# Final evaluation of the project "MIY- Multi-media Initiative for Youth in Cambodia"-Klahan9

Prepared by: Mr. Tomislav Novovic, Team Leader Ms. Sophorn Tous, Team Member

December 2018

# **Table of Contents**

List of Abbreviations	b
I. Executive summary Key findings and conclusions	
2. Project background and intervention logic	6
3. Objective of the final evaluation	7
4. The methodology for the final evaluation	7
5. Evaluation findings 5.1. Relevance 5.2. Efficiency 5.3. Effectiveness 5.4. Impact 5.5. Sustainability	10 15 19 23
6. Lessons learned	29
7. Conclusions and Recommendations Annex 1: Evaluation Matrix Annex 2: List of people interviewed (alphabet order) Annex 3: Interview guides	34 38

# List of Abbreviations

BBC	British Broadcasting Company
BBCMA	BBC Media Action
CBS	Cambodian Broadcasting Service
CDPO	Cambodia Disable People Organisation
CSO	Civil Society Organization
DAC	Development Assistance Cooperation
FE	Final Evaluation
GDP	Growth Domestic Product
KII	Key Informants Interviews
MTR	Mid-term Evaluation
MIY	Multi-media Initiative for Youth in Cambodia
MoLVT	Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training
NEA	National Employment Agency
NGO	Non-governmental Organization
NYAP	National Action Plan on Youth Development
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
00	Overall Objective
OVI	Objectively Verifiable Indicator
РСМ	Project Cycle Management
SOPs	Standard Operating Procedures
SoV	Sources of Verification
STEM	Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics subjects
ToR	Terms of Reference
ТоТ	Training of Trainers
TVET	Technical and Vocational Education and Training
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNJP	United Nations Joint Programme
WB	World Bank
WGI	Worldwide Governance Indicators
YEAC	Young Entrepreneur Association of Cambodia

### 1. Executive summary

The key findings of the final evaluation were the following:

- The overall MIY intervention, including implementation modality have been fully in line with the national strategic priorities for Cambodian and with the needs of the unemployed and youth in vulnerable employment. Preparation and implementation of the MIY project has been characterized with strong technical inputs, national participation and ownership and followed best practices for design and implementation of multi-media approaches;
- The final evaluation confirms that implementation of the MIY has been successful and achievement of results has been highly satisfactory. The results could be considered as even more successful when analysed in the context of socio-economic challenges and dynamics within the country, and also complexity and sensitivity of youth employment in Cambodia.
- The MIY project introduced multimedia programs as innovative tools and approaches to improve the overall youth employment situation in Cambodia. Also, the project has been effective in involving of youth with disabilities in activities, facilitating their inclusion at the labour market.

**"Klahan9 (which means 'Brave9')** a multi-media initiative on TV, radio, online, that aims to support young people in Cambodia to improve their life by providing information about employment, economic security opportunities and negotiating with family and other decision makers around jobs. Klahan9 uses different media platforms to deliver a range of topics to both rural and urban audiences. The TV platform plays a role in attracting audiences through a mix of formats, including drama and magazine segments. The radio platform uses a mixed format of entertainment, discussion with experts, and audience engagement via call-ins and voxpops. The online platform is structured to promote and emphasise content on radio and TV for discussion and feedback through Facebook, Soundcloud, YouTube and the website.

**Dream Station video program** is a part of the Klahan9 multimedia platforms designed by and for young Cambodians who seek decent employment and manage their finance. The show presents the real lives of young Cambodians aiming for a better future by exploring career paths and negotiating their options with critical decision-makers, especially their parents. For example, the first episode features a real life of Ms. Sreyrong, a 21-year-old young "dreamer" from Kandal. Sreyrong dreams of running her own flower business. Throughout the episode, Sreyrong has to negotiate to win her family's financial and emotional support and learns that trying to do everything on her own is not always the best way of achieving a goal.

**Radio programme** aims to provide in-depth discussion and analysis of the issues raised under 10 themes, including questions from the audience through the live call-in segment, through guest speaker interviews and expert panels.

**The roadshows** are outreach events, presenting the best of Klahan9 content through stage events, a series of booths and screenings of TV and digital content. Screenings or listening group sessions have been followed by discussion and question and answer sessions about the issue featured in the episode. The Roadshow academy has built on the results of the roadshow, delivered as a three-day training on different topics on soft skills and entrepreneurship, while also the TV series Dream Station and Klahan9 has been used and analysed.

**Parent's toolkit**<sup>1</sup> have been developed to inform parents of the variety of choices that they can make and provides practical examples and models to support their children to reach their dream goals.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The toolkit included the following modules: Module 1: the introduction of the toolkit. Module2 is to understand your child better. Module 3 is about knowing the options (employments opportunities, soft skills and skills, universities...). Module 4: Option for their child to continue the education, Module5 is about the job options and employment security. Module 6: next plan to support the children.

### Key findings and conclusions

#### Relevance

- The MIY project has been aligned with the national priorities related to youth, while also addressing the needs and challenges identified during the formulation the formulation phase shaped the MIY project.
- The MIY has been flexible and highly responsive to the needs of the youth in Cambodia, adapting to the changing environment (e.g. The Dream Station TV format prepared in an observational-documentary style replaced traditional drama programs)
- The BBC Media Action and UNDP as the leading organizations and other partners involved in the implementation showed a high commitment and ownership of the project. The support that the project has been providing responded to the present institutional and human capacities of the key stakeholders (partners) and beneficiaries
- The main target group, urban and rural youth (aged 15-30) and especially young women, who are in unemployment or in vulnerable employment, remained well selected and in demand for the assistance provided through the project.

#### **Efficiency and effectiveness**

- The MIY project has been implemented efficiency- the management and steering structures have been in place and optimized for the efficient delivery of the project.
- Management mechanisms, such as quality assurance, reporting, monitoring and financial oversight have been satisfactory.
- The effectiveness of the MIY project has been highly satisfactory and the project produced all planned results thus contributing to outcomes.

#### Impact

- At the institutional level, the positive impact has been achieved and ensured through enhanced capacities of the National Employment Agency to deliver multi-media services and provide quality media programs<sup>2</sup>. Also, other organizations that have been participating in the project
- The impact has been recorded among other institutions that were not participating or directly benefiting from the MIY project could use different project products and enhance its technical capacities through available and functional manuals and toolkits and training programs.
- The impact at the individual level could be expected among the direct beneficiaries through improved perception about employment opportunities. The analysis of the primary and secondary information show that young people reported that the MIY project/ Klahan9 contributed to improved motivation and increase confidence to discuss employment opportunities, search for jobs and understand importance of knowledge and skills. However, challenges and barriers remain especially amongst vulnerable young people such as low-educated, low-skilled youths and young women. These include a lack of skills, a lack of information of where to find jobs or access training opportunities.

#### **Sustainability**

• The MIY project has been considering strategies to ensure sustainability from the early stages of implementation. The results of the project at the institutional level, specifically plans and methods to prepare and deliver multi-media programs and improve information access, have been embedded in the operational practices of the media department of the National

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> KII with the NEA and other partners; also, the NEA has started preparing multi-media programs related to employment

Employment Agency (NEA). Especially important in ensuring sustainability at this level has been the additional, new component and support to the NEA provided by the UNDP project team.

- The assistance available through the joint UN Project "UNited For Youth Employment in Cambodia" has been further built on the MIY project's results at the institutional level, additionally contributing to its sustainability.
- Different multi-media programs remained available via web-sources (social media and YouTube channels). Also, the sources of knowledge that the MIY project created- e.g. the guidebooks and analytical reports including methodological approaches), remained available for future use and replication.
- However, ensuring sustainability of behavioural changes among the target groups and beneficiaries remains challenge, and would require well-planned, comprehensive and multi-annual approach

#### Recommendations

The final evaluation has provided several recommendations to the partners on the MIY project:

- R1: It is recommended to continue multi-media support to youth employment in Cambodia (linking it to a broader development agenda, and with clear exit strategy)
- R2: UNDP should become more visible as technical advisor to the national partners in the area of youth employment
- R3: Support the Government of Cambodia and other partners to assess the existing and design and implement measures to facilitate employment and integration of the youth with disabilities in the labour market
- R4: It is recommended to strengthen capacities of the Government of Cambodia for coordination and the stakeholders from the Government and its relevant ministries, the National Employment Agency and civil society organizations for monitoring implementation of measures and programs for youth employment in Cambodia
- R5: It is recommended that UNDP and the partners continue and expand work on generating youth led-businesses and strengthen entrepreneurial attitude among the youth
- R6: It is recommended to explore opportunities to continue strengthening civil society to become more active in supporting youth employment in Cambodia

# 2. Project background and intervention logic

The Multi-media Initiative for Youth (MIY) is a project that aims to support Cambodian young people (aged 15-30) to improve their knowledge and efficacy (confidence in their ability), individually and collectively, to work together better among themselves and with older people to achieve common goals. The project has undertaken two major activities, which include: 1) Delivery of youth-oriented employment education through multi-media platforms such as TV, radio and social media; programmes; and outreach activities; 2) Capacity development for Cambodian youth through capacity strengthening activities with the National Employment Agency.

The project has been implemented in two phases. The phase I was implemented from November 2014 to June 2016 and phase II from July 2016 to December 2018. The project is co-funded by the Swedish Government and UNDP Cambodia with the BBC Media Action is the main Implementing Partner and other additional key implementing partners including National Employment Agency (NEA), Young Entrepreneurs Association (YEAC) and Cambodia Disable People Organisation (CDPO).

During the first phase, the project strategy was guided by a theory of change which lays out the change pathway for project intervention to achieve the intended outcomes. The change pathway was determined as following:

- Increased access to information for young people aged 15-30 in Cambodia about job opportunities; formal and informal ways to find employment; access to training and support; or ways to improve the way they make a living.
- Increase Cambodian young people's knowledge and skills in seeking employment/ an occupation that will meet their economic needs and provide good conditions.
- Increase Cambodian young people's confidence, and knowledge of strategies, to discuss and negotiate with parents and other community power holders about their livelihoods.
- Increase media production skills in the Cambodian media industry to contribute to improved programming on economic resilience.

During its first phase, the MIY project has contributed to building the knowledge and self-efficacy of young people in exploring suitable jobs for themselves. The BBC Media Action commissioned impact assessment that showed the positive opinion of the young people exposed to Klahan9, as being braver in communication with others, facing up to problems, working hard, and struggling to overcome obstacles in life. The participants also felt the programme reinforced their existing knowledge, and motivated them to carry out their plans. For example, research participants commented that the information from the Klahan9 enabled them to feel motivated to initiate, run and expand their own business; become encouraged to continue studying; consider the risks before migrating for employment, and increase their capacities and skills for job interviews. Some of the participants reported that TV programme had motivating function to act differently and become more active to improve their livelihoods; however, the majority of the audience have not done anything differently after engaging with Klahan9.

The information about the achieved results indicated that young people have achieved steps following determined theory of change by acquired necessary knowledge and skills and already started applying when opportunity arisen.

The positive experience and the lessons learned from the first phase facilitated finetuning and adjustment of the intervention in the second phase. The MIY has adjusted its Theory of Change, focusing more on the participatory multi-media approach to boost the engagement of young people with the programme. The project has been working toward the following changes:

- Unemployed or vulnerably employed youth especially female youth in Cambodia know what the various job options are, the advantages and disadvantages of focus jobs, and the skills needed to do these jobs.
- Unemployed or vulnerably employed youth especially female youth in Cambodia feel motivated to enrol in Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) or study science, technology, engineering and mathematics (STEM) subjects.

- Unemployed or vulnerably employed youth especially female youth in Cambodia have negotiation skills to talk to gatekeepers about what they want to do and gain their support.
- Employed youth especially female youth in Cambodia have the analytical, attitudinal and soft decisionmaking skills needed by employers that would allow them to secure promotion.

# 3. Objective of the final evaluation

The final project evaluation has been implemented in 2018 before completion of the project to inform key stakeholders on the project results, identify lesson learns and potential future role and contribution of UNDP toward increasing employability for young people in Cambodia. The intention was also to aid UNDP future's programming and project development process in line with UNDP Country Programme Development 2019-2023.

In this context, the final evaluation envisaged the following objectives:

- Review and assess the overall achievements of development results at the level of outputs, outcomes and impacts as outlined in the Project's Results and Resources Framework and Theory of Change
- Identify opportunities and challenges related to the design, and implementation of the MIY based upon the following criteria: relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability;
- Assess how the project relates to or complements other youth employment projects including overall contribution to related national policies on youth development and employment, and the UNDP Country Programme Action Plan (CPAP) 2016-2018;
- Identify lessons and good practices from MIY, with potential for scaling up or inclusion in national policies or programmes;
- Synthesize lesson learned and provide recommendations on the opportunities for UNDP to contribute in addressing youth employment issues;

### 4. The methodology for the final evaluation

The scope and the details for this final evaluation have been stipulated in the Terms of reference while complying with UNDP/ UN Evaluation Group norms, standards, code of conduct and ethical guidelines.

This part provides a description of data collection methods and data sources that have been employed, including the rationale for their selection- e.g. how they informed the final evaluation- and their limitations. It also provided description of the data collection tools, instruments and protocols including the discussion of reliability and validity for the final evaluation.

