

Terms of Reference (TOR)

IMPACT ASSESSMENT STUDY FOR ARDAHAN KARS ARTVIN DEVELOPMENT PROJECT

A. INTRODUCTION

1. Ardahan Kars Artvin Development Project is implemented by Ministry of Food Agriculture and Livestock of Republic of Turkey as per the finance agreement signed on 10 April 2010. Based on the Ministry's proposal and IFAD's approval letter on 10 December 2014, the project completion date is extended from 30 September 2015 to 30 September 2017 and the project closure date is extended from 31 March 2016 to 31 March 2018. The project is jointly financed by IFAD and Government of Turkey. Overall responsibility for the management and implementation of AKADP would rest with MFAL with support from UNDP as per the service agreement. A Project Management Unit (PMU) was established in Kars under the leadership of MFAL covering all day to day management and implementation of the Project through the assistance from PDFAL in all three provinces.
2. The main objective of the AKADP is to improve the rural poverty conditions in Ardahan Kars and Artvin provinces. Project activities are organized under three components (i) smallholder and non-farm enterprise investments (ii) village infrastructure investments (iii) institutional strengthening and project management.
3. The total project cost is \$26.4 million. IFAD contributes \$19.2 million (73%), beneficiary contributions are \$4 million (15%), Government of Turkey contributes \$1 million (4%) and the remaining \$2 million (8%) is the added value from government taxes.
4. Project area covers one of the least developed and the poorest regions of Turkey. The population is heavily located in rural areas where the income depends on low input/low output agriculture sector. Project target group uses traditional methods in agriculture and livestock practices with limited access to capital and therefore the production model operates based on family farms without plans for growth and transforming into economically viable businesses. This situation causes lack of confidence in economic development and unwillingness to improve rural poverty.
5. Project target group is economically active livestock and agriculture producers who want to move towards more commercialized business models. Target group is defined as livestock producers with less than 20 registered cattle and horticultural crop producers with 0.3-0.5 ha of vegetable plot or small greenhouse. Project also supports non-agriculture sectors in project villages that have economic growth potential such as rural tourism.
6. This Terms of Reference deals with hiring a suitably qualified and experienced consultancy company (henceforth referred to as 'consultant') to undertake the proposed Impact Assessment of the Project. The methodology for impact assessment will involve both quantitative and qualitative approaches.
7. The project is being implemented in the following districts of Ardahan, Kars, and Artvin provinces:
 - a. Ardahan: Ardahan Centre, Çıldır, Damal, Göle, Hanak, and Posof;
 - b. Kars: Arpaçay, Kağızman, Sarıkamış, and Selim;
 - c. Artvin: Artvin Centre, Ardanoç, Şavşat, and Yusufeli.

B. Objectives and Scope of the Impact Assessment

1. The objective of the Impact Assessment is to assess the physical and socio-economic status of the targeted areas and their households where the AKADP is being implemented. In addition, using the Focus Group Discussions (FGD) and case studies methods, the aim is to assess beneficiaries' experiences and their perceptions of the projects' effectiveness, document successes, challenges and lessons learned, and develop recommendations for future.

2. The assessment should: (i) focus on key indicators required to measure the goals, outcomes and impact of the planned activities as it was mentioned in the Project's Logical Framework (see Annex 1); (ii) Provide comparison with the selected baseline survey indicators that was conducted for the AKADP; (iii) Assess how the AKADP was successful in relation to the five evaluation criteria (relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability and impact) and (iv) Evaluate the specific strategy and tactics for the areas of concern as outlined in Appendix 2 in relation to design and implementation modalities.

3. The assessment of Project performance should have a special emphasis on:

- Relevance – how and to what extent the project activities consistent with target group's needs, local condition requirements, and institutional priorities?
- Effectiveness – to what extent the project interventions contributed to the project high level objectives and outcomes, and the level of achievement in terms of undertaking activities as per the project design and AWPB?
- Efficiency – are the project inputs and resources translated into concrete results in an economically feasible manner (based on the assessment of implementation delays, technical capacity issues; operational efficiency, and the economic rates of return)?
- Sustainability – to what extent the project benefits extend beyond the project duration including the assessment of the anticipated results and risks?
- Impact – what are the actual and expected changes occurred in the rural community and target group (including positive and negative, direct and indirect) as a result of project interventions;
- Gender Equality and Women Empowerment – to what extent the project contributed to the gender equality and empowerment as outlined in the project design documents?

