



EVALUATION

UNITED NATIONS DEVELOPMENT ASSISTANCE FRAMEWORK (2005-2009)

Republic of Armenia



Prepared for: Office of the Resident Coordinator United Nations

> Prepared by: Fuat Andic, Ph.D September 2008

Table of Contents

Executive Summary

1. Introduction

Setting

Methodology

Main Objectives of the Report and its Organization

2. Outcomes and Impacts

Objectives

Findings

Partners and Resources of UNDAF

3. Assessment of UNDAF

- 3.1. Design
- 3.2. Relevance
- 3.3. Efficiency and Effectiveness
- 3.4. Sustainability
- 3.5. Perceptions

4. Conclusions and Recommendations

- **4.1 Conclusions**
- 4.2 Recommendations

Annexes

- 1. Terms of Reference
- 2. Persons Interviewed
- 3. Documents Reviewed
- 4. Budget of UNDAF

Acknowledgements

The Report is the **final** product of the field visit to Yerevan (September, 15-20, 2008) as well as the work started and completed in the home base upon the receipt of comments received following the presentation of the draft Report on September 19, 2008. Many people contributed to its preparation; their names are listed in Annex 2 with heartfelt thanks. However, it is indispensable that two names be mentioned here. Ms. Consuelo Vidal, RC, took special interest in the preparation of the Report and guided the Consultant on all-important matters. Ms. Astghik Martirosyan cooperated and collaborated with the Consultant well beyond the call of duty. Special and separate thanks are certainly due to them.

The Consultant is solely responsible for the content of the Report. However, without the cooperation of all the persons listed in the Appendix errors and omissions would have been more serious and grievous.

Executive Summary

- UNDAF appears to have been **prepared** thoroughly and with great detail. All requisite documents have been reviewed before its design.
- The design of UNDAF has followed the logical steps of convening a prioritization workshop, and liaised with the Government in order to assure concordance with PRSP and MDG strategies. The UNDAF that emerged clearly identified the issues to be tackled and identified the correct outputs, outcomes and expected impacts. The baselines are clearly delineated; outcome and impact indicators are mostly quantitative.
- Two basic concepts are used in judging the relevance of UNDAF: namely, a) the strategic positioning and focus of UN on key outcomes and impacts; and b) the outcomes and impacts relevant to national priorities, as well as consistent with the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals in Armenia and PRSP. UNDAF is relevant to the needs of Armenia.
- Measured by administrative cost and by resource mobilization UNDAF appears to be efficient.
- In very general terms overall outcomes, as delineated in the UNDAF document, are likely to be sustainable provided that UNDAF is linked to national priorities. However, the final verdict will have to wait until the programmes of each agency are subjected to an in-depth evaluation.
- The implementing partners appear to have a high regard for UN agencies. They frequently cited responsiveness, neutrality, administrative efficiency and flexibility, as well as UN's understanding of the realities of Armenia. The donor agencies also express high satisfaction with UN. Overall, UNDAF appears to be perceived very positively.
- It is safe to conclude that, in most general terms, UNDAF is a well-prepared document. However, a number of issues need to be elucidated, since the Document is not totally free of certain shortcomings. These shortcomings are by no means grievous, but they must be stated here, since they have bearings on the next UNDAF. In some cases, which are not very many, impacts, outcomes and outputs are not clearly delineated. Some indicators listed, especially those of quantitative nature, are not published by the Government periodically. Listing a number of indicators for which there is no reliable source to verify became a meaningless task and deprived the Consultant from verifying whether expected outcomes, let alone impacts, are in fact obtained or likely to be obtained. The Document is much too detailed which essentially curtails flexibility to adjust projects according to changing conditions and priorities of the Country.
- While many project components of various agencies include capacity building, there is no project that specifically aims at capacity building. Yet, in a country like Armenia capacity building should be a major concern. Capacity building is a kind of endeavor that must be tailored to the needs of the particular country. Capacity in Armenia is not so much lack of it to carry out specific tasks that the development process requires. In reality Armenia is relatively well endowed in terms of well-prepared human resources. However, economic activities are in such levels that technically prepared human resources are employed in jobs and tasks that are considerably below their technical capacities. Hence capacity building acquires an entirely different dimension and it is imperative that the next cycle takes into consideration this particular dimension. Regarding the fulfillment of the objectives, it appears that almost all UN agencies will succeed in reaching the expected results, thereby making UNDAF a successful document. But as mentioned above, in certain cases neither the outcomes nor the impacts could be ascertained with exactitude. Here an important issue is worth questioning, namely, had there been no UNDAF would the results been achieved by the programmes/projects of various agencies? The review of the information provided by the Agencies leads this Consultant to answer positively. This answer of course begs another question, namely, whether UNDAF is a fifth wheel or in fact has some added value? The answer to this question is simply an unequivocal yes, provided that UNDAF is seen as an indicative document for inter-agency cooperation and the articulation of the national priorities within the overall policy formulation of the UN family.
- The Report also concludes that the design was correct and appropriate and relevant to the realities of Armenia. Given the particular conditions of the Country, it is reasonably efficient and effective and the perception that UNDAF has created is very positive.
- It is recommended that the next UNDAF should be a road map towards the sustainable human development, rather than a process document.
- It is desirable that sufficient flexibility should lead to closer interagency collaboration and cooperation, rather than striving to fill the appropriate boxes with different agencies' specific projects as an after-thought.

- The Report strongly **urges** that, whenever it is appropriate, capacity-building components of projects/programmes should be very clearly spelt out and worked into UNDAF. Appropriate and measurable indicators must also be spelt out.
- UNDAF should contain a systemic approach to capacity building/training, assuring the participation of educational institutions, which are mostly of high quality in Armenia.
- Too many indicators both for impact and outcome assessments are very likely to end up yielding conflicting results. The norm should be to select a few but measurable indicators with the assurance that such indicators are readily available. For that purpose SMART indicators developed by UNDP would be a good yardstick. Care should be taken the collection of reliable indicators must be cost efficient. In that vein Human Development Report may be taken as a key source.
- Finally, UNDAF should be viewed as a flexible instrument taking into consideration the particular mandate of different Agencies. Long and detailed outcomes tend to put different Agencies in a position to first design projects and then seek the appropriate outcome category in the UNDAF document for a particular project. This of course goes exactly against the raison d'être of UNDAF. Such practices should be avoided at all cost.

1. Introduction

Setting

After the dissolution of the USSR a number of nation states came into being. One of these states is Armenia in the Caucuses. All these states went through a painful transition period and Armenia was no exception.

The transition brought about a host of problems that can be summarized in two rubrics. One was economic governance, i.e., moving from a command economy to a market economy; and the other is socio-political governance, i.e., nation building and public management. While settling properly these issues, Armenia lived through painful years in the nineties.

A landlocked country of 3 million people, Armenia faced considerable hardship until the very early years of the twenty first century. Household incomes declined, disparities between rich and poor became accentuated, health, education and welfare expenditures fell short of needs. At present there is a marked, but not sufficient, amelioration in the living conditions of the Armenian people. This is observable in many areas. None-the-less shortcomings still exist in public management, in the employment market, and in environmental management; periodic energy shortages occur; infrastructure is broken down and there are a host of similar issues.

Chronologically 2003 perhaps was a turning point for Armenia. An overall increase in well being became observable. Political stability and foreign assistance are most probably the contributing factors for this upturn.²

In 2005 the United Nations launched its first concerted effort to assist Armenia. This effort brought together several UN specialized agencies as well as multilateral and bilateral aid organizations, the Breton Woods institutions, the Government and CSOs in a cooperative and organized manner to provide assistance to Armenia. The result was the first United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) for the period of 2005-2009.

UNDAF rests on four pillars:

- Reduction in the levels of poverty and income inequality.
- Improvement in the quality and accessibility of social services.
- Improvement in the transparency and accountability of Government institutions.
- Promoting environmentally sound technologies and effective management of natural resources.

The pillars are not selected haphazardly, but are the logical deductions from the MDG principles and from the PRSP. It is expected that the realization of the objectives of the four pillars would contribute collectively to the overall goal of reducing economic, social and political inequality, enhance good governance and improve environmental management.

¹ Between 2000 and 2005 HDI moved from 0,738 to 0,775, while per capita income in 2001 was \$556, in 2005 it stood at the level of \$1625. Income inequality measured by the Gini index is 0. 33 (2005). This is much lower that of many developing countries. However, there are a number of disconcerting indicators. The unemployment rate is 36 % of the labor force according to unofficial estimates. There are also serious imbalances between imports and exports. Inflation, which was a serious problem, has been tamed only very recently. UNDP, *Human Development Report 2007-2008* and *Armenia Human Development Report 2006*.

² Total foreign assistance amounted to 4% of GDP. Source: UNDP, Human Development Report 2007-2008.

Methodology

The methodology used in this assignment is` essentially the one developed and used by UNEG and to a lesser extent UNDP.³ In essence it consists of simultaneous use of perception, validation and documentation in order to assess why and how the outcomes have been achieved or are likely to be achieved at the end of the cycle. The concrete steps include:

- Review of all written documentation. These documents include, but are not limited to CPAP, PRSP, MDG document, UNDAF, specific project documents and their progress reports, etc.
- Briefing and interviews with United Nations Country Team (UNCT) representatives of cooperating assistance agencies, corresponding government entities, CSOs and beneficiaries. These interviews were essentially of open-ended nature.
- Visits to selected project sites for direct observation and also interviews with project personnel and, as much as possible, with the end users.
- Preparation of the draft report with special emphasis on relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, degree of change, and sustainability. Sustainability was scrutinized especially to assess whether perceived positive changes/outcomes in the development situation will be of enduring nature.
- Presentation of major findings and conclusions/debriefing with RC and the staff of UNCT and other concerned entities and key stakeholders.
- Finalization of the draft report based upon feedback received during the debriefing session with UNCT personnel and government representatives.

Within the conceptual frame of reference two points must be elucidated, be it briefly. For the purpose of this Report **outcomes** are the actual or intended changes in development conditions that the Framework is seeking to support, whereas **impacts** are those of long-term effects of programmes/interventions. While outcomes are usually observable at the end of the interventions, impacts are very much of a long-term proposition. The ToR of this evaluation requires the assessment of impacts. The Report complies with it; however, attention is called to the fact that the outcomes will be clearly substantiated whereas the impacts are fraught with the danger of being somewhat conjectural.

1.3 Main Objectives of the Report and its Organization

The main objective of this Report⁷ is to review the progress made in attaining the outcomes and impacts as stipulated in the UNDAF document and assess the efficiency and cost-effectiveness of how the Programme elucidated in the Document has moved towards achieving its outcomes and impacts. It is expected that the Report will identify the strengths and weaknesses in the Programme design and implementation, the sustainability of the results achieved, and provide recommendations on sustaining implementation of the activities initiated within the components for the next programming cycle. For this purpose the Report focuses on several specific issues:

- The level of progress made towards achieving the outcomes and impacts, including contributing factors and impediments.
- The extent of UNDAF's contribution to the achievement of the outcomes through related indicators.

