

**Evaluation of**

“Institutional Capacity Development for the Implementation of Kuwait National Development Plan (ICDI/KNDP)” Project

*Evaluation Report*

**December 2018**

*Disclaimer: The evaluation report has been commissioned by the UNDP Office in Kuwait. The views expressed herein are those of the consultant and do not necessarily reflect the opinions of UN Kuwait or the Government of Kuwait.*

**Acknowledgements**

The evaluator expresses her gratitude to the staff at UNDP Kuwait for the assistance they provided throughout the evaluation process. Their perspective on the successes and challenges encountered during the ICDI/KNDP project implementation was indispensable as was their support in gathering necessary documentation and feedback from stakeholders. The evaluator would like to especially thank the UNDP Program Coordinators and the ICDI/KNDP Project Coordination Unit based at the General Secretariat of the Supreme Council for Planning and Development and the Central Statistics Bureau for their assistance, valuable insights, and providing documentation. The evaluator also offers sincere thanks to the representatives of all public and private stakeholders for their time, effort and availability to participate in the interviews.

Cristina MOSNEAGA, international consultant[[1]](#footnote-1)

Kuwait City, September 2018

Table of Contents

[List of Abbreviations and Acronyms 4](#_Toc531443424)

[List of Figures and Tables 5](#_Toc531443425)

[Executive Summary 6](#_Toc531443426)

[Introduction 8](#_Toc531443427)

[1. METHODOLOGY 9](#_Toc531443428)

[2. THE PROJECT 12](#_Toc531443429)

[2.1](#_Toc531443430) [The Project’s contribution to Kuwait National Development Plan 2014/15-2019/20 and New Kuwait 2035 Vision 13](#_Toc531443431)

[2.2 Project Overview 14](#_Toc531443432)

[2.3 Project Stakeholders 15](#_Toc531443433)

[2.4 Design and Implementation Arrangements 15](#_Toc531443434)

[2.5 Project’s Contribution to Achieving the SDGs in Kuwait 17](#_Toc531443435)

[3. EVALUATION FINDINGS 20](#_Toc531443436)

[3.1 Overall Findings 20](#_Toc531443437)

[3.2 Project Output Findings 23](#_Toc531443438)

[4. LESSONS LEARNT AND RECOMMENDATIONS 36](#_Toc531443439)

[Conclusions 38](#_Toc531443440)

[Appendix I. Interview Protocol 39](#_Toc531443441)

[Appendix II. Evaluation Matrix 40](#_Toc531443442)

[Appendix III. Schedule of Meetings 41](#_Toc531443443)

[Appendix IV. Evaluation Ratings and their Definitions 42](#_Toc531443444)

# List of Abbreviations and Acronyms

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | | | | |  |  | |
|  | | |  |  | | |
|  | | |  |  | | |
|  | | |  |  | | |
|  | | |  |  | | |
|  | | |  |  | | |
|  | | |  |  | | |
|  | | |  |  | | |
|  | | |  |  | | |
|  | | |  |  | | |
| AWP  CSB  CO  CP  CSO  CPAP  GSSCPD |  | Annual Work Plan  Central Statistical Bureau  Country Office  Country Programme  Civil Society Organizations  Country Programme Action Plan  General Secretariat of the Supreme Council for Planning and DeveloDevelopment | | | | |
| ICT | | |  | Information and Communication Technology | | |
| KNDP | | |  | Kuwait National Development Plan | | |
| KPI | | |  | Key Performance Indicator | | |
| NIM | | |  | National Implementation | | |
| PCU | | |  | Project Coordination Unit | | |
| PM  PPR | | |  | Project Manager  Project Progress Report | | |
| QPR | | |  | Quarterly Project Report | | |
| SDGs | | |  | Sustainable Development Goals | | |
| UNCT | | |  | United Nations Country Team | | |
| UNDP  TORs | | |  | United Nations Development Programme  Terms of References | | |

# List of Figures and Tables

Figure 1. Overview of KNDP New Kuwait, page 14

Figure 2. ICDI/KNDP Project Management Structures, page 17

Table 1. Evaluation Criteria and Definitions, page 10

Table 2. The Colour Rating Scale, page 11

Table 3. ICDI / KNDP Project’s Contribution to SDG targets, page 18

Table 4. ICDI/KNDP Project Grading & Ranking per Evaluation Criteria, page 22

# Executive Summary

This report presents the findings from the evaluation of the “Institutional Capacity Development for the Implementation of Kuwait National Development Plan” project in the State of Kuwait (further in the text, the ICDI/KNDP project) conducted in August - November 2018.

The evaluation is a qualitative study based on individual and group interviews with 36 persons, including national public authorities and private entities involved in the project, UNDP team, and project staff. Overall the respondents found that the project is highly relevant and managed to generate positive impact (although levels vary depending on the output, see Section 3 “Evaluation Findings”). Long-term impact and sustainability are not easily identifiable at this stage and will mainly depend on the commitment of stakeholders to pursue change and keep up the momentum. The evaluator ranks effectiveness and efficiency “satisfactory” and sustainability “moderately likely”[[2]](#footnote-2).

At the global level, the evaluation concluded that ICDI / KNDP managed to overcome the setbacks that are beyond the project’s control (see section 3, Challenges), activities are mostly on track and all outputs have achieved at least a 70% completion rate by mid-2018[[3]](#footnote-3). UNDP Country Office and the PCU have deployed considerable effort and that is commendable.

The project serves as a national platform to support the country in implementing the KNDP and Kuwait’s efforts in achieving and reporting on the SDGs. Moreover, it is a platform for integration of SDGs into national development plans and projects. The project not only supports localising SDGs, but furthermore, SDG-ising the national development plan following a bottom-up approach through mainstreaming the global agenda for sustainable development within a demand driven framework.

**Key achievements until November 2018:**

* The project supported GSSCPD in reviewing its organizational structure, SoPs documentation and simplification, job descriptions for staff, and developing a Human Resources Strategy that includes training strategies tailored to required competencies, a performance management system, as well as an orientation package for new staff.
* The project supported the implementation of a Leadership Development Programme targeting 52 senior officials from the government, and 75 staff from middle management at GSSCDP and CSB.
* The project supported the formulation of a strategic plan to articulate Kuwait Vision 2035 and restructure the medium-term plan (KNDP) for more effective implementation towards the fulfilment of Kuwait Vision 2035. The project is currently supporting the formulation of the third medium-term development plan (KNDP 2020-2025).
* The project supported the establishment of 4 centres as part of GSSCPD new organisational structure including the **Kuwait Public Policy Centre** (the first in the region, since February 2017 supported under a separate UNDP project), the **Kuwait Knowledge Economy Centre** (1st in the region), organising the 1st knowledge economy forum and expo in Kuwait, the **National Centre for Development Research and Studies**, and the **National Observatory for Sustainable Development and Future Forecasting.**
* The project is supporting the National Committee for Sustainable Development in producing the 1st VNR Report to be presented in 2019. Additionally, the project extended its support to formulation and implementation of sectoral and thematic national development strategies, such as the Strategy for the Supreme Council for Family Affairs (1st national strategy in this area), the Strategic Plan for Food and Nutrition Authority, the Urban Development Master Plan and the 1st national report on Sustainable Urban Development in Kuwait, the Ministry of Finance Strategic Plan, and the National Industries Development and Protection Strategy, formulation and implementation of the Research Strategy for the Ministry of National Assembly Affairs, establishment of the Strategic Programme Office for the Public Authority for Housing Welfare to manage South Mutlaa city project (the biggest housing project in the country), and in cooperation with Ministry of Youth, the project supported organising the first regional UNDP Youth Leadership Programme (YLP) and organizing the first JPO symposium in Kuwait.
* The project supported GSSCPD on the awareness and public engagement front, the New Kuwait campaign was launched with project support to raise awareness and foster public engagement to reinforce implementation of the KNDP. Currently the project is in the process of launching the New Kuwait Radio Campaign and the New Kuwait Ambassadors Campaign.
* The project supported strengthening technical capacities of the Central Statistics Bureau (CSB) in surveys sampling, upgrading statistical systems for collection and publication of data, revision of statistical methodologies, implantation of Household Income & Expenditures Survey, and ramp-up activities of national capacities to implement on the 2020 registered census.

# Introduction

The report contains four sections.

The first section lays out the methodology and the framework used for analysis. The ICDI/KNDP evaluation is a qualitative study building on observations, individual and group interviews with implementing partners, beneficiaries, the UNDP Country Team and project staff conducted in Kuwait City during 4 – 10 September 2018.

The second section presents the project. The report looks at the management structures and implementing arrangements and discuss the project’s contribution to achieving the SDGs in Kuwait.

The third section presents the evaluation findings in two ways. First, the report looks at the project performance globally including design and management structures, stakeholder participation, communication and knowledge sharing strategy. The report lists the project’s achievements, as well as the remaining challenges. Second, the report analyses individual project outcomes including specific results on stated targets.

The fourth and final section draws on the lessons learnt and makes recommendations for the future.

# 1. METHODOLOGY

**Purpose, Objective and Scope of the Evaluation**

The purpose of this assignment was to conduct an external evaluation of the ICDI/KNDP project. The evaluator worked in close consultation with the UNDP Country Office in Kuwait and the PCU staff based at the GSSCPD and CSB.

The evaluation report provides stakeholders with an independent appraisal of ICDI/KNDP project performance and impact from its start in June 2015 until September 2018. The report also contributes to accountability, and records achievements, good practices and lessons learnt from implementation thus far.

The specific objective of this evaluation is to assess the functioning and the achievements of the ICDI/KNDP project so it can better contribute to progress towards building the capacities of the GSSCPD, CSB and other public entities involved in the implementation of KNDP in Kuwait. This evaluation assesses the ICDI/KNDP project using five evaluation criteria: relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability. The findings of the evaluation shall be used by the GSSCPD and UNDP to:

* Demonstrate the project’s achievements and challenges as well as identify lessons learned and areas still to be covered;
* Enhance the project’s relevance, efficiency and effectiveness during the remaining implementation period and future similar interventions;
* Define how the project could evolve in order to secure its sustainability;
* Help link with the next Country Program.

