

Human Rights Capacity Building Project (BENAA)

# Mid-Term Project Evaluation

---

Final Report

**Khaled M. Ahmed**  
**20 October 2009**

---

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

Table of Contents	1
Abbreviations	3
Disclaimer	4
Acknowledgments	5
Executive Summary	6
1. Introduction	9
- Overall Description of Range of Project Under Review	10
- Approach and Methodology for the Mission	11
2. Summary of BENAA Achievements	14
3. Evaluation of BENAA Activities	17
3.1. Human Rights Training for Law Enforcement Sector	17
- Workshops for Judges	
- Workshops for Public Prosecution	
- Workshops for Administrative Prosecutors	
- Workshops for Police Officers	
- Workshops for Family Courts	
- Workshops for Lawyers	
3.2. Human Rights Trainings for Other Sectors	25
- Media	
- Workshops for Women	
- Students	
- Training of Teachers at the Ministry of Education	
- Diplomats	
- Parliamentarians	
3.3. Enhancing the Human Rights Culture, Knowledge and Publications	31
- Dissemination of Information on Various Human Rights Issues Through Publications	
- Assist in the Curriculum Development of Egyptian Universities to Include Various Human Rights Issues	
- Dialogue with CSOs on Human Rights Issues and Promote Public Awareness	
- Commemoration of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights	
- Organization of Competition for media persons	
4. Evaluation Findings	34
4.1. Project Relevance	
4.2. Impact of external and internal factors on the effectiveness of the project in building capacity for the community of human rights practitioners in Egypt;	
4.3. Design and implementation of the Human Rights training programmes for the different sectors in terms of: Project Strategy ( in terms of training HR, study tours, knowledge management, outreach and partnership building	
4.4. Impact of project activities on the awareness and capacity development of the target groups	
4.5. Visibility and outreach of the project	

5. Lessons Learnt	39
6. Recommendations	40
7. Annexes	
Annex 1: Terms of Reference	
Annex 2: Work Plan	
Annex 3: List of persons and organizations met during the evaluation	
Annex 4: Questionnaires	
Annex 5: Project response to the evaluation	
Annex 6: Tables	

## ABBREVIATIONS

BENAA	Human Rights Capacity Building Project
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
GoE	Government of Egypt
TOR	Terms of Reference
OPP	Office of the Public Prosecutor
MoI	Ministry of Interior
MoJ	Ministry of Justice
MoFA	Ministry of Foreign Affairs
NGOs	Non-governmental Organizations
CSOs	Civil Society Organizations
NCHR	National Council for Human Rights
NCCM	National Council for Childhood and Motherhood
NCW	National Council for Women
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
AOCJ	Administration of Criminal Justice Project
EOHR	Egyptian Organization for Human Rights
AOHR	Arab Organization for Human Right
ACIJLP	The Arab Center for the Independence of the Judiciary and the Law Profession
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
CAOA	Central Agency for Organization and Administration
LFA	Logical Framework Approach
UNICRI	United Nations Interregional Crime and Justice Research Institute
UNIFEM	United Nations Development Fund for Women
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
CEDAW	The Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women

### **DISCLAIMER**

**The views expressed in this report are those of the Consultant and can in no way be taken to represent those of the donors.**

### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

The consultant would like to thank all those who gave their time and contributed information during the evaluation. Staff at BENAA has been helpful and open, and have accommodated visits at short notice and given generously of their time. Particular thanks I owed to Amb. Ahmed Haggag who provided invaluable support to the Consultant. Special thanks also goes to Ms. Nagla Arafa of UNDP for her extended cooperation and support throughout the mission.

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This evaluation report was commissioned by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) Egypt as part of the evaluation process for the progress of the Human Rights Capacity Building Project (BENAA) referred to hereinafter as “*the Project*”. The contract was awarded to Mr. Khaled M. Ahmed referred to hereinafter as “*the Consultant*”.

The purpose of this evaluation was to assess the progress of the Project during the current phase which began in 2006, and will end in the second quarter of 2010. The evaluation team consisted of one consultant with considerable experience in human rights, rule of law and reform of judicial and legal systems. He was assisted by Ms. Mozn Hassan, Gender Expert who was responsible for the evaluation of the gender component in all BENAA activities.

Using a participatory method and consultancy approach, the team collected the basic information from UNDP, donors and BENAA Administration then met with senior Egyptian officials and other key players in the area of human rights in Egypt. The Consultant also held a series of targeted and comprehensive interviews with stakeholders and sub contractors, followed by a series of targeted focus groups with BENAA Alumni. The Consultant also conducted a parallel desk study, examining documentation and relevant material produced by donors and third parties. The Consultant also visited a number of training sites during the last two weeks of the mission.

Draft report was submitted to UNDP, donors and BENAA Administration on October 17, 2009 then this final report was submitted on 20 October 2009. It presents detailed findings and analysis specific to each sector of the project. It also provides conclusions and recommendations, which are presented here.

## CONCLUSIONS

This section of the report presents a brief of the conclusions while detailed response is developed in greater details in the body of the report.

***Concerning the Project relevance,*** BENAA has adequate target groups in general, based on the fact that the legislative and judiciary bodies, law enforcement agents and other targets, have never before been exposed to human rights doctrine and practice in a systematic manner.

In general, the Consultant believes that the project responded to the objectives and priorities areas set out in the Project Document. It is evident that most of the targets have been met and the Project goals were to a considerable extent realized. BENAA held 304 training courses for 10898 law enforcement agents and human rights practitioners. The Project also held 131 awareness sessions for staff members of the Central Agency for Organization and Administration (CAOA), police sergeants and students at the various Egyptian universities including the Police Academy. Total number of participants in these awareness sessions is 20370 which bring the total number of those directly impacted by the project to 31268. Based on that, it is fair to say that a large number of human rights practitioners in most of the targeted beneficiaries received basic training

on human rights principles while selected participants joined Advanced Courses and were qualified to participate in the 5 study tours organized by BENAA.

There have been some observations on a number of important issues such as the number of participants at every training course; the training contents, material and publication and BENAA's organizational structure. These issues will be discussed in greater details in the body of this report.

***On the effectiveness of the Project in building capacity for the community of human rights practitioners in Egypt,*** it is very clear that BENAA do contribute to the Egyptian Government's strategy in spreading the human rights culture and increasing the awareness on the basic rights. BENAA also helped increasing the awareness of human rights within all law enforcement agencies which led to establishing special human rights offices at the Office of Public Prosecutor as well as in all Security Directories in all governorates. Moreover, on the individual level, it was evident that the effectiveness of law enforcement agents trained in their human rights work has increased (*samples of their work is attached in Annex 11*). However, the absence of internal evaluations and related indicators at the side of beneficiary institutions for the period covered made it difficult to accurately assess the actual effectiveness of BENAA. The Project was praised by most of the senior officials met for the enhancement of the human rights culture within most of the targeted institutions.

***On the impact of BENAA's activities on the awareness and capacity development of the target groups,*** in one hand, it should be noted that this is an "Output Evaluation" and that only first indicators can be given with regards to "impact". On the other hand, it was difficult to measure the impact for two reasons. The first is due to insufficient time for the Consultant to implement a full range of assessment. The second is related to questions as to whether there was sufficient "buy in" by counterparts in terms of monitoring the performance of their own staff members who received the training.

***On BENAA's ability to engender sustainable enhancement in the human rights culture in Egypt,*** the Consultant considers that there is a strong likelihood of continuation of benefits produced by the Project especially in light of the strong Egyptian commitment to supporting this Project. It is also imperative to conclude that the sustainability of enhanced human rights culture will depend for the near future on whether the donors choose to continue to provide support, and the level of cooperation from the targeted institutions.

***On the visibility,*** donors' logos and knowledge of their identity was clearly observed in all activities especially at training sites. Visibility of the project itself was also observed but not sufficient.

On the outreach, BENAA organizational structure lacks a media specialist to provide experience in the field of outreach for the Project. However, the Project is well known in Egypt at law enforcement agencies and academic institutions.

At the end of this report, the Consultant provides a number of recommendations that could be summarized in the following:

- It is recommended that BENAA adopts a new special training methodology to allow more participation and interactive activities subject to continuous monitoring and evaluation. The



new methodology should include a practical training component at every Basic Training course.

- On the design of the training programmes, the Consultant suggests that BENAA adopts special methodology for conducting the training courses (*see pages 40-41*), moreover, it is recommended that BENAA adopts the Logical Framework Approach in order to achieve better results.
- It is necessary to limit the number of participants to 24 in all Basic Training Courses and 14 in all Specialized and Advanced Training Courses. This shall help the experts and participants to engage in a more dynamic dialogue/ discussions throughout all courses.
- Course material should be tailored to meet the specific needs of every institution; moreover, there is a need to update the current publications and materials distributed during the training. This could be done by recruiting an external consultant to provide inputs on updating reference material for the training courses.
- It is highly recommended that BENAA conducts TOT Programmes for staff members of the targeted law enforcement agencies to guarantee sustainability of the positive human rights culture, transfer of knowledge and dissemination of the human rights culture within all institutions
- Particular focus should be given to the rights of the vulnerable groups such as children, women and disabled people.
- On the organizational structure level, it is recommended to increase the number of staff members at BENAA's Monitoring and Reporting Unit in addition to adopting new strategy aiming to strengthen the role of the Unit and enable it to effectively conduct its important tasks. It is also recommended to recruit a permanent gender expert and media specialist to assist the project in achieving its goals. There is also a need to increase the number of BENAA operational and programming officers and provide them with advanced training on best practices in designing and managing training programmes.
- On the selection of experts, resource persons and sub-contractors, it is recommended that BENAA assigns more human rights practitioners to deliver the training to combine between the theory and practice. It is also recommended to invite international experts and resource persons to participate in the training programmes to enhance exposure and learning especially for law enforcement sector. There is also a need to adopt a set of rules and procedures for the selection of resource persons/ experts and sub-contractors to deliver the training as well as TORs for resource persons/experts that should reflect specific responsibilities such as presentation of handouts and reading material; preparation of case studies or topics to ensure interaction and dialogue with participants in the training especially in the Basic Training courses.
- There is a need to enhance the role of the media and NGOs in the planning and implementation of the various training activities.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

The Government of Egypt (GoE) emphasizes the principle of citizenship as a basis for equality in rights and duties and the elimination of all forms of discrimination (color, race, belief, etc) that guarantees respect for citizen's fundamental rights. In accordance with the Project Document signed in July 2005 between UNDP and the Egyptian Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MoFA), the Project's main goal is to strengthen the capacity of the Egyptian Government and institutions in dealing with human rights issues. The purpose of the training activities carried out by the Project is to familiarize Egyptians (at least 10% of the targeted community of Human Rights practitioners) with international standards on Human Rights and Egypt's treaty commitments and to provide educational materials so that officials and opinion leaders can disseminate this information and, when appropriate, include it in their own awareness and capacity building activities.

This evaluation aimed to assess the performance and achievements of the project at the output level namely "*Human Rights Training for the Community of Human Rights Practitioners such as law enforcement sector, legislative sector, educational sector, media sector, CSO sector, as well as the dissemination of Human Rights Knowledge*"<sup>1</sup>. The evaluation also aimed to assess the contribution of the project at the Outcome Level "*Human Rights Principles widely applied in Egypt*". As such, the purpose of this mid-term evaluation was four-fold:

- “.... *To assess the relevance and effectiveness of the project for Human Rights Capacity Building for human rights practitioners.*
- *to analyze how the human rights training has increased the effectiveness of trainees in their human rights work and how they have applied their learning in their respective organizations*
- *to identify lessons learned and best practices to further enhance the capacity of the project in building capacity for the community of Human Rights practitioners in Egypt*
- *to share experiences and best practices with the community of international human rights practitioners and provide evidence for the relevance of Human Rights promotion projects*
- *consider the achievements of the project in the light of similar initiatives in the Arab region*”<sup>2</sup>.

The evaluation exercise took place in Cairo, Egypt between August and October 2009 and covered the following:

- “...*Assessment of the impact of external and internal factors on the effectiveness of the project in building capacity for the community of human rights practitioners in Egypt;*
- *Design and implementation of the Human Rights training programmes for the different sectors (law enforcement sector, legislative sector,*

<sup>1</sup> See Annexe 1, Terms of Reference at 2.

<sup>2</sup> *Id.*

- educational sector, media sector, CSO sector etc.) in terms of: content, methodology, training materials, curricula, facilitation; logistical arrangements and special events*
- *Evaluate the strategy of the project in promoting the culture of Human Rights in terms of training HR, study tours, knowledge management, outreach and partnership building*
  - *Assessment of the Impact of project activities on the awareness and capacity development of human rights practionners in the area of human rights*
  - *Visibility and outreach of the project’’<sup>3</sup>*

### **Overall Description of Range of Project Under Review**

According to the Project Document, the main objective of the project was to increase the awareness of human rights between employees dealing with human rights issues. The main targeted beneficiaries of the project are:<sup>4</sup>

1. Police Officers;
2. Public Prosecutors;
3. Administrative Prosecutors;
4. Agents of Administrative Control;
5. Judges;
6. Judges of the State Council;
7. Judges of the Supreme Constitutional Court;
8. Family Courts;
9. Teachers at the Ministry of Education;
10. Universities;
11. Lawyers (Female lawyers);
12. Media Personnel (Private and public);
13. NGOs and CSOs.

In addition to the above, BENAA was also mandated with:

1. Dissemination of information on various human rights issues through publications;
2. Assist in the curriculum development of Egyptian universities to include various human rights issues;
3. Conduct dialogue with CSOs on human rights issues and promote public awareness;
4. Provide study tours and scholarships on human rights.<sup>5</sup>

In line with these objectives and mandates, the TOR identified the duties of the Consultant to include:

- *“...Desk Review of all substantive documentation including the Project Document; Project Progress Reports, knowledge products, Monitoring Report by the EC etc.*
- *Discussions and interviews with Government counterparts, donors, namely the EU, Ford Foundation, SIDA, the Embassy of the Netherlands and the*

---

<sup>3</sup> *Id*, at 2-3.

<sup>4</sup> *See* Annex 3, at 2.

<sup>5</sup> *Id*, at 10-11.

