

Montenegro, 2019

**Evaluation
UNDP
Gender Programme**

IPA 2015

Nataša Milenković

1. Introduction

1.1 National Context of Montenegro and EU Accession

The first National Action Plan (NAP) for the Achievement of Gender Equality in Montenegro 2008-2012 was developed and adopted and contained areas defined by the Beijing Declaration and Plan for Action. This is part of Montenegro's accession to European integration process. Out of 12 critical areas where gender inequality is the most marked in the Beijing Declaration, Montenegro had chosen nine: Improving human rights of women and gender equality; Gender sensitive education and upbringing; Gender equality in economy; Gender sensitive health protection; Gender based violence; Media and culture; Equality in the process of decision - making in political and public life; International politics and cooperation; and Institutional mechanisms for application of gender equality. The process also includes European integration, which means that the strategies and methodologies of EU practice are being adopted.

The new NAP has been brought for the period of four years (2013-2017)¹, and the areas are defined in accordance with the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action.

During project IPA 2015 implementation NAP 2017-2021 was developed. IPA 2015 as well as IPA 2010 is addressing five out of nine strategic objectives of the NAP which are: Improving human rights of women and gender equality, Gender equality in economy, Gender-based violence, Equality in the decision-making process in political and public life and Institutional mechanisms for the implementation of gender equality policies.

The CEDAW Convention requires, among other things, Member States to take action to change the social and cultural behaviours of men and women, with the aim of eliminating prejudice and customary practices like any other practice based on the idea of inferiority or superiority of any gender or stereotype role of men and women. (Article 5)

1.2 The Gender Programme IPA 2015

IPA 2015 had two results in the ProDoc. The first result was **1. An effective anti-discrimination response** and the second result was: **2. Establishment of an efficient and effective system for accomplishment of gender equality and women's empowerment standards.** EU Delegation as funder of IPA 2015 decided to split the project and result one i.e. anti-discriminatory component

¹ NAP 2013 – 2017 strategic objectives are: 1. Improving human rights of women and gender equality; 2. Gender-sensitive upbringing and education; 3. Gender equality in economy; 4. Gender-sensitive health care; 5. Gender-based violence; 6. Media and culture; 7. Equality in the decision-making process in political and public life; 8. International politics and cooperation; 9. Institutional mechanisms for the implementation of gender equality policies.

was given to Council of Europe that works on the mentioned issues and result two i.e. gender component was given to the UNDP.

In 2017, IPA 2015 was monitored by external ROM consultant and, in accordance with ROM's report, Log Frame including two mentioned results was changed. **This evaluation report is following new Log Frame** that is Annex 1.

The overall objective of the project IPA 2015 is to ensure that fundamental human rights have been protected and promoted in compliance with international standards. The specific objective of the project is to improve the social and institutional responsiveness towards promotion, protection and enforcement of human rights and equal opportunities, specifically focusing on the implementation of the anti-discrimination and gender equality policies.

IPA 2015 has two major results in the new Log Frame:

Result 1: Supported creation of enabling environment for gender responsive programming and portrayal of gender and human rights topics in the media in accordance with the EU standards.

Result 2: An efficient and effective system for accomplishment of gender equality and women's empowerment standards is established.

It supports implementation of the National Action Plan for Gender Equality in following four areas:

1. Capacity development support
2. Violence against women and domestic violence
3. Political empowerment of women
4. Women's entrepreneurship

The project has been developed and implemented in cooperation with local stakeholders participating in the Steering Committee (SC). The Steering Committee is the main decision-making body of IPA 2015. It is chaired by the gathers representatives of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare, Ministry of Economy, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and European Integrations, Delegation of European Union in Montenegro, Parliamentarian Committee for Gender Equality and UNDP. SC meets at least twice per year but also as per the needs of programme dynamics.

2. Resume

3. Methodology and Design

3.1. Introduction

The evaluation of the *Programme Support to Anti-discrimination and Gender Equality Policies* has following aims:

- Based on the analyses of the documents produced by the Programme (reports, analyses, papers, etc.) and interviews with partners and major stakeholders, assess Programme results achieved against planned objectives, targets and indicators. It also includes assessment of effectiveness and efficiency of the intervention and sustainability of Programme benefits beyond its lifetime.
- Identify and consolidate good practices, lessons learned and make recommendations on process, management, partnerships, transparency, stakeholders' participation and other aspects of project implementation that would benefit future engagement of UNDP in this area.

The evaluation addressed IPA 2015 objectives, results and four different components of the programme.

The four components are:

- Capacity development support
- Violence against women and domestic violence
- Political empowerment of women
- Women's entrepreneurship

Each component was evaluated since the themes, the stakeholders, the beneficiaries, the objectives and the programme activities are different.

Each component was evaluated in three phases:

- Desk review of project document, progress reports, relevant analysis including the all analysis and special reports are developed under the programme, policy and legal documents.
- Field visit with interviews with key stakeholders including representatives of the Steering Committee, Government, Police, Jurisdiction, Social Welfare Centres, Municipalities, Women's NGOs, Women's Political Network, journalists, Delegation of European Union and UNDP staff.
- Preparation of final evaluation report.

3.2. Structure

The structure of the evaluation follows the Result Oriented Monitoring (ROM) developed by the EC for External cooperation programmes.

The questions of the evaluation to be answered will be as follows:

1) Relevance

a) Did the operation respond to the needs of the target groups?

b) Did the operation support the policy of the partner government?

c) Was the operation in line with EC development policy and strategies?

2) Quality of design

- a) Was the design of the operation appropriate for reaching its objectives?
- b) Did the implementation arrangements take into account the capacity of the partners, and was the design fully supported by them?

3) Efficiency

- a) How well was the availability and use of inputs and resources managed?
- b) How well were the activities implemented?
- c) How well was the outputs achieved?
- d) How well were the Partners involved and contributing?

4) Effectiveness

- a) How well did the operation achieve the expected outcomes?
- b) Was the project purpose achieved?

5) Impact

- a) What is the operation's direct impact (i.e. contribution at the level of overall objective)?
- b) To what extent does/will the operation have any indirect (positive/negative) impact?

6) Potential sustainability

- a) What was the financial/economic viability of the continuation of benefits after the end of the operation?
- b) What is the level of ownership of the operation by the target group and relevant stakeholders today?
- c) To what degree did the policy environment support the operation?
- d) To what extent did the operation contribute to partner's capacity development?

7) Good practice, lesson learned and recommendations

- a) What has been established amongst the partners involved as new practice?
- b) What has been achieved as new methods and strategies amongst the partners and UNDP?
- c) What has been unforeseen gains, obstacles or achievements amongst the partners and UNDP?
- d) Have the partners and UNDP new knowledge, demands and input for the next steps in further development?
- e) Have the beneficiaries new knowledge, demands and input for the next steps in further development?

8) List of persons interviewed

9) List of documents analysed

The evaluation report follows four IPA 2015 components:

- Capacity Development Support
- Violence against women and domestic violence

- Political empowerment of women
- Women's entrepreneurship

And it reflects on project indicators in the Chapter 6.

3.3. Process

Desk Review

The relevant documents were analysed in order to answer some of the questions above. The main issues are:

- Assessment of the success of achieving the overall objective, specific objective, two results and to what extent the indicators have been met

The analysis of secondary sources during desk review assisted the evaluator in refining her approach to the field enquiry.

The Field Visit

The field visit was conducted in cooperation with UNDP Montenegro and it consist of interviews with key stakeholders representing the four components in the project. The interviews were organized as semi-structured interviews and group interviews. The field visit was scheduled to last eight days and it took place in Podgorica, Herceg Novi and Niksic in order to ensure that different stakeholders from different municipalities are involved in the evaluation process. The field visit started with kick off meeting UNDP staff. The individual and group interviews included representatives the local and national Government, public institutions, public services, women's business associations, women NGOs, Women's Political Network, and the Delegation of European Union in Montenegro. A full list was prepared in cooperation with UNDP that organized the appointments.

The Final Report

The final report included the relevant questions from the desk review and followed up with the answers from the field visit. The draft was sent for comments to UNDP and is finalized with the comments from the Steering Committee.

The report followed the above mentioned structure and is divided into the four different components of the project; Capacity development support, Elimination of violence against women, Political empowerment of women, Women's entrepreneurship.

Besides from assessing the compliance of the objectives, results and indicators the report focused on the sustainability of the project(s).

4. Analysis and Findings

IPA 2015 introduced key drivers of change, which ensured a catalytic effect on improvement of social and institutional responsiveness towards promotion, protection and enforcement of human rights and equal opportunities, specifically focusing on the implementation of the gender equality policies. The overall project contributed to the achievement of two specific results while operationally, it was implemented through four following programme components: 1) Capacity development support 2) Violence in family 3) Political empowerment of women and 4) Women's entrepreneurship support.

Following results are envisaged in the project logical framework:

Result 1: Supported creation of enabling environment for gender responsive programming and portrayal of gender and human rights topics in the media in accordance with the EU standards

Result 2: An efficient and effective system for accomplishment of gender equality and women's empowerment standards is established.

4.1 Capacity Development Support

4.1.1 Relevance

Assessment: Very good

As it is stated in the Gender Analysis for Montenegro, which has been conducted through this program, implementation of gender policies is still inconsistent and the budget for implementation of the policies is limited, which is also stressed in both UN CEDAW Report and in CEDAW Shadow Report, developed by the group of five NGOs (Women's Rights Centre, Centre for Roma Initiatives, Women's Safe House, SOS Hotline for Victims of Violence Nikšić, Spectra and Queer Montenegro). In addition, practice shows that victims of discrimination rather turn to NGOs when they face any issues that are based on discrimination than to institutions.

Such situation requires an action that combines support to capacity development of machinery for the implementation of gender equality and strong public awareness raising campaign; this program provided answers to both and it is very relevant for Montenegro, which is still patriarchal society. Also, conducting a research on discrimination of persons with disabilities within this program, was needed step in order to create a governmental strategy for this group.

It should be also stressed that Support to the anti-discrimination and gender equality policies project is in line with the Montenegro government's strategic framework, EU integration strategic framework and with the recommendations of UN human rights treaties and work towards Sustainable Development Goal 5.

4.1.2 Quality of Design

Assessment: Very good

Support to Gender Equality Policies and Anti-Discrimination has been designed to assist in development of the Ministry of Human and Minority capacities, primarily Department for Gender Equality and their work on gender equality issues which has very limited capacities. It also supported creation of enabling environment for gender responsive programming and increased visibility of gender and human rights topics in the media. The program incorporated situation analysis, capacity building of MHRM staff and public awareness raising on anti-discrimination and gender equality. In line with anti-discrimination scope of the program, a research on discrimination of persons with disabilities Roma and LGBT in Montenegro was also conducted.

Analysis of media reporting on the topics regarding human rights, anti-discrimination, and gender equality has been conducted followed by the gender review on the findings, which was an important step, because media have the capacity to draw public attention to certain issues and they also shape the content of what is being said in public. This analysis contains recommendations as to how media reporting should be changed and it is to be used as a base for education of journalists. In addition, a comprehensive Gender Analysis of Montenegro, also implemented within this project, provides an insight into situation, policies and gaps related to gender. Capacity building of MHRM staff is done not just through training on project design and project management, but also through assisting the Ministry to conduct evaluation implementation and impact assessment of the National Action Plan for Gender Equality (2013-2017) and providing consultancy support for the development of the new Action Plan (2017-2021), with accompanying activity plans. The public awareness raising campaign lasted for almost a year, under the slogan "Krenimo zajedno / Let's go together" and the program also supported production of TV family drama "Grudi" which depicts the position of women in Montenegrin society as well as covering the overall spectre of anti-discrimination issues.

Overall design of the program within this component was appropriate for the above mentioned objectives.

4.1.3 Efficiency

Assessment: Good

The Project Steering Committee is the main decision-making body of the project and it is chaired by the Minister for Human and Minority Rights (MHMR) and includes representatives of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare, Ministry of Economy, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and European Integrations, Delegation of European Union in Montenegro, Parliamentary Committee for Gender Equality and UNDP. The implementation of the Project is supervised by the dedicated Programme Manager and Programme Assistant/Coordinator, who are responsible for project and administrative support, while external consultants and NGOs are contracted according to needs of the action. Primary beneficiary of this project is MHMR and even though understaffed and overwhelmed with the amount of work, it actively participated in project implementation, including legislative framework. Commitment of other stakeholders in Steering Committee was not as strong.²

² Result Oriented Monitoring report 2019, pg.4: "The fact the stakeholders did not intervene to prevent the project falling behind schedule and have not yet met to approve the new workplan indicates a lack of commitment."

