



جمهوری اسلامی ایران: پروژه بین المللی منارید:
تقویت و انسجام سازمانی در راستای مدیریت یکپارچه منابع طبیعی
Iran: MENARID, Institutional Strengthening and
Coherence for Integrated Natural Resources Management



MENARID

بسمه تعالی

شماره: MN-16-17

تاریخ: 2016.03.07

جناب آقای دکتر علی نظری دوست

مدیر محترم طرح های گروه محیط زیست و توسعه پایدار برنامه عمران ملل متحد

موضوع: ارسال نامه پاسخ مدیریتی به ارزیابی میان دوره ای پروژه منارید

با سلام؛

احتراما به پیوست پاسخ مدیریتی به نکات درج شده در ارزیابی میان دوره ای پروژه منارید که در ماه سپتامبر ۲۰۱۵ تهیه شده است، جهت اطلاع ارسال می گردد.

هوشنگ جزی

مدیر اجرایی ملی پروژه های منارید و حبله رود



Key Issues and recommendations		Management response*	Key Actions	Timeframe	Tracking**		Status***	Comments
		Response			Focal point	Responsible unit(s)		
1	operationalize a project board secretariat that engages and prepares results-based meetings and provides a platform to establish links between the board members and the project activities.	acceptable	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Sending periodic reports to the Project Board and its members• Invite new members• Conducting project board meetings twice a year• Regular follow up of the project board's regulations	middle of 2015	PR	Admin	Completed	two PB meetings held since MTE (August 26, 2014 and February 22, 2015), the representatives of DoE and energy ministry participated in meetings. Minutes of meetings sent to all PB members.
2	Better coordination mechanisms between GEF, UNDP and FRMO are required. Immediately hold a tripartite meeting (UNDP, FRMO, GEF) to discuss the roles and responsibilities of project board i.e. include a review of its own constitution and expected outcomes.	acceptable	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• First a bilateral meeting between UNDP and the Department of Forests and Rangelands• The second meeting of the Tripartite• The project ownership and implementing role should specify• The project should support through simple methods• Less bureaucracy	middle of 2015	NPM	Admin NPM NPD UNDP GEF MFA	Pending	Project supervisor at UNDP has changed in 2015, it will take time till project reach to common understanding with this new situation. The bilateral meeting was not held, it is expected to be held by the end of 2015.
3	Payment for Environmental Service is working downstream and can be scaled across the pilots, the PES can also be elevated to also engage nationally in an economic valuation (study of the national accounts) for the purpose of mobilizing support for a national INRM framework. Policy support to land degradation, alternative and land values, water strategies versus business as usual, etc.	acceptable	It will be included in PES international consultant's TOR	2014	EE		Completed	PES manuals prepared in English. The laws reviewed regarding to PES and some suggestions for editing them were prepared.
4	Hab-e-Rud experiences must be shared more effectively across all the MENARD pilot sites, nationally and internationally, through targeted knowledge management, learning activities, public relations and joint work planning	acceptable	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Sharing Hab-e-Rud reports, products and achievement.• Organizing study tour for other international and national project of Hab-e-Rud	2015	CB	CB KM PR	Completed	Rain community have direct contact with the local community in Hab-e-Rud. Vice-President and Minister of Agriculture visited Hab-e-Rud project, a report on Hab-e-Rud project submitted to them, a book on Hab-e-Rud indigenous knowledge printed. The book was launched by the Ministry of Culture also. Hab-e-Rud progress reports, products and achievements shared via project's website, national and international scientific visited Hab-e-Rud sub projects.
5	The innovations (ganat system, solar technology, alternative livelihoods linked to INRM, conservation agriculture practices, wind erosion solutions and organic foods potential and a case study on Hab-e-Rud change process) and do case studies on promising and failing innovations and are being documented and to share and for inclusion in the defining MENARD Iran manual, the information shared and leveraged for community support, political capital and resource mobilization through the global, regional and local knowledge networks.	acceptable	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• documenting innovations and indigenous knowledge• Planning for the implementation of several replicable innovations in Hab-e-Rud and MENARD• Sharing them via website	2017	KM	ppm	Completed	Rehabilitation of Ganat in Yazd and Hab-e-Rud were done by using indigenous knowledge
6	planning for an international knowledge sharing and learning seminar in 2015 with UNDP's support. Undertake planning and hosting of an international showcase event on MENARD in 2015 and invite other MENARD regional project countries. Develop an inclusive multi-sectoral steering committee and leverage the project as a country contribution to sustainable development planning globally in advance of post 2015.	acceptable	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Getting the committee approval• Meeting with MFA to clear the objectives• Selecting the implementer	2016	PR	KM ADMIN CB	Pending	It was discussed at the project board and holding it was postponed to 2016.
7	Extension is to be discussed and approved by the project board through August 2015.	acceptable	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Getting the project board approval• Sending a request letter to UNDP• Getting GEF approval	2014	NPM		Partially Completed	PB has approved project extension by the end of 2017, its request has been submitted to UNDP. Apparently in the UNDP system the end of project was registered by the end of 2016 so it needs correction.