*Embassy of Norway, UNDP as well as civil society organizations and other development partners as appropriate*

- *Meetings with the Project Director and the project team*
- *Focus group discussions with BENAA Alumni, participants in training programmes and with facilitators*
- *Visits to and participation in training programmes conducted by the project*
- *Initial impact assessment of the project activities on the target beneficiaries through the development of a questionnaire(s), conduct of limited survey and analysis of findings”<sup>6</sup>.*

### **Approach and Methodology of the Mission**

A detailed Work Plan<sup>7</sup> was provided to UNDP and the donors shortly after commencing the mission, which contained its intended approach and methodology, a list of persons and organisations that the Consultant intended to visit or interview, together with a draft schedule of meetings that indicated when such interviews would take place. The Consultant also indicated in anticipated division of work within the team according to their respective roles and strengths, and an indication of milestones that would be used to monitor progress during the mission. All of these elements were deemed acceptable by the donors.

The Consultant adopted a broad participatory and consultancy approach. A key source of information was BENAA’s administration as well as the donors especially UNDP and the Embassy of the Kingdom of the Netherlands. Moreover, strong contact was established with BENAA Heads of Sectors which in turn enabled the Consultant to identify all the activities subject to evaluation and a broad range of stakeholders.

During the first week of the mission, the Consultant met several times with all Heads of Sectors at BENAA where he enquired about the activities of all sectors and received reports including details on each sector; moreover, he received recent progress reports, publications, CD, brochures, copies of model agendas and material. The Consultant also sought regular direction from UNDP and other available donors.

During the second and third weeks of the mission, the Consultant met with senior Govt officials in order to directly assess their perceived observations and priorities.<sup>8</sup> Moreover, extensive interviews were held with other key players in the area of human rights in Egypt with a view to identifying areas of complementarity, avoiding duplication, and gathering lessons learned from their own prior experience. The Consultant then conducted a series of targeted and comprehensive interviews with donors, stakeholders and sub contractors, which included:

- Representatives of primary and secondary beneficiaries of the Project (including the Office of the Public Prosecutor (OPP), Ministry of Interior (MoI), MoFA, members of the judiciary, NGOs and Human rights activists, university students and media personnel);
- Representatives of the Embassy of the Kingdom of the Netherlands in Cairo;
- Representatives of the National Council for Human Rights (NCHR) and the National Council for Childhood and Motherhood (NCCM);

<sup>6</sup> See Terms of Reference, *supra* note 1 at 2.

<sup>7</sup> See Annex 2, Work Plan.

<sup>8</sup> See Annex 3, List of persons and organizations met during the evaluation.

- Representatives of the EC Delegation in Cairo;
- Representatives of donors who have implemented, are implementing, or will implement projects in the area of human rights in Egypt (notably the UNDP, USAID, International Committee for the Red Cross (ICRC) and the Administration of Criminal Justice Project (AOCJ);
- Independent actors and NGOs (The Arab Organization for Human Rights (AOHR), the Egyptian Organization for Human Rights (EOHR) and the Arab Center for the Independence of the Judiciary and the Law Profession (ACIJLP);
- Representatives of sub contractors who already implemented parts of BENAA activities (El Nakib Center for Training and Democracy Support).

The Consultant also held a series of targeted focus groups with BENAA Alumni. The focus groups discussion comprised participants from Public Prosecution, Administrative Prosecution, police officers, university students, NGOs, lawyers, media and academics

In preparation for these focus group discussions, 2 questionnaires were developed to solicit inputs from the participants prior to the open discussion.<sup>9</sup> The questionnaire gave the opportunity for Alumni to share their experience of receiving basic and advanced training on human rights and to provide feedback on the training methodology, contents of the training and experts and resource persons. Based on that, this report includes information gathered from the completed questionnaires. In particular, some of the responses have been used to complement the evaluation findings.

In addition to the active interviews and focus groups as outlined above, the Consultant conducted a parallel desk study, examining relevant documentation including the Project Document, Progress Reports, BENAA Data Base, previous evaluations conducted by independent experts, information on all activities conducted between April 2006 and July 2009, agendas, pre and post evaluations collected by BENAA staff during the training activities, BENAA publications and internal reports, and other relevant material produced by donors and third parties.

The Consultant also conducted 2 visits to training sites during the last two weeks of the mission.<sup>10</sup> The first one was on 4 October 2009 to training course on human rights at the seat of the Diplomatic Institute where 22 junior diplomats including 2 females were receiving basic training on human rights. The second visit was on 7 October 2009 to two training courses held at Pyramisa Hotel for 33 journalists including 12 females on Human Rights in the Egyptian Press. The Consultant attended lectures and interviewed experts and participants.

The consultant was faced with several constraints. A significant limitation was the fact that a large number of activities were included in the evaluation and time limitations meant that it was not possible to evaluate in depth each and every activity. Where possible, the consultant visited the project site, training sites, headquarters of the targeted institutions and spoke to beneficiaries and stakeholders. Time limitations also made it impossible to conduct a second round of focus groups. Another limitation was the difficulty in establishing whether BENAA project had made significant impact. It was very clear that BENAA attained its objectives; nevertheless, this

---

<sup>9</sup> see annex 7, Questionnaires

<sup>10</sup> Mission was mostly conducted during the Holy month of Ramadan; therefore no training activities were held during that period.

difficulty was largely due to a near absence of internal reports and indicators at the side of all beneficiaries except at OPP where actual reports were submitted to the Consultant indicating the actual impact of the training on public prosecutors.<sup>11</sup>

Another limitation has been the lack of ‘buy-in’ to this evaluation by targeted beneficiaries/stakeholders. Whilst the Consultant was able to meet most of the targeted institutions and individuals (*see list of persons met with in Annex 4*), it was not possible to meet representatives of the Law Suits Authority, State Council, sub-contractor Mr. Hazem Mounir and the National Council for Women.

---

<sup>11</sup> For more details *see* Annex 8, OPP Internal Report.

## 2. SUMMARY OF BENAA ACHIEVEMENTS

### Training Activities

Between February 2006 and September 2009, BENAA held 434 training seminars (*see Table 1 attached*)<sup>12</sup>. BENAA Progress Reports indicate that the project trained 998 Public Prosecutors on basic human rights while 140 out of them received advanced training on two topics; Human Rights and Fighting Corruption and International Criminal Law and Human Rights. This number exceeds the targeted number indicated in the Project Document by 113. The average number of participants was 31 prosecutors per course.

BENAA also trained 852 Administrative Prosecutors on basic human rights while 371 of those received advanced and specialized training on corruption. The average number of participants was 34 administrative prosecutors per course.

As for judges, the project did not provide any training for regular judges or judges of the Supreme Constitutional Court; however the project trained 258 judges of the State Council and 437 staff members of the Law Suit Authority. In addition to that, the project trained 1293 staff members of the Ministry of Justice (MoJ).

In the Police Sector, 3158 police officers received basic training on human rights while 466 out of them received advanced training on various topics such as Citizenship, Rights of Women and Children, Trafficking in Persons and Terrorism. The average number of police officers in each course was 34. BENAA also held awareness sessions for 2010 sergeants<sup>13</sup> and 7777 students at the Police Academy.<sup>14</sup> The average number of participants in the courses for police sergeants and students was too high; 64 and 336 respectively; however this is justified as the purpose of those events was to increase the awareness rather than training seminars.

As for staff members of the Family Courts, the project trained 808 staff members which exceeds the targeted number by 308. The average number of participants was 53 staff members per training course.

As for NGOs, the project held 24 courses for 1009 human rights activists with an average number of 27 participants per course

As for media personnel, the targeted number was 1800 however the project trained 1009 only with an average number of participants of 23 media personnel per course. The Consultant did not receive any justification for that.

The targeted number of lawyers was 750 however the project trained 1109 with an average of 55 lawyers per course.

It is noteworthy that BENAA Administration added new beneficiaries, i.e. staff members of CAO, parliamentarians and diplomats. 5 Basic Training courses were held at CAO where 1546 staff members received basic training on human rights. Moreover, 10 Basic Training Courses were held for parliamentarians where 144 staff members of the Shura Council and People's Assembly received basic training on human rights. BENAA also held 5 Basic Training Courses for diplomats where 142 junior diplomats received basic training on human rights.

<sup>12</sup> The data included in the table is compiled by the Consultant from the various progress reports provided by BENAA administration and the beneficiary institutions.

<sup>13</sup> See Table 15 attached.

<sup>14</sup> See Table 14 attached.

### **Memorandums of Agreement and Protocols of Cooperation<sup>15</sup>**

Between June 2007 and Aug 2009, BENAA signed 28 Memorandums of Agreement and Protocols of Cooperation.<sup>16</sup> The scope of most of these agreements is increasing the awareness in human rights issues. Most of these agreements were enforced; however, in other cases, there was no indication that agreements were enforced.

### **BENAA Publications:**

Between 1999 and 2009, BENAA has been contributing to the generation of knowledge and access to information on human rights through the production of several publications such as:<sup>17</sup>

1. International Penal Justice and Human Rights (2008)
2. Human Rights in Civil Education (2008)
3. Citizenship and Human Rights (2008)
4. International Standards of Human Rights and Public Freedoms in the Egyptian Judiciary, Vol. 2 (2007/2008)
5. International Standards of Human Rights and Public Freedoms in the Egyptian Judiciary, Vol. 1 (2005/2006)
6. A Study on the Egyptian Legal System and Principles of Human Rights (2005)
7. Police and Human Rights (2004/2005)
8. Human Rights in Law and Practice (2003)
9. Human Rights and Media (2003)
10. International Standards and the Guarantees of Human Rights Protection in the Egyptian Constitution and Legislations (2002)
11. International Standards for Public Prosecutors and Police Officers (2000)
12. Human Rights and Development (1999)
13. International Politics (UNDP)
14. International and Regional Development of International Organizations
15. Horizon Magazine (3 Editions)
16. Dictionary (Vocabulary of Human Rights Law) (to be printed)

In addition to that, two other books are being printed for the Police Sector; Citizenship and Security and The relationship between citizens and police agents. Moreover, 3 new books are about to be published for the judicial sector. The Consultant did not have the chance to see these 5 books as they were not ready by the time the mission was concluded.

It is also noteworthy that BENAA produced a CD including 9 of the above mentioned list and it was offered to all participants. In addition to that, large number of the CD was distributed in the celebration of the human rights day; 10 Dec 2008.

### **BENAA Website:**

On December 10<sup>th</sup> 2008 BENAA launched its website. The contents of the website include:

- Data about BENAA project to help public press and media to know information about BENAA project such as: introduction, objectives, project scope, BENAA staff, movie

<sup>15</sup> The data included in the table is compiled by the Consultant from hard copies of 28 protocols and memorandums provided to him by BENAA administration.

<sup>16</sup> For a comprehensive list of MoUs signed, See Table 2 attached.

<sup>17</sup> Publications 1 to 9 were reprinted several times between 2007 and 2009.



about BENAA and some statistics for workshops and numbers of trainees for every sector.

- BENAA project publications: 11 books (9 printed – 2 not printed yet).
- 40 Articles, 200 general books specialized in HR subjects and sectors press releases.
- 300 materials related to human rights include: students researches – trainers researches and training materials.
- 200 Links to websites related to HR subjects around the world.
- Photo gallery from workshops, BENAA project achievements and festivals - visual materials about HR subjects such as movies explain the Universal Declaration of Human rights subjects.

The website is undergoing development and reconstruction process. The development includes adding electronic marketing for more hits and visits, developing the interactivity between users and the website by adding interactive materials such as interactive quizzes, interactive information shows about human rights, and developing organized library for researchers (materials in Arabic and English) for inside and outside Egypt researchers. Future planning for the website also includes:

- 1- Building huge library for anyone who is interested in HR in Egypt and outside Egypt.
- 2- Providing online trainings by using visual and interactive materials.
- 3- Expanding BENAA's network and increasing the number of recipients of its newsletter.
- 4- Online applications to join BENAA's activities;

### 3. EVALUATION OF BENAA ACTIVITIES

BENAA's two main goals to be achieved were: 1) Conducting human rights training for the community of human rights practitioners such as law enforcement sector, legislative sector, educational sector, media sector and CSO sector. 2) Increasing knowledge on human rights issues within trained target and related institution as a consequence of knowledge sharing.

In order to achieve these two goals, the Project Document listed various activities to be conducted by BENAA between 2006 and end of 2009. The Consultant reviewed the Project Document and identified the areas to be evaluated as follows:

#### 3.1. Human Rights Training for Law Enforcement Sector

In evaluating BENAA's activities in this sector between 2006 and 2009, the Consultant used the following key indicators to evaluate the performance in the training offered for legal professionals:

1. Quantitative Indicators:
  - a. No of trainees vs. targeted
  - b. Average no of training days
  - c. Average no of participants per activity
2. Qualitative Indicators:
  - a. Assessment of curricula developed
  - b. Pre and post training survey distributed
  - c. Interviews with trainees some time after the training

#### Workshops for Judges, State Council, Supreme Constitutional Court and Law Suit Authority

BENAA did not conduct any training courses for regular judges or judges of the Supreme Constitutional Court.

The project held 9 training courses for judges of the State Council, 13 for staff members of the Law Suit Authority and 13 awareness sessions for staff members of MoJ.<sup>18</sup>

The curricula for the Basic and Advanced courses for those targets included the following topics:<sup>19</sup>

- Importance of human rights
- International Human Rights Law. It's evolution and implementation
- The right for defense in the Egyptian criminal legislations
- International cooperation in the protection of human rights
- International treaties and conventions on human rights
- Human rights in the Egyptian constitution
- Supreme Constitutional Courts and human rights
- Human rights under the Emergency Law
- Fighting corruption

<sup>18</sup> See Table 3 attached.

<sup>19</sup> The list of topics was compiled by the Consultant from the documents and reports submitted from BENAA.

- Egyptian culture and human rights
- Role of the NCHR in the protection of human rights
- Obstacles towards Egypt's fulfillment of its treaty obligations
- Egypt's position on international and regional treaties and conventions on human rights; the reservations and reasons
- International Criminal Court
- Human rights, national security and development
- Role of State Council in the protection of human rights
- Development of the relationship between International Human Rights Law and the national judiciary
- International criminal justice and its role in the protection of human rights
- Comparative study of the statutes of the international criminal courts
- Case study from ICTY
- Rights of the defendant during investigation
- The role of the Central Bank in fighting corruption
- Investigating crimes against public funds
- Harmonization of national legislations with the UN Convention against Corruption
- New International trends to fight corruption
- Comparative study between UN Convention against Corruption and national legislations
- International cooperation in fighting corruption
- National mechanisms to fight corruption
- Assessment of the performance of the national mechanisms mandated to fight corruption
- The role of the Integrity and Transparency Commission on fighting corruption

Total number of trainees in all 35 training courses is 1988 including 258 judges, 437 staff members of the Law Suit Authority and 1293 staff members of MoJ.

