those located in Tbilisi. Both the college infrastructure, capacity of the teaching and administrative staff as well as teaching and learning materials were weak or non-existent and required significant investment and capacity building. This was a challenge for the project that was tackled really well judging from the results achieved by the project in all three Vocational Colleges.

Another challenge that was successfully tackled by the project was establishment of PPP model – Public Private Partnership that was established at the Vocational College of Agara Public School. PPP model was established in a challenging environment, with 5-party memorandum of public-private partnership.

Another challenge for the project was to develop and implement employment schemes based on vocational training and re-training. The major challenge was in the fact that the MoHLSA, the Department for Labour and Employment Policy implemented vocational re-training employment schemes without any significant positive tangible results. Participation on the state employment programmes was low, interest from the public was low which resulted in insignificant number of positive results, or the employed population.

The project established 4 vocations in the selected 3 Vocational Colleges, these are, from construction vocations: low voltage electrician, plumber; and from tourism sphere: receptionist and mountain guide. The first three vocations were approved and the fourth vocation was not approved; thus the professional standards and programmes for the first tree vocation existed and were approved, but not in the case of the fourth vocation.

The project created teachers’ guide for these vocations and worked to improve the existing ones. Working on the guide and the assessment instrument took 4 months, which was an intensive participatory working process. These working meetings were organised by the UNDP project and the Georgian Employers’ Association and consisted of UNDP project manager, education facilitators, members of Georgian Employers’ Association, members of academia and educational institutions, members of private sector and potential employers, college teachers, and college quality managers. The working group developed quality teaching guidelines comprised of theory and practical guides on how to teach the established modules. Assessment methodologies and practical tools were also developed on how to make assessment of the teaching and learning processes, as well as practical skills. These guidelines and assessment tools were successfully piloted during the teaching process.

## **Cross-cutting issues: Gender**

The achieved results show that gender mainstreaming has been taken seriously during the implementation of the project. Gender aspect was paid sufficient attention to and was reflected at the project design stage, thus, gender mainstreaming became one of the main cross-cutting principles of the project. High percentage of women inclusion and participation in the achieved results points to the prioritisation of participation of women that must have been encouraged and ensured in all project activities.

The developed vocational education programmes include vocation suitable for women but only in one of the Vocational Colleges, namely in Vocational College Tetnuldi in Mestia. However, the vocations developed at the other two colleges in Agara and Tsalenjikha are mostly oriented for male population; this explains male population domination in the classrooms in these two colleges. Therefore, the choice of developed vocational education programmes is somewhat skewed to male population.

The relative lack of balance of women’s participation in the somewhat dominant chosen male-vocations is well balanced by high percentage of women in the leading managerial, administrative and teaching positions in the selected three colleges.

The project documentation and project reports pay sufficient attention to the gender mainstreaming component, paying due attention to the equal gender balance in participation in project activities, including training events, project-based workshops and conferences.

The collecting and reporting gender-disaggregated statistics during the implementation of the project for monitoring and evaluation purposes.

Three is a demonstrated commitment to gender mainstreaming and equal participation of women and girls, men and boys in all project interventions, however there is a certain imbalance towards more male-dominated vocations, therefore resulting in higher male participation in these classes which is balanced in female-majority senior managerial and administrative staff and balanced gender participation on the teaching staff.

The project results reported high rate of the participation of female beneficiaries, with 171 out of 514 beneficiaries trained were female.

## **Cross-cutting issues: People with Disabilities**

The project paid attention to the inclusion of people with disabilities through their encouragement of participation on the training programmes as well as adapting the infrastructure to people with physical disabilities. A limited number of people with disabilities participated in the training programmes in all three target locations.

Inclusion of people with special needs have also been facilitated by the use of modular training methods that allow for individualised and flexible training profiles that can be adopted to the specific needs of the disabled in target areas.

The project introduced innovative approaches that aim to enhance access to trainings, such as mobile training groups, e-learning, electronic teaching and assessment materials, electronic library etc. All of these are designed to facilitate participation of people with disabilities in the VET training.

Disability friendly access has been integrated in the infrastructure of Agara Public School and Vocational Colleges Lakada in Jvari; as for the Vocational College Tetnuldi in Mestia, the premises of the building is currently undergoing some renovations, including the renovation of stairs and other physical access areas.

# **Conclusions and Recommendations**

All project interventions seem to have been planned and implemented in a timely manner. However, because the partners on the local level (the three Vocational Colleges) were marked by their significantly low capacity it is recommended that collaboration with them with the aim of their further capacity building remains a priority. Partnership with them is recommended to continue in order to sustain the positive impact created on the micro level.

