

UNDP Management Response Evaluation Final

Title of Project: Nationally Appropriate Mitigation Actions (NAMA) in the energy generation and final use sectors in Peru

Project PIMS number: 4679

GEF Project ID: 00088316

Date of finalization of the Final Evaluation: 19/05/2021

Date of submittal of the final report of the Final Evaluation of the Project: 19/05/2021

Date of response received from the Direction: 04/07/2019

Prepared by: Daniella Rough

Contributed by: Claudia Espinoza

Authorized by: Jesús Walter Carrasco Chacón

Context, background and conclusions

This Management Response Plan responds to the Final Evaluation of the project "Nationally Appropriate Mitigation Actions (NAMA) in the energy generation and final use sectors in Peru" (hereinafter the project), which was requested by the Country Office of the United Nations Development Program (UNDP), which acts as the implementing agency of the Global Environment Facility (GEF), while the Ministry of Energy and Mines (MINEM), through its General Directorate of Energy Efficiency (DGEE) is the national executing entity responsible for the project. The objectives of the evaluation were to verify the achievement of the project's objectives and products, while considering the factors that affected their execution, and extracting the lessons learned from the experience to improve the design practices of future projects.

The declared objective of the NAMA project is to "Support the Government of Peru in the development and implementation of nationally appropriate mitigation actions in the energy sector", so that the country could comply with its voluntary commitments to reduce Greenhouse Gases (GHG). To achieve this objective, it was decided to focus efforts on three (3) energy-related activities (electricity generation connected to the grid, isolated or off-grid electricity generation and end uses for electricity), where 4 NAMAs should be identified, developed and executed, along with the creation of a measurement, reporting and verification system for their results (MRV). In addition, the project should provide technical assistance to the public sector in the preparation of GHG inventories, policies and regulations to support the introduction of non-conventional renewable energy (NCRE) in Peru's energy matrix.

The total project budget was USD 36.5 million, of which USD 4.5 million was contributed by GEF, and the committed co-financing amounted to USD 32 million (cash and in-kind) by the Government of Peru and UNDP.

The final evaluation was carried out between February and May 2021 by an international consultant. The methodology used was defined by UNDP / GEF in 2020 for its final evaluations, and also incorporated consideration of gender and indigenous people.

As a result, 13 recommendations were presented, which included 10 recommendations for MINEM and other entities involved to be implemented between April - October 2021, and 3 recommendations for UNDP to be permanently considered in future projects. The responses and actions proposed by the responsible entities are presented in the following Table, as part of the Management Response Plan to the Final Evaluation of the Project.

SOBRE LOS OBJETIVOS Y ESTRATEGIA DEL PROYECTO

Recommendation A.1. - Although the project is operationally closed, there are still steps that must be taken to ensure the continuity of the project's achievements, so it is recommended that UNDP lead conversations with the different actors to reach agreements that constitute an exit strategy for the project.

Recommendation Accepted

Nº	Key Action	Implementation Date	Responsible Unit	Follow-up	
				Status	Comments
A.1.a	Coordinate meetings with MINAM, MTC, MEF, MIDIS and ATU to review the next steps and continue with the implementation of the 4 NAMAs and their 12 associated mitigation measures, according to their areas of competence.	April – October 2021	PNUD, MINEM, MINAM	In Process	The DGEE of the MINEM has constant communication with the entities involved in the 4 NAMAs and 12 mitigation measures, when there are actions or enabling conditions that require contributions, actions, agreements or commitments. Meetings that are held through the NDC Technical Group (GT NDC) in support of the High Level Commission on Climate Change (CANCC) considered in Law No. 30754.

Recommendation A.2.- The exit strategy should be developed in conjunction with key project stakeholders (MINAM, MINEM, MEF, MTC, ATU, and MIDIS, to name a few) with UNDP as the sponsor and high-level manager of the corresponding institutions. This strategy should fundamentally contain programmatic agreements that ensure the continuity and completion of the topics presented in A.2.1 onwards.

Recommendation Accepted

Nº	Key Action	Implementation Date	Responsible Unit	Follow-up	
				Status	Comments
A.2.a	Carry out high-level meetings with the Ministers of the sectors involved to evaluate a continuity strategy with the implementation of the 4 NAMAs and their 12 associated mitigation measures, according to their competence, and in turn to influence the new	July-December 2021	PNUD, MINAM, MINEM, MEF, MTC, ATU, y MIDIS	To begin	The DGEE of MINEM, and other MINEM Directorates have constant communication with UNDP and MINAM regarding initiatives related to existing and future projects, the SDGs and the NDC. Meetings are held in the High Level

	authorities as a result of the change of government regarding this strategy.				Commission on Climate Change (CANCC) contemplated in Law No. 30754.
A.2.b	From UNDP and MINEM, identify various initiatives that can give sustainability to the implementation of the 4 NAMAs.	Permanent	PNUD, MINEM	In Process	So far a proposal has been submitted to the IKI fund and KOICA
A.2.c	Through new projects, evaluate the viability of giving continuity to the actions and results of project through an agreement such as a project document (PRODOC or Initiation Plan)	Permanent	PNUD	In Process	

Recomendación A.2.1.- Define a budget scheme, assignment of professionals and operating structure of the MINEM MRV platform, indicating responsibilities and roles of each participating department.