	Key Issues and Recommendations	Management response*		Key Actions	Timeframe	Tracking**		Status***	Comments
		Response				Focal point	Responsible unit(s) Co-worker		
8	The Project Board must begin to function. It must be reviewed for active membership. It must be reconstituted and supported by a robust INRM national technical committee and secretariat based at PMU for better decisions. The PB must be reviewed, corrected and elevated as the primary oversight and decision-making mechanism for project works plans, strategies and changes. The PB must be reviewed, corrected and elevated as the primary oversight and decision-making mechanism for project works plans, strategies and changes.	acceptable		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review project board's procedures and duties and approve them Establishing technical Committee Linking the Technical Committee and project board 	2016	INRM	KM INRM PR	Completed	It was done. PB meetings holding regularly and new members are inviting.
9	The PMU will require training on how to hold and prepare for a good project board meeting, risk identification and management, develop partnerships and ToRs, good briefing and coordination of institutional contracts and NEX guidelines.	acceptable		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Developing training plan Conducting training course during the year Recruiting the implementer for training course Following up the training courses 	2016	KM	KM CB PR	Completed	workshops on Principles of negotiation, cooperation, facilitation, participatory management, team working and NEX instructions were conducted.
10	revisiting and writing a project implementation strategy infused with the appropriate technical support for key areas: Women's Economic Empowerment, Knowledge Management (KM), Technology Transfer (TT) and Capacity Building (CB), Sustainable Livelihoods and Payment for Ecosystem Services (PES), Institutional and Integrated Natural Resources Management (INRM), Integrated Water Resources Management (IWRM), INRM and Watershed, with focus on participatory monitoring and management of dry lands, biodiversity conservation through ecosystem management approaches and climate change adaptation.	acceptable		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Developing strategy plan for themes that mentioned Developing integrated strategy plan 	2015	NPM	INRM KM PPM CB NPM	Completed	Strategic Plans for the two pilots in Yazd and Kermanshah prepared. Knowledge management, PES, INRM and communication strategic plans have been prepared, these documents showing how project work in these areas. Capacity building strategy document is not prepared yet.
11	Future implementation must prioritize strategic partnerships with institutions and support of institutional contracts.	acceptable		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record financial support from government agencies, the supporting documents must be submitted Extension of contract updates to the site 	2014	FINANC	FINANC ME	Completed	There is a credit in national financial agreement for MENARID.
12	An area of priority post MTE is enhanced technical and implementation oversight.	acceptable		technical expert will recruit at international, national and local level	2015	CTA	NPM CTA TC	Pending	INRM specialists were recruited at national and provincial level, but international INRM expert didn't hire yet.
13	Developing a technically vetted INRM plan with benchmarks and strengthening the INRM think group at national level are priority areas for PMU, UNDP, GEF and CTA support.	acceptable		establishing INRM committee that is playing technical committee role at national level	2015	INRM	INRM CTA PPM	Completed	INRM committee has been formed in FRWO that MENARID is a member of it. The committee plays main role of integrated natural resources management in IRAN. Also a committee for coordinating international projects has been formed and headed by the deputy minister and the FRWO's head. MENARID is also a member of this committee. So there is no need to form another committee.
14	A knowledge management approach is essential for cost efficiency and effectiveness within such a broad-scope "transformation" mandate. The PMU can engage both a strategic knowledge management and a learning system advisor to help develop a master plan to leverage community, provincial, national and international-level knowledge and systematic technology knowledge exchange, research and scientific inputs into project activities, including dynamic public engagement and capacity building. Leveraging a targeted state of KM products and services will strengthen learning and networking on INRM.	acceptable		developing knowledge management strategic plan	2015	KM		Completed	The strategic document's of this part was prepared.