The evaluation report identifies the project key achievements so far, analyses the enabling factors and obstacles, and scrutinizes the challenges encountered and their causes. It further assesses what remedial actions have been or can possibly be taken to ensure a smooth and effective implementation in the future.

**Methodology**

The evaluation process had three stages: desk assessment, field work, and report drafting and review.[[4]](#footnote-4)

The evaluator held interviews in Kuwait City with the implementing partners, the main stakeholders, beneficiaries, UNDP Country Team and project staff from the 4th to the 10th of September 2018. In total 47 persons were interviewed, including the State Minister for Economic and Social Affairs, the Secretary General of the GSSCPD, the Director and Deputy Director of CSB, Assistants to the Secretary General of the GSSCPD, and Heads of Departments[[5]](#footnote-5). The evaluator held individual and group interviews with these key informants in order to get a first-hand exposure to the results of the project interventions[[6]](#footnote-6).

A debriefing session was held on 10 September 2018 in Kuwait City with the UNDP team and project staff to share preliminary conclusions and collect initial feedback.

**Evaluation Criteria**

The following OECD – DAC criteria[[7]](#footnote-7) were used during the evaluation: Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Impact and Sustainability. Table 1 below provides the assessment elements that guided the evaluation process.

*Table 1. Evaluation Criteria and Definitions*

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Criterion** | **Definition** |
| **Relevance** | Assessing both in terms of alignment of project objectives with country needs and priorities, as well as project design features geared to the achievement of objectives. |
| **Effectiveness** | Measuring the extent to which the project’s objectives were achieved considering their relative importance. |
| **Efficiency** | Indicating how economically resources/inputs were converted into results. |
| **Impact** | Referring to the changes that occurred or are expected to occur in the lives of the stakeholders (whether positive or negative, direct or indirect, intended or unintended) as a results of project interventions. |
| **Sustainability** | Indicating the likely continuation of project benefits beyond the phase of funding support. It also includes an assessment of the likelihood that actual and anticipated results will be resilient to risks beyond the project’s life. |

In addition to the criteria listed above, the evaluator also analyzed the level of involvement of stakeholders in the implementation of the project as well as the project’s knowledge management, outreach and communication strategy.

**Limitations**

Overall the evaluator conducted the assignment without any major issues to report. Nevertheless, the evaluator would like to note that the main limitation in the process was the fact that the evaluation was conducted over one year prior to the expected end date of the project (December 2019). Therefore, the full extent of the project’s impact and sustainability could not be assessed. Since this is a mid-term review of the project, this limitation also has a bearing on assessing the project impact and sustainability.

**The Evaluation Rating Scale**

The evaluator used a three-color scale in combination with the evaluation ratings as recommended by the UNEG Code.

The colour rating system provides a quick overview of progress under each criterion. It is helpful in identifying well performing and problematic areas. The rating scale includes six scores ranging from 6 - Highly Satisfactory; 5 - Satisfactory; 4 - Moderately Satisfactory; 3 - Moderately Unsatisfactory; 2 – Unsatisfactory to 1 - Highly Unsatisfactory[[8]](#footnote-8).

*Table 2. The Color Rating Scale*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Rating** | | **What it means** |
| 6. Highly Satisfactory;  5. Satisfactory | | The situation is considered satisfactory overall and if some issues were mentioned, they did not call into question the project and were solved by project team / stakeholders. |
|  | 4.Moderately Satisfactory;  3.Moderately Unsatisfactory | There were issues which needed to be addressed. Necessary improvements did not however require a major revision of the activities and/or implementation arrangements. |
|  | 2.Unsatisfactory;  1.Highly Unsatisfactory | There were serious deficiencies which required major adjustments, revisions or cancellation of activities, components, or implementation arrangements of the project. |

# 2. THE PROJECT

*Map 1. Map of the State of Kuwait[[9]](#footnote-9)*



## 2.1 The Project’s contribution to Kuwait National Development Plan 2014/15-2019/20 and New Kuwait 2035 Vision

In September 2011, UNDP signed a project agreement with the GSSCPD to provide technical experts to contribute to the development of the first five years of KNDP 2011-2015. The second KNDP, spanning 2014/15-2019/20, was approved by Kuwait’s National Assembly in 2015, and is built on two tracks, namely: 1. addressing the challenges of economic, human and social development, the efficiency of state institutions and administration, and combating corruption; and 2. assessing the enabling conditions required to achieve the “Kuwait 2035 Vision,” especially for the transformation of the country into a commercial and financial hub for the region.

Through the ICDI/KNDP project UNDP continues to support the GSSCPD in the development and implementation of this plan. This project focuses on the technical expertise and the support needed for capacity development as well as knowledge and skill transfer. The project, which started in July 2015, develops the capacities of the GSSCPD and key government agencies in the development and planning, coordination, and monitoring for effective implementation of the KNDP. This includes the following outcomes:

1. Improved human capacity and organisational effectiveness of the GSSCPD for development planning;
2. Enhanced institutional and human capacity of the Central Statistics Bureau (CSB) for sustainable development policies, and
3. Increased technical expertise and institutional capacities of public entities for strategic planning and implementation of KNDP projects.

The KNDP sets the nation’s long-term development priorities. It is organized around five themes and seven pillars for investment and improvement. Each pillar has a number of strategic programs and projects that are designed to have the most impact on achieving the vision of a New Kuwait. The KNDP is implemented through Annual Development Plans that include development programs spread over all the pillars accompanied by a set of projects under each program.

In January 2017, the government released the New Kuwait 2035 Strategic Plan (New Kuwait 2035 Vision), which aims to transform the country into a regional, financial and commercial hub as part of long-term economic diversification efforts. Through its activities, the ICDI/KNDP project contributes to the realization of this vision.

Specifically, the project has supported the finalization of a strategic plan to articulate Kuwait Vision 2035, including Implementation Action Plans for government entities. An analysis of the KNDP pillars and projection of the general direction for 2018/2019 Annual Development Plan under each pillar was undertaken with UNDP technical support. A new mechanism for ensuring alignment to KNDP and Kuwait Vision 2035 was developed and used for vetting 170 project proposals by public entities. The Annual Development Plan 2018/2019 has been finalized with UNDP technical support and through engagement of national stakeholders to ensure sustainability. Support was also provided for development of a “General Framework of Terms of Reference for Engineering Projects”, the framework was designed to ensure improved effective management of projects and provide a unified mechanism for preparing and reviewing Projects ToRs more effectively, thus improving accuracy in meeting project implementation targets.

UNDP has also supported further development of the monitoring and preparation database system of development projects. Specifically, further enhancements were applied to the monitoring platform to facilitate monitoring of project implementation schedule, new criteria were developed for selecting development projects and were integrated in the system ensuring better use of indicators to measure impact and facilitate analysis of data, and extraction of reports.

*Figure 1. Overview of KNDP 2014/15-2019/20 / New Kuwait 2035 Vision[[10]](#footnote-10)*

****

The ICDI/KNDP project overall contributes to the implementation of the KNDP and the project activities and outputs are aligned to all seven pillars of the KNDP. The specific projects under each pillar are governmental projects.

## 2.2 Project Overview

1. The ICDI / KNDP project is a part of the UNDP – Kuwait Country Program Action Plan 2015 – 2018[[11]](#footnote-11). It falls under “Outcome 3: Governance and institutional management is efficient, transparent, accessible, competitive and accountable”. More specifically, an institutional and capacity assessment of the GSSSCPD carried out in 2015 showed opportunities in the role, structure, and business process of the institution. Its aspiration to assume a think-tank role, in addition to its part in developing and implementing the Development Plan, was particularly noted. At the same time, capacity gaps on human resource data management and workforce planning were identified, together with other needs on staff skills/qualifications audit, management training, and staff well-being. The final results of this capacity assessment were used to inform the design of the ICDI / KNDP project.

It is in this context, the ICDI / KNDP project provides a framework of technical support to the GSSCPD, the CSB, and other public entities, to create an enabling environment for KNDP results, supporting to reshape the national agenda towards Kuwait Vision 2035, and foster integration with SDGs. The expected outcome of this project is:

Project Outcome: Capacities of the GSSCPD and Key Government Agencies in Development Planning, Coordination and Monitoring Developed for Effective Implementation of the KNDP.

The overarching outcome are expected to be reached through the following three specific outputs:

* Output 1.1: Improved human capacity and organizational effectiveness of the GSSCPD for development planning;
* Output 1.2: Enhanced institutional and human capacities of the CSB for evidence-based plans and policies on sustainable development;
* Output 1.3: Increased technical expertise and institutional capacities for strategic planning and implementation of KNDP projects by public entities.

The Project is mobilizing technical assistance, supporting capacity development activities and knowledge transfer, development of national systems for better formulation and implementation of development plans in line with New Kuwait Vision.

## 2.3 Project Stakeholders

The ICDI/KNDP project has two major stakeholders:

**The General Secretariat of the Supreme Council for Planning and Development** (GSSCPD)[[12]](#footnote-12) has been established as an independent structure in 2004 replacing the Ministry of Planning (established in 1976) and its precursor the Planning Council (established in 1962). GSSCPD is leading Kuwait’s development and planning process. It is mandated to design, coordinate and oversight the Kuwait National Development Plan implementation. GSSCPD is UNDP’s main partner and Executing Entity for the UNDP Country Program Action Plan in Kuwait.

The **Central Statistical Bureau (CSB)[[13]](#footnote-13)** represents the state nodal institution for Statistics in Kuwait. It is responsible for the production and dissemination of accurate, comprehensive and reliable statistical data that is necessary for research, support decision-making through shaping evidence-based policies of the country.

## 2.4 Design and Implementation Arrangements

The project follows the National Implementation Modality (NIM) with support from the UNDP Country Office in Kuwait. The GSSCPD is designated as the National Executive Agency and Implementing Partner for this project. It is responsible for chairing the Project Board and providing project oversight support to enable it to achieve its intended outputs and results with the presence of UNDP as a board member.

