

LUXEMBOURG
AID & DEVELOPMENT



UNITED NATIONS
KOSOVO TEAM



EVALUATION REPORT

Healthier Kosovo

Final Project Evaluation

Evaluation team:
Rozeta HAJDARI, Senior Evaluation Consultant
Gresa SEFAJ, Junior Evaluation Consultant

December 2020

Project information details

Project/outcome Information		
Project/outcome title	Healthier Kosovo	
Atlas ID		
Corporate outcome and output	<p>Outcomes:</p> <p>1) Kosovo institutions achieve more effective governance in environment and health through inclusive, evidence-based planning, implementation and monitoring of air pollution impacts on health</p> <p>2) More people adopt behaviours that are healthy and that increase resilience to potential threats from environmental pollution.</p> <p>Outputs:</p> <p>1.1) The environment and health committee (EHCo) is reformed to become an active steward of the environment and health agenda in Kosovo,</p> <p>1.2) Baseline data on environmental / air pollution impacts on health /related non-communicable diseases (NCDs) and risk exposure of most disadvantaged groups are available,</p> <p>1.3) Improved capacity on evidence-based environmental health policy-making,</p> <p>2.1) General population has increased awareness of negative impacts of air pollution on health and</p> <p>2.2) Innovative initiatives that address environmental concerns introduced and implemented</p>	
Country	Kosova	
Region	Western Balkans	
Date project document signed		
Project dates	Start	Planned end
	01.06.2018	31.12.2020
Project budget	950,076.00 EUR	
Project expenditure at the time of evaluation		
Funding source	Grand Duchy of Luxembourg	
Implementing party¹	UNDP, UNV, WHO	

¹ It is the entity that has overall responsibility for implementation of the project (award), effective use of resources and delivery of outputs in the signed project document and workplan.

Table of Contents

LIST OF ACCRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS	4
1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	6
2. INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW	6
3. DESCRIPTION OF THE INTERVENTION BEING EVALUATED	6
4. EVALUATION SCOPE AND OBJECTIVES	7
5. EVALUATION APPROACH AND METHODS	9
6. DATA ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS	11
6.1. RELEVANCE	11
6.2. EFICIENCY	15
6.3. EFFECTIVENESS	17
6.4. IMPACT	26
6.5. SUSTAINABILITY	30
6.6. PROJECT RESPONSE TO COVID CRISIS	32
6.7. CROSS CUTTING ISSUES	33
6.8. GOVERNANCE	33
7. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMENDATIONS	34
8. LESSONS LEARNED AND BEST PRACTICES	37
ANNEXES	
ANNEX 1 – ZOOM INTERVIEW MEETING SCHEDULE AND INTERVIEWEE LIST	38
ANNEX 2 – LIST OF REVIEWED DOCUMENTATION	40
ANNEX 3 – INTERVIEW QUESTIONNAIRE MATRIX	41
ANNEX 4 – ONLINE SURVEY QUESTIONNAIRE	45
ANNEX 5 – HEALTHIER KOSOVO (HK) LOGICAL (RESULTS) FRAMEWORK	53

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AA	Administrative Agent
CSO	Civil Society Organisation
ECSO	Environmental Civil Society Organisation
(EHCo)	Environment and Health Committee
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
EQ	Evaluation Questions
EU	European Union
HK	Healthier Kosovo
KCSF	Kosovar Civil Society Foundation
KHMI	Kosovo Hydro Meteorological Institute
KEPA	Kosovo Environmental Protection Agency
MESP	Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning
MoH	Ministry of Health
NIPHK	National Institute of Public Health of Kosovo
REC	Regional Environmental Center
SEA	Strategic Environmental Assessment
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNHRC	United Nations Human Rights Court
UNV	United Nations Volunteers
TOR	Terms of reference
TOC	Theory of Change
WHO	World Health Organization

Disclaimer:

This report was prepared by Rozeta Hajdari in her role of senior evaluation consultant, and supported by Gresa Sefaj in her role of junior evaluation consultant, under the review and oversight of the UNDP in Kosovo. The content, analysis and recommendation of this report, do not reflect necessarily the views of the UNDP or the United Nations' member states nor the Government of Luxembourg.

Acknowledgments

The evaluation team wishes to thank UNDP's Healthier project management and staff, as well as UNDP's programme staff for providing outstanding assistance throughout the evaluation process, including logistics and facilitation support during the online interview meetings arranged. The evaluation team appreciation goes specifically to the HK project team, namely Shkipe Deda Gjurgjeali, Enisa Serhati Elita Hajzeraj and Anton Selitaj, for their tremendous support.

The evaluators are also grateful to all interviewed stakeholders, institutional project beneficiaries, as well as to WHO and UNV implementing partners for their time and contributions to this external review.

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

UNDP Kosovo has commissioned an external evaluation team to review the Healthier Kosovo results and performance at the end of its two-year implementation period.

The evaluation entails a secondary desk review and a primary online interview meetings via zoom platform where the senior and junior evaluations consultants has interviewed all national and municipal government institution beneficiaries of HK project, as well as beneficiary CSOs. For the purpose of triangulating data an online questionnaire was delivered to all beneficiary institutions and CSOs. The respondents' turnover was 50 %. However this evaluation has been able to capture the essence and perspectives of the project and presents the key findings in this report.

2. INTRODUCTION

2.1 DESCRIPTION OF THE INTERVENTION

Healthier Kosovo (hereinafter referred to as HK) is a project funded by the Grand Duchy of Luxembourg delivered as one UN by UNDP, WHO and UNV. The project was initiated following the request for support by the government of Kosovo to strengthen its governance in environment and health through inclusive, evidence-based planning, implementation and monitoring of air pollution impacts on health.

The overall goal of the project was to contribute to the reduction of the environment-related diseases burden on population health and catalyze follow-up activities. By doing so, the project intended to contribute to the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals in Kosovo, specifically: Ensure Healthy Lives and Promote Well-being for All Ages (SDG 3), Sustainable Cities and Communities (SDG 11); and Climate Action (SDG 13).

The approach taken by the project was to effectively address environmental health by supporting a multi-stakeholder engagement in evidence-based policy making and to ensure institutional based solutions. During implementation, the project provided technical assistance and built capacity of the institutions on environment and health issues thereby accelerating the legal implementation. It worked with the public and local civil society organizations (CSOs) to raise awareness and built their capacities in advocating their concerns into policies and supported them in addressing such concerns with innovative solutions.

The project foresaw the following outcomes:

Outcome 1) Kosovo institutions achieve more effective governance in environment and health through inclusive, evidence-based planning, implementation and monitoring of air pollution impacts on health

Outcome 2) More people adopt behaviors that are healthy and increased resilience to potential threats from environmental pollution.

The project aimed to achieve the following five outputs:

1.1) The environment and health committee (EHC) is reformed to become an active steward of the environment and health agenda in Kosovo,

1.2) Baseline data on environmental / air pollution impacts on health /related non-communicable diseases (NCDs) and risk exposure of most disadvantaged groups are available,

1.3) Improved capacity on evidence-based environmental health policy-making,

2.1) General population has increased awareness of negative impacts of air pollution on health and

2.2) Innovative initiatives that address environmental concerns introduced and implemented.

The project implementation foreseen initially to end in December 2019 was extended to June 2020, with the approval of the project steering committee. The project closely worked with representatives of central government institutions in capacity building and coordination which sets an enabling environment to address the crosscutting issues of environment and health. Due to political instability e.g. elections in 2019 and the frequent changes in government, the project implementation was to a great extent affected. As a result, the institutional disengagement impacted the activities of “Healthier Kosovo”, and particularly the core activities that facilitate the institutional coordination on environmental health and lead to time extension of the project for an additional 6 months, i.e. the period from June 30, 2020 to December 31, 2020. The requested non cost extension was to allow the project to successfully achieve its goal. The additional time was to: (1) establish effective coordination in the field of environment and health at an inter-ministry level through the Environment and Health Committee (EHCo), (2) ensure full local ownership from the newly formed central government, and (3) build on the support of the policy dialogue between civil society and public institutions. These processes are expected to make a strong foundation to build on with the 2nd phase of the project.

The project implementation was also affected from the public health state of emergency since March 13, 2020 due to COVID 19, and went through the COVID emergency reprogramming and implementation during this year 2020.

3. EVALUATION SCOPE AND OBJECTIVES

The January 2018-December 2020 HK project has entered its final months of implementation, and an external final evaluation of the project has been commissioned to assess the progress of the project towards the expected results, and the achievement of the projects overall objective. The expected end date of the project was December 31, 2019. Following the request of the implementing partner and due to the delay of the implementation of activities as a result of political developments in the country, the project has been twice extended (each time by 6 months non-cost) to be implemented through December 31, 2020. The evaluation covers the period from 1 January 2018 to 15 December 2020. The final report reflects the preliminary update that will be made available by the Project Team on the results that are planned to be achieved in the final part of the project (15 December 2020 to 31 December 2020).

UNDP, UNV and WHO has commissioned a final external and independent evaluation of HKs with the following objectives:

- assess the project results against the planned activities, through the lens of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability and impact as well as the COVID emergency reprogramming, and identify if there were any unintended programme results;
- identify lessons learned; and
- make strategic and forward-looking recommendations for the further support of environment and health activities in Kosovo.

Scope of Work

The evaluation was conducted by an independent team of two consultants, comprised of a senior and junior evaluation consultants, who undertook the following activities:

- Conducted a comprehensive desk review of relevant project-related documents and UNDP evaluation policies and, based on this information,
- Submitted an inception report including a methodology tailored to the assignment, an evaluation matrix with elaborated key evaluation questions, a work plan and data collection tools to be applied during the assignment,
- Conducted online bilateral interviews with all project beneficiaries in central and municipal level, as well as with beneficiary CSOs. Due to health state emergency with COVID 19, bilateral interviews were organized via zoom platform,
- Prepared and distributed a questionnaire of the online survey to all HK project beneficiaries
- Managed an online survey with project beneficiaries, where only 50% of respondents answered.
- Analyzed and interpreted data gathered from desk review, bilateral interview zoom meetings and online survey, through chosen methodology guided by OECD DAC criteria, and developed change matrix based on expected project results.
- Organized a debriefing workshop and presented initial findings and recommendations to UN Team as well as to gather feedback expressed during the presentation
- Submitted a Final Draft Evaluation Report containing the methodology applied, findings, lessons learned and clear strategic and operational, stakeholder-specific recommendations, as well as recommendations for future similar interventions.
- Submitting a Final Evaluation Report addressing the feedback to the draft report.

Outputs

Following the approval of the evaluation methodology, the evaluation team's main deliveries include the following products:

- **Inception Report:** including a methodology tailored to the assignment, an evaluation matrix with elaborated key evaluation questions, a work plan and data collection tools to be applied during the assignment.
- **Draft Evaluation Report:** The Draft Evaluation Report (based on the structure outlined in the Terms of Reference) will be submitted to the UN team for initial review.
- **Final Evaluation Report:** the minimum structure of the Final Evaluation Report will : (i) Executive summary; (ii) Introduction; (iii) Description of the intervention being evaluated; iv) Evaluation scope and objective ; (v) Evaluation approach and methods; (vi) Data analysis (vii) Findings and conclusions; (viii) Recommendations; (ix) Lessons learned; (x) Report annexes,

The evaluation already delivered the following outputs:

- **Inception Report**
- **Bilateral interviews** with project stakeholders and project beneficiaries
- **Online survey** with project stakeholders and project beneficiaries
- **First draft evaluation report** with UN team for initial review and comments
- **Introductory debriefing meeting** with UNDP, WHO, and UNV where main findings and recommendations from first draft evaluation report were presented with follow up discussions and feedbacks.

Limitations

The scheduling of the interviews was particularly challenging due to the pandemic situation, however it was carried out with the unlimited support of the UNDP team member Ms. Elita Hajzeraj. The schedule was tight and responsive to the availability of the UN implementing partners, beneficiary institutions, CSO grantees, taking much time in data collection, and thus limiting the data analysis and report writing time. For example the interview with National Institute of Public Health and Kosovo Hydrometeorology Institute coincided with the final days of preparation of the first draft of the final report.

Additionally, due to the limited interview time in most of the cases only the main interview questions based on DAC criteria were covered. Interviews were scheduled for 30 minutes each with no breaks in between. Despite the above mentioned difficulties, the evaluation team made extra efforts to verify main findings including by sending out emails and making phone calls.

Evaluation period

- November 16 & December 17 2020

The evaluation team

- Rozeta Hajdari- Senior Evaluation Consultant
Gresa Sefaj- Junior Evaluation Consultant

4. EVALUATION APPROACH AND METHODS

Interview Questionnaire

The evaluation answered to all 15 evaluation questions proposed in evaluation inception report. These questions were defined by the Development Assistance Committee of Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD DAC) criteria (relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact, sustainability), as well as the assessment of COVID emergency project reprogramming, and identify if there were any unintended programme results. Each of the evaluation questions had 4-5 sub questions which guided the conversation with interviewees and also it helped structuring the data analysis, findings and drafting the evaluation report, accordingly.

The evaluation criteria are defined as follows:

Relevance

- ✓ The criterion 'relevance' analyses whether the project is doing the right thing. In more

detail, with this criterion examined whether the aspired objectives are in line with the needs of the target groups, as well as with the requirements from the UNDP, WHO and UNV.

Effectiveness

- ✓ This criterion is about the extent to which the project has achieved its objectives and the degree to which it has contributed to pre-defined impacts. The evaluation of the effectiveness covers both, intended and unintended results.

Efficiency

- ✓ The key issue under the criterion 'efficiency' is the question whether the resources dedicated to the project is managed diligently. . It will be examined, whether the proportion of resources provided (e.g. finances, expertise) has led to satisfactory results.

Impact

- ✓ This criterion researches whether the project contributes to the achievement of overall objectives which are not directly (at least not solely) attributable to the project.

Sustainability

- ✓ Under this criterion, the evaluation reveals whether the project results are likely to be sustainable, and whether the outputs provided by the project will be available for the target groups beyond the duration of the project.

For each of these criteria, evaluation questions with their respective sub questions were formulated during inception phase.

Online Survey

Based on the same evaluation criteria, an online survey questionnaire was developed with 31 questions and a number of sub-questions. These were 17 multiple choice questions and 14 open ended questions. The survey was disseminated to all project stakeholders and beneficiaries, in order to get a balanced view on the results achieved under the project. The evaluation team triangulated the results of the survey in combination with the desk review and interviews findings, to not only assess results to date but also reflect any lessons for follow up on similar support to the health and environment sectors.

50% of the respondents of the survey are civil society organisations whereas 25% were representatives of central and local level government respectively. Women dominated the number of respondents by 10%. 80% of the CSOs responding to the survey cover both matters related to health and environment in their scope of work. 80% of the responding organization are large with 50 to 100 members.

Evaluation Method guided by Project Expected Results (Evaluability Analysis Matrix included in the Inception Report)

As the approach taken by the project is to effectively address environmental and health issues through supporting a multi-stakeholder engagement in evidence-based policy making and to ensure institutional based solutions, the evaluation team was focused on the results of the Healthier Kosovo project.