³ This Report follows first and foremost the methodology developed by UNEG. See: *Norms for Evaluation in the UN System*. 2004, UN, UNDAF *Evaluation Guidelines*. July 2005, UNEG, *Study of the Evaluability of the UN Development Assistance, Framework*. 2006and also UNEG, *Evaluation in the UN system*. April 2007. As a supplementary source it also makes use of the following publications UNDP/EO, *Handbook on Monitoring and Evaluating for Results*. New York, 2003, and *Guidelines for Outcome Evaluators*. New York 2006.

⁴ Annex C lists the documents reviewed.

⁵ "It is highly unlikely that any evaluation would be able to identify a contribution, linking UNDAF to the national goal level indicators." See: UNEG, *Evaluability of the UN Development Assistance Framework*. p.20.

⁶ See: UNDP, Handbook on Monitoring and Evaluating Results, p. 101 and p. 103.

⁷ The Terms of Reference are given in Annex 1

- The viability and effectiveness of partnership strategies in relation to the achievement of the outcomes.
- Identification and assessment of lessons learnt and best practices in relation to management and implementation of activities to achieve the related outcomes.
- Identification of institutional strengths and weaknesses and areas for the improvement of the Country Office programme strategy to reduce poverty through sustainable initiatives and more equitable economic growth.

These issues are elucidated in Sections 2 and 3. The main thrust of these sections is to assess the achievements. The Report also pays special attention to the issue of sustainability, for it is of utmost importance to assess the sustainability of outputs and outcomes if the recommendations made are to be realistic and implementable. The last Section presents the conclusions reached, makes recommendations on the implementation of remaining activities with respect to the next programming cycle.

2. Outcomes and Impacts

2.1 Objectives

2.1.1 Objectives of UNDAF

As was pointed out in the previous section, there are four main objectives for the realization of which a series of projects have been designed and implemented or are being implemented. These projects in fact constitute clusters to achieve four interrelated objectives. These are:

- Reduction of the levels of poverty and income inequality.
- Improvement of the quality and accessibility of social services.
- Improvement of the transparency and accountability of government institutions.
- Promoting environmentally sound technologies and effective management of natural resources.

2.1.2 Objectives of the Government

It should be pointed out at the outset that the objectives of UNDAF, as indicated above, are not haphazard, but correspond in their totality to the objectives of the Government. A brief review of these objectives is called for here. So far as it could be ascertained there is no single document that can be called as the Government's plan or an overall policy document. However, the Republic of Armenia and the civil society adopted a Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) in August 2003. PRSP aimed at generating high rates of economic growth and redistributing this growth to social programmes for the poorest and most socially disadvantaged. By implementing the PRSP, the Government aimed to establish a sound foundation for eradicating mass poverty and improving living standards by 2015 in accordance with the Millennium Development Goals (MDG). To ensure the implementation of the strategy, the Government has adopted a Medium-Term Public Expenditure Framework (MTEF) for the first period of PRSP from 2004 to 2006 and relevant ministries and state agencies have developed comprehensive action plans based on PRSP strategies and goals. The Government aimed to use PRSP as a framework for coordinating the contributions and activities of bi-lateral and multi-lateral donors. The analysis of the PRSP shows that there is a complete concordance between the Government priorities and the precepts of UNDAF.

2.2 Findings

In what follows the Report will analyse and make comments on impacts and outcomes. These comments constitute the totality of the findings that are based on the stated indicators and their verification, triangulated with the analysis of documentation and perceptions. ¹⁰

Most of the outcomes are likely to be achieved. This finding however is mostly based on the information provided to the Consultant by the Agencies. ¹¹ In other words, the analysis, by *force majeur*, is based on agency information rather than verifying the indicators. Most of the quantitative indicators listed in the UNDAF document are either not readily available or not among the published governmental documents at all.

⁸ PRSP is a most comprehensive document, which was prepared with the participation of various sectors of the Country and is the only document that reflects government priorities. Pages 128-138 list the main directions of PRSP and implementation policies. See: *Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper*. Yerevan, 2003

⁹ For the details of the Government programme see: *Country Programme Action Plan 2005-2009*.

The format followed is identical to the monitoring tables given in the annex of the UNDAF document.

¹¹ A questionnaire was designed and distributed to all Agencies requesting pertinent information about the projects in implementation. The Consultant gratefully acknowledges their full cooperation.

The Report will return to this point and will make realistic and operationally recommendations in its last Section.

UNDAF OUTCOME ONE ECONOMIC EQUITY

The main goal in this area of cooperation is to reduce the levels of poverty and income inequality in accordance with the MDGs and PRSP.

Programme Outcomes	<u>Indicators</u>	Sources of Verification	<u>Comments</u>
1.1 Regional and community development strategies and Government budgets are based on the principles of socially-oriented and equitable economic growth.	 Impact Indicators: Percentage decrease in the number of people living below the poverty, extreme poverty and food lines at regional level and in urban and rural areas Percentage decrease in the Gini coefficient at national and regional levels and in urban and rural areas (3.5% decrease, but only national level) Percentage increase in the Human Development Index (HDI) at national level (6.45 % increase) Percentage decrease in the Human Poverty Index (HPI) at national level (0.26% decrease) Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in per capita budget expenditures by community Percentage increase in the share of social expenditures in state and community budgets 	Data and Records: NSS data Official Bulletin of RA MFE data and records NSMS data Regional Government data Municipal Administration data Reports and Publications: Global HDR National HDR PRSP and MTEF reviews and reports AST bulletins IACER periodicals Regional and Community Three-Year Programmes On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency website Donor websites NGO websites	 UNICEF-Support to enhancement of PRSP; Asessment of social budgeting. Likely to be completed UNDP-Monitoring and mapping human poverty. Completed. UNDP- Human poverty and pro-poor policies. Completed. UNDP- Performance budgeting. Completed in 2008 UNDP- Partnerships for community based projects. Will be completed in 2008. UNDP-Cross border cooperation between the Shirak region Completed

1.2 The National Social Monitoring System functions effectively.	Percentage increase in the nominal and real value of the poverty and food lines Percentage increase in the nominal and real value of minimum wage, pension and family allowance Percentage decrease in the number of people receiving wages and pensions below the poverty and food lines Percentage decrease in the number of households receiving support through the FASS Outcome Indicators: Number of PRSP strategies, policies and programmes reviewed and adjusted on the basis of NSMS data, findings and impact assessments Number of regional and community strategies, policies and budgets adjusted on the basis of NSMS data, findings and impact assessments	Data and Records: NSS data Official Bulletin of RA MFE data and records MLSA data and records NSMS data Regional Government data Municipal Administration data Municipal Administration data Municipal Administration data Municipal Administration data MGO data UN Agency data EU, WB, IMF data Reports and Publications: PRSP and MTEF reviews and reports AST bulletins IACER periodicals NGO reports UN Agency reports UN Agency reports Regional and Community Three-Year Programmes On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites UN Agency websites NGO websites	 UNFPA, Population Development Strategies. 2005-9. It will contribute to outcome of strategy and policy. It will be completed. UNICEF-Support to enhancement of PRSP; Assessment of social budgeting. Likely to be completed UNDP Monitoring and mapping human poverty. Completed UNDP-Support to participatory policy development. Will be completed ILO- Effective governance of labor migration
1.3 The process of meeting WTO commitments and ascending into the EU is accelerated.	Impact Indicators: • Percentage increase in the ratio of exports to imports at national level • Percentage increase in the share of exports in foreign trade and in GDP (Decrease in exports 12.7%) • Percentage decrease in the share of the current account deficit in GDP (Increase in deficit 6.2%)	Data and Records: NSS data Official Bulletin of RA MTED data and records MFE data and records WTO and EU data and records	UNDP- Support to post-WTO accession process. Completed

	Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the share of exports to EU countries in total exports Number of WTO and EU related laws and governmental decisions adopted .	Reports and Publications: PRSP reviews and reports MTED reports EU and WTO reports and bulletins UNDP, UNIDO, UNCTAD reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites	
1.4 Access to agro- based employment opportunities and agricultural services in impoverished communities is increased.	Percentage decrease in the number of people living below the poverty and food lines and in the Gini coefficient in rural areas Percentage increase in the ratio of agricultural production sales to gross agricultural output Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the volume of agroexports Percentage increase in the volume of investment in agriculture and agribusiness Percentage and numerical increase in jobs created in agro-based industries (No change as yet ius observable)	Data and Records: NSS data Official Bulletin of RA MOA data and records NSMS data Reports and Publications: PRSP reviews and reports MOA reports UNDP, FAO, IFAD reports WB, EU, USDA reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites	UNDP-Strengthening coordination capacities of the M. of Agriculture. Completed

1.5 Local and foreign	Impact Indicators:	Data and Records:	UNIDO-Introduction of cleaner production program in
direct investment into labour-intensive sectors is increased.	Percentage decrease in the real and official	Official Bulletin of RA	chemical, food and mining sectors; increased foreign investment possibilities in these sectors. To be completed in 2008

	 Percentage increase in the volume of public investments Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the volume of total and foreign investments in labour-intensive sectors Percentage increase in the share of labour-intensive sectors in GDP 	Reports and Publications: PRSP and MTEF reviews and reports MTED reports MFE reports Public-Private Council reports Business Forum reports UNCTAD World Investment report On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites	
1.6 Access to suitable housing for the poor and socially disadvantaged is increased.	Impact Indicators: Percentage decrease in the number of households living below the poverty and food lines at national and regional levels Percentage increase in the Human Security Index (HSI) at national and regional levels Outcome Indicators: Number of poor and socially disadvantaged households, including refugees and former refugees living in sub-standard and temporary accommodations, receiving adequate apartments or houses new apartments through housing programmes In 2003, more than 10,000 refugees were living in temporary shelters	Data and Records: NSS data Official Bulletin of RA MUD data and records DMR data and records MLSA data and records NSMS data Reports and Publications: PRSP and MTEF Reviews and reports MUD reports DMR reports AST bulletins IACER periodicals On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites	UNFPA, Population Development Strategies. 2005-9. It will contribute to outcome of strategy and policy. It will be completed. UNHCR-Strengthening national asylum system Completed.

1.7	Access to
	appropriate social
	protection services
	for at-risk
	households is
	increased.

Impact Indicators:

 Percentage decrease in the number of vulnerable groups living below the poverty and food lines at national and regional levels

(38% decrease on national level only)

 Percentage decrease in the number of children and households with children living below the poverty and food lines at national and regional levels

(Decrease from 6.1% (2004) to 4.1% (2006)

Outcome Indicators:

- Percentage increase in the number of at-risk households covered by the national action plan on at-risk households
- Percentage increase in the number of children with disabilities included in the social protection system and reintegrated with families

Data and Records:

- NSS data
- Official Bulletin of RA
- MLSA data and records
- MOH data and records
- NSMS data
- UNICEF data

Reports and Publications:

- PRSP and MTEF Reviews and reports
- MLSA reports
- MOH reports
- AST bulletins
- UNICEF, UNDP, WB, DFID reports

On-line Sources:

- Government websites
- UN Agency websites
- Donor websites
- NGO websites

<u>UNHCR-identification of at risk households.</u>
 <u>Completed</u>

1.8 Employment opportunities for the poor and socially disadvantaged are generated through Business Information Centres and SMEs.

