

Timor-Leste – Work for Peace Project Projektu Serbisu Ba Dame ILO / UNDP

In co-operation with the Government of Timor-Leste
Funded by European Union

UNDP Final Project Evaluation

Report

September, 2007



Welmoed E. Koekebakker

Timor-Leste – Work for Peace Project
Projektu Serbisu Ba Dame
ILO / UNDP

Final Project Evaluation
September, 2007
Report
Welmoed E. Koekebakker

Table of Contents

1. INTRODUCTION	3
EVALUATION PURPOSE	3
METHODOLOGY	4
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	5
2. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	6
3. THE PROJECT	8
4. ACHIEVEMENTS, OUTCOME AND IMPACT: KEY FINDINGS	9
OVERALL EVALUATION FINDINGS	9
1. ACHIEVEMENTS: LABOUR BASED EMPLOYMENT GENERATION, QUANTITATIVE ASSESSMENT	10
<i>Number of beneficiaries and workdays</i>	10
<i>Income generated by the project</i>	10
2. IMPACT ON POVERTY ALLEVIATION AND EMPOWERMENT	11
<i>How was the income generated by the project used?</i>	11
<i>Conclusions on expenditure patterns from field visits</i>	12
<i>Indicators of poverty and deprivation</i>	13
<i>Targeting Youth</i>	13
<i>Targeting Internally Displaced Persons</i>	14
<i>Targeting Women</i>	14
<i>Gender strategy and resistance against women's participation</i>	15
<i>Impact: Self-esteem, empowerment</i>	16
<i>Beneficiary satisfaction</i>	17
<i>Impact on self reliance of youth?</i>	17
<i>Decreased pressures on households sheltering IDPs?</i>	17
<i>Lasting economic impact?</i>	17
<i>Conclusions on impact of the income generated by the project</i>	18
3. IMPACT OF THE ROAD REHABILITATION AND ROAD MAINTENANCE WORKS	20
4. CONTRIBUTION OF THE PROJECT TO REDUCING THE POTENTIAL FOR CONFLICT AND DESTABILISATION	21
<i>Maximizing Impact on Conflict Reduction (I): Replicate Labour-Based Employment Programme</i>	21
<i>Maximizing Impact on Conflict Resolution (II): Do No Harm, Strengthen Conflict Resolution Capacity</i>	21
<i>Recommendations</i>	22
5. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION: RELEVANCE, EFFECTIVENESS, EFFICIENCY, IMPACT, COHERENCE, OWNERSHIP AND SUSTAINABILITY	23
1. ACCOMPLISHMENTS AGAINST WORKPLAN	23
1. <i>Establishment of the project structure</i>	23
2. <i>Management Information System</i>	23
3. <i>Introducing a Gender Equality Perspective</i>	24
4. <i>Identification of project activities in all districts</i>	24
5. <i>Involving local authorities in the identification and selection of beneficiaries</i>	24
6. <i>Organising and supervising implementation of project activities, engaging selected beneficiaries</i>	25
7. <i>Conduct Project Steering Committee Meetings</i>	25

8.	<i>Report to donor and stakeholders</i>	25
9.	<i>Conduct regular field monitoring visits and project final evaluation</i>	25
2.	PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION	26
	<i>Overall management</i>	26
	<i>Capacity Building and Training</i>	26
	<i>Learning in the course of the project</i>	26
	<i>Learning: Feedback from project staff</i>	27
	<i>Decisionmaking about labour versus capital goods component</i>	28
	<i>Wage payments: Payment dates</i>	28
	<i>Accountability and Transparency</i>	29
	<i>Monitoring presence and absence</i>	30
	<i>Targets regarding participation of women and girls: lessons learned from conflict and post-conflict situations</i>	30
	<i>Staff perceptions of what may be improved</i>	31
3.	COHERENCE WITH NATIONAL GOALS AND INSTITUTIONAL LINKAGES	32
	<i>Coherence with National Goals</i>	32
	<i>Institutional Linkages with the Ministry: Coherence, Synergies, Ownership, Sustainability</i>	33
	<i>Institutional Linkages with the Ministry: Conclusions and Lessons Learned</i>	35
	<i>Linkages with the Donor</i>	35
	<i>Linkages with other projects and stakeholders</i>	36
	<i>Coherence with MDGs</i>	36
4.	PROJECT EXIT, RELEVANCE, EFFECTIVENESS, EFFICIENCY, SUSTAINABILITY, IMPACT AND FOLLOW-UP STRATEGIES	37
6.	KEY RECOMMENDATIONS	39
	ANNEXES	42
	<i>Annex 1: Terms of Reference Evaluation Mission</i>	42
	<i>Annex 2: Time Schedule Evaluation Mission</i>	48
	<i>Annex 3: List of literature and documents consulted</i>	50
	<i>Annex 4: Serbisu Ba Dame Presence list</i>	52
	<i>Annex 5: Serbisu Ba Dame Payment receipt</i>	54
	<i>Annex 6: Government of Timor-Leste: Central Government Finances, FY 2005/2006</i>	56

Acronyms, abbreviations and local terms

<i>Adat</i>	<i>Tradition</i>
<i>Aldeia</i>	<i>= RT, Rumpung Tetangga = group of households</i>
ALNAP	Active Learning Network for Accountability and Performance in humanitarian action
<i>Bairro</i>	<i>Neighbourhood</i>
BoQ	Bill of Quantities
<i>Chefe de aldeia</i>	<i>Head of aldeia</i>
<i>Chefe de suco</i>	<i>Village head, kepala desa</i>
DEC	District Employment Centre
DESD	Division of Employment and Skills Development (MLCR)
EC	European Commission
EU	European Union
FHH	Female Headed Household
<i>Gotong Royong</i>	<i>Voluntary community labour</i>
GTL	Government of Timor-Leste
GTZ	Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit
IDP	Internally Displaced Person
ILO	International Labour Organisation
<i>Kabupaten</i>	<i>District</i>
<i>Karong of rice</i>	<i>38 kilo</i>
<i>Keadilan</i>	<i>Justice</i>
<i>Kecamatan</i>	<i>Sub-district</i>
LB	Labour-Based
<i>Loro monu</i>	<i>West</i>
<i>Loro sa'e</i>	<i>East</i>
MAFF	Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MIS	Management Information System
MLCR	Ministry of Labour and Community Reinsertion
MPW	Ministry of Public Works
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NYEAP	National Youth Employment Action Plan
OCAP	Oecussi Community Activation Programme
PSC	Project Steering Committee
RBMS	Results Based Management System
RRM	Rapid Reaction Mechanism
RWC	Regional Working Committee
SBD	Serbisu Ba Dame
<i>Serbisu Ba Dame</i>	<i>Work for Peace</i>
<i>Servi Nasaun</i>	<i>Serve the Nation, cash for work project 2006</i>
<i>Simu Malu</i>	<i>Mutual Acceptance</i>
SIP	Sector Investment Program
<i>Sopi</i>	<i>Alcohol</i>
STAGE	Skills Training for Gainful Employment Programme
<i>Suco</i>	<i>Village, Desa</i>
TL	Timor-Leste
ToR	Terms of Reference
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNMIT	United Nations Integrated Mission In Timor-Leste
YEP	Youth Employment Promotion Programme
YES	Youth Employment Study

1. INTRODUCTION

In an effort to curb the instability and prevent further social unrest ILO and UNDP initiated a comprehensive employment generation project which was implemented in all 13 districts.

The project, Serbisu Ba Dame (Work for Peace), was designed to create short-term employment opportunities to 23,350 beneficiaries. The project was perceived as a short-term bridge between ongoing emergency humanitarian response and development plans like the National Development Plan¹, the Sector Investment Plans and development initiatives like the EC Rural Development Programme II.

The project has been executed by ILO and UNDP in partnership with the Ministry of Labour and Community Reinsertion (MLCR), and articulating with the Ministry of Public Works and the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (MAFF).

The project was funded by the European Union under the Rapid Reaction Fund budget line².

The project document was officially signed by the three implementing partners on 21 March 2007 after which date the actual implementation of the project started. The project ended on 16 September 2007.

Evaluation Purpose

This final project evaluation was scheduled for September 2007 to serve UNDP's commitment to transparency and accountability.

The objectives of the evaluation are:

1. To assess whether the major objectives of the project have been achieved,
2. To formulate lessons learned and recommendations.

The overall objective of this evaluation is to assess:

1. Progress, Output, Outcome and Impact
2. Relevance
3. Effectiveness of management arrangements
4. Impact on beneficiaries, and
5. Sustainability.³

In addition, a number of specific evaluation questions were part of the Terms of Reference for the evaluation mission.

¹ Timor-Leste National Development Plan, Planning Commission, Dili, 2002

² EC Rapid Reaction Mechanism Contract RRM 2006/06-0024.00

³ The questions correspond with the evaluation frameworks of UNEG, EU, DAC, ALNAP and IFRC.

Methodology

The evaluation used a 'classical' qualitative evaluation approach. The main sources of information were: study of key documents, interviews and meetings with key stakeholders in the programme and observations during field visits.

The following documents were consulted: project documents, project reports, government policy documents, reports of international engineers, briefing notes, minutes of the Project Steering Group meetings, and management data from the database.

Interviews were held with UNDP, ILO, EU, Government of Timor-Leste representatives, local authorities, project staff (international and national); beneficiaries, non-beneficiaries and local key informants; and beneficiaries and representatives of NGOs.

Field visits were made to three districts, jointly selected by UNDP and ILO, namely Oecusse, Bobonaro and Liquiça. As this mission thought it useful to relate observations on project impact to living standards and survival strategies, I proposed to include poverty indicators in the selection of districts involved in field visits. Based on poverty indicators it was hoped that one more poor district could be added to the evaluation programme. In view of the limited number of days available for the evaluation mission, a proposed visit to Same could not be added to the evaluation schedule.

Field visits were insightful.

I spoke to beneficiaries and non-beneficiaries; people actually working on the road; people passing by and commenting on the project. I discussed with family members of beneficiaries in hamlets adjacent to the roads. Beneficiaries included several people who are actually living elsewhere but fled for various reasons (IDPs) and now lived in the backyard of family members. I discussed with the local leaders involved at various levels in the project: Chefes de suco and chefes de aldeias. Also, a few NGOs and beneficiaries of other income generation projects were consulted.

Communicating in Bahasa Indonesia was helpful and although I was aware that Bahasa Indonesia is the language of the country against which the Timorese fought a war of independence, it was time and again clarified that there are no sensitivities in speaking Indonesian. In a few instances people would not be able to speak Bahasa whereas I would not understand the local language; in that case the local project officer would translate.

Generally people were open and eager to speak to me. Humor was helpful in energizing discussions. Speaking to one person often ended up in sitting on the ground in between 15 people. Communication in general was very direct, which was a tremendous advantage in not only getting insight in the facts but also the feelings: pride and self esteem and anger and compassion and insecurity - the wide range of feelings people shared about the project and their lives and perspectives.

It was obvious that the relationship between beneficiaries and the project officers joining me in the field was good and this greatly facilitated my access to the villagers and gaining insight in the implementation of the project.

In terms of evaluation methodology perception studies are considered a powerful instrument, in particular for post-conflict interventions like the ones conducted by UNDP and ILO in Timor-Leste. For livelihood programmes a 'life perspective' is important in balancing project outcome against the life cycles of beneficiaries. For projects aiming at conflict reduction, which is very much related to personal

identities, 'we versus they', including manipulated identities – perception studies are appropriate components of the evaluation methodology. This evaluation has tried to integrate the beneficiaries perceptions on the project as much as possible within the evaluation mission schedule.

This mission accomplished interviews with some hundred beneficiaries, individually and in groups. Case studies are included in the report to make the voices of the beneficiaries heard. Their voices, their perspectives, should help in asking the pertinent questions: Are we doing the right things? Are we doing things right?

The emphasis of this final project evaluation is on output and outcome rather than impact, as in evaluation practices it is generally agreed that impact assessment is only meaningful once a certain period of time has passed since the finalisation of the project. Also, in assessing impact the attribution factor is paramount.

This evaluation mission adheres to UNEG Norms and Standards, UNDP Evaluation Policy, EC Evaluation policy standards, ALNAP Evaluation Principles and anthropological ethical frameworks.

The timing of the evaluation was not optimal as most of the work was finished. The advantage was that final project implementation data could be made available at the time of the evaluation. The evaluation was carried out by one evaluator rather than two as foreseen in the ToR.

Debriefings were organised with UNDP, ILO, EC and the Secretary of State for Vocational Training and Employment.

Acknowledgements

I hope that whatever issues of concern are raised, it is understood that this is against the background of my deep appreciation for the efforts of those who initiated and implemented this project, the commitment of the staff and management, and the high standards UNDP and ILO have set themselves in this project.

I am grateful to UNDP for giving me the opportunity to work in Timor-Leste.

I would like to acknowledge my appreciation to the ILO and UNDP staff for their obvious commitment to contribute to the well being of the people of Timor-Leste.

I wish to thank the project staff who accompanied me in the field. I wish to, most of all, thank the people I spoke to in the villages: women and men, girls and boys, walking, most of them barefoot, on the road to..... hopefully, a peaceful and prosperous Timor-Leste.

Welmoed E. Koekebakker

September, 2007

kromboom@planet.nl

2. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report contains the findings of the Final Project Evaluation that was organized towards the end of the project.

The Serbisu Ba Dame (Work for Peace) project was launched as a Rapid Reaction Mechanism in response to the deep socio-political crisis that shook Timor-Leste in 2006.

The project was implemented by ILO and UNDP in close cooperation with the Government of Timor-Leste (Ministry of Labour and Community Reinsertion) and was funded by the European Union under the Rapid Reaction Mechanism budget line. The objective of the project was to create short term employment opportunities through a Labour-Based approach, in order to rapidly increase the purchasing power of 23,350 beneficiaries, most of the rural youth, including Internally Displaced Persons. In targeting groups that have played a role in the crisis, the project also aimed at reducing the potential for conflict in Timor-Leste.

The project was implemented in all 13 districts of Timor-Leste. The project started in March 2007 and ended 16 September 2007.

A final project evaluation was organised by the end of the project. This report contains the findings of the Final Project Evaluation.