A theory of change approach is to increase the evaluability of the project and evaluate the contribution of project activities and initiatives to effectively address environment and health issues through supporting a multi-stakeholder engagement in evidence-based policy making and to ensure institutional based solutions. The theory of change approach is based on both information gathered from the document analysis and the empirical data gathered through bilateral interviews and online survey. Considering the project implementation challenges due to political changes and instability, as we all challenges to adapt and re program during last six month extension due to COVID 19, it is very difficult to draw a theory of change model, for such short time. Therefore, the evaluation of changes made through project interventions, will focus on the results of the Healthier Kosovo project. A table matrix with evaluation questions

and results based on evaluation criteria was developed and presented in draft evaluation inception report. This matrix was adapted accordingly with evaluation questions and results has guided the data gathering and analysis based on project results and OECD DAC evaluation criteria. The results already presented in inception draft report helped operationalize the 15 main evaluation questions and developing a common understanding on how to interpret our findings accordingly with the structure of evaluation questions guided by OECD DAC criteria.

The evaluation interview questions, online survey and evaluability analysis matrix are in the document annexures 3, 4 and 5

5. DATA ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

5.1 RELEVANCE

EQ. How relevant has the Healthier Kosovo (HK) project to the current context in Kosovo, particularly the needs of target groups and beneficiaries?

5.1.1. Relevance to main beneficiaries and target groups

Numerous assessments and reports on environment and health interchangeably highlighted the impacts of environmental degradation on air quality and its impact on population's health as one of the key challenges of Kosovo. Environment and health issues overlap with many sectors (such as with urban planning, transport, economy, energy, housing, social services etc.) and can affect actions and decisions within these sectors. These actions are not considered primarily from a health perspective. Thus, institutional coordination is not only crucial on the matters of air quality monitoring and reporting, but overall for ensuring an effective environment and health treatment. Kosovo has chronically performed very poorly when cross sectorial policy action and programs are needed. This is due to lack of inter sectorial cooperation mechanisms within the government and lack of government/civil society joint actions.

The project relevance to main beneficiaries and target groups is very high. The approach taken by the HK project was to effectively address environmental health through supporting a multi-stakeholder engagement in evidence-based policy making and to ensure institutional based solutions. HK project has provided technical assistance and capacity development to the institutions relevant to environment and health issues. Main project beneficiaries of HK project are Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning, now merged into Ministry of Economy and Environment (MEE) with relevant institutions Kosovo Environment Protection Agency (KEPA) and Institute of Hydrometeorology of Kosovo (IHMK), Ministry of Health (MH), National Institute of Public Health of Kosovo (NIPHK), as well as selected civil society organizations to raise awareness through improving their capacities in watch dog role and channeling their concerns into policies.

The respondents of the survey questionnaire of this evaluation specified air pollution policy, environment, health, the right to health in life, awareness raising, and climate change and health hazards as main areas of familiarity with the project.

The survey results demonstrate that all the respondents had direct interaction with the project, with 50% of them being CSOs beneficiaries (grantees) while the remaining 50% are government beneficiaries and partner institutions. On the survey question 'How familiar are you with Healthier Kosovo project objectives and expected results?', 62.5% responded that they are aware of Healthier Kosovo project and engaged in cooperation with Healthier Kosovo project while 37.5% expressed that they are very aware of and an active participant in project

implementation. The vast majority (62.5%) of the respondents expressed that they have substantially contributed to the project design, 25% to some extent.

The HK project also worked on behavior change and community engagement in two targeted municipalities of Fushe Kosova and Obliq with the environment and health theme and engages young people to become part of solutions. Such interventions are enabling young people to become stewards of the environment, empowering their capacities, and bring them a sense of responsibility to protect the environment as active citizens.

5.1.2. Relevance in addressing key challenges and problems

Environmental conditions in Kosovo are often inadequate and lead to a high environmental burden of disease. The quality of air, in particular, is one of the biggest threats to public health. Exposure to air pollution, with concentrations of fine particulate matter (PM) with a diameter of 2.5 micrometers or less (PM_{2.5}) exceed the World Health Organization (WHO) air quality guideline value of 10 µg/m³ and the European Union (EU) limit value of 25 µg/m³. During winter periods of severe pollution in Kosovo, values of the parameter PM₁₀ have been exceeded by up to 400%. According to World Bank 2019 estimations, about 760 people die prematurely every year in Kosovo because of exposure. The estimated economic cost associated to mortality from exposure to air pollution in Kosovo is in the range of US\$160–US\$310 million, equivalent to 2.5 percent–4.7 percent of gross domestic product (GDP).

Environment and health issues are overlapping with many sectors (such as, with urban planning, transport, economy, energy, housing, social services etc.) and can be affected by many actions and decisions within these sectors that are not considered primarily from a health perspective. As such, the intensification of institutional coordination is not only crucial to the matters of air quality monitoring and reporting, but overall for ensuring an effective environment and health treatment. There is still no strong and functional institutional set up or a strategic ground coordination mechanism, which could address environment and health concerns and become an active steward of the environment and health agenda in Kosovo. In 2014 former Minister of Health Mr. Ferid Agani established an environment health committee in ministerial level, which included different departments from relevant stakeholders for environment and health, respectively key national institutes and agencies, university, municipal stakeholders, and relevant CSOs. This ministerial environment and health committee was expected to collect, analyze and provide data which were not provided by relevant health and environment institutions.

The Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning (MEE, now being reformed into the Ministry of Economy and Environment), the Environmental Protection Agency, the Hydro-meteorological Institute, National Institute of Public Health and the Municipalities, are in need to strengthen their efforts to establish an effective enforcement for the legal and physical framework, as well as sustainable and efficient monitoring and reporting mechanisms. Therefore the HK project support is very much relevant in the context of addressing the improvement of relevant health and environment institutional capacities: i) to reform the environment and health committee (EHCo) to become an active steward of the environment and health agenda in Kosovo, ii) to improve the capacities of the National Institute of Public Health to assess the impact of air pollution on health and iii) to provide technical assistance to the Kosovo Institute of Public Health and Kosovo Environment Protection Agency with its Institute of Hydrometeorology, to upgrade environmental health methods and health impact assessment focusing on the quantification of the health risks of air pollution.

Civil Society Organisations (CSO) play an important role in tackling Kosovo's environmental problems. Moreover their work is complimentary to that of the government in designing and implementing policies. In this regard the support designed for CSOs within the project is of high relevance in particular to strengthen their role and enhance their watchdog functions, as

the influence of CSOs on the processes of decision and policy-making is rather weak; and many are unable to play the watchdog role. Environment civil society organizations (ECSOs) often face difficulties when trying to access public information, and/or participate in drafting of laws, regulations as they are left uninvited. Their participation is even limited in public participation meetings, such as EIAs. Often ECSOs are invited late, and without proper information for the upcoming public participatory events. The ECSOs have identified that they need further capacity development when it comes to both, public participation, but also specific environmentally related trainings. They have identified trainings, such as, advocacy and lobbying, community organization, environmental education, as potential future training topics.

Kosovar populations is not much informed about adverse effect of air pollution on health, therefore the project relevance is with outcome 2) project activities, respectively with project organizing public awareness campaign on reducing the health risk from exposure to air pollution, building upon the successful results of the #ecokosovo3 campaign, and with organizing co-design dialogue sessions with youth (students, marginalized youth), community members and municipal authorities in selected municipalities of FushëKosova and Obiliq .

Survey results of this evaluation show that 87.5% of all respondents feel that the project has tackled to a great extent challenges and problems addressed in project documents/problem analysis while 12.5% feel that the project has substantially tackled the identified challenges and problems. While 20% of the respondents answered that the project has not taken at all their needs into account, 20% of respondents feel that their needs have been taken into account to some degree, and 60% feel that this has happened to a great extent

5.1.3 Adjustment to policies and strategic development changes

The HK project document establishes very clear references to the numerous policy and strategic priorities its proposed intervention is supporting. The project expected outcomes and activities clearly reflects the main national policies and strategies related to environment and health (law on environmental protection, law on air protection from pollution, law on health, waste, water, municipal laws etc) as well it has clear reference with national and sectorial relevant strategies and action plans on health and environment.

Health Sector Strategy (2017-2021) aiming to develop the approach of this sector in relation to the continuity of reforms in the health sector, provides an analysis of the health status of the population, an analysis of the performance of health institutions and an analysis of the opinions of citizens/patients regarding health sector services and knowledge. Based on the data analyzed, it is noted that the overall health of the population is considered good, while life expectancy is short, due to both the socio-economic situation and to environmental factors, noting a higher prevalence of respiratory diseases, widely associated to the environmental conditions in Kosovo. The Kosovo Health Sector Strategy 2017 – 2021, under the specific objective 5 (health policies for all) lists as one of its priorities “State Committee for environmental health functionalized”.

Kosovo Environmental Strategy (2013 – 2022) aims to provide answers to the present and future needs of Kosovo society and specifically addresses the environmental management obligations at national and international level. The Strategy recognizes that they state of the environment in Kosovo is poor but at the same time that enough attention is not paid to its condition. It does also state that the measures set out in this strategy will be a priority, taking into account the cost of the impact on human health, legal obligations and commitments to alignment with EU legislation based on the principles of sustainable development, following with the principles stipulated in the Law on Environmental Protection

The HK project is also relevant to the Strategy on Air Quality (2013-2022) which provides the principles and criteria for the assessment of the state of air quality, objectives and measures to protect and improve air quality, by including priority measures, activities and dynamics of the implementation of these measures; and to the Climate Change Strategy (2014-2024) and its associated plan, prepared with the support of UNDP in 2012-2013, within the framework of the SLED and SLED II projects.

5.1.4 Project revision and adaption to COVID 2020 Crisis

The Healthier Kosovo project initially was destined to end on June 30, 2020, however due to the situation caused from the COVID-19 crisis, the project team requested a no-cost extension for an additional of 6 months, covering the period from June 30, 2020 to December 31, 2020, and additionally proposed a reallocation of resources in response to the new circumstances and the emergency needs of the Kosovo health system. The request for the no-cost extension and fund reallocation was first approved from the project's donor the Government of the Grand Duchy of Luxembourg. Given the decision, Eur 200,000 of the Eur 520,000 project funds budgeted for year 2020 are reallocated to support the health institution with the equipment of the University Clinical Center Kosovo with ventilators and PPEs (personal protection) for medical staff, as well as with CPR tests donated to Kosovo Institute of Public Health. The remaining Eur 320,000 are destined for project operations and activities under each of the project core pillars, although at a significantly smaller extent.

5.1.5 Areas of relevance for future interventions

Areas for future intervention are identified by the HK project team, and the concept note is already drafted. The draft presents that that environmental health issues remain pressing issues in Kosovo, particularly in the face of COVID. The pandemic has demonstrated the close interconnections between the environment and human health due to the zoonotic origin of the virus². Initial studies have further connected air pollution to more severe COVID cases and high death rates³. In addition, the pandemic has highlighted the importance of good hygiene and sanitation practices - such as the need for improved waste management and effective cleaning in health and other public facilities - to protect human health from COVID-related waste increase. The concept is rooted in the UN Kosovo Team Socio-Economic Response Plan⁴, on the WHO Manifesto⁵ for a Healthy Recovery from COVID-19, and the UNDP 2.0 Offer efforts to build forward healthier⁶.

The evaluation team confirms that there is a need to continue supporting Kosovo in its COVID-19 recovery efforts, but also, there is a need to build on the sustainability of the first phase of Healthier Kosovo project, and therefore improve resilience towards environmental threats to public health. Main suggestions for future interventions are included in the recommendations section.

Healthier Kosovo 2 project shall build on the achievements of ongoing project, and address the most pressing environmental health issues in Kosovo.

² <https://www.who.int/docs/default-source/coronaviruse/situation-reports/20200423-sitrep-94-covid-19.pdf>

³ <https://www.ons.gov.uk/releases/airpollutionandcovid19mortalityrates>.

⁴ United Nations Kosovo Team (UNKT) Socio-Economic Response Plan (SERP), COVID-19

⁵ <https://www.who.int/news-room/feature-stories/detail/who-manifesto-for-a-healthy-recovery-from-covid-19>

⁶ <https://www.undp.org/content/undp/en/home/librarypage/hiv-aids/beyond-recovery--towards-2030.html>

EQ. Have furthering gender equality, attention to vulnerable groups and environmental considerations been mainstreamed throughout Healthier Kosovo project's implementation?

5.1.6 Relevance to addressing cross-cutting issues

Evidence exists that impacts of environmental degradation and natural hazards and disasters tend to impact women, as well as the socially more disadvantaged, more negatively and more disproportionately. Therefore, in addition to better direct health outcomes for citizens, investing in mitigation of environmental impacts has clear gender and social benefits.

The Healthier Kosovo project not only is inter sectorial in nature, but as such it has successfully identified, registered and tackled all important cross cutting issues both in its design and implementation. All project activities are well reflecting women, youth and other vulnerable groups. Such as, the HK project activities related to building capacities of environmental CSOs as well as granting them with small grant projects, has directly reached a high number of women, youth and other vulnerable target groups through different grant project initiatives, through campaigns and workshops on environmental campaigning and community mobilization, and with outdoor and community-based engagements. The reach of CSO grant projects financed by HK project enabled community to become more vibrant with initiatives of functionalizing national informal ECSO group, and actively working on important ongoing environmental threats.

Healthier Kosovo team additionally ensured more empowered youth in two pilot municipalities, Fushe Kosova and Obiliq by increasing their knowledge on how to measure air pollution and by organizing presentations on indoor air pollution, as a measure of protecting young children from the risks of exposure to indoor pollutants, which is evidenced to be more polluted than outdoor air in Kosovo.

The survey results of this evaluation show that 75% of the respondents rated as extremely relevant the project support to Civil Society Organizations working with environment and health issues, whereas 25% rated it as very relevant

To the open question "How relevant is Healthier Kosovo project support to local communities in Fushe Kosova and Obiliq to increase their awareness of negative impacts of air pollution on health?" all the respondents concur that the project is of high relevance.

5.2 EFFICIENCY

EQ. How efficient has Healthier Kosovo project work been during its implementation in central, municipal and CSO level?

5.2.1 Efficiency of project management and administrative arrangements

The implementation of the HK project is designed as a joint project with participating UN Agencies – UNDP, UNV & WHO. Joint Project activities/outputs were carried out by each UN Agency in accordance with their respective regulations, rules, directives and procedures applicable. Based on the mandate and technical capacity, each participating UN Agency was responsible for specific project outputs and activities agreed upon in the work plan under the joint implementation modality. Overall, the evaluation has found no issues with the administration being supportive to operations.

5.2.2 Efficient use of resources to achieving results

As the project implementation was twice extended- six months extension due to government changes plus six month extension during this year due to COVID emergency reprogramming and implementation until the end of 2020, the project efficiency in achieving project results was reflected.

HK project which initially was foreseen to end in December 2019 was extended to June 2020, with the approval of the project steering committee, as a consequence of political instability, elections and the frequent changes in governance. The project implementation was reflected also from the public health state of emergency since March 13, 2020 due to COVID 19, and accordingly it went through the COVID emergency reprogramming and implementation during this year.

For the above mentioned reasons for project two extensions, the project efficiency in achieving project results was reflected.