One of the key activities in capacity building of MHRM staff – training in project design and management was successful and participants are now equipped with knowledge and skills to better respond to the requirements of their work. According to the consultant’s report “mostly needed training is on strategic management, since the Ministry does not seem to have a strategic plan for the future.” However, work on strategic documents (NAP for Gender equality 2017 – 2021 and bi-annual activity plans for 2017-2018 and 2019-2020) provided additional experience and skills of MHRM staff for strategic thinking and planning. It also has to be noted that due to the alignment of national strategies with the new template adopted by the Government of Montenegro, MHRM staff with the help of external consultant had the opportunity to practice writing strategies in different ways. Throughout this exercise, the Strategy for the Protection of Persons with Disabilities is aligned with the new template in 2018. In addition, UNDP provided support to MHRM in development of the Gender Index for Montenegro.

Media analysis strengthened the relevant knowledge in order to plan the public awareness campaign which produced a great impact and media attention. It contained several promotional activities (including promotion of the results on the research on domestic violence and violence against women), three street events, 20 days of promotional animated video “Report violence” on several TV stations free of charge, brunch with journalists with the topic of ethical media coverage of violence against women and domestic violence with guidance on ethical reporting, already mentioned TV family drama “Grudi” which also had a national TV coverage. Campaign was conducted by NGO Women’s Safe House and one of the activity was to draw the support network in a way that links the institutions of the system of protection and non-governmental organizations. After the development of the support network, an electronic support network for women victims of violence was created and promoted via social media.

Having in mind that the envisaged result for this project component was “Supported creation of enabling environment for gender responsive programming and portrayal of gender and human rights topics in the media in accordance with the EU standards”, it could be concluded that the activity outputs supported this result to a good extent, with well implemented activities and with the active involvement of partners.

4.1.4 Effectiveness

Assessment: Good

Program, specifically this first component, was slightly changed, since the EU Delegation (as major donor of IPA 2015) decided to split the project and result one i.e. anti-discriminatory component, that includes addressing discriminatory perceptions and attitudes towards persons with disabilities, Roma and LGBT was given to Council of Europe that works on the mentioned issues and result two i.e. gender component was given to the UNDP. Never the less, in accordance with agreements with funder (EU Delegation), and prime beneficiary (MHRM), UNDP contracted a research company to do a study about the scope and types of discrimination of persons with disabilities in Montenegro. This study has served as basis for discussions and analyses of the status and discriminatory practices of people with disability and development of the Strategy to

Address Discrimination of People with Disabilities (adopted by the Government of Montenegro in November 2016).

Considering activities on gender equality scope under this component, it has to be noted that the Action Plan for achieving gender equality in Montenegro (2017 - 2021) represents the third development document for the implementation of gender equality policy in Montenegro, which shows the commitment of major stakeholders to deal with gender equality issues strategically and methodically. This program supported this process by supporting capacity building of MHRM and providing consultancy and logistics when needed. Programme also envisaged capacity development intervention through conducting a gender mainstreaming training for the representatives from UNDP, UNICEF and OSCE, as well as staff from the EU Delegation Office, primarily project managers, which actually generated gender mainstreaming intervention in four Operational Programs of the following EU IPA sectors: Competitiveness, Transport, Environment and Employment, Education and Social Policy. It is expected that gender mainstreaming intervention in these sectorial documents will enable targeted interventions that will affect gender gap and support overall processes of enhancement of gender equality in Montenegro.

Increasing the visibility of gender equality issues in Montenegrin media and public and enabling and supporting cooperation and networking of different stakeholders within this program, (especially involving prominent NGOs in the action) is a contribution to the creation of the good environment for gender responsive programming and monitoring of national and international standards in this area. In addition, Gender Analysis in Montenegro established good bases for addressing policy issues related to gender in the future.

4.1.5 Impact

Assessment: Problems

Overall objective of this program was to ensure that fundamental human rights have been protected and promoted in compliance with international standards. The direct impact of this particular component of the program (capacity development) in relation to the overall objective was mainly in the area of gender equality: analysis of the current state of gender equality in Montenegro, capacity building of institutions and promotion and raising public awareness in this domain. Even though program was not able to deliver all planned training activities for the MHRM staff, it definitely managed to increase the ability of the Ministry to address gender equality issues. Studies, research and analysis done as parts of this project, followed by consultancy work have pinpointed some of the areas where more intervention is needed and have enabled creation of evidence based policies development (e.g. National Action Plan for Gender Equality 2017-2021 with bi-annual plans and Strategy for Protection Against Discrimination Against Persons with Disabilities in Montenegro). However, the impact would be stronger, if the Ministry had bigger capacity to receive and utilize trainings and more staff.

Successful networking and cooperation of key stakeholders - governmental institutions, prominent NGOs in this area and media - is another achievement of the program, working on gender equality and anti-discrimination.

One of the important outcomes of the action is creation of the independent monitoring mechanism: NGOs providing specialized support services to victims of domestic violence formed a coalition for monitoring CEDAW and GREVIO recommendation: Women's Rights Centre, Women's Safe House, SOS Phone for Women and Children Victims of Violence – Nikšić, SOS Phone for Women and Children Victims of Violence, supported by MNE Women's Lobby and Centre for Roma initiatives.

Last, but not the least, promotional aspect of the overall objective was empowered through innovative and long lasting raising awareness campaigns on gender equality.

4.1.6 Potential Sustainability

Assessment: Problems

The strongest sustainable elements of this component of the project are certainly the governmental policies in the fields of gender equality and protection of persons with disabilities from discrimination. Through this action, several research and assessments have been done to define the strategic documents framework, and one of the more important is the evaluation of NAP GE 2013-2017. What is imperative is that the state, or partners in this project, continue with this practice after the program ends, that is, to periodically conduct studies and check whether the implementation of new policies has led to changes or whether the policies are consistently implemented.

In view of the above, it is important to continue to strengthen institutional capacity so that laws and plans can be firmly exercised. Although the partners in this project have acquired some new knowledge and skills (through trainings, consultations, jointly implemented actions), it is evident that more resources - financial and human - need to be invested in this segment in order to achieve long-term sustainability.

Public awareness campaigns on social issues in the areas of human rights, anti-discrimination and gender equality should continue, as it is necessary to reach a social consensus on what kind of society Montenegrin citizens want to live in. NGOs are creative in conducting such campaigns and they should receive the support of the relevant institutions and the state in keeping these topics in focus with the public and the media.

Attention should also be drawn to the Strategy for the Protection of Persons with Disabilities: Although the Strategy is comprehensive and provides a good basis for improving the situation of persons with disabilities in Montenegro, there is at least one major problem for its full implementation. Namely, achieving accessibility of information, services and public (and private) spaces is a prerequisite for mobility, dignified life and full social inclusion of this target group. We are witnessing that even in developed countries this aspect is not fully reached. Creating a society without (informational, institutional, architectural) barriers requires large financial investments, change of awareness, long-term planning, involvement of end users in all planning segments,

coordination of different stakeholders and services and establishment of mechanisms for monitoring. The said Strategy is certainly a step in the right direction.

4.1.7 Good Practice, Lessons Learned and Recommendations

Composition of the Steering Committee (SC - different ministries and parliamentary committees) shows, at least declaratively, the desire and need of institutions to cooperate on actions relevant to the promotion of respect for human rights and gender equality in Montenegro. This practice, inter-sectoral and multidisciplinary - should be continued in the future, and it is desirable to transfer this type of coordination and cooperation to the local level. In order to improve the operation of the SC, it is recommended to include lower ranking personnel (e.g. Heads of relevant departments) in the future, instead ministers, which is the current case. Also, reports, proposals and project documentation should be sent in advance in order to allow time SC members to prepare for the discussion during SC meetings.

Stronger involvement of relevant NGOs and end-users in the development of plans and policies at national and / or local level contributes not only to the transparency of the work of governmental bodies, but also to better and more sustainable results generated through the implementation of those plans. There is also a need to work to further empower NGOs to monitor the implementation of laws and policies in the fields of human rights, anti-discrimination and gender equality.

It is also necessary to constantly work on strengthening the institutions and improving the competences of the employees in those institutions for consistent application of regulations and familiarization with European practices and standards. The existence of strong institutions can somewhat mitigate the consequences of potential political crises (as has already been seen, boycotting the parliament of opposition parties has led to blocking the work of certain parliamentary committees).

The project recognizes the importance of working with the media, in the context of the content of the articles, the tone and terminology used in the reporting, but some of the planned educational tool-kit for journalists and their training are still underway at the time of writing this report. Work with journalists, media and journalistic associations, including journalism schools (formal and informal) - on advancing terminology, ethical reporting, combating stereotypes and prejudices - should continue.

The involvement of foreign experts in various studies, analyses, processes is welcome and often inevitable. However, it is recommended to work on the development of own (Montenegrin) capacities, especially in the field of adapting policies and regulations to European standards, in the context of the EU accession process.

4.2 Violence against Women and Domestic Violence

UNDP Gender Programme contributed to the creation of legal framework for protection from violence in the family. IPA 2015 further supported development of gender policies and legal framework in Montenegro. The Constitution, the Law on Prohibition of Discrimination and the Law on Gender Equality directly prohibit gender based discrimination. Both IPA 2010 and IPA 2015 supported development and updating of the legislation that is applied in cases of violence: the Law on Protection from Domestic Violence, Criminal Code, the Family Law, the Law on Social and Child Protection, the Criminal Procedure Law, and the Misdemeanour Law. Gender policy documents like The Strategy for Protection from Domestic Violence 2016-2020, and the Action Plan for Gender Equality (2017-2021) were supported also by UNDP Gender Programme.

4.2.1 Relevance

Assessment: Very good

Relevance of Violence against Women and domestic violence is confirmed from gender analysis and evaluation field mission. IPA 2015 follows IPA 2010 and external evaluation of IPA 2010 emphasized that project have succeeded in good manner to address the consequences and develop activities to strengthen the law enforcement, the public awareness and thereby support the policy of the Government.

“The combination of the different elements of the project component on Violence against women and domestic violence are very relevant in Montenegro...The lack of general awareness of both the number of cases and the consequences of the violence for women have been neglected not only by government and local officials but also among the population in general.”³

IPA 2015 supported research about Intimate Violence in the Family and Violence against Women conducted by the agency IPSOS in 2017. Major outcome shows that 38% of the women in the research sample experienced some form of violence at some point of their life. The same research calculated that expense of intimate partner violence cost Montenegro nine million EUR per year.⁴

Relevance of the topic is confirmed by the data of Ministry for Human and Minority Rights that quote Social Welfare Centres with 1,213 reported cases of violence against women in 2017.⁵

In 2018, GREVIO Delegation (Council of Europe/Istanbul Convention) conducted first baseline evaluation of the implementation of Istanbul Convention in Montenegro. Key recommendations of this report confirm IPA 2015 relevance.

IPA 2015 supported different actors to lobby for further synchronization of laws and bylaws related to domestic violence with Istanbul Convention, supported creation of the Code of Conduct (Protocol of multisectorial approach among all relevant institutions in the cases of

³ Evaluation of the Gender Programme IPA 2010, UNDP Montenegro, 2014

⁴ IPSOS “Research about Intimate Violence in the Family and Violence against Women”, 2017, Montenegro

⁵ Interview during evaluation field visit

domestic violence), further training of public servants how to use Code of Conduct conducted by women's NGOs, and especially supported various analysis and researches related to gender equality and domestic violence that all involved stakeholders and duty bearers can make use of in their future work.

4.2.2 Quality of Design

Assessment: Very good

Design of Violence in the family and Violence against Women is well thought and comprehensive: establishment of the sustainable and efficient system of protection of victims of domestic violence (legal and policy changes, Code of Conduct) and introduction of sustainable measures to combat domestic violence (NGO monitoring coalition, database exchange of information between SWCs and the Police, relevant researches about DV prevalence and media presentation that all gender advocates can use).

Violence in the family and Violence against Women component is complementary with the UN Women supported regional project *"Implementing Norms Changing Minds"* that is also implemented by UNDP Montenegro. This project is supporting women's organizations that work on GBV through grants and capacity building.