Key Findings of the Evaluation are:

Key Findings of the Final Project Evaluation of the Serbisu Ba Dame project

The project has been **effective** in providing short term employment opportunities to groups which have played a destabilising role during the 2006 crisis, in particular the youth. By doing so it provided an example of a **highly relevant** intervention that, in addition to other strategies, can be and must be undertaken by the Government of Timor-Leste, the international agencies and donor organisations, to reduce the conflict potential in Timor-Leste.

This is considered an extremely relevant project outcome in view of the urgency of the need to implement feasible and effective strategies to forge stability and enable a transition from relief to rehabilitation and development in Timor-Leste.

- The project succeeded in increasing the purchasing power of 45,479 beneficiaries, almost double the target of 23,350 beneficiaries.
- The actual number of IDPs was 36%, against a target of 30%.
- The project succeeded in providing 606,325 workdays to vulnerable groups, almost double the target of 350,250 workdays.
- Actual participation of women was only 19%, against a target of 30%.

The evaluation concludes that the project design and approach were **valid** as they were **strategically congruent** with the overall National Development Goals in Timor-Leste.

The expertise provided by ILO and UNDP is considered **appropriate and relevant**.

The evaluation study concludes that the project structure was solid and **efficient**. The overall management was outstanding. Institutional linkages with the relevant Ministries from the start of the project created a solid foundation for **sustainability** in terms of organisational and management structures, project approaches as well as in terms of human resources. Also, they are reflected in increased **ownership** of Labour-Based strategies with the Government of Timor-Leste.

This evaluation study formulates 10 Recommendations.

The Key Recommendation is:

Key Recommendation

Replicate this Labour Based Employment approach, fast, on a large scale, and with a long term time frame.

The project structure and institutional linkages of the Serbisu Ba Dame project provide a solid foundation for follow-up projects.

ILO and UNDP should define an advocacy strategy to ensure that the Government of Timor-Leste adopts this project as part of its overall employment and wider development strategies.

The Government of Timor-Leste should increasingly take the lead with ILO and UNDP providing technical support.

A follow up strategy should not stand on its own but establish strategic links with other interventions, including promotion of micro-enterprises, strengthening vocational training centres, involve credit and saving organisations, and involve civil society organisations.

A follow up project should aim at 50% women's participation and ensure that obstacles to women's participation, which obviously are immense, are effectively addressed.

The evaluation, finally, recommends integrating a Do No Harm approach.

The evaluation report provides information on how the money earned through the project was used, in order to assess the indirect impact of the project. Case studies are included in the report to document the perceptions of the beneficiaries. For beneficiaries, the project contributed to self esteem and empowerment: the importance of this project impact can hardly be underestimated. The project received full support from the communities.

A considerable part of the money earned through the Serbisu Ba Dame project was spent on education. Given the relatively small number of women and girls participating in the project, the large number of girls spending their money on education is remarkable.

It is fair to conclude that the project, if replicated on a larger scale, has an immense potential to contribute to the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals in Timor-Leste.

3. THE PROJECT

The crisis that shook Timor-Leste in 2006 was the consequence of an economy growing slower than people's expectations. The limited access of young Timorese to employment opportunities has led to a situation of deep frustration, which has been expressing itself in violence and destruction.

The Serbisu Ba Dame project was initiated by ILO and UNDP as a rapid response to the crisis in an effort to contribute to breaking the vicious circle of instability > unemployment > social unrest.

The project, Serbisu Ba Dame (Work for Peace), was designed to create short-term employment opportunities in particular for youth in all 13 districts of Timor-Leste. The project operated with a short term – 6 months – time frame. The project was perceived as a short-term bridge between emergency humanitarian response and ongoing development plans.

The project philosophy was to promote a Labour-Based approach, making intensive use of workforce and limiting investments in equipments and materials. Core activities were rural road rehabilitation and maintenance and irrigation canals cleaning and restoration. Youth were a priority target of the Work for Peace Project. The project would include 30 % displaced persons. Women were to constitute 30% of the beneficiaries.

The project was executed by ILO and UNDP in close partnership with the Ministry of Labour and Community Reinsertion (MLCR), and articulating with the Ministry of Public Works and the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (MAFF).

The project document was officially signed by the three implementing partners (ILO, UNDP and MLRC) on 21 March 2007 after which date the actual implementation of the project started.

The Serbisu Ba Dame Project was implemented effectively and in accordance with the workplan and logical framework.

A solid structure was set up in a short period of time. Linkages were established with relevant government departments. Funding was secured with contributions from the Government of Timor-Leste and the European Union (the Rapid Reaction Mechanism). Activities were identified through a community-driven process, involving local authorities at the district, sub-district, village, and sub-village levels. Procedures were developed and a procedures manual was written. Staff was recruited and trained, including a team of international engineers. Trainings were organized for staff and stakeholders. A technical training manual was developed. A specific computerized Management Information System (MIS) was developed in order to enable appropriate Project management, monitoring, and evaluation, and to provide permanently updated information for reporting to donors and stakeholders. Equipment was procured. Project progress was communicated to stakeholders, also locally. Project visibility was created through project boards posted all over the project sites as well as T-shirts for beneficiaries. Decentralised decision making and accountability was ensured. A monitoring mechanism was developed and monitoring missions carried out. An exit strategy was developed.

The project ended on 16 September 2007.

4. ACHIEVEMENTS, OUTCOME AND IMPACT: KEY FINDINGS

Overall Evaluation Findings

This evaluation found that the project has been highly successful in meeting its objectives.

The project managed to exceed its specific project objectives. The evaluation concludes that the project managed to achieve its overall objective to the extent possible.

1. The Serbisu Ba Dame project managed to achieve Specific Objective number 1:

Rapidly increase the purchasing power of 23,350 beneficiaries, by injecting some badly needed cash into the economy. In the case of IDPs, diminish their reliance on international humanitarian relief and food rations, and help gradual transition towards gainful economic activity, thus creating a link between relief, rehabilitation and development.

The project succeeded in increasing the purchasing power of 45,479 beneficiaries: almost double the target of 23,350 beneficiaries. The number of IDPs benefiting was 36 % against a target of 30 % beneficiaries. The project helped to diminish their reliance on international humanitarian relief.

2. The Serbisu Ba Dame project managed to achieve Specific Objective number 2:

Balance international support provided to Timor-Leste, by creating a total of 350,250 workdays in all the 13 Districts, thereby lessening the demographic pressure on Dili and easing the current strain placed on rural households still hosting IDPs.

The project managed to create a total of 606,325 workdays in 13 districts, almost double the target of 350,250 workdays. The amount spent on salaries was USD 1,214,881 [EUR 917.235,16] as against USD 1,195,762 [EUR 902.800,31] allocated in the budget.

3. The project managed to achieve, to the extent possible, the overall project objective:

To reduce the potential for conflict and further destabilisation in Timor-Leste, by providing short-term employment opportunities to groups which have played / could play a particularly destabilising role, especially the youth.

This evaluation found that the project successfully managed to provide short term opportunities to groups which have played or could potentially play a destabilising role, in particular the youth.

By doing so it has provided an example of a highly relevant intervention that, in addition to other strategies, can be and must be undertaken by the Government of Timor-Leste, the international agencies and donor organisations to reduce the conflict potential in Timor-Leste.

This is an extremely relevant project outcome in view of the urgency of the need to implement feasible and effective strategies to forge stability and enable a transition from relief to rehabilitation and development in Timor-Leste.

It is not possible to establish whether or to what extent the project managed to meet the wider objective of reducing the potential for conflict and destabilisation in Timor-Leste. This is a matter of methodology (attribution factor) rather than of project outcome. The situation in Timor-Leste has been relatively stable since the implementation of the project. This outcome can not be directly attributed to the project. As far as the impact of the project on conflict reduction is concerned, it is fair to conclude that the project managed to contribute to political stability and a peaceful environment to the extent possible.

The conclusions of the evaluation are substantiated in further detail in the following chapters.

1. Achievements: Labour Based Employment Generation, Quantitative assessment

Number of beneficiaries and workdays

The project had two specific objectives:

1. **The first specific objective was providing short term employment to 23,350 beneficiaries.**
The project achieved providing employment to 45,569 beneficiaries: almost double the target of 23,350 beneficiaries.
2. **The second specific objective was the creation of 350,250 workdays in all 13 districts.**
The project managed to effectively create 606,325 workdays in all districts, almost double the target.

Most of the beneficiaries worked 15 days, earning USD 30 [EUR 22.65]. Depending on the work scheduled and sometimes due to contract termination, beneficiaries worked more or less workdays. On average, beneficiaries worked 13-14 days.

Income generated by the project

Total project expenditures on salaries:

- Allocated in the project budget USD 1,195,762 [EUR 902.800,31]
- Total amount spent on salaries USD 1.214,881 [EUR 917.235,16] (figures as per 28/09/2007)

All workers selected from the communities earned USD 2 [EUR 1,51] a day; some workers providing special services (like drivers for dump trucks) would earn USD 4 [EUR 3,02] a day.

The total project expenditures on wages are slightly higher (2%) than the amount budgeted for. The project management made a commitment that the budget allocated for salaries would not be diverted. This is considered a just choice. The project succeeded in generating the income in accordance with the project objectives.

2. Impact on poverty alleviation and empowerment

How was the income generated by the project used?

The workers in the Serbisu Ba Dame project in the locations visited during this evaluation spent the income they earned primarily on 3 items: food, security and education.

1. Food. Many villagers working on the project spent part of their money on buying one karong of rice. One karong of rice is usually 38 kilos and at the time of the project would cost USD 16 [EUR 12,08]. The majority of the villagers produce maize; however, rice is a staple food they have to buy for which they need cash income. The high percentage of people spending the money on basic food items reflects the level of poverty and deprivation in the villages.
2. Many bought a small goat or pig costing around USD 17 [EUR 12,84]. The small goats and pigs are not consumed but raised and sold in times of scarcity, as a security scheme.
3. Education: Many of the interviewed mentioned spending the money they earned on uniforms, books, pens, either for themselves, or for their children.

These expenditures constituted the far majority of the items bought. In addition, and to a lesser extent, villagers mentioned spending the money on:

1. Renovating or improving the house,
2. Durable consumption goods. One man mentioned buying a radio. Quite a few beneficiaries mention buying clothes.
3. Alcohol. Few men reported spending part of their income on alcohol.
4. Starting a small trade business, such as a sopi-shop (alcohol) where 1 jerrycan of sopi (5 liter) costing USD 2.50 [EUR 1,89] can generate a profit of USD 2 [EUR 1,51] when repacked to 9 bottles sold at USD 0.50 [EUR 0,38] per bottle.
5. Keeping the money in the house, without any specific purpose or for ceremonies like funeral ceremonies. Several people mentioned keeping part of the money (the balance after buying rice or a piglet) in their house. This reflects the lack of savings and credit institutions in for the rural poor.

Raimundo and Julio

Raimundo and Julio, 18 and 24, both worked on the project 15 days, earning USD 30 [EUR 22,65]. Never before they have earned money from wage labour. They are not married.

Raimundo bought one karong of rice for the household, and the rest he spent on new clothes. He laughs: *"I do not have a fiancée but I am searching"*.

Julio also spent the money on clothes, and he bought pens, books, for one of his younger sisters. He still has some money left. He did not go to school himself and he cannot read and write.

"When you received the money, did you sign that you received it?" *"Yes, but I put a fingerprint. I want to learn writing my name"*.

Both are very happy that they worked on the project.

"If we work hard we don't have to worry about things. Before, I was always stressed, now I am easy, I don't need to worry".

"I am proud to have money". "I think people respect me more now". "I am happy with the new road".

Balbina Tasai, Netenoke



Ibu Balbina Tasai is an old lady.

She has 4 children and 5 grandchildren, her husband died.

She has no idea how old she is. Her neighbours say she already had children at the time the Indonesians came.

Balbina Tasai worked on the project 15 days.

This is the first time in her life she earned a wage.

She earned USD 30 [EUR 22,65]. She has never seen so much money.

She did earn money from selling eggs and from selling forest produce, but she never worked as a wage labourer.

From the money she earned Balbina Tasai bought one small pig, for which she paid USD 18 [EUR 13,59].

"I will raise it and take well care of it, and when we need rice I will sell it".

Once before she had a pig but it had died.

The remaining USD 12 [EUR 9,06] she keeps in her house. *"I will need it when we need to buy rice or cooking oil".*

How would you buy rice if you did not have money from the project?

"Looking for peanuts and roots in the forest and sell it in the market, or selling eggs or maize".

The Project Database provides figures on overall expenditure patterns. These figures are broadly corresponding with the information collected in this evaluation.

Expenditures from income earned in Serbisu Ba Dame project According to figures from Project Database	
Category	Overall expenditure (%)
Food	63
Education	28
Clothing	24
Hygiene	22
Home improvements	6
Business	6
Cigarettes / alcohol	1

Conclusions on expenditure patterns from field visits

The project workers consulted during the field visits spent a major part of their earnings on direct survival and basic needs. In the first place they spent it on food; this highlights the level of poverty in the villages. Secondly they spent it on security to buy food in times of scarcity (more than half the respondents). A considerable part of the earnings is spent on education (20-40%) which indicates how eager people are to go to school. A small percentage (10-20%) is spent on consumption goods and clothing. A very small amount is not spent directly and kept in the house. This reflects the lack of savings and credit institutions in the villages.

The following generalizing conclusions may be drawn on group specific expenditure patterns:

- Youth. Girls and boys often mention spending a large part of their money on schools.
- Girls as well as boys often mention buying new clothes, 'to increase their status at the marriage market'. (I have a fiance and I hope to marry him; I am not married but I hope to soon find a fiancée).
- Married women with children: generally spend about half of the money on buying a karong of rice. In addition, they generally buy a small goat, to raise it and sell it in the lean time, when there is no money for food. They refer to it in terms of security, not in terms of income generation.
- Married men with a family most of the time spend their money on food and school items. In incidental cases, men also mention spending their money on luxury consumption goods (a radio) or on alcohol (*sopi/arak*). Alcohol use is reportedly low: men may spend 2 out of USD 30 on alcohol.
- Women spend relatively larger share of their wages on food and security; men spend relatively more on cloths and sometimes luxury items.

Indicators of poverty and deprivation

Indicators of poverty and deprivation in bairo Netenoke, Oecusse

Beneficiaries living along the road in Netenoke live in houses built from wood and palm leaves.