The HK project was not much efficient in use of resources for achieving project results in central level, respectively with project outcome 1) related outputs 1.1) This is due to political changes in the central government level, lack of enthusiasm from outgoing central government, as well as due to project reprogramming in response to COVID crisis. Also, some of the activities planned for Output 1.2 were not implemented, such as software development for KHMI laboratory management of data collecting and analysis, and co designing (episode 2 and episode 3) activities planned to be implemented in Obilic/Obilic.

Project efficiency relies more on project implementation activities with Output 1.3) CSOs related activities, as well as with Output 2.1) and Output 2.2) activities in municipal level and with communities.

Indeed, the project is not just about delivering CSO small grants but empowering local actors. If more support is ensured for CSOs, the intervention would impact positively good governance with active civil society and improve evidence based environmental and health policy making in national and municipal level. This would bring also a change of more people adapting behavior that are healthy and that increase resilience to potential threats from the environment pollution.

Survey results of this evaluation show that 25% of the respondents evaluate 'the support that Healthier Kosovo project gives us is exactly what we need to achieve our goals, as excellent while saying that the project managed to go beyond its original objectives, whereas 62.5% evaluated the support as very good in giving CSOs what they need to help them reach their objectives, and 12.5% feel that the project managed to support to a little extent.

To the open question "What went well and what did not go well with the support given to you/your organization by Healthier Kosovo project?" the respondents listed the ICT aspects, the study visits, the awareness raising campaigns. However, most of the CSO respondent answers relate to their implemented activities.

To the open question on 'the best practices' and 'what could be done to improve the project in terms of the ways in which it supports its project beneficiaries', the vast majority of the respondents believe that the project should be extended with its scope broadened whereas some concrete suggestion focus on capacity development, exposure to international good practices such as the ones from the study visits in Austria and Lithuania.

To another open question on the efficiency of the project and examples of efficiencies and/or inefficiencies, the respondents gave general and broad examples such as capacity building and events whereas the focused answers relate to refreshed knowledge on air quality on AQ+ software.

5.2.3. Efficiency of coordination between central, municipal and CSO level

HK project is a small team created by representatives of UNDP, WHO and UNV which team has worked on flexible and responsive manner. However, the team could not reach a satisfactory coordination between HK project activities in central, municipal and CSO level. Only one of the UN participating agency to project management team, is a field support oriented agency which pays regular visits to targeted two municipalities. Given that the diversity and important number of activities in three levels: central, municipal and CSO level, a field support oriented project management team would be more efficient, as it requires flexibility and responsiveness, in particular in relation to project activities with the two municipalities and respective communities.

The interview findings reveals that project beneficiaries in different levels are not informed for all project activities being implemented in central, municipal and CSO level. However, the project activities for capacity development implemented by UNDP and WHO, which are organized in country and in the study visits abroad, have engaged representatives from central government, local government (municipalities) and from CSOs in purpose of providing a more inclusive approach to project activities at all levels. The documents reviewed and field interviews confirms the HK project team synergies between HK activities, as same project beneficiaries and target groups were involved in different project activities in municipal and community level.

In terms of aid coordination with other donors involved in environment sector, it is noted that HK project plans to coordinate more with MCC in future for regular exchange of information and search for synergy opportunities among them and with other international stakeholders involved in environment matters.

5.3 EFFECTIVENESS

EQ. How effective has HK project been: to what extent has HK Project achieved the expected results, specific objectives, and overall objectives set forth in its original proposal (in accordance with the respective logical frameworks)?

5.3.1. Achievements and progress towards reaching project purpose and expected results

The evidence collected by the evaluation is showing good project results but also difficulties to reach expected results and respective targets, in particular project constraints are obviously related to project outcome¹.

The project has followed a three-pillar structure where the area of focus are central and local government institutions, as well as the CSOs as an important agent of change in the society.

5.3.1.1 HK Project support to Government institutions

The HK project has been focusing on laying the ground towards an effective coordination upon the committee functionalization by working on capacity building for the relevant institutions, as well as creating the ground knowledge, research and evidence for an informed advisory role of the committee.

With support to central government institutions, the project has successfully managed to raise the EHCo status, moving it from the inter-ministerial level to the Prime Minister's office. HK focused on further operationalizing EHCo, however due to political changes, the effective reach of the HK team was limited. Prime minister's resignation in July 2019 shifted away the political interests and the executive powers of the incumbent government. As such, there was no possibility to initiate official EHCo meetings and official policy discussions. Alternatively, HK team has worked closely with the representatives of relevant EHCo institutions in establishing an informal environment and health agenda in Kosovo. The representatives of the relevant institutions that participated in Healthier Kosovo activities present the institutions and which are listed in the draft TOR for EHCo (health, environment, civil society, local government) have continued cooperation with HK project team.

HK team organized two study visits with representatives of sectors in support of the EHCo committee to be functionalized. The first study visit to Lithuania, was organized by WHO, in November 2019. The purpose of this field visit was for Kosovo representatives to learn firsthand how Lithuania is implementing its National Air Pollution Reduction plan. The visit was a success and it allowed the exchange of ideas and best practices between the respective institutions of Kosovo and Lithuania, and it also served as an opportunity for Kosovo institutions to become more familiarized with the work and needs of each of the sectors presented.

In complementarity to the study visit in Lithuania, HK team organized a second study visit for 13 participants of EHCo relevant institutions. The study visit to Austria was organized by UNDP and the Austrian Environmental Agency (AEA) and followed an intensive agenda with stakeholders from central and local level of governance. The purpose of the visit was to study the cooperation between ministries and relevant institutions in the field of environment and health. The topics covered brought to the Kosovar delegation a team of renown Austrian experts on fields of environment and health including the crosscutting methodologies of the topics related health, outdoor and indoor air pollution, noise pollution, and micro plastics. The exchange further helped the participants in starting future cooperation between Kosovo public institutions and the Austrian Environment Agency.

5.3.1.2 Improved capacity on evidence-based environmental health policy-making

During the political changes of year 2019, HK team has re directed its project focus, thus intensifying the networking, organizing two highly specialized study visits in Lithuania and Austria, as well as trainings for the Kosovo National Institute of Public Health (NIPHK), Kosovo Hydro Meteorological Insitute (KHMI) and Agency of Kosovo Statistics (ASK), on assessment of air pollution impact on health. The capacities of the above mentioned two institutes and agency, to assess the impact of air pollution in the health were improved through Air Quality Index + trainings. The workshop covered the practical training on the use of the WHO Air Q+ software for quantifying the health impacts of air pollution. Official Officials from NIPHK, KHMI and ASK are given the access to continuous use of WHO Q + sotware.

This will contribute to build functional monitoring systems that monitors environmental impact on health and are in line with international standards.

However, the evaluation find out that due to HK re-programing in response to COVID 19 crisis, the project activity related to development of software for KHMI laboratory management, was not implemented. And, while WHO was initiating for transfer of funds for the development of software for NIPH, due to paperwork where Kosovo appears as per UN status, it was not convenient for NIPH to receive a transfer of funds from WHO. Therefore both softwares for KHMI and NIPHK are not developed. Instead, the project team has donated, through its

implementing partner WHO, the air sensors and samplers to measure indicators and to monitor air quality, and improve healthier learning process in classrooms of primary schools of targeted hotspot municipalities,

As indoor air pollution is a major health concern in Kosovo, WHO has also developed a methodology for analyzing school environments. This methodology has served as a guide for NIPHK to assess school environments for air pollution and other environmental risks, and this way propose interventions to respective parties to improve the situation. Further support to schools through HK project support is with instalment of air pollutant samplers for measurement of a variety of air quality parameters and air sensors to monitor air quality and improve healthier learning process in classrooms, as well as WASH assessments and air quality sampling. Such activities are of very high importance during this year health emergency or COVID 19 crisis. All HK project support to National Institute of Public Health was implemented by WHO.

The evaluation survey results shows that 37,5% respondents believe that the baseline data on environmental / air pollution impacts on health /related non-communicable diseases (NCDs) and risk exposure of most disadvantaged groups are available to a great extent, 25% substantially, 12.5% to some degree, 12.5% to a little extent and 12.5% responded that they did not have information about this.

In terms institutional capacities, 25% responded that the Kosovo Institute of Public Health and Kosovo Agency for Environment Protection upgraded environmental health methods and health impact assessment focusing on the quantification of the health risks of air pollution to a great extent, 12.5% responded substantially and 37.5% to some degree and 12.5% did not respond.

On the open ended survey question ‘what were, according to you, the main achievements and / or successful actions implemented by the project’ the respondents listed that awareness raising and CSO activism and engagement in the issues of environment and health as main achievements.

5.3.1.3 Support to civil society organizations to provide watch-dog functions in relation to the environmental pollution reduction strategies.

The evidence collected by the evaluation is showing strong results at project support activities with CSOs implemented by UNDP. ECSOs are considered as the key actors in tackling Kosovo’s environmental problems, as they can complement Kosovo institution’s work in policy implementation.

The HK project conducted an analyses to assess the capacities of ECSOs followed by the workshops with ECSOs on watch-dog functions, as well as conducting debates with ECSOs and wider public on access to information and participation in decision-making processes. The ECSOs have identified that they need further capacity development when it comes to both, public participation, but also specific environmentally related trainings. They have identified trainings such as advocacy and lobbying, community organization, environmental education, as potential future training topics.

In response, HK project has delivered five trainings on access to info and watchdog functions, six workshops/debates with CSOs, local municipalities and other stakeholders, three networking events, one-day training on social media, and three-days training and workshop on environmental campaigning and community mobilization. Each of the events brought together more than 20 representatives from CSOs covering Kosovo-wide regions.

HK project also facilitated the process of information sharing for ECSOs and wider public on decision making processes such as Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) and Strategic

Environmental Assessment (SEA). Such events organized for public and ESCOs aimed for raising their awareness and developing their capacities in channeling their concerns into policies. It is important to highlight that participating ECSOs in the projects 'capacity building activities' have initiated and established an informal network, named Kosovo Environmental Network (KEN), as they consider that their voice will be much more articulated and heard. Through UNDP workshop events and trainings, the network has developed its basic documents. This network structure includes the secretariat with two member organization in rotating leadership, and membership of 30 CSOs and 2 individuals. The network leadership is changed each year in agreement with its CSO organizations. The network is currently being led by the CSO Youth Ecological and Security Zone – EcoZ which is also a grant beneficiary of HK project.

This informal ECSOs network KEN, has taken some lobbying initiatives and as a joint voice it has supported individual initiatives from environment CSOs, as well as it has enabled the community to become more vibrant, and actively working on important ongoing environmental threats (i.e. initiative to unite against construction of a residential complex by the artificial lake of Badovc, the source of water supply for the capital and its region, etc.). As an example is the initiative of the CSO "Pishtaret" led by Ms. Shpresa Loshaj and her fellow activists have been campaigning for the rehabilitation of rivers in Decan which have seen overwhelming damage since their water started to be used to produce hydroelectric power. The organisation blamed KelKos' hydropower plants for the degradation of the rivers in the region and accused the company of operating illegally with expired environmental permits.

Moreover, KEN has initiated meetings also with green group of parliamentary deputies established during this year 2020, and is considering in near future to intensify its cooperation when with clear network mandate and roles of each member organization.

KEN is still not registered as a formal organizational structure, as its member organizations are finding it too difficult to clarify their roles and understand the network mandate.

The evaluation survey shows that 25% respondents believes that the civil society organizations including women CSOs provide watch-dog and other functions to support the implementation of environmental pollution reduction strategies to a great extent, 37.5 to some degree, 12.5% not at all and 25% did not have information.

The evaluation survey shows that 25% respondents believes that the civil society organizations including women CSOs provide watch-dog and other roles to support the implementation of environmental pollution reduction strategies to be effective to a great extent, 37.5 to some degree, 12.5% not at all and 25% did not have information.

5.3.1.4 HK grant support to Environment CSOs

In line with the assessment of the ECSOs capacities and the findings pointing to the lack of financial stability of the CSOs conducted by the HK team in 2018, UNDP awarded 6 small grants selected from the proposals received through the open call. The grants supported small project with up to 6000 euro for mobilizing communities; advocating and lobbying on the rights to live in a healthy environment; as well as for increasing awareness on negative impacts of air pollution on health. Activities under these projects have targeted women, youth and children. All project grants are completed by May 2020, while bringing multiple results at grassroot and municipal level. The project effectiveness is shown to practices of grant beneficiary CSO providing data and analysis on environmental impact in health to respective municipalities, which resulted to municipal authorities taking actions in matters related to environment and waste management. The six project grants also raised awareness of

communities in regards to environment impact in health, through information sharing, roundtables and engagement activities implemented by targeted vulnerable groups in municipalities- women, youth, and minorities.

The table in below written presents the main results of CSO grant projects funded by UNDP:

Table 1. CSO grant projects results funded by UNDP:

	CSO	Project Key Results :	Award
1	Youth Ecological and Security Zone - EcoZ	<p>Project - Empowering citizens through Information:</p> <p>EcoZ is an organization that implements activities to protect and improve environment as a valuable asset for the people of Kosovo.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - TEDx Talks with 70 young students in Fushë Kosova, Obiliq and Rahovec in purpose to inform them about environment concerns and legal violations. Students got informed that not only CSO shall delegate the legal violation in the environment, but also citizens by individual initiatives. - Prepared and launched awareness Campaigns with motivational speakers - Roundtables with decision-making in Municipality of Fushë Kosova. Obiliq and Rahovec resulted with initiative of Municipality of Obiliq to upgrade its environment impact planning document not updated since 2013 and Municipality of Rahovec proposed to integrate the educational profile of environment protection as an elective education subject for 5 and 6 grades in elementary school. 	€ 5,996
2	OJQ Ekovizioni	<p><u>Project- Effective waste management, healthy environment</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Citizens and local CSOs empowered in environmental protection through waste management activities. - Improved waste management in the municipality of Podujeva with installment of containers in town and with adoption of regulation for waste management in the municipality 	€ 5,999

3	International Business College Mitrovica	<p><u>Project - Mitrovica Environmental Forum and Research Platform:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - INFORM Online platform developed and ready to be populated with data on air quality, soil quality, water quality and EM radiation Link : http://www.ibcmitrovica.eu/inform/ - IBC-M Environment Forum established. Forum 1: 14 participants were part of the first forum held in 15th Oct 2019. Six IBC-M representatives, one IBC-M student, two representatives from GAIA NGO, one representative from GIZ, one representative of Zvecan municipality, two representatives of UN Habitat and one FTN assistant. - Forum 2 : Environmental Sustainability in Mitrovica and Region. IBC-M has organized the second forum under the “Mitrovica Environmental Forum and Research Platform” on 22nd of April, as a part of the UNDP/Healthier Kosovo Grant. Due to the situation with Covid-19 and restrictions of movement in place, it was decided for the forum to be held online, through a learning platform “BlueJeans”. Researchers involved on the project did presentations on soil measurements, water flow measurements, air quality and electromagnetic field radiation. Followed by open discussion led by prof. - IBC-M Environment and Agriculture Lab established. Lab is equipped with equipment. Link : https://www.atlas-scientific.com - Soil testing : Soil nutrient analyzer - Biolab model TPY-6A, with reagents. Link : http://www.biobase.com/ - Air quality monitoring units - 4 (four) air-quality monitoring units, measuring particulate matter PM 2.5 and PM 10, temperature and humidity in real-time, providing instant information of outdoor air quality and serve as a continuous ambient air pollution system 	€ 5,942
4	“News Agency Kosova Live”	<p><u>Project – Global Girl Media Kosova for Future Mothers:</u></p> <p>Increased knowledge and awareness among girls and women about the effects of air pollution on their health.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A total of six short educational explainer videos have been produced within the line - Activity 1: Creation of Short “Explainer Videos”. The purpose of these videos was to provide the public and especially women with tangible protective tactics against air pollution. - Two additional short explainer videos educated the public on the impact of water degradation on quality of air and life for women - A successful event held on 2019 with high attendance regarding serious issues with air pollution 	€ 6,000