Average number of participants in every course was 29 for the judges, 34 for the staff members of the Law Suit Authority and 100 for the staff members of MoJ. This said, it is highly recommended that the maximum number of judges and Law Suit Authority in each course do not exceed 24.

The average number of training days for State Council and Law Suit Authority is 3 while the average number of training hours in every course is 6 per day with no practical training offered at the Basic Course.

The curriculum and publications used for Basic Training on human rights are the same in all training activities for State Council and Law Suit Authority. They include lectures on the above-mentioned topics. The curriculum and publications used for Advanced Training are the same in all advanced training activities within this sector.

It is recommended that BENAA appoints a national expert to assist the project in the development of all curriculums.

No interviews or contact with the Alumni was made following completing the training course.

### **Workshops for Public Prosecutors**

During the course of this mission, the Consultant, accompanied by representative of UNDP, met with H. E. the General Public Prosecutor who expressed satisfaction on the results achieved by

BENAA. He indicated that the project held 30 training seminars for public prosecutors between April 2006 and July 2009.<sup>20</sup> These training seminars helped increasing the knowledge of human rights between all public prosecutors. Moreover, the training had a positive impact on the behavior of the public prosecutors who participated in all previous training seminars, as well as positive impact on the profession in general. Indicators of such impact include, but not limited to, decrease in the number of complaints against public prosecutors related to violations of human rights, decrease in the number of work related problems, and increasing the competition between all prosecutors to join the Advanced Courses and Study Tours.

It is noteworthy that all the training courses took place in Cairo but with participation from public prosecutors serving in all governorates.

The curricula for the Basic and Advanced courses for public prosecutors included the following topics:<sup>21</sup>

- Importance of human rights
- International Human Rights Law. It's evolution and implementation
- Role of public prosecutors in the implementation of human rights
- The basic human rights in the trial
- The right for defense in the Egyptian criminal legislations
- International cooperation in the protection of human rights
- International treaties and conventions on human rights
- International prospective in the implementation of human rights
- Women rights and CEDAW
- Human rights in wars and armed conflicts
- Judicial implementation of human rights
- Human rights in the Egyptian constitution
- Supreme Constitutional Courts and human rights
- Human rights in criminal litigation
- Role of the public prosecution in inspecting prisons and the basic principles in the treatment of prisoners
- United Nation's rules in the protection of juveniles
- Human rights under the Emergency Law
- Fighting corruption
- Role of the civil society in supporting human rights
- Egyptian culture and human rights
- Role of the NCHR in the protection of human rights
- Obstacles towards Egypt's fulfillment of its obligations under international treaties on human rights
- Egypt's position on international and regional treaties and conventions on human rights; the reservations and reasons
- Balance between human rights and public interest, and the impact of the exceptional circumstances in light of September 11<sup>th</sup> events.
- International Criminal Court

---

<sup>20</sup> See Table 4 attached.

<sup>21</sup> The list of topics was compiled by the Consultant from the report submitted from the Office of the Public Prosecutor.

- Human rights, national security and development
- Role of State Council in the protection of human rights
- Development of the relationship between International Human Rights Law and the national judiciary
- International criminal justice and its role in the protection of human rights
- Comparative study of the statutes of the international criminal courts
- Case study from ICTY
- Rights of the defendant during investigation
- The role of the Central Bank in fighting corruption
- International humanitarian conventions
- Investigating crimes against public funds
- Harmonization of national legislations with the UN Convention against Corruption
- New International trends to fight corruption
- Comparative study between UN Convention against Corruption and national legislations
- International cooperation in fighting corruption
- National mechanisms to fight corruption
- Assessment of the performance of the national mechanisms mandated to fight corruption
- The role of the Integrity and Transparency Commission on fighting corruption

Total number of trainees in all 30 training courses is 978 with an average number of participants in every course of 33 participants; therefore it is recommended that the maximum number of public prosecutors in each course do not exceed 24.

The average number of training days is 3 while the average number of training hours in every course is 6 per day with no practical training offered at the Basic Course.

Each participant received Pre and Post evaluation sheets. The focus in both sheets was on the evaluation of the training itself. It is recommended that the Pre and Post evaluations focus more on the level of knowledge on human rights. This will enable BENAA and the beneficiary institutions to assess the impact of the training on the participants.

The curriculum and publications used for the Basic Training courses are the same in all training activities for public prosecutors. They include lectures on the above-mentioned topics. The curriculum and publications used for Advanced Training are the same in all advanced training activities.

It is recommended that BENAA appoints a national expert to assist the project in the development of all curriculums.

The Consultant also interviewed a number of BENAA Alumni public prosecutors in order to assess the effectiveness of the training and its impact.<sup>22</sup> Most of those interviewed expressed high level of satisfaction with the programme and the practical training offered in the Advanced Courses which was described as very productive and motivating. The following observations were gathered during the focus group:

- Lack of practical training in the Basic Courses;

---

<sup>22</sup> For details of the meeting with public prosecutors *see* Annex 7, Questionnaires.

- No focus on gender issues. It is noteworthy that Alumni did not show interest on the topic, however it was noted by their leadership that curricula should include gender issues related to the work of public prosecutors;
- BENAA needs to provide the participants with more material similar to the ones offered by other projects such as AOCJ Project administered by USAID;
- There is a need for TOT to spread the culture of human rights between all prosecutors;
- BENAA should train its own staff on “Best Practices in the Design and Management of Training Programs”

No interviews or contact with the Alumni was made following completing the training courses.

### **Workshops for Administrative Prosecutors**

Between January 2007 and June 2009, BENAA conducted 25 training courses for 852 Administrative Prosecutors (*See table 5 attached*). The average number of participants in every Basic Training Course is 62 which is very high and does not assist the expert in delivering the information to the participants; therefore it is recommended that the maximum number of administrative prosecutors in each course do not exceed 24.

The average number of training days is 3 for all courses. The average number of training hours in every course is 6 per day with no practical training offered at the Basic Course.

The publications used for Basic Training on Human Rights are the same ones used for public prosecutors. It is recommended that BENAA appoints a national expert to assist the project in the development of all curriculums.

The Consultant interviewed a number of Alumni Administrative Prosecutors at BENAA facility. There was good level of satisfaction among the Alumni on the training, and it was stated by all of those interviewed that the training increased their knowledge of human rights despite the fact that most of the topics were a bit far from their specialty as administrative prosecutors except the Advanced Courses on corruption as the nature of their work involves high number of cases of administrative corruption.<sup>23</sup>

Basic Courses did not include any practical training on human rights cases; moreover, not all the participants in the Advanced Courses received Basic Course on Human Rights. In reply to this, BENAA Administration stated that sometimes they have no control over the nomination of participants when the leadership at the targeted institution decides to send fresh participants to the Advanced Courses.

The practical training at the Advanced Courses was described as excellent and motivating; however the curricula did not include enough topics on the basic human rights and there was no focus on gender issues or rights of any of the vulnerable groups; nevertheless, the training helped upgrading their knowledge on human rights.

No interviews or contact with the Alumni was made following completing the training courses.

The Consultant also enquired about the study tour that was conducted in July 2009 for the distinguish Alumni. The overall assessment is that it was well-managed and the participants benefited allot from meeting their counterparts in foreign countries. It was also noted that

---

<sup>23</sup> For more details and info on the focus groups with Administrative Prosecutors *see* Annex 7, Questioners.

exposing them to other experiences was very motivating, however, human rights was not the focus of the study tour.

### **Workshops for Police Officers**

During the course of this mission, the Consultant, accompanied by representative of UNDP, met with senior officials at the MoI who expressed satisfaction on the results achieved by BENAA. During 2006, BENAA held 16 Basic Training Courses for 663 police officers and 4 awareness sessions for 4614 students of the Police Academy. Average number of participants in the officers courses was 41 and the average training days is 5. Average number of participants in the awareness session is 1153. During 2007, the project held 22 Basic Training Courses, 4 Specialized Courses and 4 awareness sessions for Students of the Police Academy.<sup>24</sup> Average number of trainees in each Basic Training Course was 39 and 21 in the Specialized Courses and 225 in the students' sessions. During 2008, the project held 18 Basic Training Courses, 10 Specialized Course, 5 awareness sessions for students of the Police Academy and 10 awareness sessions for police sergeants. Average number of trainees in each Basic Training Course was 34 and 15 in the Specialized Courses, 425 in the students' sessions and 57 in the awareness sessions for sergeants. During 2009, the project held 18 Basic Training Courses, 8 Specialized Course and 26 awareness sessions for sergeants. Average number of trainees in each Basic Training Course was 37 and 23 in the Specialized Courses and 55 in the training courses for sergeants. These training courses helped increasing the knowledge of human rights between all the trainees. Moreover, the training had a positive impact on the behavior of the police officers who participated in all previous training courses.

It is highly recommended that the average number of participants in the training courses for police officers do not exceed 24 for the basic training and 14 for the advanced and specialized courses. It is also noteworthy that the overall average number of participants in all sessions for police sergeants and students was too high; 56 and 336; however this is justified as the purpose of those events was to increase the awareness rather than training seminars.

The average number of training days is 2 while the average number of training hours in every course is 6 per day with no practical training offered at all Basic Course.

The curricula for the Basic and Advanced courses for police officers included the following topics:<sup>25</sup>

- Introduction to human rights
- Protection mechanisms for human rights
- Role of police officers and personnel in the implementation of human rights
- Criminal protection for human rights
- Protection of security without violating human rights
- Protection of Human rights as a mechanism to fight terrorism
- Human rights in the Egyptian traditions and customs
- Citizenship and human rights
- The basic human rights in the trial

---

<sup>24</sup> See Table 6 attached.

<sup>25</sup> The list of topics was compiled by the Consultant from the reports provided to him by BENAA.

- The prohibition of Torture in the Egyptian Legislations
- The Egyptian experience in human rights
- The development of the police officer's image to the citizens
- Citizen's rights before the law
- Human rights in the International treaties and conventions
- Rights of the defendant during investigation
- Egypt's obligations under the international treaties and conventions on human rights
- The phenomenon of trafficking in persons and its negative impacts
- Human rights from constitutional prospective
- Penal philosophy in the Egyptian legal system
- Rights of women in the trial and prison
- International and regional mechanisms in the protection of human rights
- Minimum standards for the treatment of prisoners
- Child rights in correctional facilities
- The negative impact for torture on those who use it
- Fighting terrorism as a mechanism to protect human rights
- The civil society and human rights in Egypt
- Human rights cases
- Role of the civil society in supporting human rights
- International efforts in the prevention of all forms of trafficking in persons
- The trafficking in persons phenomenon in the international law
- The role of police officers in fighting trafficking in persons
- The national strategy in combating trafficking in persons
- The social and economic impacts of trafficking in persons
- The role of civil society organizations in combating trafficking in persons

The curriculum and publications used for Basic Training on Human Rights are the same in all training activities for police officers. They include lectures on the above-mentioned topics. The curriculum and publications used for Advanced Training are the same in all advanced training activities.

The Consultant interviewed 18 BENAA Alumni police officers including 3 females and inquired about the effectiveness of the training and its impact.<sup>26</sup> Most of those interviewed were satisfied with the programme; however they had a number of observations including:

- Lack of motivation and practical training in the Basic Courses;
- All lectures in the Basic Courses were theoretical and sometimes far from the participants' specialization;
- No lectures on:
  - o The impact of international treaties on national legislations;
  - o Gender issues or rights of any of the vulnerable groups. Female police officers interviewed expressed concerns about the lack of any topics on rights of women and their rights in the Egyptian society;
  - o Best practices on how the police officer should treat citizens;
  - o Human rights in criminal procedures;

---

<sup>26</sup> For details of the meeting with police officers *see* Annex 7, Questionnaires.



- International standards on the role of police officers in protecting human rights;
- Rights of police officers;
- The social and psychological aspects in the protection of human rights;
- Role of the media in the protection of human rights.
- Course duration need to be extended with less lectures every day in order to give room for discussions and practical training;
- Some of the lectures were repeated more than once which created a negative atmosphere in the meeting room;
- The average number of participants in some of the courses was above 35 which does not enable the expert to communicate with every participant;
- Curriculum of each training course should be tailored according to the specialty of the participants, moreover, when selecting officers for training courses, there is a need to make sure all of them are at the same rank and level of education i.e. those with PHD degree should not be in the same course with those with only law degree;
- No materials offered to all Alumni except one book that includes theoretical interventions;
- There is a need for TOT Programme to spread the culture of human rights between all police officers all over the country;
- Rules of selecting experts need to be amended as some of the experts were not competent or experienced enough to deliver the training. Moreover, there is also a need to use experts from outside the MoI such as academics and judges as this will help bringing in other expertise which would be very beneficial to police officers;
- No follow up with Alumni after completing the course.

### **Workshops for Family Courts**

Between April 2008 and March 2009, BENAA conducted 16 training courses for 40 judges and prosecutors of Family Courts and 814 social workers of the Court.<sup>27</sup>

Average number of participants in every training course for the social workers was 54 with an average number of 2 training days and 6 training hours per day. It is recommended to increase the number of judges and public prosecutors trained at Family Courts provided that the number of participants in such training courses should not exceed 24. Here, it is imperative that BENAA coordinates with the National Council for Childhood and Motherhood as it is already conducting training for judges and prosecutors of the Family Courts.

The Consultant did not receive copies of the agenda; therefore it was not possible to evaluate the content of the curriculum and publications used.

### **Workshops for Lawyers**

The targeted number for lawyers is 750; however, between August 2006 and April 2009, BENAA conducted 20 training courses for 1109 lawyers.<sup>28</sup>

Average number of participants in every training course for the lawyers was 55 with an average number of 2 training days and 6 training hours per day. It is recommended that the average number of participants in such training courses do not exceed 24. It is also noteworthy that the

---

<sup>27</sup> See Table 7 attached.

<sup>28</sup> See Table 8 attached.

last 5 courses were held in 2009 for Women Lawyers only with a total of 91; however, between August 2006 and December 2007, another 173 Women Lawyers participated in the first 15 training courses.

The curricula for the Basic and Advanced courses for police officers included the following topics:<sup>29</sup>

- The constitution and human rights
- The law profession between the theory and practice
- Protection mechanisms for children in prison
- The international instruments and national legislations
- The law profession and human rights
- The political and ethical dimensions to human rights cases
- The Status of the League of Arab States and human rights
- The lawyer's role in human rights cases
- The Arab Charter on Human Rights
- Round table discussion on legislations and international instruments.