IPA 2015 supported directly Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare and Ministry for Human and Minority Rights. Gender advocates among women's NGOs and Women's Political Network lobbied for changes of the Law on Protection from Domestic Violence in order to synchronize it with Istanbul Convention and GREVIO Delegation recommendations and it became possible only in the fall 2019 when the Commission that will work on this Law Amendments was formed.

Major sustainable outcome is agreed and adopted Code of Conduct ("Protocol") that described roles and obligations of everybody involved in the domestic violence and violence against women. Training of public servants who will implement Code of Conduct is equally important. All these efforts are changing basic institutional structure, meaning connecting them in multisectoral approach and increasing general knowledge about domestic violence and violence against women. This is very important in order to open doors to survivors of violence against women who want to access protection and services.⁶

Social Card and development of database in the Social Welfare system is another UNDP project that is implemented in the last six years. Very good coordination among UNDP projects allowed that IPA 2015 supported Ministry of Interior to synchronize part of their data related to DV survivors and exchange it with database of Social Welfare that collects major data about DV survivors.

⁶ Gender Analysis for Montenegro (pg33), UNDP, 2017: "...weak inter-sectorial cooperation, insufficient human, technical and financial resources, a low level of gender sensitivity among members of the legal profession...victims are reluctant to report gender-based violence against women because of stigma and the social acceptance of family violence, their limited knowledge of how to access protection and services when they are available and the limited number of shelters..."

NGOs providing specialized support services to victims of domestic violence: Women's Rights Centre, Women's Safe House, SOS Phone for Women and Children Victims of Violence – Niksic, SOS Phone for Women and Children Victims of Violence, supported by MNE Women's Lobby and Centre for Roma Initiatives formed a coalition for monitoring CEDAW and GREVIO recommendations.

Agency Arhimed conducted media analysis about human rights and women in 19 months (2016 and 2017) and found that NGOs are mentioned in 36.35% of texts which indicates that NGOs are main human rights advocates.

Another journalist who conducted qualitative analysis of media reporting⁷ shared with the evaluator:

...Media most often have an indirect negative attitude when reporting on cases of violence against women, which implies that they relativize violence, reduce its negative consequences, justify the abuser and solidify with him, and promote gender stereotypes as part of traditional cultural patterns... insufficient media interest in GBV because they do not consider it significant enough and do not assess gender based violence as a serious social problem.

4.2.3 Efficiency

Assessment: Good

Violence in the family has been characterized as a criminal act in the Criminal Code, article 220 since 2003 as a result of NGO efforts. Since then, police, SWCs, health clinics, the prosecution, courts and NGOs have increased their cooperation and their effectiveness in this matter. However, adequate protection of women who are DV survivors and adequate prosecution of perpetrators remained a challenge.

Therefore, the UNDP Gender Programme supported the Ministry of Justice in drafting a new law which will resolve the legal gap in cases of domestic violence and ensure that the perpetrators are sanctioned and survivors protected whether it is treated as a minor offence or criminal act. Furthermore, the Law on the Protection from Violence in the Family requires cooperation between institutions, proper reporting and centralized data collection on cases of violence. It was adopted by Parliament in 2013. During IPA 2015, this Law is open to changes and Amendments in order to follow recommendations that CEDAW and GREVIO made to Montenegro in last four years.

Major indicators related to efficiency are:

- 1) In at least 50 % of reported cases assured multidisciplinary support to victims of violence**
- 2) At least 40 media representatives attending educational event on media reporting on human rights and violence against women and violence in family**

⁷ Qualitative analysis of media reporting and content analysis of "Women in politics", "Family violence-violence against women" and "Women's entrepreneurship", Duska Pejovic, UNDP, 2018

- 3) **At least 300 professionals implementing the Law on Protection from Violence in Family attending tailored training program**
- 4) **Campaigns**

The first three are partially achieved, meaning that multidisciplinary approach is practiced but not always and not in the whole country; 12 media representatives are trained in reporting on human rights and violence against women; approximately 100 professionals are trained how to use Code of Conduct and Law on Protection from Violence in Family.

Public awareness campaigns supported by IPA 2015 had great success and a lot of attention in the media. Women's NGOs are using these activities for long time so they are professional and experienced in raising issues about gender equality and domestic violence. Supported activities were various: annual event One Billion Rising, theatre performance "Sama je to trazila" / "She asked for it", promotion of the study on violence against women and domestic violence, 16 days of activism campaign which incorporated social media campaign, TV serial "Grudi"/"Breasts", school lectures and a press conference, etc.

4.2.4 Effectiveness

Assessment: Problems

There are achievements and harmonization with Istanbul Convention and GREVIO, but there still remain legal changes to be adopted, Code of Conduct ("Protocol") to be implemented on daily basis and country wide, local and national budget allocation for GBV.

We can say that so far, there is not yet established a sustainable and efficient system for protection of domestic violence and violence against women survivors.

IPA 2015 hired an international expert to draft amendments to address legal gaps related to protection and support to victims of violence in family. There were two meetings of the Committee that has mandate to change Law on Protection from Violence. These meetings were held without presence of the opposition parliamentarians so no voting was possible due to lack of quorum in the Committee.

Major achievement of IPA 2015 is development of the Code of Conduct ("Protocol") which is multi-disciplinary and inter-sectorial system that involves duty bearers that should *provide adjustments to new systemic response to violence*. Protocol was signed on 28th September 2018, which is when the pilot phase of its implementation should have start.

Code of Conduct is comprehensive document that follows both Istanbul Convention and CEDAW. Its' content:

- Questionnaire that assess Risk and Safety/ Police
- The perpetrator of domestic violence rights / this is given by the Police
- Victim's rights / handing by Police

- Mol application form sent to the SWC
- SWC application form sent to the Mol
- Information about SWC and victim's rights, with contacts of all stakeholders/ SWC
- SWC request from the Shelter to place the victim
- Application form / Health Clinics send to Police in cases of suspected violence
- Application form / Education Institutions send to the Police in cases of suspected violence
- Violence indicators / information for teachers, the school principal place the indicators in the meeting room on the visible spot
- Application form / Prosecution send to Mol and SWC
- Victim's rights in court proceedings / Courts give to victims
- Application form / NGOs send to Mol and SWC
- Consent to represent the victim as a trusted person / NGO and victim
- Information sheet that NGOs give to the victim; it has all necessary data what kind of support victims should and can receive in relevant institutions.

UNDP Montenegro supported through the other project development and use of data-base and the Social Card within Social Welfare system in last six years. IPA 2015 provided technical support so that the police software upgrades in order to enable interoperability with Social Card i.e. to have automatic data exchange between police and Social Welfare Centres whenever violence case is reported. That is implemented and started to be operational in 2019. IPA 2015 priority was to assure that data-bases are aligned with new multidisciplinary framework and tested at the beginning.

So far, major constrain of Code of Conduct ("Protocol") and multidisciplinary framework is that it is not implemented yet, witnessed by women's NGOs that work with direct violence survivors. It is important to test it, use it for a while, train public servants how to use it and based on feedback by all involved, public servants that are using it and women's NGOs representatives that monitor them, it will be possible to make adjustments and expansion of data-bases IT solutions which is important for the future use of Code of Conduct and multidisciplinary framework.

Women's NGOs are very satisfied with Operation Team that meets regularly in last 18 months. It is multidisciplinary team that brings together Government representatives coming from relevant Ministries and women's NGOs. This team started with the initiative of women's NGOs and was supported by Minister of Interior. It resolves more complicated cases and cases that could not be resolved for long time. Overall changed perception, media presence of GBV and better cooperation of women's NGOs with Government representatives contributed to the Operation Team set up and smooth functioning. This is not IPA 2015 outcome however, it happened due to the women's NGOs commitment to GBV, UNDP Gender Programme overall support to GBV and at the same time as IPA 2015.

Harmful practice that does not have an adequate response from institutions is forced child marriage. Although this harmful practice that is GBV consequence has been addressed through

the Strategy against Domestic Violence, the problem is not resolved yet.⁸

Establishment of Women's Political Network that has domestic violence and violence against women on their agenda as well as lobbying for changes of Law on Protection from Violence in Family contributed to overall public and media presence of GBV.

4.2.5 Impact

Assessment: Good

The major impact of UNDP Gender Programme including IPA 2015 is constantly following GBV agenda in the country and contributing to CEDAW and Istanbul Convention reporting. Therefore, IPA 2015 major impact is in legal harmonization that both CEDAW and GREVIO recommended to Montenegro and development of Code of Conduct ("Protocol").

Increased level of media presence of GBV and IPA 2015 supported awareness raising campaigns contributed to the increased number of women who are reporting violence.

IPA 2015 supported GBV and gender analysis like *Analysis of Priority Services as per the Istanbul Convention* and *Gender Analysis for Montenegro* that can be useful to all stakeholders that work on GBV in Montenegro.

4.2.6 Potential sustainability

Assessment: Problems

The legal framework is still under revision. New Code of Conduct is sustainable, but the level of implementation is fragile as it did not start to be implemented yet. If legal changes would be adopted by the Government, and properly implemented by public servants, outcomes of IPA 2015 would be achieved fully.

During IPA 2015 around 100 public servants are trained how to use new Code of Contact but due to the serious problems in the implementation of the legal framework, more training and daily practicing at the local level is needed so that the authorities address the GBV properly and to actually reach solutions.

Code of Conduct should elaborate form for the standardized response of health practitioners to domestic violence.

The financial sustainability has several perspectives. The awareness raising activities (campaigns) and the independent CSO monitoring of public policies implementation largely rest on civil society and predominantly donor sector. Both MHMR and the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare have some modest funds for the civil society and service providers to work on both service licensing (an ongoing process in Montenegro to license services provided to women victims of violence according to the legal provision standards), and for the campaigns.

⁸ 12/2018 - Nowhere to turn: Gender-based violence against Roma women. UNDP, Istanbul.
<http://www.eurasia.undp.org/content/rbec/en/home/library/roma/nowhere-to-turn-gbv-against-roma-women.html>

4.2.7 Good Practice, Lessons Learned and Recommendations

IPA 2015 supported different actors to lobby for further synchronization of laws and bylaws related to domestic violence with Istanbul Convention and CEDAW, supported creation of the Code of Conduct (Protocol of multisectoral approach among all relevant institutions in the cases of domestic violence), further training of public servants how to use Code of Conduct conducted by women's NGOs, and especially supported various analysis and researches related to gender equality and domestic violence that all involved stakeholders and duty bearers can make use of in their future work.

International conventions ratified by Montenegro provide good legal framework for protection from discrimination, violence against women and domestic violence and protection from trafficking in human beings. However, international standards are not directly applied by judges and prosecutors in Montenegro, as noted in reports of the Protector of Human Rights and Freedoms and practice of women's NGOs.

In 2017, agency IPSOS research about Intimate Violence in the Family and Violence against Women conducted by the. Major outcome shows that 38% of the women in the research sample experienced some form of violence at some point of their life. The same research calculated that expense of intimate partner violence cost Montenegro nine million EUR per year.

Gender advocates among women's NGOs and Women's Political Network lobbied for changes of the Law on Protection from Domestic Violence in order to synchronize it with Istanbul Convention and GREVIO Delegation recommendations and it became possible only in the fall 2019 when the Commission that will work on this Law Amendments was formed. Marital rape was included in the Criminal Code following vigorous lobbying from the Women Political Network and women CSOs.

Major sustainable outcome is agreed and adopted Code of Conduct ("Protocol") that described roles and obligations of everybody involved in the domestic violence and violence against women. Protocol is not implemented yet, witnessed by women's NGOs that work with direct violence survivors. It is important to test it, use it for a while, train public servants how to use it and based on feedback by all involved, public servants that are using it and women's NGOs representatives that monitor them, it will be possible to make adjustments and expansion of data-bases IT solutions.

Multi-disciplinary approach is not practiced equally country wide. Training of public servants (social workers, police, judges, attorneys etc.) who will implement Code of Conduct is equally important. In 2019, 100 professionals are trained how to use Code of Conduct and Law on Protection from Violence in Family. The training should continue and it is recommended to include public servants that are higher in the hierarchy ("nacelnici odeljenja") in the trainings, since without their support changes on institutional level are not possible.

Very good coordination among UNDP projects allowed that IPA 2015 supported Ministry of Interior to synchronize part of their data related to DV survivors and exchange it with database of Social Welfare that collects major data about DV survivors.