An NGO has helped improving houses with corrugated zink roofs.

Florença's house has one wooden bench and an ikat weaving loom. The cooking place has a cooking pot, a water pot, 3 cups, 5 small knives and spoons, and a broken plate.

Florença and Lígia, two women in their twenties, both carrying a baby in a slendang, say that sometimes they have not enough to eat.

"I think that I should feed my children three times a day but often I can not feed them three times a day".

The basic food is maize which is grown close to the house. People grow vegetables and in addition they collect forest produce. Some of them mention not eating fish as fish is taboo according to tradition (*adat*).

All beneficiaries in this village mention they have never gone to school.

90% of all beneficiaries can not read and write. Many of them sign their project documents (presence and absence form, receipts) with a fingerprint.

All of them are to some extent numerate; however, few can distinguish between a one dollar note and a five dollar note.

None of them has ever had a wage income. They do have some cash income from selling eggs or bananas, in the market.

None of them wears shoes. The chefe de bairo Cipriano Over wears two different slippers. "If we walk to the market we go barefoot".

Targeting Youth

The project focused at youth in the age group between 16 and 29. From the beginning the age specific target was 70 %.

The project management instructed the field staff to "go for as many beneficiaries as possible in the target age groups". The project management decided to not be more strict as there was an

apprehension that youth may not be very eager to engage in rural road works in view of a possible stigma related to doing manual labour. The targets were not changed in the course of the project.

This project evaluation found, in at random interviews, that about one third of the beneficiaries were above the target age group. During the last working day in Oecusse (about 50 workers) an estimated 50% of the workers were above 29. Workers were often much older than the target groups: several beneficiaries were in their fifties, sixties, and seventies. In the districts visited during the evaluation no children below 16 were participating.

Several people answered *"I don't know how old I am"*. *"At the time the Indonesians came I was a grand mother"*. Older people did not consider the work particularly hard: *"It is as hard as the work I am doing in the field"*.

Overall findings:

- The project succeeded in including many more youth than targeted for (89 % as compared to a target of 70 %).⁴
- It is considered a just choice to not exclude people in the age groups above 29. In the communities all people badly need cash income. The burden of supporting family life often depends completely on women in the older age groups. Also, excluding older people would not be culturally acceptable. *"All people need money. We sometimes included people above 29, that is a matter of justice (keadilan)"*.
- Also in other ways the selection criteria are used in a flexible way: *"We also take people from outside the bairi if they are very poor"*.

If someone is ill during the contract period, he or she can be replaced by a family member. If someone is ill and can not be replaced, he or she is given an opportunity to work in the next batch.

Targeting Internally Displaced Persons

The second Specific Objective of the Serbisu Ba Dame project was to: *"Balance international support provided to Timor-Leste, by creating a total of 350,250 workdays in all the 13 Districts, thereby lessening the demographic pressure on Dili and easing the current strain placed on rural households still hosting IDPs"*.

The definition of displaced persons includes people living in camps and people hosted by family members. The project targeted to include 30 % households hosting IDPs. Altogether 36 % of the beneficiaries were IDPs. The project managed to exceed its targets regarding inclusion of IDPs. The high percentage of IDPs participating is indicative for the magnitude of the problem of displacement in Timor-Leste.

Targeting Women

The project included 8,876 women (19 % of the beneficiaries) against 36,693 men. The actual number of women participating has exceeded the target of 7,000 women, but the actual percentage of women participating is considerably lower than the project target, which was 30 % participation of women.

For the target age group 16-29 no sexdisaggregated figures were available at the time of writing this report.

⁴ Figures from Project Database

Gender strategy and resistance against women's participation



What do these figures represent? What were the factors behind under-representation of women? At what stage did the project realise that participation of women was lagging behind? What were the options the project had in addressing the reasons behind under-representation and in enhancing women's participation? What were the decisions taken once the level of under-representation of women had become apparent? Were any changes introduced? What are the lessons learned for future projects and the strategies required to achieve targeted levels of participation of women?

From interviews with the project management it is apparent that the project did make systematic efforts to integrate a gender perspective. The project took the following steps in supporting women's participation:

Serbisu Ba Dame project: Steps in supporting women's participation

1. A Gender Equality Perspective is an integral component of the Serbisu Ba Dame project during planning, implementation and monitoring of its activities (see project inception report, workplan and logframe),
2. The Gender Unit of the Division of Employment and Skills Development of the Ministry of Labour and Community Reinsertion was involved in all steps of the development of the project design and the development of the procedures
3. This reportedly contributed decisively to the gender balance in project staffing and the definition of procedures to promote women participation among the beneficiaries,
4. Terms of Reference for all staff were developed with the input of the Gender Unit, DESD, MLCR,
5. Gender Awareness Training was provided to all staff as part of the Induction Workshops
6. Project officers were instructed to clarify the women's participation targets to the chefes de aldeias and sucos and they were held accountable for achieving the targets,
7. The targets were clarified to the chefes de aldeias and sucos,
8. The project managers then received information about the number of women lagging behind. The situation at the time of elections was considered highly conflictuous and potentially explosive. The project management reportedly thought it risky to push for an increase of women's participation as this was considered a potentially controversial or disturbing issue. No corrective measures were introduced.

One of the project officers is asked how he contributed to achieving 30% women's participation:

"I explained it very clearly to the chefe de aldeia and the chefe de suco. Then I received the list with names of participants and I saw that there was a gender imbalance and that only very few women were proposed. I went to the chefe de aldeia and asked him why there were so few women on the list. Then the chefe de aldeia said: This work is too hard for women".

Some women living close to the road are asked whether the work is heavy for them.

"The work is heavy but it is just as heavy as the work we do every day on the field".

Gender stereotypes and gendered power relations are clearly deeply impacting the effectiveness of the project in achieving the targets concerning women's participation.

Lessons learned:

- Addressing resistance against women's access to resources requires a gender strategy which includes addressing deeply rooted resistance against women's participation.
- There is a clear gender imbalance in access to power and access to resources in Timor-Leste.
- Lessons can be learned from various strategies (past and present) aiming at increasing gender equality in Timor-Leste. These lessons can be incorporated in future projects.
- It can be concluded that in particular at village level (including chefes de suco / chefes de aldeias), resistance against changing gender imbalances is great.
- Setting targets is not sufficient.
- Even with a clear Gender Equality Support strategy integrated in the project like in the Serbisu Ba Dame project, addressing gender inequality is highly challenging.

In order to be better equipped in future projects to achieve women's participation, ILO decided to commission a survey on "Gender and Road Construction" to identify obstacles women experience when engaged in road construction and provide recommendations on how to overcome these. The study is expected to identify mechanisms which can be integrated in follow up projects to address gender imbalances.

Recommendations:

1. A follow up project should integrate a gender perspective throughout the project, at activity and organisational level, including a budget for gender training and gender expertise to support the project in strategically and pro-actively addressing obstacles to gender equality. Gender policy must be the responsibility of the project director.
2. UNDP and ILO in cooperation with other agencies may contribute to an integrated study on "Gender equality strategies in Timor-Leste: lessons learned and policy recommendations for implementing organisations and donor organisations".

Impact: Self-esteem, empowerment

For all people interviewed in the course of this evaluation, without exception, working in the Serbisu Ba Dame project is the first time they ever earned a wage. They did earn income from selling eggs or forest produce, but they never earned cash for work.

This project is a life time experience for a majority of the beneficiaries.

Some respondents said: *"I am proud to have money". "I think people respect me more now".* (See case studies, above).

The meaning, the importance of this impact can hardly be underestimated.

Beneficiary satisfaction

All beneficiaries interviewed during this evaluation without exception are very satisfied with the project. Key informants from other districts report that a far majority of the beneficiaries is highly satisfied with the project.

Impact on self reliance of youth?

Eager To Learn

Many young boys and girls interviewed during the evaluation mission say they are eager to learn.

They mention that they would like to go to school: *"I would like to learn reading and writing"*.

They are happy that they have learnt a few skills while working on the project and they would like to learn more skills: *"I am proud that I now have learnt how a road is built". "I now know how to make cement"*.

It is clear that there is a demand for skills training. There is a great need for vocational training in the rural areas. Young boys and girls are not familiar with micro economic enterprises and they lack the entrepreneurial attitude needed for starting an economic activity: entrepreneurial skills should be part of a vocational training package.

One of the questions in the ToR for this evaluation mission is: did the project result in more self reliance of targeted youth groups and greater openness to employment, micro-finance and training schemes?

The evaluation mission found that the impact of the project on targeted youth groups is limited if the project is implemented once and for a short term.

The impact could be much larger provided the project is synergized to other strategies in particular projects promoting sustainable employment.

It is clear that youth are eager to learn skills. However they have hardly any options: lack of income, lack of services, lack of facilities for skills training, lack of occasions where to gradually increase one's self confidence and gain experience, ... for most of them it is a vicious circle which can only be broken with a robust and integrated approach to increase education and skills training services for young people and tackle youth employment in rural Timor-Leste.

Decreased pressures on households sheltering IDPs?

The high number of IDPs involved in the project is remarkable. Also, the number of participants hosting IDPs is considerable, as was evident from discussions in the villages during the evaluation field visits.

It is fair to conclude that the Serbisu Ba Dame project decreased pressures on households sheltering IDPs.

Lasting economic impact?

What was the effect of the project on the rural economy? Did the project have any lasting economic impact? Did the project contribute to revival of the local economy? These were some of the questions asked in the ToR for the evaluation mission.

This mission found that the money earned through the project is rarely (if ever) invested in productive or value adding activities. The money is not sufficient for starting economic activities and an enabling environment for more sustainable economic activities does not exist. An attitude of entrepreneurship does not exist in the villages.

The project has of course resulted in a cash injection in the rural economy (wages USD 1,2 million [EUR 0.91 million], local contractors, providers of equipment) but the wage component of this cash injection is to a large extent spent on imported goods (rice, clothes, books, uniforms).

The assumption that the project may contribute to a revival of the local economy has proven to be not valid.

The project had no or very limited lasting impact on the lives of the beneficiaries in terms of multiplier effects of the income generated by the project. If multiplier effects are there at all, it is by 'accident' rather than as a built-in mechanism of the project.

The question is relevant in terms of lessons learned. It should however be borne in mind that 'contributing to revival of the local economy' was never explicitly stated as a project objective. We should not judge a project against objectives it never had.

Lessons learned: A follow up Labour-Based employment project aiming at promoting gainful economic activities with lasting impact requires a robust integrated approach with a strong micro-entrepreneurship and vocational training component.

Conclusions on impact of the income generated by the project

1. It can be concluded that the project has been successful in achieving its major project objective: alleviating short term rural poverty.
2. For many beneficiaries, working on the project helped in reducing their worries and stress.
3. The Serbisu Ba Dame project contributed to self esteem and empowerment.
This project is a life time experience for a majority of the beneficiaries.
The importance of this project impact in terms of contributing to self esteem and empowerment can hardly be underestimated.
4. Many beneficiaries mention that they have learnt something. This contributed to their empowerment.
5. There are reports of young people having come back to the districts from Dili as they heard that the project was announced. If this project is implemented on a larger scale and with a long term perspective it may potentially contribute to reducing (or even reversing) rural-urban migration patterns.
6. The project received effective support from the communities.
7. Women spend a larger part of their money on household survival than men. From an effectiveness point of view, employment generation for women has more impact on poverty alleviation.
8. The money is rarely or never invested in productive or value adding activities. The income generated is not sufficient for starting economic activities and an enabling environment for more sustainable economic activities does not exist. The economic spin-off generated by the project

is limited. Multiplier effects are virtually absent. The assumption that the money may contribute to a revival of the local economy has proven not to be valid. This was however never explicitly stated as a project objective and it is not fair to evaluate a project against objectives it never had.

9. It is fair to conclude that the project had an immediate be it short term impact on eradication of extreme poverty and hunger in Timor-Leste. The project contributed to the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals in Timor-Leste.
10. A considerable part of the money earned by the workers is spent on education. Education levels in rural Timor-Leste are extremely low. Some girls mention going back to school after having dropped out. The large number of beneficiaries investing part of their income in education can be seen as a highly important impact of the project.

Given the relatively small number of women and girls participating in the project, the large number of girls spending their earnings on education is remarkable.

Girls education is a crucial intervention factor. Promotion of girls education has proven to impact various other development indicators like increasing the age of marriage, reduction of child mortality, reduction of maternal mortality, empowerment and gender equality. By contributing to girls' education the project can be expected to indirectly strengthen various other development variables.

It is fair to conclude that the project has an immense potential to contribute to the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals.

Obviously, with a robust effort to increase the participation of girls the impact of the project on girls' education can be far more substantial. In order to contribute to the MDGs in a more sustainable way the project should be replicated on a larger scale and with a long term time frame.

The Serbisu Ba Dame project is one of the interventions that should, in addition to other strategies, be promoted to ensure progress in meeting the Millennium Development Goals in Timor-Leste.

3. Impact of the road rehabilitation and road maintenance works



All stakeholders are highly satisfied with the road rehabilitation and road maintenance projects.

- The technical quality of the road works is appreciated by all informants.
- In comparison to other road rehabilitation projects, the quality of the rehabilitation works executed by the Serbisu Ba Dame project is considered high (e.g. using laterite for the top layer).
- Rural communities are better accessible by car; new roads have shortened distances; access to markets has improved.

Although roads are now accessible by cars, many villagers will still walk to the market (barefoot), as they will not prioritize spending USD 0.50 [EUR 0,38] on transport, except when carrying heavy goods.

All agree that the roads need to be maintained. It is expected that as the rainy season starts the quality of the roads will soon deteriorate.

One of the project strategies to strive for sustainability has been to discuss future road maintenance with the communities. According to one of the technical engineers, the communities (in Oecusse) have promised to take care of roads, through voluntary community labour (*gotong rojong*). The national engineer expects that the communities will indeed maintain the roads voluntarily, as they are proud of the new roads.

As part of the exit strategy the project transferred project tools to the communities.

Several chefes de aldeias and chefes de sucos and one of the authorities interviewed mentioned that for them an impact of the improved roads is that it helps in exercising control over people 'in case something happens'.

4. Contribution of the project to reducing the potential for conflict and destabilisation

Evaluation Question: *Assess the contribution of the project to reduce potential conflict and further destabilization and where this was not achieved analyze which are the conditions under which a similar or modified initiative could contribute to the objective.*

Evaluation Conclusion: The project managed to contribute to political stability and a relatively peaceful environment to the extent possible.