In general the FE followed the steps described below:

#### 1) Desk Phase

Mapping to ensure that nothing is missed and that available time is focused on appropriate areas:

Key sources of information	<ul> <li>Project document including documented results of the project (outputs)</li> </ul>
	Project progress and financial reports
	Monitoring reports
	<ul> <li>Analytical reports (e.g. Findings from the Cambodia qualitative assessments of on-line, radio and television programs; other analytical reports produced by the project etc)</li> </ul>
	Other UNDP/ BBC project related documentation

	<ul><li>Web sources, video materials, etc</li><li>Partnership initiatives and agreements, etc</li></ul>
Key stakeholders	<ul> <li>Key national partners, such as the Government of Cambodia and the Ministry of Youth, the National Employment Agency, etc)</li> <li>International and national development partners</li> </ul>
Some of relevant documents	<ul> <li>National statistics with specific focus youth and youth employment</li> <li>Policy and strategic framework in the areas related to the project (e.g. youth and employment related laws, strategies and policies)</li> <li>The products (reports and analysis) of other organizations and development partners in this area</li> </ul>

The final evaluation undertook the following activities during the desk phase:

- Review baseline and key expected results (UNDP's programme and project quality standards were the benchmark for these reviews)
- Review documented results of the MIY project, from the inception to the current stage,
- Review the enabling environment for implementation of the project
- Identify key horizontal issues, themes, best practises, success stories, etc. for follow- up, further investigation, verification, and triangulation.
- Completion/ finalization of the final evaluation approach and methodology;
- Identification of the needs for interviews

#### 2) Research Phase

The field phase included personal interviews with the UNDP and BBCMA management and implementation teams, , other project implementing partners, project beneficiaries and stakeholders and has been implemented from 09 until 19 November 2018.

The evaluation carried out semi-structured interviews, based on questionnaires (attached as the Annex 3 of this report). This approach enabled to collect adequate information about the project, results achieved and the perception of the beneficiaries. Also, on-line interviews were used to complement field mission data collection, while facilitating with the analysis of information.

In the context of project beneficiaries, it was challenging to identify direct beneficiaries of the project (TV, radio or online programs). Therefore, the evaluation proposed to organize focus group meetings with youth (male and female) in different regions of the country, giving priorities to regions in which so-called roadshows were organized by the project, thus, visits to three (e.g. university students in Phnom Penh, etc). The purpose of the focus groups meetings will be to discuss and explore opinions, interests and priorities of the youth related to decent and sustainable employment and identify forward looking priorities that the follow up intervention and more comprehensive youth employment program may address in the future.

The meetings included more that 40 representatives from project stakeholders (a detailed list of interviewed stakeholders in provided as the Annex 2 to this report). The sample of stakeholders for the interview has been made in line with the following criteria:

i) **directly involved in programming:** UNDP, BBC Media Action, Swedish Agency for International Development (SIDA), the National Employment Agency of Cambodia, and the Ministry of Education Youth and Sports;. The programming for the additional component involved also the Young Entrepreneurs Association of Cambodia (YEAC) and the Cambodia Disable People Organisation (CDPO)

ii) directly involved in management and implementation of the project: UNDP, BBC MA, YEAC, CDPO

iii) direct beneficiaries- institutional level: the National Employment Agency of Cambodia

iv) **direct beneficiaries- youth in Cambodia**: focus groups at the regional level- with ensured gender equality and equal participation of young girls and boys. The evaluation team planned and organized visits to three regions, (Kompong Cham, Kratie, Stung Treng). The evaluation team met with the beneficiaries, of the road shows, participants in the Training of Trainers (ToT) and Klahan9 ambassadors.

v) key policy makers in the areas of youth employment: representatives of the Government of Cambodia and the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport

Also, the evaluation met with other international development partners involved in supporting youth employment in Cambodia.

#### 3) Analysis and Synthesis Phase

This phase has been mainly devoted to the preparation of the final evaluation report based on the work done during the desk and field phases and taking into consideration the results and information from the briefing meetings. The final evaluation report included findings, conclusion and recommendations for each of the evaluation areas, namely, relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability and impact the of project.

The report provided the analysis of the national, policy and strategic level, reflecting on relevance and identifying the factors at the country level that have influenced the MIY project and the overall youth employment in Cambodia. This part of the evaluation report also included analysis of youth employment trends and factors affecting them.

The evaluation assessed the alignment of the MIY project with the sectoral priorities and its flexibility to respond to the changing environment and emerging needs of the employment sector in Cambodia. The analysis at this level set the context to reflect on the contribution of the MIY project to its planned outcome. Concerning efforts to create a credible link between what MIY achieved and progress towards the outcome this, the evaluation presented a "chain of causality" that revealed linkages between the findings and conclusions about the project, its results and outcomes. Highly relevant professional judgment of the evaluator backed by analysis of data and perceptions served to provide conclusions. These efforts in conjunction with the analysis of the indicators from both, the evaluation framework and the results and resources framework, facilitated the judgments to measure progress towards the outputs/ results.

The FE distilled the main findings and conclusions by evaluation question, and highlighted findings for each line of evidence. Conclusions, as interpretations and judgments based on the findings, have been presented with sufficient evidence. The recommendations have been prepared in form of proposed actions for UNDP consideration. The guiding principles for defining recommendations have been to describe actions and required steps and associate them with benefits for the target groups.

The evaluation matrix that was the backbone of the Inception report/ evaluation methodology ensured comparability, triangulation of findings concerning the qualitative indicators on crucial evaluation questions. Also, the RRF and reports on progress together with the interview analysis, have been used as additional tools. Thus, the final evaluation employed comprehensive and independent means to the extent possible to validate information about the status of the MIY project.

The results of the situation/ context analysis together with the analysis of the primary and secondary data will enable to identify challenges or obstacles that affected progress and contribution towards the achievement of results, while also suggesting a more substantive analysis through the causal chain to identify points of break.

A cross-cutting theme of gender equality assessment was focused on the analysis to what degree gender mainstreaming has been promoted and addressed within the MIY project- the evaluation has analysed and presented the extent to what the specific results in gender equality and empowerment of women and girls have been achieved.

# 5. Evaluation findings

The **Terms of reference** formulated the essential area for the final evaluation, using the OECD/DAC evaluation criterion including relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability, and impact, as defined and explained in the UNDP's Handbook on Planning, Monitoring and Evaluating for Results<sub>1</sub>.

The final evaluation followed the evaluation guidelines from the Terms of References, focusing on the essential areas starting with assessment of project formulation/ design and achievement of results including degree of sustainability, to analysis of management approach including challenges and risks that emerged during the implementation.

These areas were further analysed through the evaluation framework (Annex 1) provided in this report; each of the evaluation criteria was further organized around core indicators and clear line of evidences. The final evaluation considered the overall period of project implementation, using mid-term evaluation report as the key reference.

Formally, to validate impact and sustainability of the undertaken project, it is recommended to carry out ex-post evaluation 2-3 years upon the end of the project However, this final evaluation provided an opportunity to anticipate and assess (potential) impact and sustainability.

#### 5.1. Relevance

Under the relevance, the final evaluation analysed the extent to which the MIY project is suited to the priorities and policies of Cambodia and the target groups. The focus was to assess the particular area and validity of the intervention logic and the elaboration of the project to meet the identified needs of the unemployed youth in Cambodia (as the target beneficiaries). The FE analysed if the proposed implementation plan, developed during the design stage, was coherent and realistic.

Also, the FE assessed relevance and importance of the MIY project at any point during its life-cycle, answering if the intervention logic remained true in the context of possible changes on the demand side while identifying the response made to address changes and fine-tune the intervention. Part of the analysis included MIY target benchmarks, from the perspective if remained valid and achievable or whether there was a need to revise them to ensure full utilization of resources.

#### **EXTERNAL COHERENCE AND CONSISTENCY WITH THE NATIONAL PRIORITIES**

# The MIY project has ensured a high degree of consistency between its goals with the national policies and the priorities in the areas of employment (and greater social inclusion) of youth in Cambodia.

The MYI project has been aligned with the national framework document for youth in Cambodia, the National Policy on Youth Development and its strategic goal to "encourage youth to have initiation, creation, innovation and entrepreneurship"<sup>3</sup>. Particularly important for the MIY project has been the priority to "promote skill training and provide information about job announcements to job seekers<sup>4</sup>." The Policy envisaged to facilitate youth's involvement in local communities and institutions and set up programs for youth to collect, discuss, analyse and impart information and produce information that is suitable for youth in Cambodia<sup>5</sup>.

Regarding overarching national policies, the MIY project has been aligned with actions and priorities for youth employment. The MIY has been aligned with the Rectangular Strategy III<sup>6</sup> and its pillars Growth, Employment, Equity and Efficiency. Particularly relevant is the Strategic objective 2 "Creating more jobs

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The National Policy on Youth Development in Cambodia, the strategic goal 4.2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The National Policy on Youth Development in Cambodia, and the strategic goal 5.4. Increase entrepreneurship and labour market, and planned measure.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The Strategic Goal 5.6. envisages youth participation in labour market and other media related activities.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> The "Rectangular Strategy-Phase III" reaffirms the RGC's mission and its strong commitment to sustainable development and poverty reduction that respond to the people's will and emerging contexts of national and international developments.

for people especially the youth through further improvement in Cambodia's competitiveness to attract and encourage both domestic and foreign investments."

The MIY project has been also aligned with other policies referential for youth employment: the Non-Formal Education Action Plan 2008-2015, the Education Strategic Plan 2014-2018, the National Policy on Non-Formal Education 2003-2015 and the Labour Law (1997). These strategic priorities that have been shaping design of the MIY project remained relevant.

The enduring relevance of the MIY project with the national priorities have been highlighted in the National Action Plan on Youth Development (NYAP)<sup>7</sup>. In phase 2016-2018, NYAP has been focused on 6 among the 12 strategies set in the NYDP, with the following strategies relevant to the project: Strategy 2: Promotion of education, training and capacity development, the Strategy 4: Development of spirit of entrepreneurship and labour market, Strategy 6: Enhancement of youth participation and the Strategy 10: Promotion of volunteerism. Other national strategic documents such as the Industrial Development Policies 2015-2025; the Non-Formal Education Action Plan 2008-2015 and the Education Strategic Plan 2014-2018, as well as the Employment Law and the Law on education confirms lasting relevance of the project and results achieved

#### **INTERNAL COHERENCE:**

# The degree of internal coherence and alignment of the MIY project's intervention with the identified needs of the beneficiaries and target groups has been high.

The project design process was comprehensive and sound resulting that the final proposed action was explicitly tied to identification and assessment phase. This bottom up approach during the formulation and design phase with collaboration and involvement of youth from different regions of Cambodia and institutional partners, the National Employment Agency, the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport and representatives of various project stakeholders, set the basis for successful implementation of the project<sup>8</sup>.

The formulation of the intervention logic has followed sound and inclusive process<sup>9</sup>; still, its internal structure, with hierarchy of objectives has been sub-optimal<sup>10</sup>. The hierarchy of objectives and benchmarks -indicators, baselines, targets and sources of verification have been weakly formulated. This has been a finding from the mid-term review that has not been addressed adequately by the implementing partners<sup>11</sup>. Still, the project team has revised and introduce more realistic targets, that have been used for monitoring and reporting on quarterly and annual level<sup>12</sup>, ensuring that they remained valid and achievable during the implementation. Also, the newly introduced UNDP component responded to the (programmatic and management-related) recommendations from the mid-term review and established a Results and Resources Framework including robust indicators and realistic targets. This has been an important impetus for a sound management/ monitoring of system. The indicators at a different level of the intervention logic have been only partially relevant to measure the progress and achievements. The MIY team addressed these comments and findings highlighted in the mid-term report only partially.

#### **RESPONSIVENESS AND FLEXIBILITY:**

The MIY project has been highly responsive to the needs of the target groups and final beneficiaries, while also adjusting to the changes of the development perspectives in Cambodia.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> The NYAP has been working to ensure that "youth, aged 15-30, are engaging in the development of physical capacity, knowledge, skills, and good living ethics; living together with peace and harmony; embracing patriotism; building leadership and confidence; enhancing dignity and raising social awareness.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> The analysis of the Project document and the notes from the formulation phase. Also, inputs from the KII- UNDP, BBC Media Action and the Government of Cambodia.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Reference to the MIY project document and the KII- mid-term review

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Project document- results and resources framework. Also, the reference could be UNDP planning and programming resources books that clearly delineate between the elements of the intervention logic.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Recommendations and comments from the mid-term review (March 2017).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Annual report for 2017 and the Quarterly reports for 2017 and 2018.

The stakeholders shared the opinion that the MIY i has been effective and relevant in addressing some of the main challenges of the youth employment in Cambodia<sup>13</sup>. The project has been particularly important in addressing limited information about decent employment options, insufficient profession/ job related soft-skills and weak interest among the youth to enrol in professional education or training. Also, the stakeholders recognized relevance of the MIY intervention to strengthen organizational support mechanism for the youth employment<sup>14</sup>

The relevance of the MIY intervention, as recognized also by the stakeholders<sup>15</sup>, has been based on a positive experience from the joint UNDP- BBCMA project Loy9<sup>16</sup>. The implementing partners have built on this positive approach, looking at and assessing the root causes of unemployment, vulnerable employment and marginalization of youth in Cambodia<sup>17</sup>. The results showed that the majority of young people in Cambodia has been employed, however, the quality of employment is often low, affecting the youth (and the country) to make the most of their economic potential. An important part of the young people stated they have chosen the self-employment route involuntarily, being exposed to the family pressure or being unable to find a wage or salaried job. The low quality of employment remains pressing problem for more than a half of young workers in Cambodia: the large majority of them receive a wage that is below the average of all workers (app 70 percent), with dominance of informal and irregular employments. The mismatch between education and skills demand in the labour market continued to affect the labour market: more than a half of the youth at vulnerable employment have been undereducated for the job that they hold. This situation is significantly affected by the Cambodia's social context with hierarchical family structure and a strong influence of traditions created unfavourable environment for young people to discuss and negotiate with parents and other influencers employment options, including better conditions or careers perspectives and opportunities. Young people, particularly young women in Cambodia have insufficient skills and capacities to articulate their professional abilities and attitudes, while lacking so-called soft skills<sup>18</sup> to facilitate their professional advancement and lead them to promotion<sup>19</sup>. Access to adequate job-related information, especially for the youth in rural areas, has been also a challenge.