UNDP provides GSSCPD with regular technical backstopping and monitoring activities, as well as with mobilizing support services for the execution of the project. UNDP has appointed a project manager responsible for day-to-day management and project decision-making. She is responsible for overall coordination of project activities, oversight, guidance and ensuring technical quality (e.g. consultants’ TOR and reports, progress reporting through quarterly, annual and final reports, financial management, etc.).

The ICDI/KNDP Project has the following management structures with the following responsibilities:

**The Project Board.** The PB is the strategic governing entity of the project through which the government exerts ownership and responsibility for the execution of the project. The PB provides technical support, shares relevant information, and reviews progress. The PB is the key decision-making body and comprises the Secretary General of the SCPD, a representative of UNDP, representatives of the CSB administration and other ministries as and when required. The PB meets quarterly to review and approve the work plan and budget and to steer, and monitor the project activities’ implementation progress. In particular, it is responsible for approving any changes to and revisions to the project document and agreeing on specific activities to be carried out by the implementing partners along with the allocated budget as specified and agreed in the Annual Work Plan.

**The Project Coordination Unit.** ThePCU includes one Project Liaison Officer, two Project Coordinators, two procurement officers but no assistants, all based at the GSSCPD and CSB in Kuwait City. The PCU oversees operations and, as a whole, ensures coordination, procurement, reporting, monitoring and evaluation of the project. The PCU is responsible for ensuring and tracking results at the outcome and output levels. However, the delivery of individual project activities is the responsibility of the nominated implementing partners / responsible units within these structures. The UNDP Country Office also provides specific technical support to the PCU as and when inputs are needed for actions, in addition to providing assurance function to the project.

*Figure 2. ICDI/KNDP Project Management Structures[[14]](#footnote-14)*

**Project Manager**

**Project Board**

**Senior Supplier**

**UNDP Senior Management**

**Senior Executive**

**Secretary General of SCPD**

**Beneficiaries**

**Project Assurance**

**UNDP Democratic Governance Team Leader**

**Project Support**

**Project Organization Structure**

**Output 1**

**Improved institutional human capacity and organizational effectiveness of the GSSCPD for development planning**

**Output 3**

**Increased technical expertise and institutional capacities for strategic planning and implementation of KNDP projects by public entities**

**Output 2**

**Enhanced institutional and human capacities of the CSB to support evidence-based plans and policies on sustainable development**

## 2.5 Project’s Contribution to Achieving the SDGs in Kuwait

Kuwait’s high-income capacity and ability to provide comprehensive social support to its citizens contributes to achieving the SDG targets.

While the successful implementation of the project would indirectly support the achievement of all 17 SDGs, the project addresses the following specific SDG targets with the accompanying indicators:

*Table 3. ICDI / KNDP Project’s Contribution to SDG targets*

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **SDG Targets** | **SDG Indicators** |
| **SDG 5.c**: Adopt and strengthen sound policies and enforceable legislation for the promotion of gender equality and the empowerment of all women and girls at all levels. | **5.c.1**: Proportion of countries with systems to track and make public allocations for gender equality and women’s empowerment. |
| **SDG 16.6**: Develop effective, accountable and transparent institutions at all levels. | **16.6.1**: Primary government expenditures as a proportion of original approved budget, by sector (or by budget codes or similar); **16.6.2**: Proportion of population satisfied with their last experience of public services. |
| **SDG 16.7**: Ensure responsive, inclusive, participatory and representative decision-making at all levels. | **16.7.2**: Proportion of population who believe decision-making is inclusive and responsive, by sex, age, disability and population group. |
| **SDG 17.13**: Enhance global macroeconomic stability, including through policy coordination and policy coherence. | **17.13.1**: Macroeconomic dashboard |
| **SDG 17.14**: Enhance policy coherence for sustainable development. | **17.14.1**: Number of countries with mechanisms in place to enhance policy coherence of sustainable development. |
| **SDG 17.16**: Enhance the Global Partnership for Sustainable Development, complemented by multi-stakeholder partnerships that mobilize and share knowledge, expertise, technology and financial resources, to support the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals in all countries, in particular developing countries. | **17.16.1**: Number of countries reporting progress in multi-stakeholder development effectiveness monitoring frameworks that support the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals. |
| **SDG 17.18**: By 2020, enhance capacity-building support to developing countries, including least developed countries and small island developing States, to increase significantly the availability of high-quality, timely and reliable data disaggregated by income, gender, age, race, ethnicity, migratory status, disability, geographic location and other characteristics relevant in national contexts. | **17.18.1**: Proportion of sustainable development indicators produced at the national level with full disaggregation when relevant to the target, in accordance with the Fundamental Principles of Official Statistics;  **17.18.2**: Number of countries that have a national statistical legislation that complies with the Fundamental Principles of Official Statistics; **17.18.3**: Number of countries with a national statistical plan that is fully funded and under implementation, by source of funding. |
| **SDG 17.19**: By 2030, build on existing initiatives to develop measurements of progress on sustainable development that complement gross domestic product, and support statistical capacity-building in developing countries. | **17.19.1**: Dollar value of all resources made available to strengthen statistical capacity in developing countries;  **17.19.2**: Proportion of countries that (a) have conducted at least one population and housing census in the last 10 years; and (b) have achieved 100 per cent birth registration and 80 per cent death registration. |

UNDP has been providing technical support to the National Observatory of Sustainable Development (NOSD), which is mandated to promote SDGs alignment, planning, and implementation in Kuwait by monitoring indicators on the national level, working to strengthen the alignment of national strategies and plans to meet sustainable development targets and supporting the preparation of SDGs VNR Reports and National SDGs reports. UNDP has been supporting GSSCPD during the establishment and operationalisation phases of the Centre by implementing training workshops and awareness raising sessions on the 2030 Agenda and its 17 SDGs., fostering the alignment of SDGs with national development planning, implementation, & monitoring through impeding international consultants in the areas of public administration, environmental planning, education, strategic planning, and sustainable development.

In 2017, a national inter-ministerial committee was established to maintain coordinated efforts among national stakeholders for data collection to capture progress of the SDGs, oversee the preparation of periodic national SDGs reports and support to achieve the SDGs on the national level. The Committee is chaired by GSSCPD, with high level representation from Central Statistics Bureau, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, and other national stakeholders. UNDP is an Observing member of the National Committee, providing strategic advice to its work in addition to facilitating the mobilisation of support needed.

Kuwait is planning to submit its first SDGs VNR report in April 2019. The Review will establish Kuwait’s baseline and enable the country to create a tool for integrated and comprehensive implementation of national development agenda for the achievement of SDGs by 2030. The project is supporting NOSD in coordinating stakeholders, building consensus, promoting partnerships, and collecting information for the report.

# 3. EVALUATION FINDINGS

This section contains two parts.

3.1 looks at the project’s performance globally. It presents findings with regard to the project management and stakeholder participation, as well as the communication and knowledge sharing. It lists ICDI/KNDP’s good practices, as well as remaining challenges.

Individual project outcomes including specific results on stated targets are analysed in section 3.2.

## 3.1 Overall Findings

The national **leadership and ownership** of the project are very high. This constitutes a strength and good practice. It is also due to the fact that the governmental stakeholders and UNDP in Kuwait have enjoyed a long and fruitful relationship since the 1960’s. All the interviewed respondents have characterized the UNDP approach as open, constructive, and participatory in the planning and implementations of activities. The respondents also confirmed that this approach provides solid ground for sustainable results and positively influences partnerships that are likely to last beyond ICDI/KNDP project interventions.

Respondents have highlighted that they appreciate the UNDP approach because:

* **Open**, as it creates a direct relationship with direct beneficiaries and partners based upon mutual discussion, trust, equality, and close consultation in both planning, implementation and decision-making;
* **Constructive**, as it builds upon existing policy frameworks in the country and relevant evidence-based capacity needs.
* **Participatory**, as key stakeholders are consulted during the design and implementation of the project. Respondents often mentioned that they see UNDP as a cooperating partner;

Nevertheless, in terms of ownership, some challenges persist. The capacity of individual departments within the GSSCPD, CSB and line ministries to plan, develop and monitor policy actions are limited. Despite strong leadership among the top management, the levels of ownership, commitment and motivation in the lower staff tiers for change and reform vary from low to moderate. As one interlocutor put it, “*young professionals are very enthusiastic when they join their departments. They are eager to learn and would come up with questions several times a day. With time, one notes a decrease in their interest. They have been assimilated by the system and fell prey to the overall culture in the public sector….*”

The **relevance** of the ICDI/KNDP project is undoubtedly **very high**. The core focus on up-stream capacity development based on needs-assessment and planning has resulted in stronger organizational capacities. The development of the institutional level capacity (as opposed to individual capacity) is more challenging as it requires working with multiple stakeholders operating within different entities and institutional cultures.

Existing capacity constraints within the GSSCPD, CSB and other public entities participating in the ICDI/KNDP infinitives limit the **impact** of the project. Although knowledge generation activities take place regularly and are at the core of the project design, activities are often delayed and overall the project framework does not contain indicators to measure progress in this area (section 4.2 discusses these aspects in more detail).

With regard to **design and implementation arrangements**, stakeholders are overall satisfied and noted the usefulness of the regular Project Board meetings as well as the full-time presence of the PCU in the premises of the main implementing partners. The professionalism, dedication and technical knowledge of the project staff have been highly commended by all those interviewed. However, some respondents have deplored the lack of a Team Leader / Overall coordinator for the project. A Team Leader would have contributed to the consolidation of activities and results under individual project outputs. She or he would have acted as a coordinator and main point of contact in particular with regard to overall strategy, coherence and overall guidance in the country’s political context.

Although the project has no official **communication strategy**, the team uses various communication tools, including one-page information sheets, success stories, presentations, video materials to disseminate information. ICDI/KNDP communication activities included publication of articles in local and international newspapers and media outlets (TV and radio). The project document and a project brochure containing an overview of activities and expected outputs are available on the UNDP’s website[[15]](#footnote-15).