4. In addition to the above, the impact assessment study should discuss:

- Innovation: In what aspects did the project manage to bring innovative solutions to meet the needs of the target groups, provide unique methods to overcome challenges, and demonstrate exemplary approaches within the rural development context?
- Lessons Learned: What are the key results (both positive and negative), insights, stories, and messages learned from AKADP project worthwhile reporting to improve the design and implementation of the future projects?

C. General Approach of the Impact Assessment

5. The proposed Impact Assessment Survey will be used to collect data to measure the impact on both project outcomes and impacts. The Survey will consider having a representative sample from beneficiaries, attribution of impact through interviewing both beneficiaries and non-beneficiaries, and provide results for impact level indicators as per the log frame. Both quantitative and qualitative methods will be used by the consultant to assess the impact of the project. A statistically sound sampling methodology will be designed in collaboration with PMU and MFAL. The consultant may also be asked to prepare a technical document outlining the survey sampling methodology and roll-out plan.

6. The consultant will be responsible for the development of stratified random sampling method under the guidance of PMU and MFAL. The sampling selection will consider control groups and will be based on beneficiary/non-beneficiary and the project target areas including the targeted provinces, districts, and communes.

7. The Impact Assessment will be undertaken in close collaboration with the relevant staff of the project. The Rural Development Advisor will be responsible for the direction and management of the Survey. The Final Impact Assessment report is to be completed by 10/15/2017.

D. Phasing

8. The assignment will be undertaken in three key phases: preparation, implementation, data analysis and reporting. The assignment will be completed after the presentation of results in a workshop. Progress reports on key deliverables may be requested during and at the completion of each stage. The specific activities include:

Preparation

- Review the AKADP design documents and identify the key requirements for the Impact Assessment;
- Review the programme log frame and identify assessment methodology required for each of the pre-determined indicators to be measured on the Projects Goal/Impact and Objectives/Outcome levels;
- Review the results of the AKADP Baseline Survey, as well as the relevant data collected by AKADP M&E system; identify the data gaps and develop proxy indicators as necessary.
- Identify and review available sources of secondary data; assess primary data collection requirements;
- Develop a full technical document discussing the survey instruments including sampling methodology, stratification details, and statistical assessment criteria; develop the sampling framework with a brief action plan;
- Prepare the questionnaires (for survey and FGD), other survey tools, and the database system for data entry. The questionnaire should be comprehensive enough to cover the indicators as outlined in the Goals/Impact and Objectives/Outcomes level of the project logframe matrix.
- Preparation of training materials and detailed interviewer manual (and supervisor manual, if necessary);
- Establish proper data quality procedures (i.e. avoiding duplications and controlling data integrity issues);
- Prepare an outline for the final report for the outcomes of the survey and the FGDs.

Implementation

- Enumerators will be assigned by PDFAL/DDFAL, however, consultant is responsible from the training and the supervision of the field staff; The consultant should also dedicate one team leader for each province (Ardahan Kars and Artvin) for effective coordination and to ensure that the enumerators follow the established guidelines and procedures;
- Undertake a pilot survey in one of the selected settlements to test the methodology and questionnaire, and in discussion with relevant AKADP project staff review the methodology/questionnaire as necessary;
- Conduct field visits and manage the necessary processes for data collection and audio/video recording of FGDs. Coordinate data collection work and ensure full compliance with the data entry protocols, data privacy and protection rules, and the transcripts; the assessment process should respect ethical best practices in terms of obtaining consent from interviewees and respecting their right to privacy;
- Consultant is responsible to make hotel & transportation arrangements for team leaders, and should reflect all related expenditures in the price offer except for the transportations within the project districts and villages, which will be undertaken by the PMU. All travel and accommodations costs of the PDFAL/DDFAL enumerators will be compensated by the AKADP project.