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - One-day workshop with women from throughout Kosovo with the focus on inspiring them to take action and become environmental activists. - A detailed article was written to educate the public on everything the government has been and not being doing, which was then split up into a photo and text campaign and promoted on social media, as a way to enhance online public activism. <p>In the long-run, the project team believes that by educating girls and young women on key tactics they can use to improve indoor and outdoor air quality, the air quality in their surroundings may improve, as well as their health</p>	
5	“Qendra Rinore Ardhmeri a Kline”	<p><u>Project - Take care of the Environment if you want to live Healthier :</u></p> <p>Main target group of this project are young people aged 14-30 coming from the Klina city surroundings. Therefore the following results were reached :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 20 young people are educated for lobbying for the rights of health environment in Klina, through a days training courses on september 2019 - Awareness of 80 young people from four local schools for their rights how to live healthy, through four workshops in primary schools . - The regulation for the garbage penalty started to be implemented in Klina Municipality. - Promotional video : https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=MO0xzgbNFn8&feature=share&fbclid=IwAR0FIFyInDhQE-Fea1q4gwylVZ08cVrY-ay942o7OAKWaf60F1cVSTPsQQs 	€ 5,950
6	“Science for Change Kosovo”	<p>Project - The impact of air pollution on the health of pregnant women:</p> <p>Pregnant women and children understand the air pollution problems and had access to data which informed about the quality of air they breathe, and</p> <p>Citizens are informed on air quality by independent data giving them an opportunity to request more information through online channels</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Three training bootcamps with: pupils from “Naim Frasheri” primary school – Prishtina (age group 9-14 old, women and the staff from main center of family medicine in Prishtina. - Training with students from mathematical and natural science university of Prishtina. - Air pollution monitoring phase and public awareness campaign has been realized together with pupils and students. During this phase pupils and students were equipped with digital tools and together with professional 	€ 5,900

		<p>team of SfCK they have monitored air quality (pollution pm 2.5). Pupils and students have done measurements in real time in the school areas, areas around the family medicine center and in other parts of the city.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - An information booklet is available for pregnant women with air quality pollution information, effects on health and alternatives through individual activities for clean air and healthy body and mind too. 	
--	--	---	--

'Everything has gone well in terms of support from the Healthier Kosovo project, it's worth noting that the support has gone beyond our expectations, such as the exchange of experiences from environmental and health institutes in European countries'

- *Statement from beneficiary CSO*

5.3.1.5 Public Awareness Campaign

The evaluation has found the project's success with the launch of the awareness raising campaigns #ecokosovo, #ecokosovo2 and #ecokosovo3, which aim to reach larger audiences by using diverse tools for the purpose of amplifying the outreach through: social media, outdoor and community-based engagements, and the photography competition. These campaigns resulted to increase of awareness of the population on the negative impacts of air pollution on health.

HK project organized public awareness campaigns reaching general public in Kosovo in reflecting on their environment and health issues by calling for the submissions of pictures and videos on social media with a specific hashtag. This was achieved through utilizing direct outreach tools as well as an existing and unique online campaign design, using current social media services such as Facebook, Instagram and Twitter. The # ecokosovo2 campaign which built on the already successful results of the first #ecokosovo campaign conducted earlier in 2016, was implemented within a period of 1 month during the second half of October 2018 and ended by the end of November 2018. It has achieved successful results through a social media (Facebook, Instagram and Twitter) online photo and video competition on the topics of Environment and Health in Kosovo, on the topic: "How does pollution influence your every-day life in Kosovo?" There have been over 500 pictures and over 33 video submissions.

While 2019/2020 awareness camping #Ecokosovo3 - Development and implementation of an awareness campaign on reducing the health risk from exposure to outdoor air pollution, has successfully reached a larger audience, through a 9-months of activity from September 2019 to May 2020, through development and implementation of an online engagement and awareness campaign on Environment and Health, while relying on the already successful results of the first and second #ecokosovo campaigns implemented by UNDP in 2017 and 2018. It has built upon what has already been presented to the public, while continuing to facilitate the process and become a visual identity through the campaign Taglines, slogans and hashtags Kur toka flet, unë dëgjoj! When earth talks, I listen! Kad zemlja govori, ja slušam! #ecokosovo3, #llisten, #becauseIcare, #agenda2030, #globalgoals, #SDGs, #SDG3, #SDG6, #SDG11, #SDG13, #SDG14, #SDG15.

The extended period of implementation allowed for more time to explore diverse tools that amplify the reach of the campaign, including: (1) outreach through the online social media, Facebook, Instagram and Twitter; (2) direct outreach through outdoor and community based engagements, and (3) the photography competition.

Under the first (1) component of the campaign, online social media: Facebook, Instagram and Twitter were used on daily basis to deliver health protection advices related to pollution, build on the knowledge of the sources of pollution in Kosovo, and communicate the importance of a healthier environment through measures that each individual can take. The campaign is organized in monthly basis, with each month targeting one of the four specific type of pollution or pollutant. For instance, in September #ecokosovo campaign targeted indoor pollution, in October the campaign targeted transport pollution, in November and December the campaign targeted air pollution, and in the coming months the focus will be on waste management. In this purpose, WHO has adapted 5 UN videos on environment and health and has transmitted them in Albanian and Serbian in local TV stations between Sept and Dec 2020.

To boost the reach of this #ecokosovo campaign, influential public figured have accepted to volunteer in pushing forward our messages. Among the influencers, there was the former Kosovo president- Atifete Jahjaga, TV presenter – Alaudin Hamiti, Fashion Designers Krenare Rugova and Kaone, Actress Maylinda Kosumovic, and lastly the Artist Eliza Hoxha. The support of influencers has been continuous, through a call of their followers to join #ecokosovo campaign platform, but also by sharing #ecokosovo campaign's messages on ways of mitigating the impact of pollution on public health.

The photography competition with an environmental theme under the #ecokosovo name was finalized with the subject of the competition is line with the overall slogan of the campaign, with the question *'What does Earth tell you about the life we'll have tomorrow? How will our lives look if we don't take immediate action?'*

The evaluation brings it to light also another larger awareness activity delivered by HK project which is the organization of the Earth Day activities, where the HK team implemented a competition for planting trees between schools.

5.3.1.6 Community co- design/ co – creation engagement activities

Healthier Kosovo project has invested also at community empowerment and active civic engagement through community co-design /co creating engagement activities for increase awareness on environment protection and sustainability.

UNV as a lead partner with project youth activities has selected the innovative and participatory co-design methodology, where communities are not only regarded as ultimate beneficiaries of the project's interventions but also as key partners in identifying problems and solutions with the final goal of building sustainable and meaningful changes for everyone.

UNV engaged 20 student volunteers from different disciplines (architecture, design, environmental engineering, sociology, etc) were selected to implement co-design activities under facilitator's instruction. A particular emphasis during the selection process was to engage young women to enhance their skills in carrying out the phases of co-design – consequently, roughly 80% of all selected student volunteers were girls. The selected students were engaged in interactive capacity building through 3 workshops, where they got equipped with skills and knowledge to conduct field visits and carry out qualitative research interviews including defining target audiences, selecting the most suitable interview methodologies, and preparing the questionnaires before starting the explorative research in the field.

The two of most polluted cities in Kosovo* - FushëKosova and Obiliq– were selected as the key cities to implement the co-design methodology. Starting in Fushë Kosova, during the span of October 2019, the team interviewed over 650 persons from different communities in FushëKosova to identify the most pressing needs and problems, and willingness of people to partake in addressing the issues.

Episode 1: Co-design against Pollution by UNDP Kosovo - Exposure

Students increased their knowledge on how to measure air pollution – including the main pollutants PM_{2.5}, PM₁₀, NO₂, O₃, and SO₂ – as a result of a training held on the usage of air monitoring devices. Consequently, the team then checked the levels of the pollutants in the neighborhoods where they carried out the interviews in the first stage.

A visualization of this measurement was produced and made public to the general audience with the hopes to encourage citizens to make data-informed decisions and to take constructive personal and civic action.

Episode 2: Capturing and Analyzing Valuable Insights

Moreover, a co-creation workshop was organized gathering the co-design team, municipal authorities comprised of high officials in directorates of environment and urban planning, and environmental civil society organizations with the aim to translate the insights gathered from the discussions with the people of Fushe Kosova, into a set of frameworks, opportunities and solutions so called ‘design prototypes jointly with community and municipal authorities’ (respectively translate primary data gathered in the field and secondary research into solutions) 3 categories consisting of a total of 11 well-established concept ideas emerged from co-creation workshops, in the area of i) prevention air pollution; ii) waste management solutions and iii) reduction of air pollution.

When evaluating the solutions, the UNV-led co-design initiative developed criteria that ensured that all the solutions were screened by the maximum of “leave no one behind”, in other words, the solutions had to be inclusive of all communities.

Episode 3: From Ideation to Implementation: Moving from abstract thinking to real-world solutions

The same methodology was followed also in the municipality of Obiliq gathering 30 young people from all of Kosovo, who interviewed another 150 persons from communities in Obiliq and identified the most pressing needs and problems, as well as the willingness of people to partake in addressing the issues. However the second stage of activity i.e development of ideas/ design prototypes jointly with community and municipal authorities, did not happen due to COVID crisis. Instead, the resources allocated for these activities were repurposed together with other project activities – to purchase CPR tests that were donated to the Ministry of Health, particularly the Kosovo Institute of Public Health.

Of the 11 concepts developed through project activity of ‘designing prototypes jointly with community and municipal authorities’ in municipality of Fushe Kosova, 1 concept has been chosen to advance - the purchase and installation of air purifiers in schools - while the others are "on hold" which means they have not advanced to the implementation stage as a prototype. However, these concepts will help project team when they will be in the co-creation phase in other municipalities, in the future, where they can find greater application.

The Healthier Kosovo team additionally ensured more empowered youth in two pilot municipalities, Fushe Kosova and Obiliq by organizing presentations on indoor air pollution, as a measure of protecting young children from the risks of exposure to indoor pollutants, which often recorded to be more polluted than outdoor air in Kosovo.

Air Purification Devices in Schools was selected to advance and be implemented.

“Mihael Grameno” elementary school comprised of 25 classrooms and a total of over 3000 pupils, “Gezimi Yne” kindergarten comprised of 8 classrooms and 300 pupils, and “The Ideas Partnership” led kindergarten in the RAE community comprised of 3 classrooms and around 140 pupils, were set to trial air purification systems in order to determine how varying levels of air quality affects children in schools. Information has been provided on the dangers of indoor pollution and ways to avoid it, including reach to Serb and RAE majority communities. Students and teachers were additionally equipped with leaflets and informative materials.

A training on indoor air pollution was delivered to approximately 50 teachers in the three schools, aiming to develop their skills and knowledge in providing lectures to their pupils about

the importance of clean air in indoor environments. Also, the training served as a tutorial on the how to use the air purification devices.

Together with the Director of Education from the municipality of Fushe Kosova the co-design group equipped each of the schools' classrooms with air purification devices.

The survey results on the open ended question 'what were, according to you, the main achievements and / or successful actions implemented by the project' the respondents listed that awareness raising and CSO activism and engagement in the issues of environment and health as main achievements.

About the question for increasing awareness of women and men in targeted municipalities 12.5% of respondents state that the women and men in target municipalities of Fushë Kosova and Obiliq have increased awareness of adverse impacts of air pollution on health (with special focus given to most vulnerable groups effected; young girls and pregnant women) to a great extent, 37.5% substantially, 12.5% to some degree and 25% not at all.

25% responded that the innovative initiatives that address environmental concerns are introduced and implemented by young women and men, community members and municipal authorities in targeted two municipalities Obiliq and FusheKosova to a great extent, 25% substantially and 50% do not have information about this.

To the open ended question "In your opinion, is there certain aspects were Healthier Kosovo project could improve its effectiveness? Are you aware of actions or interventions that were not effective?" respondents gave a number of ideas about additional project activities that would increase the effectiveness such as: scientific research on Air Quality and Pollution; Forestation; Prevention of CO₂ emission; lobbying for bio fuelled public transportation; prevention of environment degradation and reduction of health hazards.

5.4 IMPACT

EQ.To date, what have been the intended impacts of Healthier Kosovo project to strengthening capacities of Kosovo institutions to have effective governance in environment and health with inclusive evidence based policy planning, implementation and monitoring of air pollution impacts on health (improved capacity on evidence based environmental health policy making?

5.4.1 Intended impact to strengthening capacities of Kosovo institutions

As the project' overall goal is to contribute to the reduction of the environment-related disease burden on population health and catalyze follow-up activities, regardless many good results in particular in local level – municipality, CSO, the project implementation could not achieve its best, especially in first outputs of outcome 1. The project aimed to reform and bring in function the environment and health committee (EHCo) in its role as an active steward of the environment and health agenda in Kosovo. The project has challenged to bring in function the established EHCo, due to political changes during 2019

The capacities of the National Institute of Public Health of Kosovo (NIPHK), Kosovo Hydro Meteorological Institute (KHMI) and Kosovo Agency of Statistics (ASK) to assess the impact of air pollution in the health are improved through AirQ+ trainings, with practical training on the use of the WHO AirQ+ software for quantifying the health impacts of air pollution. AirQ + software's access is provided to the above three mentioned institutions,in follow up (two officials with licence, per each institution/agency). This made a change, in particular for NIPHK

which has developed its tools for assessment of the impacts of air pollution on population health, based on WHO guidelines. NIPHK is actually assessing schools environments for air pollution and other environmental risks. Respondents in schools are filling out questionnaires developed by NIPHK. This is of very high importance during this year health emergency or COVID 19 crisis. Also, the instalment of air pollutant samplers for measurement of a variety of air quality parameters and air sensors to monitor air quality in classrooms, will improve healthier learning process of children in classrooms. Moreover the NIPHK's environmental unit is being considered to be formalized and be placed on the organogram of NIPH with additional staff. This depends on national budget limitations. As well, the software for disease classification is still not developed for NIKHP (due to paperwork issues, respectively transfer of funds from WHO to NIPHK, in which papers Kosovo appears as per UN status). Development of such software would have bring a greater project impact, as NIPHK plans are to extend its activities of measuring air quality also in households with already developed tools with clear parameters and indicators for air quality measurement.