The curriculum of the Advanced Courses is different from the Basic Courses and the topics were carefully selected. The Consultant recommends that sessions should be dedicated for practical training and moot trials if possible. It is also suggested to add the following topics to the curricula:

1. The role of lawyers in the implementation and protection of human rights principles
2. The United Nations Basic Principles on the Role of Lawyers (Adopted by the Eighth United Nations Congress on the Prevention of Crime and the Treatment of Offenders, Havana, 1990).
3. Regional standards on the role of lawyers
4. The right to defense and its implementation according to the Egyptian Constitution and legislations

The publications used for lawyers training are the same in all training activities for lawyers. They include lectures on the above-mentioned topics in addition to other topics on human rights such as the international instruments on human rights.

The Consultant interviewed 3 BENAA Alumni lawyers and inquired about the effectiveness of the training and its impact.<sup>30</sup> They expressed good level of satisfaction with the programme; however they had a number of observations including:

- Lectures in the Basic Courses are theoretical and “dry”;
- No lectures on rights of any of the vulnerable groups, human rights in criminal procedures, International standards on the role of lawyers in protecting human rights;
- No practical training at all sessions;
- Experts delivering the training are not all qualified for delivering such training;
- The average number of participants in most of the courses was above 30;
- No materials offered to all Alumni except one book that includes theoretical interventions;

<sup>29</sup> The list of topics was compiled by the Consultant from the reports provided to him by BENAA.

<sup>30</sup> For details of the meeting with police officers *see* Annex 7, Questionnaires.

- No follow up with Alumni after completing the course.

### 3.2. Human Rights Training for Other Sectors

In evaluating BENAA's activities in this sector between 2006 and 2009, the Consultant used the following key indicators to evaluate the performance in the training offered for legal professionals:

1. Quantitative Indicators:
  - a. No of attendees
  - b. Distribution of attendees from the media according to the field of work (TV, radio, press)
  - c. Geographical distribution of attendees
  - d. Total number of training hours for each group
  - e. No of meetings with university representatives
2. Qualitative Indicators:
  - a. Articles on the press after the training events
  - b. TV/radio programs speaking about HR
  - c. Pre and post Evaluation Sheets
  - d. Interviews with journalists
  - e. Participants' comments on training
  - f. Interviews with trainees

#### Media Personnel:

The targeted number for media personnel is 1800; however, between September 2006 and October 2009, BENAA conducted 43 training courses for 1009 media personnel.<sup>31</sup>

The curricula for the Basic and Advanced courses for media personnel included the following topics:<sup>32</sup>

- Human rights concepts
- The role of the media in general, and the press in particular in enhancing human rights principles
- Human rights and the concept of gender equality
- Women's image in the Egyptian press
- Right of expression in the framework of human rights principles and the Press Code of Honor
- Historical presentation for the development in Egyptian women's role in the press
- The role of the press in enhancing women rights
- Press coverage for women political and civil rights
- Press coverage for women social and economic rights
- How the Egyptian press handles women issues
- Women rights between international instruments and the Egyptian constitution
- The right to expression and respecting the privacy of others under the Egyptian constitution
- The right to expression and respecting the privacy of others under international instruments
- The opinion and the other opinion

<sup>31</sup> See Table 9 attached.

<sup>32</sup> The list of topics was compiled by the Consultant from the reports provided to him by BENAA.

- Mechanisms of enhancing and disseminating human rights in the Egyptian press
- Press coverage for human rights and publishing disputes
- The role of the National Council for Human Rights
- Egypt's report on human rights to the Human Rights Council in 2010
- The international conventions on human rights
- Mechanisms of the international human rights law
- Laws governing the Egyptian press (associated with practical training on the modalities of legal press)
- International reports on the assessment of the Egyptian press
- Human rights in the Egyptian press
- Addressing human rights cases in the Egyptian press
- Gender equality and the role of the press in enhancing the principle of equality and social justice
- Human rights and psychological health in the Egyptian press
- The role of the press in the development of the society

The average number of participants in every course is 24 participants, and the average number of training days is 2 and a half days while the average number of training hours in every course is 6 per day with no practical training offered at the Basic Course except for some courses, as mentioned by the Alumni interviewed.

Within the Media Sector, the curriculum of the different targets was tailored according the needs of each group. For example, contents of the training for journalists were different from NGOs, diplomats and CSOs. The topics included for every group was carefully selected but the agenda lacked any reference to practical training. As for publications and reference material, The Consultant reviewed the only one publication used for all training courses for media personnel; Human Rights and the Media. It was produced in 2003 and reprinted several times during 2007 and 2008. It includes lectures on the above-mentioned topics.

The Consultant interviewed 4 BENAA Alumni journalists; they expressed good level of satisfaction with the programme and the content of the training which resulted in positive impact on their daily work; moreover, it was evident that the training helped increasing their awareness on human rights in general and their duties as journalists and the rights of individuals Vs. the right to publish in particular. One of the participants presented two samples of her writing after receiving the training.<sup>33</sup>

It was noted that the duration of the training is short with no practical training offered during the Basic Courses. Furthermore, the material distributed was limited, and in some cases, some of the subjects taught at the Advanced Courses were repeated from Basic Courses. In addition to that, there was no follow up with the Alumni after the completing the training course.<sup>34</sup> A number of observations were also gathered during the interview including:

- All lectures in the Basic Courses were theoretical and sometimes far from the participants' specialization;
- No lectures on the right to believe, gender issues or rights of any of the vulnerable groups.

<sup>33</sup> See Annex 11, Sample Articles in Newspapers.

<sup>34</sup> For details on the focus group with media representatives, see Annex 7, Questionnaires.

- The average number of participants in some of the courses was above 30 which turned the training course into a class room.
- No materials offered to all participants except one book that includes theoretical interventions.
- Some of the experts were not competent or experienced enough to deliver the training.

It is noteworthy that, on 2-3 February 2009, BENAA held training course on Women's Rights in the Egyptian Media. The topics selected were of great importance and the selection of experts was very good; however, it is important in such activities to include NGOs to deliver parts of the training in order to benefit from their practical experience.

On 7 October 2009, the Consultant visited training site for media personnel where 33 journalists including 12 females were receiving basic training on human rights. The training took place at Pyramisa Hotel and the participants were split between 2 meeting rooms set up in small round tables where every 6 journalists shared one table. Two Admin assistants were monitoring the training in both rooms. According to the agenda of the training course, only 2 experts delivered the training for each group for the entire duration of the course.

Each participant received one book; Human Rights and Media as well as the project's CD including 9 of the publications produced between 1999 and 2008. No training manual, documents or copies of the lectures were given to the participants.

### **Workshops for Women<sup>35</sup>**

While BENAA did not integrate gender and women rights generally in the topics and did not hold any training activities for women as described in page 9 of the Project Document, they were very keen to have women participants in all sectors. In one hand, as stated above, the project held special training for journalists on Women's Rights in the Egyptian Media where topics and experts were carefully selected. On the other hand, the project held 4 training course for Women Lawyers only. The attached special report on Gender discusses all matters related to gender in greater details.

### **Students**

Between April 2007 and June 2009, BENAA conducted 64 training courses for 3149 students and 12 awareness sessions for 5888 students. Average number of participants for the students' courses is 49 and the average for the awareness sessions was 490 students per session.

During the course of this mission, the Consultant met with students representing different training courses. The students expressed high level of satisfaction with the training provided by BENAA. Discussions with the students showed increase in the knowledge of human rights, however, they indicated that there was no practical training and the materials provided were very limited; moreover, there was no follow up training session which they needed very much.<sup>36</sup>

---

<sup>35</sup> The gender report includes more details on women participation in the various courses.

<sup>36</sup> For details on the focus group with students, *see* Annex 7, Questionnaires.

It is noteworthy that BENAA conducted these training courses and awareness sessions for various groups of students at universities and higher institutes as well as students at summer camps. Due to time constraints, the Consultant was only able to interview students of the Higher Institute for Social Service.

The curricula for the Basic Courses for students included the following topics:<sup>37</sup>

- Introduction to human rights
- Human rights concepts and principles
- The Universal Declaration for Human Rights; brain storming
- The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
- The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
- The international mechanisms for the protection of human rights
- National protection for human rights
- The special protection for vulnerable groups (women, children, political refugees and persons with special needs)
- Youth rights
- Youths' role in the development and enforcement of human rights
- Human rights cases (Dialogue and workshops)
- Future of human rights in the Arab region
- Culture and social privacy and human rights policies
- The relationship between terrorism and human rights
- Terrorism; its reasons and dimensions
- Human rights in religions and fighting terrorism
- Citizenship and terrorism
- Citizenship and human rights
- Protection of Human rights as a mechanism to fight terrorism
- Human rights in the Egyptian strategy to fight terrorism
- The effects of terrorism on development and society
- The role of NCHR and CSOs in disseminating the culture of human rights

### **Training of Teachers at the Ministry of Education**

BENAA did not conduct any activities targeting teachers at the Ministry of Education

### **Diplomats:**

The Project Document signed in July 2005 did not include training of diplomats; however BENAA conducted 5 training courses for 142 junior diplomats at the seat of the Diplomatic Institute.<sup>38</sup> Average number of participants is 28 per training course, and the average number of training days is 3 while the average number of training hours per day is 6.

The Consultant was unable to interview any of the diplomats however he attended half of the first day of the fifth course where Prof. Ahmed Al Rashedy, Professor of Law at the Faculty of Economics and Political Sciences at Cairo University, delivered a lecture on the International

<sup>37</sup> The list of topics was compiled by the Consultant from the reports provided to him by BENAA.

<sup>38</sup> See Table 10 attached.

Humanitarian Law then he engaged with the participants in a broad discussion covering the intervention as well as other issues on the international arena.

Each one of the participants received 3 books; the International Penal Justice and Human Rights, and two volumes on the International and Regional Standards on Human Rights and Criminal Justice. The participants also received the project's CD including 9 of the publications produced between 1999 and 2008. No training manual, documents or copies of the lectures were given to the participants; therefore it was not possible for the Consultant to assess the contents of the curriculum.

The curricula of the five courses included the following topics:

- The international humanitarian law
- The international human rights system
- The role of the National Council for Women (NCW) in involving women in development and planning
- The role of the National Council for Human Rights (NCHR) in the protection of human rights in Egypt
- The role of the National Council for Childhood and Motherhood (NCCM) in the protection of the right of child
- The International Criminal Court
- The role of the civil society in the protection of human rights
- The international humanitarian law
- Human rights in the Egyptian culture
- Right of women and child in Egypt
- The role of national councils in the protection of the rights of women and child
- The status of human rights in Egypt between the reality and hopes
- The comprehensive periodical review in the Human Rights Council in 2010
- Enhancing the capacity of diplomats in dealing with human rights issues
- Establishing and developing the International Human Rights Council and its mechanisms.

### **Parliamentarians**

BENAA conducted 10 training courses for 144 staff members of the Shura Council and People's Assembly (*See table 11 attached*).

Average number of participants in every training course was 14 with an average number of 2 training days and 4 training hours per day.

The curricula of the five courses included the following topics:

- What is needed from the Parliament in the field of human rights?
- What is needed from the parliamentary researchers to support MPs performance in the field of human rights
- Social and psychological aspects in human rights
- Women rights in Egypt
- How to read the international reports on human rights
- Status of human rights in Egypt
- Legal framework for human rights
- Electronic research in human rights issues
- Human rights in reports of international and regional organizations on human rights

- Human rights component in parliamentary reports
- Practical training: How to respect human rights in my work at the Parliament?

It is recommended that the curricula include the following three topics:

- Introduction to human rights
- Human rights concepts and principles
- Comparative experiences and best practices, i.e. the role of the European Parliament in the protection of human rights.

### **The Central Agency for Organization and Administration (CAOA)**

BENAA conducted 5 training courses for 1546 staff members of CAO (See table 16 attached). Average number of participants in every training course was 309 with an average number of 3 training days and 3 training hours per day.

The curricula of the five courses included the following topics:

- The role of the National Council for Human Rights
- Women and Development
- Egyptian Legal mechanisms to combat corruption
- International and Regional mechanisms to combat corruption
- Administrative Corruption
- The role of the Central Bank in combating corruption and in human rights

The training did not include any lectures on human rights in general; therefore it is recommended that the curricula include interventions on the introduction to human rights, and human rights concepts and principles.

### **3.3. Enhancing the Human Rights Culture, Knowledge and Publications**

In evaluating BENAA's activities in this target, the Consultant used the following key indicators for evaluation:

1. Quantitative Indicators:
  - a. Number of publications produced and the quality of the contents
  - b. Number of meetings
  - c. Number of participants
2. Qualitative Indicators:
  - a. Comments from stakeholders on the quality of material and content
  - b. Comments of curriculum from Egyptian Universities representatives
  - c. Participants' inputs on agenda and training; recommendations from CSO
  - d. Selection criteria of candidates
  - e. Inputs from receiving institutions on candidates

### **Dissemination of Information on Various Human Rights Issues through Publications**

The Consultant received a list of the publication produced by BENAA including 16 different publications. Out of that number, the Consultant received the following 8 publications:

1. International Penal Justice and Human Rights (2008)
2. International Standards of Human Rights and Public Freedoms in the Egyptian Judiciary, Vol. 2 (2007/2008)



3. A Study on the Egyptian Legal System and Principles of Human Rights (2005)
4. Police and Human Rights (2004/2005)
5. Human Rights in Law and Practice (2003)
6. Human Rights and Media (2003)
7. International Standards and the Guarantees of Human Rights Protection in the Egyptian Constitution and Legislations (2002)
8. International Standards for Public Prosecutors and Police Officers (2000)

The Consultant examined the above mentioned publications and found that:

1. Six publications were produced before 2006 –N. 3 to 8- therefore they could not be considered as part of the activities to be evaluated; however, according to BENAA administration, they were reprinted several times during 2007 and 2008 and distributed between the participants.
2. Seven out of them were prepared mainly for the Judiciary and Police Sectors while one was prepared for the Media Sector in 2003 and reprinted in 2006.
3. Seven out of them did not include any of the international or regional instruments on human rights while only one -International Penal Justice and Human Rights- included some references and related international instruments, however these documents were printed in the publication as annexes using its original format from the source including UN documents.
4. No publications or training manuals received for any of the other targeted groups.
5. The contents of all publications were lectures delivered during the course of the project and none of them included any reference for practical training during the various courses except one -International Penal Justice and Human Rights- which was originally prepared for Advanced Courses.