The work created on the local (micro) level at the selected three Vocational Colleges should be replicated at the national level. This replication on the national level was not done by the project, therefore further work in this direction is needed, so that other Vocational Colleges adopt the same teaching and assessment principles, capacity building approaches, adopt the same vocational education and employment models developed by the project; the replication should also be done in relation to other vocations, not only the four selected vocations.

In the absence of projects like the present project under evaluation, the methods and approaches adopted and used by the project to build the capacity of the Vocational Colleges, developing the vocations should be replicated by the national agencies and partners (MoES) that work with the Vocational Colleges on their empowerment and capacity building. This implies closer partnerships with Vocational Colleges, participatory approaches to the needs identification, training and other development needs.

The project targeted developing, adopting and improving the quality of a selected group of vocations, namely four vocations only. But the similar quality approaches to developing and adopting various vocations should be applied to all other vocational education programmes the same Vocational Colleges or indeed at other colleges.

There is a willingness from the side of the Vocational Colleges to become high quality, trusted and renowned training providers. In order for this to happen, a significant investment in needed, which requires a whole set of approaches and quality control mechanisms and the subject expertise. Once a Vocational College develops a number of vocations, adopts quality control mechanisms and pilots them, they will become more proficient in developing these vocations independently, but time, practice and quality control investment is required.

The concept of student mobility and internationalisation was developed by the project, but its practical application and implementation is still premature in Georgia. In order for the concept of international student mobility to work in practice it is essential that the full teaching and professional practice cycle correspond to a very high quality on a large scale throughout the country, not only in certain selected Vocational Colleges, otherwise the whole concept of internationalisation loses its relevance and urgency. The vocational education programmes that exist in Georgia fall short of meeting the international quality standards, without this, the priority of the concept of student internalisation becomes less urgent.

The concept of Lifelong Learning (LLL) will become more relevant once the LLL concept is acknowledged on a national level and it becomes a part of the national strategy in the respective field, once the draft law on LLL Concept is adopted. The complex and practical approaches successfully tested and piloted by the project results should be adopted elsewhere in other Vocational Colleges and be made a part of the national strategy and overall approach to the LLL Concept.

Participatory approaches to trainings and capacity development methodologies developed and adopted during the project interventions should be adopted and replicated at the national level. The key to success in this approach is its participatory nature and two-way interaction to capacity building rather than one-way traditional approach to teaching and trainings.

## **Sustainability of the Project**

The project achieved high quality of the teaching and training programmes that implies sustainability of the achieved project results. Private sector and potential employers are now more interested in hiring the potential graduates that received quality trainings and are able to comply to the demand of the labour market, which in turn also translates in increasing demand of the job seekers to have their professional skills upgraded through certified professional training courses on the one hand and guarantees sustainability of the action through their employment on the other.

The project managed to address three main barriers to sustainability: (a) low quality of the education institutions and their capacity; (b) low capacity of human capital, the admin, managerial staff and teachers; (c) insufficiently developed teaching environment. The present project managed to successfully address all these issues in relation to the selected three Vocational Colleges on a local level; however, in order to ensure overall sustainability, meeting all these three requirements is recommended.

To ensure their long-term sustainability, the Vocational Colleges should develop partnerships with the private sector and become more active in engaging themselves more closely with the potential employers. The employers market is dynamic, and the Colleges should be become more flexible and labour market oriented in order to accelerate their pace at following this dynamism.

# **Annexes**

Annex 1: Evaluation Terms of Reference

Annex 2: Detailed evaluation methods and tools used for analyses

Annex 3: A list of the field visits to colleges and interviews with external stakeholders

Annex 4: List of documents reviewed:

**ANNEX 1: Evaluation Terms of Reference**

**Post Title:** Project Evaluation Consultant (National Hire)

**Contract:** Individual Contract

**Duration:** 14 working days from Mid-October 2017 (including 3 field missions to Agara, Lakada and Tetnuldi colleges – 4 days)

**Duty station:** Home based with mission trips to Agara, Lakada (Tsalendzhikha) and Tetnuldi (Mestia) colleges

**Starting date:** ASAP

**Supervisor:** Economic Development Team Leader

1. **Background**

UNDP is implementing EU funded project “Deepening Linkages Between Formal/non-formal VET System and the Labor Market Needs in the Context of Lifelong Learning in Georgia”, which addresses the mismatch between the vocational education and labor market needs within a broader lifelong learning context in Georgia. The Overall Objective of the project is improving the labor market responsiveness of the formal and non-formal VET system and promoting the lifelong learning process in Georgia. The project concentrates on two specific objectives that target continuous improvement of the capacity and quality of formal VET education on one hand, and introduction and recognition of non-formal learning in the VET sphere on the other. The action is implemented at both the national level (for conceptual work in the field of non-formal VET education) and regional level (in selected pilot regions - mountainous areas of Samegrelo and Svaneti, and conflict-affected areas in Shida Kartli).