Therefore, the multimedia component of the MIY project responded to these needs and provided young people, and especially young women, with skills to search for employment and negotiate better professional opportunities. Thus, the MIY project relevance has been ensured by supporting positive changes towards decent employments communicated through multimedia<sup>20</sup>.

The MIY project has also identified weakness of youth employment support networks, as there has been an inadequate and frequently absent professional assistance to guide young people in a job search using more generation-adequate tools<sup>21</sup>. Therefore, the relevance of "non-multimedia" elements of the intervention has been ensured through its support to the National Employment Agency, as the central pillar of assistance, to develop and pilot awareness raising and public education programs about decent employment among the youth. Also, this component provided essential business knowledge and responsibilities, offering opportunities to interact with business owners, young entrepreneurs and public authorities.

The MIY project has shown high degree of adaptability and flexibility during its implementation. The multimedia project component swiftly responded to the field-findings and adjusted its approach from fictional drama stories to a reality TV show, presented in an observational-documentary style under the title

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Ref to Desk Review- Project Analytical Documents and Project reports; and Key Informant Interviews (KII)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> KII with the NEA and with other partners involved in support to youth employment, such as ILO, UNICEF, SDC

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> The reference are KIIs during the filed phase; however, the collected information has been analysed together with the national statistics and analytical reports. Also the MIY project products have been considered

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Loy9 project- Final Project Report, 2013-2014 prepared and submitted by United Nations Development Programme – Cambodia. Also available via:

https://info.undp.org/docs/.../77136\_Loy9\_Final\_Report\_Jan\_2013\_Apirl\_2014.docx

 $<sup>^{\</sup>scriptscriptstyle 17}$  Ref to MIY Project document and KII with UNDP and BBC Media Action

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Soft skills include analytical or communication skills

<sup>19</sup> KII- UNDP; KII- BBC MA

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> KII-UNDP and KII-BBCMA. Also, the meeting minutes from the Project Board Meetings

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> MIY identification of problems from the project document

"Dream Station<sup>22</sup>." These adjustments followed and responded to the findings from the Klahan9 impact analysis at the target audience<sup>23</sup>. Thus, the MIY started with an hour-long reality TV show that integrated behaviour changing communication approach to support young people on their journey to find decent employment<sup>24</sup>. The new programs have adopted an observational-documentary style, using "the Dreamers" personal journey from the "dream" stage (business idea) through experts' support to the final point as the actual achievement of a dream. The Dream Station programs have sent a message to the audience that soft skills – in particular, adaptability, communication, confidence, problem-solving, negotiation and planning- have been factors that could make difference, inevitable linked with (decent) employment. Also, the MIY project has shown responsiveness and flexibility related to the radioprograms. The assessment of the relevance (and adequacy) of the radio programs<sup>25</sup>, presented negative trends and decreasing interest for this media form among the target groups. Thus, this finding served to the implementing partners to implementing partners have decided to focus on web-based means and tools, thus, not to continue with radio programs<sup>26</sup>.

Another example of flexibility and responsiveness of the MIY/ Klahang project could be introduction of the "9:09 show". This on-line education and entertainment show has involved Cambodia influencers and celebrities, presenting their career secrets and paths to success. The decision to initiate the "9:09 show" has been made to substitute the initially planned mobile App programme. Namely, the mobile App programme has been assessed to have lower comparative advantage than the show with limited project timeframe<sup>27</sup>.

Also, the non-multimedia component of the MIY project has been responsive and flexible to the emerging needs to institutionalize changes and also enhance the scope of support available through the MIY project. Through the new UNDP defined and implemented component formulated as a response to the recommendations from the mid-term evaluation and also based on findings from the situation analysis, the MIY project expanded support to the National Employment Agency. This approach has ensured that multimedia skills have been inserted into operational practices of the NEA. Through additional capacity development efforts, the NEA has been able to prepare and pilot multimedia TV programs for decent employment of youth. Also, under this component the new areas of support for the youth have been introduced by enhancing partnership with the private sector and providing employment-related assistance to the youth with disabilities. Through the work with the Young Entrepreneurs Association of Cambodia (YEAC), the project enabled youth to understand essential business knowledge and responsibilities; this has been done through interaction between the youth with business owners, young entrepreneurs and local authority, and among youth. The MIY project has been working to increase employability of youth with disabilities by improving their knowledge, developing advocacy tools and engaging private sector and other key policy makers to ensure provision of employment opportunities to YWDs. This component has re-affirmed the principle "leaving no one behind".

The responsiveness and flexibility of UNDP as the implementing partner has been also evidenced through the formulation and participation in the United Nations Joint Project "UNited for Youth Employment in Cambodia<sup>28</sup>." The UNJP has adopted a holistic approach to addressing "multidimensional facets of youth employment" through the involvement of specialized UN Agencies and well-targeted activities<sup>29</sup>; including additional and complementary multi-media support programs that have included the NEA<sup>30</sup>.

However, the MIY implementation team was less flexible in integrating inputs from the development partners working in the areas of youth employment. Specifically, some of the international development

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Reference to the MIY Annual Project Report for 2017

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> KII BBC Media Group and the impact assessment reports prepared by the BBC Media Group

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Reference to the MIY Annual Project Report for 2017

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Findings from the Cambodia Qualitative Evaluation of Klahan9 Radio Programme, July 2016

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Quarterly project reports for 2016 and Annual Project Report for 2016

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Q2 and Q3 progress reports for 2018 have provided detailed information on the advantages of the 9:09 shows and justification for its introduction.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> The participating UN Agencies in the joint programme are: ILO, UNDP, UNESCO, UNICEF and UNV

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Project document "UNited For Youth Employment in Cambodia", United Nations Joint Programme Document, Phnom Penh, August 2017

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> KII Ministry of Education of the Government of Cambodia and the KII National Employment Agency

partners stated that attempts to communicate with the MIY implementing team (from BBC Media Action) or ensure greater complementarity or cross-sectoral cooperation of different interventions have not been successful<sup>31</sup>. Also, the work of the Technical Advisory Group<sup>32</sup>

#### **COMMITMENT OF THE TARGET GROUPS:**

The main target group, the unemployed youth and youth in vulnerable employment but also employers from private and public sectors, remained well selected and in demand for the assistance provided through the MIY project<sup>33</sup>. The need to strengthen the National Employment Agency (NEA) for implementation of educational, advocacy and multi-media programs remained relevant; thus, this partner has remained highly committed to the MIY project and its core areas of intervention.

The partners involved in the implementation of additional activities, the Young Entrepreneur Association of Cambodia (YEAC) and the Cambodia Disable People Organisation (CDPO) confirmed commitment to the principle of "no one left behind" and the objectives of the project.

#### **COMMITMENT OF PARTNERS:**

The BBC Media Action and UNDP as the leading organizations involved in the implementation showed a high commitment to the implementation of the MIY project, its stated objective and achieved results<sup>34</sup>, deriving from their long-term cooperation. Also, the National Employment Agency, its sub-ordinated units and the Ministry of Education, Sports and Youth as the key institutions involved in the specific areas of the MIY project have expressed high degree of commitment to the project<sup>35</sup>. been instrumental to define well-articulated and tailored approach for the end beneficiaries.

Still, the coordination and cooperation among the key project partners has been sub-optimal<sup>36</sup>; this finding almost mirrored weak coordination options and mechanisms within the youth sector. Some of the leading international development organizations<sup>37</sup> in the area of youth employment stated that the BBC MA and its MIY project team, has not been showing openness and willingness to cooperate and consult on youth employment priorities, issues and concerns related to youth employment. The development organizations expressed concerns that important opportunities for cross-sectoral cooperation and possible multiplier effects have been underutilised<sup>38</sup>.

The FE found that an ambivalent partners' perception of the MIY deliverables has been created. While the quality of the prepared programs from the media perspective has been highly regarded and acknowledged, the concerns have been raised about the specific youth employment technical skills and substantive knowledge of the challenges for Cambodia of the team that had been working and preparing media programs<sup>39</sup>.

#### **CONCLUDING REMARKS**

The analysis of the priorities and assessment of established project's intervention confirm that the MIY priority areas, its intervention logic and focus to increase knowledge, soft skills and the confidence to of urban and rural youth and especially young women in Cambodia to identify alternative jobs and mobilise support from their influencers, remained relevant from the start of the project.

As indicated in the previous paragraphs, the MIY project was instrumental in the implementation of some of the key national priorities as identified during the formulation process. Also, its important contribution has been in the area of capacity and institutional development of the National Employment Agency. The evaluation finds that the support provided to the youth in Cambodia as the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> KII UNICEF, KII ILO

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> More details have been provided in the part of this report on Efficiency.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> The findings and conclusions from the Klahan9 Impact Assessment confirmed high degree of commitments of the target groups, although the FE expressed some concerns related to methodology, the findings are valid.

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm 34}$  KEE with UNDP and KEE with BBC Media Action

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> KEE with NEA and KEE Ministry of Youth

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> KEE with UNDP

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Key Informants interviews (KII)- IOM and UNICEF

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Key Informants interviews (KII)- IOM and UNICEF

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Key Informants interviews (KII)- IOM and UNICEF, UNDP

primary target group, the employers, the NEA and the educational institutions available through the project remained highly relevant and needed throughout the implementation phase. The enduring relevance of the MIY project has been confirmed in the expanding national efforts to improve status of the youth at the labour market by addressing vulnerable employment and increasing competitiveness and employability of the youth at the labour market in Cambodia.

The evaluation confirms the demand for the continuation of the existing activities, especially considering the intervention areas and cross-sectoral challenges within the broader area of youth employment that the MIY is addressing through multi-media and non-multimedia components.

### 5.2. Efficiency

Efficiency refers to the extent to which the project results have been achieved by rational use of inputs, such as financial resources, expertise, time, etc: it concerns the link between results and the activities and inputs envisaged for the achievement of the result.

# The MIY project has been in general implemented efficiently, characterized with well-established management and operational mechanism, but the cooperation and communication between the key partners has been less effective.

The analysis of the degree of the MIY efficiency has been based on the qualitative benchmarks provided in the evaluation matrix, while also using findings and conclusions from the mid-term review as points of reference. The evaluation has reflected on the overall project management and operational procedures, analysed if and to what degree measures have been implemented to increase the efficiency. Also, FE assessed functioning of the monitoring and evaluation systems, and risk management practices in the context of the overall management efficiency. The MIY project progress (quarterly and annual) reports served as the basis for this analysis<sup>40</sup>, covering the entire period of implementation with information on the project results and the budget. Also, the project document provided information on the project governance structure and mechanisms that have been in place during the project implementation. The evaluation team validated these initial findings from the desk review during the filed phase and interviews with the project team, UNDP and BBC Media Action.

#### **CONTRACTUAL ARRANGEMENTS**

The contractual arrangements between UNDP and the BBC Media Action, and also with other implementing partners, the National Employment Agency (NEA), the Young Entrepreneurs Association of Cambodia (YEAC) and the Cambodia Disable People Organisation (CDPO) have been conducive for project efficiency and achievement of the expected results.

The implementing partners have selected and followed NGO modality for the implementation of the MIY project. The preparatory phase met the requirements from the UNDP Programme and Operations Policies and Procedures; thus, a micro-assessment has been conducted to analyse both, its financial system and management capacities of the BBC Media Action as the implementing partner. The independently prepared experts' report provided positive conclusions and assessed the risks associated with the BBC Media Action capacities as "low<sup>41</sup>." The decision has been made to use the option of the Cash Advances for the implementation of the project.

Also, the additional project component introduced new implementing partners. The micro assessment of these partners, (NEA, YEAC and CDPO) confirmed availability of institutional capacities to implement assigned functions (the risk assessment has been marked "low")

# Experience and technical capacities of the implementing partners have been valuable for the efficient implementation of the project and high quality of achieved results.

The sequencing of activities together with the utilisation of financial resources have been soundly planned by the Implementing partners<sup>42</sup>. Still, a three-month non-cost extension has been approved upon request

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> UNDP provided all progress report, with the last quarterly report until September 2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Micro-assessment report on the BBC Media Action, 2014

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Reference to the project progress reports, project work plans and other project products

from the BBC media action team. The justification to "ensure successful closure of the project and full utilization of available resources<sup>43</sup>" has been valid and did not affect actual efficiency, Other than this, the project did not record any significant delays in the delivery of activities or deviations from the approved work plans, while the budgetary revision has not been requested.

#### **MANAGEMENT ARRANGEMENTS**

Following provisions from the project document, the partners have established a comprehensive steering (the Project Board) and management (MIY implementation team with the BBC Media Action and the Project Staff of UNDP) mechanisms.

#### The MIY project steering mechanism

# The steering structure for the MIY project has been established with the role to provide strategic guidance and regular annual meetings have been organized.