Impact Indicators:

- Percentage decrease in the number of economically-active people living below the poverty and food lines at national and regional levels
- Percentage decrease in the Gini coefficient in urban areas and small and medium towns

Outcome Indicators:

- Percentage increase in the share of SMEs gross output in GDP
- Percentage increase in the ratio of SMEs located in regions to the total number of SMEs

Data and Records:

- NSS data
- Official Bulletin of RA
- MTED data
- National Centre for SME data
- Municipal Administration data

Reports and Publications:

- PRSP and MTEF reviews and reports
- MTED reports
- AST bulletins
- IACER periodicals
- UNDP, IOM, WB, EU reports

On-line Sources:

Government websites

• UNFPA, Population Development Strategies. 2005-9. It will contribute to outcome of strategy and policy. It will be completed.

1.9 Employment opportunities for poor and socially disadvantaged youth are generated through training and public private partnerships.	Impact Indicators: • Percentage decrease in the number of youth living below the poverty and food lines at national and regional levels • Percentage decrease in the real and official unemployment rates for youth at national and regional levels Outcome Indicators: • Percentage increase in the number of jobs created for poor and socially disadvantaged youth (No appreciable change as yet) • Number of jobs created through public-private partnerships for youth • receiving vocational training Baseline: Although the Government is committed to increasing job opportunities for youth and ensuring good labour practices, the Labour Code is not yet approved and statistics on child labour are not available.	UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites MESA data Municipal Administration data PRSP and MTEF review and reports MTED reports MEYA reports MESA reports Regional Government data	UNDP-Cross border cooperation between the Shirak regionCompleted UNDP- Modernization of vocational education. Will be completed
1.10Employment opportunities are generated and public infrastructures are rehabilitated in impoverished urban and rural communities through food-for- work schemes and public private partnerships.	Impact Indicators: Percentage increase in the per capita and per household income in rural areas and small and medium towns Percentage increase in the share of wages in the total income of poor and very poor households at national and regional levels Percentage increase in the share of non-farm income in the total income of rural households Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the income of urban and rural households participating in food-	Data and Records: NSS data NSMS data MLSA data Municipal Administration data Regional Government data Reports and Publications: MLSA reports Regional Government reports AST bulletins IACER periodicals WFP reports	UNDP- Support to SME. Will be completed in 2008

	for-work schemes	On-line Sources:	
1.11The process of post-conflict recovery in targeted communities is accelerated.	 ■ Percentage decrease in the number of people living below the poverty and food lines in border areas ■ Percentage increase in the HSI at national and regional levels ■ Percentage increase in the volume of agricultural production at national and regional levels Outcome Indicators: ■ Percentage increase in the area of agricultural lands in targeted communities cleared of landmines ■ Percentage increase in the area of cultivated agricultural land in targeted communities cleared of landmines ■ Number of officials trained on prevention and addressing damage caused by UXOs 	Data and Records: NSS data MOD data and records MOA data and records NSMS data State Cadastre data Regional Government data Municipal Administration data Reports and Publications: MOD reports MOA reports Regional Government reports AST bulletins UN Agency reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites	 UNHCR-Training socially disadvantageous youth. On going UNDP-Global compact project Will be completed UNDP- Modernization of vocational education. Will be completed ILO- Development of comprehensive anti-trafficking response in Armenia Will be completed

1.12The national emergency response system functions effectively. Percentage increase in the HSI at national and regional levels Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in allocations in state and community budgets for national emergency response system Percentage increase in the number of special disaster units Percentage increase in the number of communities participating in the national emergency response system	Data and Records: NSS data Official Bulletin of RA MFE data EMA data NSMS data Regional Government data Municipal Administration data Reports and Publications: EMA reports AST bulletins UN Agency reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites	UNHCR- private public partnership to rehabilitate impoverished families. On-going
---	---	---

1.13The poor and
socially
disadvantaged in
targeted
communities
participate actively
in generating
employment
opportunities.

Impact Indicators:

- Percentage decrease in the number of women living below the poverty and food lines at national and regional levels
 - Percentage increase in the Gender Development Index (GDI) at national and regional levels
- Percentage increase in the income of womenheaded households at national and regional levels

Outcome Indicators:

- Percentage increase in the number of businesses established by poor and socially disadvantaged, particularly women and adolescent girls, in targeted communities
 - business opportunities conducted in targeted communities

Number of community members, particularly women

Data and Records:

- NSS data
- NSMS data
- National Centre for SME data
- Regional Government data
- Municipal Administration data

Reports and Publications:

- National HDR
- PRSP review and reports
- Regional Government reports
- AST bulletins
- UN Agency reports

On-line Sources:

websites

1.14The PRSP and other socio-economic programmes are monitored effectively by local NGOs and CBOs.	 Impact Indicators: Percentage increase in the Social Activeness Index (SAI) at national and regional levels Percentage increase in the Public Confidence Index (PCI) at national and regional levels Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of NGOs and CBOs participating in monitoring and assessing of PRSP policies and programmes Percentage increase in the number of indicators and findings developed by social support groups incorporated into the NSMS for PRSP monitoring 	Data and Records: PRSP Steering Committee records PRSP Working Group records NSMS data Regional Government data Municipal Administration data Reports and Publications: PRSP reviews and reports Regional Government reports AST bulletins IACER periodicals UNDP, WB, DFID, EU reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites	UNHCR- Disaster preparedness. on-going
1.15At-risk communities participate actively in mitigating the damage caused by disasters.	Impact Indicators: • Percentage increase in the HSI at national and regional levels Outcome Indicators: • Percentage increase in the number of at-risk communities prepared technically and professionally for disaster response • Percentage increase in state budget allocations for emergency response systems	Data and Records: NSS data MFE data and records EMA data and records NSMS data Regional Government data Municipal Administration data Reports and Publications: EMA reports AST bulletins UNDP reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites NGO websites	UNDP- Modernization of vocational education. Will be completed

UNDAF OUTCOME TWO SOCIAL EQUITY

The main goal in this area of cooperation is to improve the quality and accessibility of basic social services in accordance with the MDGs and PRSP.

Dura managara Octobr	<u>Indicators</u>		Comments
2.1 Access to high quality maternal and child health services is increased, particularly for the poor and socially disadvantaged.	Impact Indicators: Percentage decrease in the maternal mortality and morbidity rates at national level (There is increase of 20%) Percentage decrease in the infant and child mortality and morbidity rates at national level Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of maternal and child health cases referred to secondary and tertiary levels Percentage decrease in the case specific morbidity rate Percentage decrease in the number of delivery complications Percentage decrease in the number of home deliveries Percentage increase in the number of visits to PHC facilities	Data and Records: NSS data DHS data MOH data and records Centre for Disease Control records NSMS data Regional Government data Municipal Administration data Reports and Publications: MDG reports PRSP reviews and reports MOH reports Centre for Disease Control reports Regional Government reports MOH reports Centre for Disease Control reports Regional Government reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites	 UNFPA-Strengthening SRH Services (outcome 2.1). Outcome will be achieved. WHO- According to WHO/EURO and M. of Health agreement. Several outcomes. Will be completed in 2009. ¹² UNICEF(1)- Health policy, Development and Advocacy. Will be completed in 2009. UNICEF(2)- Health and Nutrition: Improving Quality and Access. Will be completed in 2009. UNICEF(3)- Health and Nutrition: Child ,Family and Community Participation. Will be completed in 2009
2.2 Access to high quality primary health care is increased, particularly for youth and socially disadvantaged.	 Impact Indicators: Percentage increase in the accessibility of PHC at national and regional levels Percentage increase in the share of health care expenditures in GDP (Only 1 percentage point in three years) 	Data and Records: NSS data DHS data MOH data MFE data NSMS data	 UNFPA-Strengthening SRH Services (outcome 2.2). Outcome will be achieved. WHO- According to WHO/EURO and M. of Health agreement. Several outcomes. Will be completed in 2009. UNICEF(1). See 2.1 UNICEF(2) See: 2.1

¹² Note: WHO does not work in the Country on a project basis. Regional Bureau in Europe and M. of Health select priority areas.

	Outcome Indicators: • Percentage increase in state budget allocations for PHC • Percentage increase in the ratio of PHC targeted funds to the state budget allocations for health sector	 Centre for Disease Control records Reports and Publications: MDG reports PRSP and MTEF reviews and reports MOH reports Centre for Disease Control reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites 	•	UNICEF(3)- See 2.1 UNAIDS- Development of national program HIV/AIDS prevention. Completed UNAIDS- MARP's size estimation. To be completed UNAIDS- Evaluation of GFATM supported projects. Completed
2.3 Access to high quality reproductive health services is increased, particularly for youth and socially disadvantaged.	Impact Indicators: • Percentage increase in accessibility to Reproductive Health services Outcome Indicators: • Percentage increase in state budget allocations for RH services • Percentage increase in the ratio of the RH targeted funds to state budget allocations for health care .	Data and Records: NSS data DHS data MFE data MOH data and records NSMS data KAPS data Reports and Publications: MOH reports UN Agency reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites	•	UNFPA-Strengthening SRH Services (outcome 2.3). Outcome will be achieved. WHO- According to WHO/EURO and M. of Health agreement. Several outcomes. Will be completed in 2009. UNAIDS- Development of national program HIV/AIDS prevention. Completed UNAIDS- Support to CCM for the proposal to Global Fund. Completed UNAIDS- Evaluation of GFATM supported projects. Completed
2.4 Access to HIV/AIDS prevention and treatment services is increased.	Percentage decrease in the HIV/AIDS prevalence rate and Mother to Child Transmission (MTCT) cases at national level Percentage increase in the ratio of HIV/AIDS targeted funds to state budget allocations for health care Outcome Indicators: Percentage decrease in the HIV prevalence rate among at-risk groups (intravenous drug users,	 Data and Records: MOH data and records MFE data National Centre for AIDS Prevention data and records Reports and Publications: MDG reports MOH reports 	•	UNFPA-Reproductive Health Initiative for Youth (2006-2009?). Contributes To 2.4. Will be completed WHO-UNICEF- See 2.1 UNHCR-HIV/AIDS prevention program Completed UNDP-HIV/AIDS prevention system in penitentiaries, police and military. Completed UNDP-Support to national program on HIV/AIDS. Completed