Activities carried out under the Objective 1 “Quality of the formal VET education is improved and it responds more effectively to labor market needs” aim to result in increased employability and productivity of VET graduates (Activity 1), as well as in better transition from education to employment and reduced skill mismatch at the Georgian labor market (Activity 2).

Objective 2 “Non-formal VET learning is introduced and recognized in Georgia” aims at the introduction of life-long learning opportunities for adults in the VET segment through the provision of non-formal learning. The activities carried out under this objective should result in established non-formal learning opportunities for adult population in VET (Activity 3), and in higher skills and productivity of workers in professions (Activity 4).

The project intends to benefit youth and long-term unemployed, self-employed persons in low-productivity/low paid employment, and IDPs. The target groups among the direct beneficiaries of the project include the Government agencies (Ministry of Education and Science (MoES), Ministry of Labour, Health hand Social Affairs (MoLHSA), National Centre for Enhancing the Quality of Education (NCEQE), Employment Support Service (ESS)), VET providers (public and private colleges), private employers and social partners.

The project implementation started in November 2015 and will be completed by end of October 2017. Now that the project is approaching its end, UNDP seeks local consultant to conduct independent evaluation of the project results.

1. **Duties and Responsibilities**

The Consultant will work under Supervision of Economic Development Team Leader.

The Consultant will have the following duties and responsibilities:

* Producing the evaluation report which will be elaborated through reviewing the project implementation since the beginning to date and provide a comprehensive assessment:
  1. Developing detailed plan of review of project performance as well as the context around the project with a forward-looking perspective agreed with UNDP Georgia.
  2. Collect information for assessing the relevance, timeliness, effectiveness and sustainability of the project activities considering existing context.
  3. Arranging discussions with the main stakeholders: European Union Delegation, UNDP, Ministry of Education and Science (MoES), Ministry of Labour, Health and Social Affairs (MoLHSA), National Centre for Enhancing the Quality of Education (NCEQE), Employment Support Service (ESS) for consolidation of feedback on whether and how the Project met the expectations, achieved targets in sustainable manner.
  4. Collect necessary information and evidence for assessment of the Project vis-à-vis the set targets set in the Description of Action.

The consultancy will involve 3 field missions to the project implementing partners: Agara public School (Kareli municipality), Lakada Vocational college (Jvari, Tsalendzhikha Municipality) and Tetnuldi Vocational college (Mestia Municipality).

1. **Outline of methodology and consultancy criteria related to Skills Project Evaluation:**

The consultancy will be undertaken in close cooperation with the Project Team and entail a combination of desk review and document analysis, field visits, and interviews with key stakeholders. The evaluation should include quantitative and qualitative survey of perspectives beneficiaries (participants of various trainings and events) undertaken by the project.

The project review and elaboration of recommendations will be participatory in nature and will make use of different tools. The list of key project documents to be reviewed is attached to this TOR.

The consultant will develop a report with the assessment of the Project performance in close cooperation with UNDP and EU. UNDP Georgia will provide the consultant with a list of key stakeholders, draft schedule of the meetings and will facilitate communication of the consultant with EU, MoES, MoLHSA, NCEQE, and the Project Beneficiaries. UNDP will also support the consultant logistically (transport, hotel reservations, organization of workshops, arrangement of meetings, etc.)

The Consultant shall look at the following criteria while reviewing the project:

1. Relevance – to what extent project has been responding to respond to the national context,
2. Timeliness – how much the activities were carried out in a responsive and timely manner,
3. Effectiveness - to what extent the project is on track to achieving the project outputs and outcomes,
4. Efficiency - to what extent the project has used least costly resources possible in order to achieve desired results,
5. Sustainability - national ownership and the prospects for further institutionalization of capacity development efforts to strengthen the developed systems and services (primarily farmers and cooperatives support).