The Multi-media Initiative for Youth has been established under the broader framework of the Strengthen Democratic Programme (SDP) and its Programme Board (PB) remained in the centre of the steering structure. The PB members have been representatives of UNDP, BBC Media Action, the National Employment Agency. Following recommendations from the MTR<sup>44</sup>, the PB has been reconstructed and the most relevant stakeholders have been included as the members of the PB; specifically, the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports, the National Employment Agency, the Cambodian Women Entrepreneur Association and the Youth Star Cambodia<sup>45</sup>. The evaluation finds that the responsiveness of the MIY project to involve highly relevant stakeholders in the steering structure has been an important progress to ensure commitment and expand partnerships for addressing issues related to youth employment.

The meetings of the PB have been organized on an annual basis, as envisaged in the Terms of Reference<sup>46</sup>. In addition to regular annual meetings, there have been additional, needs based "virtual" consultations with the PB members on different issues that could affect achievement of planned outputs and required attention. One example could be "virtual" on-line consultations concerning replacement Mobile App with the program 9:09<sup>47</sup>.

The core functions of the PB have been, among others: providing strategic guidance and decisions on MYI direction, endorsing project progress reports and deliverables, approving work plans with budgets. These functions the PB has implemented effectively<sup>48</sup>. The minutes from the Project Board meetings have been available and anal ysed, indicating active and substantive discussion during each meeting. Also, a brief power point presentation on the achieved results and progress for the respective period has been prepared, including the overview of issues and challenges and description of planned activities<sup>49</sup>.

The MIY project document envisaged a Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) with representatives from UNDP, UN Agencies, youth CSOs, development partners and BBC Media Action. The planned role for the TAC has been to provide "technical advice to BBC Media Action's production team on specific governance matters and help ensure that MIY's content is relevant and accurate to the current youth employment context in Cambodia<sup>50</sup>". However, the rigidity of the BBC MA in Cambodia and the BBC MA members of the MIY project team to accept inputs, consult on priorities, issues and concerns related to youth employment, as well as editorial rights of BBCMA, has been highlighted as the main reason for lost interest of the partners to participate in the TAC's meetings. The technical inputs and suggestions that the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> KII with BBC Media Group

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Reference is to the part 5 Recommendations of the report Mid-term review of the MIY project, February 2017

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Minutes of the Programme Board Meeting from 20 October 2017

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> MIY project document- management arrangement

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> E-mail to the PB members from the Project Manager, dated 29 Maerch 2018, that informed the PB members on changes and also enclosed the Request to Adjust MIY project 9 Output (letter from BBCMA to UNDP, dated 28 March 2018)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> The minutes from the Project Board meetings have been available and analyzed. Also, for each PB meeting, a brief power point presentation on the achieved results and progress, including the overview has been prepared

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> The UNJP also benefited from the MIY experience, by establishing an inclusive, relevant and technical steering structure to facilitate genuine coordination and collaboration between the Government and development partners in Cambodia.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> MIY Project document- part on management arrangements

development partners provided remained noted but have not been reflected through the multi-media programs. Thus, the partners could not see the value to remain and participate in the work of the TAC<sup>51</sup>.

#### The MIY implementation team

# The MIY project has established skilled implementation team that ensured efficient and effective implementation of the project.

The MIY project was implemented under the NGO implementation modality. Extensive experience and technical capacities of the BBC Media Action team ensured efficient implementation of the project and high quality of the results<sup>52</sup> in relation to media components. The role of the UNDP in implementation of the multi-media activities has been primarily related to technical assistance and quality assurance. The FE finds that UNDP has undertaken important steps to strengthen technical basis strengthen the development dimension for the project., efficiency and effectiveness of the MIY project<sup>53</sup> This has been achieved through the additional non-multimedia component, that included technical assistance to the National Employment Agency and expanded scope through the highly relevant involvement the private sector (through the Young Entrepreneurs Association of Cambodia) while also addressing employment needs of the youth with disabilities (through the involvement of the Cambodia Disable People Organisation). In this context, the decision of the UNDP to engage a full-time Project Manager complied with the MTR recommendation to strengthen managerial involvement and has been instrumental to increase project efficiency.

The start of the joint UN project "UNited For Youth Employment in Cambodia<sup>54</sup>" further contributed to enhance the role of the UNDP in the area of youth and youth employment, confirming the validity and benefits of multi-media approach as a tool in the development context. The complementarity between the MIY and the UNDP managed component of the UNJP has also been ensured at the level of work-planning and implementation, as the (same) UNDP Project Manager has been responsible for policy advice, technical support and implementation of the UNDP tasks under both projects<sup>55</sup> (MIY and UNJP).

#### Project monitoring system:

Project monitoring system: the initial project document provided the RRF, with a set of indicators at the level of outputs including output targets that presented results and milestones. These milestones are responding to the results/ activities.

Also, the project document included a part about "Monitoring and Evaluation Framework (MEF)" presenting the general principles for project monitoring. The MEF provided basis for a quality assurance system, under the heading "Quality Management for Key Deliverables." This part of the document presented outputs and quality assurance methods.

As indicated in the mid-term review, the indicators (and the milestones) from the RRF have been weakly formulated, without inherent ability to reflect on the progress, resulting in the conclusion that the MIY project did not have a sound monitoring system with verifiable indicators. Therefore, the progress reports have been mainly focused on immediate achievements, missing reference to the indicators and targets. Following the MTR recommendations, the RRF was substantive reviewed by UNDP with involvement from BBCMA through a series of meetings. The nature of the project (and also the contractual obligations) prevented substantive review of the indicators. However, the MIY project team have clearly defined targets, source of verification and measurement methodologies for the indicators to ensure accuracy of data/results<sup>56</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Key Informants interviews (KII)- IOM and UNICEF

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Review of the project progress reports from the desk review phase and KII with UNDP and BBC Media Action and also with other partners provided evidences for this.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> The substantive/ technical side of the UNDP intervention has been presented under the Relevance part of this report

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> The meeting minutes from the MIY Project Board, held of 20 October 2017, have provided that the MIY project (Klahan9) is not part of this UN joint project; but "many of UNJP outputs are complement or support to Klahan9 project "- more details available in the Minutes of the Programme Board Meeting from 20 October 2017

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> UNDP has been steadily working to expand the portfolio of activities related to youth employment; in addition to MIY and the component within the UNJP, UNDP CO has been conceptualizing new framework document to mobilize and facilitate youth employment.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> KII with the UNDP and BBC MA. Also, the meeting minutes and progress reports captured these changes.

The final evaluation finds that UNDP has been effective in improving monitoring system and quality assurance mechanism (following the recommendations from the mid-term review), thus, since the adjustments of the MIY benchmarks, the monitoring system has been satisfactory.

#### Project reporting practice:

The MIY project followed UNDP requirements for extensive and results oriented reporting practice, through annual and quarterly progress reports. The MIY Annual Progress Reports have been prepared, reflecting on the implemented activities, presenting progress and achievements, while also showing contribution to the outcomes. Also, the MIY team has been preparing quarterly reports that provided detailed information on sequencing of activities and the overall progress. The desk review and interview with the implementing partners confirmed that these reports have been useful for monitoring purposes, to identify progress and identify eventual issues during the implementation.

Considering the size and scope of the MIY project, complexity of activities/ deliverables, the reporting practice with quarterly and annual reports has been adequate and facilitated efficient implementation.

Part of the reporting efforts has included the mid-term review report that provided platform for fine tuning of the intervention and highlighted some weaknesses that required attention.

#### Timely availability of inputs

The evaluation of the MIY efficiency was highly satisfactory measured by the degree of timely availability of inputs to implement activities. The inputs for implementation of the MIY project have been available timely, while corresponding to the needs of the action and to the planned/ implemented activities. Planning and budget allocation for procurement of services and goods were based on a market study. The remuneration system is based on the scale that was applied for the previous projects.

The BBC Media Action team requested a non-cost extension of the project that ensured full utilisation of all resources. Payment to the implementing partners was in line with the Financing Agreements that were effective from the start of the project.

#### STAKEHOLDERS' OPINION ABOUT EFFICIENCY OF THE MIY PROJECT

# The MIY project efficiency measured by stakeholders' opinions (beneficiaries, project partners and the target groups) has been high.

The stakeholders' experience communicated as the type and quality of their involvement in the delivery of project activities and also their perception about the functioning of the Project Team, has been highly affirmative<sup>57</sup>. They have stated that the implementing partners, particularly the BBC Media Action team, have been highly skilled and professional, timely, experienced and courteous in the management approach to and relationship with the beneficiaries and target groups<sup>58</sup>.

The National Employment Agency as the beneficiary but effectively a MIY project partner, has stated that the MIY project has been implemented efficiently<sup>59</sup>. Some examples have been opinion about the training program delivered within the framework of the MIY project: the NEA management and representatives of media department stated that these training programs have been well organized, relevant and demanded, following interactive approach and practical learning, at the same time adhering to high quality standards of the BBC Media Production. The training programs have established "the adequate agenda", prepared "relevant presentations, and materials, expressing interactive relationship with the participants while accepting needs and opinions<sup>60</sup>" Furthermore, the additional capacity development assistance to the National Employment Agency provided through the UNDP supported non-multimedia intervention has been rightly formulated to ensure that the

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm 57}$  KII with the NEA, KII with the focus groups during the field work

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> KII with the NEA, other partners and beneficiaries

<sup>59</sup> KII with the NEA

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> KII with the NEA

knowledge and skills acquired through trainings have been embedded in the operational structures of the NEA media production unit<sup>61</sup>.

In this context, the beneficiaries/ participants in the project activities such as trainees and the Klahang Ambassadors stated that "the MIY team made a tremendous contribution in project realization, they were available at any time for various questions that would appear during the concrete field activities (road-shows and public appearances)<sup>62</sup>." It was reported that the BBC Media Action team has been 'fully engaged' in the project implementation, and prepared to assist wherever necessary so that participants in the activities felt supported in their work, while also beneficiaries have been receiving demanded assistance. This approach demonstrated "well- established communication" with beneficiaries and target groups, positively affecting project responsiveness and flexibility.

### 5.3. Effectiveness

The MIY project has been effective to produce timely results, in line with the quality standards and following work plans. The overall score for the effectiveness is highly satisfactory. The effectiveness of the MIY project has been contributing to broader outcomes related to youth employment.

The effectiveness in the evaluation matrix reflected the extent to which the MIY achieved its outcome and objectives, and number of qualitative indicators have been suggested. This approach has been instrumental in identifying progress. Also, the analysis revealed the main factors that contributed to the effectiveness of the project, were lasting experience and proved capacities of the leading organization, supported by technical abilities of the project team, and also commitment of the project partners. Also, the results achieved within the frameworks of the previous interventions were factors that positively influenced effectiveness, ensuring well-targeted assistance and demand-driven support to the unemployed youth in Cambodia.

The main evidences on the MIY effectiveness and the achievement is provided in the following paragraphs of this report:

#### **Comments on the MIY effectiveness**

The quarterly and annual project reports, together with information collected through the filed phase, served to validate indicators related to project effectiveness. As already indicated in the previous paragraphs, the expertise and experience of the partners, the BBC Media Action and UNDP, in using multi-media initiatives as tools to address development challenges have been instrumental for the effectiveness and achievement of results<sup>63</sup>. However, the problems related to low level of activation and employment of youth in Cambodia have been multidimensional, deriving from the social, economic and political structures in the country<sup>64</sup>. Thus, the implementing partners have designed multimedia approach in accessible, and attractive manner with clear messages. Also, the additional assistance established by UNDP within the non-multimedia component of the MIY has been introduced other elements, such as private sector/employers' engagement through work with the YEAC, building entrepreneurs mindset, sensitize communities on issues related to the position of the youth with disabilities in the labour market and developing capacities of youth with disabilities and sensitise population on these issues etc.

The FE confirms that the MIY project team, have succeeded in designing useful and targeted multimedia and non-multimedia support to youth employment, measured through the perception of the stakeholders and the surveys implemented within the framework of the project..

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> KII with the NEA and also project document

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> KII with the Klahan9 Ambassadors in Kompong Cham and Stung Treng

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> The primary references remained multimedia programs to promote reproductive health and citizen participation, well-known as the Loy9 and Love9 programs.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Desk review of the analytical documents reflecting on youth employment. Also, OECD Investing in Youth reports and recently released publication Youth Aspirations and the Reality of Jobs in Developing Countries reflect on this, main factors, that influence employment of youth.

The MIY project through its results has strived to address the main areas that are affecting youth unemployment:

- Social factors: providing support to the targeted groups- youth in vulnerable employment and unemployed youth especially from marginalized groups- to overcome societal barriers and challenges and become more active in searching for decent and sustainable employment. The focus has been to increase Cambodian young people's confidence, and knowledge of strategies, to discuss and negotiate with parents and other community power holders about their livelihoods<sup>65</sup>. Also, the MIY project has been promoting partnerships at all levels, increasing skills and contributing to creation of "youth employment friendly" climate in the country;
- Economic factors: the main focus and contribution of the project in this area have been i) promoting employment and self-employment of young people; ii) increasing access and quality of information to the young people about job opportunities; formal and informal ways to find employment; access to training and support; or ways to improve the way they make a living.
- Political factors: the main focus and contribution of the project in this context have been: i) supporting young people to become more aware and obtain their rights; ii) minimizing prevailing stereotypes against young people, especially from marginalized and vulnerable groups through appropriate media programs and educational activities.