On the other hand, In September 2009, BENAA started to develop an electronic newsletter that is distributed between the alumni, the media and human rights practitioners. The Consultant received the newsletter by email. It highlights the previous and future activities and includes a competition for journalists and Students on the best articles on women rights. The visibility of the donors, especially their logos, was very clear at the last page of the newsletter. The Consultant recommends that the newsletter is produced on regular basis and includes –in every edition- one page on one of the most important instruments on human rights and Egypt's position from that instruments i.e. signature, ratification, reservations and implementation.

Another successful mean of outreach was the documentary film produced by BENAA. The film included the history of the project as well as explanation of its objectives and progress. According to BENAA Administration, the film was distributed in several occasions including the commemoration of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights.

### **Assist in the Curriculum Development of Egyptian Universities to Include Various Human Rights Issues**

BENAA participated in one seminar focusing on the development of university curriculums to include human rights issues. The seminar took place on 17 August 2009 in cooperation with the American University in Cairo and focused on teaching human rights in Egyptian universities. It

was indicated that BENAA will continue working with the American University in Cairo on this regard but the Consultant did not receive any information on this regard.

### **Dialogue with CSOs on Human Rights Issues and Promote Public Awareness**

BENAA conducted 24 training courses for 644 staff members of Egyptian NGOs.<sup>39</sup> The average number of participants in every training course was 27 with an average of 2 training days per course and 5 training hours per day.

The curricula of the Basic Courses included the following topics:

- International system of human rights
- Human rights' obstacles in the Egyptian society
- The Universal Declaration for Human Rights; brain storming
- The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights "Part I"
- The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights "Part II"
- The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
- The protection mechanisms for human rights
- The role of NGOs and CSOs in disseminating the culture of human rights

It is recommended that the curricula include a practical training component in all sessions. Such training is necessary for NGOs especially in the implementation of the different rights. It is also suggested that the curricula include the following topics:

- Citizenship and human rights
- International humanitarian law
- Rights of the vulnerable groups especially women and children.

As for CSOs, the Project held a number of activities aiming to disseminate the culture of human rights. For example, on 15-17 March 2009, the project held special training targeting for CSOs on rights of the elderly. The topics selected were of great importance and the selection of experts was very good. The Consultant interviewed 2 Alumni and it was evident that the training left a positive impact on them and increased their knowledge on the rights of elderly people in the Egyptian constitution and legislations.

### **Commemoration of the Universal Declaration of HR**

In commemoration of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights for the year 2008, BENAA signed 4 Protocols of Cooperation to celebrate the human rights day. The first protocol was signed with the United Nations' Information Center to celebrate the human rights day through a competition for journalists. 15 topics on human rights were identified and all journalists were invited to present their work. Financial prizes were awarded to the top winners as well as authors of good articles/ pieces published in newspapers during 2008.

The second protocol was signed with Bedaya Foundation for Youths. 150 youths leaders were invited to attend an awareness session on the Universal Declaration of Human Rights where they received 3 lectures and then they were invited to write papers/ researches on human rights. The top 10 were awarded financial prizes.

---

<sup>39</sup> See Table 12 attached.

The third protocol was signed with Al Ahram Regional Press Institute to celebrate the human rights day through a competition for journalists. 15 topics on human rights were identified and all journalists were invited to present their work. Financial prizes were awarded to the top winners as well as authors of good articles/ pieces published in newspapers during 2008.

The fourth protocol was signed with the Faculty of Economics and Political Sciences to hold an awareness session for students of Egyptian Universities on the Universal Declaration of Human Rights.

In addition to the above, BENAA held a celebration in cooperation with Al Ahram newspaper on 16 December 2008 where academics and experts were invited to celebrate the human rights day.

### **Organization of Competitions for media persons**

In addition to the two above-mentioned competitions in relation with the celebration of the human rights day, BENAA also signed 4 protocols of cooperation to organize competitions for journalists. The first protocol was signed with the Higher Council for Press to hold 2 annual “on line” competitions on human rights. All media personnel in Egypt were invited to participate and financial prizes were awarded to the winners. BENAA also organized 2 competitions between journalists participating at 2 different training courses in Oct 2008 on human rights issue.

The second protocol was signed with Al Ahram Regional Press Institute to organize a competition for journalists on human rights. Financial prizes were awarded to the tops 3 winners; best article, best report and best caricature.

The third protocol was signed with Nesf Eldonia Magazine in 2008 to organize a competition on women rights between journalists and students of the final year at the Faculty of Media. The top 4 journalists and 4 students were awarded financial prizes. The fourth protocol was also signed with Eldonia Magazine in 2009 for the same purpose.

#### 4. EVALUATION FINDINGS

This section of the report is organized in response to the tasks mentioned in the Terms of Reference (TOR).

##### **Project Relevance**

##### ***The relevance of the project for Human Rights Capacity Building for human rights practitioners***

In general, the project responded to the objectives and priorities areas set out in the Project Document. BENAA has adequate target groups in general, based on the fact that the legislative and judiciary bodies, law enforcement agents and other targets, have never before been exposed to Human Rights doctrine and practice in a systematic manner; moreover, BENAA has not lost any of its relevance and reached its target group efficiently and, at the same time, we found very few instances where responsibilities and targets were not met; therefore we conclude that the project goals were to a considerable extent realized. A large number of human rights practitioners in most of the targeted beneficiaries received basic training on human rights principles and concepts which helped to upgrade their knowledge and increase their awareness on human rights issues.

There have been some observations on important issues such as the high number of participants at training courses; lack of training material and handouts, limited publications, lack of follow up with trainees, lack of effective monitoring mechanisms and BENAA's organizational structure which needs specific attention. The Consultant will deal with these issues separately in greater details in the Recommendation Section, however, the consultant would like to stress that the project under evaluation do respond, to a good extent, to local human rights concerns and needs as it is the only project in Egypt with access to all law enforcement agencies, and it has been providing training on human rights for a number of years which led, irrespective of the above mentioned observations, to an increase in the awareness of all those who received the training. As a consequence, senior officials interviewed at OPP, MoI and MoFA indicated that there is a need to extend the Project as it is one of the very important tools to implement the Government's plan to enhance the human rights situation in Egypt. The Recommendations Section will provide suggestions on how to overcome these observations and assist the project to achieve its goals.

##### **Effectiveness**

##### ***The impact of external and internal factors on the effectiveness of the project in building capacity for the community of human rights practitioners in Egypt.***

Although a definitive answer is difficult to achieve over the entire time span because the targets set in the Project Document covered very wide area, however it was evident during all focus groups that participants effectiveness in their human rights work have increased. The project has delivered a reasonable number of outputs (304 training courses for 10898 law enforcement agents and human rights practitioners in addition to 131 awareness sessions for 20370 staff members of CAO, police sergeants and students at the various Egyptian universities including the Police Academy. This leads to concluding that a large number of human rights practitioners in every targeted beneficiary received basic training on human rights principles while selected

participants joined Advanced Courses and were qualified to participate in the 5 study tours organized by BENAA.

While some of the goals were not met such as the training of regular judges, judges of the Supreme Constitutional Court, teachers and the Authority of Administrative Control, some of the goals were unrealistic and based on too optimistic assumptions especially with regard to the possibilities for training such high number of media personnel on human rights during the life time of the project, i.e. 1200 within 3 years. The recommendation section in this report discusses, in details, some suggestions for BENAA to achieve better results.

In addition to the above, senior officials at OPP and MoI praised BENAA's efforts and indicated that public prosecutors and police officers benefited from the training and were able to use the knowledge of human rights in their work. It is evident that the training provided by the Project helped increasing the awareness of human rights and enhanced the human rights culture within these two very important law enforcement agencies. And as a direct result for such positive human rights culture, a dedicated Department for human rights was established at the Office of the Public Prosecutor. This department is responsible for receiving complains concerning violations of human rights not only related to prosecutors themselves, but it also covers investigating all kinds of violations of human rights.

Another similar indicator for the impact of the project on the MoI is establishing Human Rights Office at every MoI directorate in all governorates. Citizens now can file complaints related to human rights violations. The Consultant believes that this would not have happened without the MoI engagement with BENAA in training all officers, including those at very important departments such as Training Dept, police stations and State Security on human rights.

On the individual level, the training provided by BENAA was one of the main reasons behind the dramatic decrease which took place in the number of complaints filed against public prosecutors related to violations of human rights. Moreover, the Alumni prosecutors interviewed showed very high level of respect and understanding of human rights. They were also able to demonstrate high level of understanding of the relationship between the international standards and norms of human rights and the national legislations.

As for police officers, those who were interviewed gave multiple examples as to how they benefited from the training. One of the examples was given by a Deputy Sheriff at Upper Egypt where he applied what he learnt at the course on all suspects once he returned to his office and he has been keen on respecting human rights. Another example was given by a police officer at the Training Dept indicating that he used the information he received in most of the training activities he has been working on. A third example was given by a female police officer who indicated that she has been very careful when dealing with women suspects and juveniles.

Another increase in the effectiveness of trainees in their human rights work was also observed between journalists. The Consultant collected sample articles published in newspapers for BENAA Alumni journalists; they applied their learning in their work which showed increase in respecting human rights.

## Impact

### ***What has been the impact of project activities on the awareness and capacity development of the target groups?***

In general, impact is difficult to measure in the government, and there has simply not been sufficient time for the Consultant to implement a full range of assessment; however he met with senior officials at most of the targeted beneficiaries and received good feedback on the quality of the training provided by BENAA.

In all the training courses and awareness sessions for which this information is available, more than 30.000 persons have been directly involved with the Project. This seems to be a lot, but can be comprehended better by explaining that there were a couple of beneficiaries with very high number of participation; students and the police sergeants. Leaving these two targets aside, the number of people reached indirectly condenses to about 11.000 persons –still quite an impressive number- with an average of 36 people per course.

Again on average, there were persons from 10 law enforcement agencies and institutions concerned with human rights involved in BENAA activities.

On the evaluation side, currently BENAA has only one monitoring and reporting officer that was appointed few months ago. Our review of the system put in place, the files, interviews and focus groups showed no efforts to undertake systematic evaluation of the impact and results of the training. Here, it is noteworthy that OPP is doing a better job than most in evaluating the impact of the training on its own staff members. Though BENAA is doing a great effort in increasing the knowledge of human rights practitioners in Egypt, it must develop mechanisms that measure effectiveness and impact. If it does not translate that into a more professional work product, the training goals might not be achieved.

***On the question if BENAA is likely to engender sustainable enhancement in the human rights culture in Egypt*** the Consultant considers that there is a strong likelihood of sustainable continuation of benefits produced by the Project. The reasons for which are as follows:

- Strong commitment to supporting this Project has been evident at all beneficiary institutions;
- The observations noted on the project are mostly easy to tackle and needs better planning and organization.
- The majority of the proposed activities are inherently sustainable.

It is important to note that the project will be even more effective and sustainable if the evaluation's recommendations are followed for the next phase. Meanwhile, it is imperative to conclude that the sustainability of enhanced human rights culture will depend for the near future on whether the donors choose to continue to provide support. This is due to the fact that public and administrative prosecutors and police officers participating in BENAA are undoubtedly better equipped and their effectiveness in their work is increased, according to their own assessment. Therefore, without the donors support, the increased knowledge of human rights and the existing human rights culture, irrespective of their current strength, will, at least, not improve especially in light of the lack of basic training for those law enforcement agents upon their appointment. The sustainability of this enhanced human rights culture also depends on the

cooperation of the targeted institutions; however, there is little on the horizon that would suggest that any of them would stop cooperating with BENAA.

BENAA should consider TOT as an important element in project sustainability. This will be discussed in greater details in section 6 of this report.

### **Visibility and outreach of the Project**

Visibility in terms of donors' logos and knowledge of their identity was clearly observed in all BENAA's stationery, publications, posters, and competitions for media personnel. Moreover, for the most part, donors' logos and identity were clearly seen by the consultant on banners used at training sites, BENAA offices, etc.

The Project is also visible in the Egyptian human rights community. BENAA news is often in the newspapers especially concerning the training of police officers country wide on human rights. This leaves good impression in the Egyptian society that police officers are provided training on human rights.

On the outreach, the Project is well known in Egypt at law enforcement agencies and academic institutions; however there have not been enough efforts on the outreach especially in light of the absence of media expert at BENAA. Moreover, there is no cooperation with national centers concerned with human rights such as the National Council for Human Rights (NCHR), the National Council for Childhood and Motherhood (NCCM) and the National Council for Women (NCW). On the International level, BENAA signed MoU with United Nations Interregional Crime and Justice Research Institute (UNICRI) to train law enforcement agents as well as organizing study tours to Italy. Moreover, UNDP, on behalf of the project, is in the final stage of liaising with the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) to benefit from their experience in producing human rights training manuals and training law enforcement agencies on human rights and the implementation of international instruments on the national level.

## 5. LESSONS LEARNT

The Consultant identified a number of lessons learned, which have been applied in this evaluation mission.

These lessons have included:

- Administration of Criminal Justice Project (AOCJ) administered by USAID, which can be used constructively in the design of the training programmes, not simply at the designing level, but also relative to the implementation, training manuals, publications and the monitoring and evaluation mechanisms. In one hand, AOCJ training programmes are designed in a very efficient and dynamic way and the impact is measured bilaterally with the Office of the Public Prosecutor. On the other hand, AOCJ training manual corresponds to the international standards, and it meets the needs of public prosecution. In addition to that, AOCJ publications are very creative and well produced. It was indicated by H. E. the General Public Prosecutor that BENAA's publications should be updated and the quality should be enhanced similar to AOCJ publications.
- ICRC training programme in the field of human rights, which can be used in demonstrable long-term sustainability in relation to training of the trainers at the beneficiary institutions to guarantee sustainability of the positive human rights culture and continuous transfer of knowledge within these institutions. It was noted by senior officers at MoI that they highly appreciate ICRC efforts in training police officers to become trainers for their colleagues. Currently, 11 police officers became highly qualified trainers in the field of International Humanitarian Law and they are the ones delivering the training on that topic to police officers as well as other law enforcement agents.
- Insan Project administered by the National Council for Human Rights; in particular relative to the need to liaise strongly with other ongoing projects/ initiatives in the field of human rights in Egypt. Insan project made bilateral agreements with the concerned National Centers in order to avoid overlapping in the training targets and/ or training contents. Another lesson learned from Insan Project was maintaining the focus of the Project on the targets indicated in its Project Documents therefore it was obvious for Insana to achieve its goals.



## 6. RECOMMENDATIONS

Bearing in mind the importance of BENAA project and the desire expressed by all targets to extend the project, the recommendations will focus on what might be most helpful to those charged with designing the next phase of BENAA.

