Mid-Term Review Report

Gender Promotion in the Garment/Clothing Industry through Skill Development
Mid-Term Review Report:
Gender Promotion in the Garment/ Clothing Industry through Skill Development (GENPROM)

1. BACKGROUND AND SCOPE OF MID-TERM REVIEW (MTR)

1.1 Brief introduction of the GENPROM Project

The GENPROM project launched in August 2006 for 5 years, aims to reduce poverty by generating employment for women in the garment industry through training; building the capacity of the private industry to conduct research and advocate gender mainstreaming in the garment industry and to promote gender participation in the garment industry; and recording best practices and disseminating the information for up-scaling skill development initiatives in the country. The project is being implemented in Sindh and Punjab in partnership with two implementing partners, Pakistan Ready-Made Garments Manufacturers & Exporters Association (PRGMEA) in Sindh and GC University Faisalabad in Punjab.

The project has a total approved budget of USD 11.65 million. Out of this US$ 5.0 million is to come from UNDP which is in-turn supported by a pool of Gender Support Programme (GSP) cost sharing partners, namely; Department for International Development (DFID), Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC) and the Norwegian Agency for Development (NORAD). The rest of US$ 6.65 million is contribution from implementing partners and participating companies in-kind in the form of stipend to trainees, their transportation, machinery, office space and equipment.

1.2 Major Changes During Implementation

1. The Implementing Partner (IP) in Punjab was changed from Faisalabad Institute of Textile & Fashion Design (FITFD) to GC University in Faisalabad in 2008, as FITFD became a sub-campus of the GC University. During the same year, Project Management Unit (PMU) in Punjab has moved from Faisalabad to Lahore.

2. In addition to the program of training, international technical experts Kurt Salmon Associations (KSA) provided consulting guidelines to Satellite Training Units (STUs) in one of four areas in accordance with the company’s choice; industrial engineering, cutting room management, sewing room management, and quality control/ assurance. In response to high demand from the industry, business process mapping will be added as the fifth consulting guidelines. Moreover, guidelines on merchandising will be provided additionally, if requested by STUs. Revised MT training module will have machinery maintenance (mechanics) as well.

3. Since the implementation of the GEN-PROM, PMU in Punjab has been charging STUs Rs. 300,000 per training module. In Sindh, no fees were charged to STUs during the first round of the training. From the second to fourth rounds, Rs. 100,000 was charged. Starting from this year, Rs. 300,000 will be charged to the STUs per training module. This fund has been utilized to pay the salaries of Programme Coordinators (PCs) at IP institutions.

4. The project was started with a limited period training contract granted to KSA on a single source basis that has been completed. For the remaining period of the program, UNDP has invited bids from

---

1 Initially, Faisalabad Institute of Textile & Fashion Design (FITFD).
interested consultants in an international tender to provide training in the GENPROM program. KSA-
Technopak India won the tender in competitive bidding and is now in process of finalizing the contract.

1.3 Scope, Methodology and Limitations of MTR

5. The project document of the GEN-PROM called for a mid-term review (MTR). The present MTR was commissioned to evaluate the success of the project made so far, identify issues, and recommend course corrections. The GEN-PROM provided preliminary Terms of Reference (TORs) for the review mission in February 2009. The final version of the TORs is reproduced in Annex I.

6. Throughout the MTR process, UNDP and the two mission members have maintained the independence of the review. The mission members of this MTR, who have had no prior involvement in the GEN-PROM project, are Dr. Zubair Khan, (mission leader) an independent consultant based in Islamabad, and Ms. Yumiko Yamamoto, who is working with UNDP Asia-Pacific Regional Centre Colombo office.

7. The MTR was based on periodic GEN-PROM progress reports, various statistics and documents provided to the mission by PMUs, and discussions held with donor partners, PMU staff, PCs, participating firms, implementing partners, garment industry managers and MTs and other stakeholders. The field mission to Lahore, Faisalabad, and Karachi was undertaken between February 28 and March 7, 2009. The list of meetings held during the mission is listed in Annex II.

8. The preliminary findings from the pre-mission documentation review and field mission were discussed with the UNDP Islamabad staff and Joint Secretary Mr. Mohammed Asif, Economic Affairs Division on 11 March 2009. An Aide Memoire was presented to the project partners and stakeholders on 18 March 2009 to incorporate their feedback in the final MTR Report. The participants of the workshop are listed in Annex III.

2. ASSESSMENT OF GEN-PROM

9. In accordance with the TORs, project performance has been assessed here using five criteria: relevance of the objectives, effectiveness and impact, efficiency, followed by the two over-arching issues of sustainability and network/ linkages. The findings are summarized below.

2.1 Relevance of the Goal and Objectives of GEN-PROM

10. In Pakistan, the “poorer the household, the higher is the likelihood of its dependence on female labor. This is further corroborated by evidence on greater impoverishment in households relying on women’s productive labor, due to the low economic value of female labor (United Nations Pakistan 2003).” Lower educational attainment and restricted mobility inhibit women’s ability to compete for access to training and jobs on an equal footing with men. In the garment industry, which is the largest source of industrial employment in the country, women account for less than a quarter of the workforce in contrast to some other garment producing countries where women form the bulk of the workforce. GEN-PROM is well focused on poor women and the garment industry, the main intended beneficiaries of the project.

11. The project is imparting a relevant skill successfully to poor women, a skill that is in demand in the garment industry, resulting in the employment of women and providing them income. These
women come from impoverished households, some in the immediate neighborhood of participating factories, others from all over the city where the project is located. Outputs of the GEN-PROM contribute to the country’s decent employment and poverty alleviation strategy as well as promotion of gender equality

12. The garment industry is another intended beneficiary of the project. In Pakistan’s garment industry, lack of skilled labor is the weakest link and the skills gap is much more apparent and distinct in women labor force compared to men (UNDP Pakistan 2006: 8-9). Even at the large garment firms, about one-third of men and more than half of women workers have never received training before taking the job (Base Line Survey 2008). The industry is benefitting from the supply of well-trained labor that will contribute towards reducing shortages of skilled labor at a time of intensified competition after the expiry of the textiles and clothing quota system and recent economic contraction in international markets. Provision of skilled workers not only increases the productivity of the firms but also allow them to produce and export diversified products including high-end garments.