The project prepared and delivered communicable and motivating media programs, appealing and attractive to the target groups<sup>66</sup> while also sending the key messages about their employment. The MIY project contributed to generate a nation-wide more favourable environment for implementation of comprehensive programs and activities for youth employment<sup>67</sup>. Also, the results showed the need to expand the focus and explore other opportunities to boost youth employment in Cambodia<sup>68</sup> (e.g. the UNJP large-scale program, other donor and the Government supported activities).

Deliverable 1: Delivery of youth-oriented employment education by establishing media platforms, programmes, and community outreach activities

More details on the process have been captured in the progress reports; still, it is important to highlight that the process of preparation and broadcasting of all media programs has been effective and optimized for the achievement of its purpose.

The main results of the MIY under the Deliverable 1: Delivery of youth-oriented employment education by establishing media platforms, programmes, and community outreach activities have been:

**Television:** production of ten episodes of the TV programme has been completed within the proposed timeframe<sup>69.</sup> The three dramas "Departed", "Lakhoun" and "What if" have been prepared, filmed and completed- currently available via the MIY YouTube channel. These TV dramas adhered to BBC Media Group quality standards. Practically, the BBC Media Group engaged top-notch technical experts during the preparation of scripts and the filming/ production stage. Complementary to TV drama production, the magazine segments have also been developed using three different formats, namely Challenge, Documentary and Studio discussion segments<sup>70.</sup> These

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> KII BBC Media Group and UNDP Cambodia- also, project analytical documents

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> KII NEA and KII Ministry of Education. Also, KII with the sub-ordinated offices of the NEA and other stakeholders (Swedish PES and SDC supported initiative)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> KII- NEA, KII other stakeholders (Swedish PES, SDC). Also, other UN Agencies participating in the UNJP have expressed positive opinion about the MIY contribution to generating support to youth employment.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> The findings and conclusion from the MTR and situation analysis from the United

<sup>69</sup> Annual Project Reports 2016 and 2017

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Annual Project Progress Report for 2017

formats have provided links to real people's experiences, and reinforced the MIY learning points about youth employment<sup>71.</sup>

The responsiveness and adaptability of the MIY project has been directly correlated to its effectiveness. Particularly, the feedback of the targeted audience served to design a new program, the Dream Station. This program has been conceptualized as reality TV show prepared in an observational-documentary style<sup>72.</sup> The intention has been to present a person's journey (the Dreamer) to success, using soft skills– in particular, adaptability, communication, confidence, problem-solving, negotiation and planning. The case studies, the dreamers, came from all regions of the country, displaying different socio-economic, ethnic and educational backgrounds thus ensuring higher degree of relevance.

The available documents showed that the Dream Station programs have been effective in reaching target population, as both urban and rural young people stated that the program has been motivating and educational<sup>73.</sup> Also, the beneficiaries stated that the program offered a wide range of soft skills, enabling them to deal with real life challenges.

The MIY project introduced a new **"9:09 show"** program, essentially as a substitution for the mobile App programme. As highlighted in the previous parts of this report, the assessment showed that the initially planned a mobile application had a lower comparative advantage than the show with limited project timeframe; thus, this has been another evidence of the links between responsiveness and flexibility and the MIY effectiveness. The "9:09 show" has been designed as a fast-paced online educational and entertainment program. The main characters of this show have been Cambodian celebrities and influencers, presenting their career secrets and talking about their professional paths. The MIY project has prepared a total of 25 programs, available via Klahan9 YouTube channel. The best performing episode has been the programme number 13 "Raven and Cutting Stress" (which is about coping with the stress); it received nearly 27,000 views and more than 2,000 likes.

The implementing partners have ensured broad approachability through the nation-wide Cambodian Broadcast Service (CBS) and broadcasting the Klahan9 programs in the prime-time slots. This approach has increased effectiveness of the Klahan9. , with the primetime slots for objective to reach the audience/ target groups. Part of the overall success has also been the primetime slot to broadcast the TV programs, ensured through the BBC Media Group successful negotiation.

**Radio:** the radio shows have been actual during the first years of project implementation, and these programs have been prepared expertly. The internal structure and the messages through the radio-programs have been clear and well-formulated, thus, contributing to the learning process and changing attitudes among the target groups. The BBC team organized radio programs to include drama segments, live music, expert interviews, also enabling audience call-ins. Availability (and sustainability) of the prepared radio programs has been enabled through online platforms such as SoundCloud, Facebook and the Klahang website<sup>74</sup>.

The MIY remained engaged in defining right and demanded radio programs through this period of implementation. These achievements have been ensured through regular online researches and communication with the targeted audience; also, the team has been involved in capturing stories and interviews from provinces and regions. The radio programs have been relevant and effective in meeting its purpose and expressed through the measurable achievements, the radio team delivered a total of 41 episodes, registering nearly 220,000 listeners each week<sup>75</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> The reference is to the evaluation reports measuring impact of the MIY project

 $<sup>^{72}</sup>$  The researched showed that first 10 TV episodes have reached approximately 1.5 million youth in 2017/2018, compared to 1,2 million in 2016

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> KII from the filed work in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> https://www.facebook.com/klahangcambodia/ and also https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCsMW6ol4zLO11NB6ckap57g

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> Reference to the Annual Project Progress Reports for 2016 and 2017

<u>Online platform</u>: the project was highly effective with the implementation of online communication tools, following sound digital strategy. The online platform has been operational through Cambodia Facebook page<sup>76</sup>, Instagram<sup>77</sup>, YouTube<sup>78</sup>, and a dedicated website<sup>79</sup> ().

The Klahan9 Facebook page has more than 710K followers, being the most dominant social media platform for young Cambodians. The content of the social media platforms – Instagram, YouTube and Facebook, has been mainly focused on soft skills, financial management, entrepreneurship and STEM/TVET. The evaluation finds that the MIY project has a sound and well-elaborated posting strategy, that ensured continues increase in number of viewers. Also, important finding is that the audience perceived that the Klahan9 Facebook profile has been informational and motivational; the video format remained the most important tool with an average of 78k reach per video<sup>80</sup>.

The MIY team has been effective in addressing editorial challenges, dealing with compliance adequately for social media, and designing a new TV show from scratch with an inexperienced team in a limited time frame<sup>81</sup>.

**Roadshows:** the MIY also included roadshow programs targeting mainly rural audience, particularly focusing to reveal the links of soft skills for employment. The roadshows presented the best of Klahan9 content through stage events, a series of booths and screenings of TV and digital content. Involvement of the National Employment Agency and other partners provided information on employment opportunities to young audiences. The FE confirms that roadshows and other events have also proved to be an important place to find inspiring stories of young people.

Deliverable 2: Capacity development for Cambodian youth through capacity strengthening activities with the National Employment Agency (NEA)

The main results under the Deliverable 2: Capacity development for Cambodian youth through capacity strengthening activities with the National Employment Agency (NEA) have been:

The MIY project provided technical assistance to the NEA to prepare its communications strategy, currently being used at provincial job centres and the HQ in Phnom Penh<sup>82</sup>. The strategy has been designed to publicise the work of the NEA and drive more young job-seekers to use the service. With the training, the NEA has reported that they have also been able to improve existing communications channels (for example, the NEA Facebook page) so that young job seekers get more out of their service.

The project followed best-practice approach to organizational development<sup>83</sup>, that included training needs assessment and gap identification that resulted in demand-driven capacity and organizational development assistance for the NEA and its media department<sup>84</sup>. The topics such as script writing, program production and post-production have been prioritized. The participants benefited from training programs for improved creativity to storytelling, editorial guidelines, multi-platform media programming, knowing your audience and research<sup>85</sup>. Also, additional training has been provided to NEA production team and UNDP Communication team, focusing on skills advancement in the areas of camera, light, sound, editing, creating TVCs, radio spots, interviews and TV episodes, writing

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> <u>https://www.facebook.com/klahangcambodia/</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> https://www.instagram.com/klahan9cambodia/

<sup>78</sup> https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCsMW6ol4zLO11NB6ckap57g

<sup>79</sup> www.klahang.com.kh

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> Information from the visits to the web-sites and facebook page (accessed 06 Decembers 2018)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> KII with UNDP and KII with SIDA

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm 82}$  KII with the NEA. Also, KII with Swedish PES

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> More information in William J. Rothwell, Roland Sullivan: "Practicing Organization Development: A Guide for Consultants", Pfeiffer, 2005

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> KII with NEA and KII UNDP. Also, important reference remain progress reports.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup> Project Progress Reports and also KII with the NEA

effective and creative scripts for TV and radio, creating videos for social media, and making use of 2D animation and basic graphic design.

The evaluation of the training programs has been highly positive<sup>86</sup>, although some concerns have been raised regarding important discrepancy in the equipment used during training programs and the equipment available for the NEA media department<sup>87</sup>.

Part of the efforts included strengthening partnership with Young Entrepreneurs Association of Cambodia (YEAC) to create opportunities for youth to have face to face interaction between business owners, young entrepreneurs, and local authority, and among youth, and providing youth essential business knowledge and responsibilities. Youth were inspired, asked questions, and got connection to access to other opportunities to realize their career/dream. Two youth conferences on "Becoming Young Entrepreneurs and Leaders" have been organized. Also, the project supported youth with disability through CDPO, an umbrella organization for people with disability in Cambodia, to provide knowledge to YWDs, developing advocacy tools for YWDs, and engage private sector and other key policy-makers to ensure provision of employment opportunities to YWDs.

### 5.4. Impact

Impact measures the effect of the project in meeting the outcome. By definition, the latter is beyond the scope of a particular project but a positive impact could be expected if the project outputs are achieved so that it helps to meet to wider objective. Sustainability on the other hand is a measure of the degree to which the project has a lasting effect or durability after its completion.

Impact (as much as sustainability) can only be assessed after certain period upon the end of the project. However, it is increasingly conventional in final evaluations to anticipate or forecast both impact and sustainability. Therefore, the final evaluation followed general practice to validate impact looking at the delivered results and assessing its contribution to the outcome, namely, greater participation and inclusion of the students with disabilities in the labour markets in three participating countries.

The analysis of impact included three interlinked levels, individuals, institutions and the systemic level.

#### **IMPACT AT THE SYSTEMIC LEVEL**

It has been difficult to associate or credibly link results of the MIY project with the reform or improvements of the policy and legal frameworks that regulate youth employment in Cambodia. This conclusion derives from the analysis if the MIY project influenced or provided inputs for reforms or improvements at the systemic level for youth employment- including legal, policy and institutional set up for implementation of youth employment measures. However, the project provided some inputs and recommendations for the improvement of this system.

The MIY project provided that multi-media outreach activities aimed at improving the knowledge and efficacy of young people for better employment opportunities and livelihood enhancement should combine innovative, educational, and entertaining elements, while involving all the responsible stakeholders in the implementation process. The MIY showed that appropriate co-operation should exist between the public employment service with other institutions to ensure that the information reach as wider group of unemployed youth as possible. At the same time, the National Employment Agency should be in the centre of public employment system with the sufficient capacities to develop and implement information and outreach programs focusing to identify and contact disconnected and vulnerable youth, encouraging them to become more active at the labour market. The results of the MIY in the transferring knowledge and developing capacities of the NEA have been initial steps in ensuring more effective employment system in Cambodia.

Concerning policy decision, the evaluation finds that the MIY project highlighted some of the critical issues and challenges at different levels related to youth employment and employability (e.g.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> The NEA stated that one of the important events has been presenter training with Babita Sharma, renowned presenter of the BBC World News.

<sup>87</sup> KII with NEA

unemployed and youth at vulnerable employment; employment of the youth from vulnerable groups, including youth with disabilities; education and training for the youth among other). The reports prepared during the project implementation-Findings from the Cambodia Qualitative Evaluation of the Klahang TV Programme, Radio Programme, and Klahang online and also Perceptions of young Cambodians on Soft Skills and Digital life of Young Cambodians, analysed actual impact of multi-media approach on targeted audience. These materials could serve as the framework for planning policies and approaches to address core challenges and define multi-media actions and outreach activities to support employment of youth, especially from vulnerable groups.

#### **IMPACT AT THE INSTITUTIONAL LEVEL**

The final evaluation analysed if the MIY project influenced the performance and functioning of the institutions in Cambodia. The findings and conclusions from the mid-term evaluation proved to be valid and re-confirmed during the final evaluation:

The impact of the MIY project at the institutional level has been satisfactory, ensured through the additional UNDP component, focused on direct technical assistance to the National Employment Agency. Specifically, organizational, operational and technical capacities of the key national partners, the Media Departments of the National Employment Agency (NEA) and the Cambodian Broadcasting Service (CBS) have been strengthened for strategic communication and delivery of information services. Through the additional UNDP managed component, the NEA received demanded media skills training focusing on the core areas (e.g. camera, light, sound, editing, creating TVCs, radio spots, interviews and TV episodes, writing effective and creative scripts for TV and radio, creating videos for social media, and making use of 2D animation and basic graphic design). Also, the management and employees of the NEA and the CBS stated that their capacities had been increased to use multi-media tools for different areas related to their work (expanding the primarily youth employment defined scope). Furthermore, the new UN Joint Programme "UNited For Youth Employment in Cambodia" (UNJP) and its component 3.3. Unemployed and vulnerably employed youth are better informed about their rights and employment prospects has built on the results of the MIY, further ensuring impact at the level of the NEA.

Also, the key national partners, the National Employment Agency and the Cambodian Broadcasting Service have established mutually beneficial relationship and strong partnership with BBC Media Action to expand support and activities for youth employment.