The evaluation found out, that also the software development for the management of the laboratory processes for KHMI, which did not realize as planned from HK project (due to project response to COVID crisis), would have enabled high quality results of data provided from KHMI laboratory. The software could positively impact performance and quality control of the laboratory's work and its results. Most important, the development and good functioning of the software, and implementations of protocols for KHMI laboratory would enable KHMI to be accredited from the Agency of Accreditation in within Ministry of Trade and Industry.

The evaluation survey results states that that 25% of respondents, have answered that the project has to a great extent improved capacity of Kosovo Institute of Public Health and of Kosovo Environment Protection Agency to upgrade environmental health methods and health impact assessment focusing on the quantification of the health risks of air pollution (to support evidence-based environmental health policy-making), 37.5% answered that the capacities were improved substantially, 12.5% to some degree, 12.5% to little extent and 12.5 responded that they were not involved.

HK project also strengthened institutional capacity and build up expertise in both central and local level, and civil society to achieve effective public involvement in EIAs and SEAs. It also pointed towards identifying and using coherent instructions and best practice guidelines for an inclusive public participation and would be instrumental in increasing citizens' active participation in public meetings and consultation processes.

EQ. What has been the impact of Healthier Kosovo project to strengthening capacities of environment civil society organizations (ECSOs) to raise awareness and develop their capacities in channeling their concerns into policies (and support them in addressing such concerns with innovative solutions. To what extent have beneficiary CSOs improved their capacities to engage in governance and municipal level decision-making processes? To what extent have they enhanced their advocacy capacities?

5.4.2 Improved capacity on evidence-based environmental health policy-making.

Through UNDP capacity building workshops and trainings the HK project has built on capacities of the environmental civil society organizations (ECSOs) in Kosovo. This work has empowered environmental civil society actors in Kosovo by enabling them to better access information and act as watchdogs in the field of environment and health, and to become a stronger partner pursuing transparency and central institutions engagement with the civil society in Kosovo.

5.4.2.1 The small grant projects implemented by the six CSOs

The project impact is shown to CSO municipality strengthening cooperation with the municipalities where the CSOs have taken a complementary role in contributing to development and implementation of the municipal regulations related to environment and waste management. Some of the key highlights are as follows:

- CSO Qendra Rinore Ardhmeria with its grant project 'Take care of the Environment if you want to live Healthier' has strengthened its cooperation with Klina municipality which resulted in bringing forward the enforcement of the municipal regulation for the garbage penalties in municipality of Klina. As a result, the municipality has turned the former city park from garbage dump yard into a green park in the Dukagjini plain. Malushgan Park and the city stadium, is nowadays one of the largest and most beautiful parks in the city.
- CSO Ekovizioni with its grant project 'Effective waste management, healthy environment' provided a research report on waste management in the municipality of Besiana resulted in adopting the municipal regulation on waste management and environment protection, and placing more garbage collections bins for citizens in different suburbs of the city. Advocacy campaign activities notice a change in behavior towards environment.
- CSO Science for Change with its grant project 'The impact of air pollution on the health of pregnant women' had targeted pregnant women, children and schools and municipal health staff by conducting trainings and game activities. With presentations of environment data analysis the project has informed about impact of environment so called 'secret killers' to pregnant women, while the public awareness campaign was conducted together with pupils and students. Pupils and students were equipped with digital tools and together with professional team of Science for Change they have monitored air quality. Pupils and students have done measurements in real time in the school areas, areas around the family medicine center and in other parts of the city.
- CSO International Business College Mitrovica with its grant project 'Mitrovica Environmental Forum and Research Platform' has developed the 'INFORM Online platform' which is ready and being populated with data on air quality, soil quality, water quality and EM radiation. The platform <http://www.ibcmitrovica.eu/inform/> aims to provide accurate and credible information to citizens of Mitrovica and the region on current environmental situation and issues troubling the town, and ways to protect themselves and our environment.
- Youth Ecological and Security Zone - EcoZ with its grant project 'Empowering citizens through Information' in addition to its awareness campaign with motivational speakers, it has organized TEDx talks with 70 young students in Fushë Kosova, Obiliq and Rahovec in purpose to inform them about environment concerns and legal violations. Students were informed that not only CSO shall pursue the legal violation of the environment, but also citizens by individual initiatives. While the grant project activity of roundtables with decision-makers in Municipality of Fushë Kosova Obiliq and Rahovec, has resulted with initiative of Municipality of Obiliq to update its environment impact planning document (last updated in 2013) and the initiative with the municipality of Rahovec proposed to integrate the educational profile/subject of environment protection as an elective education subject for 5 and 6 grades in elementary school. Moreover, through UNDP activity of facilitating CSO networks, Youth Ecological and Security Zone – EcoZ is managing the secretariat of the informal network of environment CSOs (KEN) and serves as a contact point for its 30 member organizations.

- CSO New Agency Kosova Live with its grant project 'Global Firl Media Kosova for Future Mothers through short educational explainer videos has increased knowledge and awareness among girls and women about the effects of air pollution on their health and provided the public especially women with tangible protective tactics against air pollution; as well as it educated the public on the impact of water degradation on quality of air and life for women. A detailed article was written to educate the public on the responsibility of the government, which was then split up into a photo and text campaign and promoted on social media, as a way to enhance online public activism (its project outreach is 90,000 online). In the long-run, the project team believes that by educating girls and young women on key issues they can use to improve indoor and outdoor air quality, and will improve their health.

Survey results shows that 25% of respondents declared that the civil society organizations including women CSOs to provide watch-dog and other functions to support the implementation of environmental pollution reduction strategies were supported to a great extent, 25% substantially and 50% declared that they were not involved in such project activities of CSOs.

5.4.3 Project impact increased awareness of general population on adverse impacts of air pollution in health.

HK project has contributed to increasing awareness of adverse impacts of air pollutions on health and builds on the knowledge of the sources of pollution in Kosovo. For instance the #ecokosovo online campaign through social media with large outreach communicates the importance of a healthier environment through measures that each individual can take.

The survey results shows that 37.5% responded that women and men have increased awareness of adverse impacts of air pollution on health (most vulnerable groups effected; young girls and pregnant women) to a great extent, 12.5% substantial, 12/5% to some degree, 25% to little extent and 12.5% were not involved.

5.4.3.1 Innovative initiatives that address environmental concerns introduced and implemented.

HK project also built on students' knowledge on how to measure air pollution – including the main pollutants PM_{2.5}, PM₁₀, NO₂, O₃, and SO₂ – as a result of a training held on the usage of air monitoring devices. A visualization of this measurement was produced and made public to the general audience encouraging citizens to make data-informed decisions and to take constructive personal and civic action. The Healthier Kosovo project additionally ensured more empowered youth in two pilot municipalities, Fushe Kosova and Obiliq by organizing presentations on indoor air pollution, as a measure of protecting young children from the risks of exposure to indoor pollutants, which is evidenced to be more polluted than outdoor air in Kosovo, often.

HK evaluation found out that the co-design team together with municipal authorities and officials in directorates of environment and urban planning, and environmental civil society organizations have transformed the insights gathered from the discussions with the people of Fushe Kosova, into a set of frameworks, opportunities and solutions so called 'design prototypes jointly with community and municipal authorities' Together with the Director of Education from the municipality of Fushë Kosova, the co-design group of young students equipped classrooms with air purification devices in 'Mihael Grameno' primary school and 'Gezimi Ynë'. This impacts both health and qualitative learning for pupils.

The evaluation survey results shows that 25% of respondents declared that young women and men, community members and municipal authorities in selected municipalities of Fushe

Kosova and Obiliq are taking community engagement initiatives to increase awareness on environmental sustainability 'to a great extent'. 50% of respondents declared as 'substantial' 12.5% to a little extent and 12.5% were not involved.

EQ. What has been Healthier Kosovo (HK) project contribution (impact) to changes in Kosovo, particularly in relation to the areas on which UNDP, WHO and UNV works (, the implementation of key national legislation, and relevant international agendas (e.g., Sustainable Development Goals- SGD3, SDG7, SDG 8, SDG 11, SDG 13, Health 2020, the new European health policy framework?

HK project has a clear link and contribution to the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals in Kosovo, specifically: Ensure Healthy Lives and Promote Well-being for All at All Ages (SDG 3); Make Cities and Human Settlements Inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable (SDG 11); Decent Work and Economic Growth (SDG8) and Take Urgent Action to Combat Climate Change and Its impacts (SDG 13).

The implementation of the Joint Project activities/outputs is the responsibility of the participating UN Agencies (UNDP/UNV & WHO) and is being carried out by each UN Agency in accordance with their respective regulations, rules, directives and procedures applicable. Based on the mandate and technical capacity, each participating UN Agency is responsible for specific project outputs and activities agreed upon in the work plan under the joint implementation modality. Each UN agency is bringing unique expertise and experience to this multi-agency project, which is delivered as one UN and contributing to SDG Goals mentioned above.

The online survey results shows that 62.5% of the responded stated that they were familiar with the UN Development Goals (SDG) whereas 37.5% that they were not. When it comes to the question on which SDGs the project has contributed to, 62.5% of the respondents stated the project has contributed to SDG3 Ensure Healthy Lives, 12.5% to SDG8 Decent Work and Economic Growth, 12.5% to SDG11 Sustainable Cities and Communities and the remaining 12.5% to SDG 13 Climate Action.

5.5 SUSTAINABILITY

EQ. How sustainable are the changes achieved (including related to ministerial/agency, municipal, CSO and individual level)? What may be the challenges to sustainability at various levels: central, local, CSO and individual level? Follow up evidenced based planning from environment and health committee? ECSO advocacy initiatives at municipal level? More people adopting behaviors that are healthy and that increase resilience to potential threats from environment pollution?

5.5.1 Government institutions

The evaluation data analysis find out that due to political changes and COVID crisis the project could not reach much positive effect on sustainability of the project output 1.1) even though that project reached to reform the environment and health committee from ministerial technical level to government level. The evaluation's further analysis on the documents related to decisions taken for establishment of the environment health committee from Ministry of Health in year 2014 realize that more stakeholders in technical level were involved, and the mandate of the committee is not limited in time period, while the decision of the Government taken in June 2018 for the establishment of the environment health committee gives a three year

mandate with the possibility of extension. The analysis confirms the interview findings, that not all members which were part of the environment health committee established in 2014 were included in the new format of the environment health committee established in June 2018. However, further interview findings reveals that the environment and health committee established in June 2018 was not functional, due to political changes in governance and lack of enthusiasm from the outgoing government during second half of 2019.

The evaluation findings reveal that HK project has contributed to capacity building of relevant institutions, respectively National Institute of Public Health (NIPHK), Kosovo Hydro Meteorological Institute (KHMI), and Kosovo Agency of Statistics (ASK) to assess the impact of air pollution in the health and provide data on environmental/air pollution impact on health. These institutions are given an access the WHO Air Q + software. This has brought a positive effect for NIPHK which has developed its tools based on WHO methodology, with clear parameters and indicators for assessment of the impact of air pollution in health. NIPHK is actually working with schools and municipalities on assessment of air quality in school environment and is considering in near future to initiate also assessment of air quality in households where women are mostly impacted. However NIPHK would need to have also a software of disease classification which would multiply many data results for different public institutions in both central and local level. As well, the Kosovo Hydrometeorology Institute is in need to develop and install a software which would increase the quality of its laboratory performance and data results for sharing with the public, as well as ensure its accreditation.

Other challenges related to sustainability are related to the cooperation and information sharing between central, municipal and CSO level stakeholders and officials, which is a persisting problem across sectors. And, a challenge faced by the HK project was central government and municipal official turnover. HK project implementation in particular was disturbed by the governmental and municipal officials being replaced during the project implementation, and therefore often the 'I don't know' answer came out during interviews with HK project beneficiaries. However, HK project gave its bests to gather all project stakeholders in study visit tours, workshops and roundtable meetings.

Multiple project implementers and multiple number of beneficiaries at both central and local government levels as well as CSOs, created conditions of interrupted communications at times. For instance the interview findings reveals that Institute of Hydrometeorology did have the chance to be engaged with WHO training activities together with National Institute of Public Health and Kosovo Agency of Statistics, as well as in HK project awareness raising campaign, but is not much informed about HK project activities in the two target municipalities, as well as no well informed about UNV project activities with youth.

5.5.2 CSOs and Community

HK project support aimed to build on the capacities of the ESCOs through different capacity building workshops and trainings and facilitated their networking on the functions of the ESCOs, sustaining thus their willingness to continue their engagement with the Kosovo Environmental Network (KEN). In total, there were 5 trainings on access to info and watchdog functions, 6 workshops/debates with CSOs, local municipalities and other stakeholders, 3 networking events, 1 one-day training on social media, 1 three-day training and workshop on environmental campaigning and community mobilization. Each of the events brought together more than 20 representatives from CSOs covering Kosovo-wide regions. The evaluation findings from CSO interviews states that some of UNDP trainings were rather short and did not improve much in capacities of CSOs.

Positive effects related to sustainability are more promising with the HK grant beneficiary CSOs, which established their cooperation with municipalities and have initiated to work closer with municipal decision makers, in their role of bringing inputs for evidenced based policy making, in organizing public awareness roundtables in matters of environment impact in health, as well as, in engaging respective communities for more activism on environment concerning matters in Kosova in national and municipal level.

But, the interview and survey data analysis finds out that CSOs are in very much high need for financing as many open grant calls are closed down due to COVID crisis. Development cooperation interventions are more concentrated in Prishtina municipality compare to other municipalities, thus more challenges of CSOs work sustainability in municipal and community level. If more financial support will be granted to local CSO this will result with successful HK project ownership transfer to local stakeholders. Hence, sustainability of changes achieved with grant beneficiary CSOs will be ensured only with follow up financial support to CSOs which support would enable them to channel their concerns into policies in municipal and national level.

The HK project' sustainability is shown also to more people being aware about environment impact in health and therefore adopting behaviors that are healthy and that increase resilience to potential threats from environment pollution. For instance the UNDP awareness raising campaign and UNV co-design activities empowered youth, women and other vulnerable groups from communities, and brought them a sense of responsibility to protect the environment as active citizens. Information sharing, awareness raising campaign, and community engaging activities of HK project, has changed the behaviors that are healthy and that increase resilience to potential threats from environment pollution.

The survey findings reveals that 25 % of the respondents believe that the project contributed to the sustainability of its actions to a significant extent, 50% of the respondents stated to a large extent and 25% of the respondents responded not at all.

On the question 'at what extent has HK support contributed to the sustainability of your organization'? 25% of the respondents answered that the HK project has contributed to the sustainability of their organization to a significant extent, 50% to a large extent and 25% only to a small extent.

In response to 'what are the greatest needs of your organisation for the future in terms of project support are?', a scoring system 1 being least priority, and 5 being highest priority was used The top 3 priorities are as follows:

i) Need for further support through Healthier Kosovo project to improve national and local institutional capacities and public awareness on environment and health matters

Score: 4.96/5

ii) Need for more training on organisation capacity development of relevant institutions of environment and health matters

Score: 4.4/5

iii) Need for mentoring on strengthening CSO advocacy capacities in health and environment matters in national and municipal level

Score: 4.4/5

5.6 Healthier Kosovo Project Response to COVID Crisis

EQ. What are the key changes in project reprogramming as a result of COVID 19 state of emergency project reprogramming, and identify if there were any unintended programme results?