The project was integrated with the Simu Malu (mutual acceptance) Programme of the Government of Timor-Leste in the context of the national reconciliation framework.

Key Recommendation: In order to maximize impact on conflict reduction and lasting stability a two-pronged approach is recommended:

Maximizing Impact on Conflict Reduction (I): Replicate Labour-Based Employment Programme

This evaluation concludes that the Serbisu Ba Dame project successfully managed to create short term employment opportunities to groups which have played or could potentially play a destabilising role, in particular the youth.

By doing so it has provided an example of a highly relevant intervention that, in addition to other strategies, can be and must be undertaken by the Government of Timor-Leste, the international agencies and donor organisations to reduce the conflict potential in Timor-Leste.

This is an extremely relevant project outcome in view of the urgency of the need to implement feasible and effective strategies to forge stability and enable a transition from relief to rehabilitation and development in Timor-Leste.

As far as the impact of the project on conflict reduction is concerned, it is fair to conclude that the project managed to contribute to political stability and a peaceful environment to the extent possible.

Maximizing Impact on Conflict Resolution (II): Do No Harm, Strengthen Conflict Resolution Capacity

The second strategy recommended is to strengthen conflict resolution capacity in the context of the project.

Did the project itself experience or generate conflicts? How were these dealt with? What lessons can be learned?

A few conflicts have been reported in the context of the implementation of the project. They may have to do with cultural differences, work attitude differences, power relations, gender relations, identities and manipulation of identities, articulation of interests, differential access to resources.

Recommendations

It is recommended that a follow up Labour Based Employment project integrates a Do No Harm approach.

Development interventions in Timor-Leste may integrate the lessons learned from the extensive experience in working with a Do No Harm framework in conflict and post-conflict situations all over the world.

In follow-up Labour Based Employment projects a Do No Harm approach is expected to contribute to addressing potential conflict dimensions in a proactive way.

Conceptual assumptions of the Do No Harm Approach

Aid is not neutral in the midst of conflict. Aid can cause harm or can strengthen peace capacities in the midst of conflicted communities. All aid programmes involve the transfer of resources (money, food, water, training, etc.) into a resource-scarce environment. Where people are in conflict, these resources represent power and wealth and they become an element of the conflict. Some people attempt to control and use aid resources to support their side of the conflict and to weaken the other side. If they are successful or if aid staff fail to recognise the impact of their programming decisions, aid can cause harm. However, the transfer of resources and the manner in which staff conduct the programmes can strengthen local capacities for peace, build on connectors that bring communities together, and reduce the divisions and sources of tensions that can lead to destructive conflict.⁵

Principles of the Do No Harm approach:

- It is possible and urgent to apply DO NO HARM in conflict-prone, active conflict and post-conflict situations,
- Conflict-exacerbating impacts of development interventions should be and can be identified in an early stage,
- Development interventions, in particular in potentially conflict prone areas, have an obligation to heighten their awareness of inter-group relations in project sites to play a conscious role in helping groups to come together,
- Development interventions should heighten their attention for inter-project relations and interconnections about programming decisions (where to work, how to work, with whom, what conditions, what approach etcetera) and the potential conflict implications of differing or conflicting (not mutually supportive) strategies,
- Do No Harm should help the project staff to identify programming options when things go badly; it should help the staff through providing an analytical framework; it should be able to provide practical tools for conflict prevention and conflict resolution in the context of the project and its surroundings.
- To support local capacities for peace requires careful reflection on staff conduct and organisational policies so that the 'implicit ethical messages' that are sent communicate congruent messages that strengthen local capacities for peace.

⁵ There is extensive documentation available on the Do No Harm approach and the lessons learned in emergencies, post-conflict rehabilitation and in development interventions. The classic document is the document written by Mary Anderson. See Mary B. Anderson: *Do No Harm: How Aid Can Support Peace - or War*. Boulder, Lynne Rienner Publishers, 1999; see also Mary B. Anderson (ed.) *Options for Aid in Conflict: Lessons from Field Experience*, Boulder, 2000; Do No Harm / Local Capacities for Peace Project, Conflict Sensitive Approaches to Development, Humanitarian Assistance and Peace Building, Tools for Peace and Conflict Impact assessment.

http://conflictsensitivity.org/resource_pack/8_do_no_harm_local_capacities_for_peace_project_323.html; Collaborative for Development Action, <http://www.cdainc.com/lcp/index.php>; Marshall Wallace *Learning from communities that prevent conflict*, in: *Global Future*, first quarter 2005.

5. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION: RELEVANCE, EFFECTIVENESS, EFFICIENCY, IMPACT, COHERENCE, OWNERSHIP AND SUSTAINABILITY

1. Accomplishments against workplan

The Serbisu Ba Dame project was implemented with vigour and in accordance with the work plan.

This conclusion is based on observations, documents, discussions with authorities, beneficiaries and comments from outside observers having worked in the districts at the time of implementation of the project.

The workplan comprised nine (9) components:

1. Establishment of the project structure

A solid project structure was designed and materialised in close cooperation with the Ministry of Labour and Community Reinsertion so as to attain maximum synergies with the government structure.

A three-tier management-and-decision making structure was set up.

Staff was recruited, including a team of international engineers. National staff was employed against government contracts so as to maximize integration in terms of human resources. Procedures were designed, and a Project Procedural Manual was developed and available for all project staff for reference at the start of the project which has proven to be highly effective.

Procurement of tools and equipment was a great challenge as was the distribution to the 13 districts.

Trainings were organised for all project staff and stakeholders, which greatly contributed to synchronising and synergizing project objectives and implementation. Technical trainings were also organised for project staff and stakeholders. The Technical Manual is highly appreciated by the project staff.

Overall evaluation findings:

- The Serbisu Ba Dame project structure is found to be effective and efficient.
- A follow up project may be founded on a similar structure.

2. Management Information System

A Management Information System was designed especially for the SBD project to record all project activities and provide management information available on a daily basis for all 13 districts. The Management data include numbers of workers and targets set, financial information, a solid accountability system. The Management Information System allowed for monitoring of overall achievements and specific objectives and targets.

The MIS was a major project management tool, enabling appropriate project management, monitoring, and evaluation. The MIS was able to provide permanently updated information for reporting to donors and stakeholders.

All relevant project data were available by the end of the project.

Staff were trained to insert data and use the system.

The Management Information System is considered a major achievement of the project. The Management Information System can be replicated in a follow up project.

3. Introducing a Gender Equality Perspective

A Gender Equality Perspective was integrated in the Serbisu ba Dame Project (See before, Chapter 4.2.). The Gender Unit of the Division of Employment and Skills Development of the MLCR was involved in all steps in the development of the project structure.

There is no doubt about the commitment of the project coordinator and other stakeholders in endorsing gender equality.

The gap between Gender targets and Gender achievements, however, is rather alarming, in particular in view of the efforts made to integrate a gender perspective.

Conclusion: an analysis of the effectiveness of the gender strategy and the resistance against gender equality at various levels of project implementation is required. There is a need for gender specific expertise.

4. Identification of project activities in all districts

The project organised a community driven process for identification of project activities in all 13 districts involving local authorities in the district, sub-district, village, and sub-village levels.

5. Involving local authorities in the identification and selection of beneficiaries

The selection of beneficiaries was in accordance with the procedures and timely. Local authorities were closely involved in the selection of beneficiaries. (See before, chapter 4.2., about the crucial role of local authorities in selecting beneficiaries in view of gender targets).

The likelihood of political favouritism was considerable as the project was implemented at a politically sensitive time (elections).

There have been some allegations of clientelism and favouritism in selection of beneficiaries, but these can not be substantiated. It is not clear whether this has impacted beneficiary selection. None of the interviewees in this evaluation mission mentioned having been excluded or knowing someone who has been excluded. Reportedly there have been a few conflicts between the chefe and groups of workers (Liquiça) and it was reported that *"if they could not cooperate with the chefe we took another group"*.

In discussing the issue of possible political favouritism the project coordinator has been convincing it that he has done everything in his power to avoid politicization of the project, and that if any incidence of favouritism came up, the issue was thoroughly investigated by the project coordinator and appropriate action was taken.

Lessons learned: It is realistic to anticipate that any project which is about access to resources is likely to experience some degree of favouritism.

The challenge for a follow-up project is to establish mechanisms to counter favouritism to the extent possible.

These could include:

- timing of implementation: avoid coinciding with elections
- participatory methods of selection, selection committee reflecting the diversity of the population to be served
- involving civil society organisations
- more explicit procedures regarding political accountability
- including training on governance principles in project training (this actually happened)
- procedures ensuring public announcement of the list of beneficiaries (written and orally, maximizing outreach) and procedures allowing for questioning the lists of beneficiaries (disadvantage: time).

Recommendation: in follow up projects mechanisms should be established to minimise favouritism and maximize coverage.

6. Organising and supervising implementation of project activities, engaging selected beneficiaries

Rapid identification of rural infrastructural works was conducted in all 13 districts. Priority lists were identified. Rehabilitation and maintenance activities were planned. Activities were selected in a community driven process. Activity assessments were carried out by the district technical teams, with international engineers assisting the national engineers.

7. Conduct Project Steering Committee Meetings

A three-tier management-and-decision making structure was set up. Stakeholders participating in the management structure did not report any concerns with regard to the project management structure.

8. Report to donor and stakeholders

Reports were carried out according to plan. Inception report and Mid-Term report were submitted to EC Bruxelles through UNDP Bruxelles.

9. Conduct regular field monitoring visits and project final evaluation

Two monitoring mechanisms were developed with ILO responsible for direct monitoring of project activities in the field and UNDP conducting monitoring missions facilitated by ILO. UNDP has produced separate monitoring reports⁶.

⁶ UNDP: Serbisu Ba Dame (Work for Peace) Project, Field Visit Report, Liquica District, September 2007, prepared by Teresa Jamero; UNDP: Serbisu Ba Dame (Work for Peace) Project, Field Visit Report, Oecusse District, September 2007, prepared by Ruth Jorge; UNDP: Serbisu Ba Dame (Work for Peace) Project, Field Visit Report, Bobonaro District, September, 2007, prepared by Ruth Jorge.

2. Project Implementation

Overall management

This final project evaluation found that the overall management of the project was outstanding.

The overall management was appropriate and effective

- a. in term of structures and systems
- b. in terms of organisational culture.

This is reflected in

- valid project design
- efficiency of project organisation
- a solid structure
- good staff relationships, mutual appreciation, enthusiasm
- appropriateness and effectiveness of the Management Information System
- accountability and transparency
- commitment regarding priorities in resource allocation
- selection of beneficiaries and checks and balances
- implementation in line with activity planning
- choices being justified and substantiated (e.g. re. wage levels, selection methods, transport of cash, security issues).

Capacity Building and Training

Capacity Building was an integral and vital component of the Serbisu Ba Dame project. Capacity building involved project planning and implementation, technical training, procedural training, principles, attitudes. The project involved formal trainings as well as on the job training.

Whereas 6 months is a short time frame for capacity building, the project staff is highly appreciative about the trainings and what they have learnt. All staff in the end received a training certificate from the Secretary of State for Vocational Training and Employment. The contribution of the international engineers to on the job training was highly valued.

Learning in the course of the project

When asked what they learned and what has improved in the course of the project, project staff all mention different issues. One recurring and most often mentioned issue is the work discipline of the workers, and what is the best method or attitude to bring about an improvement in work discipline.

"It is a little bit difficult for them. This is the first time for them to work like this. We always explain it to them, but it is difficult for them to change, they don't understand". "They do not have a watch". "They work in a different way".

The project used a range of methods and attitudes to try to bring about change in work discipline:

Serbisu Ba Dame Project: Methods used to improve work discipline of workers

- Explaining rules and expectations
- Listening and trying to understand
- Organising groups of workers, delegate management, create leadership
- The presence/absence form. Workers sign (signature or fingerprint) in the morning and by the time they leave.
- Payment by task rather than by day
- Adapting the criteria for "normal productivity"
- Leading by example
- Terminating the contract for people who do not work well or do not appear in time.
- Replace a group of workers who do not work well.

There is evidence that this combination of methods was effective in bringing about change. There has been notable improvement in discipline. Yet, till the last day, workers arrive late and leave early. A fundamental difference in perceptions between "the project" and the workers is still there.

Learning: Feedback from project staff

This evaluation asked project staff what they have learned in the course of the project. A range of learnings were mentioned by them:

Feedback from project staff: Learnings from the Serbisu Ba Dame project

- I Learned how to organise people, how to guide large groups of people
- I Learned how to plan a project systematically and implement it
- I learned how an international project works
- I learned monitoring
- I learned the very practical work of a project
- Learned discipline
- One of the local technical engineers: *"Sometimes I was scared, as I had to manage large groups of people, and I had to put pressure on them to work in a disciplined way. I did not feel safe. I did not want to put too much pressure on them and I tried to first understand them. The first three days they worked well, then there were a lot of complaints and people were sitting and did not move. After that the situation became better again, not because I put pressure on them but because I talked to them and tried to understand them, they changed. After that I did not have fear anymore."*
- I learned to relate to people, communicate with people
- I learned how to handle a conflict
- I have more self confidence

- I learned most in doing the work, on the job
- I learned a lot from the international engineer.
- I learned from the people.
- I learned a lot from the project leader
- I learned a lot from the trainings. The technical manual is very clear and good. I learned everything that is in the book.
- I learned what rehabilitation is.
- How to build a road: I have increased my technical knowledge
- I learned the system of calculations
- I learned to take responsibility for money, for large amounts of money. I learned the system of how to account for the money and for the project tools.
- I was scared in handling such large amounts of money.
- I learned that women staff have different needs
- I learned working in remote areas without being scared (a woman staff member)
- That as a man I can work very well with women staff and male staff
- I learned discipline
- I can now support my family for a while. Now that the project is finished I am scared that there will be no more work for me.

Decisionmaking about labour versus capital goods component

The project management made a commitment to ensure that the wage component of the budget is not diluted. This is considered a just choice.