The Media Department of the National Employment Agency of Cambodia remains to be the central national institution in charge of implementation of policies and measures for employment. One of its core service line remains to provide information to beneficiaries/ end-users. The NEA through the MIY project has been exposed to successful models for preparation and implementation of multi-media approaches reflecting policy priorities. Established capacities and positive experience from the MIY project serve as a successful model for replication in the future.

The unintended impact of the MIY project at the organizational level has been through the establishment of (local) media production companies. Namely, a group of well-trained associates, previously involved in work with the BBC Media Group, have established an independent media production company. Although not planned, this is undoubtedly one of the important achievements that will be important in the future socio-economic development of the country

National institutions, such as the relevant ministries of the Government of Cambodia, have received a platform to plan and execute information or public awareness campaigns, as planned in the core strategic documents related to youth employment.

#### **IMPACT AT THE INDIVIDUAL LEVEL**

The MIY project has made an impact on individuals, primarily youth as the main target group/ direct beneficiaries of this intervention.

The MIY-Klahan9 has focused on providing support to the young people including those from vulnerable groups, striving to increase their capacities to weight up options and capably negotiate their future including employment options with power holders (e.g., parents, other older people). Through different

multi-media approaches, young people have been exposed to real-life success stories, while receiving messages that they could and should actively participate in agreeing on acceptable future and decisions relating to their employment. These results have been ensured through a successful model, based on the promotion of behaviour models through media.

The impact at the individual level could be also observed among the youth, including youth with disabilities, employers and local authorities that have benefited from the capacity development support. They have been participating in different activities, such as training and in-company training programs, conferences and workshops, while also being able to use tailor-made tools and guidebooks. These beneficiaries have reported improved abilities to communicate and cooperate, expressing positive opinion about sustainability of established partnerships<sup>88</sup>. The MIY provided capacity development support for the trainers and Human Resources departments of the of private sector representatives that participated in the project. This support has been ensured through in-company training<sup>89</sup>) are not captured in this evolution, hence, missed out the key results performed under UNDP lead component.

The MIY project has been instrumental in increasing understanding about links between educational attainments and skills training with (better) employment opportunities for the youth. Practically, young people in Cambodia have increased their interest to acquire the vocational and soft skills needed to secure better jobs. The regional units of the National Employment Agency reported a constantly increasing commitment and interest for the TVET courses among the youth, measured by number of registered students in roll-out programs or decreased drop-out rate.

Also, individuals from the National Employment Agency and the Cambodian Broadcasting Company that participated in the capacity development efforts, have increased their technical capacities and knowledge basis in the broad area of media production, starting from script writing to preparation and production of media programs. Their capacities have been enhanced in the specific area of youth employment, ensuring more scientific and fact-based reporting on developments and challenges.

Another dimension of impact at the individual level is through the exchange of experience and direct interaction of the experts from Cambodia through top-notch BBC experts. Besides, an unintended impact at the individual level has been through informal networks that have been established. Namely, training participants from different stakeholders have been attending and benefiting from training programs. Thus, the MIY project enabled direct interaction and communication between them, facilitating partnerships and horizontal knowledge sharing. Finally, the long-term influence and possible impact at the individual level could be expected through available media materials via YouTube channels or Facebook profile.

Qualitatively, the conclusion of the final evaluation confirms that the MIY project will likely ensure short-term impact; thus, the mark satisfactory from the mid-term review has been re-confirmed. However, the social learning theory<sup>90</sup> suggests that the enduring behavioural changes ("learning") would depend on favourable social context and the "usefulness", practical application of individual learning. Thus, to ensure long term impact and sustainability the knowledge received through the MIY project should be adopted through "corrective" behaviour leading to positive experience to become corrective practice. The youth should be able to have benefits from the received and adopted skills.

This suggests that, in long term-perspective, the impact could erode without further external support to institutionalize results of the MIY project, especially through a sound policy action (reference to the Recommendations chapter of this report).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> Key Informant Interviews confirmed these findings. Also, the impact assessments and the project progress reports with the statements from the beneficiaries. For example, most participants reported that they have never attended anything like the Klahang Roadshow event before, citing it as inspiring and educational which provided them with knowledge on a plethora of skills. Panellist mentioned that the workshops were tailored to suit all types of audiences which was useful for them, yet they still find it difficult to know how to implement it.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> KII with UNDP and also project progress reports. The findings have been validated through the interview with participants in the training and also through the interview with the YEAC

<sup>90</sup> Bandura Albert "Social Learning Theory", Prentice Hall, New Jersey, second edition 2011

### 5.5. Sustainability

The fifth criterion, sustainability, relates to whether the positive results of the project are likely to continue after external funding ends, and also whether its longer-term effects on the wider development process can also be sustained at the level of the sector or country.

This means that there is a strong correlation between impact and sustainability since the explanatory variables are often the same for explaining impact and/or sustainability. In the context of final evaluations, sustainability and impact are often assessed in conjunction. This suggests that challenges leading to impact erosion could certainly apply in this case.

The final evaluation analysed the (potential) sustainability, assessing whether the beneficiaries can continue to work without external intervention that was present through the project. The desk review of the project plans and reports and the primary data sources suggest that project partners, project team, BBC Media Action and the UNDP, did not develop an exit strategy or consider sustainability plan during the implementation of the project. Still, the evaluation reflected on the following core questions related to sustainability

#### i) Why is it essential to ensure sustainability?

The central idea of the MIY project has been to leave a legacy of the operational system and knowhow to support Cambodian young people to improve their knowledge and efficacy (confidence in their ability), individually and collectively, to become more active members of the society, that are capable to ensure decent employment.

The project has been instrumental in improving democratization process in Cambodia, working to strengthen mechanisms for citizens dialogue, representation and participation. The MIY project has been using television drama and magazine formats with radio phone-in shows, online content and live events.

As indicated in the previous paragraphs, the MIY project has been thinking about sustainability from the early stages; however, the evaluation finds that the efforts to ensure sustainability are partially satisfactory. The results of the project, including development practices and methods for increasing information tested within its scope, supported through the project have been only partially embedded in the operational practices of the media department of the National Employment Agency (NEA). Additional support provided through the joint UN Project "UNited For Youth Employment in Cambodia" complemented these efforts further enhancing capacities of the NEA thus ensuring greater degree of sustainability.

The additional work is also required to strengthen capacities and capabilities of the educational institutions, employers and their associations; youth organizations and other stakeholders to support youth in Cambodia to become more active participants in the society, labour market and education. Also raising awareness and knowledge of employers to plan human resources and define medium- and longer-term capacity needs thus ensure economic benefits remains a priority.

On a broader level, sustainability of the results achieved through the MIY project is indispensably linked to the development of a comprehensive national youth employment plan that will ensure comprehensive evidence based strategic platform.

ii) Can the national institutions and stakeholders continue to replicate what the project was doing and further build on these results?

What about the scaling?

Are there recommendations for the Government of Cambodia and National Employment Agency?

The central idea of the project is to leave a legacy of an operational system and know-how to implement multi-media initiatives thus facilitate employment of youth, especially from vulnerable groups in Cambodia. The analysis of the legal and policy framework in Cambodia showed that the

basis for affirmative action measures had been created, with references to the areas of TVET and employment in a broader context of their social inclusion.

The MIY project offered well-targeting and tested multi-media approach to encourage young people and change dominant societal paradigm thus remove main obstacles that prevent them to become more active participants in the labour market. The MIY has been providing direct support to the national institutions in Cambodia particularly to the media department of the National Employment Agency and the Cambodian Broadcasting Service. The completion of the MIY project would mean that its considerable support to the institutions and beneficiaries in Cambodia, primarily aimed at technical and organizational improvements, will be withdrawn almost in entirety. The analysis of information from the mid-term review and interviews with the representatives of institutions and beneficiaries showed some degree of sustainability through the capacities of the national partners.

However, additional efforts of UNDP provided through the complementary UN-joint project "UNited For Youth Employment in Cambodia" contributed to the possible sustainability of results. Members of the media department of the National Employment Agency (the NEA has their own media studio and produce their TV programs) and representatives of the Cambodian Broadcasting Service with this additional technical assistance and training, confirmed that they had been capacitated to work independently on scriptwriting and production of media programs, while also recognizing the importance of social media. It is important to highlight that changes in the approach occurred after the mid-term review. The BBC Media Action training programs have been useful and considered as highly relevant, the participants expressed concerns that the "technical equipment of the BBC Media Action team has been advanced and more sophisticated than the equipment available to the NEA media professionals." Therefore, additional technical support being well-aware of this fact has been developing its approach around existing technical capacities and tools of the NEA, encouraging and guiding them to use available technical capacities for preparation of similar media programs. The evaluation finds that additional institutional assistance and capacity development support have been substantial to insert new practices and approaches in the performance of the media department of the National Employment Agency.

Also, the project created a highly competent node of well-trained young Cambodians, that were involved in preparation and roll-out of TV and radio programs and in use of social media. This is the capacity that will remain in Cambodia for future actions and activities related to youth employment.

However, the risk of erosion of the achieved results is present unless additional technical assistance is provided to continue some of the activities piloted through the project. Some examples that have been mentioned by the NEA management included the need to enhance production (directing) and post-production capacities and continue with on-the-job assistance with script writing and program production.

The project has generated knowledge that could be used as a relevant source for the improvement of the situation of youth employment in Cambodia. This know-how has codified in the form of easy to use handbooks and manuals and could be replicated and used in the future. However, limited financial resources of the NEA and the Government of Cambodia to invest in the media production could affect achieved sustainability.

Therefore, the decision of the SIDA- Swedish International Development Agency to continue its support to the production of the new multi-media youth initiatives programs remain highly relevant. This additional time for the BBC Media Action could serve to prepare and implement sound exit strategy and work on transfer of all results to the national stakeholders.

#### iii) Implications for follow-up

Cambodia is one of the fastest growing economies in Asia with its average annual GDP growth rate of 7% over the last two decades, mainly supported by exports of goods and services and

increased in construction and tourism. The population growth in the last two decades reached impressive fifty percent, reaching nearly 16 million today, and this trend would continue (22.5 million by 2050). In Cambodia, people under the age of 30 represent two-thirds of the total and about 43% of the working age population. Thus, the large proportion of young population and its demographic dividend provide a rare opportunity for the country to boost economic growth and bring about positive social transformation. Youth employment rate in Cambodia is high (75.7% compared to 83% of overall labour force participation rate). However, despite this active participation, the majority of the workforce (two thirds) are working poor or in vulnerable employment and over 50% of all youth in waged employment are under-educated and engaged in low-skilled labour, thus low pay. Jobs in urban areas have absorbed rural youth workforce and among the sectors that provide them jobs is the industry sector, particularly the garment industry where young women make the majority of the workforce

Labor market opportunities for vulnerable young people are limited, and only low percentage has access to employment. According to the National Employment Agency, a common mismatch between job qualifications and the skills young workers have and those that employers seek. This gap between the demand and supply is a significant problem in Cambodia's labor market - employers are unable to fill posts with qualified candidates while youth are struggling in poor quality jobs. These official statistics do not capture the extent of their labor market disadvantage which could be explained by a 'discouraged worker effect': because chances of getting a job are perceived to be low, they do not enter the labor market at all. The educational structure of the unemployed youth indicates very narrow qualifications. This confirms that the youth, especially from vulnerable groups, are exposed to multiple forms of exclusion, and demand adequate support to become more active and access labour market. This requires cross-sectoral support.

Focusing on some of the strategic areas, and addressing family barriers and lack of confidence as priorities in which support is prioritised, the project played an important role in advancing improvement of life of young people in Cambodia. However, this is a long-lasting process and support should continue, with the involvement of policy and decision makers from different levels. It will be important to explore opportunities to involve key policymakers in this process. Revising and adjusting legal and policy frameworks, ensuring commitment at the highest levels and resources for implementation of activities related to integration of the youth represent priority.

# 6. Lessons learned

#### Multi-media tools could be highly effective tools for supporting youth employment:

The project partners (but also researchers) confirm that multimedia applications can be used to support youth employment, helping unemployed and vulnerable youth to become more active in the labour market. Application of multimedia tools and methods can increase the knowledge of users more striking and motivate them to practice approaches and examples provided, even if the model they are operating under is passive.

The lessons from the MIY project indicated that building multimedia approaches to make them suitable to contribute to youth employment have been:

- consider systematic approach and longer-term perspective for implementation of media support to youth employment programs;
- make a clear introduction to the issue of employment and develop brief and direct messages;
- multimedia professionals should work with technical experts in the area of youth employment to ensure that right messages have been provided using right multimedia methods;
- carry out regular monitoring of the direct audience if accepting messages and programs or has difficulties to accept them.

#### Effective multi-media materials have clear outcomes in sight

Multimedia platforms combine several different media elements with learning platforms, as it has been with the MIY project. This approach simulates different situations and help target groups (youth at vulnerable employment, unemployed, particularly youth with disabilities, and youth from other vulnerable groups) to understand complicated subjects easily and understand the most relevant parts of that subject.

The MIY proved that application of multimedia applications could be effective addressing youth employment issues and challenges. Also, the MIY showed catalytic effects, setting the ground for more comprehensive measures for improvement of the situation of the youth at the labour market.

# Responsiveness and flexibility are underlying factors for successful implementation of multimedia youth initiatives

To offer all young people in Cambodia a career perspective, and to avoid negative effects of unemployment and inactivity on future employment and earnings, it is essential to (re)engage youth into education or employment as quickly as possible. This is a challenge, in particular as a substantial fraction of the youth in the country is difficult to reach out to: usually, this group of young people were either unemployed but not registered with the public employment service, or inactive (i.e. not looking for work) without family, health or educational reasons. Implementation of multi-media initiatives could be a useful tool but requires longer term perspective. Regular monitoring and assessment of impact and appropriateness of format of multi-media initiatives on the targeted group of population is important to avoid decrease in interest and participation of the target groups.