13. The successfully trained female worker coming out of the GEN-PROM program has about 60-70 percent of the productivity of the skilled labor already working with the factories and will require some more months before she can be at the same level as the latter. Nevertheless, the GEN-PROM trainee has been scientifically trained through a curriculum, according to the factory management, that would help build further skills more easily. The alternative source of skilled or semi-skilled worker currently comes from the labor market, either attracted from another factory or ‘learning by doing’ at a considerable cost to the factory.

14. The design of the program, however, benefits mostly large firms, that have good short-term business prospects and pay salary (in contrast to the piece-rate wages). As the needs of the garment industry for skilled labor are far in excess of the targets of GEN-PROM, some large firms consider the program too small to meet their needs significantly. Other also feel that consulting guidelines, one of the training benefits, cannot meet the needs of firms, unless these are supported with ‘in depth’ guidance and implementation. On the other hand, small and medium firms do not have the funds, machines, space and business prospects to participate in the GEN-PROM program.

15. Majority of the beneficiaries are women but those who pass the selection tests have basic education and endowed with natural dexterity. A large proportion of marginalized women remain in the clasp of poverty. Due to the scale of the project, the impact of the project is limited in comparison to the needs of impoverished women nationwide or in the cities where GEN-PROM is operating.

16. While the project design is relevant to the intended objectives of the project, the scale of the project is small compared to the needs of the millions of women engulfed in poverty and is small in relation to the need for skilled labor across the industry.

---

2 See United Nations Pakistan (2003, 2009). GEN-PROM outputs contribute to the outcome 1 in the UNDAF (2003-2008) Area of Cooperation II (Contribute to employment and income generation, with special emphasis on women, the disadvantaged and youth/adolescents) and One UN JP component 2: Decent Employment and Poverty Alleviation among others.
2.2 Effectiveness in Achieving Objectives and Impact

Positive Impact on workers

17. The first objective of GEN-PROM is to generate employment for women in the garment industry through training. Since the first training in May 2007, 4 rounds of training (3 modules and third module extension) were completed in 31 STUs (15 STUs3 in Punjab and 16 in Sindh). As of the end of the 4th round of training program, the GEN-PROM successfully trained 12 Program Coordinators (PCs), 266 Master Trainers (MTs)4 and 1,400 workers, of which 89 percent or 1,252 trainees are women (Table 1). The training program continues at STUs under the supervision of MTs for additional rounds of training. As a result, nearly 2,500 additional workers, of which 72 percent women, have received training and retraining in the garment factories (Table 1).

18. During training, women earn Rs. 3,000-4,600 a month although some firms pay the minimum wage of Rs. 6,000 as they are on payroll from the Day One of the training. After the completion of the training, all earn Rs. 6,000 or more depends on their performance. GEN-PROM training program requests the participating STUs to provide transportation to the trainees/employees to overcome women’s mobility issues. This also ensures the safety of the commuting environment and women reaching home before dark.

Table 1. Summary of the number of operators trained in GEN-PROM, 2007-2008

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Province</th>
<th>Total operators trained directly by GEN-PROM</th>
<th>Of which, women operators</th>
<th>Total operators trained by firms after GEN-PROM</th>
<th>Of which, women operators</th>
<th>Total operators trained</th>
<th>Of which, women operators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Punjab</td>
<td>707 Persons</td>
<td>667 Persons</td>
<td>94 %</td>
<td>1,852 Persons</td>
<td>1,171 Persons</td>
<td>63 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sindh</td>
<td>693 Persons</td>
<td>585 Persons</td>
<td>84 %</td>
<td>600 Persons</td>
<td>588 Persons</td>
<td>98 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1,400 Persons</td>
<td>1,252 Persons</td>
<td>89 %</td>
<td>2,452 Persons</td>
<td>1,759 Persons</td>
<td>72 %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

19. Results of trainee survey show a significant positive impact of the training on operator’s household income and their standard of living5. Nearly 20 percent of the trainees provide the first and only income to the household. The rest provide the secondary income to the family. About a quarter of the operators responded their family income rose by more than 45 percent because of additional income she brings. Another quarter of them said that their family income increased by 30-45 percent. One-third of them observed their family income rose by 15-30 percent. More than 80 percent of the operators now enjoy improved standard of living. More than three-quarters of the operators reported an increase in the family saving. Trainee survey also reveals that acquiring skills and contributing to the family income enhanced their self-esteem and confidence at work. Such empowerment allows women to bargain better for better work conditions and better pay in competitive private industry (Condor et al. 2008). GSP multi-donor review report recognized GEN-PROM as a successful case of providing the “options for women to start with one skill and then move to multiple production lines, thus increasing their skills and their social standing in the open, competitive labor market (p. 51).”

---

3 Technical Education & Vocational Training Authority (TEVTA) is counted as one STU.
4 The figure includes MTs trained for the training institutes such as SMEDA and PRGTII.
5 See GEN-PROM Pakistan (forthcoming).
Positive Impact on the participating firms and industry

20. Results of supervisor survey\(^6\) endorse the high quality of GEN-PROM training program. Eighty percent of the supervisor in the participating firms treat the GEN-PROM STU as Center of Excellence while the rest consider it same as other department. Ninety-five percent of supervisors find that improvement in the performance of the GEN-PROM trained workers has led to better quality in production, and nearly 70 percent of them agreed that it led to an increase in productivity. More than 70 percent of supervisors responded that the performance of the GEN-PROM trained operators right after the completion of the training is same or exceeding average worker with respect to production and quality.

21. Because of good performance of the GEN-PROM trained operators, a number of participating firms now recruit more women as operators and train them with GEN-PROM methods. Previously, women, when present, concentrated in low skill units such as finishing and packing. In some STUs, women’s share in stitching unit has increased from 0 to 20 percent after the completion of GEN-PROM training, and the share keeps rising as the number of training is multiplied. In other STUs, 50-60 percent of the production line is now run by women.