Recommendation Partially Accepted. A platform operating structure is already developed and implemented as part of the final deliverable of the MRV Platform development service. Although it has not been formalized at the moment, a specialist has been hired to manage the MRV platform, and measurement and reporting of the mitigation measures. However, a formal budget is not yet established.

Nº	Key Action	Implementation Date	Responsible Unit	Follow-up	
				Status	Comments
A.2.1.a	Hiring and / or designation of specialists from the DGEE to help with the reporting of the progress of the NDC for the energy sector via the MRV Platform.	April 2021-December 2022	DGEE	The DGEE hired an MRV specialist to manage the MRV Platform, but may also designate others	This action can be carried out gradually according to the increased implementation of mitigation measures.
A.2.1.b	Via internal memo to other directions of the Minem, send the request for the appointment of specialists who provide information for the MRV, including DGE, DGER and FISE.	April 2021-December 2022	DGEE	Pending	This action can be carried out gradually according to the increased implementation of mitigation measures.
A.2.1.c	Request through Official Letter the appointment of professionals to external entities (Osinermin, Foncodes, COES, OCSE, MTC, ATU) to formalize their role in the delivery of data required to report the	April 2021-December 2022	DGEE	Pending	This action can be carried out gradually according to the increased implementation of mitigation measures.

	progress of the MRV for mitigation measures that involve other entities.				
Recommendation A.2.2.- Finalization of the technical regulation on charging stations for electric mobility					
Recommendation Accepted					
Nº	Key Action	Implementation Date	Responsible Unit	Follow-up	
				Status	Comments
A.2.2.a	Finalize and publish the regulation on operation and installation of charging infrastructure	April-October 2021	MINEM	Pre-published	RM 189-2021-MINEM-DM was pre-published on 26 June 2021. Now receiving comments
Recommendation A.2.3.- Define, together with the responsible directorates and relevant actors of the MINEM, beneficiaries and supplier companies, a working group to implement the changes in the payment scheme of the rural electrification program. This working group must have a clear and specific mandate, a detailed work plan, a defined timeframe and responsible parties defined for each role.					
Recommendation Partially Accepted.- Explicar que no es competencia propia de DGEE					
Nº	Key Action	Implementation Date	Responsible Unit	Follow-up	
				Status	Comments
A.2.3.a	Meet with DGER to evaluate the feasibility of reviewing the payment scheme in a participatory manner with the relevant stakeholders.	April-October 2021	DGEE-MINEM (DGER) – requires validation from DGER	In revision for the new massive SFV program	The responsibility for this activity remains with the DGER. The Project developed a study with recommendations to change the payment scheme, which has been sent to the DGER for consideration in future programs and projects.
Recommendation 2.4.- Create a working group with the same characteristics as the previous one, to clear up disagreements regarding the distributed generation law, in order to support a greater participation of solar energy in the grid, based on the proposals of the project or others.					

Recommendation Partially Accepted. Talks are currently underway with the General Directorate of Electricity, which has the authority to publish the Distributed Generation Regulation.					
Nº	Key Action	Implementation Date	Responsible Unit	Follow-up	
				Status	Comments
A.2.4.a	Offer technical support to the DGE to consider for the finalization and publication of the distributed generation regulation.	April-October 2021	DGEE, DGE, Osinergmin	In evaluation by the DGE	There is the Multisectoral Commission for the Electricity Subsector Reform (CRSE) and one of the goals is the distributed generation regulation, it is just pending publishing of the final report. The DGE is currently developing recommendations to advance the publication of the distributed generation regulation.
<p>Recomendación 2.5.- Define an inter-institutional governance scheme between operators, MTC, MINAM, MEF, ATU to continue the electric bus pilot in conjunction with TransPeru and establish specific multi-stakeholder working groups (with deadlines, responsible parties for results and specific proposals) to determine i) master bus pattern, ii) electric / hybrid transport business model; iii) normative and regulatory adjustments based on the project's proposal for the promotion of electric transport, or others that are available.</p>					
<p>Recommendation Partially Accepted.- Currently, studies have been completed to propose i) master bus patterns, ii) electric transport business model, and iii) normative and regulatory adjustments, including the technical standard for charging infrastructure that has been pre-published. In addition, one year of bus circulation and monitoring still remains according to the current framework agreement. However, it is important to ensure that the remaining time of the pilot's life is monitored and the results are disseminated.</p>					
Nº	Key Action	Implementation Date	Responsible Unit	Follow-up	
				Status	Comments
A.2.5.a	Follow up on the results of the inter-institutional agreement and make a presentation to ATU on the results so that they can consider them in future tenders for fleets of electric buses.	April-October 2021	MINEM, MTC, MEF, MINAM, ATU	Replicability study in final stage of development	ATU must face the dilemma of prioritizing natural gas buses versus electric buses, where the former are currently more competitive and there is strong interest in expanding the use of natural gas.