5.6.1 Key changes in project reprogramming as a result of COVID 19 state of emergency

The Healthier Kosovo project initially was destined to end in December 2019 and was extended to June 2020, with the approval of the project steering committee, as a consequence of political instability, elections and the frequent changes in governance. The requested no cost extension was to allow the project to successfully achieve its goal, which requires additional time so as to (1) establish effective coordination in the field of environment and health at an inter-ministry level through the Environment and Health Committee (EHCo), (2) ensure full local ownership from the newly formed central level authorities, and (3) build on the support of the policy dialogue between civil society and institutions.

Again, in March 2020, due to the public health measures and COVID-19 crisis, the project team requested a no-cost extension for an additional of 6 months, covering the period from June 30, 2020 to December 31, 2020, and additionally proposed a reallocation of resources in response to the new circumstances and the emergency needs of the Kosovo health system. Planned activities for this second no cost extension were: (i) technical advisory to the Ministry of Health and the Ministry of Environment and Infrastructure, (ii) technical support and strengthening of ECSOs, and (iii) finalize the co-design solution development in pilot municipalities and the environmental awareness campaign.

Reallocation of Eur 200,000.00 from the originally planned activities, to emergency support to the Kosovo health institutions response to COVID crisis resulted in cancellation of some of the project activities, respectively i) Output 1.2 activity of UNDP support to IHMK for qualitative data by developing a software for laboratory management of IHMK and HK project Output 2.2 activity (episode 2 and episode 3) of UNV Community co- designing/co-creation engagement activities in the municipality of Obiliq.

EQ. What are the key results reached during project reprogramming as a result of COVID 19 state of health emergency?

5.6.2 Key results reached during project re programming

The 200,000 Euro out of 520,000 Euro project budget for year 2020, were reallocated to respond to state of health emergency COVID 19. The project has supported the health institution with the ventilator equipment for the University Clinical Centre Kosovo, and therefore saving lives in danger from COVID 19.

Other project results include also installation of sensor for air quality measurement to classroom schools in three municipalities, and improving health and learning outcomes for the pupils in schools. A donation of PCR tests was also undertaken.

5.7 Crosscutting issues

Investing in mitigation of environmental impacts has clear gender and social benefits. Document review, interview and survey data confirms that women, youth and other vulnerable groups and communities have participated during the implementation of HK project. Even though project did not have a gender specific address, in every study tour, roundtables, trainings workshops and meetings has ensured gender equality.

Starting with Outcome 1 all project activities the evaluation noticed that there is a clear balance of women participation to study visits in Lithuania and Austria, as well as a balanced participation of women in HK activities supporting the civil society organizations to provide watchdog and other functions, to support the implementation of environmental pollution reduction strategies. HK project grant support to CSOs has high number of women, youth and other vulnerable target groups' participation through different grant project initiatives.

The evaluation also found that campaigns and workshops on environmental health and community mobilization i.e. outdoor and community-based engagements, women, youth and RAE vulnerable group were highly involved (outcome 2). Through community development activities, the Healthier Kosovo team ensured empowered youth in two pilot municipalities, Fushe Kosova and Obiliq by increasing their knowledge on how to measure air pollution and by organizing presentations on indoor air pollution, as a measure of protecting young children from the risks of exposure to indoor pollutants, which is more polluted than outdoor air in Kosovo.

The survey results shows that 75% of the respondents rated as extremely relevant the relevance of the project support to Civil Society Organizations working with environment and health issues whereas 25% respondent very relevant.

To the open ended question "How relevant is Healthier Kosovo project support to local communities in Fushe Kosova and Obiliq to increase their awareness of adverse impacts of air pollution on health?", all the respondents concurred that the project is of high relevance.

5.8 Governance

The implementation of the Joint Project activities/outputs is the responsibility of the participating UN Agencies (UNDP/UNV & WHO) and is being carried out by each UN Agency in accordance with their respective regulations, rules, directives and procedures applicable. Based on the mandate and technical capacity, each participating UN Agency is responsible for specific project outputs and activities agreed upon in the work plan under the joint implementation modality. Each UN agency is brings its unique expertise and experience to this multi-agency project, which is delivered as one UN.

WHO serves as the technical lead for this project. In this capacity, WHO contributes to technical inputs and provides quality assurance to the joint programme strategic direction. WHO continues to have a strong relationship with the Ministry of Health (MOH) and the relevant agencies and works closely with central level institutions including EHCo (with WHO efforts, currently upgraded to Prime ministry level) to strengthen their capacities to lead, coordinate, and mainstream the environment and health agenda. WHO is also working with Institute of Public Health and other relevant organizations to bringing technical expertise on assessment, quantification, and monitoring of environmental burden on health. Moreover, WHO provides technical assistance to relevant institutions and develop their capacities to enable more evidence-based policy-making in the environment and health sector.

UNDP has a longstanding partnership with MESP and KEPA. UNDP has a track record of experiences working with both central, municipal and civil society organizations as well as on public outreach campaigns. While the focus of this project is on environment, UNDP also

contributes to better governance at all levels. In doing so, it puts efforts in to institutional reform and capacities and effectively creates mechanisms within ECSOs and the public for accountability.

UNDP is also ensuring coordination with other donors and partners. Quarterly coordination meetings are held with other significant donors, including JICA, World Bank, GIZ, US embassy etc.

UNV has a proven experience working with youth and facilitate co-design dialogue with young people where they play a critical role identifying issues and formulating solutions.

The outcome of this approach is that local institutions have not been the drivers and implementers of HK project activities.

In terms of coordination of project beneficiary institutions in government and municipal level, the evaluation reveals that some of project activities are reflected due to lack of institutional coordination, and lack of information and data sharing between institutions, in particular in government level. One of the reasons why NIPHK was not able to carry out the project activity of health assessment with support of WHO, was due to lack of data available from Kosovo Institute of Hydrometeorology (IHMK). However, this is expected to be improved soon, as MCC is supporting IHMK in data management and sharing, and WHO plans to give this another try next year.

In terms of project coordination with other donor funded project, involved already with their interventions in environment sector, the project team attended donor meetings organized by MCC in purpose of information sharing on each other's activities. With this coordination it was understood that MCC will support IHMK in data management and sharing which will complement and positively result to HK project activities with NIPHK. As more donors are nowadays giving attention to the environmental degradation and its impact on health, several development partners are supporting the environment sector, including the Millennium Challenge Corporation and its implementing organization Millennium Foundation Kosovo, EU, JICA, WB, EBRD, Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA), Swiss Agency for Development Cooperation (SDC), Austrian Development Agency (ADA), and LuxDev. Taking into account these environment and health initiatives, *Healthier Kosovo 2* will put continuous efforts to ensuring complementarity and synergies with the existing and new partners.

6. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMENDATIONS

HK project team consisted by UNDP, WHO and UNV has worked hard to achieve the overall objective, but project implementation suffered from political instability, and from COVID state health emergency. There has been lack of political commitment from the 2019 outgoing government, therefore, HK team had limited access to institutions and many of the activities that involved EHCo were reflected (output 1.1).

However, HK team managed to build on capacities – through study tours in Lithuania and Austria, and through WHO trainings on Air Quality + software, of beneficiary institutions in central level, namely National Institute of Public Health (NIPHK) Hydrometeorology Institute of Kosovo (IHMK) and Agency of Kosovo Statistics (ASK). This approach is highly appreciated from these beneficiary institutions, as after visiting relevant institutions in Lithuania and Austria, they understood and clarified more on their roles and mandates.

Institutional data collection and monitoring of air quality and health impact assessment are of high importance for evidenced based policy making in national and municipal level. Both institutes are in need for software development for disease classification under the responsibility of NIPHK, and for IHMK laboratory management in need for improving quality of

data results and accreditation. This could ensure qualitative data collection, information and data sharing, and assessment of air quality and health impact assessment.

Currently health data system is flawed, as well as air monitoring data are not qualitative. NIPHK department of human ecology has already developed its tools for air quality measurement and is currently in the process of assessment of impact of air pollution on population health. This is of very high importance during this year health emergency or COVID 19 crisis. Also, the instalment of air pollutant samplers and purifiers for measurement of a variety of air quality parameters and air sensors to monitor air quality in classrooms, will improve healthier learning process of children in classrooms.

There is ongoing cooperation of NIPHK with Ministry of Health and IHMK. However, there is not much cooperation between the Agency of Environment Protection (KEPA, under which agency is IHMK) and the Ministry of Health. Information and data sharing is a key challenge between these governmental institutions.

HK project has built on capacities of the Environmental Civil Society Organizations (ECSOs) in Kosovo. This work has empowered environmental civil society actors in Kosovo by enabling them to better access information and to become a stronger partner pursuing transparency and central institutions engagement with the civil society in Kosovo. However, to enable CSOs act as watchdogs in the field of environment and health, a longer in duration and streamlined capacity development programme should be planned and delivered (one day format trainings were not sufficient).

The small HK grant projects implemented by the six beneficiary CSOs resulted in CSO municipality strengthening cooperation. The CSOs have taken a complementary role in contributing to development and implementation of the municipal environment and waste management regulations.

There is a spirit of volunteer work from CSOs in municipalities however they struggle with financial resources as donors have re programmed in response to meet the challenges of the COVID crisis.

HK project has contributed to increased awareness of adverse impacts of air pollutions on health in Kosovo. Respective success activities are #ecokosovo online campaign through social media with very high outreach. The CSO grant project implementation by UNV co-design activities with youth organized presentations on indoor air pollution, as a measure of protecting young children from the risks of exposure to indoor pollutants. Young women and men, community members and municipal authorities in selected municipalities of Fushe Kosove and Obiliq are taking assignments to increase awareness on environmental sustainability ‘

HK project intervention was implemented at three levels – national, municipal and CSO, tried to achieve good governance targets. However, cooperation between did not take place, especially, national level cooperation with municipal and CSOs stakeholders. It is very difficult to see any visible impact or change made in municipal level, regardless that HK team involved same project beneficiaries from the two target municipalities and representatives from the family medical centers, of Fushe Kosove and Obiliq. The evaluation findings revealed that officials in municipalities were changed during the HK project implementation.

Municipalities are often challenging with budget limitations, and in other side development cooperation efforts are more focused in national government level. There is a need for more development cooperation support in municipal level, especially in this difficult COVID health emergency situation, when many of calls for proposals are canceled, in response to COVID crisis.

The project timeframe was short and affected by the Covid-19 related lockdown measures, therefore so far reached results cannot ensure sustainability and impact. However, the project

was quick to re-prioritize some activities, by donating ventilators and sensors as a response to COVID health emergency.

HK project aims to reach a better coordination with other donors involved in environment sector, and therefore identify opportunities for synergy of activities tackling environment and health matters.

6.1 Organizational capacities and future needs of project beneficiaries and target groups

There is a clear need to further strengthen institutional capacity and build up expertise in both central and local level, and civil society to achieve effective public participation in environment and health issues for the best interest of the Kosovar society:

- Law enforcement with national and local level institutional governance in tackling air pollution are still weak
- National institutions - NIPHK and IHMK which supports evidence-based environmental health policymaking operate with reduced staff, limited budget resources, not fully functional in their mandate, as well as with very much undeveloped infrastructure for data collection and reporting on environmental / air pollution impacts on health. Also health information system is not functioning.
- NIPHK data collection system is in need for developing a software for disease classification;
- IHMK needs a software for its laboratory management for ensuring qualitative data and reports.
- Municipalities need to review and implement their municipal plans for environment and waste management, but are constrained by their budgetary limitations.
- CSOs need better capabilities to play their watchdog functions, policy influencing efforts, empirical research methodologies and practices, community mobilization, awareness raising campaigns, constituency building and better use of social media for advocacy purposes. It is recommended that trainings shall be in longer duration.
- While outdoor air pollution has been more addressed through various interventions in Kosovo, it is the household air pollution that is often the silent killer. Use of wood for heating and cooking needs is largely practiced in Kosovo, and it is one of the main sources of air pollution, especially in urban areas. Women and children are mostly affected from household air pollution

RECOMMENDATIONS

Healthier Kosovo future programming should prioritize on raising capacities of central and local institutions to address environment and health issues at the national policy level and specifically, through integrating environment & health policy and planning into cross cutting sectors

The following recommendations are based on evaluation findings from desk review, interviews and online survey:

- Support government institutions for law enforcement with national and local level institutional governance in tackling air pollution
- Support NIPHK meta data collection and statistical analysis by developing a software for disease classification and burden which can be interactive batched for policy making e.g. SPSS and HIS
- Support IHMK for quantitative and qualitative data by developing a software for its MIS.

- Review Government policy decisions of year 2014 and year 2018 on creating environment health committee and address inaction of the Institute of Hydrometeorology
- Review and support implementation of municipal plans for environment and waste management. Municipal plans of FushëKosova and Obiliq are not updated due to lack of financial resources.
- As CSOs cooperation with municipalities has been successful on raising their concerns about environment and waste management, the project is recommended to consider raising the capacities of local municipalities on waste management
- CSO trainings on watchdog functions and public participation efforts to be focused on rights, citizen's charter, environmental and health audits, research practices, community mobilization, awareness campaigns.
- CSOs grants for those in particular located in different municipalities that would help them display watchdog skills and/or public participation efforts in one or multiple environmental topics. Furthermore, it would also complement the trainings that the CSOs have been part of thus far, and the suggested future training modules.
- Continue with existing #ecokosovo campaign by developing new ways to engage the public, inform them and have them join a sustainable lifestyle for a cleaner environment.
- Decrease air pollution in targeted municipalities through implementing human centered design and co-designing prototype solutions that reduce air pollution
- Address household air pollution by raising institutional knowledge and capacity (through assessments, trainings), and through awareness raising campaigns with focus on women and the most vulnerable.

Additionally, the evaluation survey responses have suggested for Healthier Kosovo project to:

- Ensure sustainability of already achieved results from implemented activities,
- Broaden HK project scope of work with development of Health Information System based on health indicators for municipalities of Fushe Kosova and Obiliq.
- Sustained funding for CSOs and support Think Tanks to undertake independent research; Informal Education; Awareness Raising. Policy Influencing, Constituency Building.

LESSONS LEARNED AND BEST PRACTICES

HK project in cooperation with National Institute of Hydrometeorology and National Institute of Public Health has a great potential for success. The two representatives Prof Ass Dr and Dr. Antigona Ukëhaxhaj from NIPHK and Letafete Latifi from KHMI/KEPA/MESP are highly committed to reach success in ensuring qualitative data for air quality and air pollution impact in health. Even though they spoke individually with evaluation team via zoom platform, they expressed common concerns on adverse impact of air pollution in the Kosovar society and are very professional when it comes to strengthening cooperation between NIPHK and IHMK. Another potential for success is working with CSO grant teams who are highly motivated to work on environment and health issues even with small grant amount. CSO grant projects also motivate youth to be engaged with UNV activities.