NGOs providing specialized support services to victims of domestic violence: Women's Rights Centre, Women's Safe House, SOS Phone for Women and Children Victims of Violence – Niksic, SOS Phone for Women and Children Victims of Violence, supported by MNE Women's Lobby and Centre for Roma Initiatives formed a coalition for monitoring CEDAW and GREVIO recommendations.

Public awareness campaigns supported by IPA 2015 had great success and a lot of attention in the media. Women's NGOs are using these activities for long time so they are professional and experienced in raising issues about gender equality and domestic violence.

Local and national budget allocation for GBV is minimal if at all. Public funding for the operation of the SOS Hotlines, and women's shelters who are under threat and in danger, is an important step that would lead to financial sustainability.

Harmful practice that does not have an adequate response from institutions is forced child marriage.

4.3 Political Empowerment of Women

4.3.1 Relevance

Assessment: Very good

The project component Political Empowerment of Women is relevant in Montenegro, in which society is still patriarchal and in which the male political culture is dominant. The importance of women's participation and representation in politics was also highlighted in the final report of the OSCE / ODIHR Observation Mission after the October 2016 parliamentary elections in Montenegro⁹, stating as one of the recommendations: "To ensure a better balance between men and women who exercise public functions, political parties should consider internal measures for appointing women to higher positions within the party structure and increase the visibility of women candidates during the election campaign." Work on political empowerment of women was focused on parliamentary political parties to influence that parties incorporate gender aspects into their internal decision-making processes and enable the advancement of women in their political careers.

This component is in line with a number of international documents and recommendations adopted by Montenegro: "The United Nations (UN) Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW), the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action and

⁹ Montenegro, Parliamentary elections 2016, OSCE/ODIHR Election Observation Mission Final Report, Warsaw, 25th January 2017

the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, a set of internationally recognized standards and goals for achieving equality between women and men in decision-making and participation in public life. In addition, the Council of Europe calls on governments to achieve balanced participation in political life (defined as achieving a minimum representation of 40% of women) and urges authorities to encourage women to stand for election.¹⁰

It should also be emphasized that the IPA 2015 applies the lessons learned from the previous IPA 2010 project and that it responded to the needs of the target group (female politicians), especially during the election campaign 2016 and also by launching Women's Political Network in November 2017, which is the biggest impact of the project. Results of analyses of gender sensitivity of political parties and leading media in Montenegro conducted during IPA 2015, further indicate the importance and relevance of the measures envisaged and performed.

4.3.2 Quality of Design

Assessment: Very good

Activities on improving the legal framework (especially quota system) and raising the capacity of women involved in politics are powerful methods for strengthening the position of women within existing structures in Montenegro. Indirectly, such approach also contributes, in the long-term, to the reduction of the gender gap in other areas of social life, as demonstrated through this project¹¹.

Assessment of political perceptions on gender sensitivity¹² as well as the study of media reporting on gender issues are also a very important segment in this project, because not only do the results of these analyses set baseline values against which progress in political empowerment of women can be measured, but also indicate possible directions of action while highlighting priority areas.

As already stated, the project under this component applies the lessons learned from IPA 2010 and thus manages to achieve improved effects and results. The best example of this is a change in approach to the formation of the WPN. Namely, it appeared that women in leadership positions within women's groups and forums in political parties are also heavily influenced by the leaderships of those parties, so the focus had to be changed. Also, although all parliamentary political parties have established women's groups, their position in the parties' infrastructure is not always clear, nor do they have sufficient support and finances. Therefore, under this program and with the support of UNDP, Women's Political Network has established by two generations of women trainers (IPA 2010, IPA 2015), coming from 16 different political options but working jointly on common goals and priorities.

Increasing the capacity of women politicians during election campaigns, but also later through trainings within parties and at the local level, networking, creating an atmosphere for legislative

¹⁰ Result Oriented Monitoring report from 2019

¹¹ E.g. the positive impact of WPN's actions on women's entrepreneurship

¹² Study on Gender Sensitivity of Political Parties has been developed in 2016 within the program Support to Antidiscrimination and Gender Equality Policies, IPA II (2014-2020), implemented by UNDP and the Ministry for Human and Minority Rights. Author of the Study is national legal expert Vlado Dedović.

change, and favouring political empowerment of women through advocacy and lobbying campaigns, providing mentoring support - these are all measures that contribute to the achievement of the envisaged aim for this program component: "Aim of intervention in this area are political parties involved to support gender mainstreaming into internal political party decision-making processes and developed capacities of women politicians to advance their political careers." Additionally and not less important component is raising visibility of women in politics activities and breaking down prejudices and negative attitudes in society about this issue, because the media are maintaining the stereotypes and traditional gender roles in Montenegrin society (as concluded in the study done by Arhimed media monitoring agency).

4.3.3 Efficiency

Assessment: Good

Equal participation of women in political life is extremely important for the processes of advancing the position of women in society and achieving gender equality. The importance is also demonstrated and confirmed through this project component and the realized effects that have "spill over" into other two IPA 2015 components (especially into economic empowerment of women and advocacy efforts with GBV). Indicators related to the efficiency of this project component were set as follows:

1. **Proportion of seats in the National and Local Parliaments held by women (target: at least 30% of seats occupied by women till 2019 at National and Local level Parliaments)**
2. **Further improved National Action Plan provisions on quota for women and accompanied measures related to sanction, replacement and positioning on electoral list (target 40% of quota for women defined as goal in new NAP for GE 2017-2021 and Electoral Law (2019))**
3. **All parliamentary political parties' women's forums trained in gender equality and conducted at least one political action specifically addressing gender equality**
4. **At least 15 certified trainers for women in politics**
5. **At least 300 local women councillors in municipalities attended gender equality trainings**
6. **At least one annual conference gathered regional key advocated on women's political empowerment**
7. **50% of Montenegrin media assessed from the perspective of gender sensitivity**
8. **80% of Montenegrin political parties assessed from the perspective of gender equality**
9. **At least one monthly (TV, radio) show broadcasted addressing the issue of gender equality concerns**
10. **At least 80% of women's party forums have developed gender action plans within their own parties**
11. **At least 2 joint actions per year by women's groups from different parties on issues of mutual concern**
12. **At least 3 political parties mainstreamed gender equality through political party policies, processes and practices**

13. At least 20 women politicians received mentorship support from experienced politicians

The results of the activities under this component have largely led to the fulfilment of the set indicators (despite prolonged opposition's boycott of the Parliament), with a few minor exceptions. Parliamentary elections in Montenegro are due for 2020 and the target of 40% of seats occupied by women is yet to be seen if it will be achieved (currently, 28% of seats are occupied by female MPs). Quota of 40% for women is defined as a goal in the new NAP for GE 2017-2021 and the same goal will be addressed in the Electoral Law (adoption is in the procedure). Women politicians from all parliamentary parties participated in the training on GE and 15 of them received trainer's certificates. The most important achievement of this project is the creation of Women's Political Network in 2017, a group of politicians from ruling and opposition parties who have jointly performed a number of activities since their founding to date: education, lobbying and advocacy, mentoring, promotional campaigns, conference, etc. Studies on gender sensitivity of political parties and the media have been conducted and during the 2016 and local elections in 2017 at least five political parties have integrated gender in their electoral programs.

Total number of participants at the gender equality trainings was 251 out of which 144 or 59% were local councillors in municipalities. Achievement of the indicator "At least one monthly (TV, radio) show broadcasting addressing the issue of gender equality concerns" can be followed by the activities of the WPN so far:

<https://www.facebook.com/pg/zenskapolitickamreza/videos/>

It can be concluded that their actions and program support contribute to this topic receiving additional media attention.

4.3.4 Effectiveness

Assessment: Very good

The specific objective of the program was to improve social and institutional responsiveness towards protection and promotion of human rights and equal opportunities, specifically focusing on the implementation of anti-discrimination and gender equality policies. This project component has clearly directly influenced the strengthening of the institutional framework for the implementation of gender equality policies. The accomplished cooperation of women politicians on issues of women entrepreneurship, violence against women and political empowerment and the achieved results of this cooperation are certainly an important step towards building a society of equal opportunities.

Not only are women empowered to improve their position and functioning in the parties and have gained confidence, but with the already accomplished and expected changes in the legal framework, women's participation in decision making processes at all levels is enhanced. Establishing WPN with mechanisms for mentoring and peer support and creating a pool of trainers from different political parties is a platform that will have positive impacts in times to come, especially in the context of empowering women who have just entered politics or have

not had much experience so far. The importance of this platform can also be recognized through the results of a training evaluation held for women politicians from 17 municipalities: more than 80% of training participants for the first time took part in such training although majority has been active in their parties for longer than 5 years.

Even though the program has already led to legislative advancements in the field of gender equality, advocacy and lobbying activities of WPN implemented during this project should result in an even better legal framework in the near future, by enhancing a set of existing laws. However, there is still no consensus on changes to one of the more important laws that should recognize the importance and contribution of women's participation in political parties and support their strengthening - the Law on Financing Political Parties.

4.3.5 Impact

Assessment: Very good

The entire corpus of activities within this project unit are in line with Objective 7.1 of the Action Plan for Achieving Gender Equality 2017-2021: Achieved balanced representation of women and men in the legislative and executive bodies at all levels.¹³ However, the biggest impact is the launch of Women's Political Network in November 2017, at a time when there is no dialogue between opposition and ruling parties in Montenegro. It may be added here that if women involved in WPN work manage to get their voices heard in the political organizations they come from, they can also be a channel of communication to overcome potential parliamentary crises in the future. Only in the first year of its operation, this organization has achieved the adoption of amendments to the Criminal Code regarding compliance with the definition of rape with the Istanbul Convention. They managed to obtain support from seven political parties for the proposed changes in the electoral legislation and to receive support from six municipalities for the development of women entrepreneurship. The WPN's action was not only aimed at advancing the law and providing support for change at all levels of government, but also at creating a positive public image of women in politics, both through gender mainstreaming of political party programs and work, and through media appearances and promotional videos. One of the events that best demonstrates the current strength of WPN is the conference at which they gathered more than 200 participants - all party leaders, MPs and international partners as well as partners from civil society - and revealed the results of negotiations and advocacy campaigns, in October 2018 .

In the period between April and June 2016, three-day trainings were held for women's groups of eight parliamentary political parties on gender equality and the result of this work were training participants present with at least 60% of candidates at electoral party lists¹⁴. This shows how important it is to constantly work on capacity building and empowerment, and that relatively modest inputs can produce visible results. It has to be noted that during the four years of the

¹³ Action Plan for Achieving Gender Equality 2017-2021, pg. 41

¹⁴ From the interim narrative report "Support to anti-discrimination and gender equality policies" 2016-2018

project realization, a large number of women politicians from all political parties have participated in trainings on gender equality and women's empowerment topics.

Finally, the existence and operation of the WPN and the established dialogue and cooperation with relevant institutions should guarantee that gender equality issues will continue to be mainstreamed in local and national policies in the future. Time will tell if this is the case.

4.3.6 Potential Sustainability

Assessment: Problems

The legal framework which have been established and improved is important factor that contributes to the sustainability of this project. Its implementation should lead to an increase in the number of women participating in the decision-making processes, and this claim will be verified as early as in 2020, when the parliamentary elections in Montenegro are scheduled.

The importance of the existence and functioning of Women's Political Network has been repeatedly emphasized in this text and it is evident that this is one of the sustainable results of this program. Major challenges for women involved in the WPN are if they will manage to remain unique and effective in their work even after the completion of the project IPA 2015, when financial support for the activities is over, and whether the influence of the parties' leadership from which they come will prevail.

Increasing the quota for women's participation in the electoral lists will certainly lead to more female politicians, which means that there will be a greater need for trainings to empower them to equally engage in political processes with their male counterparts. With this in mind, we can conclude that the experiences gained during the various trainings held within this component, together with the training programs, material and the training pool itself, provide a quality response to the envisaged needs of this target group. Even if there is no institutional or project support for trainings and empowerment of women politicians, there is a possibility to continue this process within individual parties, since the training pool from this and the previous IPA project consists of women coming from 16 different political organizations in Montenegro.

Studies and analyses on gender sensitivity of political parties and media are also one of the elements of sustainability, as they indicate priority directions for action in the future.

4.3.7 Good Practice, Lessons Learned and Recommendations

Women's Political Network is highlight of this project component and one of the most important achievements. It is necessary to ensure the work of this group in the long run, and perhaps a formal registration would be a step in this direction as this would allow the application for funds. Also, the continuation and intensification of regional and international collaboration should

further strengthen WPN through the acquiring and exchange of know-how with similar initiatives in the region.