	sex workers, men having sex with men, migrants, prisoners) • Percentage increase in the number of children born from HIV positive mothers who are not infected with HIV • Percentage increase in the number of people with advanced HIV infection receiving ARV combination therapy • Percentage decrease in the HIV prevalence rate in 15-24 age group	 National Centre for AIDS Prevention reports WHO reports UNAIDS Annual AIDS epidemic updates Gon-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites 	 UNDP- Support to PLHIV.Completed UNAIDS- Development of national program HIV/AIDS prevention. Completed UNAIDS- Support to establish an M&E system. Completed UNAIDS- Support to PLHIV and their families. To be completed in 2009. UNAIDS- Evaluation of GFATM supported projects. Completed
2.5 Access to quality care for at-risk children including children with disabilities, abused children, street children, children from disadvantaged households, and children in residential care institutions is increased.	 Impact Indicators: Percentage decrease in the number of children living below the poverty and food lines at national and regional levels Percentage decrease in the number of households with children living below the poverty and food lines at national and regional levels Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the enrolment rate of disabled children in the FASS Percentage increase in the nominal and real value of average family allowance for families with children and 900 in orphanages In 2003, approximately 10,000 children with disabilities were included in the MLSA database In 2003, more than 200 "street children" were included in the MLSA database 	Data and Records: NSS data MLSA data and records NSMS data Commission of Minors (COM) records Regional Government data Municipal Administration data Reports and Publications: MLSA reports MES reports MES reports MES reports Con-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites	UNICEF-Legal and administrative reforms On child protection Will be completed in 2009 UNICEF-Strengthening the child protection accountability mechanisms. Will be completed in 2009. UNICEF-Child-family community participation in child protection. Will be completed in 2009.
2.6 Access to the national registration system, particularly for newborn and unregistered children, is increased.	 Impact Indicators: Percentage decrease in the infant mortality rate at national level Outcome Indicators: Percentage decrease in discrepancies between official rate and DHS data on infant mortality (Decrease from 20.5% to 13.7% in 5 years) 	 Data and Records: NSS data DHS data MOH data and records MOJ data and records Regional Government data Municipal Administration data 	 UNFPA, Population Development Strategies. 2005-9. It will contribute to outcome of strategy and policy. It will be completed. WHO- According to WHO/EURO and M. of Health agreement. Several outcomes. Mostly completed. UNICEF(1)- See 2.1 UNICEF(2) See: 2.1 UNICEF(3)- See 2.1

	Percentage increase in the number of registrations of newborn children and infant deaths	Reports and Publications: MDG reports MOH reports MOJ reports UNICEF reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites	UNICEF-Legal and administrative reforms 0n child protection. be completed in 2009. UNICEF-family community participation in child protection. To be completed in 2009 UNHCR-Birth registration survey. Yet to be completed. UNICEF-Strengthening the child protection accountability mechanism. To be completed in 2009.
2.7 Under-six children in targeted communities benefit from comprehensive Early Childhood Development services.	 Impact Indicators: Percentage increase in the enrolment rate of under-six children at national and regional levels and in urban and rural areas (21.8% of pre-school children now enrolled) Outcome Indicators: Number of ECD policies developed and adopted (Accomplished) Number of national standards on ECD developed and adopted (Accomplished) 	Data and Records: NSS data DHS data NSMS data Regional Government data Municipal Administration data Reports and Publications: MES reports AST bulletins Regional Government reports UNICEF reports UNICEF reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites	UNICEF- Education reform and child development. Will be completed in 2009.
2.8 At least 90 percent of children benefit from timely vaccinations, including new and underused antigens.	Impact Indicators: • Percentage decrease in the case specific morbidity and mortality rates from vaccine-preventable diseases at national level Outcome Indicators: • Percentage increase in the share of Government contributions in total vaccine procurement • Percentage increase in the number of children receiving timely vaccinations	Data and Records: NSS data DHS data MOH data Regional Government data Municipal Administration data UNICEF, WHO data	 WHO- According to WHO/EURO and M. of Health agreement. Several outcomes. Some completed UNICEF(1)-See; 2.1 UNICEF(2) See: 2.1 UNICEF(3)- See 2.1

	Percentage increase in the rate of usage of selected antigens	Reports and Publications:	
2.9 Children in at least 50 percent of schools are represented on school councils.	Percentage increase in the enrolment rates at national and regional levels and in urban and rural areas Percentage increase in the school-life expectancy rate at national and regional levels Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of schools with students participating in self-governance bodies (Achieved) Percentage increase in the number of schoolchildren participating in school councils (All schools now have councils)	Data and Records: NSS data MES data Regional Government data Municipal Administration data School Administration data Reports and Publications: MES reports Centre for Education Reforms reports WB reports UNICEF reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites NGO websites	UNICEF - Education reform and child development. Completed.

2.10At least 50 percent of children in	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		nta and Records: NSS data	UNICEF - Education reform and child development. Will be completed in 2009.
	Percentage increase in enrolment rates at			
primary and	national and regional levels and in urban and	•	NSMS data	
secondary schools	rural areas	•	Regional Government data	

benefit from needs based and life-skills programmes.	Percentage decrease in the real unemployment rate for 16-18 age group Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of employed 16-18 year olds Percentage increase in the number of school graduates employed within the first year	Municipal Administration data School Administration data Reports and Publications: MES reports Centre for Education Reforms reports WB reports UNICEF reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites	
2.11School-age children from culturally different and socially disadvantaged backgrounds benefit from ageappropriate and culturally-sensitive learning materials.	 Impact Indicators: Percentage increase in the enrolment rate at national and regional levels and in urban and rural areas Percentage increase in accessibility to primary and general education at national and regional levels and in urban and rural areas Percentage increase in the school-life expectancy rate at national and regional levels and in urban and rural areas Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of refugee, national minority schoolchildren and children with disabilities enrolled in schools Percentage increase in the attendance rate of refugee, national minority schoolchildren and children with disabilities in schools (Currently 31 inclusive schools, 120 by 2010) 	Data and Records: NSS data MES data MES data MLSA data DMR data and records NSMS data Reports and Publications: MES reports MES reports MLSA reports MLSA reports UNICEF, UNHCR reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites	UNICEF - Education reform and child development. Possibly completed in 2009

2.12Reproductive-aged populations benefit from reproductive health services.	 Impact Indicators: Percentage increase in accessibility of health care services at national and regional levels and in urban and rural areas Percentage decrease in the maternal mortality rate at national level (Decreased from 34% to 15%) Percentage increase in the contraceptive prevalence rate at national level Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of reproductive age population with access to high-quality integrated RH services and information Percentage decrease in the number of abortions (Increased slightly) Percentage decrease in STI incidence 	Data and Records: NSS data DHS data MOH data and records NSMS data National Centre for AIDS Prevention records Reports and Publications: MOH reports AST bulletins National Centre for AIDS Prevention reports UNFPA, UNAIDS, WHO reports UNFPA, UNAIDS, WHO reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites	 UNFPA-Strengthening SRH Services (outcome 2.12). Outcome will be achieved. UNFPA, Population Development Strategies. 2005-9. It will contribute to outcome of strategy and policy. It will be completed. WHO- According to WHO/EURO and M. of Health agreement. Several outcomes. Will be completed in 2009.
2.13Micronutrient deficiencies decline.	 Impact Indicators: Percentage decrease in the incidence and prevalence rates of IDD and IDA for children and women Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of households using adequately iodised salt Percentage increase in the urinary iodine median rate Number of nutrition standards for children aged 0 to 3 and pregnant women revised and adopted 	Data and Records:	WFP- Relief and recovery assistance to vulnerable groups. Completed

2.14Parents, youth, families, communities and caregivers participate actively in the development of social policies and the provision and monitoring of health, protection and education services.	 Impact Indicators: Percentage increase in accessibility of primary health care at national and regional levels and in urban and rural areas Percentage decrease in the morbidity rate at national and regional levels and in urban and rural areas Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of families and children knowledgeable about alternative care services Percentage increase in the number of timely referrals to PHC services Percentage increase in the number of timely referrals for ARI and Chronic Diarrhoeal Diseases (CDD) parental education 	Data and Records: NSS data DHS data MOH data and records NSMS data KAPS data Regional Government data Municipal Administration data Reports and Publications: MOH reports Regional Government reports Regional Government reports UNFPA, WHO, UNICEF reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites	 UNICEF(1)- See; 2.1 UNICEF(2) See: 2.1 UNICEF(3)- See 2.1 UNICEF-Legal and administrative reform on child protection. To be completed in 2009. UNICEF-Strengthening the child protection accountability mechanism To be completed in 2009. UNICEF-Child- family community participation in child protection. To be completed in 2009.
2.15Youth and at-risk people participate actively in community-based prevention programmes for STI and HIV/AIDS and the development of STI and HIV/AIDS policies.	Impact Indicators: • Percentage decrease in the STI/HIV/AIDS prevalence rate among youth and at-risk people at national level Outcome Indicators: • Percentage decrease in the number of STI/HIV/AIDS cases among youth and at-risk people • Number of STI/HIV/AIDS policies and programmes addressing the needs of youth and at-risk people developed and adopted	Data and Records:	 WHO- According to WHO/EURO and M. of Health agreement. Several outcomes. Mostly completed. UNICEF(1)- See 2.1 UNICEF(2) See: 2.1 UNICEF - Education reform and child development. Possibly completed in 2009.

2.16Child-care services
are monitored
effectively by NGOs
and CBOs.

Impact Indicators:

• Percentage increase in the SAI

Outcome Indicators:

- Number of policies and programmes formulated by NGOs and CBOs developed and adopted
- Percentage increase in the number of NGOs and CBOs involved in the NSMS

Data and Records:

- NSS data
- NSMS data
- Municipal Administration data
- Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) Committee concluding observations

Reports and Publications:

- MLSA reports
- MFA Reports on Convention on the Rights of the Child
- NGO Coalition for Children Alternative Report on the CRC

On-line Sources:

- Government websites
- UN Agency websites
- Donor websites
- NGO websites

- UNDP-Support to participatory policy development. Will be completed in 2009
- UNICEF-Strengthening the child protection accountability mechanism. To be completed in 2009.
- UNICEF- Child-family community participation. To be completed in 2009.

UNDAF OUTCOME THREE DEMOCRATIC GOVERNANCE

The main goal in this area of cooperation is to improve the transparency and accountability of Government institutions in accordance with the MDGs and PRSP.