22. Participating STUs also benefit from skilled MTs and consulting services that they receive during training module. Some firms promoted MTs to the middle management. The former project manager in Karachi was hired by the firms as a senior manager. Enhancing productivity of labor-intensive industry like garments is crucial to overcome the challenges imposed by global competition and increase the production, thus employment. GENPROM provided consulting guidelines in one of 4 areas in accordance with the company’s choice, industrial engineering, cutting room management, sewing room management, and quality control/ assurance. In response to demand from the industry, GEN-PROM now provides guidelines in 3 additional areas; merchandising, business process mapping, and machinery maintenance (mechanics). Overall, the participating STUs found the guideline was useful for improving the productivity and production management.

23. An important characteristic of the GEN-PROM program is to request the participating STUs to implement gender-sensitive corporate policies and to advocate gender mainstreaming at work. One of the policies is to apply salary-based compensation system to trainees/employees. The system also provides them social safety nets such as social security and medical insurance that the piece-rate workers are not entitled to. Women who face restricted mobility in the night as well as a responsibility in domestic care work prefer salary compensation system, which guarantees a decent pay for working during daytime\(^7\).

24. Another policy is to provide pick up/ drop off services to women trainees and employees but the participating factories now extend the service to all workers. Providing transportation service means extra costs to the firms but supervisors found the positive effect; the pick-up services ensure all workers come to work on time and such services attract skilled women workers. Other requirements include separate bathrooms, rest area, and praying areas for women and men. The success of the GEN-PROM

---

\(^6\) See GEN-PROM Pakistan (forthcoming).

\(^7\) Men tend to prefer the piece-rate system as they have autonomy over their working hours. Switching jobs is relatively easy for men as well.
displays that Pakistani garment industry is providing not just a job but a decent job to women in contrast to ‘sweatshop’ conditions practiced in competing countries.

25. Project management units so far produced and disseminated women’s industrial rights posters (3 types) and GEN-PROM brochures at the participating STUs and other project partners. Such advocacy materials help to enhance gender awareness as well as understanding of the GEN-PROM program in the garment factories. A comparison between the factories implemented GEN-PROM training program (GEN-PROM factories, hereafter) and those, which have not (non-GEN-PROM factories, hereafter), endorses the success of the program towards gender equality in the industry. Owners, administrative officers and human resource managers in GEN-PROM factories show much more positive attitudes towards working women and higher likelihood of hiring women than those in non-GEN-PROM factories. The proportion of men and women workers who agree on equal pay for comparable jobs regardless the sex of workers is much higher in GEN-PROM factories, compared to non-GEN-PROM factories.

26. GEN-PROM approach towards knowledge transfer to MTs is also contributing to capacity development and quality assurance of national training institutes regarding garment-related programs. So far, 20 MTs were trained for the Technical Education & Vocational Training Authority (TEVTA), Small and Medium Enterprises Development Authority (SMEDA), Pakistan Readymade Garments Technical Training Institute (PRGTII). It is also noted that Ministry of Textiles’ Stitching Machine Operator Training (SMOT) program now uses GEN-PROM trained MTs. Those certified courses also contribute to generate thousands of trainees to the industry each year.

**Performance of the project in respect to the Project Document and Multi-year funding framework**

27. The Project document plans to implement the training at 24 STUs (Annexure A). During the first two years of the program implementation, the GEN-PROM exceeded the goal by conducting training at 31 STUs. Approximately 30,000 persons were expected to receive sewing machine operation training over the course of five years. So far, 3,852 persons trained directly and indirectly through GEN-PROM training program (Table 1). One factor led to a low number of trainees is a rise in trainees’ salary. In the project document, monthly stipend per trainee was estimated as Rs. 2,500. Due to inflation caused by recent food and fuel price hikes as well as the minimum wage hike, the monthly salary paid to trainees increased to Rs. 4,600-6,000. It is also noted that the firms are likely to start training with a small group for trial. A positive prospect, however, is that the number of operators trained or retrained by firms is rising as MTs repeat the training module in respective firms.

28. Overall, the project is in right direction towards the national goals of increased employment and income generation opportunities for the poor, economic empowerment of the poor, reducing vulnerability of the poor to economic and other shocks, with special emphasis on women (United Nations Pakistan 2003: 49). The outputs of the projects also contribute to the achievement of the One UN Programme goals of creating enabled environment for enhanced income and employment

---

8 This paragraph is based on the analysis provided by Professor Ehsan UI Haq, the author of the baseline study conducted as part of the GEN-PROM activity.
9 Major difference between GEN-PROM and certified courses is that the trainees under the GEN-PROM are on payroll of the STUs from Day One of the training; in other words, trainees receive both job and skill training at the same time. For certified courses, job after the training is not guaranteed. For example, placement rate of SMOT trainees is 71 percent (Textile Commissioner Organization, “Zone wise consolidated statement of SMOT Phase I and II.”)
generation opportunities, developing employable skills developed, and increasing opportunities for decent work (United Nations Pakistan 2009: 17-18).

### 2.3 Efficiency

29. Project use of funds is reported periodically and is being audited. Most of the program components are on schedule and broadly within budget. As per private sector’s contribution, initial investment made to the GEN-PROM, which includes the training of PCs, MTs and operators as well as business guidelines, will be paid off as the firm repeats the training modules after GEN-PROM moves on. In other words, the efficiency of achieving the training objective will improve as the training program continues at STUs after the GEN-PROM concludes.

30. As per the timeline and quality of reporting, the GEN-PROM produced the progress report of the training after the completion of each round. These reports were released in timely manner and discussed in national workshops. Annual review reports produced by PMUs and annual project steering committee meetings are utilized well to share good practices among the stakeholders, raise key problems and issues regarding the delivery of the projects, and recommend course corrections. As discussed in 1.2, a number of changes or new initiatives are made to the project design and implementation to make the delivery of the projects in more efficient and effective manner.