Key Issues and Recommendations	Management response*	Key Actions	Timeframe	Tracking**			Status***	Comments
				Focal point	Co-worker	Responsible unit(s)		
15	provide strategic preparation and technical inputs to PB. PMU should facilitate PB meeting in provinces and make strategic monitoring visits to project sites.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provincial project board is basin management committee and provincial monitoring and evaluation committee National expert will support the provincial level with required information The field visit will be organized for project board members. 	2015	INRM	INRM PPM		Completed	Several members of the Steering Committee have visited project's sites. The project intends to hold one of the PB meetings in one of the project sites.
16	The project needs KM approaches to increase visibility and knowledge sharing across pilots.	developing public awareness strategy	2015	PR	KM PR		Completed	Strategic document has been prepared
17	UNDP. Provide support to the NPM on the conceptualization of micro-management of the technical institutional development work; be involved in the recruitment and selection of project activities, based on NEX guidelines' project TRA on Institutional Development (Public Policy professional with technical NRM thematic background).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Organizing coordination meeting with UNDP Submitting the request letter by NPM Approving the request letter and support by UNDP 	2015	NPM	UNDP NPM		Pending	Project intends to provide the description of International Technical Advisor by the end of the third quarter of 2015. And necessary measures done to hire him. In this regard, necessary consultation and coordination has been done with the UNDP.
18	The UNDP program officer should also be involved on the national technical committee as a substantive technical member.	Inviting UNDP expert to technical committee regularly	2014	NPM	INRM NPM PR Admin		Completed	Was explained in the thirteenth suggestion.
19	Continue with good work. It is critical to negotiate for the NPM to be immediately placed on a UNDP contract with direct reporting to UNDP and host government for the duration of the project.	It should be followed by UNDP	2014	ANPD	ANPD UNDP		Completed	This activity has been done.
20	The engagement with other environmental, social and economic development projects can be explored to increase technical and operational implementation efficiencies. An international KM expert can be employed with a view to creating an inclusive sustainable development network.							
21	Focus is needed on developing an M&E system for dry lands (can do in partnerships of ICARDA-MENARID).	The suggestion should review in the INRM committee to see if it is applicable and practicable, then to extract its indicators and providing related software.	2015	INRM			Partially Completed	By preparation the cadastral maps, a software for controlling the land use change of natural and national areas prepared and be in use as a pilot.
22	Teams must write down a strategy and begin to augment activities to date with plans to make concrete learning links to local and national universities, agricultural or business/other colleges.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Developing mutual learning strategies with university Developing strategy to support the university thesis 	2015	KM	KM INRM		Completed	A memorandum was signed with the University of Zabol/Gorgan University has communicated with MENARID project on INRM. In Yazd province, the project's studies and research are done by the University of Yazd. Also in agreement with the University of Kermanshah, MENARID's replication is following by this university. A memorandum was signed with the research institute and consultative meetings have been held. project wants to communicate with Iranian elites and abroad universities professors through the presidential scientific and technological deputy.
23	In the second half, the project needs to focus on building resilience against each of these risks. Project Board and UNDP must have a rolling risk management matrix to monitor on a regular basis.							