Pro	gramme Outcomes	<u>Indicators</u>	Sources of Verification	<u>Risks</u>
3.1	National Assembly councils and commissions and the Chamber of Control function effectively.	 Impact Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of positive evaluations by the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe (PACE) Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of Chamber of Control recommendations implemented Percentage increase in the ratio of implemented Chamber of Control recommendations to the total number of recommendations Percentage increase in the ratio of legislative initiatives drafted by NA councils and commissions to the total number of legislative initiatives Number of laws developed, reviewed and adopted in conformity with international standards 	 Data and Records: Official Bulletin of RA Constitutional Court protocols Reports and Publications: Council of Europe reports Venice Commission reports Chamber of Control reports On-line Sources: NA website Chamber of Control website Government website IRTEK website 	
	Municipal services are implemented and monitored effectively.	 Impact Indicators: Improved ranking in the Democratisation Index (DI) Percentage increase in the PCI at national and regional levels Percentage increase in the SAI at national and regional levels Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of positive evaluations in public opinion surveys on service delivery conducted at community level 	Data and Records: NSS data NSMS data Public opinion surveys Regional Government data Municipal Administration data Reports and Publications: Regional Government reports	 UNICEF-Child-family community participation in child protection. To be completed in 2009 UNDP- Performance budgeting. Completed in 2008 UNDP- Municipal service system Completed UNDP- Partnership for community based projects. Will be completed I 2008. UNDP-Crossborder cooperation between the Shirak regionCompleted UNDP- Development of community typology Completed

	 Percentage increase in the ratio of public services offered by municipal administration to the total number of delegated services Percentage increase in the share of community budget allocations for public services to total community budgets Percentage increase in the ratio of citizen complaints addressed by municipal administration to the total number of complaints received 	 Public Service Regulatory Commission reports WB reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites 	UNICEF-Legal and administrative reforms in child protection. To be completed in 2009 UNICEF-Strengthening the child protection accountability mechanism. To be completed in 2009
3.3 Policies in pilot ministries are developed effectively and transparently.	 Impact Indicators: Improved ranking in the DI Percentage increase in the PAI at national level Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of normative acts developed and adopted on the basis of recommendations made by PAFUs Number of mid- and long-term programmes developed and adopted by pilot ministries 	Data and Records: Official Bulletin of RA NA records NSMS data Reports and Publications: MFA reports MNP reports MOE reports Nations In Transit reports On-line Sources: Government websites IRTEK website	UNFPA, Population Development Strategies. 2005-9.It will contribute to outcome of strategy and policy. It will be completed in 2009.
3.4 The 2005-2009 elections are administered effectively and transparently.	 Impact Indicators: Improved ranking in the Freedom House index Improved ranking in the DI Percentage increase in the SAI at national and regional levels Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the ratio of positive evaluations of the 2005-2009 elections to the total number of international and local evaluations 	Data and Records: NSS data NSMS data CEC data and records Reports and Publications: Local and international election observation mission reports CEC training handbooks CEC pre- and post-election studies	

	Percentage decrease in the number of inaccuracies reported in the electoral process Percentage increase in the number of local observation reports	 Nations in Transit reports Freedom House reports On-line Sources: CEC website UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites 	
3.5 Public access to the legislative process is increased.	 Impact Indicators: Improved ranking in the DI Percentage increase in the PCI at national and regional level Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of adopted laws lobbied by interest groups 	Data and Records: NSS data NSMS data Official Bulletin of RA Reports and Publications: Office of Prime Minister reports Public Defender reports NA commission and council reports WB reports Nations In Transit reports On-line Sources: Government websites NA website NGO websites	
3.6 Public access to legislative and executive bodies is increased.	 Impact Indicators: Improved ranking in the Digital Access Index (DAI) at national and regional levels Percentage increase in the TAI at national and regional levels Percentage increase in the SAI at national and regional levels Improved ranking in the DI Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of people accessing e-Governance systems and public information delivery facilities Percentage increase in the number of requests 	Data and Records: NSS data NSMS data Regional Government data Municipal Administration data Reports and Publications: Office of Prime Minister reports MTA reports Regional Government reports World Telecommunication Development reports Nations In Transit reports	

	and responses channelled through e-Governance systems and public information delivery facilities • Number of municipal administrations offering public services on-line	On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites NGO websites	
3.7 Public institutions protect and promote human rights effectively.	Impact Indicators: Improved ranking in the Freedom House index Improved ranking in the DI Outcome Indicators: National Strategy on Human Rights (NSHR) developed and adopted	Data and Records: Official Bulletin of RA MES data Reports and Publications: MES HR training handbooks MES reports Human Rights Watch reports Freedom House reports Nations In Transit reports Public Defender reports UNICEF reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites	UNICEF-Child-family community participation in child protection. To be completed by 2009.
3.8 The Public Defender's Office functions independently and effectively.	Impact Indicators: Improved ranking in the Freedom House index Improved ranking in the DI Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the ratio of human rights cases successfully addressed by the Public Defender to the total number of cases Percentage increase in the number of cases brought to the Public Defender	Reports and Publications: Public Defender reports Freedom House reports Nations In Transit reports	

3.9 Access to high quality services for refugees is increased. 3.10 Access to high quality services for asylum-seekers is increased.	 Impact indicators: Percentage increase in the number of positive country evaluations by Human Rights Watch Percentage increase in the number of positive country evaluations by Amnesty International Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the share of registered asylum-seekers in the total number of asylum-seekers 	Data and Records: DMR data UNHCR data Reports and Publications: MOD reports DMR reports Police Department reports Human Rights Watch reports Amnesty International reports	 UNFPA, Population Development Strategies. 2005-9.It will contribute to outcome of strategy and policy. It will be completed. UNHCR-Democratic governance. On-going
3.11 Public institutions combat human and drug trafficking effectively.	Impact Indicators: Improved ranking in the country's human trafficking status by the US State Department Outcome Indicators: Percentage decrease in the number of illegal drug users Percentage decrease in the number of human trafficking victims	Data and Records: DMR data Police Department data Customs Department data Reports and Publications: Police Department reports MFE reports Anti-trafficking Commission reports	UNICEF-Child-family community participation in child protection. To be completed in 2009 UNICEF-Adolescent health development Will be completed in 2009 ILO- Development of comprehensive anti-trafficking response in Armenia Will be completed
3.12 Human rights violations are monitored effectively by civil society.	 Impact Indicators: Improved ranking in the Freedom House index Percentage increase in the number of positive country evaluations by Human Rights Watch Percentage increase in the number of positive country evaluations by Amnesty International Percentage increase in the SAI at national and regional levels 	Data and Records: NSMS data Reports and Publications: Public Defender reports UNICEF reports Human Rights Watch reports Amnesty International reports	

	Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of refugees and asylum-seekers using services available in their communities Percentage decrease in the number of human rights violations, including child rights .	On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites	
3.13 The National Anti- corruption Strategy is monitored effectively by civil society.	 Impact Indicators: Improved ranking in the Corruption Perception Index (CPI) Percentage decrease in the State Capture Index (SCI) at national level Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the ratio of poor governance practices reviewed by the Government to the total number reported by civil society Number of National Anti-corruption Strategy monitoring indicators incorporated into the NSMS Number of stories on corruption covered by the media 	Data and Records: Official Bulletin of RA NSMS data Reports and Publications: Office of Prime Minister reports EBRD Transition Reports Transparency International reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites	
3.14 Gender-based violence is reduced and women participate actively in political processes at all levels.	 Impact Indicators: Percentage increase in the GDI at national level Improved ranking in the DI Percentage increase in the number of positive country evaluations by Human Rights Watch Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of women candidates running for local, parliamentary and 	Data and Records: NSS data Official Bulletin RA NSMS data MLSA data Reports and Publications: National HDR National Committee on Gender	

presidential elections (Increase of 8%) Percentage increase in the number of women elected to community councils and NA Percentage increase in the ratio of women elected to the total number of women candidates running for community councils and NA Percentage increase in the number of women appointed to senior decision making levels Percentage increase in the number of women leaders and women's groups participating in conflict resolution processes Percentage increase in the ratio of cases of gender- based violence addressed by local authorities and protection bodies to the total number of cases reported Number of stories on cases of gender- based violence covered by the media	observation missions reports Police Department reports Nations In Transit reports Human Rights Watch reports WB reports On-line Sources: Government websites CEC website UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites
---	--

UNDAF OUTCOME FOUR ENVIRONMENTAL GOVERNANCE

The main goal in this area of cooperation is to promote environmentally sound technologies and effective management of natural resources in accordance with the MDGs and PRSP.

Programme Outcomes	<u>Indicators</u>	Sources of Verification	<u>Comments</u>
4.1 Government growth strategies and plans are based on the principles of sustainable development.	 Impact Indicators: Percentage increase in the Sustainable Development Index (SDI) and HDI at national level Outcome Indicators: Number of sectoral strategies and plans incorporating SD principles developed and adopted Number of policies based on recommendations 	 Official Bulletin of RA MNP data and records NCSD records Reports and Publications: 	 UNFPA-Strengthening SRH Services (outcome 4.1). Will be completed. UNFPA, Population Development Strategies. 2005-9.It will contribute to outcome of strategy and policy. It will be completed.

	from the NCSD	 NHD reports Global HDR NCSD reports On-line Sources: Government websites NCSD website UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites 	
4.2 The national education system promotes the principles of sustainable development effectively.	 Impact Indicators: Percentage increase in the SDI at national level Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of education institutions with courses on SD Percentage increase in the number of students in secondary and tertiary education institutions that have taken courses on SD 	Data and Records: NSS data Official Bulletin of RA MNP data and records MES data and records NCSD data and records MNP reports MNP reports MES reports UN Agency reports Government websites UN Agency websites NGO websites	UNFPA, Population Development Strategies. 2005-9.It will contribute to outcome of strategy and policy. It will be completed.
4.3 Funding mechanisms for environmental protection function effectively.	 Impact Indicators: Percentage decrease in the Ecological Situation Index (ESI) at national and regional levels Percentage increase in the HSI at national and regional levels Percentage increase in the share of allocations for environmental protection in GDP Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in state budget allocations 	Data and Records: NSS data Official Bulletin of RA MFE data MNP data and records NSMS data NCSD data and records Reports and Publications: MDG reports	

for environmental protection • Percentage increase in the ratio of budget expenditures for nature protection to the total revenue from natural resources • Percentage increase in the volume of investments channelled through the National Environmental Fund (NEF)	 PRSP reviews and reports MNP reports National HDR AST bulletins NCSD reports Regional Government reports UNDP, UNEP, WB reports
	On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites

4.4 Public institutions combat environmental health hazards effectively.	 Impact Indicators: Percentage decrease in the morbidity rate caused by environmental heath hazards at national level Outcome Indicators: Percentage decrease in the number of water-born and food-born incidents Percentage decrease in the level of medical waste in public garbage sites Number of injuries among children and their families caused by environmental hazards been delayed. 	Data and Records: NSS data MNP data MOH data and records DHS data Reports and Publications: MOH reports MNP reports UNICEF, WHO reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites	 WHO- According to WHO/EURO and M. of Health agreement. Several outcomes. Completed in 2007. UNIDO- Establishment and operation of a cleaner production program. To be completed in 2008.
4.5 Lake Sevan is managed and conserved	Impact Indicators: • Percentage increase in the water level of Lake Sevan	Data and Records:NSS dataMNP data and records	

effectively.	 Percentage increase in the number of people living below the poverty and food lines in the Lake Sevan basin Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of fish in Lake Sevan Percentage increase in the number of monitored and improved water quality indicators (BOD₅, N and P content) Percentage increase in the share of income from recreational activities in the total income of households in the Lake Sevan basin management Number of officials and civil society representatives trained on Lake Sevan basin integrated management 	 Regional Government data Municipal Administration data Reports and Publications: MNP reports Regional Government reports UNDP, UNEP, WB reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites NGO websites 	
4.6 Bio-diverse resources are managed and conserved effectively.	Impact Indicators: • Percentage increase in the amount of forest-covered areas at national and regional levels • Percentage increase in the ratio of specially protected areas to the total territory of the country Outcome Indicators: • Percentage decrease in the amount of illegally-cut forest • Percentage increase in the number of newly established SPAs • Percentage increase in the number of species recorded in the Red Book	Data and Records: NSS data Official Bulletin of RA MNP data and records Regional Government data Municipal Administration data Reports and Publications: MNP reports Regional Government reports UNDP, UNEP, WB reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites	

4.7Water resources are managed effectively.	 Impact Indicators: Percentage increase in the accessibility of safe drinking water at national and regional levels Percentage increase in the accessibility of safe irrigation water resources at national level Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of monitored and improved water quality indicators Number of regulatory acts on water management developed and adopted Percentage increase in the area covered by rehabilitated mechanical and biological treatment plants 	 Data and Records: NSS data NSMS data MNP data and records Water Management State Committee data Regional Government data Municipal Administration data Reports and Publications: MDG reports MNP reports Environmental Impact Monitoring Centre Reports Regional Government reports National HDR AST bulletins UNDP, WB, IFAD reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites 	
4.8The Kura-Araks river basin is managed effectively.	Impact Indicators: Percentage decrease in the trans-boundary pollution rate of Kura-Araks river basin Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of monitored water quality indicators Number of regional agreements on joint monitoring of Kura-Araks river basin developed and adopted by riparian countries .	Data and Records: NSS data Official Bulletin of RA MNP data and records Regional Government data Municipal Administration data Reports and Publications: MNP reports Regional Government reports UN Agency reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites	WHO- According to WHO/EURO and M. of Health agreement. Several outcomes. Completed in 2007.