31. In some activities, however, the GEN-PROM projects have been experiencing implementation delays. Failure of recruitment of some PMU posts, particularly absence of National Project Manager for eight months in 2008 in Sindh, Research Officers and Administrative and Finance Officer or Assistant in both PMUs, is one of the main reasons for delayed implementation of activities, particularly the ones under GEN-PROM Research and Advocacy Unit (GRAU). Examples of such activities are establishment of placement unit (Activity 1.3), production of research papers on gender advocacy in bilateral negotiations (Activity 2.2), and production of social audit and compliance study (Activity 2.3). These posts need to be filled as soon as possible. Despite of shortage of staffs, PMU staffs have been undertaken: production and dissemination of GENPROM brochure; GENPROM women rights posters (3 types); reports on training\(^{10}\); initial development of the GENPROM project website featuring the placement board; the preparation for the baseline survey and study; and TORs for a research paper on gender mainstreaming in bilateral trade negotiations drafted.

32. Unavailability of the KSA consultants is another factor that affects implementation delays as well as the effectiveness of the training program. The main reason for their unavailability during the first two years was the visa problems; the KSA consultants had to fly back to India to get a new visa every other week (GEN-PROM Sindh 2007). During the MTR mission, the KSA consultants were also absent, as the contract renewal process has been delayed.

33. Training manuals, business guidelines, job application form, questionnaires, contract, test materials, and useful information to trainees (e.g., information on placement unit) need to be translated into Urdu and modified into the local context, as English competence is not the requirement for the operator’s job. This also applies to any signs in the STUs regarding safety information and compliance guidelines.

---

\(^{10}\) Two reports were published. The third one is forthcoming.
34. The project document asserts that implementation of activities in the work plan shall be carried out through two Implementing Partner (IPs), and IPs will house the respective PMU. National Project Directors (NPDs) were selected from the IP organizations and her/his TORs are specified in the project document. However, institutional support for promoting the program by creating awareness in the industry remains weak, particularly in 2008 after the key advocates since the project formulation left the IP or the leader’s post in the institution. As a result, responsibilities for strengthening institutions for conducting research and advocating gender mainstreaming in the garment industry are borne by PMUs, not by IP institutions. For example, good outputs of the projects are not yet enough to convince many garment units to participate. Significant efforts to disseminate good practices to the industrialists and call for participation have to be made by IP institutes for the sake of the garment industry.

2.4 Sustainability

35. There are clear indicators of sustainability of training within the STUs as reflected in the continuing training of women by participating factories with the help of MTs left behind at STUs by the GEN-PROM program. The participating factories are revealing their approval of the training program, confidence in the training capacity of MTs and relative usefulness of the woman worker by continuing the training program. In fact, more women have been trained subsequently as compare to during the GENPROM program period.

36. However, the training program of women is unlikely to spread to other factories not covered by GEN-PROM on its own. This is indicated by the fact that even GEN-PROM still has to make a hard ‘sell’ to convince factories to become STUs’ in Faisalabad, although the participating factories have expressed satisfaction with the training, there were no more factories willing to join the GEN-PROM program and the PMU has shifted to Lahore.

37. A related issue is the continuing funding and location of PCs who could potentially train MTs in freshly joining STUs to help spread the training program and thus sustain the program horizontally. Program managers should look into this aspect of the design of the program and make recommendations, although this mission feels that the training institutes or the IPs could be burdened with this important aspect of the cost the program.

38. Firms/units that adopted the training program are large ones, whose business is doing well and they are able to offer salary-compensation system. On the other hand, small- and medium enterprises (SMEs) do not have the funds to cover Rs. 300,000 services fee and stipends to trainees and cannot spare machines, space and business prospects to accept the GEN-PROM program. Through knowledge transfer to MTs, GEN-PROM already started assisting a number of training institutes (e.g., TEVTA, PRGTII) and SMOT programs, which has a potential to supply large pool of skilled operators for the benefit of garment industry at large and SMEs in particular. A proposal to set up a GEN-PROM training facility within the Export Processing Zone (EPZ) in Sindh is also expected to cater the needs of the industry. Adoption of GEN-PROM training methods at national training institutes and EPZ should be designed to benefit SMEs; for example, facilitating the on-the-job-training, thus employment, at SMEs. A significant drawback of relying on training institutes/EPZ for training is that these cannot provide the essential factory floor training without which the program would not be half as useful according to some STUs and factory management.

39. Firms experiencing resistance to the GEN-PROM training program at middle-management level and among existing workers have suspended the training during the module or after the completion.
Draft 14 July 2009

Providing re-training by using GEN-PROM modules is useful to ease the tensions between existing workers and new comers. Work environment that encourages skill development and promotion, decent work and gender equality is important for sustainability of the training program within the participating firms.

40. Industry leaders’ requirements for training are much larger than the program’s capacity. In order to enhance the understanding of the program at the top- and middle-management, the training program should:

   a. Provide not one but any number of guidelines that a firm requires; provide ‘in depth’ guidelines helping implementation in at least one area, if there are limited time/ resources;
   b. Utilize KSA consultants’ (and PCs’) expertise in business guidelines and follow-ups while Phases 1-6 of training program (training needs assessment, program design and team profile development, team selection, training of MTs, training of operators and follow-ups) can be done by PCs; and
   c. Provide trainings to the middle management.

41. GEN-PROM trained MTs are demanded by the industry. Some firms promoted MTs to the middle management. Constant supply of talented MT candidates with master’s or bachelor degree in textile, industrial engineering, commerce and other related fields are essential for sustainability of the training program and increased productivity of the industry. Many young people with higher education prefer to work in the office, not in the factory. Outreach activities (e.g., job fair, seminars on GEN-PROM activities) are needed at educational institutes such as FITFD, Textile Institute of Pakistan, and Pakistani Swedish Institute of Technology to recruit MT candidates, particularly women students. Placement of GEN-PROM, once it is activated, will be useful to attract new graduates and those with some work experiences in the industry.