Another important achievement is the improvement of legislation by introducing a 40% quota for women. In practice so far, we have seen that even the 30% quota is hardly achievable, regardless of the existing legal framework. Not only should laws be enforced, but also awareness should be raised among all actors on the importance of quotas, as a generally accepted measure for achieving gender equality in society.

The IPA 2010 evaluation recommendation is still accurate: "Gender sensitivity training of officials in the state administration and the ministries is also recommended especially due to the fact that the central machinery on gender equality is considered quite weak since the Department of Gender Equality only consists of four persons". It should be added here that it is necessary to continue the activities and training on introducing a gender perspective in the work of political parties and developing the skills for advocating gender equality in politics.

The important role of the media in these processes is evident, and this is best recognized in the extensive media analysis undertaken during this project, covering the time of the election campaign in 2016. Investing efforts in gender sensitization of journalists and media and at the same time in the presentation and public relation skills of women politicians could be a winning combination that will boost promotion of gender equality issues in the public and introduce a better and more realistic picture of women in Montenegrin society.

4.4 Women's Entrepreneurship at the Local Level

4.4.1 Relevance

Assessment: Very good

The relevance of this project component "women's entrepreneurship at the local level" is significant because women in Montenegro have limited opportunities for self-employment and economic independence. Not only do women own only 4% of houses, 8% of land, and 14% of holiday homes in Montenegro, which makes it difficult for them to raise loans for business development (they do not have a loan guarantee), but the traditional patriarchal family structure is not making situation for women who want to start their own business any easier. It should also be noted that "according to the Study on Women Entrepreneurship for 2014, carried out by the Directorate-General for Enterprise and Industry (European Commission), the percentage of women entrepreneurs in Montenegro decreased sharply from 19% in 2004 to 9% in 2014", as stated in Gender Analysis for Montenegro¹⁵. Same document also mentions that "instability of the business environment and complicated regulatory framework also puts additional burden on women and discourages them from entering the business and taking the risk." Further, according

¹⁵ Gender Analysis for Montenegro was developed in 2017 within the program "Support to Antidiscrimination and Gender Equality Policies", which is financed by EU and implemented by UNDP and Ministry for Human and Minority Rights.

to data of the Central Bank of Montenegro, in 2015, out of 32 credits for unemployed persons for opening of business, only 1/3 of credits were obtained by women. It has to be stressed that the Ministry of Economy has developed informational guide with the information about all entrepreneurship initiatives in Montenegro, which is important for new start-ups to avoid overlaps in same municipalities. Also, IDF has three credit lines for Women's entrepreneurship which supported 39 projects in 2018, while National Employment Agency provided 1.5 million euros for women's start-ups in the same year.¹⁶

There is also lack of political will of decision-makers to systematically address the issues related to economic empowerment of women, but in this regard, it is important to note that the Government of Montenegro has adopted the Strategy on Development of Women Entrepreneurship 2015-2020, as the first document that should set systemic approach to women's entrepreneurship development¹⁷. This project component supports this strategy with its activities through providing women with new knowledge and skills to apply for funds and run their own business and at the same time working with institutions on local and national level to create favourable atmosphere for such actions.

4.4.2 Quality of Design

Assessment: Very good

The aim of this project component was "strengthened local institutional and women's capacities to enable and encourage entrance in entrepreneurship through utilized local support services and established cooperation with financial institutions as credible clients to financial institutions." The action is built on the experience from IPA 2010 and it takes into account the needs of target groups, especially by enabling adequate support to women entrepreneurs during the development and implementation of their business plans.

Initially, it is planned that the work to support women's entrepreneurship will focus on the two largest cities in Montenegro - Podgorica and Niksic - in cooperation with local authorities, the Department for Gender Equality, the IDF and competent NGOs. During the implementation, and after intensive advocacy campaign and lobbying of Women's Political Network, several more towns have joined the program.

The design of this component of the project demonstrates both a grass-root approach through working directly with women who want to grow their businesses (motivation, education, one-on-one mentoring and consultations) and bottom-down, through the involvement of decision makers in creating more favourable conditions for the development of women's entrepreneurship (financial support measures, improvement of existing practices and simplification of procedures). It should be emphasized that through their participation in this

¹⁶ Information from the evaluation interview with the representative from the Ministry of Economy; it is also added that out of 29540 registered entrepreneurship, 21.8% have female owners and that the number of women owning business has increased from 3021 in 2011 to 6460 in 2018.

¹⁷ Montenegro does not have the capacity to finance the implementation of this Strategy with its own funds and is applying for it with foreign donors

program, women have gained new contacts, networking opportunities and could exchange personal experiences in business, which was very important for many of them, as pointed out in their evaluation.

Finally, the program has anticipated and implemented a section related to the promotion of successful women entrepreneurs whose stories are an additional motivating factor for others to follow in their footsteps. This could contribute to the economic development of the society, but also to gender equality through the achievement of economic independence.

4.4.3 Efficiency

Assessment: Good

Although women in Montenegro make up the majority of the population (50.6% according to the 2011 census), they have much less opportunity to start business ventures, get a job or own a business. That is why the adoption of the Women's Entrepreneurship Development Strategy (2015-2020) is an important step towards the society with equal opportunities for women and men. The goal of the Strategy is to stimulate faster and easier economic empowerment of women by supporting their entrepreneurial potential and creating a favourable business environment for their involvement in entrepreneurship, which will also contribute to the development of existing and new businesses, job creation and employment growth, and thus the overall development of the SME sector and entrepreneurship. The program follows this goal by piloting support mechanisms for women entrepreneurs in two cities with the involvement of local governments in the activities.

Key efficiency indicators were:

- 1. Number of new support services/measures for women entrepreneurs established**
- 2. At least 70 women per municipality actively involved in the training program**
- 3. At least 40 women per municipality receive mentorship support**
- 4. 80% of women from the program included in business association networks**
- 5. At least 50% of developed business plans considered by the IDF**
- 6. At least 70% of programme staff from the municipalities working on women entrepreneurship included in the tailored training programme**
- 7. At least 10 women promoted as role models through social media communication tools**

Almost all indicators are fully achieved, one was even exceeded. In the first year of realization of the project, the initiative of the Women's Political Network to have allocated funds in local budgets for woman's entrepreneurship was accepted by seven municipalities, and in the budgets for 2018 in Podgorica, Danilovgrad, Kolasin, Bar, Budva, Ulcinj and Herceg Novi 130,000 euros were earmarked to support female entrepreneurship. Funds in the 2019 budgets for supporting women entrepreneurship were allocated in 11 municipalities: Danilovgrad, Podgorica, Ulcinj, Bar, Budva, Herceg Novi, Mojkovac, Bijelo Polje, Pljevlja, Berane, Rozaje in the total amount of 144,000 euros. Training program involved 65 and 69 women in Niksic and Podgorica respectively, most of them received mentoring support or at least one-on-one consultations and similar

program was later conducted in Herceg Novi, Danilovgrad, Tivat and Kolasin. Women from the program were included in business association networks, success stories are promoted on the Internet and in social media, while programme staff from the piloted municipalities working on women's entrepreneurship were involved in training. Three women start-ups received the financial support from the IDF for their business plans.

4.4.4 Effectiveness

Assessment: Good

This project component directly supports the second result of the project (as per revised Log Frame): "An effective and effective system for achieving gender equality and women's empowerment standards is established." It should be borne in mind that the other two components (gender violence and political empowerment) are also related to this result.

Development and implementation of measures and services supporting women's entrepreneurship, as well as empowering women to start a business, are very important factors contributing to gender equality (gaining economic independence, increasing visibility, breaking prejudices, reducing male dominance in entrepreneurship). Various studies produced through this project, including training needs assessments and recommendations from consultants who have worked directly with women entrepreneurs and local administrations, should serve as a basis for establishing standards for women's empowerment in this domain. Also, the cooperation of different levels of government and involvement of the NGO sector in activities under this component represent a good model for further work in this area.

It is evident that raising awareness with local authorities about the importance of women's entrepreneurship, as well as providing small grant schemes for women to start their own businesses, along with mentoring support have been success factors. Activities such as interactive discussion forums with the President of the Women's Business Centre in Washington¹⁸ and participants from the program's beneficiaries and representatives of local governments and their relevant secretariats are also very useful in the context of transferring know - how and supporting efforts of all stakeholders to improve the practice on institutional level.

4.4.5 Impact

Assessment: Good

Overall social environment for women entrepreneurship (in Montenegro) is unfavourable¹⁹, but the impact of this component in this regard has been very concrete in piloted cities (Niksic and

¹⁸ In partnership with the US Embassy to Montenegro, on 25th September 2017, the program hosted Samira Cook Gaines, the founder and President of the Women's Business Center in Washington, a person with many years of experience in providing support to entrepreneurs through training, counselling and mentoring.

¹⁹ Gender Analysis for Montenegro was developed in 2017 within the program "Support to Antidiscrimination and Gender Equality Policies", which is financed by EU and implemented by UNDP and Ministry for Human and Minority Rights.

Podgorica), as well in several more municipalities, as already mentioned. Women interested in starting and running a business gained the knowledge and entrepreneurial skills, as well as the opportunity to apply for funds in their local communities, which ultimately resulted with operational budgets of 55,000EUR in four municipalities dedicated in local budgets for 2018 and 2019 cumulatively for the development of women's entrepreneurship.

It can be estimated that this impact is relatively modest, given how few women eventually received financial support. However, it is very possible that in the coming period, after the end of the project, some of the women who participated in the program will take a step to apply for funds and start their own businesses. They have acquired the necessary knowledge and skills, some already have business plans in place, in many municipalities in Montenegro financial support measures for women entrepreneurship have already been established, and key support to make the move towards financial independence can come from women's peer networks.

Assessment of the Existing Mechanisms for Supporting Women's Entrepreneurship in Herceg Novi municipality is a study conducted by the Institute for Entrepreneurship and Economic Development (IPER) in October 2018 for the purpose of this project. The aim of this study is to improve business processes and streamline the procedures for licensing and permits to existing and future entrepreneurs. The document makes suggestions for improving coordination between local authorities in order to avoid jurisdiction overlapping, but also to shorten the processing time by eliminating unnecessary steps in the procedure. If the local administration adopts recommendations, and especially if other municipalities co-opt this model as well, it can lead to a better atmosphere for the development of small businesses in general, and thus women's entrepreneurship.

Equally important is the promotion women's stories who have started new or upgraded existing businesses with the support of this program, but also a way of reporting on this topic. Research Media Representation on Human Rights and Women in Montenegro²⁰ states the following: "UNDP had concrete activities that contributed to increasing media visibility of the topic. UNDP and the Delegation of the European Union to Montenegro are emerging as strong promoters of women's entrepreneurship, and directly the announcements that have been made at the initiative of these institutions have addressed the core of the issue."

It has to be stressed once more that the activities of Women's Political Network in the area of women's entrepreneurship have made a substantial impact in achieving overall goal of the program.

4.4.6 Potential Sustainability

Assessment: Problems

One possible problem is that once the IPA 2015 project is completed, the local focus on developing women's entrepreneurship can be reduced in intensity. National Women's

²⁰ Research on media reporting on the topics regarding human rights, anti-discrimination and gender equality was conducted by media-monitoring agency Arhimed, for the period from 01/01/2016 to 31/09/2017

Entrepreneurship Development Strategy 2015 -2020 and the future activities of WPN in this area should reduce the risk of this happening. Also, the activities of women's entrepreneurial groups have to be taken into account in this regard. The decision on the Criteria, Methods and Procedures for Allocation of Funds for Supporting Women Entrepreneurship has been adopted by a number of municipalities in Montenegro, and it is expected that the remaining municipalities will do the same in the coming period, which also contributes to the sustainability of the effects of this project.

Never the less, "...it is also not entirely clear who would be continuing on the services to the women entrepreneurs beyond project, as the current capacities at the local level are low."²¹ Improvement of capacity of local government employees dealing with this topic was done through training only in Niksic and Podgorica, but this is not enough. Opening of centres like IPC Tehnopolis (Niksic)²² could be part of the solution on the long run.

One of the key sustainability factors in this project is knowledge and skills transferred through trainings and consultations: some of the women included in the program may decide to start their own businesses in the future, when the circumstances are more favourable to them if they haven't done that already for the duration of this program. In addition, businesses created and/or enhanced as a result of this program are contributing to local economies, women's economic independence and could provide a motivating boost for those who are still thinking to enter entrepreneurship.