		NGO websites	
4.9 Public institutions combat land degradation and desertification effectively.	 Impact Indicators: Percentage decrease in the amount of land area threatened by desertification at national level Percentage increase in the amount of arable land area at national and regional levels Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the amount of irrigated land Percentage increase in the amount of recultivated land 	Data and Records: NSS data MNP data and records MOA data State Cadastre data Regional Government data Municipal Administration data Reports and Publications: MNP reports National reports to UNCCD MOA reports UNDP, UNEP, WB reports On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites NGO websites	
4.10Public institutions effectively help to mitigate the impact of climate change.	Impact Indicators: Percentage decrease in the volume of losses caused by climate change hazards at national level Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of national development strategies incorporating climate change concerns and adaptation mechanisms Number of climate change legislative and regulatory acts developed and adopted Percentage increase in the share of renewable energy in total energy production Percentage increase in the number of sites using renewable energy resources	Data and Records: NSS data Official Bulletin of RA MNP data and records MFE data MOA data MOE data and records National GHG Inventory Reports and Publications: MNP reports MOE reports MOE reports UNDP, UNEP, WB reports	UNIDO- Establishment and operation of a cleaner production program. To be completed in 2008.

		On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites	
4.11Local NGOs and CBOs participate actively in developing, monitoring and evaluating environmental policies and programmes.	Impact Indicators: • Percentage increase in the SAI at national and regional levels Outcome Indicators: • Percentage increase in the number of complaints on environmental issues initiated by NGOs and CBOs and submitted to the courts • Percentage increase in the number of appeals passed as a result of public hearings • Percentage increase in the ratio of successfully addressed environmental complaints to the total number of appeals	Data and Records: NSS data MNP data and records NSMS data Reports and Publications: MNP reports AST bulletins On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites NGO websites	
4.12 ts, youth, families, communities and health-service providers participate actively in promoting safe environments.	Impact Indicators: Percentage decrease in the morbidity rate caused by environmental hazards at national and regional levels Outcome Indicators: Percentage increase in the number of communities promoting safe environment and healthy life-style through their development plans		

	On-line Sources: Government websites UN Agency websites Donor websites NGO websites
--	--

As can be observed from the tables above some indicators that were readily available are indicated in red. It must be understood that tracking all the indicators would have been counterproductive, time wise. Many indicators required, e.g., investigations in parliamentary records, enactments of laws etc. Moreover not all of them may have been accessible. ¹³

2.3. Partners and Resources of UNDAF

UNDAF is a collaborative endeavour where practically all UN agencies cooperate not only in programme implementation but also in sharing the financing responsibilities. At the time when UNDAF was launched financial requirements were also estimated. These expected outlays are given in the Table below.

Table Estimated Outlays (US\$ 000)

	Economic Equity	Social Equity	Governance	Environment	TOTAL	
UNDP	7,300	872	9,100	8,000	25,272	
UNHCR	1,200	750	750		2,750	
UNICEF	500	3,865	1,000	100	5,465	
WFP	680	5,484		65	6,229	
UUNFPA	350	800	150		1,300	
WHO		210		70	280	
FAO	600			690	1,290	
UNEP				3,350	3,350	
UNIDO				500	500	
	10,680	11,981	11,000	15,665	48,436	

As can be surmised, the first three areas – economic equity, social equity, governance – had about the same budget requirements; the environmental issues had some higher requirements, perhaps due to the fact that historically, i.e., during the Soviet times, environment was always given secondary importance. Financial contributions to UNDAF were not expected to come only from the Agency budgets, but from the bilateral and multilateral assistance organizations. The implementation of UNDAF components has shown a great deal of success. Including the cost sharing with the multilateral and bilateral agencies, the realized outlays exceeded considerably the original estimates. The financial success of UNDAF will be taken up once again in the following section.¹⁴

_

¹³ It took this Consultant one full day to track only a few indicators, which are shown in their appropriate places in red. The inordinate amount required to verify them all was deemed unproductive at the end. Moreover for the same outcome/impact different indicators gave different results.

¹⁴ See also Annex 4

3. Assessment of UNDAF

Now, to recapitulate the findings discussed in the previous chapter: The overall expected outcomes of the four pillars can be summarized thus:

- Economic Equity. Reduction in inequality and poverty through job creation and income generation, vocational training, capacity development and access to reproductive health and family planning.
- Increase in social equity through equal access to health, education and nutrition and housing social equity.
- Increase in transparency and accountability in national and local authorities through increased access to public information and increased knowledge of rights.
- The assurance of the establishment of national capacities for implementation of environmentally sound technologies and of sustainable economic development and human health protection.

Before a detailed analysis is pursued several conceptual issues must be pointed out. First and foremost UNDAF, being a **holistic** document, is a general guideline that must be evaluated from the standpoint of its intent. Its success cannot be evaluated unless the outcomes and impact of its component projects are assessed. Secondly, it is important to note whether UNDAF contains sufficient measurable indicators that are conducive to evaluation. In general terms this Report finds the UNDAF document has complied with these two conditions.

The Report looks at UNDAF from a macro point of view and strives to assess its achievements under four sub-headings.

3.1 Design

UNDAF appears to have been prepared thoroughly and with great detail. It also appears that all requisite documents have been reviewed before its design. ¹⁶ In other words, preparation of UNDAF has followed the logical steps of convening a prioritization workshop, liaised with the Government in order to assure concordance with PRSP and MDG strategies. The UNDAF that emerged clearly identified the issues to be tackled and the correct outputs, outcomes and the expected impacts. Baselines are clearly delineated; outcome and impact indicators, which are mostly quantitative appear to be facilitating their assessment in the first instance.

Unfortunately this was not the case. In more cases than not, the indicators were not readily available, or they were not available at all. After several attempts this Report decided to use individual projects' achievements rather than relying on UNDAF indicators, except in cases where information was readily available in one UNDP document.¹⁷

Box: MDGs of Armenia

- Eradicate extreme hunger and poverty.
- Achieve universal primary education.
- Promote gender equality and empower women.
- Reduce child mortality.
- Improve maternal health.
- Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases.
- Ensure environmental stability.
- Develop a global partnership for development.

45

¹⁵ See: UNEG, Evaluability of the UN Development Assistance Framework. 2006. p. 18

¹⁶ It should be noted that CCA, which is a necessary background document for design was not available in time.

¹⁷ UNDP, Country Development Situation Assessment for Armenia. March 2008

3.2 Relevance

Two basic concepts are the guiding pillars in deciding the relevance of UNDAF in question: namely, a) the strategic positioning and focus of UN on key outcomes and impacts; and b) the outcomes and impacts relevant to national priorities, as well as consistent with the *Achieving Millennium Development Goals in Armenia* and *PRSP*. However, *Common Country Assessment*, usually prepared by the United Nations, was not used in the preparation of UNDAF. It relied mostly on the Government's PRSP document¹⁹.

According to PRSP reduction in poverty and inequality is one of the major goals. This reduction has several ramifications, which are articulated in the Document. They are briefly: Expansion of economic activities; better health, welfare, and education; better governance; efficient public administration; and better utilization of natural resources.

Each and every one of these objectives and the policy measures to achieve these objectives are articulated in the Document. Concomitantly the strengthening of the capacity of key institutions is a recurrent theme in all the documents, although there is not a single stand-alone capacity project. The issues of MDGs are in fact a cross-cutting theme that occurs throughout. To track properly the advances made is of paramount importance, which requires no justification. Enhancing the capacity of local communities so that they can participate in the progress of MDGs is also *sine qua non* and it is an inalienable component of *good governance*. Even a cursory comparison between UNDAF and PRSP reveals the parallelism between the two.

Hence, the Report expresses the opinion that the expected outcomes and impacts certainly reflect the priorities of the Government and the overall mandate of UNDAF. All Programmes under review in this Report are relevant and pertinent to the expected outcomes in the realm of enhanced capacity of designated institutions as well as contributors to Millennium Development goals. The relevance of the strategic positioning of UN is attested by the support it received from the donor community. The Report finds that the interventions were timely and relevant and consistent with UN strategic goals and the goals of the Government.

3.3 Efficiency and Effectiveness

Efficiency can be measured in a variety of ways. One method would be to estimate the proportion of the resources that UN allots to a set of outcomes to their administrative costs. Another method is to compare the extent of UN's contribution to the outcomes and impacts with that of its partners.

Overall administration cost varied during the years between 2005 and 2007. In 2008 it is expected to be about 14%. There is no hard and fast rule as to what the administrative cost should be with respect to total outlays. Administrative costs vary with prices and salary levels in a country. Nonetheless, one would have wished this percentage to be closer to ten. However the Report wishes to add that in a number of so-called transition economies the administrative cost is considerably higher than that of Armenia. ²¹

The picture is quite different when UN's financial contribution versus that of its partners is taken as a yardstick. During the UNDAF period UN underwrote 31.5 % of the cost of the projects that composed UNDAF, while the bilateral and multilateral donors financed 68.5% of the outlays. Considering that UN had to respond quickly to the Government's growing needs and priorities and mobilized funds that are twice as

_

¹⁸ Millennium Development Goals (Armenia 2005) can be obtained from: www.UNDP.am-MDG

¹⁹ PRSP is the only document in which the Government articulated its goals, objectives and the policy measures. See: Republic of Armenia, *Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper*. Yerevan 2003.

²⁰ Taken from *UNDP Managements Results Framework* 9/15/2008.