42. Although employment generation for MTs in skill development is not the primary objectives of the project, their roles as supporters of the GEN-PROM as well as trainers and mentors to operators is important for the project sustainability. In order to provide incentives for MTs to stay in the industry, the participating firms need to provide a clear career development plan for the MTs upon recruitment. Providing skill-up training opportunities in various fields in management is another example of incentives. Likewise, skill-development opportunity and career development plan of PCs and PMU staffs should be provided by the IPs as an incentive to stay in the project and industry.

43. Stronger partnership with IPs is crucial for the sustainability of the program beyond the project’s lifetime. Since the program is benefiting the garment industry, garment associations such as PRGMEA and PHMA (Pakistan Hosiery Manufacturers Association) should be the primary IP in both provinces, while the services of SMEDA, GC University in Faisalabad, and others can be examined to supplement the services of the garment associations. Recently PRGMEA, PHMA, Pakistan Knitwear and Sweater Exporters Association (PAKSEA) and Pakistan Cotton Fashion Apparels Manufacturers and Exporters Association (PCFA) formed Pakistan Apparel Forum, and the Forum can be one of the options to be the primary IP.

44. Ideally, there should be 4 PMUs, one each for each garment industry cluster at Karachi, Faisalabad, Lahore and Sialkot. Business models that will be able to finance PCs’ salaries and other project needs and to develop consulting services and project implementation mechanism that meet the demands of the industry can be explored in next two years to provide a practical exit plan for the UNDP
project. In order to receive the further support from the garment associations, it would be helpful to conduct the surveys among the firms participated in the GEN-PROM training program to assess the economic impacts of the program on productivity of the firms.

2.5 Network/linkages

45. Constant efforts to incorporate the needs and demands of the stakeholders are undertaken by PMU staffs and UNDP Pakistan as discussed in 1.2. Collaboration between Ministry of Textiles and GEN-PROM in the context of SMOT program has not materialized yet. PMUs established the partnership with TEVTA, PRGTII, and SMEDA on training of MTs, and the similar arrangement will be discussed with EPZ and NAVTEC. Overlap with the ILO funded training at PRGTII was pointed out. UNIDO might be able to provide financial and technical support to SMEs. Harmonization of the activities among the UN agencies is recommended under the One UN initiative.

46. Production of social audit study and bilateral negotiations strategy papers are listed among planned activities. However, the implementation of the policies suggested by those studies would require having a policy buy-in environment among the stakeholders – particularly officials from relevant ministries and policy makers – before the studies are commissioned. Beneficiaries, government, garment association, and other stakeholders need to participate in consultation at the various stages of production of the research studies.

47. Dissemination of the best practices is relatively weak among garment industry leaders, buyers, and general audiences. For garment industry leaders, dissemination of the positive impacts of training on productivity, efficiency and work environment, announcement of the next round of training, call for participation can be circulated among PRGMEA, PHMA, SMEDA, and Chamber of Commerce members via its emailing list, website and newsletter, in addition to GEN-PROM website. Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) and women’s empowerment would be useful tools to increase orders and investment from buyers into Pakistan. A summary of best practices should be communicated with key buyers of Pakistani garments. The same can be disseminated via mass media for wider dissemination targeted the business leaders, policy makers and potential workers. So far, there are two newspaper articles reported the GEN-PROM\textsuperscript{11}. The socio-economic impact of the project on women trainees (“A stitch in time”) was featured in UNDP’s Newsletter (May-July 2008), and this kind of story should also be featured in major newspapers, TV news, magazines and other sources in English and Urdu to raised the interests of industry leaders, policy makers and potential workers.

48. Scientific method of training and training curricula/ materials are valued and repeated by the industry. Four business guidelines are available from the UNDP Pakistan website. However, various dissemination strategies are crucial to increase awareness of the program and enhance the productivity of the industry as a whole. The guidelines in Urdu will increase accessibility to modules: Translation of the guidelines into Urdu is underway. GEN-PROM should make business guidelines available at the websites of PRGMEA, PHMA, SMEDA and other relevant associations.

49. Due to increased global competition and effect of global economic crisis, mergers and acquisitions as well as closure or downsizing of the units are taking place in the garment industry. Placement unit is more likely to be helpful when the program has expanded. Placement board on the GEN-PROM website will be of more use to MTs, who are computer literate. Operators will benefit from assistance from MTs and supervisors and information sharing on notice boards at PMUs, factories, and vocational schools. Telephone number of the PMUs should be provided to trainees for services of placement and any other follow-ups. However, male staffs contacting a women operator might create a problem in her family. So far, CSOs such as Sarsabz in Faisalabad and Caritas Pakistan have assisted GEN-PROM in mobilizing new women trainees in the communities. The project could create a similar linkage with them on placement services particularly requesting assistance from women staffs.

50. Towards a strategic approach to gender equality in Pakistan, key implications of GEN-PROM should be reflected upon the UN programmes and nation’s gender equality program. For example, majority of the project beneficiaries are women with 5-10 years of education. Percentage of women garment workers with less than primary education or illiteracy are 11.3 percent in Karachi, 49.8 percent in Lahore and 42.1 percent in Faisalabad (Ul Haque 2009). GEN-PROM shows that primary and secondary educational attainment makes a considerable difference to women in obtaining skills and decent job. On the other hand, the project have difficulties to recruit women for MT posts since there are few women majoring industrial engineering and textile and garment technology at university. Then, the implications of the programme should be reflected upon Gender Responsive Budgeting by allocating more public investment towards primary and secondary education for girls as well as scholarships for women majoring in industrial engineering, garment technology and other relevant subjects.

51. Linking GEN-PROM to other gender-mainstreaming initiatives would benefit the operator trainees as well as outreach strategy of other gender projects. GEN-PROM was well designed to overcome the demand-side issues of attracting women workers in non-agricultural industry. However, the program has not dealt with the problems regarding the supply of women workers. A young girl from single-mother household working in the garment factory with a pride of being breadwinner may have to leave the industry if her future husband and in-laws do not allow her to work outside of the home. Health problems are common among the garment workers. In addition to eyesight problem and back pain caused by repetitive work in the production line, poor health from imbalanced nutrition and hygiene problems at home are common among women from the impoverished household. Moreover, earning income does not automatically lead to woman’s empowerment if she has no control over the money she earned. Informative sessions on nutrition, hygiene, basic financial management, gender-based violence and other topics related to human development can be provided to trainees during lunch break once a week or so by relevant government agencies or CSOs in the community.