The evaluation team agree with the following statements from interviews with HK grant beneficiaries:

'The best practice is to activate NGOs in environmental and health issues and work concretely with young people and citizens, as throughout Kosovo it is much better to work directly with citizens and young people in order to use more creative methods to approach the community in the right way to educate and raise their awareness about the environment and health'

-Statement from grant beneficiary CSO

HK project also could follow the practice of being focused i.e 2-3 main activities that can draw synergies and thus results in higher project effectiveness, sustainability and impact.

Healthier Kosovo project has responded to COVID 19 state of emergency very quickly in the fragile context of Kosovo, is in line with OECD DAC principle 9 for International Engagement in Fragile States: Act fast... But stay engaged long enough to give success a chance. This principle requires assistance to fragile state to be flexible enough to respond to changing conditions on the ground, while being of sufficient duration to enable capacity building in core institutions, which can take up to ten years or more. It also highlights the importance of aid predictability, and the importance of mitigating the destabilizing effect that aid volatility can have in fragile situations. Aid volumes vary over time as a result of political crisis, security concerns or the phasing out of humanitarian aid, but these variations are sometimes not predictable for recipients.

ANNEXES

[ANNEX 1 – ZOOM INTERVIEW MEETING SCHEDULE AND INTERVIEWEE LIST](#)

[ANNEX 2 – LIST OF REVIEWED DOCUMENTATION](#)

[ANNEX 3 – INTERVIEW QUESTIONNAIRE MATRIX](#)

[ANNEX 4 – ONLINE SURVEY QUESTIONNAIRE](#)

[ANNEX 5 – HEALTHIER KOSOVO \(HK\) LOGICAL \(RESULTS\) FRAMEWORK](#)

ANNEX 1 – ZOOM INTERVIEW MEETING SCHEDULE AND INTERVIEWEE LIST

Date	Stakeholder	Name/Position
16.11.2020	UNDP	Shkipe Deda Gjurgjeali; Enisa Serhati, Elita Hajzeraj , UNDP TEAM
17.11.2020	UNDP	Anton Selitaj, Elita Hajzeraj, UNDP TEAM
20.11.2020	WHO	Bujar Rexhepi, WHO Team
23.11.2020	UNV	Blerim Azizi, Arblin Pireva, UNV Team
26.11.2020	CSO Science for Change	Adhurim Hoxha, Director
26.11.2020	CSO Youth Centre Kline	Vitore Zefi, Director
26.11.2020	CSO Live Kosova	Annea Hapciu, Programme Manager
26.11.2020	CSO IBCM	Alfia Urazaeva, Head of Business Development Department
26.11.2020	Ministry of Health	Pashk Buzhala, Director of Operational Centre
26.11.2020	UNDP	Enisa Serhati, Project Coordinator
27.11.2020	CSO ECOZ	Egzona Shala, Director
27.11.2020	Ministry of Economy, KEPA	Afrim Berisha, Director of Directorate of the State of the Environment
30.11.2020	CSO Ekovizioni	Shpend Sopa, Director

03.12.2020	UNDP	Maria Suokko, Niels Knudsen, UNDP Management
04.12.2020	National Institute of Public Health	Antigona Ukehaxhaj, Professor
07.12.2020	Hydrometeorological Institute of Kosovo	Letafete Latifi, Project Manager

ANNEX 2 – LIST OF REVIEWED DOCUMENTATION

Title	Date	Author
UNDP SHARED FOLDER OF HL PROJECT DOCUMENTS	OCTOBER 2017	UNDP, UNV, WHO
ANNUAL PROGRESS REPORTS 1 JUNE 2018 – 31 DECEMBER 2018	MARCH 2019	UNDP, UNV, WHO
ANNUAL PROGRESS REPORTS 1 JANUARY 2019 – 31 DECEMBER 2019	JANUARY 2020	UNDP, UNV, WHO
MINUTES OF THE MEETINGS		
CONSULTANCY REPORT ON ENVIRONMENT AND HEALTH	6 NOVEMBER 2020	JUAN FERNANDEZ
WHO HIA DATA MAPPING	15 NOVEMBER 2019	ANNA PALADY
HIA DEVELOPED METHODOLOGIES		ANNA PALADY
STUDY VISIT REPORTS (AUSTRIA, LITHUANIA, GERMANY)	1 DECEMBER 2019; NOVEMBER 2019; OCTOBER 2019	UNDP, UNV, WHO
ENVIRONMENT & HEALTH IN THE LIGHT OF INTERNATIONAL & NATIONAL PROCESSES	4 DECEMBER 2019	SONJA SPIEGEL
CHEMICALS POLICY IN AUSTRIA CHALLENGES, INSTRUMENTS, PERSPECTIVES	5 DECEMBER 2019	THOMAS JAKL
REQUESTS FOR EXTENSION	APRIL 2020	UNDP, UNV, WHO
REPORTS ON ADVOCACY AND LOBBYING	6 JULY 2020	DIELL GRAZHDANI
ECSOS REPORTS	JUNE 2020	EKOVIZIONI, IBMC, KOSOVALIVE, SCIENCE FOR CHANGE, YOUTH CENTRE KLINE
SCHOOL ENVIRONMENTS SURVEY – METHODOLOGY AND TOOLS	30 DECEMBER 2019	DARIO BRDARIC
POLICY BRIEF ON AIR QUALITY AND HEALTH IN KOSOVO	5 MARCH 2019	WHO
NATIONAL AND SECTORIAL POLICIES RELATED TO HEALTH, ENVIRONMENT AND CLIMATE CHANGE	NOVEMBER 30	WEB LINKS
UN AND EU KEY STRATEGIC DOCUMENTS OF ENVIRONMENT AND CLIMATE ACTION – SDG GOALS and HORIZON 2020	NOVEMBER 30	WEB LINKS

ANNEX 3 – ZOOM INTERVIEW QUESTIONAIRE MATRIX

Nr.	Evaluation questions	Evaluation Sub questions	Criteria
1	How relevant has the Healthier Kosovo project to the current context in Kosovo, particularly the needs of target groups and beneficiaries	<p>Has the intervention been based on well informed needs assessment and context analyses?</p> <p>Was the project designed in such a way to best meet the identified needs of project main beneficiaries?</p> <p>Was the project aligned to country stated priorities?</p> <p>Did HK project tackled challenges and problems addressed in project documents/problem analysis?</p> <p>Have there been any changes in policies and strategy development, or in context changes occurred that have affected the project? If yes, have necessary revisions and adaptations been designed</p> <p>What are the areas of relevance for future interventions in the target area</p> <p>How does the project link and contribute to the Sustainable Development Goals ?</p> <p>What challenges have been faced?</p> <p>In what ways could the project improve its efforts in second phase project planning and implementation, to achieve its expected results and maximizing impact</p>	Relevance – why was the project necessary for stakeholders?
2	Have cross cutting issues (such as environment, gender equality and social standards) been duly considered/ mainstream in the project implementation and how well is this reflected in the project reports? How could they be better integrated?	<p>How important was the project intervention for the target groups and to what extent did it address their needs and interests?</p> <p>How project contributed in particular to gender mainstream and involvement of vulnerable groups- young women and men?</p> <p>Is there any evidence in project design and project reports referring to crosscutting issues (principles, standards and criteria)</p> <p>What effects are being realized in particular in terms of gender equality?</p> <p>Have women and men been distinguished in terms of participation and benefits to project activities.</p>	
3	How efficient has Healthier Kosovo (HK) project work been during its implementation in central, municipal and CSO level.	<p>Are the resources being used efficiently? How well have the various activities transformed the available resources into the intended results in terms of quantity, quality and timeliness? (in comparison to the plan</p> <p>Did project coordinate with other donor initiatives in purpose to harmonization and efficient use of resources?</p> <p>Are the management and administrative arrangements sufficient to ensure efficient implementation of the project?</p> <p>For which target groups did the project create better outcomes? If so, why?</p>	Efficiency- how well were the resources used?

		To what extent are the expected outcomes of the project realistic?	
4	How effective has HK project been: to what extent has HK achieved the expected results, specific objectives, and overall objectives set forth in its original proposal (in accordance with the respective logical frameworks)?	<p>Is the project on track to achieve its expected results How far has the collaboration with CSOs or public institutions strengthened the quality and relevance of their services?</p> <p>To what extent were local capacities in terms of individuals, CSOs or Government institutions were developed or strengthened through the project interventions?</p> <p>To what extent was the project intervention exemplary, created structures and/or had a broad effect/impact in terms of leverage (e.g. replication by target groups and organizations)?</p> <p>What challenges have been faced ? What has been done to address the potential challenges/problems ? What has been done to mitigate risks In what ways could the project improve its efforts in the second phase of the project implementation, toward achieving the expected results and maximizing impact?</p>	Impact- What was achieve?
5	To date, what have been the intended impacts of Healthier Kosovo project to strengthening capacities of Kosovo institutions to have effective governance in environment and health with inclusive evidence based policy planning, implementation and monitoring of air pollution impacts on health (improved capacity on evidence based environmental health policy making)	<p>To what extent were local capacities in terms of individuals, CSOs or Government institutions were developed or strengthened through the project interventions? (thereby accelerating the legal implementation, and raising awareness on health and environment)</p> <p>To what extent the project intervention created structures and/or had a broad effect/impact in terms of leverage (e.g. replication by target groups and organizations)?</p> <p>Is there evidence that institutional systems/mechanisms are in place which supports further capacity development at national and local level.</p> <p>To what extent were CSOs empowered to advocate and get engaged in municipal level evidenced based environmental health policy making)</p> <p>Is there evidence of long lasting desired changes, in which aspects ?</p> <p>Which positive and negative unexpected and expected effects can be observed as consequences of this project?</p>	Impact- What was achieve?
6	What has been the impact of Healthier Kosovo (HK) project to strengthening capacities of environment civil society		

	<p>organisations (ECOs) to raise awareness and develop their capacities in channelling their concerns into policies (and support them in addressing such concerns with innovative solutions. To what extent have members improved their capacities to engage in governance and municipal level decision-making processes? To what extent have they enhanced their advocacy capacities?</p>		
7	<p>What has been Healthier Kosovo project contribution (impact) to changes in Kosovo, particularly in relation to the areas on which UNDP, WHO and UNV works (, the implementation of key national legislation, and relevant international agendas (e.g., Sustainable Development Goals-SDG3, SDG7, SDG 8, SDG 11, SDG 13, UNSCR 1325, Health 2020, and the new European health policy framework). Documentation of best practices and examples are welcome.</p>		

8	<p>How sustainable are the changes achieved (including related to ministerial/agency, municipal, CSO and individual level)? What may be the challenges to sustainability at various levels: central, local, CSO and individual level? Follow up evidenced based planning from environment and health committee? ECSO advocacy initiatives at municipal level? More people adopting behaviours that are healthy and that increase resilience to potential threats from environment pollution?</p>	<p>To what extent was the concept of sustainability addressed in the selection, design planning and implementation of project activities? How is the project stimulating sustainability of its results and impacts (i.e. strengthened capacities, continuity of use of knowledge, improved practices, etc.)? How likely will the intervention be continued or scaled up by counterparts in the Government and CSOs in time span of the next 3-5 years?</p> <p>To what extent is/are the target group(s) capable and prepared to sustain the positive effects of the intervention or even scale up without further support of UN Agencies, especially in the light of the COVID-19 pandemic?</p> <p>In how far have the experiences of the project supported by UN been integrated and/or replicated in other projects funded by other donors? How can the cooperation between the projects be assessed?</p> <p>Are there any jeopardizing aspects that have not been considered or abated by the project actions ? In case of sustainability risks, were sufficient mitigation measures proposed ?</p>	<p>Sustainability- What will be left after the funding stops?</p>
9	<p>What are the organizational capacity strengths and challenges faced by Healthier Kosovo project beneficiaries and target groups?</p>		<p>Organizational capacity strengths and challenges of Healthier Kosovo project beneficiaries and target groups</p>
10	<p>What recommendations can evaluators give for strengthening capacities of target groups and beneficiaries of Healthier Kosovo project</p>		
11	<p>What are the key changes in project reprogramming as a result of COVID 19 state of emergency project reprogramming, and</p>		<p>COVID emergency project reprogramming</p>

	identify if there were any unintended programme results.		
12	What are the key results reached during project reprogramming as a result of COVID 19 state of emergency		
13	What are the best practices and what could be done to improve the Healthier Kosovo project in terms of the ways in which it supports its project beneficiaries and targeted groups?		Recommendations
14	What are the greatest needs of the target groups for the future in terms of Healthier Project support?		
15	What recommendations do evaluators have for Healthier Kosovo project as it moves into its second phase planning process related to future objectives and approaches?		

ANNEX 4- ONLINE SURVEY QUESTIONNAIRE

TRANSLATION NEEDED

UNDP
External evaluation of the Healthier Kosovo Project

Online survey

This survey is part of the External Evaluation of the Healthier Kosovo Project, implemented by UNDP Kosovo, United Nations Volunteers (UNV) and World Health Organization (WHO) funded by the Government of Luxembourg

The main purpose of the final evaluation is to review and assess the relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, and – to the extent possible and meaningful – the impact and sustainability – of the results achieved under the Healthier Kosovo project until now, and make strategic recommendations for future decision making in the area of environment and health both for participating UN agencies and project stakeholders.

We kindly ask you to participate in this survey, whose results will help considerably the evaluation and the promotion of good practices and lessons learned by Healthier Kosovo Project.

It will only take a few minutes to complete the questionnaire. Any information provided in this survey is confidential and anonymous.

Thank you very much in advance for your participation!

About you

1. You are (please mark what is applicable):
 - a. a civil servant or official employed by Kosovo Government/ Agency
 - b. a civil servant or official employed by the municipality (please specify which municipality
 - c. a representative from CSO beneficiary of Healthier Kosovo Project
 - d. other (please specify_____)

2. What is your Gender
 Man Woman

3. You are:
 - a. Albanian
 - b. Serb
 - c. Goran
 - d. Roma
 - e. Other

4. If you are a representative of CSO, do you work on: (please select all that apply)?
 - a. Environment related issues

- b. Health related issues
- c. The interests of vulnerable groups – women, youth, minorities. If yes, which one (please specify_____)

5. Trigger question – if a or b under question 6: how many members does your organisation have?

- a. Less than 10 members
- b. 10-50 members
- c. 50-100 members

Relevance

6. Have you interacted with Healthier Kosovo Project?

Yes No

7. If yes, you have interacted with Healthier Kosovo Project, as:

- a. Staff engaged in the project
- b. Beneficiary Government/Agency
- c. Beneficiary Municipality
- d. Beneficiary CSOs
- e. Partner

8. Other (please specify_____)

9. Are you familiar with Healthier Kosovo project objectives and expected results?

- a. I am very aware of and an active participant in project implementation
- b. I am aware of Healthier Kosovo project and engaged in cooperation with Healthier Kosovo project.
- c. I am a bit aware – I have heard a few times about Healthier Kosovo project, but not engaged in cooperation with this project.
- d. I am not aware at all of Healthier Kosovo Project

10. If yes, please specify main areas you are familiar with Healthier Kosovo Project?

- i)
- ii)
- iii)
- iv)

11. To what extent have you had an opportunity to participate/contribute to the design of the Healthier Kosovo Project or Healthier Kosovo Project specific actions?