Wage payments: Payment dates

Many similar projects have witnessed complaints about payments of wages: too late, not transparent. In the Serbisu Ba Dame Procedures Manual the payment regime is clearly described: if week 1, 2, and 3 are working weeks (15 days), then payment should happen in week 5, and project staff should clearly explain the payment process to beneficiaries and local authorities⁷.

It is found that *(i)* at times, there was a gap between expectations of beneficiaries and actual date of payments; *(ii)* the payment schedule has not always been sufficiently clarified; *(iii)* in some cases, payments were made later than planned.

A complaint from a beneficiary not having been paid for a month (Balibo) was promptly followed up by the SBD project coordinator; the Community Development Officer responded that the worker concerned worked on a nearby government employment scheme.

⁷ Procedures Manual p 74 and p 61

Accountability and Transparency

Transparency was an integral component of the project and ILO / DESD work strategy.

The Serbisu Ba Dame project has solid structures, checks and balances in place to ensure accountability and transparency.

The procedures regarding the payments of salaries are as follows:

Serbisu Ba Dame Project: Procedures regarding salary payments

- all beneficiaries use a standard form
- all data from the forms are put into the database
- beneficiaries sign a list of presence twice a day
- group control prevents misinformation
- the lists are checked against the beneficiary registration form,
- upon receiving and approving the list of attendance, the central operation officer produces a payment list containing names and amount to be paid for each beneficiary to be signed (by signature of finger print - see annex)
- the central operations officer presents the lists to the administration officer and the administration officer withdraws the fund from the bank
- funds are counted and exchanged
- district teams collect the funds with PNTL or UNPOL protection and transport the funds to the districts
- payments are conducted as per the list of payments directly to the beneficiaries.

What are the vulnerabilities or weakest chains in the process?

1. When the payments are due, all beneficiaries are called to the location of payment. Projects officers are instructed to pay directly to the beneficiaries. However, for various reasons it is not always possible for each beneficiary to be present at the time of payment; at every salary payment a few people are absent. These remaining payments are then handed over to the chefe de suco or chefe de aldeia for them to transfer the money to the beneficiary.

The project ensures follow up of these cases.

No complaints have been reported to the project regarding the payments of salaries. One complaint was reported during this evaluation; this was followed up and there is evidence that the complaint is related to a nearby government-implemented project. There are no reports of beneficiaries receiving less money than the amount they signed for. This evaluation found not one single report on corruption of fraud.

This is a major achievement of the project in a highly difficult working environment.

2. A second vulnerability in the system: People are not numerate. They can count a little but they generally can not make out the difference between a one-dollar and a five dollar note. Are they able to count what they have received and signed for?

This evaluation found that the project has clear systems in place to prevent irregularities in wage payments to illiterate people.

3. A third vulnerability in the system: the transport of the money, and related to this: security of staff.

No incidents have occurred with respect to the transport of the money.

For the Serbisu Ba Dame project the emphasis on accountability and transparency also pertains to what is communicated to the beneficiaries (educating by example): that and how the project works in a transparent way.

For procurement suppliers, tender procedures are conducted as per ILO and UNDP procurement policies and standards.

Monitoring presence and absence

Well defined procedures on presence / absence are in place. Labour monitoring was carried out with the help of a.o. the presence / absence list.

Workers account for their presence at the beginning and the end of the day, by signature or fingerprint (See annex).

The presence / absence list is also a tool to increase labour discipline. It is a group list. This is expected to facilitate group control. A group list may also help in preempting discretionary decisions vis-à-vis individual workers.

Targets regarding participation of women and girls: lessons learned from conflict and post-conflict situations



Participation of women has been an issue of concern right from the start of the project.

In consultation with the donor the project target was set at 30 % women. An alternative option was to aim at equal participation of girls and men. The decision to target at 30% women was taken with reference to the fact that during the 2006 crisis the perpetrators of violence were in majority young men and unemployment of young men is considered one of the root causes of violence.

In setting the targets about women's participation, lessons can be learned from likeminded projects in post -conflict situations in other countries.

In conflict and post-conflict situations, men are generally in majority the perpetrators of violence. Unemployment of men (including demobilisation of military personnel) resulting in social unrest and crisis of identity may be

among the root causes of violence.

For aid interventions engaged in income generation, targeting men may be appropriate in terms of addressing one of the root causes of violence.

There is evidence that in conflict and post-conflict situations, the prevalence of domestic violence tends to increase. There is usually a high incidence of displacement and an increase of female headed households.

For aid organisations providing resources, targeting women is appropriate in terms of addressing poverty and providing security to vulnerable groups.

Depending on the objectives of the programme and the actual needs identified, the targets may be defined. If there is no particular reason to focus on either women or men, this evaluation recommends equal participation of women and men.

Staff perceptions of what may be improved

Staff was asked what they appreciate in the project and about every thinkable issue was mentioned by them. They were also asked what according to them should be improved if a follow up project were to be implemented. The following issues are mentioned by staff in the districts visited during this evaluation. They are just quoted here in order to document their feedback, without any further comments.

Staff perceptions on what should be improved

- The wages of the workers
- More priority towards employing youth
- The road may be not good enough, if the rainy season starts, the road will soon be affected
- There is primarily vertical communication, not enough horizontal communication
- There should be more integration at regional level, with the Ministry and with other projects
- Wages of staff need to be increased.
- There should be more motor bikes, two in every district. Often I have to go to a far away project area and there is not transport, I have to stay there two days, it is very heavy.
- There should be more staff in every district. There is not enough staff to monitor the entire project.
- It is very risky to handle such amounts of money. I can do it but I was scared.
- The local engineer should have participated more
- There is a need for more capacity building and training in the project. Including for more technical training needed.
- The criteria for "normal productivity" are not good, they need to be revised, there needs to be flexibility and space for revision
- Sometimes procurement of tools was late, that should be improved
- Sometimes payment of salaries was late, that should be improved.

3. Coherence with National Goals and Institutional linkages

Coherence with National Goals

Youth employment features high in the agenda of the relevant ministries: the Ministry of Labour and Community Reinsertion, the Ministry of Education and Culture and the Secretariat of State for Youth and Sport. In view of the 2006 socio-political crisis and in particular in view of the demographic situation in Timor-Leste and the age specific difficulties for youth to create a living, the Government is concerned about the employment situation of young people. The Government is seen to take an increasingly proactive stand in programming initiatives providing youth employment opportunities and skills building.

The Serbisu Ba Dame project is congruent with the National Development Goals for Timor-Leste as formulated in the National Development Plan which was pertinent at the time of planning and implementation of the project.⁸

A commitment to peace, security and stability is one of the overarching development goals⁹. Also, a commitment to equitable employment is one of the components of the overall goals.

Employment and living standard related objectives are mentioned throughout the Development Plan: they are set in the Macro-economics and Public Finance Framework¹⁰; in the Guiding Principles of the Macro-economics Framework¹¹ and in the Medium Term Economic and Financing Outlook.

Three sector plans are relevant for the Serbisu Ba Dame project and each of these include strategies and approaches similar to those informing the Serbisu Ba Dame project: the Sector Plan on Poverty Reduction, Rural and Regional Development¹², the Sector Plan on Agriculture, Fisheries and Forestry¹³ and the Sector Plan on Infrastructure.¹⁴

In april 2006 the sector plans were updated. It is evident that the Serbisu Ba Dame project approach and design very well aligns with the priorities set in the Sector Investment Program on Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries and the Sector Investment Program on Transport.¹⁵

Conclusion:

The project design and approach of the Serbisu Ba Dame project are **valid** as they are **strategically congruent** with the overall National Development Goals and with the relevant Sector Investment Plans.

The expertise provided by ILO and UNDP is highly **relevant and appropriate** in view of the priorities set in the National Development Goals and the Sector Investment Plans.

⁸ Government of Timor-Leste, Planning Commission: Timor-Leste. National Development Plan. Dili, 2002.

⁹ Idem, p. 20

¹⁰ Idem, p. 5, p.65

¹¹ Idem, p. 60

¹² Idem. p.121

¹³ Idem, p 171

¹⁴ Idem, p. 263

¹⁵ See Ministry of Transport and Communication, Ministry of Public Works, Timor Leste: Transport. Priorities and Proposed Sector Investment Program. Dili, April, 2006. Published with the assistance of the UNDP.

Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, Timor Leste: Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries. Priorities and Proposed Sector Investment Program. Dili, April, 2006. Published with the assistance of the UNDP.

Institutional Linkages with the Ministry: Coherence, Synergies, Ownership, Sustainability

The Serbisu Ba Dame Project was defined and designed in close consultation and cooperation with the Ministry of Labour and Community Reinsertion (MLCR), reflecting a solid relationship developed through the implementation of past initiatives and sustained in ongoing initiatives. Also, the former Ministry of Public Works was involved from the beginning of the project. Key components of the project approach – Labour Based Employment – were developed with and approved by the Ministry.

As an immediate response to the 2006 crisis the ILO and UNDP offices in Timor-Leste in close cooperation with the Ministry of Labour and Community Reinsertion launched a Cash for Work project: Servi Nasaun (Serve the Nation), implemented through the Division of Employment and Skills Development (DESD) and the four District Employment Centers of the MLCR. Servi Nasaun, in a six-month time frame, provided cash for work for 30,000 unemployed youth, thus addressing some of the root causes of the social unrest. As Servi Nasaun was assessed as an effective and relevant intervention the MLCR and the ILO and UNDP offices in Timor-Leste were requested to replicate and expand the project (in terms of numbers of youth benefiting, time frame, and geographic coverage). While scaling up the Servi Nasaun activities, Serbisu Ba Dame in terms of institutional linkages and organisational structures could benefit from and build on the foundations of the previous project.

A major ongoing ILO/UNDP/MLRC intervention in Timor-Leste is the STAGE skills training project, funded by the European Commission.¹⁶ STAGE is building capacity to deliver demand driven micro enterprise and skills training. STAGE provides MLCR with the competences and methodologies to coordinate vocational and entrepreneurial skills training and deliver employment services in a decentralised approach, by strengthening the capacity of existing rural training providers.

The synergy between the Serbisu Ba Dame Project and the Ministry of Labour and Community Reinsertion is further reflected in the Youth Employment Study (YES) carried out mid 2007 by ILO and MLCR in partnership with UNDP, WB, European Commission and GTZ; and in particular in the long term – 4 year - Youth Employment Promotion project (YEP) starting 1st of October 2007.¹⁷

A disadvantage of the former government structure was that the Division of Employment and Skills Development (DESD) was located in the Ministry of Labour and Community Reinsertion (MLCR). The social policy components of the MLCR tended to take priority over the employment components and gain more visibility.

With the recent reorganisation of the government structures and the ensuing creation of the Secretariat of State for Vocational Training and Employment, Employment is more strategically situated in the government structure.

The Serbisu Ba Dame Project was to a considerable extent integrated within the Division of Employment and Skills Development (DESD) of the MLCR. National staff, for example, were recruited under government conditions and labour contracts were issued by DESD. It was anticipated that this would contribute to part of the staff being included in other similar projects by the time the project is ended.

¹⁶ STAGE: Skills Training for Gainful Employment Programme.

¹⁷ Ministry of Labour and Community Reinsertion, International Labour Organization: YES. Youth Employment Study. Timor-Leste 2007. Dili, 2007

Ministry of Labour and Community Reinsertion, International Labour Organization: YEP. Youth Employment Promotion, Programme Outline, 2007. Dili, 2007.

The Ministry took ownership of the project by contributing USD 1,5 million [*EUR 1.13 million*] to the overall project funding of the Serbisu Ba Dame project.

In view of sensitivities during the election period and in order to avoid the appearance of politicization of the project, a decision was taken to delay the disbursement of government funds till after the elections.

The close cooperation with the Ministry was reflected in the management structure of the project and the position of the Ministry within the management structure. The three-tier management structure itself was designed in consultation with MLCR. At the highest management level was the Project Steering Committee (PSC) comprising all stakeholders (MLCR, ILO, UNDP and EC); the PSC provided overall guidance and direction and reviewed progress of the project. The PSC was chaired by MLCR.

The second management layer, the Regional Working Committee (RWC) comprised the director and deputy director of the DESD and the MLCR regional coordinator, in addition to the UNDP monitoring officer and SBD project staff.

In the districts the project worked together with District Administrations and local authorities (chefs de sucos and aldeias) in the process of identification of roads, and in identification and selection of beneficiaries. Local authorities were invited to work in tandem in the entire process of the project implementation. Their actual participation varied from district to district with local authorities in some districts visiting the project sites on a daily basis and playing a highly pro-active and supportive role (e.g. the administrator of sub-district Maliana, Bobonaro).

At the end of the project, the project transferred the equipments and tools to the sector Ministries and local authorities.

Close cooperation with the responsible local administration and sector Ministry is likely to contribute to the sustainability of the project output. Local authorities reported that they have made commitments to take responsibility for the maintenance of the rehabilitated infrastructure.

Beneficiaries were asked how they perceive the sustainability of the (newly opened and rehabilitated) roads in particular during and after the rainy season; several beneficiaries mentioned that they were willing to maintain the roads without receiving salary (as gotong royong, voluntary labour) and that they expect the local authorities to take the lead.

The Ministry and local authorities benefited from the linkages with the project. In addition to the immediate project outcome they gained visibility (clearly visible delivery, additional visibility through presence, sign boards, T-shirts, etc.) and capacity building.

Capacity building was one of the key components in the cooperation with the Ministry, with ILO/UNDP providing technical support at various levels periodically, and Ministry of Public Works staff and local administration staff participating in technical trainings.

In terms of the practicalities of implementation, the project benefited highly from the close cooperation with the government. The government provided office space and project staff was situated in government premises. Furthermore, local authorities were requested to facilitate access to communities, organise meetings, provide transport when needed, support procurement of equipment, and in general actively participate in the process.

The close cooperation with the government was in the first place an intrinsic value for the project. In view of the sustainability, it is acknowledged that ownership of any intervention should be, increasingly, with the Government of Timor-Leste itself.

Institutional Linkages with the Ministry: Conclusions and Lessons Learned

The institutional linkages between the ILO/UNDP and MLRC reflect a solid relationship developed through the implementation of past and ongoing initiatives (Servi Nasaun, STAGE, YES), thus ensuring the **coherence and synergies** required for successful implementation of the project.

With hindsight, it can be concluded that the decision of the project management to work in close cooperation with the Ministry and with local authorities in all stages of the project has been a just choice.