3 RECOMMENDATIONS SUMMARY

3.1 Recommendations on Project Goals, Objectives and Outputs

a. Business guidelines, MT Induction Test, training manuals and all documents and information regarding operators should be translated into Urdu and modified into a local context. The same also applies to any signs in the STUs regarding safety information and compliance guidelines.

b. Significant efforts to disseminate best practices to the industrialists and call for participation have to be made by IP institutes and project partners for the sake of the garment industry. Existing member’s network and information channels at PRGMEA, PHMA, SMEDA, and Chamber
of Commerce should be utilized. A summary of best practices should be communicated with key buyers of Pakistani garments as well as business leaders, policy makers and potential workers via mass media.

c. Placement unit is more likely to be helpful when the program has expanded. Innovative approach to reach to women operators in assisting their jobs placement needs to be explored.

d. Arrangement between Ministry of Textiles and GEN-PROM in the context of SMOT program needs to be materialized soon. The partnership with TEVTA, PRGTII, SMEDA, NAVTEC and EPZ on project support to SMEs is encouraged.

e. Beneficiaries, government, garment association, and other stakeholders need to participate in consultation at the various stages of production of the research studies on social audit and bilateral negotiations strategy to maximize the policy buy-in from them.

f. Towards a strategic approach to gender equality in Pakistan, key implications of GEN-PROM should be reflected upon the UN programmes and nation’s gender equality program.

g. Linking GEN-PROM to other gender-mainstreaming initiatives would benefit the operator trainees as well as outreach strategy of other gender projects. Informative sessions on nutrition, hygiene, basic financial management, gender-based violence and other topics related to human development can be provided to trainees during the training period by relevant government agencies or CSOs in the community.

3.2 Recommendations on management and coordination

h. To avoid further delays of project implementation, vacant posts needed to be filled as soon as possible.

i. So far, the beneficiaries of the training program are large firms. Adoption of GEN-PROM training methods at national training institutes and EPZ should be designed to benefit SMEs.

j. In order to recruit MT candidates, particularly women students, for sustainable employment in the industry, outreach activities such as a job fair and seminar series on GEN-PROM program are encouraged at leading institutes.

k. In order to provide incentives for MTs to stay in the industry, the participating firms need to provide a clear career development plan for the MTs upon recruitment. Providing skill-up training opportunities in various fields in management is another example of incentives. Likewise, skill-development opportunity and career development plan of PCs and PMU staffs should be provided by the IPs as an incentive to stay in the project.

l. Stronger partnership with IPs is crucial for the sustainability of the program beyond the project’s lifetime. Since the program is benefiting the garment industry, garment associations such as PRGMEA, PHMA or Pakistan Apparel Forum should be the primary IP, while the services of SMEDA, GC University in Faisalabad, and others can be examined to supplement the services of the garment associations.

m. Ideally, there should be 4 PMUs, one each for each garment industry cluster at Karachi, Faisalabad, Lahore and Sialkot. Business models that will be able to finance PCs’ salaries and other project needs and to develop consulting services and project implementation mechanism that meet the demands of the industry can be explored in next two years to provide a practical exit plan for the UNDP project. In order to receive the further support from the garment associations, it would be helpful to conduct the surveys among the firms participated in the GEN-PROM training program to assess the economic impacts of the program on productivity of the firms.

n. Harmonization of the activities among the UN agencies is recommended under the One UN initiative.
Annex I: Terms of Reference-Mid-Term Review Mission:  
Gender Promotion in the Garment/Clothing Industry through Skill Development

Background

Pakistan is the 4th largest cotton producer of the world. Textile and apparel makes-up for 64 percent of total export volume and 11 percent of total GDP. 38 percent of the total labour force is employed in the textile and apparel industry. However, Pakistan’s Textile & Apparel Industry’s Share in Global trade is only 2 percent.

Post quota regime after year 2005 brought increased competitiveness and ability to win buyers confidence as a challenge for textile and garments industry in Pakistan. The labour ratio of Pakistan’s textile industry is highly skewed towards males as opposed to the competing nations of South Asia where women are drivers of garment industry. There is a huge skill gap coupled with lack of enabling policies at the national level for skill development, promotion of social safety nets, equal and fair wages and affirmative action for promoting equitable opportunities for women.

Gen-Prom project is a 5 year initiative of UNDP that aims at reducing poverty and empowering female garment workers through skill development and private industry partnership. The project objectives are to increase income and generate employment for garment workers, particularly women, affected by the changing international trade environment through skills up-gradation, carry out research and advocate gender mainstreaming in the garment industry, and by promoting policy incentivization whereby the industry will be encouraged to promote gender participation in the garment industry. The project is a component of UNDP’s and the Government of Pakistan’s overarching Gender Support Programme (GSP).

The project is being implemented in Sindh and Punjab in partnership with two associations namely Pakistan Ready-Made Garments Manufacturers & Exporters Association (PRGMEA) and GC University Faisalabad (previously FITFD) respectively. The project has a total approved budget of USD 11.654 million. Out of this, US$ 5.0 million is to come from UNDP, which is in-turn is supported by a pool of GSP cost sharing partners, namely; DFID, SDC and Norway. The rest of US$ 6.654 million is contribution from implementing partners and participating companies in-kind.

The objectives of GENPROM are:

1. To generate employment for women in garment industry through training and retraining;
2. To build the capacity of the private industry to conduct research and advocate gender mainstreaming in the garment industry, and to promote policy incentivization whereby the industry will be encouraged to promote gender participation in the garment industry.
3. To record best practices and disseminate the information for up-scaling skill development initiatives in the country.

A Mid-Term Review will evaluate the success of the project, as well as identify issues and recommend course corrections on the basis of Genprom Weekly Reports, Reports on First Round and Second Round of trainings in 2007 and 2008, various documents provided, responses in interviews and questions raised during the mission, and if possible, additional evidence collected. The Review will pave the way for improved project delivery for the remaining project duration and review amendments (if any) required in project design, implementation and/or institutional anchorage in order to contribute to creation of
Draft 14 July 2009

systems for sustained capacity building of garment workers.