Management Response and Tracking Template
updated in September 2015

Key Issue and Recommendations		Management response*	Key Actions	Timeframe	Tracking**		Status***	Comments
		Response			Focal point	Responsible unit(s)		
24	The TCs are also expected to provide inputs on the development of the longer-term institutional arrangements, including drafting the INRM strategy and policy document.	NOT acceptable						
25	MTE recommends that, based on foundational work, the team develop a plan for international and south-south cooperation for technology development projects for each site linked to demonstrations livelihood incubation centers already set up.	acceptable	developing a plan for south-south cooperation (reviewing project sites needs and interaction with countries base on project sites needs)	2015	KM		Completed	A memorandum was signed with China in order to transferring the experience of this country and build 3 passive greenhouses in 3 provinces. And the preparation of it's implementation will be provided by 2016.
26	The PMU, however, must be systematic in its NGO/CBO approach across the provinces in an overall partnership strategy. The Small Grants Program of GEF is a key partner to help draft and implement a NGO/CBO strategy.	acceptable	developing a methods for working with NGOs and CBOs base on SGP practice	2014	CB	NPM CB	Completed	It was done by cooperation of SGP
27	the project team must review the consequence of private sector activities and immediately develop a coherent and informed strategy toward a long-term vision, striving for a win-win situation.	acceptable	developing strategy for involving the private sector in project activities	2014	CB	KM CB INRM EE PPM	Pending	developing strategy for involving the private sector in project activities is on processing.
28	More technical monitoring aspects, such as developing an early warning system and mechanism to track land use and land changes, need to be outsourced to consultancy firms or research institutions.	NOT acceptable						
29	The co-financing and appropriate project budget breakdown should be reviewed and agreed on through a post MTE tripartite meeting.	acceptable	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reviewing the budget part of project document Editing budget breakdown of the project conducting meeting between FRMO, UNDP and MFA 	2015	FINANC	NPM NPD UNDP MFA GEF M&E	Partially Completed	Meeting between FRMO, UNDP and MFA did not conduct, budget breakdown of the project edited. The budget part of project document did not change.
30	Project baseline on environmental conditions and status are a matter of priority. NPM should vet the quality and advise the TC on the need to undertake proper follow-up baseline analysis. Update baseline information upon approval from PB.	acceptable	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Updating the baseline studies Developing the basin strategic plan 	2016	INRM		Partially Completed	This activity is on processing.
31	As an immediate action, develop a toward end-of-project and sustainability strategy, including revisiting the log frame targets and work plans at national and provincial levels in light of recommendations arising from the MTE (PPUs, PMU and PB).	acceptable	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Project work plan till end of project drawing up Developing the exit strategic plan 	2015	NPM		Completed	Framework and work plan has been prepared, annual objectives predicted, indicators have been modified by MTE. The strategic plans of project approaches have been prepared.
32	Develop a training package including a replication manual for up scaling activities at the provincial and community level. Focus on principles, i.e. trust, community engagement, cross-sector institutional work.	acceptable	writing a TOR for developing training package (training package will include case study and experiences)	2015	CB	KM CB INRM	Partially Completed	The activity is on processing
33	Mitigate key project risk (continuity of implementation) by instituting an operational National Technical Committee as a target for national capacity building support.	acceptable	it will include in M&E process	2014	ME		Completed	Project risks are reviewed in the quarterly monitoring and evaluation meetings.
34	Host a staff retreat. Host a post MTE project team learning and orientation workshop, including history of project, concept and MTE recommendations (PMU, provincial units supported by GEF NPMs, UNDP).	acceptable	conducting workshop	2014	ME		Completed	The activity is done and workshops have been held.
35	Have the project board lift the international security clearance requirement so that technical advisors can visit the sites, forestalling disadvantage to the project.	acceptable	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Getting the project board approval UNDP follows up through MFA 	2014	UNDP	NPD UNDP	Completed	It was done and now it is possible to have mission to Sistan and Bluchestan.