The institutional linkages thus created constitute a solid foundation for **sustainability** in terms of organisational and management structures, project approaches as well as in terms of human resources. Also, they are reflected in increased **ownership** of labour-based employment generation strategies with the Government of Timor-Leste.

Recommendations

It is recommended that the project is replicated on large scale with a long term time frame.

The present project and in particular the institutional linkages created over time by the implementing organisations provide evidence that future similar projects are effective and feasible.

When scaling up the SBD activities, follow up projects can build on the solid foundations – institutional coherence, organisational set up - of the Serbisu Ba Dame project.

In future projects the government of Timor-Leste should increasingly take the lead with ILO / UNDP providing technical support.

Linkages with the Donor

Immediately after the 2006 crisis, and following the visit by the Special Envoy of President José Manuel Barroso, the European Commission launched a series of stabilisation measures in Timor-Leste. The Commission adopted a EUR 4 million short term stabilisation programme under the EC Rapid Reaction Mechanism. The Serbisu Ba Dame project was one of the two projects supported under the RRM, while the second project involved support to the national dialogue process through high-level third party facilitation of the dialogue by members of the Club of Madrid¹⁸, and through technical assistance, including information activities and civic education.

The two projects constitute different mechanisms to conflict reduction and promotion of stability: a socio-economic mechanism and a socio-political mechanism. While the first approach addresses root causes of the crisis, the second mechanism addresses the level of political integration. The two approaches are considered complementary.

¹⁸ <http://www.clubmadrid.org/cmadrid/index.php?id=1>

Linkages with other projects and stakeholders

The Serbisu Ba Dame had links with various stakeholders at the local level – other donor agencies and international NGOs like CARE, CARITAS, WFP and OXFAM. Some of these worked with likeminded approaches like WFP.

The project established cooperation with local NGO and various NGOs participated in the initial meetings organised in the districts to communicate the objectives of the project. Several NGOs participated in trainings organised by the project.

The dynamics between the SBD project and other stakeholders have been different in various districts. While in general cooperation has been smooth, there have been instances where diverging approaches (e.g. regarding salary levels: one project paid USD 4 [EUR 3,02] per day, twice as much as the SBD project) were found to be disturbing for intra-project relations.

Evidently, two projects maintaining different wage levels in the same district are likely to increase rather than reduce the local conflict potential.

It is recommended that in future projects, efforts be undertaken to in an early stage of the project assess the dynamics between various interventions so as to avoid that the aid intervention itself contributes to conflict.

Coherence with MDGs

The Government of Timor-Leste has committed itself to the Millennium Development Goals.¹⁹

The very approach and design of the Serbisu Ba Dame project is in line with the intentions of the MDGs. In particular, Goal number 1 (eradicating extreme poverty and hunger), Goal number 2 (universal primary education) and Goal number 8 (highlighting the needs of youth including youth employment) explicitly address the objectives also stated by the SBD project.

It is fair to conclude that the project has an immense potential to contribute to the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals. Obviously, with a robust effort to increase the participation of girls in follow up projects the impact on girls education could be far more substantial.

In order to contribute to the MDGs in a more sustainable way the project should be replicated on a larger scale and with a long term time frame.

The Serbisu Ba Dame project is one of the interventions that should, in addition to other strategies, be promoted to ensure progress in meeting the Millennium Development Goals in Timor-Leste.

¹⁹ Timor Leste 2005: Millennium Development Goals. Where are we now? Dili, GTL, 2005

4. Project exit, Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Sustainability, Impact and Follow-up strategies

This study has demonstrated that the Serbisu Ba Dame project is sustainable.

The sustainability of the project is fundamentally supported by 5 “pillars”:

1. Project approach and project structure.

The Serbisu Ba Dame **project approach and structure** have proven to be **effective** and **efficient**. The project approach was **valid** and **relevant**. The project achievements exceeded most of the project targets.

It can be concluded that the project approach and project structures are replicable. They should be consolidated and scaled up. When scaling up the Serbisu Ba Dame project a follow up project should build on the solid foundations of the approach and structure of the Serbisu Ba Dame project.

2. Institutional linkages with the Government of Timor-Leste.

The Serbisu Ba Dame project developed strong **institutional linkages** with the Ministry and local administration, thus ensuring the **coherence and synergies** required for successful implementation of the project. The institutional linkages thus created constitute a solid foundation for **sustainability** in terms of organisational and management structures, project approaches as well as in terms of human resources. Also, they are reflected in increased **ownership** of labour based employment generation strategies with the Government of Timor-Leste.

In view of **sustainability** of the project, it is acknowledged that **ownership** of any intervention should be, increasingly, with the Government of Timor-Leste itself.

While scaling up the Serbisu Ba Dame project, follow up projects in terms of institutional linkages and organisational structures could benefit from and build on the foundations of the Serbisu ba Dame project.

3. Capacity Building.

Capacity Building was an integral and vital component of the Serbisu Ba Dame project. Capacity is a major component aiming at sustainability of project impact.

4. Education.

Education, like capacity building, is pre-eminently a ‘sustainability factor’. It is an ‘investment for ever’. This study has demonstrated that the project had a remarkable **impact** on education of girls and boys through the fact that a large part of the money earned was spent on education. Education itself is a factor which has a spin-off to several other development variables like health and empowerment.

Education is one of the Millennium Development Goals. The project, when replicated on a large scale, has an immense potential to contribute to the achievement of the MDG. The Serbisu Ba Dame project is one of the interventions that should, in addition to other strategies, be promoted to ensure progress in meeting the Millennium Development Goals in Timor-Leste.

5. Community support.

In the course of the project implementation, the project has gained full support from the communities. Support from the communities is a prerequisite for sustainability.

Support from the communities is also a sine qua non as far as the sustainability of the project output is concerned: future road maintenance. One of the project strategies to strive for sustainability has been to discuss future road maintenance with the local authorities and with the communities. Local authorities and local communities have made commitments to take responsibility for the maintenance of the rehabilitated infrastructure. As part of the exit strategy the project transferred project tools to the communities.

There is an urgent need for this labour based employment project to be sustained.

Two conditions have to be met in order to achieve sustainability of the project impact:

1. An integrated approach: strategically linking this employment project to other rural development projects.
2. Long term commitment from all stakeholders.

Stakeholders, in the first place the Government of Timor-Leste must be willing to commit themselves to long term funding and implementation of labour based employment strategy.

In view of the huge level of underspending of government expenditures (see annex)²⁰, the challenge may be in implementation capacity rather than financial capacities.

Recommendations

It is recommended that the project is replicated on large scale with a long term time frame.

When consolidation and scaling up the SBD activities, follow up projects can build on the solid foundations – institutional coherence, organisational set up - of the Serbisu Ba Dame project.

In future projects the government of Timor-Leste should increasingly take the lead with ILO / UNDP providing technical support.

²⁰ Government of Timor Leste: Central Government Finances, FY 2005/2006, quoted in Asian Development Bank, presentation, internal document, n.d.

6. KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

This Final Project Evaluation report provides ten (10) Key Recommendations based on the key findings of this evaluation study.

The recommendations are intended to serve as an input for drafting follow up programming on Labour-Based Employment generation, in particular on Youth Employment, and on Programming on Conflict Reduction and lasting Peace in Timor-Leste.

1. Replicate the Labour Based Employment approach.

Root causes of the conflict are still equally existent, there remains an unmet need for road rehabilitation, and youth employment has far from improved.

In this imminent crisis situation the present labour based employment approach has proven to be an appropriate and effective response.

There is a definite and urgent need to replicate the labour-based road maintenance-cum-rehabilitation project. **The project should be consolidated and scaled up.**

A long term time frame is needed. Geographical coverage must be expanded.

2. Replicate the organisational structures and institutional linkages of the Serbisu Ba Dame Project.

The present project and in particular the institutional linkages created over time by the implementing organisations provide evidence that future similar projects are effective and feasible. When scaling up the Serbisu Ba Dame activities, follow up projects can build on the solid foundations – institutional coherence, organisational set up – of the Serbisu Ba Dame project.

3. Define a Strategy of Advocacy to ensure that the Government of Timor-Leste adopts this project as part of its overall employment and wider development strategies.

ILO/UNDP should engage in a constructive dialogue with the Government of Timor-Leste with the objective of the GTL taking over responsibility for a follow up SBD project. The advocacy strategy may include briefings, project visits for Ministers of the relevant ministries, production of visual materials, dissemination of project achievements through media.

Advocate the replication of this project as one of the strategies to achieve the Millennium Development Goals.

The project has an immense potential to contribute to the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals. With a robust effort to increase the participation of girls the impact of the project of girls education can be far more substantial.

The Serbisu Ba Dame project is one of the interventions that should, in addition to other strategies, be promoted to ensure progress in meeting the Millennium Development Goals in Timor-Leste.

4. In future projects the government of Timor-Leste should increasingly take the lead with ILO / UNDP providing technical support.

Ownership of the project should be increasingly with the Government of Timor-Leste.

ILO/UNDP will increasingly transfer the management project and provide technical support, including capacity building.

5. Establish Strategic Links with other projects. Integrated approach.

In order to maximize impact the project should not stand on its own, it has to be part of an integrated approach combining multiple strategies.

These multiple strategies should at least include the following components:

- a. Promotion of productive, value adding activities. Micro-entrepreneur support. Strategies to support young starters.
- b. Vocational training, skills training and entrepreneurial training, targeting youth. Support to local vocational training institutes and training centres.
- c. Enhancing local procurement of equipment and tools;
Linking local procurement of tools to the project.
- d. Establish linkages with Credit and Savings organisations, local banks, in the region. Promote the development of Self Help Groups in managing the money earned through the project.
- e. Integrate a strong gender component in all related activities.
Reduce gender stereotypes in education, skills training and vocational training.
- f. Integrate an empowerment approach in all related activities.
- g. Involve schools and community organisations including women's organisations and youth organisations.
- h. Strengthening services for the rural poor.
- i. Decentralised approach
Allow for diversity in regional approaches and implementation.

6. Target Groups should be Youth (male and female) and IDPs.

Target groups should be in line with the present project.

Target group criteria should be maintained with flexibility, like in the present project.

7. Target 50 % Women's Participation.

Ensure that obstacles to women's participation are effectively addressed. Integrate a gender perspective at all levels of project implementation.

Equal participation of women will contribute to maximizing project impact.

A follow up project should integrate a gender perspective throughout the project, at activity and organisational level, including a budget for gender training and gender expertise to support the project in strategically and pro-actively addressing obstacles to gender equality.

Responsibility for gender should be with the project coordinator.

8. Integrate a Do No Harm perspective.

Like any other aid intervention, the Serbisu Ba Dame project can exacerbate conflict or strengthen local capacities for peace. All aid projects involve the transfer of resources. Where people are in conflict, project resources can easily become an element in the conflict.

Integrating a Do No Harm approach helps in recognising the impact of programming decisions on conflict and addressing potential conflict dimensions in a pro-active way.

9. Integrate the Recommendations from this evaluation study.

10. Document the process, document lessons learned.

Build in visual documentation. Produce visual training materials.

Annexes

Annex 1: Terms of Reference Evaluation Mission

I. GENERAL INFORMATION

Project: "Work for Peace" (Serbisu ba Dame) Project ID: 00055638

Activity: Final Evaluation

Starting date: 1 September 2007

Ending date: 15 September 2007

II. BACKGROUND

i) Situational Analysis

The crisis that happened in 2006 was provoked by the roaming disarmed and armed disgruntled soldiers; ineffective or partisan police; IDPs; East-west cleavages, youth gangs and martial art groups fighting, destabilization of productive activities.

Even if other causes of the above-mentioned events may exist, it is important to highlight the fact that poverty and its attendant deprivations, high unemployment and the lack of foreseeable job opportunities have been major contributors to the recent conflict.

ii) Timor-Leste's Development Challenges and Government Response:

Non oil per capita GDP decreased to USD 356 in 2006 (-1.6 in percentage term) Poverty and chronic deprivation continue to affect more than 40% of all households and the numbers of those in absolute poverty have likely risen in the last three years. Inequality is also on the rise. Rural poverty is more endemic than urban poverty with the poorest households being farming households. 64% of households are food insecure. The current unemployment rate is around 9%, figure that is far to provide a right and realistic dimension of the problem, considering that underemployment is increasing especially amongst the youth. Young Timorese enter the labour market facing a mismatch between the supply of skills they are able to offer and the demand of skills and expertise required by employers. Many youth drop out of school too early or receive education and training that was not suited to the requirements of the labour market which results to low wages, in low productive activities with little or no job security. The youth employment problem is also characterized by issues relating to underemployment, low pay and low quality jobs in the informal economy.

Intimately connected with the wide spread poverty and unemployment, the 2006 crisis that shook the people and structures of Timor-Leste was very much the consequence of an economy growing slower than people expectations. The limited access of young Timorese to employment opportunities, has led to a situation of deep frustration, which expressed itself in violent and destructive acts. On the other hand, the crisis itself delayed the Government capacity to launch and implement its planned actions, which further exacerbated the dramatic situation of the country.

The long term development of the 2006 TLDPM remained valid, but more flexible approaches addressing the crisis politically and socially were to be adopted.

iii) Justification of the Project

This project is justified within the broader context of finding crisis' solutions. The National Dialogue started by the President intended to foster dialogue at various level (High level, medium level and low level). In response to this

effort the EC supported through the RRM the high level dialogue with the facilitation of the club of Madrid. It provided support to National Dialogue secretariat for the dialogue at medium and lower level and it contributed to the extension in rural areas of the rapid employment scheme started by the Minister of Labour with Servi Nasaun in urban areas.

iv) The Work for Peace (Serbisu ba Dame) Project:

This project is fully funded by the European Commission (EC) and is executed by UNDP and ILO in partnership with the former Ministry of Labor and Community Reinsertion (MLCR), and articulating with the Ministry of Public works (MPW) and the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (MAFF). The "Work for Peace" (Serbisu ba Dame) Project has been established with the objective to reduce the potential for conflict and further destabilization in Timor-Leste, by providing short-term employment opportunities to groups which have played/ could play a particularly destabilizing role, especially the youth.