**Objectives of the Review Mission:**

The mid-term project Review of GENPROM project will do an analysis of the project progress thus far in accordance with the resources, time and information available against stated objectives. The Mission will also highlight issues and challenges affecting effective implementation of objectives and recommend course corrections.

**Key Focus Areas:**

The mission should critically assess the following:

**Relevance:**

i. How well the project focused on the needs and demands of the beneficiaries.

**Effectiveness and Impact:**

ii. Has the project accomplished its objectives in terms of direct impact of the project on beneficiaries, particularly women to the extent that is possible with available information.

iii. The performance of the Project, so far with particular reference to qualitative and quantitative achievements of objectives and targets as defined in the project document and work-plan;

iv. The contribution of the projects towards the achievement of national objectives and CPAP MYFF (Multi-year funding framework) goals vis-à-vis gender equality;

**Efficiency:**

v. Assess how the project has utilized the project funding to achieve results?

vi. Assess the timeline and quality of reporting followed by the project

vii. The qualitative and quantitative aspects of management and other inputs (such as equipment, monitoring and review and other technical assistance and budgetary inputs) provided by the project vis-à-vis achievement of objectives and targets;

**Sustainability:**

viii. Consider preliminary indications of the degree to which the project results are likely to be sustainable beyond the project’s lifetime, and provide recommendations for strengthening sustainability.

ix. The appropriateness of the training and implementation strategies adopted by the project (including but not limited to the process of selecting Master trainers/Programme Coordinators, trainers development of training materials/curricula, dissemination of training tools, and appropriateness of training methodologies used (separate for both provinces);

x. Indicate if the reproduction/replication of the project or service methodology elsewhere is feasible;

**Network /linkages**

xi. The level, degree and appropriateness of participation by the beneficiaries, stakeholders, government and donor partners in the implementation of the project (with particular attention to the development, testing and production of training materials, formulation and planning of project activities and other technical assistance inputs);
xii. Any linkages formed as a result of project activities which further advanced project objectives or conversely, any missed opportunities which would have significantly enhanced achievement of objectives/targets;

xiii. Project’s knowledge management strategy and outreach and communication to all stakeholders.

Lessons learnt:

xiv. Significant lessons learnt that can be drawn from the experience of the projects and its results and impact on beneficiaries;

xv. Identify lessons learned and recommendations for adjustments in project strategies, implementation approaches and management structures to improve project implementation and its impact, even after donor intervention has ended;

Outputs:

The Mission’s findings and recommendations will be thoroughly discussed with the UNDP, GSP, Project Partners, project management, donors and the EAD.

The Mission will complete and submit a draft final report in both hard and soft copy at the end of the mission. The Mission Leader will finalize the report in the light of comments/suggestions of stakeholders. The key outputs of the Review are:

1) Draft Report Template: Submission of a draft report format containing Table of Contents for final report for approval by UNDP.

2) An Aide Memoire (Executive Summary and Key findings) and Presentation:

   The consultants will present the key findings and executive summary of the report to the project stakeholders (GSP’s cost sharing partners, EAD and Gen-prom) in a consultative workshop.

3) Mid-Term Review report: The final Review report should be logically structured, contain evidence-based findings, conclusions, lessons and recommendations, and should be free of information that is not relevant to the overall analysis. The report should respond in detail to the key focus areas described above. A set of specific recommendations formulated for the project; and, identify the necessary actions required to be undertaken, who should undertake those and possible timelines (if any);

4) Presentation: For presenting and discussing the draft final report interactively, the consultants will facilitate a one-day concluding workshop in Islamabad for the project stakeholders as well as representatives from other provinces and any other participants invited by the projects.

Consultants:

A team of two consultants; one with at least eight years of experience in garment industry and the other with eight to ten years of expertise in livelihoods including gender