It is evident that the process of continuing activities within this component will be more effective and sustainable with the focus and support from an outside partner (like UNDP and EU).

4.4.7 Good Practice, Lessons Learned and Recommendations

This program is building on the achievements and experiences of IPA 2010 and activities within this component are somewhat similar to the previous project. Never the less, one substantially different and, at the time, unforeseen factor is the effect of the WPN work in the area of women's entrepreneurship. This group apparently can reach decision makers and influence positive developments in supporting women who want to start or grow their own businesses. Finding a way to back up WPN's activities after the end of the project could provide even greater effects in the future.

Networking of women owning or starting businesses is important on many levels. However, as stated in one of the consultant's report²³ "...institutions at the national and local level with its act (strategies, action plans) encourage the establishment and development of the association of women entrepreneurs and all entrepreneurs without proper research on potential interests and

²¹ ROM report 2019

²² IPC Tehnopolis provides space and logistics as well as part of the expert capacities for SMEs and they charge their services at very low prices

²³ Economic Empowerment of Women in Niksic, consultant final report, Budimka Golubovic, December 2017

future benefits or long-term and sustainable solutions, as well as the criteria for such association for the beneficiaries. Satisfying a particular form is the only condition fulfilled.” In this context, this issue should be given further analysis and attention to achieve the sustainability and significant impact that such associations could have on the development of women's entrepreneurship in Montenegro.

The access to small grants for the women to apply for, is very important even though the amounts seems small. Also, encouraging and further empowering women entrepreneurs to apply for the support from IDF should be continued. So far, not many women participating in this program even considered IDF as potential source of finances for their businesses. It is also important to establish a strong monitoring system to secure the continuation of local support to women's entrepreneurship at least at the same level.

“Women from vulnerable groups - Roma and Egyptian, rural women and women with disabilities belong to category of long-term unemployed and hardly employable persons²⁴.” Future actions concerning women's entrepreneurship should include these target groups as well. Maybe not just through building their capacities or advocating for dedicated budget lines, but also through exploring possibilities to find employment opportunities within existing start-ups.

Raising awareness and increasing visibility in media of female entrepreneurs by highlighting the importance related to the national and local economy and overcoming of the traditional male and female roles in society should become permanent task of relevant institutions and organisations.

Analysis, like the one conducted in Herceg Novi by IPER, about potentials for small business development are a good tool to improve existing mechanisms and measures on the local and national level. However, this particular study was missing gender perspective on the issue. The potential effects of such analysis in the future could be greater if they take into account different starting positions of women and man regarding entrepreneurship.

The training, knowledge and skills, mentorship support and access to finances for women entrepreneurs provided through this program seems extremely important. Never the less, it can also be added that “Even though women entrepreneurs develop business plan and register their business, they need continuous support with mentors, at least for one year”, as it was stressed in consultant's report²⁵.

Currently, there is no law on Guarantee Fund in Montenegro. It is recommended to find a way to launch guarantee funds that would help sustainability of new businesses. Also, new measures should be introduced for women's start-ups such as covering interest on loans, assisting with

²⁴ Gender Analysis for Montenegro was developed in 2017 within the program “Support to Antidiscrimination and Gender Equality Policies”, which is financed by EU and implemented by UNDP and Ministry for Human and Minority Rights.

²⁵ Delivery of Trainings for Women Entrepreneurs, CEED – consultant report, January 2018

participation for applying for EU Structural Funds, tax exemption and other fees in the initial period of business development, etc. For example, if new entrepreneurs were exempted from paying taxes for the first two years, this would allow women starting new businesses out of the grey economy. Lobbying with the Ministry of Economy to determine the benefits for women who have just entered entrepreneurship should be initiated by the association of women entrepreneurs.

City of Podgorica has founded first business incubator to aid emerging businesses. Support was provided for 15 entrepreneurs during the second cycle of the program, and within them it is only one woman entrepreneur. It is evident that initiatives like this one, should have more visibility in the public with messages targeting women with start-ups.

The Chamber of Commerce should prepare and send a guidebook to new entrepreneurs with all the information on what is available to them from incentive measures and what they will need for the first few years of the enterprise.

As already mentioned, IDF has three credit lines for women's entrepreneurs and 34 projects were supported from these funds in 2017 with 2.4 million euros, 39 projects with 1.2 million euros in 2018 and 15 projects in 2019 with total of 130 000 euros. Beneficiaries were women between 20 and 50 years of age. The recommendation is to find a way for women over the age of 50, who belong to the hard-to-employ group, to be motivated and included in support programs for entrepreneurship development.

5. Conclusions

The overall objective of the project was to ensure that fundamental human rights have been protected and promoted in compliance with international standards. The specific objective was to improve the social and institutional responsiveness towards promotion, protection and enforcement of human rights and equal opportunities, specifically focusing on the implementation of the gender equality. Project activities have been focused in four working areas:

- 1) Capacity Development Support
- 2) Violence against Women and Domestic Violence
- 3) Political Empowerment of Women
- 4) Women's Entrepreneurship at the Local Level

The project has succeeded in all four areas to increase capacities of stakeholders, improve existing legislation and policies, introduce new mechanisms and practices and increase visibility of important issues concerning human rights and gender equality – all in favour of supporting the above mentioned specific objective.

It is important to underline that the IPA 2015 Steering Committee consisted of representatives of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare, Ministry of Economy, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and European Integrations, Delegation of European Union in Montenegro, Parliamentarian

Committee for Gender Equality and UNDP, which enabled coordination of activities with competent actors in changing existing or adopt new policies. The project involved both local and international experts for the purposes of researches, analysis, harmonization of regulations with European standards, trainings and consultations. Also, it should be added that a number of relevant NGOs played a significant role in the project implementation, which each contributed to the quality and effectiveness of the program from their own expertise. In designing the project and activities of IPA 2015, the UNDP Montenegro relied on the results and lessons learned from IPA 2010.

All four program components are very relevant for Montenegro and program's beneficiaries, while the overall design of the IPA 2015 is appropriate for reaching objectives and producing envisaged results. Implementation was effective and efficient in most parts, but it has to be emphasized that Log Frame matrix has been changed after the ROM recommendation in 2017 and that the project has been extended for one year (non-cost extension) due to work overload of some of the partners and UNDP understaff in Gender Programme.

Some of the activities realized within the program were not initially planned; however they even exceeded expectations in some areas²⁶. A portion of planned activities have not been fully completed in the time of evaluation field mission and writing this report, but the overall positive impact of the project is not diminished by that fact. Programme has contributed to partner's capacity building and new knowledge and inputs are gained for the future development.

Potential problems have been identified in capacity building component, where the impact would be stronger, if the Ministry of Human Rights and Minorities, as the main beneficiary, had bigger capacity to receive and utilize trainings and more staff. Also, the adopted Strategy for the Protection of Persons with Disabilities, even though very good and comprehensive, may have issues in implementation due to the fact that it requires a lot of resources (e.g. in improving accessibility of public spaces, information and services) and Montenegro already has one strategic document – the Strategy for the Development of Women's Entrepreneurship – that is stalled or slowed down due to a lack of funds.

Violence against women and domestic violence component had a good impact, however it can be assessed that so far, there is not yet established a sustainable and efficient system for protection of domestic violence and violence against women survivors. In addition, new Code of Conduct is sustainable, but the level of implementation is fragile as it did not start to be implemented yet and more training and daily practicing at the local level is needed so that the authorities address the GBV properly and to actually reach solutions.

Efficiency of the political empowerment of women component was assessed as good, but the major impact was done by the launch of Women's Political Network and their engagement in the program, which had very positive effects on two other priority areas of this project – violence against women and women's entrepreneurship. Challenges for women involved in the WPN are if they will manage to remain unique and effective in their work even after the completion of the

²⁶ E.g. Women's entrepreneurship component was supposed to pilot activities only in Podgorica and Niksic, but activities were extended to four more municipalities as opportunity has arisen due to advocacy work of Women's Political Network.

project IPA 2015 when financial support for the activities is over, and whether the influence of the parties' leadership from which they come will prevail.

There is lack of political will of decision-makers in Montenegro to systematically address the issues related to economic empowerment of women or lack of funds, as already stated. That is why the women's entrepreneurship at the local level component was important and relevant, especially terms of design of the action: it demonstrates both a grass-root approach through working directly with women who want to grow their businesses and bottom-down, through the involvement of decision makers in creating more favourable conditions for the development of women's entrepreneurship. However, some problems have been recognized in sustainability and it is evident that the process of continuing activities within this component will be more effective and sustainable with the focus and support from an outside partner (like UNDP and EU).

Composition of the Steering Committee (different ministries and parliamentary committees) shows, at least declaratively, the desire and need of institutions to cooperate on actions relevant to the promotion of respect for human rights and gender equality in Montenegro. This practice, inter-sectoral and multidisciplinary - should be continued in the future, and it is desirable to transfer this type of coordination and cooperation to the local level. In order to improve the SC operation, it is recommended to include lower ranking personnel (e.g. Heads of relevant departments) in the future, instead ministers, which is the current case. Also, reports, proposals and project documentation should be sent in advance in order to allow time SC members to prepare for the discussion.

Stronger involvement of relevant NGOs and end-users in the development of plans and policies at national and / or local level contributes not only to the transparency of the work of governmental bodies, but also to better and more sustainable results generated through the implementation of those plans. There is also a need to work to further empower NGOs to monitor the implementation of laws and policies in the fields of human rights, anti-discrimination and gender equality.

It is also necessary to constantly work on strengthening the institutions and improving the competences of the employees in those institutions for consistent application of regulations and familiarization with European practices and standards. The existence of strong institutions can somewhat mitigate the consequences of potential political crises (as has already been seen, boycotting the parliament of opposition parties has led to blocking the work of certain parliamentary committees).

The project recognizes the importance of working with the media, in the context of the content of the articles, the tone and terminology used in the reporting, but some of the planned educational tool-kit for journalists and their training are still underway at the time of writing this report. Work with journalists, media and journalistic associations, including journalism schools (formal and informal) - on advancing terminology, ethical reporting, combating stereotypes and prejudices - should continue.

The involvement of international experts in various studies, analyses, processes is welcome and often inevitable. However, it is recommended to work on the development of own (Montenegrin) capacities, especially in the field of adapting policies and regulations to European standards, in the context of the EU accession process.

IPA 2015 supported different actors to lobby for further synchronization of laws and bylaws related to domestic violence with Istanbul Convention and CEDAW, supported creation of the Code of Conduct (Protocol of multisectoral approach among all relevant institutions in the cases of domestic violence), further training of public servants how to use Code of Conduct conducted by women's NGOs, and especially supported various analysis and researches related to gender equality and domestic violence that all involved stakeholders and duty bearers can make use of in their future work.

International conventions ratified by Montenegro provide good legal framework for protection from discrimination, violence against women and domestic violence and protection from trafficking in human beings. However, international standards are not directly applied by judges and prosecutors in Montenegro, as noted in reports of the Protector of Human Rights and Freedoms and practice of women's NGOs.

In 2017, agency IPSOS researched about Intimate Violence in the Family and Violence against Women. Major outcome shows that 38% of the women in the research sample experienced some form of violence at some point of their life. The same research calculated that expense of intimate partner violence cost Montenegro nine million EUR per year.

Gender advocates among women's NGOs and Women's Political Network lobbied for changes of the Law on Protection from Domestic Violence in order to synchronize it with Istanbul Convention and GREVIO Delegation recommendations and it became possible only in the fall 2019 when the Commission that will work on this Law Amendments was formed. Marital rape was included in the Criminal Code following vigorous lobbying from the Women Political Network and women CSOs.

Major sustainable outcome is agreed and adopted Code of Conduct ("Protocol") that described roles and obligations of everybody involved in the domestic violence and violence against women. Protocol is not implemented yet, witnessed by women's NGOs that work directly with violence survivors. It is important to test it, use it for a while, train public servants how to use it and based on feedback by all involved, public servants that are using it and women's NGOs representatives that monitor them, it will be possible to make adjustments and expansion of data-bases IT solutions.

Multi-disciplinary approach is not practiced equally country wide. Training of public servants (social workers, police, judges, attorneys etc.) who will implement Code of Conduct is equally important. In 2019, 100 professionals are trained how to use Code of Conduct and Law on Protection from Violence in Family. The training should continue and it is recommended to

include public servants that are higher in the hierarchy (“nacelnici odeljenja”) in the trainings, since without their support changes on institutional level are not possible.