The Consultant should evaluate the following aspects:

* **Project concept and design**

The evaluation will assess the project concept and design. He/she will review the problem addressed by the project and the project strategy, encompassing an assessment of the appropriateness of the objectives, planned outputs, activities and inputs as compared to cost-effective alternatives. The executing modality and managerial arrangements should also be judged. The evaluator(s) will assess the relevance of indicators and review the work plan, planned duration and budget of the project.

* **Implementation**

The evaluation will assess the implementation of the project in terms of quality and timeliness of inputs and efficiency and effectiveness of activities carried out. Also, the effectiveness of management as well as the quality and timeliness of monitoring and backstopping by all parties to the project should be evaluated. The evaluation is to assess the Project team’s use of adaptive management in project implementation.

* **Project outputs, outcomes and impact**

The evaluation will assess the achievement of outputs and contributions to outcomes as well as the sustainability of project results and potential impact. This should encompass an assessment of the achievement of the immediate objectives and the contribution to attaining the overall objective of the project. The evaluation should also assess the extent to which the implementation of the project has been inclusive of relevant stakeholders and to which it has been able to create collaboration between different partners. The evaluation will also examine positive and negative changes produced by the project, directly or indirectly, intended or unintended

* **Cross cutting issues:**

The evaluation will assess the project implementation process and its approaches in terms of due attention to gender aspects and environmental aspects. The evaluation should give an answer to the question to which degree the approaches, concepts and services provided gender balanced and promoted environmentally friendly approach, whether the gender and environmental aspects were addressed sufficiently in monitoring and reporting with the view of relevant to the Projects Document.

* **Visibility:**

The evaluation will assess the project implementation process how the Project ensured compliancy with the visibility guidelines of EU and how did it ensure awareness raising of the project in general within the stakeholders and beneficiaries

1. **Deliverables and timeline:**

The consultant should provide:

* the draft and final Evaluation Reports reflecting the findings of the review along with the recommended actions by mid-October 2017.

1. **Management:**

Consultant will work under the guidance and direct supervision of Economic Development Team Leader.

The UNDP Georgia and the Project Team will be responsible for ensuring liaising with partners, and supporting the consultant in acquiring relevant documentation, data and evidence.

1. **Competencies:**

**Corporate Competencies:**

* Demonstrates commitment to UNDP’s mission, vision and values;
* Displays cultural, gender, religion, race, nationality and age sensitivity and adaptability;
* Highest standards of integrity, discretion and loyalty.

**Functional Competencies:**

Knowledge Management and Learning:

* Shares knowledge and experience;
* Actively works towards continuing personal learning, acts on learning plan and applies newly acquired skills.

**Development and Operational Effectiveness:**

* Ability to perform a variety of specialized tasks related to Results Management, including support to design, planning and implementation of program, managing data, reporting;
* Ability to provide input to business processes re-engineering, implementation of new system, including new IT based systems;
* IT competencies in Word, Excel, Power Point and internet.
* Excellent negotiations skills

**Leadership and Self-Management:**

* Focuses on result for the client and responses positively to feedback;
* Consistently approaches work with energy and a positive, constructive attitude;
* Remains calms, in control and good humored even under pressure.

1. **Required Qualifications**

I. Education:

* University (At least Master’s degree or equivalent) in Economics, Public policy, Public Administration, or a related discipline;

II. Experience

* At least 2 cases of evaluating donor funded development projects preferably in vocational education, skills development, employment, economic development or other fields.
* Minimum 3 years of experience of working either in programme/project development, reporting, evaluation preferably in poverty, skills development, economic and local development fields.
* Familiarity with the development context of Georgia (previous working experience in the country or the South Caucasus and good understanding of current development dynamics in agriculture sector development will be an asset).

III. Other Requirements

* Fluency in spoken and written English; knowledge of Georgian is a must.
* Strong research and analytical skills;
* Excellent verbal and written communication skills;
* Excellent organizational skills;
* Excellent computer literacy (MS Office; Windows);
* Initiative and sound judgment, dedication to the UN principles and demonstrated ability to work harmoniously with persons of different nationalities and cultural backgrounds.

**Annex 2: Detailed evaluation methods and tools used for analyses**

Independent evaluation of the Project: “Deepening linkages between formal/non-formal VET system and the labour market needs in the context of lifelong learning in Georgia”

**Methodology and consultancy criteria related to Skills Project Evaluation:**

The consultancy will be undertaken in close cooperation with the Project Team and entail a combination of desk review and document analysis, field visits, and interviews with key stakeholders. The evaluation should include quantitative and qualitative survey of perspectives beneficiaries (participants of various trainings and events) undertaken by the project.