Duration

25 working days with at least 10 days for field assessment, as per the following schedule
## Annex II: Schedule of Meetings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Meeting/ Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Islamabad</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 26 Feb | 12:00 | Orientation meeting with UNDP Islamabad  
Mr. Alvaro Rodriguez, Country Director  
Ms. Mikiko Tanaka, Deputy Country Director of Programme  
Ms. Faiza Effendi, ARR/ Chief of Poverty and Gender Unit  
Mr. Shakeel Ahmad, Programme Officer  
Ms. Linn Wallerstedt, Programme Officer |
|      | 13:30 | Briefing with Mr. Mohammed Asif, Joint Secretary, Economic Affairs Division (EAD) |
|      | 15:00 | Briefing with GSP Cost Sharing Partners;  
Ms. Rabya Nizam, Social Development Advisor, DFID  
Mr. Amir Khan Goraya, Programme Officer, SDC  
Mr. Naufil Naseer, Programme Officer, Norway  
Mr. Sajid Baloch, GSP Programme Coordinator  
Mr. Saud Bangash, Economic Analyst, UNDP  
Mr. Shakeel Ahmad, Programme Officer, UNDP  
Ms. Linn Wallerstedt, Programme Officer, UNDP |
| 27 Feb | 09:30 | Briefing with Ministry of Textile Industry:  
Mr. Farkhand Iqbal, Joint Secretary,  
Mr. M. Tariq Nawaz Janjua, Deputy Secretary,  
Mr. Kanwar M. Usman, Director of R&D, |
|      | 10:45 | Discussion with Mr. Mohammed Asif, Joint Secretary, EAD |
| **Lahore** |
| 28 Feb | 09:45 | Briefing with Punjab Project Management Unit in Lahore  
Mr. Sajeeel Butt, National Project Manager, GENPROM Punjab  
Mr. Mahmood Anwar, M&E Officer |
|      | 11:30 | Meeting with Dr. Ehsan Ul Haq, the author of “Current Status and Prospects of Female Employment in the Apparel Industry in Pakistan” |
|      | 14:30 | Meeting with PRGMEA representatives  
Mr. Muhammad Nasser Malik, Chairman  
Mr. S. Azhar Mahmood, Advocate,  
Mr. Kamran Yousaf Sandhu, Project Director/ Principal of PRGTII |
|      | 16:00 | Visiting STU, Combined Fabrics  
Mr. Lafar Mahmood Theikh, Chief Executive  
Mr. Usman Ahmed Chaudhry |
| 2 March | 10:00 | Meeting with SMEDA representatives  
Mr. Fayyaz Ahmed Riaz, Deputy General Manager  
Mr. Iqbal Kidwai, General Manager Out Reach Division |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Meeting/Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Faisalabad</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 March</td>
<td>16:00</td>
<td>Briefing with the implementing partner in Punjab</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Dr. Ahmad M. Khalid, Vice Chancellor, GC University in Faisalabad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 March</td>
<td>18:45</td>
<td>Meeting with the Crescent Textiles Mills Representatives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Ahmad Shafi, Managing Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ms. Saima Bilal, HR Manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Ilyas Tahir, VP Processing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 March</td>
<td>10:00</td>
<td>Visiting STU, Masood Textiles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 March</td>
<td>11:30</td>
<td>Visiting STU, Image Garments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Muhammad Nadeem, General Manager Operations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Hassan Aqeel, Director Operations &amp; Marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karachi</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 March</td>
<td>09:30</td>
<td>Briefing with GENPROM PMU Sindh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ms. Maham N. Sadique, National Project Director, PRGTII/PRGMEA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Syed Muhammad Nawab, National Project Manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Moin Haider Zaidi, M&amp;E Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Aafaq Ahmed, Programme Coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Muhammad Shad Nasir, Programme Coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Syed Nabeel Raza, Programme Coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11:30</td>
<td>Roundtable with stakeholders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Abdul-Salam Ansari, Head of Department, Pakistani Swedish Institute of Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Razzak Paracha, Director, Universal Fashions, and Acting Chairman of PRGMEA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Faraz, Admin. Officer, Pakistan Hosiery Manufactures Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Muhammad Wasif Shafi, Manager Coordination, Prime Safety Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Syed Shahid Ali, Manager System Compliance, J&amp;M Clothing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Shahid Khan, Program Coordinator, J&amp;M Clothing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Syed Muhammad Nawab, National Project Manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Moin Haider Zaidi, M&amp;E Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Aafaq Ahmed, Programme Coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Muhammad Shad Nasir, Programme Coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Syed Nabeel Raza, Programme Coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>15:00</td>
<td>Visiting STU, Maxco Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Zubair Gilani, Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 March</td>
<td>10:00</td>
<td>Meeting with Textile Commissioners’ Organization (TCO) representatives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Muhammad Idrees Ahmed, Textile Commissioner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. S. Ausaf Ahmed, Deputy Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12:00</td>
<td>Meeting with the former chairmen of PRGMEA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Bilal Mulla, Mulla International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Shehzad Salim, Master Textile Mills Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Razzak Paracha, Director, Universal Fashions, and Acting Chairman of PRGMEA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13:45</td>
<td>Meeting with NAVTEC representative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ms. Talat Wassem, Sindh Regional Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Meeting/ Activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 March</td>
<td>14:45</td>
<td>Meeting with Ms. Maham N. Sadique, NPD GENPROM Sindh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Contd.)</td>
<td>16:00</td>
<td>Meeting with Textile Institute of Pakistan representative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Dr. Zubair Bandukda, President</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>17:20</td>
<td>Meeting with PMU, Mr. Syed Muhammad Nawab and Mr. Moin Haider Zaidi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 March</td>
<td>11:00</td>
<td>Visiting Export Processing Zone, Landhi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Kamran Y. Mirza, Chairman of EPZ Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12:20</td>
<td>Visiting STU, Prime Safety Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Saifuddin Sodagar, Business Executive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ms. Asia Parveen Assistant Manager and former MT trainee (1st round)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>14:30</td>
<td>Visiting STU, J&amp;M Clothing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Priyanta Wanniarachchi, Chief Executive Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Syed Shahid Ali, Manager System Compliance, J&amp;M Clothing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Shahid Khan, Program Coordinator, J&amp;M Clothing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>16:00</td>
<td>Visiting current STU, Gul Ahmed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Muhammad Asif Khan, Manager Quality Assurance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Muhammad Shad Nasir, GENPROM Programme Coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 March</td>
<td>11:15</td>
<td>Visiting STU, Rajby Industries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Ekhlaque Ahmed, Director Operation Rajby Industries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Irfan Abdullah, General Manager Rajby Industries, and the former Project Manager, GENPROM Sindh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamabad</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 March</td>
<td>11:00</td>
<td>Debriefing meeting with UNDP Islamabad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ms. Mikiko Tanaka, Deputy Country Director of Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ms. Faiza Effendi, ARR/ Chief of Poverty and Gender Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Shakeel Ahmad, Programme Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ms. Linn Wallerstedt, Programme Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>15:30</td>
<td>Debriefing meeting with Mr. Mohammed Asif, Joint Secretary, EAD</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Annex III: List of participants of the workshop, 18 March 2009

Mr. Shakeel Ahmad, Programme Officer, UNDP Pakistan
Mr. Sajid Baloch, GSP Programme Coordinator
Mr. Sajeel Butt, National Project Manager, GENPROM Punjab
Ms. Faiza Effendi, ARR/ Chief of Poverty and Gender Unit, UNDP Pakistan
Dr. Zubair Khan, Consultant
Mr. Syed Muhammad Nawab, National Project Manager, GEN-PROM Sindh
Mr. Razzak Paracha, Director, Universal Fashions, and Acting Chairman of PRGMEA South
Ms. Maham N. Sadique, National Project Director, GEN-PROM Sindh
Ms. Linn Wallerstedt, Programme Officer, UNDP Pakistan
Ms. Yumiko Yamamoto, Consultant
Mr. Khalid Hanif EAD
Annex IV: Documents and Studies Reviewed


GEN-Prom project brochure.


UNDP Pakistan. 2006. *GENPROM Pakistan Project Document*.