The project appears to lack a clear **knowledge sharing strategy**. For example, the project website does not include updates on project activities and progress, as well as other documents (or links to external websites) produced with project support, such as training materials or other types of project deliverables. Since the project website is the main entry point it should also serve as a platform for information and knowledge sharing, it is recommended that for future interventions the website be updated regularly so that it can serve its purpose as “knowledge portal” and “best practice” sharing tool even after project completion. Work is on-going to collect all materials, research and reports produced by the project into one single database and publish selected studies.

*Table 4. ICDI/KNDP Project Grading & Ranking per Evaluation Criteria*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Criterion** | **Status** | **Comments** |
| **Relevance** | Highly Satisfactory | The project is highly relevant to the needs of the country’s public sector and is in line with the national development priorities. It particularly responds to the needs identified under the Public Administration Pillar of the Kuwait Development Plan / New Kuwait 2035. The project addresses the most pressing issues such as transparent, accountable and evidence-based policy making across all development areas. The project also undertakes considerable efforts in building the knowledge base of public employees through provision of tailored long and short – term technical expertise, and access to international best practice. Overall the evaluator estimates that the project relevance is “highly satisfactory”. |
| **Effectiveness** | Satisfactory | The main targets are on track, despite experiencing some bottlenecks and delays throughout implementation. The original timeframe has been extended by 10 months (this relates to the decision by the Project Board to allow the project to run until the end of the current KNDP). Respondents were satisfied with the quality of support provided. In particular, the respondents noted the high level of commitment and availability of the PCU team. Therefore, effectiveness is rated as “satisfactory”. |
| **Efficiency** | Satisfactory | Overall the project has created added value, catering to a wide array of demands. The project is delivering on the set targets and is on track both operationally and financially. The procurement process that the UNDP adheres to and its long-term agreements are a good indication of the value for money. Therefore, efficiency is rated as “satisfactory”. |
| **Impact** | Satisfactory | The impact of the project is visible. Respondents were overall satisfied with the various activities carried out so far. Long-term impact would have to be assessed two or three years after project completion. Nevertheless, based on the current situation and future projections overall impact is ranked “satisfactory”. |
| **Sustainability** | Moderately Likely | Sustainability is rated “moderately likely” because the evaluator found that many activities were unlikely to continue or may lose momentum after project completion. The likelihood of sustainability is not necessarily linked to the project performance. In order for attitudes and practices to change within the public sector in Kuwait, bigger and more overhauling reforms would be required going beyond the project implementing partners. At the moment, change relies heavily on “individual champions” rather than a systemic approach. Please refer to Findings section and Recommendations for suggested actions on how to improve prospects of sustainability. |

## 3.2 Project Output Findings

This section looks at the key results per individual project output. The tables under each output summarize the key achievements linked to expected results. The narrative part discusses the main achievements and challenges faced during implementation.

**Output 1. Improved human capacity and organizational effectiveness of the GSSCPD for development planning**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Expected Results** | **Key Achievements** |
| **1.1** **Develop an institutional organizational structure for GSSCPD** | * An institutional skills audit and analysis of all GSSCPD staff job descriptions to create functional job categorization and descriptions conducted; * A new GSSCPD organogram/structure with delegations of authority and defined lines of reporting developed, approved and enacted; * Standard operating procedures (SOPs), business and administrative processes and systems improvements developed and implemented; * Implementation of a communication plan for internal administration and with external institutions in progress. |
| **1.2 Implementation of GSSCPD Human Capital Strategy** | * A Human Resources Strategy 2015-2025 for GSSCPD aligned with the new GSSCPD organogram and informed by the institutional skills audit developed and being implemented[[16]](#footnote-16); * Staff capacity needs assessment conducted and capacity development plan including design and implementation of a skills and mentoring program developed; * A pilot Performance Management System for merit-based assessment of GSSCPD staff developed and pending approval of the SG. |
| **1.3 Align GSSCPD’s Strategic Planning for improved implementation and monitoring of the KNDP** | * An institutional strategic plan for GSSCPD inclusive of GSSCPD positioning within the KNDP designed and implemented. The plan identifies GSSCPD priorities for implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the KNDP; * An “action plan” for KNDP implementation establishing tasks and key performance indicators (KPIs) to achieve the objectives of the KNDP and identification of potential challenges with a risks/mitigation strategy, and monitoring plan developed; * Centres for sustainable development and future forecast, KNDP-related research, knowledge economy, and Public Policies as part of an innovative and evidence-based approach to national development planning in Kuwait operationalized. |
| **1.4 Improve GSSCPD policy advisory services to support decision making** | * Technical advisory services to the Office of the Minister of State and Secretary General of SCPD on follow-up of the KNDP implementation being provided; * Strategic policy position papers on thematic development areas being produced; * Needs assessment conducted and capacity development strategy being implemented; * A consultancy roster for functional and technical advisory services (applying an on-going assessment of productivity for service delivery) established. |
| **1.5 Upgrade GSSCPD monitoring and evaluation mechanisms for implementation of KNDP** | * Improvements to KNDP M&E mechanism based on an assessment & gaps analysis that includes necessary database, systems or tools applied; * A framework for KNDP results-oriented and evidence-based indicators put in place; * A M&E capacity development program for national entities and relevant technical staff developed and implemented. * New Kuwait Media Campaign was launched to raise awareness and foster civic engagement of stakeholders on KNDP. |

**Achievements:**

The project supported the GSSCPD in developing, approving and enacting the **new organogram** with clearly defined tasks and responsibilities, delegations of authority, as well as reporting channels. Although this has been completed in 2016, the organigram has been revised in 2018 to reflect regulatory and institutional changes. For example, a new section for assets accounting has been established within the Finance Department to comply with MOF instructions, and the project supported the establishment of two units within the newly stablished KPPC[[17]](#footnote-17).

The project assisted the GSSCPD in conducting an **institutional skills audit and analysis** of all job descriptions. As a result, jobs were categorized according to their functionality, staff job descriptions were revised and SOPs were simplified to address bottlenecks and improve efficiency of operations.

Pending the conclusion of this restructuring exercise, the project will support GSSCPD in implementing a communication plan (internally and with external institutions) and in the revision of the **Human Resources Strategy 2015-2025.** Achieving this objective has been delayed by the internal reorganization process discussed above. Nevertheless, in 2017 the project supported the GSSCPD in formulating a **training and development strategy** for its staff. The main objective was to design a long – term strategy for developing competencies and maintaining a successful carrier path for all employees. The formulation process was based on the analysis of current capacities vis-à-vis GSSCPD’s Human Capital Vision and included multiple rounds of consultations with the Secretary General, the Administrative Affairs Department, GSSCPD permanent staff and consultants. The strategy also incorporates the findings of a 2017 study conducted by the Civil Service Commission regarding career path development of civil servants in Kuwait. The implementation of the training and development strategy started in 2018. It is based on an action plan that includes several tools, such as employment satisfaction questionnaires, self-development planning for GSSCPD employees, an onboarding platform for new employees and tools pertaining to the resignation process. The other components of the HR Strategy, such as the diagnostics of the HR Management System and the finalization of the overall HR Strategy, are expected to be completed by end of 2018.

The project has contributed to **capacity building and development** of the GSSCPD office staff through providing on-the-job training on international relations and management of agreements with different development partners. More specifically, the project is leading work in supporting the SG’s office to launch a new “**Sustainable Development Award**”. This new initiative is part of the New Kuwait Vision and is aimed at recognizing and promoting sustainable business practices. The award intends to encourage participation of private and government sector companies and NGOs contributing towards KNDP and SDG targets. The purpose is to assist these companies and organizations in their work by applying tools and mechanisms rooted in the principles of sustainable development. The ultimate goal is to accelerate sustainable development in Kuwait by establishing a nation-wide sustainability related database that supports participants toward adopting best sustainable development practices and helps Kuwait to measure progress against SDGs targets.

The project is also supporting the organization of the second **New Kuwait Annual Event**. Planned for April 2019, the event will gather top governmental officials to showcase a joint effort to realize the New Kuwait Vision 2035 and to inform the public on progress made in implementation. The intention is to secure wide coverage by national and international media in the presence of national stakeholders, CSOs, citizens and international representatives.

Another important achievement under this output was the creation for the first time in Kuwait of four **centres for Sustainable Development and Future Forecast, Development Research, Knowledge Economy and Public Policies.** as part of an innovative and evidence-based approach to planning and implementing the KNDP. The GSSCPD’s revised organogram contains the following new centres, which have realized the following initiatives so far:

**The Knowledge Economy Centre**:

* The project supported GSSCPD in organizing the **Knowledge Economy Forum** in February 2018, which convened high-level representatives form government institutions in Turkey, US, UK, Kuwait public institutions, and international private sector companies. The debates centred around new ideas regarding the future role of governments in the 21st century, key aspects of Knowledge Governments and future leaders, and enhancing the effectiveness of public service in a rapidly evolving knowledge environment, as well as the role of the private sector to support the fulfilment of such visions.
* The Centre also organized the **International Expo 2018**, the largest gathering of Kuwaiti SMEs and entrepreneurs, that provided an opportunity to establish partnerships with international companies from several countries. Several workshops were organized with participation of Kuwaiti youth, SMEs and international corporations to discuss ideas around leadership and knowledge management, building innovative capacities via knowledge management, Big Data for senior decision makers, Social Media in the public sector, and the Internet of Things.

**The National Observatory for Sustainable Development and Future Forecast**:

* The project assisted in recruiting a consultant that joined the Observatory in March 2018. The consultant supports the formulation of the first SDGs voluntary **National Review Report (VNR) for Kuwait**. He is also responsible for capacity development activities, such as identifying training needs for the NOSD staff who have been recruited.

**The National Development Research Centre**:

* The project continues supporting data collection for the database of national economic indicators. The database strengthens the capacity of the department by providing quantitative data for further research on national development issues and by feeding primary macroeconomic data into Kuwait’s macroeconomic model[[18]](#footnote-18). The NDRC collaborates closely with the Central Statistics Bureau and the Central Bank of Kuwait.