Analysis

- Analyze and interpret the data/information collected using household survey and FGD, taking into consideration the goal, objectives, outcome and outputs and target group of AKADP; place emphasis on analyzing the results from the viewpoint of data triangulation;
- Prepare a detailed report and analysis based on the submitted outline during the preparation phase. Modify and amend the report if necessary based on the feedback from MFAL and PMU.

Final Workshop

- The Impact Assessment results should be presented to the MFAL and AKADP relevant staff and to the representatives of different partners and stakeholders;

G. Required Qualifications

Contractor's personnel (i.e. expert to be mobilized by the Contractor to deliver the Assignment) that have a crucial role in implementing the contract are referred to as key personnel. CVs, copies of diplomas, and relevant certifications of key personnel should be included in the Technical Proposal.

CVs shall list all the relevant activities for the entire time period mentioned in their CVs as years of experience.

Hereinafter, the profiles of the key personnel are presented. Note the minimum requirements and the assets. The minimum requirements refer to the qualifications that the personnel to be proposed by the Proposer should definitely possess.

“Assets” are preferred qualities and qualifications of the key personnel. Proposed personnel that possess the minimum requirements will obtain 70% of the maximum obtainable points, whereas proposed personnel that also possess the “assets”, in addition to all the minimum requirements, may secure up to 100% of the maximum obtainable points.

The below defined key personnel are the main responsible persons for the tasks defined in this Assignment.

The list of key personnel and required general/specific professional experiences are shown in the following table:

The duties and detailed required qualifications for each key personnel are given below:

Duties of the Project Coordinator:

- Responsible for the development of the work plan and implementation of the impact assessment study and revises as appropriate to meet changing needs and requirements;
- He/she will ensure that positive and productive working relations and regular communication are maintained with the MFAL, UNDP, and PMU;
- He/she will ensure accordance of the developed methodology and activities to the needs and expectations of the project administration;
- He/she will manage the overall processes of the design of the survey methodology, focus group discussions, questionnaire, data entry tools, reporting, and the arrangements of the final workshop;
- He/she will ensure that the coordination mechanism is working properly with the field supervisors and the proposed activities are rolled out before the deadlines;
- He/she will attend the working groups and other activities conducted by the Contractor.

Required Skills and Experience for Project Manager:

	Minimum Requirements	Assets
General Qualifications	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- At least bachelor's degree in agriculture, business administration, economics, social sciences, or other related fields- Fluency in Turkish	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- Post graduate degree (MSc, M.A. M.B.A. and/or PhD degree)- Fluency in English
Professional Experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- A minimum of 8 years of professional experience.- At least 3 years of experience as a project manager/ coordinator/team leader under projects/programmes-	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- More than 10 years of professional experience in relevant subject- Experience in working with Governmental Organizations, UN, and/or International Donor Agencies

	Minimum Requirements	Assets
Specific Experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Minimum 2 years of working experience in the design and implementation of M&E systems and/or impact assessment surveys 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - In depth knowledge and experience of cross cutting issues and thematic areas Experience in rural development, agriculture, and/or social policies

Duties of the Senior Expert in Social Sciences:

- Understand the project goals, objectives and the interventions through desk review of relevant project documents, and discussions with the project implementers and stakeholders;
- Build and articulate the study hypotheses, assumptions, and risks to guide the design processes and ensure that the questionnaire and focus group discussions are in line with the requirements;
- Communicate the social development objectives in the log frame proactively and lead the integration of social policy dimension into the impact assessment study;
- Provide insights and interpretations from social sciences perspectives to improve the design, analysis, and reporting;
- Contribute in the development of survey and focus group questionnaire by integrating the cross cutting issues and thematic aspects during the design stage;
- Work closely with senior analyst to review and interpret the readings from the data and support the team by providing in depth insights from the social policy contexts.