### Design of the Training Programmes:

In designing and managing BENAA's programmes, the Consultant recommends that BENAA adopts the Logical Framework Approach which elegantly weaves together top-down and bottom-up approaches to project management. This approach has significant value for any size of project as it helps identify the exact steps to be taken and the expected results.

The framework of the Logframe Matrix (*shown in figure 1 below*) cross-references seven key areas of the project to ensure that the key questions are asked:

- **Goal** - what results do we expect?
- **Purpose** - why are we doing this?
- **Outputs** - what are the deliverables?
- **Activities** - what will we do to deliver the outputs?
- **Indicators of Achievement** - how will we know we've been successful?
- **Means of Verification** - how will we check our reported results?
- **Risks and Assumptions** - what assumptions underlie the structure of our project and what is the risk they will not prevail?

The answers to these questions are put into a Logical Framework Matrix (Logframe) and become the output of the logical framework. The Logframe is a four by four matrix, shown below:

**Figure 1**

<b>Log-frame Matrix</b>			
Project Summary	Indicators of Achievements	Means of Verification	Important Risks and Assumptions
Goals			
Purpose			
Outputs			
Activities			

It is necessary that beneficiary institutions participate in the project design and needs assessment as well as log-frames and indicator formulation. Absence of such participation usually leads to little or no sense of ownership of the overall project.

As for the training methodology, the Project needs to adopt a special methodology to allow more participation and interactive activities subject to continuous monitoring and evaluation. It is recommended that BENAA's training activities are divided into Units. Each Unit consist of 2 groups each includes 120 trainees for duration of 10 weeks. Each group should be divided between 5 sub-groups. For every week, one sub-group receives 3 days of training, i.e. Saturday,

Sunday and Monday for sub-group 1 from Group 1 and the following week sub-group 1 from Group 2 receives training on Saturday, Sunday and Monday. At the end of the training Programme, 2 participants of every sub-group should be invited to a focus group with the concerned Head of Sector to evaluate the entire Programme.

The top 14 participants from all sub-groups should be invited to participate in Advanced Courses.

It is also recommended to hold a second focus group 2 months after the conclusion of the programme. The top 2 participants of every sub-group should be invited and evaluated on the same Post Evaluation Sheet that was given to them at the end of the training course.

Beneficiary institutions should also participate in the evaluation and focus groups; therefore the Project should share copies of the Post and Evaluation Sheets with the beneficiary institutions in order to assess the performance of its own staff members.

It is imperative that the mode of conduct of Basic Courses is interactive. Resources persons should prepare in advance topics and case studies that are of relevant to the specific target group. The purpose is to engage participants in discussion to apply the human rights values and principles in their specific context. It is also suggested that an international consultant with experience on human rights training programmes is recruited to provide an external advice which could consolidate the training needs.

### **Training Contents**

Based on the discussions with BENAA Alumni and the beneficiary institutions, a common comment was made related to the need of updating the manuals distributed through the trainings; therefore, it is recommended to recruit an external consultant(s) to provide inputs on updating reference material for the training courses.<sup>40</sup>

Currently the situation in the Police Sector is that a bulky publications/ text books are being distributed to all participants in the different courses. The publications are a mere compilation of lectures delivered in training courses that took place in 2004 and 2005. This said, it is recommended that the Project produces new training manuals and include the related international instruments on human rights. Moreover, it is important that different modules/ training manuals are produced for the different targets according to their field of specialization. For example, training manual for officers of the Dept of Correction should be different from those of the Training Dept or officers at police stations.

The issue is a little bit different for the Media sector and in particular as far as CSOs and journalists is concerned. For those two targets, the Consultant received and reviewed several hard copies of lectures used in previous courses as reference material. The Head of the Sector indicated that the project did not produce an ad hoc material for this target.

The situation seems to be different for the judiciary sector for which the Consultant received 3 publications produced for this target; however, it was noted by Alumni Public Prosecutors that the quality of publications was poor comparing to the training material offered by other projects in the same field.

---

<sup>40</sup> See Annex 9, Consultative Note provided by PMU TA, P. 3.

For all courses, it is recommended to develop specialized training manuals for the different target groups (judges, public prosecutors; administrative prosecutors; prison police officers; police officers in police stations; police sergeants; lawyers; etc). In this regard, the Consultant fully supports UNDP plan to coordinate/ partnership with OHCHR to request the Egyptian authorities to use OHCHR training materials in any future capacity building for law enforcement agencies especially judges, public prosecutors and police officers.

It is also suggested that an Arab speaking consultant with experience on human rights is recruited to provide an external advice which could consolidate the needs of BENAA training activities. The output of the consultancy could be used for the next phase of the project.

### **Monitoring and Reporting**

The heads of the 3 sectors are the ones currently responsible for monitoring all training activities including distribution and collection of Pre and Post Evaluation Sheets. This seems to be inefficient as, in some cases, training courses for different targets within the same sector overlapped which does not allow the Head of the Sector to monitor all activities personally. Moreover, based on the discussions with all heads of sectors, there is no one consolidated monitoring system for all sectors. Here, the Consultant recommends that BENAA adopts the monitoring system identified by PMU earlier as a tool to effectively monitor all activities.

It is also noteworthy that the current BENAA Unit responsible for monitoring and reporting consist of 1 programme officer assisted by 2 admin assistants. The Unit has been established in the second half of 2009 and still under establishing. The Consultant interviewed the officer in charge of the Unit and was informed that, at that time, work was under going to compile all data and information and loading it to the system; therefore it was not possible to evaluate the Unit. Nevertheless, realizing the important role of this Unit, it is recommended that the number of its staff should be increased to at least 4 officers. One officer should be responsible for each of the three sectors while the fourth should be responsible for supervising and the production of the reports which the others should follow on the monitoring of the training.

Monthly coordination meetings should be forecasted to bring together this Unit with Heads of Sectors. Whilst this Unit is responsible for monitoring the project activities, it should also be responsible for the Pre and Post evaluation of the participants as well as implementing the following evaluation mechanism which will enable the project to accurately assess the impact of the training:

- Each participant should be evaluated twice; once at the beginning of the training course and once at the end.
- At the end of every training course, the beneficiary institutions should receive copies of the Pre and Post Evaluation Sheets. This way each institution will be able to internally assess the impact of the training on its own staff members.
- A focus group should be held every 3 months to bring together small number of BENAA Alumni representing various courses in the same sector. In order to actually measure the impact of the training, the participants in this focus group should be given the same Post Evaluation sheet they received at the last day of the training. Accurate results/ indicators on the impact of the training should be received from such exercise.

- The moderator(s) of the focus group, assisted by the concerned Head of Sector should then engage with the participants in an open discussion to assess the training and its impact on them and their profession in general. The outcome of such discussions will be extremely beneficial when designing future training course.
- The participants should be asked to identify the best and worst element in the training. This shall enable BENAA to identify possible means for developing the Project.
- Each institution should be invited to participate in this focus group and submit a report on the impact of the training on its own staff members.

### **Impact assessment**

In light of the difficulties to assess the impact of the project on the targets especially government agencies, the Consultant recommends that special mechanism is put in place to better assess the impact of the various activities conducted. It is also recommended that indicators are identified in advance in order to realistically assess the impact; moreover, this process has to be done in close cooperation with the targeted institutions.

### **Collaboration with International Organizations**

Realizing the important role that OHCHR plays worldwide in the field of human rights education, the Consultant recommends to strengthen the relationship between BENAA and OHCHR. The consultant also supports the initiative led by UNDP to study the possibility of using OHCHR manuals for training Egyptian law enforcement agents. This shall increase their awareness of the international norms and standards and their implementation on the national level.

It is noteworthy that BENAA is currently cooperating with UNICRI in training Egyptian Law enforcement agents on human rights as well as organizing study tours to Italy. The Consultant recommends that BENAA also cooperate with other international organizations. For example, realizing the importance of protecting children from violence, exploitation and abuse as well as their rights to survival, growth and development, BENAA should collaborate with the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) in Cairo to increase the awareness of law enforcement agents, media personnel, lawyers and human rights practitioners on these very important rights. Such collaboration is extremely important for BENAA in order to benefit from UNICEF's experience especially in training of law enforcement agents on the implementation of international instruments on the right of the child on the national level, i.e. the Convention on the Rights of the Child, the Millennium Declaration, and numerous international human rights agreements.

BENAA should also collaborate with the United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM). For example, on December 18<sup>th</sup>, the international community will celebrate the 30<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) which was adopted 30 years ago, on 18 December 1979; therefore, BENAA should organize a celebration in cooperation with UNIFEM to celebrate the 30<sup>th</sup> anniversary of CEDAW and the 10th anniversary of the Optional Protocol to the Convention, which empowers the CEDAW Committee to hear complaints of rights violations brought by individuals. BENAA could also benefit from UNIFEM's experience in mainstreaming gender issues in its activities as

well as to advice on the best training methodology for law enforcement agents and human rights practitioners on women's rights.

As for study tours and external training, it is recommended that BENAA collaborates with more international institutions and research centers besides UNICRI as this will expose law enforcement agents to more experiences. For example, BENAA could cooperate with the International Academy for Leadership in Gummersbach, Germany in the training of NGOs, CSOs and lawyers. Moreover, BENAA could also cooperate with the International Institute for Higher Studies in Criminal Sciences of Italy (ISISC) in the training of judges of the State Council and staff members of the Law Suit Authority. In this regard, the donors shall assist BENAA to identify the best credible institutions to partnership with.

### **BENAA Organizational Structure**

The Project is lead by one National Coordinator; Ambassador Ahmed Haggag. He is assisted by one Executive Assistant. The National Coordinator attends the opening of most of the activities either inside or outside Cairo; moreover, he supervises/ monitors the entire work load of all sectors and participates in the planning and implementation. The term "National Coordinator" is not common in Egypt and does not give any indication to the multiple tasks/ duties and responsibilities it assumes; therefore the Consultant suggests changing the title into "Project Director".

Currently the project is structured in a way that 23 of the staff work on admin and financial related matters while only a core of 9 persons are working on the operational/programming matters. Five out of those are mostly concerned with the coordination of the training courses. The current organizational structure and the need to focus more on the analytical and qualitative aspects of the trainings lead to suggest that before the end of the project an organizational expert is recruited to provide a feedback on a proposed revised structure which could be implemented in the next phase. The organizational expert recommendation will help in fine tuning the staff costs needs which in the current phase were over estimated and required a rider to the project financial.<sup>41</sup>

There is also a need to appoint a media specialist at BENAA. The specialist should be responsible for putting a comprehensive plan to increase the awareness about the project itself as well as best practices for similar projects concerning outreach. Moreover, the media specialist should also develop new ideas to increase the awareness of civil servants on human rights. It is also recommended to hire a gender specialist at BENAA to develop specific gender and women rights content within each of the specialized and targeted manuals relevant that is applicable and relevant to the specific target group. This expert shall also assist in developing the BENAA vision and strategy to mainstream gender and women rights in their capacity building in human rights.

There is also a need to provide advanced training for BENAA operational and programming officers on best practices in designing training programmes.

---

<sup>41</sup> *Id.*

### **Training of Law Enforcement Agents**

Law enforcement agencies play an important role in spreading the human rights culture in Egypt, therefore the following ideas could be adopted by BENAA:

- Number of participants at the Basic Training course for should not exceed 24 in each course. Similarly, the number of participants at the Specialized Courses should not exceed 14.
- Curricula should be tailored to correspond to the needs of every agency. For example, for officers of the Department of Correction, the curricula should focus more on the rights of inmates, rights of women prisoners, rights of the child, UN Guidelines for the Prevention of Juvenile Delinquency (The Riyadh Guidelines of 1990), the UN Basic Principles for the Treatment of Prisoners (1990), Code of Conduct for Law Enforcement Officials (1979) and the Basic Principles on the Use of Force and Firearms by Law Enforcement Officials (1990).
- There is also a need to produce a special training manual on human rights. The training manual should include hard copies of all interventions, copies of the related international and regional instruments, copies of the related Egyptian legislations/ provisions, case studies for practical training and evaluation forms.<sup>42</sup>
- Experts delivering the training should be selected from different institutions. In other words, BENAA should select academics, human rights practitioners and judges to deliver the training in order to bring in different practical experiences that could be beneficial to police officers
- Practical training component should be included to the curricula of the basic training on human rights. This component could take the form of small working groups inside each training seminar and present a case to the participants to deliberate about it then each group presents the case and its solution. Another form of practical training is holding workshops that would bring together representatives of the various law enforcement agencies to discuss practical problems and share opinions and solutions.
- It is necessary to increase the number of training courses for public prosecutors with a particular focus on those outside Cairo and in rural areas.

### **Training of the Trainer Programme (TOT)**

Taking into consideration the importance of strengthening the capacity of law enforcement agencies in human rights which is dealt with during this project, it is suggested that the project focus on training qualified cadres of each of the beneficiary law enforcement agencies to become trainers in the field of human rights. TOT would guarantee the sustainability of the positive culture on human rights inside all law enforcement agencies, in addition to continuous transfer of knowledge and dissemination of the human rights culture within all institutions.

The main objective of this TOT Programme is to provide the participants with sufficient knowledge and skills to enable them to train fellow law enforcement agents in the field of human rights, and - at the same time - to enable them to acquire special skills needed in managing training programmes in their own agencies.

---

<sup>42</sup> See Annex 10, AOCJ training Manual for public prosecutors.

The main beneficiaries of this programme should be the Ministry of Justice (MoJ), OPP, MoI, and Bar Association. Maximum number of participants in each TOT should not exceed 15 persons (3 persons from each of the above-mentioned agencies). And as the success quota usually does not exceed 60% in such training programmes, we recommend therefore that 6 persons from each beneficiary should receive this special training. In order to cope with this, the same programme will be repeated twice; this would guarantee that each of the main beneficiaries will have at least 4 well qualified trainers at the end of the project. In case any of the targeted institutions chooses to receive this training independently, the number of participants should not exceed 10 at each programme.

Each programme will be achieved in 45 days divided between three phases. The first phase of each programme should focus on increasing the capacity of participants on human rights. It should contain:

- Theoretical lectures dealing with definitions, general principles and concepts;
- International and regional instruments on human rights;
- Egypt's treaty commitments and the enforcement of international and regional standards on the national level;
- International and regional mechanisms for the protection of human rights;
- Special training on the rights of vulnerable groups including women, children, disabled people;
- Practical training sessions;
- Training methods sessions: dealing with promoting training skills, ways of communication with the trainees and the concerned organs, and designing training programmes

The second phase should focus on preparing the participants to be trainers, and the training methods sessions should be designed in a way that shall give the participants enough practical knowledge about:

- **Preparing the training:**

- Analysis of the training needs
- Objectives of training.
- Framework of content.
- Methods of training.
- Technological facilities.
- Training plan.