In terms of **expanding and consolidating relations with international partners**, the project contributed to facilitating initial discussions with the Global Green Growth Institute (GGGI)[[19]](#footnote-19) headed by former UN SG Mr. Ban-Ki Moon, in collaboration with the Kuwait Council of Ministers, and the Kuwaiti Environment Public Authority. The main objective is to foster Kuwait participation in this international cooperation platform in line with national economic and development priorities.

The project is providing facilitation and coordination support to GSSCPD for initiating discussions with China on Kuwaiti Islands Development Project. The Project continues to support liaison and coordination with JICA, the MoU signed earlier in 2017, is pending ratification by the Parliament in Kuwait. The project continues to support coordinating with State Department’s CLDP, the Kuwaiti Chamber of Commerce, Central Tendering Committee, and High Judicial Institute, aiming at transfer of knowledge and strengthening national capacities in areas of Commercial Arbitration and fostering public procurement mechanisms.

The project assisted in the review of the **World Bank’s Ease of Doing Business 2018 Report** with a special focus on Kuwait. The review compared ten of Kuwait’s key doing business indicators and assessed progress against KPIs in comparison with other GCC countries over five years. The project has also supported the preparation of an analysis of **Kuwait’s performance with regard to Knowledge Economy Indicators** (such as Network Readiness Index, Global Innovation Index, R&D expenditure as % of GDP, Knowledge Economy Index) at the global and GCC levels. The project also contributed to the analysis of Kuwait competitiveness based on the 2017 Competitiveness Index Report by the World Economic Forum and the first National Report on Housing and Sustainable Urban Development. In the area of statistics, the project supported the development of the Producer Price Index (PPI), an annual publication on the producer prices for 2016, the first annual report on this subject in Kuwait. The project also supported the Ministry of Finance (MOF) to establish the first Award of Excellence to be awarded through a competitive process selecting most innovative candidates from MoF staff.

Since its launch, the project has assisted preparing **various policy papers, briefs and reports**. Examples include quarterly economic briefs including fiscal issues; weekly intelligence reports featuring macroeconomic developments, current affairs and issues affecting national industries; draft policy papers on the Development of Public Administration in Kuwait and on Establishing a Framework for Public Administration Institutional Governance. The report on successful models in public administration was presented and discussed with stakeholders during a national workshop. The project has also supported the formulation of the Government’s Annual Plan 2018-2019 under two KNDP pillars (Effective Public Administration and Distinguished International Positioning).

Another important achievement of the project is the creation of the **first national consultancy roster in Kuwait** for functional and technical advisory services covering a multitude of areas and specializations pertaining to the KNDP. As a result of the vetting process, ninety-nine applications were longlisted and a series of interviews have been conducted. Currently the roster has thirty-three confirmed experts.

The project has facilitated organizing the first annual event under the **New Kuwait 2035 Vision**. The event marked the first anniversary of launching the New Kuwait campaign promoting KNDP and the seven thematic pillars under this new brand identity. The event served as a platform to present the achievements of the plan and its strategic projects in 2017. The event theme (*We promised; We deliver*) was chosen to promote transparency and information sharing with citizens. Five ministers reported on the achievements of the development plan in the presence of the Prime Minister, and the event received wide media coverage mobilized with the project’s support. The event has been organized simultaneously with **Kuwait Investment Forum** to highlight the importance of partnering with the private sector and mobilizing foreign and national investments for the implementation of KNDP. The project assisted with the media coverage (Bloomberg Investment Service covered the event), including the production of a promotional video broadcast on the Financial Time’s foreign direct investment website. In the same line of action, the project has assisted with the update of the New Kuwait website and the transfer of website management from the UNDP to the GSSCPD.

The New Kuwait media campaign had several components:

* The launching of the “New Kuwait” campaign on January 31st was a success with high level participation from the government officials under the patronage of His Highness, the Prime Minister. The New Kuwait pillars were presented by the responsible ministers and the event was attended by parliamentarians and had a large media coverage by local, regional and international media outlets.
* The project supported the campaign with designing media content, development and launching of the media campaign website, and production of TV infomercials on KNDP. In addition to publishing awareness materials in the “Oxford Business Group” annual publication on Kuwait, “Newsweek”, and “The New York Times”, the project also contracted a local advertising company to implement several public outreach activities.
* The project supported managing the media campaign website and social media outlets, which were updated with details on the progress of KNDP projects, design of two New Kuwait promotion booths, and facilitated participation in two national exhibitions.
* The project provided technical support to strengthening communication channels between GSSCPD and media outlets, including necessary mentoring for new staff.
* The project continues to provide guidance to the public relations team on monitoring of media articles and news about GSSCPD and KNDP, and analyse collected data on monthly basis with the aim at gauging the public opinion and improve the engagement with the public through media outlets. The GSSCPD staff is carrying out this task with support and guidance from the project consultant, which includes a template for the monthly report that undergoes continuous improvements with technical assistance from the project and in close collaboration with the relevant department and senior management of the GSSCPD.

These activities have generated a large number of followers on the social media, for example the Instagram account has gathered so far 143, 000 followers and the Facebook page of New Kuwait has over 800 permanent followers.

**Remaining challenges:**

The evaluator finds that one of the main challenges under this output is the **segmentation of efforts**. While acknowledging that by its design the project has been conceived as an umbrella project and a platform catering to the needs of multiple entities within the GSSCPD, the observations from the field mission reveal a certain lack of coherence between the various components of this project output.

Interventions appear to happen at different levels and in various sectors leading to different types of deliverables. Requests for assistance vary and cover a wide array of services (ranging from communication and visibility campaigns, to revision and overhauling of the GSSCPD structure, to support in organizing international events). On the one hand, such an approach is explained by the demand-driven nature of the project, whose purpose is ultimately to bridge gaps as identified by the stakeholders themselves. On the other hand, this results in a collection of activities that resemble more patchwork than a comprehensive approach leading to overarching transformation and change. The ensuing link in coherence may also be due to the fact that the project **lacks a Team Leader** (challenge discussed in Section 3.1) who should have been responsible for streamlining the various project interventions more.

The evaluator also notes the lack of proper indicators to measure impact rather than progress. The impact of UNDP’s interventions through the ICDI/KNDP project is visible, although it remains diffused among a wide range of actions and activities. While the project is delivering in terms of actions and targets agreed in the project documents and the annual work plans, the consultant notes that the current indicators, which rely on number of activities or participants, do not appear to measure actual improvements in human capital or develop capacity.

**Output 2. Enhanced institutional and human capacities of the CSB for evidence-based plans and policies on sustainable development**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Expected Results** | **Key Achievements** |
| **2.1 Transition to a Social Accounting Matrix (SAM) for national accounts 2008-2013** | * Identified National Accounts and other economic data between 2008-2013 for SAM; * Reviewed and updated the input – output tables & economic data between 2008-2013 for SAM. |
| **2.2 Develop information technology infrastructure for data management** | * Conducted a GIS informed needs assessment of the national institution relevant to the 2020 population census and put in place a system to enhance the data flow to CSB; * Facilitating the development of reliable and efficient software data management systems; * Improvements to CSB information system(s) for monitoring and review of CSB development plan project(s). |
| **2.3 Improved capacity and statistical quality management** | * Standards and Quality Control for CSB and the statistical departments of the national institutions relevant to the administrative data in place and applied; * Assisting statistical quality assurance to build framework and to raise the statistical capacity of CSB, several ministries and relevant government agencies; * Providing advisory services and training activities for CSB, ministries and relevant agencies; * Assisting national accounts for quality assurance in national accounts and supporting economic statistics to ensure the quality of the statistical data. |
| 2.4 Develop and enhance statistical foundation for new KNDP indicators | * Reviewed CSB development plan and projects for alignment to the KNDP; * Reinforced CSB capacities for surveys and sampling processes; * Created a Composite Index of Leading Indicators; * Improved national reports, aligned with developed indicators and data collection on areas such as trade, ICT, gender, environment etc. |

**Achievements:**

The project has supported the CSB by assisting in the identification and recruitment of several **long-term key experts**. This represents one of the project’s strengths (i.e. the quality of experts has been praised), but also poses a challenge at the same time. It mainly refers to difficulties in the recruitment of quality specialists. For example, the TOR for recruiting a National Accounts Specialist was published three times without any success in identifying suitable candidates. Another example refers to two failed attempts at recruiting a consultant to support the CSB in the area of Quality Control of Formal Statistics, and several months delay in selecting the Macroeconomic Statistics Specialist. The TOR for Organizational Development Specialist were published twice and three candidates were considered by the selection panel. However, none were selected. The TOR for Household Income and Expenditures Survey Specialist were published three times but not candidate was retained.

One of the reasons is that the area of expertise required for specific inputs is narrow, and coupled with the linguistic requirements (i.e. Arabic speakers), this shortens the list of available candidates. Another reason is that sometimes the financial expectations of candidates exceed the available budget. In order to mitigate these obstacles, the project is working with CSB on revising the TORs to include more flexible selection criteria that could enlarge the pool of candidates and attract more applicants. Another solution is using the newly established Kuwait National Roster. The project is working on establishing a Statistics Profile in the Roster.

One of the main actions to be achieved under this project output refers to supporting preparations for **2020 Registered Census**. Over the years, CSB has accumulated vast experience in conducting nation-wide censuses. However, the 2020 exercise will be the first one to be conducted based on available records rather than on in-person household surveys. In that sense, the CSB has requested specific assistance from the project, such as capacity building and training courses, as well as the deployment of specialists with previous experience in registered censuses.

Based on this need and in line with the Action Plan for conducting the 2020 Registered Census, the project has assisted in preparing and delivering a **training course on STATA software** to the staff of the Census and Population Department at CSB. Other knowledge transfer initiatives include trainings and study tours to the Central Agency for Public Mobilization and Statistics in Cairo, Egypt (April 2018) and to the High Commission for Planning in Casablanca (mid-2018). The study tours have the purpose of transferring information and experience on using specialized IT tools for extracting and processing information for the 2020 Registered Census.