²¹Turkmenistan 26 %, Kazakhstan 27 %, Macedonia 15 %.

high as core funds one can surmise that the efficiency of UN must have played an important role in resource mobilization. ²²

Effectiveness poses the question whether, given the budget, the specified output could have been achieved at a lower cost. The Consultant does not have any comparative data to make a fair judgment. Nor does UN's accounting system allow such a comparison. However, given the outputs and their qualities and the reasonably modest sums allocated to them, one cannot but help tend to think that by and large the UN Country Office was effective.

It is important in this context at least some multilateral and bilateral partners of the UN agencies should be mentioned. EU is the most important multilateral donor. Norway, Italy and USAID are among the top ones. In addition the contributions made by the Government and the private sector should also be mentioned.

3.4 Sustainability

Sustainability refers to the durability of positive results after the termination of the technical cooperation. It is important to assess that the programme/project results are institutionalized and internalized. With respect to outcome and impact sustainability refers to the positive change in the situation will endure and lead to other projects/programmes pursued by the Government. This Report adheres to the view that it would be rather presumptuous the discuss the sustainability of UNDAF as such, since in the final analysis sustainability will depend upon the sustainability of the programmes/projects that have completed at the end of the period and upon their success/failures to yield outcomes that are or are not sustainable. In very general terms, however, overall outcomes as delineated in the UNDAF document are likely to be sustainable, provided that UNDAF is linked to national priorities. In that sense, conjecturally it is safe to say that sustainability is highly likely since, as argued above, there certainly is a close link between national priorities and expected UNDAF outcomes. However, the final verdict will have to wait until the programmes/projects of each agency are subjected to an in-depth final evaluation. If and when such evaluations are conducted, three elements will come into play, namely, 1- degree of transfer of technology ad 2- intensity and internalization of training. However, the political will is the most important determining factor for sustainability. Should subsequent evaluations find these three conditions in place, it is only then that one can unequivocally state that UNDAF is sustainable.

3.5 Perceptions

Perception is a fairly recently introduced concept in evaluation. UNDP, through its Country-Level Impact Assessment (CLIA) methodology developed in 1999, underlined the benefit of this approach to record the differences of views and opinions of partners on a specific programme or institution. If a programme/project is to be improved, it is important to know how the outsiders perceive its image, so that when the image is negative the missing or correct explanation can be introduced, or the elements that create this negative image can be modified. The Consultant would like to make clear that the perceptions cited here are those of the interviewed, and do not necessarily reflect the views already expressed in this Report.

The implementing partners appear to have a high regard for UN agencies. They frequently cited responsiveness, neutrality, administrative efficiency and flexibility, as well as UN's understanding of the realities of Armenia.²³ They appeared to be impressed by the thoroughness of the UNDAF document, which

_

²² For details of the financial sources see Annex. 4. Also note that the outlays for the year 2009 are projections.

²³ The Consultant does not have documentary evidence to sustain this understanding. It is only based on informal interviews. However, one survey, which relates only one UN agency, provides substantial evidence towards this direction. See: UNDP *Partners Survey*. 17 March 2008. Regarding the collaborating partners the Consultant was able to interview only two donoragencies (USAID and EU). Therefore only the perceptions of these two agencies are reflected here.

helps them to understand better the issues surrounding Armenia. One agency in fact expressed its willingness to cooperate with UN when second UNDAF is in place.

Given the scope of work and time constraints, it was physically impossible to have a large sample to assess the perceptions of various entities of Government organizations, donors and the wide variety of beneficiaries. However, those who were interviewed²⁴ expressed satisfaction with the UN agencies with which they cooperate or collaborate or they are the beneficiaries of the interventions. They all expect that during the preparation of the next UNDAF the same collaboration, understanding and flexibility will prevail.

²⁴ See; Annex 2.

4. Conclusions and Recommendations

4.1 Conclusions

It can be safely stated that, in most general terms UNDAF is a well-prepared document. However, there are a number of issues that need to be elucidated here, since the Document is not totally free of certain shortcomings. These shortcomings are by no means grievous, but they need to be stated here. They will have bearings on the next UNDAF.

- In some cases, which are not very many, impacts, outcomes and outputs are not clearly defined.²⁵
- Some indicators listed, especially those of quantitative nature, are not published periodically by the Government. Listing the number of indicators for which there is no reliable or immediately accessible source to verify becomes a meaningless task. In fact the abundance of not easily obtainable indicators deprived the Consultant to verify whether expected outcomes, let alone the impacts, are in fact obtained or likely to be obtained.
- The document is much too detailed which essentially endangers the flexibility to adjust the projects according to the changing conditions and priorities of the Country.
- While many project components of various agencies include capacity building, there is no project that specifically aims at capacity building. Yet, in a country like Armenia capacity building should be a major concern. Capacity building is a kind of endeavour that must be tailored to the needs of a particular country. The need for it differs among countries. The issue of capacity building in Armenia is not so much a lack of overall capacity to carry out specific tasks that the development process requires. In reality Armenia is relatively well endowed in terms of well-prepared human resources. However, economic activities are in such levels that technically prepared human resources are employed in jobs and tasks that are considerably below their technical capacities. The main problem appears to be a supply-demand imbalance. Hence, capacity building acquires an entirely different dimension and it is imperative that the next UNDAF take into consideration this particular dimension.

Regarding the fulfillment of the objectives, it appears that almost all UN agencies will succeed in reaching the expected results, thereby making UNDAF a successful document. But as mentioned above it is, in certain cases neither the outcomes nor the impacts could be ascertained with exactitude.

Here an important issue is worth questioning, namely, had there been no UNDAF would the results have been achieved by the programmes/projects of the various Agencies? The review of the information provided by the Agencies leads this Consultant to answer positively. This answer of course begs another question, namely whether UNDAF is a fifth wheel or in fact has some added value? The answer to this question is simply an unequivocal yes, provided that UNDAF is seen as an indicative document for inter-agency cooperation and the articulation of the national priorities within the overall policy formulation of the UN family.

The Report also concludes that the design was correct and appropriate and relevant to the realities of Armenia. Given the particular conditions, it is reasonably efficient and effective and the perception it created is very positive.

²⁶ See, Sakiko Fukuda-Paar, Carlos Lopes, Khalid Malik, *Capacity for Development*, UNDP/Eartscan, New York 2002, and Marie Lavigne, *The Economics of Transition*, New York 1995.

²⁵ Some specific examples can be found in "Results Based management in UNDAF's

4.2 Recommendations

In view of the conclusions it reaches the Report wishes to put forward a set of recommendations. Some of these recommendations are of general nature and some specific, directed to better preparation of the next UNDAF.

4.2.1 General recommendations.

The starting point of general recommendations is a set of precept that can be described as follows:²⁷

- Economic growth does not have to be at the expense of increasing inequality.
- Long-term growth must focus on human development and realization of MDG.
- Advocacy efforts must increase awareness in meeting development goals.
- Good governance must be aligned with helping the poor.
- Capacity development must guide the interventions.
- Promotion of gender equality is the key-integrating theme of interventions.

Hence, taking the above into consideration, the Report suggests that the next UNDAF should be a road map towards the sustainable human development, rather than a process document or a rigid mandate. It should have sufficient flexibility to lead to closer interagency collaboration and cooperation, rather than striving to fill the appropriate boxes with different agencies' specific projects as an afterthought.²⁸

4.2.2 Specific recommendations

- The Report wishes to return to the capacity building issue with some detail. It is evident from the overall findings that many of the projects contained capacity building components either implicitly or explicitly. There are training seminars, workshops and the like. And yet the indicators to verify the results of capacity building *per se* are lacking. The end results of these capacity building efforts, in more cases than not, remain either unknown or, at best, are simply assumed and certainly difficult to assess. The Report strongly urges that, whenever it is appropriate, capacity-building components of projects/programmes should be very clearly spelt out, and worked into UNDAF. Appropriate and measurable indicators must also be spelt out.
- UNDAF should contain a systemic approach to capacity building/training, assuring the participation of educational institutions, which are mostly high quality in Armenia.
- Too many indicators both for impact and outcome assessments are very likely to end up yielding conflicting results. A few but measurable indicators should be selected with the assurance that such indicators are available readily and timely. In that vein it is recommended that *Human Development Report (HDR)* may very well be considered as a major source for setting up indicators. HDRs are usually most comprehensive and reliable source and provide time series. If need be some additional sources may also be used. One of the major additional sources would be *Armenia Human*

Characteristics of Good Indicators

S Specific

M Measurable

A Attainable

R Relevant

T Trackable

²⁷ These are not a haphazard set of norms, but are taken from the new strategic plan of UNDP (Executive Board Decision, October 2007). It is highly likely that other specialized agencies will follow suit.

²⁸ Some Agency heads indicated that in preparing the programmes of the Agencies they represent, they first adhere to their mandate and prepare their programmes, and then strive to fit them into UNDAF sub-categories. This modus operandi of course undermines the very purpose of UNDAF preparation.

- *Development Report.*²⁹ However, care should be taken that collecting and verifying indicators must be especially consistent and cost efficient.³⁰ It would be good to keep in mind the SMART indicators designed by UNDP.³¹
- Finally UNDAF should be viewed as a flexible instrument taking into consideration of the particular mandate of different agencies. Long and detailed outcomes tend to put different agencies in a position that first they design projects and then seek the appropriate outcome category in the UNDAF document for a particular project. This of course goes exactly against the *raison d'être* of UNDAF. Such practices should be avoided at all cost.

²⁹ The latest *Armenia Human Development Report* contained, for example, official and unofficial unemployment statistics. Although interesting in its own rights, such conflicting information is not particularly useful, and leads to confusion.

³⁰ Given the time constraint, this Consultant could only verify a few indicators. They are marked with red in their appropriate places.

See, UNDP, Results-Oriented Monitoring and Evaluation. New York 1997. p.42.

Annex 1 Terms of Reference

Purpose and Objectives of Review

The purpose of the in-depth Review is to assess the effectiveness of the current UNDAF in terms of contribution to national development priorities and define lessons and recommendations for the next program cycle.

According to decision of the Regional Directors' Team during a meeting held a on 11 September 2007 it was recommended that UNCTs could opt for a more in-depth UNDAF annual review, as opposed to a full evaluation. Thus, assessment of design and focus (objective 1), assessment of comparative advantage of the UN System (objective 2), and assessment of the effectiveness of the UNDAF in terms of progress towards agreed UNDAF outcomes (objective 3).