This project, in six months timeframe, specifically aims to:

1. Rapidly increase the purchasing power of 23,350 beneficiaries, by injecting some badly needed cash into the economy. In the case of IDPs, diminish their reliance on international humanitarian relief and food rations, and help gradual transition towards gainful economic activity, thus creating a link between relief, rehabilitation and development.
2. Balance international support provided to Timor-Leste, by creating a total of 350,250 workdays in all 13 districts, thereby lessening the demographic pressure on Dili and easing the current strain placed on rural households still hosting IDPs.

To ensure that investment in rural infrastructure has targeted impact on poverty reduction, the Project is promoting a Labour-Based approach, making intensive use of the workforce and minimum investment in equipment and materials. This Labour-Based methodology ensures that most of the funds are channeled directly into the local economy instead of purchasing expensive machinery, which traditionally represents a major cost factor in infrastructure-related works and leads to unsustainable maintenance plans.

Aside from injecting cash into rural economy, the other objective of this Project is to provide local communities with quality rural infrastructure. Regional engineers supervising the works and delivering on-the-job training to Timorese technicians ensure a proper design and implementation of selected activities.

Local authorities were involved in the identification and selection of beneficiaries. Youth is the priority target of the project, but other vulnerable groups like women and members of displaced households also benefit.

Actual implementation of this Project started on March 21, 2007 and will end on September 16, 2007.

The Project developed simple and effective methodologies to ensure that activities are selected through a community-driven process reflecting relevant local needs, involving local authorities at the district, sub-district, village and sub-village levels. A rapid identification of rural infrastructure works was done in all the 13 districts of Timor-Leste, working in close cooperation with the respective District administrations.

The initial round of consultations facilitate the identification of core range of activities, focused on rural roads repair/rehabilitation, national roads maintenance and irrigation canals cleaning and restoration. Road repair and maintenance was identified as top priority due to their high degree of deterioration.

Capacity building is an important component of the Project using on-the-job training and workshops for recruited national engineers, community workers and other stakeholders like Ministry of Public Works staff and local administration staff.

The project is integrated within the Division of Employment and Skills Development (DESD) of the MLRC and the national staff was recruited under Government conditions and employment contracts issued by the DESD, which will facilitate the absorption of some of them by the counterpart institution at the end of this initiative. The approach will create conditions for the establishment of a national capacity for the organization of activities oriented to the creation of short-term employment opportunities planned, funded and implemented by the Government structures.

As of end of June 2007, 16,372 beneficiaries have been enrolled in the project creating a total of 212,655 workdays of employment. 91% of these beneficiaries belong to the youth sector as against the targeted 70% participation, 19% of them are females against the targeted 30% participation and 40% are IDPs against the 30% targeted participation.

This project has experienced delay in implementation due to security situation and electoral period; late end of rainy season which hampered delivery of materials to the site; simultaneous implementation in the districts which require a high level of participation of qualified national staff to allow appropriate organization and supervision of the works and construction and other materials were not available on time. This delay has registered a low utilization rate of the project fund, however, a remarkable increase in fund utilization is expected when activities will speed up starting July 2007.

v) Objectives relating to Terminal Review of Work for Peace (Serbisu ba Dame) Project:

1. To assess the contribution of the project to reduce potential conflict and further destabilization and where this was not achieved analyze which are the conditions under which a similar or modified initiative could contribute to the objective.
2. To assess the validity of Project design and its strategic fit to overall national goals and the respective expertise provided by ILO and UNDP. In particular this should include the project organization established prior and during the project, the management of the information system, the management of the time available, the mainstreaming of youth, female youth and IDP. Assessment should be made also on the procurement of tools and equipment and the balance between the allocation of financial resources to equipment and technical assistance as compared to the labor.
3. To assess the project implementation effectiveness, in term of generation of purchasing power to targeted households and revival of the local economy; verify if the allocation of resources , both human and financial , for the proposed activities was adequate and in line with the project's Work Plan.
4. To assess if the increased employment's opportunities in the districts has decreased pressures on households sheltering IDPs;
5. To assess the accomplishments against the work plan for Project Implementation as per the ProDoc (see Section III, page 17 of the ProDoc) and the revised work plan (See page 14 of the Inception Report).
6. To assess if the project resulted in more self reliance of targeted youth groups and greater openness to employment, micro-finance and training schemes;
7. To assess the sustainability of project achievements in term of implementation of useful public works and link between these and the responsible local administration and sector Ministry; draw lessons learned and recommendations for future reference;
8. To assess if intended Project Results as per the Logical Framework Matrix have been achieved (See Section II page 15 of the Prodoc).
9. To assess the successful implementation of the activities resulting in the project outputs, outcomes and impact of the project;

10. To assess the effect/impact of the project on women;
11. To develop recommendations on possible adjustments and modifications and identify other areas of concern to be addressed for future interventions.
12. An analysis regarding partnerships and execution/implementation arrangements and their proven effectiveness in terms of capacity development of relevant national entities.
13. Evaluate the mechanisms in place to ensure coherence, coordination, complementary and synergies between the Project and the similar interventions by other stakeholders (GTL, other donor agencies, international NGOs, other implementing partners) in Timor-Leste. In particular assess the weaknesses or strength resulted from the Government contribution to be disbursed within a short time and by the same project's organization.

III. DELIVERABLES EXPECTED FROM THE EVALUATION

The expected outputs of the review and assessment would be a final evaluation report on the "Work for Peace" (Serbisu ba Dame) Project. The report should include but not limited to:

- Assessment of the Project design and relevance to national development plans and priorities
- Qualitative and quantitative assessment of progress towards intended outcome;
- Qualitative and quantitative assessment of relevant outputs;
- Effectiveness in Project implementation
- Impact and sustainability
- Lessons learned concerning best and/or less than ideal practices in producing outputs and achieving the outcome;
- Strategies and recommendations in terms of exit strategies and suggested follow up actions, replication or expansion.

IV. METHODOLOGY OF THE EVALUATION APPROACH

The evaluation shall be an independent evaluation. It will adhere to the UNEG Norms and Stands for Evaluation and UNDP Evaluation policy.

The review and assessment team may employ relevant and appropriate methods to conduct study including review of relevant documents, interviews with the stakeholders and partners, field visits, use of questionnaires, or surveys. During the start of the mission, the UNDP/ILO shall provide the documentation reflected below to the team:

Review of Documentation:

- Sector Investment Program (SIP) of Transport Sector and Irrigation within the SIP of Agriculture .
- Project document ,inception report , Mid Term progress report ;
- Procedures Manual developed by the project
- Project Steering Committee meeting minutes , internal monitoring report
- UNDP Handbook on Monitoring & Evaluation for Results

Evaluation Questions:

Validity of the Project Design: What were / are the strategic components of the Project? What was the Project's intended strategy? What was the project means of action?

Relevance of the Project: How does the project align with and support national development plan and programmes and priorities of national partners? How adequately does the project relate to the sector strategies? How well does the project link with the activities of other donors at the local level including WFP cash for work? How well does it fit with the other components of RRM financed by the EC and with the broader UN framework in Timor-Leste and local donor context?

Project Progress and Effectiveness: Will the project achieve the intended outputs at the end of the project? What are the demonstrated success of the project and how to build on these achievements? Have the quality and quantity of the output so far been satisfactory and how well the benefits accrue equally for men and women? In which areas does the project have the least achievements and how to overcome these in future interventions?

Effectiveness of management arrangement: Has the project received effective support from national partners? Does the project team receive adequate political, technical, and administrative support from national partners, Project Steering Committee, and other relevant implementing partners? Is the project governance effective with clear roles and responsibilities defined? Did the project receive effective support from the community? Was the selection of beneficiaries participatory?

Impact orientation and sustainability: How far is the project making sustainable contribution to broader and longer-term development impact? What is the impact on different communities such as women, youth and IDPs? Are national partners committed to continuation of the project work and what further support they would need? Can the project approach be replicable and scaled up by national partners and other actors? What are the support requirements for overtime replication and scaling up of project strategy by national partners? How to best further consolidate project achievements beyond the project life time?

Field Visits:

- Field visits to selected project sites (to be determined later) but not less than 5 days.
- Interviews/Discussions
- Discussions with the ministers & relevant officials of the government, in particular the Secretary of State for Vocational Training and Employment, Ministry Infrastructure and Ministry of Agriculture and Fisheries
- Discussions with District Administrators and local authorities (chefes de Sucos and Aldeias).
- Discussion with programme beneficiaries and non-beneficiaries.
- Discussion with UNDP and ILO staff, including project team members.
- Meeting with Donor

V. IMPLEMENTATION ARRANGEMENTS, DURATION OF THE ASSIGNMENT & FINAL REPORT

The review and assessment team shall be working under the overall supervision of the Head of Poverty Reduction and Environment Unit, according to the following timeframe:

- Desk review, field visits, interviews: 9 days (Sept 1-9)
- Drafting evaluation report and debriefing and preparation of final report: 5 days (Sept. 10-14)
- Presentation of the final report: 1 day (15 Sept.)

The final Draft Report should be ready by the end of the 2nd week of consultancy. During the course of the second week, consultations with UNDP and ILO should take place for any feedback on initial drafts. Final payment will be

made only on the completion of the above report. The assignment is scheduled to start on September 1, 2007 lasting for 15 days including report writing.

VI. EVALUATION TEAM AND PROFESSIONAL BACKGROUND

The documentation and logistical-related support, including field visits will be facilitated by UNDP AND ILO Project team. The details of the required background are given below:

Composition, Qualification & Experience of Evaluation Team

The review and assessment team shall consist of 2 persons, one international consultant who will act as the team leader and a mission member (national consultant).

The general areas of expertise for both consultants are: 1) knowledge of results based management and evaluation, and 2) in-depth knowledge of the outcome being evaluated. More specific requirements are outlined below:

International Consultant - Team Leader:

1. An engineer with experience in community development.
2. Substantive experience (preferably 10 years) in carrying out monitoring and evaluation of area development projects in Asian Region.
3. In depth knowledge of various project evaluation/monitoring tools.
4. Should have been involved in terminal evaluation of projects with International Agencies, preferably with the UN.
5. Should have had experience relating to Community Development type of projects.
6. Should have minimum a Master's Degree in Development type of projects.

National Mission Member:

1. Substantive experience (preferably 5 years) in development projects or related field, especially in the Asian Region.
2. In depth knowledge of various project evaluation/monitoring tools.
3. Should have been involved in evaluating/monitoring of projects with International Agencies, preferably within the UN.
4. Should have had some experience relating to Community Development type of projects.
5. Should have minimum a Master's Degree in Development or its related studies.

VII. PROPOSED CONTENT OF THE EVALUTION REPORT

1. Introduction
2. Executive summary
3. Description of the scope of the project
4. Project Relevance , Effectiveness , efficiency , impact and sustainability ,
5. Project's achievements
6. Project exit/follow-up strategies/options
7. Lessons learnt
8. Conclusions and recommendations

Annex 2: Time Schedule Evaluation Mission

Sept. 6 Thu	Dep. Amsterdam
Sept. 8 Sat	Arrival Dili Briefing Teresa Jamero, Programme officer, UNDP Study Key Documents
Sept. 9 Sun	Study Key Documents
Sept.10 Mon	Introductions, administration, security Mr. Guglielmo Colombo, EC Representative Office in Timor-Leste Project Workshop ILO - Meeting with international engineers Fernando Encarnação, ILO Coordinator of the Serbisu Ba Dame Project
Sept.11 Tues	Project Workshop ILO National Engineers International Engineers Focus group discussion with national project staff Meeting with Sec.of State for Vocational Training and Employment Mr. Benedito Freitas Dep. Dir. of DESD, Mr Paulo Alves Closing ceremony of project workshop
Sept.12 Wed	Field visit Oecussi with Ruth Jorge, UNDP Programme Officer National Engineer Mr. Cancio National project officer Mr. Agustu Visit project locations Oecussi bairo Netenoke Interviews with beneficiaries, focus group discussions Interviews with non-beneficiaries Chefe de Suku Marcolino Chefe de Aldeias Ernestu Nono Chefe de Bairo Cipriano Ove
Sept.13 Thu	Visit project location Oecussi desa Bobokasi Francesco Marquez D.A. Dep. Secr. of State, Dept for Vocational Training and Employment
Sept.14 Fri	Cancio, National Engineer Departure for Dili Security Meeting UNMIT
Sept.15 Sat	Study project documentation
Sept.16 Sun	Study project documentation, Report writing
Sept.17 Mon	Field visit Maliana / Bobonaro with Fernando Encarnação, ILO Coordinator of the Serbisu Ba Dame Project, and Ruth Jorge, UNDP Visit project locations Bobonaro Visit road rehabilitation and maintenance, visit new road and bridge Interviews with national staff National engineer Mr. Januari, National staff Ms. Ligia National staff Ms. Flora

	<p>Interviews with beneficiaries</p> <p>Focus group discussion with beneficiaries</p> <p>Interviews with non-beneficiaries</p> <p>Chefe de suku</p> <p>Meeting of President Ramos Horta with local authorities, Maliana</p>
Sept.18 Tues	<p>Meeting with CDO</p> <p>Meeting with Ministry of Labour and Community Reinsertion – MLCR, Mr. Herminio Moniz, Ms. Eugenia Moniz, Mr. Domingus Mendauz</p> <p>Lunch with national staff</p> <p>Meeting with beneficiaries of ILO credit project through Stage at local market- female shopkeepers, informal sector</p> <p>Group discussion with Kelompok '99, Fokupers, organisation of 50 widows, beneficiaries of credit project ILO</p> <p>Departure for Dili</p>
Sept.19 Wed	<p>Report writing</p> <p>Field visit Liquiça district, Qassait, Ulmera Suco</p> <p>Meet Cipriano, Technical Engineer and Eldina; Jorge, Field officer,</p> <p>Meet vice DA Maria de Jesus Carvalho</p> <p>Meet Chefe de suku Lau Hata, José dos Santos</p> <p>Meet beneficiaries (men, women), meet chefe de aldeia</p> <p>Back to Dili</p> <p>Nick Beresford, Dep. Country Director (Operations) UNDP</p>
Sept.20 Thu	<p>Report writing</p> <p>Meet Pradeep V. Sharma, Senior Ass. Resident Representative, Poverty Reduction, Recovery and Environment Unit</p>
Sept.21 Fri	<p>Meet Finn Reske-Nielsen, UN Resident Coord., UN Humanit. Coord., UNDP Resident Representative</p> <p>Report writing</p> <p>Mr. José Assalino, Chief Technical Adviser & Liaison Officer, ILO</p>
Sept.22 Sat	free
Sept.23 Sun	Report writing
Sept.24 Mon	<p>Report Writing</p> <p>Project Staff Oecusse</p>
Sept.25 Tue	<p>Report Writing</p> <p>Fernando Encarnação, ILO Coordinator of the Serbisu Ba Dame Project</p>
Sept.26 Wed	<p>Debriefing UNDP and ILO, Mr. José Assalino, Chief Technical Adviser & Liaison Officer, ILO</p> <p>Fernando Encarnação, ILO Coordinator of the Serbisu Ba Dame Project, Sec.of State for Vocational Training and Employment, Ruth Jorge, UNDP</p> <p>Report Writing</p> <p>EU Mr. Guglielmo Colombo, EC Representative Office in Timor-Leste, with Mr. José Assalino, Chief Technical Adviser & Liaison Officer, ILO, and Fernando Encarnação, ILO Coordinator of the Serbisu Ba Dame Project, and Ruth Jorge, UNDP</p>
Sept.27 Thu	Report Writing
Sept.28 Fri	Report Writing

Annex 3: List of literature and documents consulted

Anderson, Mary B: Do No Harm: How Aid Can Support Peace - or War. Boulder, Lynne Rienner Publishers, 1999

Anderson, Mary B. (ed.): Options for Aid in Conflict: Lessons from Field Experience, Boulder, 2000.