In terms of assisting with **quality improvement and raising the statistical capacity** of CSB (as well as within ministries and government agencies), the project provided technical assistance to the delegation of Kuwait who attended the annual meeting of the United Nations Statistics Division (March 2018). Other technical assistance includes a study on SDG 17 using the data from the Kuwait Fund for Arabic Economic Development and support to establishing statistics departments in government agencies and facilitating the coordination and monitoring of these departments by the CSB[[20]](#footnote-20).

The project also supported the CSB in preparing a report compiling the observations and suggestions of Kuwait on the draft resolution of the **Statistical Commission of the Economic and Social Council of the UN** related to sustainable development. The project has also provided technical advice on the questionnaire developed by the **Statistical, Economic and Social Research and Training Centre for Islamic Countries (SESRIC)** referring to SDG list of Indicators.

Supporting CSB in **aligning the statistical data to the KNDP** is another major line of action under this output. The project continues providing technical support with regard to follow-up and monitoring of implementation progress of CSB projects in the KNDP. For example, for the Annual Development Plan 2018 – 2019, the project is assisting CSB in setting up four key projects: National Network of Statistical Information; Registered Census 2020; Monitoring SDG Indicators; and Institutional, Technical and Structural Modernization of CSB.

The project is also supporting the CSB in collecting, analysing and publishing quarterly **Foreign Trade Statistics and Indices**. The latest reports came out in February 2018 and concern Foreign Trade Statistics and Indices for the period October – December 2017. With support from the project, Foreign Trade Statistics data are now disseminated via a new tool (IBM BI) allowing to generate various types of tables. The tool will be enhanced to include external users, who will be able to generate customized tables via the CSB official website. The project has also assisted the CSB in developing, testing and enhancing such Oracle – based tools as Foreign Trade Data Validation and Processing System; and Calculation of Foreign Trade indices system (using Fisher Chain Index Formula).

In that sense, the project is also collaborating with the **Kuwaiti Customs Department** to improve foreign trade methodology. More specifically, the project has supported the CIF/FOB adjustment exercise in 2017. The recording of imports and exports in the national accounts and the balance of payments will now be produced using statistical techniques.

The project continues supporting the CSB in the area of **Consumer and Producer Price Indices** by providing technical assistance for collecting, analysing and publishing these indices. The latest publications include the Producer Price Index for the last quarter of 2016, and all the quarters in 2017. The Consumer Price Index has been released for December 2017 and January 2018.

**Remaining challenges**:

One of the remaining challenges, which applies overall to the whole project, but has been particularly underlined under this project output, refers to the **recruitment of consultants**. CSB has noted that in addition to the fact the required expertise is difficult to find (because of narrow technical specifications or the requirement to speak Arabic), recruiting and retaining qualified consultants is difficult under national contracts. Many interlocutors (from CSB and GSSCPD) have signaled the fact that when offered to transit from UNDP contracts to national contracts, many consultants refuse and leave.

CSB has also suggested for future recruitment procedures that one way of addressing this limitation was **advertising the posts to a wider international audience** (in particular on specialized websites for statisticians and / or regional newspapers in Arabic, local newspapers in Arabic speaking countries). The evaluator finds this suggestion reasonable.

CSB has also expressed the wish to have **a standalone project** so that it is able to manage activities and recruitment of expertise directly (without having to pass through the GSSCDP). CSB felt that this would reduce delays and increase flexibility.

Another important challenge refers to the frequent changes in CSB leadership. The current Director General has been appointed only in August 2018 and the organization has seen multiple changes in management during the project life cycle. This has had an impact on the activities that underwent continuous changes as a consequence.

The absorption capacity of the CSB staff remains limited. In many instances, consultants have reported that there were no employees assigned to them for training or that the scope of the trainings / support activities were no longer a priority to management.

**Output 3. Increased technical expertise and institutional capacities for strategic planning and implementation of KNDP projects by public entities**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Expected Results** | **Key Achievements** |
| **3.1 Create a targeted and proactive system for delivery of technical expertise/advisory services in response to requests from public entities.** | * Conducted a baseline assessment for current advisory service delivery mechanisms, including identification of gaps, roles and responsibilities and a prioritization framework (2016); * Capacity development of the Technical Cooperation Unit mandated to manage the service delivery system (continuous). |
| **3.2 Provision of demand-based recruitment of technical experts for public entities, with a monitoring and reporting mechanism in place** | * Reinforce strategic planning capacities of public entities to ensure submission of technical expertise requests in a timely and quality manner(continuous); * Create and implement a new monitoring and reporting mechanism for GSSCPD linked with the request system for efficient and effective service delivery. |
| 3.3 Enhance partnerships for experience exchange & knowledge transfer | * Private sector development strategy in place for increased socio-economic development impact (completed in 2017). |

**Achievements:**

Some of the activities under this project output were merged with on-going activities under the other outputs or have been removed from the Work Plan by the Project Board. Among the most notable activities carried out, the evaluator notes the technical support provided to the Research and Studies Department at the **Ministry of National Assembly’s Affairs**, particularly in implementing the research strategy (also developed with project support). Since the launch of the project in mid-2015, different research topics have been identified and multiple reports and media briefings were prepared by the members of the research team with technical support and guidance from the project. In parallel, the project continues supporting the implementation of the capacity development plan, including media analysis and group discussions with the Department’s research team on different political and economic topics.

The project has also provided support to the **Public Authority of Housing Welfare** (PAHW), whose mandate is to provide residential units to eligible citizens of Kuwait as well as the construction of quality housing that is distinctively developed. To deliver on this mandate, PAHW is implementing the program “South Mutlaa City Development” (SMCD). Within this context, PAHW solicited the project’s support in recruiting a Project Management Specialist to support the PAHW Strategic Program Team (SPT), who provides oversight and quality assurance relating to the SMCD program delivery. The project Management Specialist was a key member of the SPT and developed and maintained the management tools for use in the SMCD program delivery. More specifically, the consultant assisted in the development of the SMCD Execution Plan (stage II), conducted a technical review of the SMCD Master Delivery Schedule, the Construction Logistics Plan, as well as the second round of reviews of SOPs for the SPT. Thanks to the technical support received, PAHW was able to make savings of around 50 million Kuwaiti Dinars.

The project has also supported the **Public Authority for Food and Nutrition** (PAFN), which was established to set up a national food and nutrition policy and to advocate for legislation and appropriate implementation of laws related to food and nutrition. PAFN aims at ensuring optimal food safety, food security and the promotion of healthy community nutrition at the national level. The mission of PAFN is to prevent outbreaks and epidemics resulting from food, to control nutrition related non- communicable diseases and to ensure high quality food to consumer. The authority’s mandate also includes monitoring the implementation of national and international standards related to food safety and quality through quality control/quality assurance protocols to ensure the control of food imports, local food production & food markets in addition to taking actions against violators. Within this context, the PAFN sought the support of the project in recruiting a Strategic Planning Specialist to support its mandate and objectives. More specifically, the consultant assisted the PAFN in developing its five-year strategic plan in view of streamlining operations. Support included situation analysis, developing template questionnaires to collect relevant data, the formulation of PAFN’s vision and mission, and a SWOT analysis. A leadership program from Harvard Business Publishing (Corporate Learning) which aims to build GSSCPD General Management Capabilities is underway. The program was provided under a Long-Term Agreement (LTA) between UNDP and Harvard Business. A needs assessment and design of modules curriculum were completed and delivered in 2017. Additionally, a new capacity building initiative for leadership skills of senior government officials was launched in partnership with Harvard Business Leadership Program. The program is implemented with support from UNDP and targets about fifty Assistant Secretaries General from GSSCPD and other government entities involved in KNDP implementation.

The project also supported the **Public Authority for Industry**, particularly the Anti-Dumping Department in implementing the WTO agreements. The project focused on supporting the protection of national industries in the international cases filed by members of WTO against Kuwait that would have an impact on Kuwaiti exports. This included providing technical advice for the preparation of relevant studies, legal memos responding to these cases as per the WTO regulations, preparation of Facts Reports, follow-up on complaints by national industries, preparation of legal notices sent to other WTO member states, and support with the analysis of all notifications submitted by WTO members to all committees on safeguards/countervailing/anti-dumping/international questioning. The consultants deployed by the project also conducted a technical review of the Arabic translation of the GCC common law on anti-dumping, countervailing measures and safeguards and the respective WTO committees were informed of the common law. Capacity development efforts supported staff of the Anti-Dumping Department and other national stakeholders through discussion and hands-on training on the procedures and systems to be followed when filing cases by a WTO member state against Kuwait, and follow-up on relevant notifications, as well as in areas related to the management of implementation of relevant clauses of WTO agreements, and the application of the GAT treaty.

The project provided technical assistance to the **Ministry of Finance** in the area of strategic planning and alignment of the ministry strategies to the fiscal reform objectives. For example, the consultants deployed by the project assisted in reviewing the third quarterly report for the financial year 2015-2016. Additionally, the project provided support in drafting a memorandum to establish a high-level committee to oversee the ‘Najah’ IT system and in preparing the annual work plan for 2017-2018 using Najah System. Several field visits to various departments and offices at the MOF and to Kuwait University were conducted to raise awareness on the ‘Najah’ system and its success, and to share with staff the strategic plan of the ministry in order to increase engagement and commitment. The project also supported to follow-up on a bid for the second phase of the Najah project for strategic planning and budgeting and finalization of the criteria for selecting the winners of the institutional distinction prizes resulting in the signature of a contract between MoF and a private company for further developing the Najah system. The project continues to provide technical support to the management and implementation of the process, including on-job training for staff at the Planning and Monitoring/ Follow-up Department at the MOF and practical training to 20 MoF staff on the use of Najah system, how to process data and generate monitoring and evaluation reports.