The project review and elaboration of recommendations will be participatory in nature and will make use of different tools. The list of key project documents to be reviewed is attached to this TOR.

The consultant will develop a report with the assessment of the Project performance in close cooperation with UNDP and EU. UNDP Georgia will provide the consultant with a list of key stakeholders, draft schedule of the meetings and will facilitate communication of the consultant with EU, MoES, MoLHSA, NCEQE, and the Project Beneficiaries. UNDP will also support the consultant logistically (transport, hotel reservations, organization of workshops, arrangement of meetings, etc.)

The Consultant shall look at the following criteria while reviewing the project:

1. Relevance – to what extent project has been responding to respond to the national context,
2. Timeliness – how much the activities were carried out in a responsive and timely manner,
3. Effectiveness - to what extent the project is on track to achieving the project outputs and outcomes,
4. Efficiency - to what extent the project has used least costly resources possible in order to achieve desired results,
5. Sustainability - national ownership and the prospects for further institutionalization of capacity development efforts to strengthen the developed systems and services (primarily farmers and cooperatives support).

The Consultant should evaluate the following aspects:

* Project concept and design

The evaluation will assess the project concept and design. He/she will review the problem addressed by the project and the project strategy, encompassing an assessment of the appropriateness of the objectives, planned outputs, activities and inputs as compared to cost-effective alternatives. The executing modality and managerial arrangements should also be judged. The evaluator(s) will assess the relevance of indicators and review the work plan, planned duration and budget of the project.

* Implementation

The evaluation will assess the implementation of the project in terms of quality and timeliness of inputs and efficiency and effectiveness of activities carried out. Also, the effectiveness of management as well as the quality and timeliness of monitoring and backstopping by all parties to the project should be evaluated. The evaluation is to assess the Project team’s use of adaptive management in project implementation.

* Project outputs, outcomes and impact

The evaluation will assess the achievement of outputs and contributions to outcomes as well as the sustainability of project results and potential impact. This should encompass an assessment of the achievement of the immediate objectives and the contribution to attaining the overall objective of the project. The evaluation should also assess the extent to which the implementation of the project has been inclusive of relevant stakeholders and to which it has been able to create collaboration between different partners. The evaluation will also examine positive and negative changes produced by the project, directly or indirectly, intended or unintended

* Cross cutting issues:

The evaluation will assess the project implementation process and its approaches in terms of due attention to gender aspects and environmental aspects. The evaluation should give an answer to the question to which degree the approaches, concepts and services provided gender balanced and promoted environmentally friendly approach, whether the gender and environmental aspects were addressed sufficiently in monitoring and reporting with the view of relevant to the Projects Document.

* Visibility:

The evaluation will assess the project implementation process how the Project ensured compliancy with the visibility guidelines of EU and how did it ensure awareness raising of the project in general within the stakeholders and beneficiaries

**Annex 3: A list of the field visits to colleges and interviews with external stakeholders**

1. Project Introductory Meetings with the UNDP team: 20 October, 2017;
2. Second Project Meetings with the UNDP team: 23 October, 2017;
3. Field Visits To Colleges: 25-26-October-2017;
4. A visit to Agara Public School Vocational College, 25 October 2017;
5. A visit to Jvari Vocational College Lakada, Tsalenjikha, Smegrelo-Zemo Svaneti Region; 25 October 2017;
6. A visit to Mestia Vocational College Tetnuldi, Mestia, Smegrelo-Zemo Svaneti Region; 26 October 2017;
7. Meeting with Ms Elza Jgerenaia, Ministry of Health, Labour and Social Affairs, head of the Labour Department; 3rd November, 2017;
8. Meeting with Ms Irina Tserodze, Ministry of Education and Sciences, head of the Vocational Education Department; 6th November, 2017;
9. Meeting with Tea Osepashvili, former representative of NCEQE, and an Education Support Expert, 6th November 2017;
10. An Interview with Ms Ana Diakonidze, Head of the EU Monitoring Group.

**Annex 4: The list of key project documents reviewed:**

1. Description of Action per EU contract
2. UNDP project Document
3. Quarterly reports submitted to EU
4. Project Cooperation Agreement between UNDP and “Georgian Employers’ Association”
5. LoA Agara Public School
6. LoA Lakada
7. LoA Tetnuldi
8. Contract for Professional Consulting Services between UNDP and Association of Business Consulting Organizations of Georgia (ABCO)
9. Contract for Professional Consulting Services between UNDP and Kutaisi Education Development and Employment Centre (KEDEC)