- **Providing the training:**

- Presence skills.
- Observation skills.
- Listening skills.
- Questioning skills.

- **Evaluation of the training:**

- What to evaluate
- How to evaluate.
- Who to evaluate.

- When to evaluate.

The third phase should take the form of practical training by a certified recognized training institute abroad. The purpose of such external training is to enable the participants to meet their counterparts and exchange experiences with them. Moreover, they should be able to monitor actual training activities and review evaluations of similar training activities.

In order to achieve the above mentioned goals, BENAA should cooperate with highly qualified experts from Universities and the specialized national centers. In addition to this, BENAA should elaborate a detailed evaluation/assessment system to gauge the success of each training session, and to evaluate the whole programme in form of pre/post test.

### **Number of Participants**

Bearing in mind that the events conducted for students and police sergeants involve high number of audience as the nature of such events is to increase the awareness of such groups on the basic principles on human rights, statistics indicate that the average number of participants in all 304 training courses between 2006 and 2009 is 36 per seminar; therefore it is necessary to limit the number of participants in all training seminars to 24 participants at the most. Training courses involving more than 24 participants usually do not achieve its targets as the expert(s) lose the personal contact with the participants.

The number of participants at the Advanced Courses should also be decreased to a maximum of 14. This shall help the experts and participants to engage in a more interactive dynamic dialogue/discussions throughout the course.

It is recommended that the above mentioned numbers are not to be exceeded otherwise the training will not reach its goals and the event will take the form of class room which is not productive on all levels.

### **Training of NGOs and CSOs**

Selection of sub-contractors and experts to deliver the training should be based on more institutionally based measures. It is recommended that BENAA uses available expertise and institutions in the field of human rights rather than using independent consultants who cannot bring in-depth experience similar to those of human rights organizations based in Egypt. There is also a need to add practical training component to the curriculum of the basic training on human rights. This component could take the form of small working groups inside each training seminar and present a case to the participants to deliberate about it then each group presents the case and its solution.

### **Rights of Vulnerable Groups**

It is recommended that more focus should be given in the Basic Courses to the rights of the vulnerable groups such as children, women and disabled people. This could be achieved by dedicating one session for this topic in every training course along with distributing material and references including the conventions on the rights of the various vulnerable groups.

There is also a need to give more focus on Women rights. Dedicated training courses for women should be conducted in order to educate different groups on their rights in the Egyptian



Constitution and laws and encourage them to actively participate in local elections. The curricula should be more gender sensitive irrespective of the composition of the group receiving the training.

### **Experts' Selection Criteria**

It is beyond doubt that BENAA was successful in selecting most of the experts to deliver the training in all sectors. BENAA's list of experts includes distinguish professors at all major academic institutions in Egypt as well as experts in the field of human rights. Therefore, it is recommended that BENAA appoints more human rights practitioners to deliver the training to combine between the theory and practice. It is also recommended to invite international experts and resource persons to participate in the training programmes to enhance exposure and learning especially for law enforcement sector.

There is also a need to put together a set of rules and procedures for the selection of resource persons/ experts and sub-contractors to deliver the training. This is related to another need to create a data base for all experts and lecturers with specific TOR for every topic according to the area of specialization and the needs of every sector. The TOR for resource persons/experts should reflect specific responsibilities such as presentation of handouts and reading material; preparation of case studies or topics to ensure interaction and dialogue with participants in the training especially in the Basic Training courses.

It is also recommended that BENAA conducts coordination meetings for the experts selected for each training course in order to avoid any overlapping or duplication in the subjects taught. In these meetings, special focus should be given to the importance of practical training and discussions during the courses as well as preparing case studies and distributing handouts.

### **Role of the Media**

It is recommended to enhance the role of media in the implementation through comprehensive media coverage. As described above in the "BENAA Organizational Structure" section, this could be done through recruiting a full time media specialist to assist BENAA in formulating a comprehensive plan to increase the awareness about the project itself including outreach of the project, moreover, the media specialist should also develop new ideas to increase the awareness of civil servants on human rights.

There is also a need to increase the number of competitions made for the media personnel. The competition could be done on monthly basis which will motivate more journalists to participate which will lead to publishing more items in the newspapers on human rights.

BENAA conducted 3 training courses for staff members of the Egyptian Radio & TV Union; 2 in late 2006 and one in April 2007; therefore it is recommended that BENAA conducts more training courses for them.

### **Role of NGOs**

NGOs constitute an important element in the human rights culture in Egypt; therefore they should be given more positive role in the project. This role could include the following:

- Involving NGOs in the planning of BENAA's next phase. This could be done by forming a committee from active NGOs that already received training in the current phase to

review the curricula and decide on the topics that need to be amended, added and/ or omitted;

- Enhance the role of NGOs inside BENAA's Advisory Board;
- Sub-contracting credible NGOs to implement BENAA training activities for other NGOs, media personnel, students and CSOs.

**Annex I: Terms of Reference****Terms of Reference****Mid-Term Project Evaluation**

**Project Title:** Human Rights Capacity Building Project (BENAA)

**Post Title:** Short-term Consultant to conduct Mid-Term Project Evaluation

**Duration:** 20 August through 19 October 2009

**Deadline for Application:** 7 June 2009

**Background**

**Project Duration:** January 2006 – June 2010

**Project Budget:** US\$ 6,015,986

**National Counterpart:** Human Rights Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

**Partners:** EU, Ford Foundation, SIDA, Embassy of the Netherlands, Embassy of Norway, UNDP

**Beneficiary Partners:** Ministry of Interior, Ministry of Justice, Prosecutors' Office, Media, NGOs and others

The Government of Egypt emphasizes the principle of citizenship as a basis for equality in rights and duties and the elimination of all forms of discrimination (color, race, belief, etc) that guarantees respect for citizen's fundamental rights. The Human Rights Capacity Building Project (BENAA) aims to strengthen the capacity of the Egyptian Government and institutions in dealing with human rights issues. The purpose of the training activities carried out by the project is to familiarize Egyptians (at least 10% of the targeted community of Human Rights practice) with international standards on Human Rights and Egypt's treaty commitments and to provide educational materials so that officials and opinion leaders can disseminate this information and, when appropriate, include it in their own awareness and capacity building activities.

**Project Output:** Human Rights training for the community of Human Rights Practitioners, such as law enforcement sector, legislative sector, educational sector, media sector, CSO sector as well as the dissemination of Human Rights knowledge.

**Project Activities:**

1. Cairo-based training in Human Rights Issues

*Categories of participants:*

A1: Police Officers

A2: Prosecutors (General Prosecution, Administrative Prosecution, Administrative Control)

A3: Judges (Ministry of Justice, State's Council, Supreme Constitutional Court)

A4: Family Court members

A5: Media (Public and Private Media)

A6: Women's Groups

A7: Parliamentarians

A8: Lawyers

2. Training in Human Rights issues outside of Cairo

*Categories of participants:*

A9: Police Officers

A10: Prosecutors (General Prosecution, Administrative Prosecution)

A11: Judges (Ministry of Justice, State's Council, Supreme Constitutional Court)

A12: Family Court members

A13: Media (Public and Private Media)

A14: Women's Groups

A15: Parliamentarians

A16: Lawyers

A17: Publications about Human Rights issues

A18: Training of teachers/trainers at the Ministry of Education.

A19: Assist in curriculum development in Egyptian Universities to include various human rights issues.

A20: Dialogue with CSOs on human rights issues for them to promote awareness

A21: Provide Study Tours/ Scholarships on Human Rights

A22: Institutional Direct Support

## 2. Purpose of the Evaluation

The purpose of this mid-term evaluation is four-fold:

- to ensure the relevance and effectiveness of the project for Human Rights Capacity Building for human rights practitioners.
- to assess whether the human rights training has increased the effectiveness of trainees in their human rights work and how they have applied their learning in their respective organizations
- to identify lessons learned and best practises and advise on ways to further enhance the capacity of the project in building capacity for the community of Human Rights practitioners in Egypt
- to share experiences and best practices with the community of international human rights practitioners and provide evidence for the relevance of Human Rights promotion projects
- consider the achievements of the project in the light of similar initiatives in the Arab region

## 3. Evaluation Scope

In accordance with signed project document, the evaluation will assess the performance and achievements of the project at the **output level** namely *"Human Rights Training for the Community of Human Rights Practitioners such as law enforcement sector, legislative sector, educational sector, media sector, CSO sector, as well as the dissemination of Human Rights Knowledge"*. The evaluation will also assess the contribution of the project at the **Outcome Level** *"Human Rights Principles widely applied in Egypt"*. As such, the scope of this mid-term evaluation of the BENAA project covers the following:

- Assessment of the impact of external and internal factors on the effectiveness of the project in building capacity for the community of human rights practitioners in Egypt;
- Design and implementation of the Human Rights training programmes for the different sectors (law enforcement sector, legislative sector, educational sector, media sector, CSO sector etc.) in terms of: content, methodology, training materials, curricula, facilitators and trainers, logistical arrangements and special events
- Evaluate the strategy of the project in promoting the culture of Human Rights in terms of training HR, study tours, knowledge management, outreach and partnership building
- Assessment of the Impact of project activities on the awareness and capacity development of human rights practitioners in the area of human rights
- Visibility and outreach of the project

The evaluation exercise will assess the performance of the project based on the following criteria: Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency and Sustainability.

#### **4. Evaluation Outputs/Deliverable**

- ***Evaluation Inception Report***: An inception report should be prepared by the evaluator before going into the full fledged evaluation exercise. It should detail the evaluator's understanding of what is being evaluated and why, showing how each evaluation question will be answered by way of: a) proposed methods, b) proposed sources of data, and c) data collection procedures. The inception report should include a proposed schedule of tasks/ activities and deliverables. The inception report provides the partners and the evaluators with an opportunity to verify that they share the same understanding about the evaluation and to clarify any misunderstanding at the outset.
- ***Draft Evaluation Report***: The draft evaluation will be presented in a formal meeting to the project partners for review and comments.
- ***Final Evaluation Report***: The final report will be presented in a formal meeting to the project partners (A template is attached as annex hereto).

#### **5. Evaluation Methodology**

The evaluation process will include key Government counterparts, donors, civil society, media and UN agencies, as well as beneficiaries and facilitators of the training. Such broad-based participation will be necessary to enhance ownership of results and the credibility and transparency of the evaluation exercise. The evaluation methodology will be based on the following:

- Desk Review of all substantive documentation including the Project Document; Project Progress Reports, knowledge products, Monitoring Report by the EC etc.
- Discussions and interviews with Government counterparts, donors, namely the EU, Ford Foundation, SIDA, the Embassy of the Netherlands and the Embassy of Norway, UNDP as well as civil society organizations and other development partners as appropriate
- Meetings with the Project Director and the project team
- Focus group discussions with BENAA Alumni, participants in training programmes and with facilitators
- Visits to and participation in training programmes conducted by the project
- Initial impact assessment of the project activities on the target beneficiaries through the development of a questionnaire(s), conduct of limited survey and analysis of findings

#### **6. Composition and Required Competencies of the Evaluation Team**

The evaluation will be led by a national consultant, who will identify additional consultants for support as need may be, including a gender specialist. ToR for each consultant will be prepared by the lead consultant; He/she should have advanced knowledge of judiciary/human rights and of educational methodologies and techniques related to promoting the culture of and building capacity in human rights. The lead consultant should have an M.A. degree and 15 years of experience preferably in judiciary/human rights or in a related field.

The team of consultants is comprised of five short term consultants to support the impact assessment regarding the training for:

- Public prosecutors
- Ministry of Justice
- Ministry of Interior
- NGOs

**NB: This is an independent project evaluation and candidates applying for this short term consultancy should not have had any prior working relationship (whether directly or indirectly) with the project**

## **7. Implementation Arrangements and Time Frame**

BENAA and UNDP will facilitate and obtain appointment with different stakeholders as deemed necessary by the consultant. The coordination of the evaluation process and the proposed work plan will be decided upon with the consultant. The time frame for the evaluation will be approximately 30 working days. The evaluation exercise is expected to start immediately.

## **8. Terms of Payment**

The remuneration for the consultancy is US\$ 20.000 to be paid in three tranches:

- 20% upon signature
- 40% upon presentation of the draft report
- 40% upon presentation of the final report

**Kindly submit your CV to Ms. Mai Abdel Rahman at [mai.abdelrahman@undp.org](mailto:mai.abdelrahman@undp.org)**

**Annex 1:****Ethical Code of Conduct for UNDP Evaluations**

Evaluations of UNDP supported activities need to be independent, impartial and rigorous. Each evaluation should clearly contribute to learning and accountability. Hence, evaluators must have personal and professional integrity and must be guided by codes of conduct of their business.

*In this respect, evaluators:*

- Must present information which is complete and fair in its assessment of strengths and weaknesses so that decisions or actions taken in the future are well founded
- Must disclose the full set of evaluation findings along with information on their limitations and have this accessible to all affected by the evaluation with expressed legal rights
- Should protect the anonymity and confidentiality of individual informants. They should provide maximum notice, minimize demands on time, and respect people's right to privacy and right to not engage. Evaluators must respect people's right to provide information in confidence, and must ensure that sensitive information cannot be traced to its source. They should inform participants about the scope and limits of confidentiality. Evaluators are not expected to evaluate individuals, and must balance an evaluation of management functions considering this general principle

**Evaluations sometimes uncover evidence of wrongdoing. Such cases must be reported discreetly to the appropriate investigative body.** Evaluators should consult with other relevant oversight entities when there is any doubt about if and how issues should be reported.

- Should be sensitive to beliefs, manners and customs and act with integrity and honesty in their relations with all stakeholders. In line with the UN Universal Declaration of Human Rights, evaluators must be sensitive to and address issues of discrimination and gender equality. They should avoid offending the dignity and self-respect of those persons with whom they come in contact in the course of the evaluation. Knowing that evaluation might negatively affect the interests of some stakeholders, evaluators should conduct the evaluation and communicate its purpose and results in a way that clearly respects the stakeholders' dignity and self-worth
- Are responsible for their performance and their product(s). They are encouraged to deliver a clear, accurate and fair written and/or oral presentation of study limitations, findings and recommendations
- Should reflect sound accounting procedures and be prudent in using the allocated resources of the evaluation.