The project has supported the formulation of the new strategy and action plan for the **Supreme Council for Family Affairs** mapping out KNDP policies related to family and ensuring the new strategy is aligned with these policies. The strategy includes several elements that aim at empowerment of women particularly in terms of advocating for developing a law criminalizing domestic violence, preventive and support measures against domestic violence, awareness raising activities and mechanisms on family issues that foster equality.

**Remaining challenges**:

This challenge pertains to the project overall; however, it has been particularly raised under this project output. While acknowledging that **knowledge transfer and capacity building** is at the core of the project design and purpose, many respondents questioned the **tools** chosen by some consultants to deliver these objectives (note that this requirement is included in the consultants’ TOR). More specifically, respondents noted that they would find knowledge transfer and training on-the-job (or ‘shadowing the consultant’) more efficient than delivering trainings the ‘old fashioned way’, i.e. organizing trainings for groups of participants. The evaluator concurs and would suggest a more personalized approach. Rather than attaching a fixed indicator / target in the consultant’s TOR (usually measured in “number of people” trained), a more individual approach should be taken based on the needs of the unit / department and the capacity gaps of the staff. Impact should be measured in a way that goes beyond the number of participants and/or the number of training days as these indicators do not gauge learning or knowledge transfer levels.

The project could benefit from additional staff, for example a Team Leader who could contribute to the consolidation of activities and results under individual project outputs. She or he could also act as a coordinator and main point of contact in particular with regard to overall strategy, coherence and overall guidance in the country’s political context. Additionally, the project could use the services of an assistant to take over time consuming clerical tasks.

The current system for managing requests for consultants, planning, reporting and evaluation requirements could benefit from automation as it is currently manual and its efficiency is therefore limited (since activity 3.1.2, which was supposed to automate the system developed for recruitment and management of consultancies was cancelled).

The GSSCPD mentioned that on several occasions, consultancies had to be re-advertised several times because not enough candidates expressed their interest or the ones who applied did not correspond to the requirements of the job. One of the reasons for that could be that the job descriptions were too narrow and that reduced the pool of consultants from the start. Another reason is that the announcements were not circulated to a wider auditorium, which limited the number of candidates who saw the announcement. Usually, UNDP publishes the announcements on its global site. Perhaps in the future announcements could also be published in regional Arabic-language newspapers or specialized websites (e.g. in the area of the advertised job, for example statistics) to increase the number of potentially interested / relevant readers.

Another challenge pertains to the lengthy implementation mechanisms of the project, an issue raised by many interlocutors among the national stakeholders. The issue here mainly refers to recruitment and procurement procedures, which, according to the national counterparts, “take too long”. This observation maybe explained in part by the fact that the approval of the Terms of Reference for any job has to go through an internal procedure before being published. Additionally, UNDP has certain deadlines that have to be respected when announcing the job and several steps in the recruitment process (e.g. interviews, checking of consultant’s references, signature of the contract, other logistical aspects). These elements take time and will depend on the availability of the consultant too (i.e. for long term positions, which involve the relocation of the consultant to Kuwait, one cannot expect the person to move countries overnight). The alternative is to use national Kuwaiti recruitment procedures. However, many consultants prefer a UNDP contract as the employment conditions (such as remuneration and overall package), which are better. The government counterparts also agree that the UNDP procurement rules provide the ‘proper channels’ for recruiting and attracting international talent.

# 4. LESSONS LEARNT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Specific remaining challenges have been discussed in section 3 under individual project outputs. This section builds on the more horizontal lessons learnt during the implementation of the project thus far and makes some recommendations for the remaining implementation period of the project (until December 2019).

1. **Add indicators that measure impact not only progress.** The problem with the current results and reporting framework of the project is that it relies on indicators that take highly dimensional phenomena and represent them in a low-dimensional way. Complex systemic outcomes like “institutional capacity” or “knowledge transfer” are collapsed into a single dimension, which are sometimes then measured in rudimentary ways because of data collection limitations. For example, can the number of trainings conducted or the number of participants in any given training really gauge the knowledge that was acquired as a result of these activities? Could the number of policy briefs or reports produced with the project support really speak to changes in attitude or approaches to conducting operations on a daily basis? The problem with using progress indicators is that we tend to assume that progress on any of the indicators leads to benefit to overall capacity building, and that progress under any of the project activities / outputs is increasing the overall impact. Yet, this is not always the case. For example, if the staff who received training is unable to apply it in a consistent manner on a daily basis, the knowledge acquired is lost. Capacity building requires more than simple-to-track inputs like the presence of consultants, trainer – participant ratios, and availability of training materials or computers.

For the remaining implementation period, the project is encouraged to include modalities that measure knowledge and are part of a knowledge management strategy that will contribute to the sustainability of the project’s results in the long term. There are many ways of doing it, but Nonaka’s[[21]](#footnote-21) knowledge flow model is still very useful for an organisational knowledge management strategy to ensure that knowledge doesn't bottleneck or get lost within routine practices. It comprises several stages unified by the principle “knowledge that doesn't flow, doesn't grow”:

1. Socialisation: knowledge is shared and expanded to others through social connectivity and shared activities;
2. Externalisation: knowledge is rendered explicit through brainstorming, collection of best practice and the creation of process guidelines;
3. Combination: new knowledge is created by combining different sources;
4. Internalisation: knowledge becomes internalised through training, education etc.
5. **Be more innovative.** In general, the relationship between UNDP and the Kuwaiti Government (in the case of the project represented mainly by the GSSCPD and CSB) is very good. Nevertheless, the evaluator finds that UNDP in Kuwait should be more daring and come up with bolder initiatives. The UNDP in Kuwait has the potential to bring a lot more added value. For example, it has the opportunity to build better and smarter partnerships with the private sector and civil society (underdeveloped and little engaged at the moment). UNDP is well-placed to help achieve outcomes linked to the New Kuwait Vision 2035, the KNDP, as well as the country’s SDG agenda. The UNDP office in Kuwait should act more as a bridge between the government, private sector and civil society to stimulate civic engagement and entrepreneurship among Kuwaitis. In practical terms, these partnerships need to be meaningful from a development standpoint and beneficial to the country’s development goals, but ultimately appealing to the private sector too. One of the wishes expressed by the national counterparts during the interviews was for UNDP to bring to Kuwait ‘innovations’ from other countries. These innovations refer not only to technologies, but to modalities of implementing activities. For example, the majority of interlocutors mentioned that the ‘old fashioned’ training techniques (“teacher in the classroom”) were outdated and they should be replaced by newer approaches to knowledge building. “We want UNDP to bring the best from other countries to Kuwait”, as one interlocutor put it.
6. **Moving towards a more integrated platform.** This could be one option allowing to build on the multiple activities and achievements so far while further enhancing the coherence of project interventions. The project implementation has highlighted the need to ensure that public and private partners streamline development efforts in a coherent way rather than engaging in isolated initiatives. While the project is already acting as a platform and covers a wide array of needs and demands from multiple stakeholders, the risk is that it may be lacking in a holistic approach and be perceived as somewhat of a patchwork. With this in mind, the government and UNDP should consider launching a joint national KNDP platform. The platform should be open to all development and public and private partners in the country. It may take the form of both a virtual and physical space hosted, for example, by the GSSCPD and supported by UNDP. The new SDG platform could provide both public and private sector contributors with a space for experimentation, collaboration, analytics and human resource development. The role of the platform could be that of testing and promoting new approaches, methodologies and possibly new types of institutions to provide ‘out of the box’ solutions that bring about transformative change. To do this, the platform could draw on the experience accumulated under the ICDI / KNDP (and KPPC) project so far, as well as from expertise from around the world, including UN innovation facilities and tools. In practical terms, the first step towards this would be appointing a Team Leader covering all the project outputs.

# Conclusions

The results and impact of the ICDI/KNDP project, which benefits from a strong ownership from the GSSCPD and CSB, can be regarded as positive. This has been achieved through a consistent application of UNDP’s participatory approach in capacity development and through overall good quality technical assistance.

The ICDI/KNDP project is highly relevant to the country’s needs and is fully aligned with UNDP’s Country Program and Kuwait’s New Vision and Development Plan. The project interventions are relevant to the governmental stakeholders, their internal process and development policies and they are well-targeted to the specific counterparts the project has been working with. The role and function of UNDP as an upstream policy adviser are highly appreciated and understood, although not always sufficiently recognized by some stakeholders.

This evaluation confirms that the capacity development efforts deployed by the project so far have been successful in producing the anticipated project results, but more can be done in the remaining time. Policy development and planning capacities, as well as technical capacities in setting up and developing systems, guidelines and tools relevant to KNDP implementation have clearly increased since the start of the project in mid-2015, but more time and effort are needed to ensure that these capacities are further developed and strengthened.

The findings of this evaluation show that there is a learning curve. Some stakeholders have demonstrated a clear willingness to adapt, change and improve their methods. However, these changes are not visible across the board, and depend more on “individual champions” rather than on a systemic change. The long-term impact of the capacity development support from UNDP to national counterparts could only be fully gauged after the ICDI/KNDP interventions have been completed (expected in December 2019). Nevertheless, through the project activities UNDP has acted as a broker between Government actors and the private sector stakeholders and thus has contributed to increasing mutual recognition and co-operation. Such efforts should definitely continue and be featured in the new UNDP – Kuwait Country Program.

# Appendix I. Interview Protocol

Relevance:

* Were the project activities relevant?
* What was the value of the project in your sector?
* Did the project offer appropriate solutions to the problems addressed?

Effectiveness:

* Did the project achieve satisfactory progress toward its stated objectives and indicators?
* What factors contributed to achieving or not achieving intended outcomes?
* To what extent did the project’s M&E mechanism(s) contribute to meeting project results?
* Were there any lessons learned, failures/lost opportunities? What might have been done better or differently?
* How did the project deal with issues and risks?
* Have the outputs been achieved in a timely manner?

Efficiency:

* Were the resources utilized in the best way possible?
* Did the resources (time, funding, human resources) justify the costs incurred and were they sufficient?
* Were the expected results achieved?
* Did the projects reach the expected number of target groups?
* Are the beneficiaries satisfied with the quality and delivery?