- a. to a great extent
- b. substantially
- c. to some degree
- d. to little extent
- e. not at all
- f. I don't know

12. To what extent have Healthier Kosovo project tackled challenges and problems addressed in project documents/problem analysis?

- a. to a great extent
- b. substantially
- c. to some degree
- d. to little extent
- e. not at all
- f. I don't know

13. To what extent do you feel that your needs were taken into account by Healthier Kosovo Project?

- a. to a great extent
- b. substantially
- c. to some degree
- d. to little extent
- e. not at all

14. Are you familiar with UN Development Goals (SDG)?

- Yes No

15. If yes, to which following SDGs the project has contributed?

- a. Ensure Healthy Lives and Promote Well-being for All Ages (SDG3)
- b. Achieving Affordable and Clean Energy (SDG 7)
- c. Decent Work and Economic Growth (SDG8)
- d. Sustainable Cities and Communities (SDG 11)
- e. Climate Action (SDG13)

16. How relevant is Healthier Kosovo project support to Civil Society Organizations working with environment and health issues? (from 1 to 5)

- 5 – Extremely relevant
- 4 – Very relevant
- 3 – Somewhat relevant
- 2 - Not particularly relevant
- 1 - Completely irrelevant

17. How relevant is Healthier Kosovo project support to local communities in Fushe Kosova and Obiliq to increase their awareness of negative impacts of air pollution on health? Please describe:

Effectiveness

18. What were, according to you, the main achievements and / or successful actions implemented by the Healthier Kosovo Project?

19. To what extent did Healthier Kosovo project achieve the following, in your assessment:

The environment and health committee (EHCo) is reformed to become an active steward of the environment and health agenda in Kosovo.

- a. to a great extent
- b. substantially
- c. to some degree
- d. to little extent
- e. not at all
- f. I don't know / I don't have information about this

Baseline data on environmental / air pollution impacts on health /related non-communicable diseases (NCDs) and risk exposure of most disadvantaged groups are available

- a. to a great extent
- b. substantially
- c. to some degree
- d. to little extent
- e. not at all
- f. I don't know / don't have information about this

Kosovo Institute of Public Health and Kosovo Agency for Environment Protection upgraded environmental health methods and health impact assessment focusing on the quantification of the health risks of air pollution.

- a. to a great extent
- b. substantially
- c. to some degree
- d. to little extent
- e. not at all
- f. I don't know / don't have information about this

Civil society organizations including women CSOs provide watch-dog and other functions to support the implementation of environmental pollution reduction strategies.

- a. to a great extent
- b. substantially
- c. to some degree
- d. to little extent
- e. not at all
- f. I don't know / don't have information about this

Women and men in target municipalities of Fushe Kosova and Obiliq has increased awareness of negative impacts of air pollution on health (with special focus given to most vulnerable groups effected; young girls and pregnant women)

- a. to a great extent
- b. substantially
- c. to some degree
- d. to little extent
- e. not at all
- f. I don't know / don't have information about this

Innovative initiatives that address environmental concerns are introduced and implemented from young women and men, community members and municipal authorities in targeted two municipalities Obiliq and FusheKosova

- a. to a great extent
- b. substantially
- c. to some degree
- d. to little extent
- e. not at all
- f. I don't know / don't have information about this

20. In your opinion, is there certain aspects were Healthier Kosovo project could improve its effectiveness? Are you aware or some actions or interventions that were not effective?

Efficiency

21. How would you evaluate the way Healthier Kosovo project supported you/your organization?
- a. excellent – the support that Healthier Kosovo project gives us is exactly what we need to achieve our goals, we managed to go beyond our original objectives.
 - b. very good – the support that Healthier Kosovo project gives us is what we need to help us reaching our objectives.
 - c. to some degree – the support that Healthier Kosovo project gives us helped us reaching our objectives but the management of the support was time consuming.
 - d. to little extent – the support that Healthier Kosovo project gives us helped us reaching our objectives but it was not always easy to manage.
 - e. not at all. The support that Healthier Kosovo gives us does not help us because it is too difficult to get, to manage, and/or to report on.

22. What went well and what did not go well with the support given to you/your organization by Healthier Kosovo project?

23. What are the best practices and what could be done to improve the Healthier Kosovo project in terms of the ways in which it supports its project beneficiaries –

Government institutions, municipalities and municipal communities, CSOs active with environment and health matters?

24. How efficient would you say Healthier Kosovo project is in its work? What examples would you give of efficiencies and/or inefficiencies?

Impact

25. To which extent did Healthier Kosovo project support to the environment and health committee (EHCo) have built institutional capacities for better coordination across different sectors, for policy implementation in environment and health.

- a. to a great extent
- b. substantially
- c. to some degree
- d. to little extent
- e. not at all
- f. I was not involved

Improved capacity of Kosovo Institute of Public Health and of Kosovo Environment Protection Agency to upgrade environmental health methods and health impact assessment focusing on the quantification of the health risks of air pollution (to support evidence-based environmental health policy-making)

- a. to a great extent
- b. substantially
- c. to some degree
- d. to little extent
- e. not at all
- f. I was not involved

Civil society organizations including women CSOs to provide watch-dog and other functions to support the implementation of environmental pollution reduction strategies.

- a. to a great extent
- b. substantially
- c. to some degree
- d. to little extent
- e. not at all
- f. I was not involved

Women and men has increased awareness of negative impacts of air pollution on health (most vulnerable groups effected; young girls and pregnant women)

- a. to a great extent
- b. substantially
- c. to some degree
- d. to little extent
- e. not at all
- f. I was not involved

Young women and men, community members and municipal authorities in selected municipalities of Fushe Kosove and Obiliq are taking engagement initiatives to increase awareness on environmental sustainability

- a. to a great extent
- b. substantially
- c. to some degree
- d. to little extent
- e. not at all
- f. I do not know/ I was not involved

Sustainability

26. To what extent has Healthier Kosovo project support contributed to the sustainability of its actions?

- a. To a significant extent
- a. To a large extent
- b. Somewhat
- c. Only to a small extent
- d. Not at all

27. To what extent has Healthier Kosovo project support contributed to the sustainability of your organization?

- b. To a significant extent
- e. To a large extent
- f. Somewhat
- g. Only to a small extent
- h. Not at all

28. What are the greatest needs of your organisation for the future in terms of KWN support? (1 being least priority, and 5 being highest priority) :

iv) Need for further support through Healthier Kosovo project to improve national and local institutional capacities and public awareness on environment and health matters

1 2 3 4 5

v) Need for more training on organisation capacity development of relevant institutions of environment and health matters

1 2 3 4 5

vi) Need for mentoring on strengthening CSO advocacy capacities in health and environment matters in national and municipal level

1 2 3 4 5

Recommendations

29. What are the institutional/organizational capacity strengths and challenges faced by Healthier Kosovo project beneficiaries and target groups (i.e. Government structures/agencies, municipalities, CSOs active in environment and health matters)?
30. What are the greatest needs of the target municipalities and target communities of Fushe Kosove and Obiliq for the future in terms of Healthier Project support?
31. What are the greatest needs of the target CSOs active in health and environment for the future in terms of Healthier Project support?
32. What recommendations do you have for Healthier Kosovo future programming? What do you think should be prioritized there?

Thank you very much for your participation and support!

ANNEX 5 – HEALTHIER KOSOVO RESULTS AND RESOURCES FRAMEWORK

Outcome 1: Kosovo institutions have effective governance in environment and health with inclusive evidence-based planning, implementation and monitoring of air pollution impacts on health
 Outcome 2: More people adopt behaviors that are healthy and that increase resilience to potential threats from environmental pollution.

Outcome level indicators, baselines and targets:
 Indicator 1.1: Number of functional monitoring systems that monitor impact of environment on health.
 Baseline 1.1: 0 (August 2017)
 Target 1.1: At least one functional monitoring systems that monitors environmental impact on health and are in line with international standards by the end of the project.

Indicator 2.1: Percentage of public who consider the environment to be unhealthy, disaggregated by sex and ethnicity
 Baseline 2.1: 43.01% of the public consider environmental conditions in Kosovo to be unhealthy (women: 40.78%, men: 45.90%, Albanian: 42.30%, Serb: 63.81%, others: 42%, August 2017).
 Target 2.1: 58% of public consider environmental conditions in Kosovo to be unhealthy (women: 55%, men: 60%, Albanian: 47%, Serb: 70%, others: 57%) by the end of the project.

Project title and ID (ATLAS Award ID): Healthier Kosovo

Outcome 1: Kosovo institutions have effective governance in environment and health with inclusive evidence-based planning, implementation and monitoring of air pollution impacts on health

INTENDED OUTPUTS	INDICATIVE ACTIVITIES	RESPONSIBLE PARTIES	INPUTS (EUR)
Output 1.1: The environment and health committee (EHCo) is reformed to become an active steward of the environment and health agenda in Kosovo.			
<p>Indicator 1.1.1: Number of effective decision taken by EHCo at each quarterly meeting.</p> <p>Baseline 1.1.1: No decision has been taken (August 2017).</p> <p>Target 1.1.1: 4 decision taken by the end of project.</p>	<p>Activity 1.1.1: Provide technical assistance to EHCo for better coordination across different sectors.</p> <p>Activity 1.1.2: Support EHCo for policy implementation in environment and health.</p> <p>Activity 1.1.3:</p>	<p>UNDP / Contributing WHO / Lead</p> <p>UNDP / Contributing WHO / Lead</p>	<p>46,000 105,000 15,000 56,000</p>

	Provide support to EHCo to identify most cost-effective interventions of tackling air pollution and support their implementation.	UNDP / Lead WHO / Contributing	20,000 10,000
	Activity 1.1.4; Support process to develop an investment portfolio with social returns that have been agreed on, in a participatory governance process	WHO / Lead	10,000
Output 1.1 Sub-total			262,000
Output 1.2: Baseline data on environmental / air pollution impacts on health / non-communicable diseases (NCDs) and risk exposure of most disadvantaged groups are available.			
Indicator 1.2.1: Baseline data on environmental impact on health Baseline 1.2.1: No data available on environmental impact on health (August 2017) Target 1.2.1: Establish baseline data on environmental impact on health by the end of project	Activity 1.2.1: Upgrade environmental monitoring system to make it functional. Activity 1.2.2: Facilitate public access to data from the environmental monitoring system. Activity 1.2.3: Conduct assessment to quantify burden of disease from environmental pollution.	WHO / Lead WHO / Lead WHO / Lead	45,400 30,000 35,000
Output 1.2 Sub-total			112,000
Output 1.3: Improved capacity on evidence-based environmental health policy-making.			
Indicator 1.3.1: Health impact assessment Baseline 1.3.1: No assessment is conducted (August 2017)	Activity 1.3.1: Provide technical assistance to the Kosovo Institute of Public Health and KEPA to upgrade environmental health methods and health impact assessment including the quantification of the health risks of air pollution. Activity 1.3.2:	WHO / Contributing UNDP / Lead WHO / Lead	30,000 71,000 22,000

<p>Target 1.3.1: Health impact assessment developed by the end of the project</p> <p>Indicator 1.3.3: Number of reports produced by the civil society organizations in relation to Environment & Health policy implementation</p> <p>Baseline 1.3.3: 0 reports (August 2017)</p> <p>Target 1.3.3: 2 reports from the civil society on Environment & Health policy implementation by the end of the project.</p>	<p>Provide evidence-based guidance and public health advice on air pollution impacts to policy-makers.</p> <p>Activity 1.3.3: Support development of the monitoring and evaluation framework by providing further technical support to the upgraded EHCo.</p> <p>Activity 1.3.4: Support civil society organizations to provide watch-dog functions in relation to the environmental pollution reduction strategies.</p>	WHO / Lead	35,000
		UNDP /Lead	47,000
Output 1.3 Sub-total			205,000
Outcome 1 Sub-total			579,000
Outcome 2: More people adopt behaviors that are healthy and that increase resilience to potential threats from environmental pollution.			
INTENDED OUTPUTS	INDICATIVE ACTIVITIES	RESPONSIBLE PARTIES	INPUTS
Output 2.1: General population has increased awareness of negative impacts of air pollution on health			
<p>Indicator 2.1.1: % of population in Kosovo disaggregated by region, gender and age groups that are aware on potential threats from environmental pollution</p> <p>Baseline 2.1.1: TBD in the beginning of the project</p> <p>Target 2.1.1: TBD once the baseline is set</p>	<p>Activity 2.1.1: Develop and implement a comprehensive public outreach program, providing informational and educational materials and training on indoor air pollutants, its health effects, health risks and techniques in exposure reduction.</p> <p>Activity 2.1.2:</p>	UNDP / Lead	40,200
		WHO / Contributing	18,000
		UNDP / Lead	46,000
		WHO / Contributing	4,000

<p>Indicator 2.1.2: % of population Kosovo disaggregated by region, gender and age groups that are aware on their basic rights on clean environmental</p> <p>Baseline 2.1.2: TBD in the beginning of the project</p> <p>Target 2.1.2: TBD once the baseline is set</p>	<p>Organize public awareness campaign on reducing the health risk from exposure to air pollution building upon the successful results of the #ecokosovo campaign</p> <p>Activity 2.1.3: Organize workshops for CSOs and local population on access to legal protection on environmental matters.</p>	<p>UNDP / Lead</p>	<p>13,500</p>
<p>Output 2.1 Sub-total</p>			<p>121,700</p>
<p>Output 2.2: Innovative initiatives that address environmental concerns introduced and implemented.</p>			
<p>Indicator 2.2.1: # of innovative initiatives implemented.</p> <p>Baseline 2.2.1: 0 (August 2017)</p> <p>Target 2.2.1: 1 initiatives per municipality (total 2 initiatives) by the end of project</p>	<p>Activity 2.2.1: Organize co-design dialogue sessions organized with youth (students, marginalized youth), community members and municipal authorities in selected municipalities.</p> <p>Activity 2.2.2: Engage effectively community in defining environmental challenges affecting their neighborhood and proposing solutions.</p> <p>Activity 2.2.3: Design prototypes jointly with community and municipal authorities that would address the environmental challenges identified through co-design dialogue sessions and community engagement.</p> <p>Activity 2.2.4: Support the implementation of 2 prototypes (initiatives) jointly with community and municipal authorities.</p>	<p>UNV / Lead</p> <p>UNV / Lead</p> <p>UNV / Lead</p> <p>UNV / Lead</p>	<p>12,000</p> <p>10,000</p> <p>10,000</p> <p>50,000</p>

	Activity 2.2.5: Publicize and promote results of community co-design / co-creation engagement initiatives in order to increase awareness on environmental protection and sustainability, community empowerment and active civic engagement.	UNV / Lead	3,400
Output 2.2 Sub-total			85,400
Outcome 2 Sub-total			207,100

Project component	WHO	UNDP / UNV	TOTAL (Euro)
Outcome 1	378,400	199,000	579,000
Outcome 2	22,000	185,100	213,100
Total Outcome 1 and Outcome 2	400,400	384,100	792,100
Project Implementation office, personnel)		95,200	95,200
Administrative Agent 1%		8,797	8,797
GMS: 7% WHO, 7% UNDP/UNV	28,028	33,551	61,579
TOTAL	428,428	521,648	950,076