Binnendijk, Annette: RBM in the development cooperation agencies: A review of experience. Evaluation Capacity Development in Asia. UNDP/NCSTE/WB, 2000,
http://intra.undp.org/eo/documents/evaluation_cap_dev_china.pdf

Collaborative for Development Action, <http://www.cdainc.com/lcp/index.php>

Do No Harm / Local Capacities for Peace Project, Conflict Sensitive Approaches to Development, Humanitarian Assistance and Peace Building. Tools for Peace and Conflict Impact assessment.
http://conflictsensitivity.org/resource_pack/8_do_no_harm_local_capacities_for_peace_project_323.html

European Commission, Ministerio do Trabalho e da Reinsercao Comunitaria Timor-Leste, UNDP, ILO: Technical Manual, Labour based road construction method, Project "Work for Peace", Dili, 2007

European Commission, Ministerio do Trabalho e da Reinsercao Comunitaria Timor-Leste, UNDP, ILO: Procedures Manual, Labour based road construction method, Project "Work for Peace", Dili, 2007

European Commission: Evaluation Guidelines.
http://ec.europa.eu/europeaid/evaluation/methodology/guidelines/gui_en.htm

Government of Timor-Leste, Planning Commission: Timor-Leste. National Development Plan. Dili, 2002.

Government of Timor-Leste: Central Government Finances, FY 2005/2006, quoted in Asian Development Bank, presentation, internal document, n.d. (see annex)

International Labour Organisation: Decent work matters in crisis. ILO response to crisis challenges. ILO, InFocus Programme on Crisis Response and Reconstruction, Recovery and Reconstruction Department, Geneva, 2003

Maitreyi Bordia Das: The Labour Market Impact of minimum wage policy: The case of Timor-Leste in comparative perspective. World Bank, July 2004

Ministry of Transport and Communication, Ministry of Public Works, Timor-Leste: Transport. Priorities and Proposed Sector Investment Program. Dili, April, 2006. Published with the assistance of the UNDP.

Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, Timor-Leste: Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries. Priorities and Proposed Sector Investment Program. Dili, April, 2006. Published with the assistance of the UNDP.

Ministry of Labour and Community Reinsertion, International Labour Organization: YEP. Youth Employment Promotion, Programme Outline, 2007. Dili, 2007.

Ministry of Labour and Community Reinsertion, International Labour Organization,
YES: Youth Employment Study. Timor-Leste 2007. Dili, 2007

OECD/DAC: Principles for Evaluation of Development Assistance, 1991,
<http://www.oecd.org/dac/Evaluation/pdf/eval.pdf>

OECD/DAC. Review of the DAC Principles for Evaluation of Development Assistance, 1998,
<http://www.oecd.org/dac/Evaluation/pdf/eval.pdf>

OECD/DAC Evaluation Criteria, <http://www.oecd.org/dac/Evaluation/htm/evalcrit.htm>

OECD/Public Management Service, Improving Evaluation Practices: Best Practice Guidelines for Evaluation and Background Paper. 1999, <http://www.oecd.org/puma>

Roche, Chris: Impact Assessment for Development Agencies. Learning to Value Change. Oxford, OXFAM, 2000

Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation, External Evaluation: Are we doing the right things? Are we doing things right? June 2000

Timor-Leste 2005: Millennium Development Goals. Where are we now? Dili, GTL, 2005

UNDP: Human Development Report 2006, Timor-Leste: The Path Out of Poverty. Integrated Rural Development. Dili, 2006.

UNDP: Handbook on Monitoring and Evaluation for Results, UNDP Evaluation Office, New York, 2002

UNDP: Serbisu Ba Dame (Work for Peace) Project, Field Visit Report, Liquiça District, September 2007, prepared by T.Jamero

UNDP: Serbisu Ba Dame (Work for Peace) Project, Field Visit Report, Oecusse District, September 2007, prepared by R.Jorge

UNDP: Serbisu Ba Dame (Work for Peace) Project, Field Visit Report, Bobonaro District, September, 2007, prepared by R.Jorge

UNDP/ILO: Implementation Report, Bobonaro/Svai district. Dili, ILO, September 2007

UNDP/ILO: Implementation Report, Oecusse district. Dili, ILO, September 2007

UNDP/ILO: Implementation Report, Liquiça/Ermera district. Dili, ILO, September 2007

UNDP/ILO: Implementation Report, Baucau/Manaturo district. Dili, ILO, September 2007

UNDP/ILO: Implementation Report, Viqueque/Lautem district. Dili, ILO, September 2007

UNDP/ILO: Implementation Report, Dili/Aileu district. Dili, ILO, September 2007

UNDP/ILO: Implementation Report, Manufahi district. Dili, ILO, September 2007

UNEG, United Nations Evaluation Group: Standards for Evaluation in the UN System, April 2005. <http://www.uneval.org/indexAction.cfm?module=Library&action=GetFile&DocumentAttachmentID=1496>

UNEG, United Nations Evaluation Group: Norms for Evaluation in the UN System, April 2005. <http://www.uneval.org/indexAction.cfm?module=Library&action=GetFile&DocumentAttachmentID=1491>

Wallace, Marshal: Learning from communities that prevent conflict, in: Global Future, first quarter 2005.

World Bank: Timor-Leste Education since Independence from Reconstruction to Sustainable Development, Human Development Sector Unit East Asia & Pacific Region, December 2004

Annex 4: Serbisu Ba Dame Presence list



Serbisu Ba Dame

Lista Traballador Sira

Distritu Dili
SubDistritu Metinaro
Suku 1
Comesa
Deskrisau MANUTENSAUN BA ESTRADA RURAL HO DISTANCIA 2



Aktividade: DILSD09C RURAL ROAD REHABILITATION

Naran Koompletu Data Moris Loron 1 Dader Loron 1 lokraik Loron 2 Dader Loron 2 lokraik Loron 3 Dader Loron 3 lokraik Loron 4 Dader Loron 4 lokraik Loron 5 Dader Loron 5 lokraik Total Loron

Aldeia: 01

EMILIANO CARDOSO

1

24/12/1979

Etul Etul Etul Etul Etul Etul Etul Etul Etul Etul

5

Aldeia: BENUNUK

JOAQUIM KINSALE

2

02/05/1979

[Fingerprint] [Fingerprint] [Fingerprint] [Fingerprint] [Fingerprint] [Fingerprint] [Fingerprint] [Fingerprint] [Fingerprint] [Fingerprint]

5

FRANCISCO DA SILVA

3

03/02/1987

[Signature] [Signature] [Signature] [Signature] [Signature] [Signature] [Signature] [Signature] [Signature] [Signature]

JACINTO GOMES

4

01/06/1982

Cu Cu Cu Cu Cu Cu Cu Cu Cu Cu

5

BERNADO PAUL

5

13/08/1986

Bnt Bnt Bnt Bnt Bnt Bnt Bnt Bnt Bnt Bnt

5

JOAO FARIA

6

12/03/1986

H H H H H H H H H H

5

ALEXANDRINO GUSMAO

7

19/02/1986

[Fingerprint] [Fingerprint] [Fingerprint] [Fingerprint] [Fingerprint] [Fingerprint] [Fingerprint] [Fingerprint] [Fingerprint] [Fingerprint]

5

DOMINGOS MENDOCNA

8

16/10/1986

Degl Degl Degl Degl Degl Degl Degl Degl Degl Degl

5

HERCOLANO DECO

9

11/09/1983

Hamb Hamb Hamb Hamb Hamb Hamb Hamb Hamb Hamb Hamb

5

SIMAO GORES

10

03/08/1988

Sing Sing Sing Sing Sing Sing Sing Sing Sing Sing

5

DOMINGOS MENDONCA

11

11/10/1986

[Signature] [Signature] [Signature] [Signature] [Signature] [Signature] [Signature] [Signature] [Signature] [Signature]

5

DOMINGOS SOARES TETI

12

27/06/1987

Dnt Dnt Dnt Dnt Dnt Dnt Dnt Dnt Dnt Dnt

5

GLEMENTE MENDONCA

13

01/03/1981

bl bl bl bl bl bl bl bl bl bl

5

15/08/2007 9:01:28 AM

User evodio

Naran Supervisor

Page 1 of 8

Mano Baptista

Titlu

Dist 7-6

Loron

Assinatura

[Signature]

Annex 5: Serbisu Ba Dame Payment receipt



Serbisu Ba Dame

Lista Pagamentu

Aktividade: OECSD06D

RURAL ROAD REHABILITATION

Distritu Oecusse
SubDistritu Pante makassar
Suku Bobocasae
Comesa
Deskrisau no Rural Nian Volumen mak ,0.625
Responsavel Rejistu OsCAR DO ROSA



Naran Koompletu	Data Moris	Distritu	SubDistritu	Suku	Aldeia:	DataRejistu:	Loron Serbisu	Salariu Loron	Salariu Total	Assina
Aldeia BIHALA										
JULIANA OQUI 61	2/07/1986	Oecuss	Pante mak	Boboca	BIHAL	28/06/2007	15	2	\$30.00	
JULIO NUNES 62	4/08/1982	Oecuss	Pante mak	Boboca	BIHAL	28/06/2007	15	2	\$30.00	
JUVITA ABI 63	7/08/1985	Oecuss	Pante mak	Boboca	BIHAL	28/06/2007	15	2	\$30.00	
LASARU SALU 64	26/12/1984	Oecuss	Pante mak	Boboca	BIHAL	28/06/2007	15	2	\$30.00	
LORENCO SIQUEIRA 65	27/03/1982	Oecuss	Pante mak	Boboca	BIHAL	28/06/2007	15	2	\$30.00	
LORENSU NENO 66	5/12/1984	Oecuss	Pante mak	Boboca	BIHAL	28/06/2007	15	2	\$30.00	
LORENSU A'U 67	15/06/1987	Oecuss	Pante mak	Boboca	BIHAL	28/06/2007	15	2	\$30.00	
LUSIA TANAET 68	7/03/1985	Oecuss	Pante mak	Boboca	BIHAL	28/06/2007	15	2	\$30.00	
MADALENA DA CONCEICA 69	28/05/1984	Oecuss	Pante mak	Boboca	BIHAL	28/06/2007	15	2	\$30.00	
MARIA IMELDA CUSI 70	8/03/1986	Oecuss	Pante mak	Boboca	BIHAL	28/06/2007	15	2	\$30.00	
MARIA SUNA 71	17/03/1983	Oecuss	Pante mak	Boboca	BIHAL	28/06/2007	15	2	\$30.00	
MARIA QENAT 72	15/09/1984	Oecuss	Pante mak	Boboca	BIHAL	28/06/2007	15	2	\$30.00	

18/08/2007 10:09:42 AM
User Cisela

Naran Supervisor
Page 6 of 9

KANSIL KUNTA

Titlu

END. DISTRICTO

Loron

Assinatura

05/09/2007

Annex 6: Government of Timor-Leste: Central Government Finances, FY 2005/2006

Timor-Leste: Finances of Central Government							
(In millions of U.S. dollars, or otherwise noted)							
	FY 03/04	FY 04/05	FY2005/06		FY2006/07		Q1-Q3 % change FY07/ FY06
			Q1-Q3	Year	Sup. Bud.	Q1-Q3	
Total revenue and grants	111.1	344.7	373.7	523.9	897.1	719.7	92.6
Domestic revenue	29.2	36.8	38.8	33.8	31.1	27.8	-3.4
Oil/gas revenue	41.4	265.5	338.8	481.8	841.5	674.3	99.0
Revenue auton. agencies	5.7	8.1	5.8	7.3	8.9	5.2	
Grants	34.8	34.2	0.3	1.0	15.6	12.4	-4,378.3
<i>Current year expenditure on commitment basis</i>							
Expenditure	73.5	80.7	95.2	126.4	328.6	214.2	125.1
Recurrent expenditure	63.2	68.2	58.3	84.2	198.9	119.3	104.6
Wages and salaries	24.2	25.6	19.5	26.3	38.4	24.8	27.2
Goods and services	39.0	42.6	38.8	57.9	131.7	82.9	113.7
Current transfers	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	28.8	11.6	n.a.
Capital expenditure	10.3	12.5	36.9	42.2	129.7	94.9	157.3
<i>Total expenditure on cash basis</i>							
Total expenditure	72.4	77.6	70.3	99.8		99.6	41.7
Expenditure from current budget	59.4	65.7	60.9	88.5		84.4	38.8
Recurrent expenditure	56.8	62.9	48.1	72.6		78.8	63.7
Wages and salaries	24.2	25.6	19.5	26.3		24.8	27.2
Goods and services	32.5	37.3	28.6	46.3		50.1	75.2
Current transfers	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		3.9	n.a.
Capital expenditure	2.6	2.8	12.8	15.9		5.7	-55.4
Expenditure from past budgets	13.0	11.9	9.5	11.3		15.2	60.3
Overall balance	38.7	267.1	303.4	424.1		620.1	104.4