					However, in large cities that do not have a CNG connection, it is more feasible to develop urban transport projects with electric buses and taxis, so projects should be identified in these cities.
--	--	--	--	--	--

Recommendation 2.6.- Define an inter-institutional working group with regional and local authorities, and relevant beneficiary community organizations, to agree on how the women's technical school should be implemented.

Recommendation Partially Accepted, but it is not seen as necessary to define an inter-institutional working group with regional and local authorities, among others, but focus should be made on finding partners, funds and entities that can help give eMujer sustainability.

Nº	Key Action	Implementation Date	Responsible Unit	Follow-up	
				Status	Comments
A2.6.1	Follow up on the roadmap for the scaling up of eMujer	2021-2025	MIDIS, DGEE y DGER-MINEM, MIMP, MINEDU	Currently and actively looking for funds and financing partners to implement eMujer	Pending: response from CIP, SE4All, IKI and ACG.

Recommendation 2.7.- Establish a pilot working group with selected regions to test an institutional coordination and strengthening mechanism to develop decentralized GHG inventories for the energy sector.

Recommendation Not Accepted. It has been previously explained in the PIRs that GHG inventories are not made and reported according to that logic and sub-regional distribution, but at the subsector level, and it is the responsibility of MINAM to define it.

Recommendation 2.8.- Hold a final online event to close the project, with the participation of national, regional, municipal authorities and relevant social organizations, to report on the results of the project and the working groups that will continue these achievements into the future. This event could be divided into a national event (Lima) and 2-3 selected regions.

Recommendation Partially Accepted. The Project published a closing note thanking all of the institutions that have supported the development of the Project, which was published in all of the media associated with El Comercio, both printed and digital.

Nº	Key Action	Implementation Date	Responsible Unit	Follow-up	
				Status	Comments

A.2.8.a	The Project hired El Comercio to publish a National Project Closing Note in a printed version for a weekend and in a digital version for a month, which was published in July 2021: https://elcomercio.pe/publirreportaje/el-proyecto-que-promovio-mayor-generacion-y-uso-de-la-energia-limpia-en-el-peru-noticia/	April-July 2021	DGEE-MINEM, PNUD	The closing note was published by El Comercio in printed and digital version	The closure of the Project was communicated through a printed and digital publication of El Comercio networks that reached millions of people nationwide over one month of publication.
---------	---	-----------------	------------------	--	---

Recommendation A.3.- For future projects, it is recommended that UNDP ensure consistency between the documents approved by the CEO of GEF and those signed by the country, in order to avoid misunderstandings during the project's progress and provide initial advice to the project coordinators regarding the GEF criteria for accounting deadlines and M&E, for example.

Recommendation Accepted

Nº	Key Action	Implementation Date	Responsible Unit	Follow-up	
				Status	Comments
A.3.1	A checklist will be implemented to complement the QA process in the preparation of UNDP - GEF Project Documents	Permanent	PNUD	To initiate	

Recommendation A.4.- For complex projects that need to specify their scope and indicators, as well as collect the necessary information to report the indicators, it is recommended to integrate a specialized professional in the project teams, in order to organize the type and amount of information necessary to carry out an adequate follow-up to the implementation

Recommendation Accepted

Nº	Key Action	Implementation Date	Responsible Unit	Follow-up	
				Status	Comments
A.4.1	The recommendation for future PRODOCs will be taken into consideration and the recommendation will also be raised to Regional UNDP-GEF for future projects.	Permanent	PNUD	To initiate	

Recommendation A.5.- Future projects should include the installation times of the executing units within the institution that hosts them, in order to have a more realistic execution period than what currently exists, which is assuming that a project begins with the signing of the Prodoc.

Recommendation Accepted

Nº	Key Action	Implementation Date	Responsible Unit	Follow-up	
				Status	Comments
A.5.1	The recommendation for future PRODOCs will be taken into consideration and the recommendation will also be raised to the Regional UNDP-GEF for future projects.	Permanent	PNUD	To initiate	