Sustainability:

* Do the beneficiaries own up to the project, are they willing to continue, and is the host institution developing the capacity and motivation to administer it?
* Will the government counterpart be able to carry on the activities supported by the project after the conclusion of the project?
* Have the consultants transferred knowledge/built capacity to the employees in the government counterparts?

Impact:

* What difference has the project made to beneficiaries?
* What are the improvements and changes resulted directly by the project?
* What are the social, economic, technical, environmental, and other effects on individuals, communities, and institutions – either short-, medium-, or long-term; intended or unintended; positive and negative; on a micro- or macro-level?
* Which areas did the project support in regard to the KNDP?

# Appendix II. Evaluation Matrix

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **No.** | **Evaluation Criteria &Questions** | **Measure/Indicator[[22]](#footnote-22)** | **Main Sources of Information** | **Data Collection Methods** | **Data Analysis Methods** | **Evidence quality** |
| ***Relevance, Efficiency, Effectiveness, Impact, and Sustainability*** | | | | | | |
| **Evaluation Questions:** | | | | | | |
| *Please see Appendix I for specific questions under each evaluation criterion* | | * GSSCPD Institutional and Business Operations infrastructure in place * Improved GSSCPD’s human resources capacities performance in GSSCPD * Increased efficient and effective policy advisory services delivery within GSSCPD * Number of analyses conducted using SAM with 2008-2013 data * Number of government entities for the 2020 register-based census linked to CSB through the new ICT infrastructure * Number of requests for technical experts applying a prioritisation process through the system developed and the average response time to requests submitted * % of technical experts with data entered in the GSSCPD monitoring and reporting mechanism * Proportion of KNDP implementation through private sector or public-private partnerships | **Primary Sources:**  **Key informant interviews (KIIs):** key stakeholders from GSSCPD, CSB in Kuwait City.  **Group discussions (GDs)** with UNDP and PCU staff.  **Secondary Sources:**  **Documentation** including project documents, quarterly and annual reports, and annual work plans. | **Semi-structured interview protocols** to gather qualitative information from respondents.  **Desk Research:** review of project documentation and additional material provided by stakeholders**.**  **Field Visit and observations** to Kuwait City. | **Gather and consolidate information**: findings from the desk review and country-based data collection.  **Organize findings:** Data that meet the defined criteria analysed and grouped per evaluation criterion, question, type of deliverable.  **Analyse data:** The consultant analysed the responses received as a result of KII and FGD and provided findings, recommendations & conclusions. | After the aggregation of all relevant data was finalized, an appraisal of the quality of the information using the clearly defined criteria was made, and conclusions were drawn only from the data that met the quality standards. |

# Appendix III. Schedule of Meetings

**(Kuwait City, 4-10 September 2018)**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Day- Date** | **Time** | **Person** | **Title, Department, Agency** |
| Tue- 4 Sept | 08:00 – 09:30 | Mr. Ali Elmuntaser  Ms. Fatima Keaik | Project Officer ICDI- UNDP  Project Coordinator KPPC-UNDP |
|  | 09:30 – 10:30 | Dr. Khaled Mahdi | Secretary General of GSSCPD |
|  | 11:00 – 12:00 | Ms. Eman Al-Mutairi | ASG, Administration GSSCPD |
|  | 12:30-13:30 | KPPC team |  |
|  | 14:00 – 15:00 | Mr. Faleh Al-Dosari | Director, Administrative Dev. Dept. |
|  |  |  |  |
| Wed-5 Sept | 8:00 – 09:00 | ICDI Project team |  |
|  | 9:00 – 10:00 | Ms. Wafa Saad and Prof. Sungsoo Chun | KPPC Policy Advisors |
|  | 10:00- 10:30 | Mrs. Hind Al-Sabeeh | Her Excellency, the Minister |
|  | 10:30 – 11:30 | Mr. Othman Al-Othman | CBS, ASG of Statistics Affairs |
|  | 11:30 – 12:30 | Mr. Talal Al-Shemmary | ASG, Development Advisory Support- GSSCPD |
|  | 12:30 – 13:30 | Ms. Mona Al-Daas | CSB, ASG for Administration and Information |
|  | 15:00-16:00 | UNDP Team | DRR, PO, PA, PC, PO (Briefing) |
|  |  |  |  |
| Thu-6 Sept | 08:15-09:00 | Ms. Narjas Mahmoud | Project Coordinator KPPC-UNDP |
|  | 9:00 – 10:00 | Mr. Bader AlRifai and Ms. Souad Al-Awad | ASG, Planning  Head of Planning and Monitoring Department |
|  | 11:00 – 12:00 | Ms. Rasha Al-Adsani | Head of Strategic Unit; Housing Welfare Authority |
|  | 13:30-14:30 | Mr. Yousef Al-Mazeedi | Program Manager – KFAS |
|  | 14:30-15:30 | Mr. Faris Al-Obeid | Advisor to the Secretary General of GSSCPD |
|  |  |  |  |
| Sun-09 Sept | 08:00-09:30 | ICDI Project teams |  |
|  | 10:00-11:00 | Dr. Ahmed Al-Kawaz | Consultant at the Ministry of Finance |
|  | 11:00 – 12:00 | Ms. Khoulud El Mutawa | Head of Planning & Follow-up Department, Ministry of Finance |
|  | 14:00-15:00 | Manaf Al-Hajri | MARKAZ – Kuwait Financial Centre (Private Sector) |
|  | 15:30 – 16:30 | Mr. Sami Al-Ali, Mr. Adel Khadadah | General Director and Director of Technical Office at CSB |
|  |  |  |  |
| Mon-10 Sept | 08:00-09:30  09:30-10:30 | Mr. Lasaad Charayti  Mr. Tasleem Siddiqui | ICDI consultant in Public Administration  ICDI consultant in Macroeconomics and Strategic Planning |
|  | 11:00-12:30 | Dr. Yasmeen Abdulgafour  Dr. Khaled Al-Anezi | MOH, Former Head of International Relations  MoH, Deputy Head of International Relations |
|  | 14:00-15:30 | Mr. Bashar Marafie and Mr Mohamed Allahou | Program Managers, UNDP |
|  | 15:30-17:30 | UNDP Team | DRR, PO, PA, PC, PO (Debriefing) |

# Appendix IV. Evaluation Ratings and their Definitions

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Ratings for Progress Towards Results:** | | |
| 6 | Highly Satisfactory (HS) | The objective/outcome is expected to achieve or exceed all its end-of-project targets, without major shortcomings. The progress towards the objective/outcome can be presented as “good practice”. |
| 5 | Satisfactory (S) | The objective/outcome is expected to achieve most of its end-of-project targets, with only minor shortcomings. |
| 4 | Moderately Satisfactory (MS) | The objective/outcome is expected to achieve most of its end-of-project targets but with significant shortcomings. |
| 3 | Moderately Unsatisfactory (HU) | The objective/outcome is expected to achieve its end-of-project targets with major shortcomings. |
| 2 | Unsatisfactory (U) | The objective/outcome is expected not to achieve most of its end-of-project targets. |
| 1 | Highly Unsatisfactory (HU) | The objective/outcome has failed to achieve its midterm targets and is not expected to achieve any of its end-of-project targets. |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Ratings for Sustainability:** | | |
| 4 | Likely (L) | Negligible risks to sustainability, with key outcomes on track to be achieved by the project’s closure and expected to continue into the foreseeable future |
| 3 | Moderately Likely (ML) | Moderate risks, but expectations that at least some outcomes will be sustained due to the progress towards results on outcomes at the Midterm Review |
| 2 | Moderately Unlikely (MU) | Significant risk that key outcomes will not carry on after project closure, although some outputs and activities should carry on |
| 1 | Unlikely (U) | Severe risks that project outcomes as well as key outputs will not be sustained |

1. [cristina.mosneaga@oba.co.uk](mailto:cristina.mosneaga@oba.co.uk) [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. Please refer to Appendix IV for the evaluation ratings and their definitions. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. The ICDI/KNDP project expected end date is December 2019. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. Please refer to Appendix 2 “The Evaluation Matrix” for more details on the methods and tools used. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. Please refer to Appendix 3 “Schedule of Meetings” for the full list of persons and organizations met during field work. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. Please refer to Appendix 1 “Interview Protocol” for the list of evaluation questions. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. <https://www.oecd.org/development/evaluation/dcdndep/47069197.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. Please refer to Appendix IV for the full list of ratings and their definitions [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. Source : <https://www.britannica.com/place/Kuwait> [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. Source : <http://www.newkuwait.gov.kw/en/plan/> [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. Extended to June 2019. [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
12. <https://www.scpd.gov.kw/Default.aspx?More=1> [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
13. <https://www.csb.gov.kw/Default_EN> [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
14. Source : Project Document [↑](#footnote-ref-14)
15. <http://www.kw.undp.org/content/kuwait/en/home/operations/projects/democratic_governance/institutional-capacity-development-for-implementation-of-the-kuw.html> [↑](#footnote-ref-15)
16. Using the Civil Service Commission database. [↑](#footnote-ref-16)
17. The KPPC project has been evaluated separately and the findings were presented in a separate report. [↑](#footnote-ref-17)
18. The macroeconomic model is one of the key deliverables of the KPPC project and is discussed in more detail in the KPPC project evaluation report. [↑](#footnote-ref-18)
19. GGGI is an International Organization with 28-member states, its mission is to deliver socially inclusive, environmentally sustainable economic growth around the world in line with Paris agreement and SDGs. [↑](#footnote-ref-19)
20. In accordance with Law No. 27 of 1963 regarding Statistics and Census. [↑](#footnote-ref-20)
21. Ikujiro Nonaka “A Dynamic Theory of Organizational Knowledge Creation”, *Organization Science*, Vol. 5, No. 1 (Feb., 1994), pp. 14-37, www.jstor.org/stable/2635068

    [↑](#footnote-ref-21)
22. Based on Results Framework from the Project Document. [↑](#footnote-ref-22)