Very good coordination among UNDP projects allowed that IPA 2015 supported Ministry of Interior to synchronize part of their data related to DV survivors and exchange it with database of Social Welfare that collects major data about DV survivors.

NGOs providing specialized support services to victims of domestic violence: Women's Rights Centre, Women's Safe House, SOS Phone for Women and Children Victims of Violence – Niksic, SOS Phone for Women and Children Victims of Violence, supported by MNE Women's Lobby and Centre for Roma Initiatives formed a coalition for monitoring CEDAW and GREVIO recommendations.

Public awareness campaigns supported by IPA 2015 had great success and a lot of attention in the media. Women's NGOs are using these activities for long time so they are professional and experienced in raising issues about gender equality and domestic violence.

Local and national budget allocation for GBV is minimal if at all. Public funding for the operation of the SOS Hotlines, and women's shelters who are under threat and in danger, is an important step that would lead to financial sustainability.

Harmful practice that does not have an adequate response from institutions is forced child marriage.

Women's Political Network is highlight of this project component and one of the most important achievements. It is necessary to ensure the work of this group in the long run, and perhaps a formal registration would be a step in this direction as this would allow the application for funds. Also, the continuation and intensification of regional and international collaboration should further strengthen WPN through the acquiring and exchange of know-how with similar initiatives in the region.

Another important achievement is the improvement of legislation by introducing a 40% quota for women. In practice so far, we have seen that even the 30% quota is hardly achievable, regardless of the existing legal framework. Not only should laws be enforced, but also awareness should be raised among all actors on the importance of quotas, as a generally accepted measure for achieving gender equality in society.

The IPA 2010 evaluation recommendation is still accurate:

“Gender sensitivity training of officials in the state administration and the ministries is also recommended especially due to the fact that the central machinery on gender equality is considered quite weak since the Department of Gender Equality only consists of four persons.”

It should be added here that it is necessary to continue the activities and training on introducing a gender perspective in the work of political parties and developing the skills for advocating gender equality in politics.

The important role of the media in these processes is evident, and this is best recognized in the extensive media analysis undertaken during this project, covering the time of the election campaign in 2016. Investing efforts in gender sensitization of journalists and media and at the same time in the presentation and public relation skills of women politicians could be a winning combination that will boost promotion of gender equality issues in the public and introduce a better and more realistic picture of women in Montenegrin society.

This program is building on the achievements and experiences of IPA 2010 and activities within this component are somewhat similar to the previous project. Never the less, substantiality is different and, at the time, unforeseen factor is the effect of the WPN work in the area of women's entrepreneurship. This group apparently can reach decision makers and influence positive developments in supporting women who want to start or grow their own businesses. Finding a way to back up WPN's activities after the end of the project could provide even greater effects in the future.

Networking of women owning or starting businesses is important on many levels. However, as stated in one of the consultant's report

"...institutions at the national and local level with its act (strategies, action plans) encourage the establishment and development of the association of women entrepreneurs and all entrepreneurs without proper research on potential interests and future benefits or long-term and sustainable solutions, as well as the criteria for such association for the beneficiaries. Satisfying a particular form is the only condition fulfilled."

In this context, this issue should be given further analysis and attention to achieve the sustainability and significant impact that such associations could have on the development of women's entrepreneurship in Montenegro.

The access to small grants for the women to apply for, is very important even though the amounts seems small. Also, encouraging and further empowering women entrepreneurs to apply for the support from IDF should be continued. So far, not many women participating in this program even considered IDF as potential source of finances for their businesses. It is also important to establish a strong monitoring system to secure the continuation of local support to women's entrepreneurship at least at the same level.

"Women from vulnerable groups - Roma and Egyptian, rural women and women with disabilities belong to category of long-term unemployed and hardly employable persons." Future actions concerning women's entrepreneurship should include these target groups as well. Maybe not just through building their capacities or advocating for dedicated budget lines, but also through exploring possibilities to find employment opportunities within existing start-ups.

Raising awareness and increasing visibility in media of female entrepreneurs by highlighting the importance related to the national and local economy and overcoming of the traditional male and female roles in society should become permanent task of relevant institutions and organisations.

Analysis, like the one conducted in Herceg Novi by IPER, about potentials for small business development are a good tool to improve existing mechanisms and measures on the local and national level. However, this particular study was missing gender perspective on the issue. The potential effects of such analysis in the future could be greater if they take into account different starting positions of women and man regarding entrepreneurship.

The training, knowledge and skills, mentorship support and access to finances for women entrepreneurs provided through this program seems extremely important. Never the less, it can also be added that “Even though women entrepreneurs develop business plan and register their business, they need continuous support with mentors, at least for one year”, as it was stressed in consultant’s report.

Currently, there is no law on Guarantee Fund in Montenegro. It is recommended to find a way to launch guarantee funds that would help sustainability of new businesses. Also, new measures should be introduced for women’s start-ups such as covering interest on loans, assisting with participation for applying for EU Structural Funds, tax exemption and other fees in the initial period of business development, etc. For example, if new entrepreneurs were exempted from paying taxes for the first two years, this would allow women starting new businesses out of the grey economy. Lobbying with the Ministry of Finance to determine the benefits for women who have just entered entrepreneurship should be initiated by the association of women entrepreneurs.

City of Podgorica has founded first business incubator to support emerging businesses. Support was provided for 15 entrepreneurship during the second cycle of the program, and within them it is only one woman entrepreneur. It is evident that initiatives like this one, should have more visibility in the public with messages targeting women with start-ups.

The Chamber of Commerce should prepare and send a guidebook to new entrepreneurs with all the information on what is available to them from incentive measures and what they will need for the first few years of the enterprise.

As already mentioned, IDF has three credit lines for women’s entrepreneurship and 34 projects were supported from these funds in 2017 with 2.4 million EUR, 39 projects with 1.2 million EUR in 2018 and 15 projects in 2019 with total of 130 000 EUR. Beneficiaries were women between 20 and 50 years of age. The recommendation is to find a way for women over the age of 50, who belong to the hard-to-employ group, to be motivated and included in support programs for entrepreneurship development.

6. List of all the Indicators of the Project and their Fulfilment

6.1 Capacity Development Support

1. Number of IPA sectorial documents gender mainstreamed (target: 4)

Result: Programme also envisaged capacity development intervention through conducting a gender mainstreaming training for the representatives from UNDP, UNICEF and OSCE, as well as staff from the EU Delegation Office, primarily project managers, which actually generated gender

mainstreaming intervention in four Operational Programs of the following EU IPA sectors: Competitiveness, Transport, Environment and Employment, Education and Social Policy.

2. Three NGOs formed M&E coalition with adopted action plan and regular coordination meeting

Result: NGOs providing specialized support services to victims of domestic violence formed a coalition for monitoring CEDAW and GREVIO recommendation: Women's Rights Centre, Women's Safe House, SOS Phone for Women and Children Victims of Violence – Nikšić, SOS Phone for Women and Children Victims of Violence, supported by MNE Women's Lobby and Centre for Roma initiatives.

3. Media reporting on human rights used as evidence based education for journalists

Result: Research on media reporting on the topics regarding human rights, anti-discrimination and gender equality was conducted by media-monitoring agency Arhimed, for the period from 01/01/2016 to 31/09/2017, covering four TV stations, four printed media and three web portals in Montenegro. Both quantitative and qualitative analysis were done. However, development of media educational toolkit is still in progress.

4. Number of communication products and media stakeholders involved in human rights and gender equality topics (targets: two communication products and 5 media stakeholders involved)

Result: Action supported the making of the TV mini-series GRUDI - family drama with documentary parts to raise awareness about the position of women in Montenegro, but also contains messages covering the overall spectre of anti-discrimination issues. In addition, almost a yearlong campaign on raising public awareness on violence against women and domestic violence was realized by with Women's Safe House under the slogan "Krenimo zajedno / Let's go together". Training for media on human rights is still pending.

5. 70% of MHMR staff trained to design and manage projects

Result: Training program was delivered in two modules: from 1st till 3rd December 2016 and second module from December 20th till December 22nd 2016. Ministry for Human and Minority Rights of Montenegro has 23 employees (2016) and according to the trainer's report, first module was attended by 8 participants, while the second module was concluded with 6 participants on the evaluation. During the training need assessment it was envisaged that maximum of the MHMR staff will attend the training due to heavy workload.

6. 50% of MHMR staff attending thematic training programs on human rights and gender equality

Result: MHMR staff is trained in gender mainstreaming, basic gender awareness training in December 2019.

7. % of professional staff in MHMR equipped with knowledge and skills in human rights and gender mainstreaming approach to programming (target 50% of MHMR staff)

Result: MHMR staff received consultancy support in evaluating previous and drafting new National Action Plan for Gender Equality, as well as bi-annual activity plan (see under 11.)

8. Ten trainers recognized by HRMA to conduct gender mainstreaming training for civil servants

Result: Not implemented.

9. Three HR innovative knowledge and awareness raising products developed by at least 2 youth groups

Result: Campaign “Krenimo zajedno / Let’s go together” raised public awareness of the right of women to life without violence and during the campaign several knowledge products were developed, promoted and distributed via social and classical media (e.g. animated video “Report violence²⁷”, promotional material with campaign messages, 5 gifs with data from the results of the research on domestic violence and violence against women).

10. HR awareness raising booklet with best practices used as knowledge product for training on human rights

Result: Not implemented.

Additional activities, which are not included in the Log Frame indicators

11. National action Plan for Gender Equality Evaluation

Result: The Program engaged the consultant in order to conduct the evaluation of the National action Plan for Gender Equality (2013-2017). Based on the evaluation and impact assessment findings, recommendations for new NAP for the period 2017-2020 were developed to support Department of Gender Equality, Ministry of Human and Minority Rights communication and coordination with other governing authorities. New NAP was drafted by the contracted consultant and adopted by the Government in March 2017.

6.2 Violence against Women and Domestic Violence

1. Prevalence of girls and women who have experienced physical or sexual violence (by an intimate partner) in the last 12 months (target: Prevalence measured within scope of program twice)

Result: IPSOS Strategic Marketing conducted a Study on Violence Against Women and Domestic Violence (2017), to establish a baseline values for this indicator. Smaller scale research will be completed at the end of the project and it will show if there are any difference in attitudes.

2. Number of reported cases of gender and sexual based violence against women and children (target: Reduced gap for at least 50% between reported cases between police and Social Welfare Centres (2019))

Result: The new Code of Conduct - Protocol on the Treatment of Violence against Women and Domestic Violence - aligns multidisciplinary work with the commitments made in the Istanbul Convention and promotes inter-institutional treatment based on past experience, with the aim

²⁷ <https://youtu.be/8ZKbl9B2Wdk>

of ensuring: 1. Implementation of the Istanbul Convention in the daily practice of institutions and organizations; 2. Exchange of data and information through information systems between relevant institutions and organizations and 3. Harmonize the methodology of data collection with relevant institutions and organizations, with the aim of establishing a single database. Code of Conduct was signed on 28/09/2018 and entered its PILOT phase. No data is available to measure a gap between reported cases between police and Social welfare Centres from 2015 and 2017. However, it is expected that exchange of data in the new database between Social Welfare Centres and Police will synchronize data collection in these two institutions and exchange will be possible in 2020.

3. Established system of monitoring of prevalence of violence against women

Result: see under 1. & 2.

4. 80% of proposed amendments to the Law on Protection from Violence in Family adopted by the Parliament

Result: Program engaged an international expert to draft amendments and to provide guidance in the practical interpretation of the provisions of the Law on Protection from violence in family that can serve for the discussion in the Parliament. Due to political tensions and hence the lack of quorum of Parliamentary Committee for Gender Equality in the year of general election, it was impossible to initiate amending of the Law through Parliament, at that time. In 2019, this Committee met twice and amendments of the Law on Protection from violence in family should be adopted in 2020.²⁸

5. In at least 50 % of reported cases assured multidisciplinary support to victims of violence

Result: see under 2.

6. At least 40 media representatives attending educational event on media reporting on human rights and violence against women and violence in family

Result: 12 journalists are trained in media reporting on human rights and violence against women and violence in family.

7. At least 300 professionals implementing the Law on Protection from Violence in Family attending tailored training program

Result: Two NGOs were engaged in training of public servants in the implementation of new Protocol and the Law on Protection from Violence in Family. Around 100 professionals are trained.