Key issues and recommendations		Management response*		Key Actions		Timeframe	Tracking**		Status***	Comments
		Response					Focal point	Responsible unit(s)		
36	Hire (RE-HIRE) international specialist in key thematic areas such as climate change, PES and INRM.	acceptable		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> PES and Technical consultant will recruit Regarding climate change consultant, if the national climate change committee see it necessary then she/he will recruit 	2015		INRM	EE	Completed	PES consultant was hired and his mission was done. International technical consultant is being hired. About the recruitment of climate change international consultant, project does not reach to agreement yet.
37	Develop KM, CB, INRM and public awareness strategy.	acceptable		developing strategic plan for each department and approve them in related committee.	2015			KM CB INRM PPM	Completed	The activity is done
38	Translate all project reports to English and avail on website for researchers and others; prepare good quality PowerPoint in both Farsi and English for presentation in relevant gatherings (PMU and provincial units PMU).	acceptable		translating all project reports and documents to English and uploading them on project website	2015		km	KM INRM PR	Partially Completed	The activity is on processing.
39	Develop project website and project storage portal to enact efficiencies for project operations, including promote less travel between national and provincial levels, and strategically position knowledge sharing and public relations/visibility as a core strategy for the implementation approach and results (KM).	acceptable		discussing the suggestion with website company to see how it is possible to change website to portal	2014		PR		Pending	Project's website can be a portal but it is not carried out.
40	Turn public relation unit into "public relations and international affairs," or engage an additional person for international affairs with responsibilities for searching and finding the related international events that are opportunities for MENARID attendance and presentation/sharing its lessons learned. This would also bring the other project lessons learned to MENARID (PMU).	acceptable		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The name will change It should search the similar project in other countries and make connection with them To present MENARID experiences on reference websites 	2014		PR		Completed	The name has not changed.
41	Train PMU staff on NEX guidelines.	acceptable		holding a joint meeting with UNDP to review the issues of NEX project	2015		FINANCE	FINANCE ME	Completed	Training workshop was held.
42	Have a stakeholder's analysis, get the list updated by project M&E processes regularly and add new recognized stakeholders with whom the project could establish good partnerships and benefit from contributions.	acceptable		it will include in M&E process	2015		ME		Pending	This activity has not been carried out.
43	Get national and provincial technical committees to ensure the correct mix of experts from sectors and non-governmental stakeholders for INRM expected results (PMU-CIA).	acceptable		recognizing new stakeholders and provincial expert for INRM committee and project board	2015		INRM	PPM INRM	Pending	This activity has not been carried out.
44	Strengthen the GEF project learning and sharing network, share GEF new approaches (in new manual on MENARID approach and resources) and mobilize and influence GEF pipeline for future GEF projects (PMU).	acceptable		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Conducting regular meetings Implementing common site visiting Developing common strategy 	2015		INRM		Completed	Joint meetings are in processing between international projects, but UNDP did not transfer GEF new approaches to these projects.

Key Issues and recommendations	Management response*		Key Actions	Timeframe	Tracking**		Status***	Comments
	Response				Focal point	Responsible unit(s) Co-worker		
45	Establish concrete cooperation with the meteorology organization and scientific centers for conducting climate change resiliency studies, possibly also as PhD thesis.	acceptable	make relationship with meteorological organization in project sites	2015	PPM	INRM PPM	Completed	Project's team in Kermanshah connected with meteorological department. A digital meteorological station has been installed on the promotional farm in Razin site. In Yazd, meteorologists are members of the Technical Committee and participate in the construction of Chinese passive greenhouses. And it is supposed to prepare proposal, project team make connection with the provincial meteorological department d to give the necessary information for establishing and monitoring the greenhouses.
46	Ensure common strategies for cooperation between FRWO and DOE.	acceptable	developing strategic plan for Hamoon wetlands with participation of DOE	2015	INRM		Partially Completed	MENARID in cooperation with wetlands project trying to work out the strategic document of Hamoon that is a joint projects site. (Same to recommendation # 30)
47	Provide training on international negotiation for Multilateral Environment Agreements (MEAs) (MFA interview) as part of MENARID's KM agenda, i.e. provide training on MEA negotiations in climate change, biodiversity and desertification (PMU, UNDP).	NOT acceptable						
48	Complete a technology transfer as mentioned in project output 1.3. MTE recommends that the project develop PTO projects in project site to make added values to the promotional livelihood incubation centers.	acceptable	defining TOR of participatory technology development sub-project	2015	INRM		Partially Completed	This activity is on processing in pilot sites to promote sustainable agriculture.
49	Operationalize national INRM Technical Committee. The TOR of the technical committee should be reviewed and revised with a focus on INRM (PB PMU).	NOT acceptable						
50	Undertake studies on climate change impact.	acceptable	one case study will implement in Yazd province	2015	EE		Completed	In Yazd, the Meteorological department has prepared a research proposal that has not been confirmed. Also in Sistan, it is in progress.
51	Enact the project-level M&E system and conduct training to ascertain results. Scope and report on MTE highlighted technical gaps (highlighted in MTE report) in implementation strategies.	acceptable	including in project M&E plan	2014	ME		Completed	Quarterly monitoring and evaluation meetings are held regularly.
52	and do future studies to identify the poor as a primary target group of the project.	acceptable	defining TOR	2015	NPM		Partially Completed	in Sangzholi and Alakbar village, project tried to recognize poor people and undertake capacity building and skill training for them. In other two pilots, project is trying to plan the process.

* Unit(s) assigned to be responsible for the preparation of a management response will fill the columns under the management response section.
 ** Unit(s) assigned to be responsible for the preparation of a management response will be updating the implementation status. Assigned with an oversight function monitors and verifies the implementation status.
 *** Status of implementation: Completed, Partially Completed, Pending