Therefore, implementation of multi-media programs requires high degree of flexibility and responsiveness as part of the implementation modality to safeguard validity and relevance of multimedia programs.

#### Direct support twinned with the multimedia approach is effective approach to address youth activation

Feedback from field visits confirmed that local institutions involved in implementation of youth employment programs can be greatly encouraged and motivated by clear coordination, guidance and information dissemination from the central level. For instance, good examples have been found in the functioning of the NES and its sub-ordinated offices in Cambodia. The MIY materials have been recommended and used by the NES sub-offices during the information days for the high school students

and during other public information events. This support has been effective to achieve broader impacts on youth activation and employment.

#### Ownership of results and processes is inevitably linked with sustainability of results and processes

Ownership could be defined as the exercise of control and command over development activities; practically, national stakeholders "owe" the development process when they are committed to it and able to translate its commitment into effective action. This definition incorporates institutional dimensions such as the control of resources and abilities to implement activities and achieve results.

The MIY project has been working to ensure national ownership, starting from ideas to implementation. The programs have been designed in close cooperation with the national stakeholders and partners, reflecting their ideas and strategies. The national partners stated that the MIY was flexible and responsive to their needs, while also expressing high degree of satisfaction with actual involvement in implementation of activities. The ownership of implementation processes has been particularly important for the implementation of capacity development support, as stated by the media department of the NEA. They took the initiative and reflected on their needs and also participated in fine-tuning of the capacity development programs.

### 7. Conclusions and Recommendations

#### Key conclusions:

The relevance, effectiveness, and efficiency of the MIY project over the entire period of implementation (2014-2018) provided a foundation for continued work in the area of youth employment: the implementing partners, UNDP and BBC Meadia Action and also have put strong building blocks in place for the future intervention in the area of youth employment. They have been positioned well in the country, with some challenges to make the impact at the level of the national policies, measurement of capacity-development effects and performance and gender mainstreaming.

Overall, the MIY project has been aligned with the Government national priorities and strategies, while the needs of target groups have been generally met.

The effectiveness of the MIY project has been highly satisfactory. The project achieved all planned objectives, contributing importantly to expected outcomes. Active and strong engagement of the National Employment Agency and endorsement of the Government of Cambodia have been important factors that contributed to quality of results.

Although the sustainability of results has been considered since the start of the project and addressed well during the implementation, there are still challenges to institutionalize this experience and practices tested through the project. Further assistance is required with the attention on transfer of knowledge rather than on delivery of programs.

Extensive capacity development efforts have been undertaken within the framework of the project, but the results have not been effectively measured.

Partnership, networking, and coordination have overall been successfully applied during the implementation of the project. Also, the project mainstreamed human-rights based approach, focusing on the encouraging vulnerable and disadvantaged youth to become more active in the labour market in Cambodia.

#### **Recommendations:**

The final evaluation has analysed the situation in the area of youth employment and proposed the following recommendations to the key partners:

# R1: It is recommended to continue multi-media support to youth employment in Cambodia (linking it to a broader development agenda, and with clear exit strategy)

It is recommended to continue multi-media assistance to youth employment, that has been available through the MIY project. The exit strategy and sustainability plan should be explored from the beginning. This would require stronger and more effective partnerships with the stakeholders involved in different areas of youth employment. Specifically, sustainability of behavioural changes should be ensured through corrective experience that leads to corrective practice and this is inherently linked with assistance that combines multimedia support with other forms of youth employment measures.

R2: UNDP should become more visible as technical advisor to the national partners in the area of youth employment

It is recommended for UNDP to use its technical capacities and expertise and position itself as the principal advisor to the national stakeholders, the Government of Cambodia and the relevant ministries and the National Employment Agency.

The UNDP development, non-media component of the MIY and its participation in the UNJP have been important actions and achieved results contributed to UNDP's strategic positioning. Still, it is recommended that UNDP continues with further positioning in the area of youth employment through development of new initiatives and in enhance its internal technical capacities for planning and programming in the area of youth employment.

# R3: Support the Government of Cambodia and other partners to assess the existing and design and implement measures to facilitate employment and integration of the youth with disabilities in the labour market

Physical or intellectual impairments may limit their job options. For most, social prejudice makes employers unwilling to hire them. The MIY project through the partnership with CDPO has raised the issues related to employment of youth with disabilities and some activities have been implemented. Building on these results, it is recommended to expand the existing partnerships and involve the Government of Cambodia and important non-governmental partners to expand the coalition to identify priorities and jointly agree on measures to advance employment of youth with disabilities.

Coming on to the job market with poor education and limited skills, young people with disability have difficulties competing. It is recommended to continue activities on the supply side to increase employability of youth with disabilities<sup>91</sup>. The need remains to continue with the employment related services that the MIY project piloted (e.g. employment guidance, information on training and employment opportunities, job search training including CV preparation, interview techniques, presentation skills). Also, the need remains to extend this support through more technical trainings. The partners should explore opportunities to adjust current and design new technical training programs for youth with disabilities, based on the market needs and employment opportunities for youth with disabilities.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> The MIY support through the partnership with the CDPO (Cambodian Disable People Organisation) has been focused more on the supply side and soft skills development. Some of the planned activities have been training sessions to DPOs on employment focusing on the process of job seeking, job coaching (CV writing, application letter, communication), research on employment challenges of YPWD in public and private sectors, organization of Employment Workshop , job exhibition, development of an accessible workplace toolkit for employers.

It is recommended to design and implement measures to create demand for employment of youth with disabilities. Some of the best practices suggest to explore and define feasible measures for financial support to encourage employment for youth with disabilities<sup>92</sup>. Also, part of the financial support should include planning and implementation of the workplace adjustments. The work to ensure implementation of disability employment quota that has been issued by the Government of Cambodia should be intensified through strong commitment of all partners.

It is recommended for the partners to explore opportunities to pilot so-called special employment centres/ enterprises for the youth with disabilities, offering them appropriate work to their personal characteristics, with the support required to facilitate labor integration. The centre should be created by the Government in collaboration with other partners, offering employment for employment of youth with higher degree of disability.

R4: It is recommended to strengthen capacities of the Government of Cambodia for coordination and also capacities of the Government of Cambodia and line ministries, the National Employment Agency and civil society organizations for monitoring implementation of measures and programs for youth employment in Cambodia

It is highly recommended that UNDP work to establish a more coordinated approach for achieving targets (results) under the youth employment framework. This is especially important considering that youth employment require cross-cutting and multi-sectoral coordination. As part of these efforts, it is recommended to prepare a sound coordination/ cooperation approach within the framework of the youth employment strategy, with the engagement of high-level coordination specialist, while also ensuring participation of the national stakeholders and involvement of other development partners.

It is recommended to use the positive experience of the UNDP with the coordination systems, while analysis and considering functioning of the existing coordination platforms in this area to avoid overlaps (e.g. the National Technical Working Group hosted by the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Trainings (MoLVT) in the area of TVET has been established and supported by the Swiss Development Cooperation - SDC).

In this context, it is recommended to support the Government of Cambodia to develop a sound monitoring framework, with clear, realistic and measurable process and results indicators that will ensued effective monitoring of activities and results.

# R5: It is recommended that UNDP works on generating youth led-businesses and strengthen entrepreneurial attitude among the youth

Through the development component of the MIY project, and involvement of UNDP and the Young Entrepreneur Association of Cambodia, the assistance has been on the supply-side, delivering youth entrepreneurship conference, entrepreneurship week, in-companies trainings, specific training on taxation and financial management for young entrepreneur. The intention has been to enhance skills of the youth workforce and make them more appealing to employers. This approach assumes that jobs are available but that the youth lack the skills required to perform the work.

However, assistance at the demand side has been less evident and it is recommended to explore opportunities to enhance demand for youth labor.

Some of the possible intervention on the demand side could be:

• Self-Employment Programmes: shortages of capital and skills and the unsupportive regulatory environment undermine entrepreneurship in Cambodia. Therefore, it is recommended to work and support entrepreneurship in Cambodia by implementing self-employment programmes with the objective to assist young people to become entrepreneurs or expand existing businesses.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> One of the most common types of such supports to employers is wage subsidies to cover a shortfall in productivity. Also, direct financial incentives for employment of youth with disabilities should be explored.

They could include microfinance as well as technical or financial training which is designed to suit the needs of budding entrepreneurs

- Business Support Programmes: it is recommended to identify opportunities for growth for selected companies, including needs for qualified and trained staff. The business support could include services such as training, technical assistance, financing, innovation policy and establishing value chains and clusters<sup>93</sup>.
- Promote training within companies: it is recommended to explore opportunities to promote and support companies to provide trainings for employees and for newly recruited staff<sup>94</sup>.

# R6: It is recommended to explore opportunities to continue strengthening civil society to become more active in supporting youth employment in Cambodia

It is recommended to continue partnership with the Young Entrepreneur Association of Cambodia and for UN Agencies to follow the two-fold approach in continuing partnership and expanding support to the civil society organizations in Tajikistan. It is recommended the UN addresses the need to enhance capacities of CSOs across a number of functional areas, with focus on capacities for effective engagement in policy-making processes and participation in the delivery of public services, to enhance their capacities to competently engage in policy dialogue and strategic planning in the priority areas related to the NDS and SDGs.

Also, it is recommended to strengthen the watchdog role of the CSOs for competent monitoring of development processes, policies, and strategies and actively involve in the implementation of national priorities. In this context, the role of the CSOs should be strengthened to engage directly with vulnerable groups and give a voice to vulnerable groups

https://www.campbellcollaboration.org/library/improving-youth-labour-market-outcomes.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> Glick, P., Huang, C. & Mejia, N. 2015. The Private Sector and Youth Skills and Employment Programmes in Low and Middle-Income Countries. World Bank. Washington DC.

http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/878201467987873644/pdf/101565-WP-P156234-Box393264B-PUBLIC-S4YE-Private-Sector-Report.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup>. "Interventions to Improve Labour Market Outcomes of Youth: A Systematic Review" by Kluve, J., Puerto, S., Robalino, D., Romero, J.M., Rother, F. Stoterau, J. Weidenkaff, F. & Witte, M; Campbell Collaboration. International Development Coordinating Group, 2017. Web-link available at:

# Annex 1: Evaluation Matrix

Evaluation Question	Measures or Indicator	Evidences and Data Sources
	1. Relevance	
	elevance of the MIY's strategy, design a context while also considering future of	
1. 1. What is the level of relevance of the MIY project (considering national policy context and development needs and challenges)?	<ul> <li>The extent of consistence of the MIY's project goals with the national policies and the priorities in area of youth employment- e.g. the National Strategy on Youth Employment</li> <li>Examples of MIY's project contribution to the national strategy on youth employment</li> <li>The degree of responsiveness of the project to the needs of youth</li> <li>The degree of internal coherence and alignment of the intervention logic with the identified needs</li> <li>The degree to which assumptions and risks held true.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Interviews with the project stakeholders</li> <li>Analysis of the project document, progress reports and other documents</li> <li>Review of the needs assessment</li> <li>Analysis of the national legal and policy frameworks for youth employment</li> </ul>
1.2. To what extent does the MIY's intervention addresses the challenges of the target group, especially female youths and youth in informal employment;	<ul> <li>The degree of responsiveness of the project to the needs of youth (especially female youths and youth in informal employment)</li> <li>The degree of internal coherence and alignment of the intervention logic with the identified needs</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Interviews with the project stakeholders</li> <li>Analysis of the project document, progress reports and other documents</li> </ul>
1.3. To what extent are the objectives of MIY still valid in the current and future Cambodia's development context;	<ul> <li>The degree of alignment of the MIY project with the priorities and measures with on-going measures for youth employment in Cambodia</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Interviews with the project stakeholders</li> <li>Analysis of the statistic on youth employment</li> <li>Analysis of the strategic and policy frameworks for youth employment in Cambodia</li> </ul>
1.4. Is the project sufficiently supported by all stakeholders?	<ul> <li>The level of involvement of the key stakeholders in the design and implementation</li> <li>The existence of coordination and cooperation mechanisms</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Interviews with the project stakeholders</li> <li>Analysis of the project document, progress reports and other documents</li> </ul>
2. Effectiveness		
Objective: to evaluate how effective MIY was in achieving its objectives during each year of its four years of implementation including assessment of risk management system.		