Required Skills and Experience for Senior Expert in Social Sciences:

	Minimum Requirements	Assets
General Qualifications	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - At least bachelor's degree in social sciences - Fluency in Turkish 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Post graduate degree (in social sciences) - Fluency in English
Professional Experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A minimum of 5 years of professional experience. - At least 3 years of experience as a social program officer, social expert, or in any other related capacity 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - More than 8 years of professional experience in relevant subject - Experience in working with Governmental Organizations, UN, and/or International Donor Agencies
Specific Experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Minimum 2 years of working experience in social policy design, strategy development, social analysis, or any other related discipline 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - In depth knowledge and experience of cross cutting issues and thematic areas Experience in rural development, agriculture, social analytical works

Duties of the Senior Analyst:

- Understand the project goals, objectives and the interventions through desk review of relevant project documents, and discussions with the project implementers and stakeholders;
- Develop statistically sound sampling methodology and lead the design of questionnaire forms in consultation with MFAL and PMU based on the project log frame and as described in the ToR;
- Ensure that the data collection tools are properly designed, data entries are managed according to the guidelines, enumerators received training on the data entry protocols.
- Ensure that the collected data is consolidated and maintained/stored/secured in proper database platform;
- Carry out data analysis works of the survey data to extract useful insights, benchmark against the control group and baseline data, and update the logical framework;

- Report the findings in a proper format and in line with the project log frame, discuss the results and implications, and assist the project coordinator in the completion of reports;
- Respond the adhoc inquiries from the project management when requested in a timely manner;
- Develop proper data management tools to capture qualitative information from focus group discussions and conduct categorical analysis to meaningfully report on the qualitative data.

Required Skills and Experience for Senior Analyst:

	Minimum Requirements	Assets
General Qualifications	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - At least bachelor's degree in statistics, economics, business administration, social sciences, or other related fields - Fluency in Turkish 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Post graduate degree (MSc, M.A. and/or PhD degree) - Fluency in English
Professional Experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A minimum of 5 years of professional experience. - At least 3 years of experience as a data/business analyst, statistician, or data specialist, or program specialist - Must have practical experience in using statistical software or data mining tools 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - More than 8 years of professional experience in relevant subject - Experience in working with Governmental Organizations, UN, and/or International Donor Agencies
Specific Experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Minimum 2 years of working experience in the design and implementation of surveys, analysis of panel data, mapping survey results, and/or data mining 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - In depth knowledge and experience of cross cutting issues and thematic areas - Experience in rural development, agriculture, and/or social policies

Duties of the Field Survey Coordinators (one for each 3 provinces):

- Responsible in the overall coordination of enumerators (assigned by PDFAL/DDFAL) during the survey implementation;
- Provide trainings on the questionnaire, data entry protocols, and beneficiary communication etiquette before the implementation;
- Monitor the quality of data collection processes to endorse or request renewal of the survey on a case by case basis;
- Provide technical assistance to enumerators and be on call whenever needed to respond the inquiries during the implementation;
- Set and execute control/spotcheck procedures to ensure that the surveys are being conducted according to the desired quality standards;
- Provide regular updates on the implementation progress to MFAL and PMU when requested.

Required Skills and Experience for Field Survey Coordinators:

	Minimum Requirements	Assets
General Qualifications	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - At least bachelor's degree in statistics, economics, business administration, social sciences, or other related fields - Fluency in Turkish 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Post graduate degree (MSc, M.A. and/or PhD degree) - Fluency in English

	Minimum Requirements	Assets
Professional Experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A minimum of 5 years of professional experience. - At least 3 years of experience as a field coordinator, survey team leader, or in a similar role 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - More than 8 years of professional experience in relevant subject - Experience in working with Governmental Organizations, UN, and/or International Donor Agencies
Specific Experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Minimum 2 years of working experience in coordinating and/or training of field survey teams or enumerators 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - In depth knowledge and experience of cross cutting issues and thematic areas - Experience in rural development, agriculture, and/or social policies

Key Documentation to be provided

10. The following documentation will be provided under separate cover:

- AKADP design documents;
- AKADP Baseline Survey Report and Data;
- Annual RIMS reports and project output reports.