1. Assess the <u>design and focus</u> of the UNDAF, i.e. the quality of the formulation of results at different levels, i.e. the results chain:

The following questions need to be addressed:

- To what extent the current UNDAF results are linked to the country analysis carried on by the UNCT at the beginning of the past planning cycle?
- To what extent does the current UNDAF addresses key national development challenges?
- To what extent is the current UNDAF designed as a results-oriented, coherent and focused framework?
- Is it likely that the planned Country Programmes and projects and programme strategies will lead to the expected UNDAF results?
- Are expected outcomes realistic given the UNDAF timeframe and resources?
- To what extent and in what ways have risks and assumptions been addressed in UNDAF design?
- Is the distribution of roles and responsibilities among the different UNDAF partners well defined, facilitated in the achievement of results and have the arrangements been respected in the course of implementation?
- Do the Country Programmes and the UNDAF respond to the challenges of national capacity development and do they promote ownership of programmes by the national partners?
- Has the UNDAF results matrix been sufficiently flexible to adjust to evolving national policies and strategies e.g.
 National Development Plans and Goals, PRSP, SWAP, legislative reform) during the current programme cycle?
- Were new issues and their causes as well as challenges that arose during the UNDAF cycle adequately addressed?
 (flexibility)
- To what extent have human rights principles and standards been reflected or promoted in the UNDAF and, as relevant, in the Country Programmes?
- To what extent and in what ways has a human rights approach been reflected as one possible method for integrating human rights concerns into the UNDAF?
- To what extent and in what ways are the concepts of gender equity and equality and other cross-cutting issues reflected in programming?
- Were specific goals and targets set?
- Was there effort to produce sex disaggregated data and indicators to assess progress in gender equity and equality?
- To what extent and how is special attention given to girls' and women's rights and empowerment?
- 2. Assess the validity of the stated collective *comparative advantage* of the UN System:

The following questions need to be addressed:

- To what extent and in what ways have the comparative advantages of the UN organizations been utilized in the national context (including universality, neutrality, voluntary and grant-nature of contributions, multilateralism, and the special mandates of UN agencies)?
- 3. Assess the *effectiveness* of the UNDAF in terms of progress towards agreed UNDAF outcomes:

The following questions need to be addressed:

• What progress has been made towards the realization of UNDAF outcomes as a contribution to the achievement of MDGs and in terms of indicators as reflected in the UNDAF M&E Plan?

- To what extent and in what ways was special emphasis placed on strengthening of national capacities, building partnerships, promoting innovations, and the realization of human rights and promoting gender equity and equality?
- Which are the main factors that contributed to the realization or non-realization of the outcomes? How were risks and assumptions addressed during the implementation of programmes and projects?
- To what extent and in what ways did UN support promote national execution of programmes and / or the use of national expertise and technologies?

4. Assess the effectiveness of the UNDAF as a coordination and partnership framework:

The following questions need to be addressed:

- To what extent and in what ways has UNDAF contributed to achieving better synergies among the programmes of UN agencies?
- Has the UNDAF enhanced joint programming by agencies and /or resulted in specific joint programmes? Were the strategies employed by agencies complementary and synergistic?
- Have agency supported programmes been mutually reinforcing in helping to achieve UNDAF outcomes? Has the effectiveness or programme support by individual agencies been enhanced as a result of joint programming?
- Did UNDAF promote effective partnerships and strategic alliances around the main UNDAF outcome areas (e.g. national partners, International Financial Institutions and other external support agencies)?
- 5. To the extent possible, assess the <u>impact</u> of UNDAF on the lives of the poor, i.e. determine whether there is any major change in UNDAF indicators that can reasonably be attributed to or be associated with UNDAF, notably in the realization of MDGs, National Development Goals and the national implementation of internationally agreed commitments and UN Conventions and Treaties.
- **6.** To the extent possible, assess the <u>efficiency of the UNDAF as a mechanism to minimize</u> <u>transaction costs</u> of UN support for the government and for the UN agencies;

The following questions need to be addressed

- To what extent and in what ways has UNDAF contributed to a reduction of transaction cost for the government and for each of the UN agencies? In what ways could transaction costs be further reduced?
- Were results achieved at reasonably low or lowest possible cost?
- 7. Analyse to what extent results achieved and strategies used by the supported Country Programmes and projects are <u>sustainable</u> (i) as a contribution to national development and (ii) in terms of the added value of UNDAF for cooperation among individual UN agencies.

The following questions need to be addressed

To what extent and in what ways have national capacities been enhanced in government, and civil society?

Have complementarities, collaboration and / or synergies fostered by UNDAF contributed to greater sustainability of results of Country Programmes and projects of individual UN agencies?

Methodology of the Review

Combination of different methodologies and tools will be applied during the review. Particularly approaches of Stakeholder Analysis, PLA (Participatory Learning and Action) and Outcome Mapping will be used. In that framework the following methods and tools to be applied:

- 1. Document review:
 - UNDAF with its supplementary documents;
 - PRSP and other national strategic documents.
 - Evaluations and reviews within UN system (including those of specific agencies);
 - National Household Survey;
 - Other studies and surveys on national situation.

- 2. Individual and group interviews with key stakeholders:
 - National counterparts;
 - UNCT members, UN agencies, projects;
 - Multilateral and bilateral donors;
 - Civil society (local level: partners and leading NGOs in the respective fields);
 - Researchers;
 - Direct beneficiaries.

Annex 2

Persons interviewed

UN

25 Mr. Aram Tananyan

1	Ms. Con	suelo Vidal	UN Resident Coordinator/ UNDP Resident Representative Armenia
2	Mr. Arm	en Baibourtian	UN RC/UNDP RR Senior Adviser
3	Ms. Ano	ush Avanesyan	UN RC Unit Coordination Analyst
4	Ms. Astg	ghik Martirosyan	UN RC/UNDP Monitoring and Evaluation Specialist
5	Ms. Bush	hra Halepota	UNHCR Representative
6	Ms. Mar	ine Shahbazyan	UNHCR Programme Assistant
7	Ms. Mala	athi Pillai	UNICEF Deputy Reprisentative (Officer in Charge)
8	Ms. Alva	ard Poghosyan	UNICEF Programme Officer (Education)
9	Ms. Lian	a Hovakimyan	UNICEF Programme Officer (Health and Nutrition)
10	Mr. Hayl	k Khemchyan	UNICEF Programme Officer (Child Protection)
11	Mr. Gari	k Hayrapetyan	UNFPA Assistant Representative
12	Ms. Ana	hit Simonyan	UNIDO, Head of Operations
13	Ms. Eliza	a Tonda	UNIDO, NCPP Project Manager (Vienna)
14	Ms. Nari	ine Sahakyan	UNDP ARR/Programme Analyst (Socio-economic Portfolio)
15	Ms. Alla	Bakunts	UNDP Programme Analyst (Democratic Portfolio)
16	Mr. Arm	en Martirosyan	UNDP Programme Analyst (Environmental Portfolio)
17	Mr. Kare	en Vardanyan	UNDP Operations Manager
18	Ms. Lian	a Kharatyan	WFP Programme Officer
19	Ms. Nair	a Sargsyan	UNAIDS Social Mobilization and Partnership Adviser (Officer in Charge)
20	Mr. Avet	tik Nersisyan	FAO Assistant Representative
21	Ms. Arm	nine Halajyan	UNDPI Information Officer (Officer in Charge)
		rnmental nterparts	
22	Ms. Dziu	ınik Aghajanian	Ministry of Foreign Affaires, Head of International Organizations Department
23	Mr. Sure	en Karayan	Ministry of Finance and Economy, Deputy Minister
24	Mr. Tatu	l Hakobyan	Ministry of Healthcare, Deputy Minister

Armenian Rescue Service, Deputy Head

International Organizations

26 Mr. Timothy Alexander USAID, Programme Officer

27 Mr. Pegor Papazian USAID, Project Development Officer

28 Mr. Raul De Luzenberger Ambassador, Delegation of the European Commission to the Republic of Armenia

Annex 3

Documents reviewed

A complete list of documents and of books consulted is not warranted here since; all important sources are given in the text of this Report. Suffice it to note that UNDAF (2005-2009) document, MDG document, PRSP documents, as well as agencies' CPAPs and country operation plans were the main sources.

PRSP is particularly important since there is no single document that articulates Government of Armenia's policy stand with respect to development, the said Document constituted the major source of information.

UNCT distilled all the pertinent information related specific projects for the use of this Report. Financial information, again, provided to the Consultant as courtesy of the finance offices.

Statistical information is obtained from the Government's WebPages, which are easily available both in English and Armenian. UNDP's Human Development Report of various years and National Human Development Report were also very valuable source of statistical information.

Annex 4
Budgets of UN Agencies for period 2005-2009

A	gency	Name	UNFPA	UNHCR	UNICEF	FAO	WFP	UNIDO	WHO	UNAIDS	UNDP	ILO	Total Budget
	QSN C	ore Money	523,750	1,050,000	785,988	N/A	0	0	170,000	75,000	1,450,050	N/A	\$4,054,788
	05,	Non-core Money	112,010	0	411,785	N/A	1,471,980	1,800	0	0	4,506,079	N/A	\$6,503,654
	Budg	otal for the year	635,760	1,050,000	1,197,773	N/A	1,471,980	1,800	170,000	75,000	5,956,129	N/A	\$10,558,442
		ore Money	433,146	932,335	796,220	N/A	0	0	816,000	150,000	2,028,142	N/A	\$5,155,843
	Budget for 2006, USD	Non-core Money	72,530	254,289	425,820	N/A	4,130,481	103,500	0	0	2,825,623	N/A	\$7,812,243
	To	otal for the year	505,676	1,186,624	1,222,040	N/A	4,130,481	103,500	816,000	150,000	4,853,765	N/A	\$12,968,086
		ore Money	406,000	529,660	731,612	N/A	0	0	N/A	110,000	2,286,966	N/A	\$4,064,238
	Budget for 2007, USD	Non-core Money	283,715	50,000	1,867,567	N/A	5,633,712	92,700	N/A	0	3,809,472	N/A	\$11,737,166
	Te	otal for the year	689,715	579,660	2,599,179	N/A	5,633,712	92,700	N/A	110,000	6,096,438	N/A	\$15,801,404

Agen	Agency Name		UNHCR	UNICEF	FAO	WFP	UNIDO	WHO	UNAIDS	UNDP	ILO	Total Budget
USD	Core Money	520,000	1,451,600	667,675	N/A	0	0	795,000	186,000	1,500,000	N/A	\$5,129,275
Budget for 2008,	Non-core Money	1,009,845	408,000	516,378	N/A	994,985	48,500	0	36,400	5,137,824	N/A	\$8,151,932
Budș	Total for the year	1,529,845	1,859,600	1,184,053	N/A	994,985	48,500	795,000	222,400	6,637,824	N/A	\$13,272,207
(projected)	Core Money	500,000	529,000	450,800	N/A	0	0	N/A	35,000	1,265,000	N/A	\$2,779,800
Budget for 2009, USD (projected)	Non-core Money	320,000	500,000	35,000	N/A	0	0	N/A	0	7,613,501	N/A	\$8,468,501
Budget for	Total for the year	820,000	1,029,000	485,800	N/A	0	0	N/A	35,000	8,878,501	N/A	\$11,248,301
005-2009	Core Money	2,382,896	4,492,595	3,432,295	2,500,000	0	0	1,781,000	446,000	8,530,158	N/A	\$23,564,944
Total for the period 2005-2009	Non-core Money	1,798,100	1,212,289	3,256,550	9,000,000	12,231,158	246,500	0	36,400	23,892,499	N/A	\$51,673,496
Total for	TOTAL	4,180,996	5,704,884	6,688,845	11,500,000	12,231,158	246,500	1,781,000	482,400	32,422,657	N/A	\$75,238,440