2.1. To what extent were the project objectives achieved / are likely to be achieved by the end of the project in of December 2018?	<ul> <li>Examples of the main achievements of the MIY project</li> <li>The extent to which the project improve situation of the beneficiaries</li> <li>Evidence of existence of coordination mechanisms;</li> <li>Evidence of coherent policies and implementation across youth employment sector</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Interviews with the project stakeholders</li> <li>Progress project reports and other analytical documents produced by the project</li> <li>Data from the national statistics and other development partners reports</li> </ul>
2.2. What were the major factors influencing the achievement or non- achievement of the objectives?	<ul> <li>Opinions of stakeholders on barriers, analysis of the challenges encountered by implementation of the MIY project</li> <li>Factors/ examples of factors that have influenced the responsiveness and flexibility</li> <li>Examples of unplanned developments (external to the project) that have affected achievement of the project objectives</li> <li>Positive and negative factors that are influencing degree of internal coherence</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Interviews with the project stakeholders</li> <li>Progress project reports and other analytical documents produced by the project</li> <li>National reports on youth employment</li> <li>Reports of different development partners</li> </ul>
2.3. To what extent has the project's capacity building process been effective in helping the NEA to effectively reaching out and engage young people for better employment opportunities?	<ul> <li>Opinion of the National Employment Agency (NEA) about the project and its effects</li> <li>Opinion of other stakeholders about capacities of the NEA to reaching out and engage young people for better employment opportunities</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Interviews with the project stakeholders</li> </ul>
3. Efficiency		
Objective: to analyse and assess to the extent possible how efficient project implementation was, by comparing the benefits from MIY with the approved and implemented budget		
3.1. To what degree has the project been implemented efficiently?	<ul> <li>Opinions and analysis of the project cost-efficiency</li> <li>Stakeholders' opinions about the efficiency of the MIY project</li> <li>Information about the existence of measures to increase efficiency;</li> <li>Factors that have contributed to or undermined the efficiency of MIY</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Interviews with the stakeholders</li> <li>Project reports and other foundation of documents</li> </ul>

	<ul> <li>Factors that have influenced the sustainability of the project and</li> </ul>			
5.1. What is the likelihood that the results of the MIY will be sustained or continued after its completion?	<ul> <li>Stakeholders' opinions on sustainability of achieved results and probability of continuation;</li> <li>Stakeholders' opinions on national ownership;</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Interviews with the stakeholders</li> <li>Project reports and other foundation of documents</li> </ul>		
	Objective: to assess how the project's achievements contribute to sustainability by engaging appropriate Government, non-Government and community level stakeholders.			
	5. Sustainability			
	<ul> <li>Opinions and examples of benefits for the target groups</li> </ul>			
	<ul> <li>Examples of changes in the job seeking behavior and career development of young people</li> </ul>			
	<ul> <li>Opinions of stakeholders on the changes in the job seeking behaviour and career development of young people</li> </ul>			
	<ul> <li>Examples and evidences about the influence of the MIY on developing capacities of NEA</li> </ul>			
that the MIY project will ensure impact?	from MIY intervention in the way in which Cambodia is addressing youth employment issues	<ul> <li>Project reports and other foundation of documents</li> </ul>		
contribute to future strengt 4.1. What is the likelihood	<ul><li>hening of capacities both the youths ar</li><li>Examples of changes resulting</li></ul>	<ul> <li>Interviews with the</li> </ul>		
Objective: to analyse both h	ow capacity has been developed and he	ow project achievements		
	projects/ joint activities <b>4. Impact</b>			
3.2 Did the project leverage the synergies with similar initiatives	<ul> <li>Opinions of the stakeholders on cooperation and synergies with similar projects</li> <li>Examples of synergies with other</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Interviews with the stakeholders</li> <li>Project reports and other foundation of documents</li> </ul>		
	Opinions of the stakeholders on the quality of communication			
	<ul><li>timely achievement of outputs</li><li>Existence of a sound monitoring system</li></ul>			
	,			

6.1. Has the MIY project ensured that it has delivered an inclusive approach? Has gender mainstreaming at all levels of the project cycle been delivered to ensure this?	<ul> <li>Opinions of stakeholders on inclusive approach that the project followed</li> <li>Examples of gender mainstreaming within the project</li> <li>The extent to which project will influence changes in the gender related approaches in the employment</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Interviews with the stakeholders</li> <li>Project reports and other foundation of documents</li> <li>Other project progress reports</li> </ul>
--	--	---

# Annex 2: List of people interviewed (alphabet order)

Name	Organization	Position
H.E. Hang Choeun	NEA	Head of NEA,
H.E. Tauch Choeun	MoEYS	Director General
Ms. Khin Pheakdey	Youth	Klahan9 Ambassador
Mr. Bun Hengtharoth	Youth	Youth Ambassador
Mr. Bun Sambath	YEAC	Young Entrepreneur Association of Cambodia (YEAC)
Mr. Bunly Meas	UNICEF	Communicayion Specialist
Mr. Hieb Badeirathanak	Youth	Klahan9 Ambassador
Mr. Khoun Sovannara	NEA	Deputy Director
Mr. Lars-Ake Svensson	Swedish PES	Project Director
Mr. Ly Vandy	Youth	Youth Ambassador
Mr. Michael Mechthold-Jin	Meet Swiss Contact	Programme Director
Mr. Minea Chrouy	NEA	Officer
Mr. Ou Sothea	Provincial Training Center	PTC-Officer
Mr. Oun Chanra	Youth at Motor Repairing Shop	Intern (Gratuated PTC Student)
Mr. Phoung Sam Ath	NEA	N/A
Mr. Pim Sophea	NEA	Deputy Director
Mr. Prom Panharith	Youth	Klahan9 Ambassador
Mr. San Kichoing	Youth	Klahan9 Ambassador
Mr. Sok Sarem	Job Centre-Kampong Cham	Director
Mr. Sol Saovady	BBC	Project Officer
Mr. Srorn Dara	Youth	Klahan9 Ambassador
Mr. Uy Akara	IOM	Project Manager
Mr.Sim Kouch	Youth at Motor Repairing Shop	Intern (Gratuated PTC Student)

Mr.Socheat Kanharith	NEA	Advisor
Mr.Theoung Ha	Motor Repairing Shop	Shop Owner
Ms. Amara Bou	UNDP	Programme Analyst
Ms. Clara Raven	ВВС	Project Director, BBC Media Action
Ms. Em Raksa	Youth	Youth Ambassador
Ms. Haem Sreykouch	Gratuated Student at PTC	Trainee-PTC at Viley Tailor Shop
Ms. Khuon Chandore	BBC	Research Manager
Ms. Megan	BBC	Country Represntative
Ms. Por Thyna	Youth	Youth Ambassador
Ms. Prum Kunthear	Youth	Klahang Ambassador
Ms. Sim Viley	Vilay Tialor Shop	Entrepreneur
Ms. Socheat UI	SDK- Swiss Contact	Provincial Coordinator for Kratie
Ms. Sophorn Tous	UNDP	National Consultant
Ms. Sou Socheata	ILO	Program Coordinator
Ms. Suy Sokha	HRINC	Operation Manager
Ms. Tim Theareak	Gratuated Student at PTC	Trainee-PTC at Viley Tailor Shop
Ms. Yann Sophorn	UNDP	Project Manager
Ms.Kolney	NEA	Head of Cooperation and Planning Unit
Ms.Pou Liza	Youth	Youth Ambassador
Ms.Sopheak Keo	SDK- Swiss Contact	Provincial Coordinator for Stung Treng
Ms.Tum Sotheary	BBC	Project Manager
Yeang Sethsam Prathna	UNYAP	Ambassador

#### Annex 3: Interview guides

#### **Interview Guide: UNDP Programme**

Could you please introduce yourself?

#### Relevance

What have been key priorities of UNDP in Cambodia in the area of governance and economic growth? To what degree have the Government of Cambodia priorities and the needs of citizens been recognized during the planning and programming?

Did the development challenges affect the planning, programming and implementation of the UNDP portfolio? How did it affect the MIY project?

How is UNDP coordinating its efforts in the areas of relevant for the MIY project (governance and economic growth)? What were the main coordination and cooperation challenges and how could it be improved?

How was the MIY project coordinated with other international development partners?

#### Effectiveness

What are the main results of the MIY project during its first and the second phase? Has the MIY project achieved planned results and has the project contributed to the outcome?

Were there barriers that prevented success? And were risks anticipated and mitigated against? In particular, were program responses appropriately designed to mitigate or prevent them?

#### Efficiency

What measures were taken to deliver the MIY project in an efficient way? Were the resources available for implementation of the project adequate to its scale, objectives, its complexity and the context? In what ways could efficiency have been improved?

#### Impact and sustainability

What is the probability of continued long-term benefits of the MIY project? What could be done to increase the continuation and sustainability of these effects?

#### Gender and social inclusion

Did the project contribute to social inclusion of vulnerable youth? What was the contribution of the MIY project to gender equality?

#### Interview Guide: UNDP MIY Team

Could you please introduce yourself?

How were you involved in the implementation of the MIY project?

#### Relevance

What have been key priorities of UNDP in Cambodia in the area of youth employment and also in the governance and economic growth sectors? To what degree have the Government of Cambodia priorities and the needs of citizens been recognized during the planning and programming?

Did the development challenges affect the planning, programming and implementation of the UNDP portfolio? Has the development landscape and situation of the youth in Cambodia changed and how did it affect the MIY project?

Is the MIY project still relevant for Cambodia? Is it still relevant for UNDP?

How would you mark coordination efforts of the MIY project with other interventions in the sector? How would you assess

#### Effectiveness

How appropriate and realistic were the objectives of the MIY project? How effective was the MIY project towards achieving these objectives? What specific internal and external factors have contributed to achieving objectives/ results? Were there areas in which the MIY project was underachieving and why?

Were there any unexpected results (positive and negative) achieved?

#### Gender equality

Was the MIY project effective in addressing and integrating the crosscutting theme of gender equality and social inclusion? To what extent did the planned objectives have on addressing gender equality?

#### Efficiency

What measures were taken to deliver the MIY project in an efficient way? Were the resources available for implementation of the project adequate to its scale, objectives, its complexity and the context? In what ways could efficiency have been improved?

Was the implementation of the MIY project according to the planned timeline? Were there any challenges encountered and how did these delays affect the achievement of the planned results?

Were appropriate M&E mechanisms set up for implementation of the project?

#### Impact and sustainability

What is the probability of continued long-term benefits of the MIY project? What could be done to increase the continuation and sustainability of these effects?

### Interview Guide: BBC Media Action Team

Could you please introduce yourself

How were you involved in the implementation of the MIY project?

#### Relevance

What have been key priorities of the Government of Cambodia in the youth employment sector? To what degree have the GoC priorities and the needs of unemployed and vulnerable youth have been recognized in the MIY project?

Has the development landscape and situation of the youth in Cambodia changed and how did it affect the MIY project?

Is the MIY project still relevant for Cambodia? Is it still relevant for BBC Media Action?

How would you mark coordination efforts of the MIY project with other interventions in the sector?

Has the MIY project (and the BBC Media Action) been flexible to respond to the changes and the needs of beneficiaries

How did the MIY project and the BBC Media Action ensure coordination with similar interventions in the area of youth employment?

#### Effectiveness

How appropriate and realistic were the objectives of the MIY project? How effective was the MIY project towards achieving these objectives? What specific internal and external factors have contributed to achieving objectives/ results? Were there areas in which the MIY project was underachieving and why?

Were there any unexpected results (positive and negative) achieved?

#### Efficiency

What is your opinion about implementation of the MIY concerning efficiency (timeline, quality of deliverables, availability of inputs, etc.)?

Was the implementation of the MIY project according to the planned timeline? Were there any challenges encountered and how did these delays affect the achievement of the planned results?

Were appropriate M&E mechanisms set up for implementation of the project?

#### Impact and sustainability

What is the probability of continued long-term benefits of the MIY project? What could be done to increase the continuation and sustainability of these effects?

#### Gender equality

Was the MIY project effective in addressing and integrating the crosscutting theme of gender equality and social inclusion? To what extent did the planned objectives have on addressing gender equality?

### Interview Guide: National stakeholders and international development partners

Could you please introduce yourself, your organisation and your role in this organisation?

Brief objective of the study and a brief about the project objective and results

Are you familiar with the MIY project? If yes, how is your work related to the areas of intervention of the MIY project?

#### Relevance

What have been the priority development needs of Cambodia in the area of youth employment?

Which specific development priorities of the country and needs of youth (especially vulnerable) your organisation is addressing?

What have been the initiatives/projects implemented by your organisation in Cambodia in the sector of youth employment? Was your project complementary to the MIY?

How was your organization coordinating and cooperating with the MIY project? Were there such measures such as policy dialogues or joint interventions in place to coordinate efforts?

#### Effectiveness

What is your opinion about the results of the MIY project? Are there factors that have contributed to the effectiveness of the MIY project?

#### Impact and sustainability

Has the Government of Cambodia created a policy environment that is conducive to sustaining the accomplished results?

What is your opinion about the impacts of the MIY project? Are there factors that have contributed to the sustainability approach to address the issue/youth employment in Cambodia?

What are other important factors (conditions/policy/niche) for sustainable employability of youth in Cambodia?

#### Interview Guide: Private sector- employers

Could you please introduce yourself, your company and your role in the company? Explanation of the objective of the study and a brief about the project objective and results

- Are you familiar with the Klahan9 (MIY) project? How do you know about Klahan9?
- Did your company benefit from the Klahan9? What were these benefits? Please provide example.
- From the perspective of your company, what are the priorities for to increase employment of youth in Cambodia?
- Is your company employing youth from vulnerable groups? What are the needs and how to improve employability of vulnerable youth?
- What are the priority areas for the youth in Cambodia that you recommend future development assistance addresses?

### Interview Guide MIY Project level: Final Beneficiaries

• Could you please introduce yourself?

(take note of gender, age, location-urban or rural, employment status, education background, and present goal setting)

- How did you become involved in the project? How did you get to know Klahan9?
- What is Klahan9 about? What kind of program does klahan9 provide?
- What were your needs? Did Klahan9 help you to address your needs?
- How did it help you? What has it changed you? Please provide specific examples. If not, please explain.
- Do you think Klahan9 project can help to improve the situation related to the youth employment in Cambodia? If yes, in what way? If not, advise how to do address it.
- What are the priority areas for the youth in Cambodia that you recommend future development assistance addresses?