8. At least 4 case studies presented by NGOs used for monitoring institutional response to violence

Result: Not implemented.

²⁸ Sources: [Medijsko saopštenje ŽPM](#) and [Fb objava ŽPM](#)

Additional activities, which are not included in the Log Frame indicators:

9. Campaigns

Result: AD Program supported different awareness raising campaigns and events throughout the whole project period: annual event One Billion Rising, theatre performance “Sama je to trazila” / “She asked for it”, promotion of the study on violence against women and domestic violence, 16 days of activism campaign which incorporated social media campaign, school lectures and a press conference, etc.

10. Conducted research on costs of violence in family

Result: This research was part of the Study on Violence against Women and Domestic Violence conducted by IPSOS in 2017.

6.3 Political Empowerment of Women

1. Proportion of seats in the National and Local Parliaments held by women (target: At least 30% of seats occupied by women till 2019 at National and Local level Parliaments)

Result: Parliamentary elections in Montenegro are due for 2020. Never the less, it is important to stress that proportion of seats held by women in current National Assembly raised from 24% (2017) to 28% (2019) as a result of replacement of several MPs for different reasons (advancing in diplomacy, retirement).

2. Further improved National Action Plan provisions on quota for women and accompanied measures related to sanction, replacement and positioning on electoral list (target 40% of quota for women defined as goal in new NAP for GE 2017-2021 and Electoral Law (2019))

Result: Montenegro has officially adopted National Strategy for Sustainable Development until 2030, which follows the UN Agenda 2030 and one of the measures related to gender equality was determined participation of at least 40% of women in political decision-making bodies. Consequently, request for integration of the same goal and indicator in the National Action Plan for Gender Equality 2017-2021 was adopted (Strategic goal 7: Equal participation of both women and men at all levels of decision-making, objective 7.1). Women's Political Network, formed in 2017 within this project, also prepared and submitted amendments to improve electoral legislation in the same regard. Lobbying is in progress and the results are still pending.

3. All parliamentary political parties' women's groups trained in gender equality and conducted at least one political action specifically addressing gender equality

Result: Representatives of women's sections from eight parliamentary parties attended trainings in gender equality. There were nine three-days trainings in total realized, gathering up to 25 participants on following topics: gender equality and political parties, political planning for women's activism and public presentation skills. Trainings were conducted just before parliamentary elections campaign in 2016, and some of the indirect results was that about 60% of the training participants were present on the electoral party lists as candidates. In addition, some of the parties included political messages and program aimed for women voters.

4. At least 15 certified trainers for women in politics

Result: This activity is continuation of good practice from previous IPA 2010 project. Second cycle of training for trainers for women in politics gathered candidates from all parliamentary parties. After three training cycles (Jun – December 2016), trainees had the opportunity to conduct one training in pairs, as a part of certification process. During March 2017, eight trainings were conducted in pairs, gathering 162 participants from 17 municipalities. Total number of certified trainers for women in politics, as a result of this activity is 15.

5. At least 300 local women councillors in municipalities attended gender equality trainings

Result: Union of two generations of trainers was organized in April 2017 in Podgorica to address important issues concerning gender equality and women empowerment in politics. Major outcome of that event was the creation of Women's Political Network as a platform for mutual cooperation of women from different political parties, working on common goals. One of the first actions of WPN, through the support of this program, was gender equality and women's empowerment trainings for local councillors and women leaders. In total 12 trainings were delivered with 251 participants (144 were local councillors) from 20 municipalities.

6. At least one annual conference gathered regional key advocates on women's political empowerment

Result: WPN organized an event in October 2018 to present results of negotiations and advocacy campaign and announced upcoming campaign. The event was attended by over 200 officials, including the President of Montenegro, all party leaders, several ministers, MPs, activists, representatives of international community and media. Following month, UNDP project partners and WPN attended the Regional Western Balkan Forum on implementation of Istanbul convention.

7. 50% of Montenegrin media assessed from the perspective of gender sensitivity

Result: Program contracted media-monitoring agency Arhimed to assess major media in Montenegro from the perspective of gender sensitivity during 2016 and 2017 and this period also covered parliamentary election campaign. In addition, consultant (Duska Pejovic) was engaged to conduct qualitative analysis of Arhimed's research findings. The aim of the qualitative content analysis was to show whether there is a gender perspective in Montenegrin media reporting that should be applied in the media communication process. Monitoring of media covered four TV stations, four printed media and three portals.

8. 80% of Montenegrin political parties assessed from the perspective of gender equality

Result: Study attached in the previous report (2016)

9. At least one monthly (TV, radio) show broadcasted addressing the issue of gender equality concerns

Result: Examples can be found at:

<https://www.facebook.com/pg/zenskapolitickamreza/videos/>

<https://www.facebook.com/UNDP-Gender-Programme-Montenegro-134396116646047/>

10. At least 80% of women's party forums have developed gender action plans within their own parties

Result: Pending.

11. At least 2 joint actions per year by women's groups from different parties on issues of mutual concern

Result: Since its establishment in 2017, Women's Political Network representing joint efforts of women from 14 political parties (position and opposition) had several successful actions, such as: Amendments of the Criminal Law adopted, advocacy for necessary amendments to Montenegrin legislation to improve political participation of women, obtained support from different political parties for the proposed changes of electoral law, adoption of the Criminal Code regarding the compliance of the definition of rape with the Istanbul Convention, received support from four municipalities for the development of women's entrepreneurship, video communication products (video clips) for promotion of WPN and awareness raising, etc.

12. At least 3 political parties mainstreamed gender equality through political party policies, processes and practices

Result: As per interim report, during the electoral campaign in October 2016 as well as local elections in 2017, more than 5 political parties integrated gender in their electoral programs.

13. At least 20 women politicians received mentorship support from experienced politicians

Result: Mentoring was delivered with the support of WPN, where coordinators of Women's Political Network for political empowerment of women, women's entrepreneurship and violence against women would share their vast experience and knowledge in these fields with less experienced members of WPN through mutual work on different activities and initiatives.

Additional activities, which are not included in the Log Frame indicators

14. Advanced trainings for trainers for political parties

Result: Advanced training for trainers from previous generation (IPA 2010) was realized in June 2016 with the aim to further improve their skills. Focus was given to the processes of the party recruitments and women political networking. Trainers have agreed to develop Women's Political Network and to jointly work on gender equality and women's empowerment issues. Acting collectively on issues of mutual concern: 40% quota, GBV, and women's entrepreneurship.

6.4 Women's Entrepreneurship at the Local Level

1. % of actions from the Strategy on women's entrepreneurship implemented (target: At least 10% of activities of the Strategy on women's entrepreneurship implemented (2019))

Result: Actions and activities were supported through UNDP IPA 2015 project. Ministry of Economy did not invest or fundraised any resources in order to implement the Strategy.

2. Number of new support services/measures for women entrepreneurs established (target: Supported establishment of support services for women entrepreneurs in at least Niksic and Podgorica (2019))

Result: One of the areas of engagement of the WPN is women's entrepreneurship. Even though the program initially targeted only Niksic and Podgorica, WPN's advocacy work succeeded to involve more towns into this action. As a result, 7 municipalities (Podgorica, Danilovgrad, Kolasin, Bar, Budva, Ulcinj, Herceg Novi) created a special budget line for women's entrepreneurship in the first year (2018, total amount 130 000 euros) and 11 municipalities (Danilovgrad, Podgorica, Ulcinj, Bar, Budva, Herceg Novi, Mojkovac, Bijelo Polje, Pljevlja, Berane, Rozaje) in the second year (2019 total amount 144 000 euros). Currently, support services for entrepreneurs exist in the Municipality of Herceg Novi – secretariat is providing advices for entrepreneurs, in Danilovgrad - there is a business-guide service designed specifically for entrepreneurs to shorten time and increase efficiency in addressing their requirements and in the Municipality of Budva - a Citizens' Bureau, provides entrepreneurs with all the necessary information on business registration. Operational budget in Herceg Novi was 10,000EUR in 2018 and 15,000EUR in 2019, while Tivat, Kolasin and Danilovgrad implemented budgets of 10,000EUR this year.

3. At least 70 women per municipality actively involved in the training program

Result: Program engaged external consultants to provide trainings in how to set and successfully manage a business and how to improve business and network in 2017. To support this process and to mobilize interested women to start new or enhance their existing businesses, Business Women Association has been tasked to work in Niksic, while Association of Women Entrepreneurs has been tasked to work in Podgorica. In total, 69 women entrepreneurs from Podgorica and 65 women entrepreneurs from Niksic have joined education program. In Podgorica 46 women entrepreneurs attended all three training days, 11 of them attended two training days and 12 attended one training day. In Niksic 27 women entrepreneurs attended all three training days, 18 of them attended two training days and 20 of them only one training day. The set of additional trainings was carried out upon the completion of business plan development cycle, providing 15 different topics and in Podgorica none woman entrepreneur attended full set of specific trainings but 31 of them attended at least one training. In Niksic, 7 trainings were carried out and three women entrepreneurs attended each specific training and 16 of them attended at least one.

4. At least 40 women per municipality receive mentorship support

Result: In parallel to business plan consultations, contracted NGO Business start-up Centre Bar provided the service of early business diagnostic mentoring: Based on the expression of interest in Podgorica and Niksic 15 meetings with women were scheduled. After initial meeting 12 women (4 from Podgorica and 8 from Niksic) have decided to enter mentoring support. Support to women's entrepreneurship included mentoring support for women who wanted a help in finalizing their business plans and/or applying for funds in several more municipalities, besides Niksic and Podgorica, where funds were allocated for the women's entrepreneurship in a local

budget in 2018 and 2019: Herceg Novi, Tivat, Danilovgrad, Kolasin. During this second and third phase, one-on-one consultations were conducted with 43 women entrepreneurs, where 18 women have asked and received mentoring support from consultant in developing business plans, enhancing their business or filling the application form in these municipalities.

5. 80% of women from the program included in business association networks

Result: Women in Podgorica and Niksic who were included in programme joined women's business associations.

6. At least 50% of developed business plans considered by the IDF

Result: Even though only three developed business plan through support of this program was considered by the IDF and received financial support (one in Niksic and two in Podgorica), truth is that women's entrepreneurs were not ready to apply for grants with this fund. Nevertheless, results of this educational, networking and mentoring program were very good, since only in Niksic 29 women from the program developed plans for further development: started own business within the business incubator IPC Tehnopolis (4 women) or in Shopping Mall (Robna kuca NK – 6 women), one woman requested and obtained loan from Employment Biro; three women registered their own business. In Podgorica one woman asked for other financial sources – investor, two women entrepreneurs obtained loans from the Employment Agency, two women received loans from IDF, six women entrepreneurs registered the business. In Herceg Novi, Tivat, Danilovgrad, Kolasin total of 23 women received financial support from local budgets as a result of this program, so far.

7. At least 70% of programme staff from the municipalities working on women entrepreneurship included in the tailored training programme

Result: 67% in Podgorica - two staff member out of 3 from the relevant secretariat actively participated in all the programme activities and trainings. 100 % in Niksic - 5 women from the relevant secretariats included in the trainings. Trainings with public servants in municipalities of Herceg Novi, Tivat, Danilovgrad and Kolasin will take place in November and December 2019.

8. At least 10 women promoted as role models through social media communication tools

Result: Programme continued supporting the promotion and networking of women's businesses, by participating in organisation of the Women Entrepreneurship Fair in May 2018, and enabling online promotion of success stories, through the portal <http://zenski-biznis.com> In order to promote the women entrepreneurs who received the funds and their stories, IPER is engaged to interview and prepare stories to be submitted by UNDP for promotion on the mentioned website. So far, at least 18 women, beneficiaries of this program, were promoted by IPER.

Additional activities, which are not included in the Log Frame indicators

9. Assessment of local governance mainstreaming for gender equality and women's entrepreneurship empowerment

Result: Consultancy agency IPER was contracted to deliver an assessment of existing mechanisms to support women entrepreneurship in Municipality of Herceg Novi in 2018. Report provides

detailed information on business processes and procedures related to issuing permits and licenses to existing and future entrepreneurs. Also, report gives recommendation on how to improve current system. Although the assessment is useful to anyone who is looking to start or expand his or her own business in Herceg Novi, as well as to program and municipality itself, it is lacking a gender perspective.