**Annex II: Work Plan**

United Nations Development Programme

**Mid-Term Project Evaluation**23<sup>rd</sup> August 2009

Prepared by: Khaled M. Ahmed

---

**I. Introduction**

---

This document presents the Work Plan for the Mid-Term Project Evaluation of the Human Rights Capacity Building Project (BENAA). It has been prepared pursuant to the *Terms of Reference for Mid-Term Project Evaluation* (the Terms of Reference), and in particular Section 7 *Implementation Arrangements and Time Frame* as follows:

*BENAA and UNDP will facilitate and obtain appointment with different stakeholders as deemed necessary by the consultant. The coordination of the evaluation process and the proposed work plan will be decided upon with the consultant.*

This Work Plan is based on the following information:

- Input from briefing with Mr. Mounir Tabet and Ms. Naglaa Arafa (UNDP) carried out by the Expert in Cairo;
- Input from briefing with BENAA Project Team;
- Project Progress Report received from the UNDP;
- Project documents and progress reports received from BENAA;
- External articles and general information concerning the status of human rights in Egypt;

- Preliminary meetings with governmental officials (including the Ministry of Justice (MoJ), Ministry of Interior (MoI), Office of the Public Prosecutor (OPP), Administrative Prosecution and media representatives);
- Preliminary meetings with international donors, and key local NGOs ;
- Site visits to training locations inside and outside Cairo.

## **II. Methodology**

---

### *1. Context*

The evaluation of the Project will be conducted in accordance with Sections 2, 3 and 5 of the Terms of Reference, and in regular consultation with UNDP Cairo, BENAA Project Director and Project Team and key stakeholders, in particular the Ministry of Justice, Ministry of Interior, Office of the Public Prosecutor, Administrative Prosecution, key NGOs and media officials.

### *2. Content*

The Expert identified a number of key elements that he intends to examine in the course of his enquiries. It is to be emphasised however that this Framework is to be viewed more as a tool for prior reflection and focus by the Expert, rather than a rigid “questionnaire” format to be applied with each interlocutor. In reality, the content of enquiries will be tailored to the specific role of each stake holder, since the Expert’s aims during the mission is to establish an open and creative dialogue with stakeholders, with a view to examine the relevance and effectiveness of the project for human rights practitioners and advise on how the training has increased the effectiveness of trainees in their human rights work and how they have applied their learning in their respective organizations.

### *3. Stakeholders*

The Expert, having at the time of writing already established strong contact with UNDP Cairo, other donors and the Project Team, will build on existing relationships to identify a broader range of stakeholders, and continue his enquiries through a series of targeted and comprehensive interviews.

These potential stakeholders include, in particular:

- Representatives of primary and secondary beneficiaries of the Project (including the Ministry of Justice, Ministry of Interior, Public Prosecution, Administrative Prosecution, key NGOs and media representatives).
- Representatives of donors implementing or having implemented projects in the human rights field in Egypt (UNDP and USAID);

- Representatives of inter-governmental organisations present in Egypt and working with issues in the human rights field (notably ICRC);
- Independent actors and observers (legal academics, private lawyers and others involved in the field of human rights).
- National human rights organisations and other members of civil society.

In general terms, the evaluator will adopt an “open enquiry” approach, seeking to establish areas of concern and possibilities. A key source of information will be other donors in the human rights field, with a view to gather lessons learned from their own prior experience.

In addition to the active interview and *tête-à-tête* inquiry method as outlined above, the Expert will conduct a parallel desk study, examining curriculum, progress reports, academic and other studies, as well as any other materials deemed relevant by the Expert or stakeholders.

#### 4. *Site visits*

A number of site visits are proposed as part of the assessment mission. These visits are specifically provided for in Section 5 of the Terms of Reference, and will form a crucial source of concrete information as to the progress of the project

Date	Site Visit	Objectives
26 August	MoI Training site	
30 August	OPP Training site	
8 September	MoJ Training site	
15 September	Assuit Training site	

#### 5. *Focus Groups*

The Terms of Reference specifically provide for the hosting of one or more focus groups discussions, as follows:

*Focus group discussions with BENAA Alumni, participants in training programmes and with facilitators*

The Expert will examine, in consultation with UNDP and BENAA, conducting focus group discussions with BENAA Alumni and participants in on-going training seminars, the objective of which would be to discuss their observations, suggestions, lessons learnt, prior to the drafting of the assessment report.

### **III. Work Programme**

---

The Work Programme is comprised of a List of Persons and Organisations that the Expert intend to visit or interview, together with a draft Schedule of Meetings that indicates when such interviews will take place.

#### *1. Division of Work*

The strength of the Expert and the Team of Consultants engaged to conduct the evaluation mission is their diversity and complementarity of skills and expertise. The Expert will be involved in all activities while they intend to capitalise upon this inherent strength by maintaining a close collaboration in all work outputs, and by conducting, to the extent possible, all interviews on a joint basis.

Throughout the mission, The Expert, as Team Leader, will act as the focal point for communications with UNDP Cairo and BENAA as well as all stake holders. Moreover, the Expert will be responsible for organising interviews that are not already pre-arranged by UNDP Cairo or BENAA.

Maintenance of minutes of meetings, and other day-to-day team outputs, will be divided between team members according to their specialization. Preparation of the weekly reports will be divided between the consultants according to the particular areas of expertise, and available working days for each Expert, but will otherwise be drafted on a joint basis with the Expert.

#### *2. Persons/ organisations to be visited*

The Expert, and the consultants according to their areas of expertise, will visit the person and organisations tabled below, and interviews conducted in accordance with the Methodologies outlined at

II. Note however that, as of the time of writing, this list of persons and organisations is subject to change, since some persons listed may not be available or willing to be interviewed during the mission. In addition, the field visits will provide an opportunity to meet with other stakeholders who may not be mentioned here, and whose details will be subsequently annexed to the Assessment Report.

Organisation	Contact	Title
United Nations Development Programme	Mr. Mounir Tabet	Resident Representative
United Nations Development Programme	Ms. Naglaa Arafa	Assistant Resident Representative
BENNA Project	H. E. Amb. Ahmed Hagag	National Project Coordinator
BENNA Project	Dr. Emad Awwad	Assistant Coordinator, Police Training Sector
BENNA Project	Ms. Arwa Khadr	Media & Civil Society Sector
BENNA Project	Mr. Ayman Rashed	Legal Assistant
EC Delegation	Mr. Nicola Bellomo	
Ford Foundation		
SIDA		
Embassy of the Netherlands	Tessa Terpstra	First Secretary
Embassy of the Netherlands	Gielan El Messiri	Senior Policy Advisor
Embassy of Norway		
Ministry of Foreign Affairs	H.E. Ambassador Wael Abo El-Magd	Assistant Minister
Ministry of Foreign Affairs		
Ministry of Justice	H.E. Mr. Osama Atawia	Assistant Minister
Ministry of Interior		
Office of the Public Prosecutor	H.E. Mr. Abdel Mageed Mahmoud	General Public Prosecutor

Office of the Public Prosecutor	Mr. Adel Zayed	Head of the Technical Office
Administrative Prosecution		
Arab Organization for Human Rights	Mr. Mohsen Awad	Secretary General
Arab Organization for Human Rights	Mr. Alaa Shalaby	Senior Advisor
Egyptian Organization for Human Rights	Mr. Hafez Abo Sea'da	Secretary General
	Mr. Hazem Mounir	
National Center for Human Rights	H. E. Amb. Mokhles Kotb	Secretary General
El Nakib Center for Training and Democracy Support	Mr. Salah Soliman	Chairman
	Dr. Nehad Abo El-Komsan	Secretary General
USAID		
ICRC	Judge Cherif Atlam	

### 3. Draft schedule

Below is the draft schedule of the mission. Note however that at the time of writing some interviews have not yet been fixed, and that this Schedule is therefore subject to change.

DATE	TIME	LOCATION
Thu Aug 20	10:00	Briefing at UNDP
	11:15	Mr. Salah Soliman El Nakib Center for Training and Democracy Support
	14:00	Office of Public Prosecutor
Sat Aug 22	10:00	Office of Public Prosecutor
	21:00	Mr. Mohsen Awwad

		Arab Organization for Human Rights
Sun Aug 23	11:00	Embassy of the Netherlands
	13:00	Judge Amr Abdel Moa'aty Ministry of Justice
Mon Aug 24	10:00	BENAA Administration
	12:00	BENAA Sector Leaders
Wed Aug 25	09:00	Amb. Ahmed Hagag
	11:00	Amb. Wael Abu El Magd
	12:30	Amb. Mokhles Kotb
Mon Aug 31	10:30	Focus Group with academics and Media
Tues Sept 1	10:30	Mr. Naser Amin Arab Center for the Independence of the Judiciary and the Law Profession
	12:30	Mr. Hafez Abo Seada Egyptian Organization for Human Rights
Wed Sept 2		Study Documents and reports
Sun Sept 6	11:00	Focus Group with public prosecutors
	12:30	Focus Group with Administrative Prosecutors
Mon Sept 7	11:00	Focus Group with NGOs
	12:30	Focus Group with Police Officers
Tues Sept 8	10:00	National Council for Women
	11:30	National Council for Children and Motherhood
	13:00	Presentation of Inception Report
Wed Sept 9		
Mon Sept 14		

Tues Sept 15	Visiting Assuit Training Site “Focus Group with Alumni and participants”
Wed Sept 16	
Mon Sept 29	
Tues Sept 30	
Wed Oct 1	
Thu Oct 2	
Sun Oct 4	
Mon Oct 12	
Tues Oct 13	
Wed Oct 14	Presentation of Draft Final Report
Thu Oct 15	<b>Drafting Assessment Report</b>
Sun Oct 18	
Mon Oct 19	
Tues Oct 20	
Wed Oct 21	
Thu Oct 22	Presentation of Final Report



**Annex 3: List of persons and organizations met during the evaluation****List of Persons Interviewed**

<b>Organization</b>	<b>Name/ Position</b>	<b>Date</b>
<b>GoE</b>	<b>Amb. Wael Abu Al-Magd</b> Ministry of Foreign Affairs Corniche El Nil Cairo, Egypt Tel.: Fax: Email:	26 August 09
<b>Donors</b>	<b>Mr. Mounir Tabet</b> Country Director UNDP 1191 Corniche El Nil, World Trade Center Cairo, Egypt Tel.: +202 22578 4840 Fax: +202 2578 4847 Email: <a href="mailto:mounir.tabet@undp.org">mounir.tabet@undp.org</a>	20 August 09
	<b>Ms. Nagla Arafa</b> Assistant Resident Representative UNDP 1191 Corniche El Nil, World Trade Center Cairo, Egypt Tel.: +202 22578 4840 Fax: +202 2578 4847 Email: <a href="mailto:naglaa.arafa@undp.org">naglaa.arafa@undp.org</a>	20 August 09
	<b>Ms. Tessa Terpstra</b> First Secretary Embassy of the Kingdom of the Netherlands 18 Hassan Sabri Street Zamalek, Cairo, Egypt Tel.: +202 2739 5582 Fax: +202 2736 5249 Email: <a href="mailto:tessa.terpstra@minbuza.nl">tessa.terpstra@minbuza.nl</a>	23 August 09
	<b>Ms. Gielan El Messiri</b> Embassy of the Kingdom of the Netherlands 18 Hassan Sabri Street Zamalek, Cairo, Egypt Tel.: +202 2739 5569 Fax: +202 2735 7928 Email: <a href="mailto:gielan.elmessiri@minbuza.nl">gielan.elmessiri@minbuza.nl</a>	23 August 09
<b>Project Partners</b>	<b>Amb. Ahmed Haggag</b> National Coordinator 1191 Corniche El Nil, World Trade Center Cairo, Egypt Tel.: +202 2794 1583	26 August 09

	<p>Fax: +202 2794 1540 Email: <a href="mailto:ahmedhaggag2002@yahoo.com">ahmedhaggag2002@yahoo.com</a></p> <p><b>Dr. Emad Awwad</b> Training Sector Manager Police Sector 1191 Corniche El Nil, World Trade Center Cairo, Egypt Tel.: +202 2794 1736 Fax: +202 2794 1540 Email: <a href="mailto:emad.awwad@hrp-undp.org">emad.awwad@hrp-undp.org</a></p> <p><b>Ms. Arwa Khadr El-Burai</b> Training Sector Manager Media and Civil Society Sector 1191 Corniche El Nil, World Trade Center Cairo, Egypt Tel.: +202 2794 1736 Fax: +202 2794 1540 Email: <a href="mailto:arwa.khadr@hrp-undp.org">arwa.khadr@hrp-undp.org</a></p> <p><b>Ms. Marian Samuel</b> Training Sector Manager Law Enforcement Sector 1191 Corniche El Nil, World Trade Center Cairo, Egypt Tel.: +202 2794 1736 Fax: +202 2794 1540 Email: <a href="mailto:marian.sam@hotmail.com">marian.sam@hotmail.com</a></p> <p><b>Judge Ayman Rashed</b> Legal Consultant Law Enforcement Sector 1191 Corniche El Nil, World Trade Center Cairo, Egypt Tel.: +202 2794 1736 Fax: +202 2794 1540 Email: <a href="mailto:ayman.rashed@hotmail.com">ayman.rashed@hotmail.com</a></p> <p><b>Ms. Radwa Hassan</b> Monitoring &amp; Reporting Officer 1191 Corniche El Nil, World Trade Center Cairo, Egypt Tel.: +202 2794 1736 Fax: +202 2794 1540 Email: <a href="mailto:radwamhassan@yahoo.com">radwamhassan@yahoo.com</a></p>	<p>24 August 09</p> <p>24 August 09</p> <p>24 August 09</p> <p>24 August 09</p> <p>26 August 09</p>
<b>Stakeholders</b>	<p><b>H. E. Mr. Abdel Mageed Mahmoud</b> General Public Prosecutor Dar El-Qadaa El Aly, 26<sup>th</sup> July Street Cairo, Egypt Tel.: +202 2578 3888 Fax: +202 2575 3800</p> <p><b>Mr. Adel Zayed</b></p>	<p>22 August 09 6 Sept 09</p>

	<p>Director of the Technical Office of the General Public Prosecutor  Dar El-Qadaa El Aly, 26<sup>th</sup> July Street  Cairo, Egypt  Tel.: +202 2574 1023  Fax: +202 2575 3800  Mobile: +202 10 1770 509  Email: <a href="mailto:zayed3011@hotmail.com">zayed3011@hotmail.com</a></p> <p><b>Brig. Essam El Bdaiwy</b>  State Security  Ministry of Interior  Cairo, Egypt</p> <p><b>Captain Haytham Osman</b>  State Security  Ministry of Interior  Cairo, Egypt  Tel.: +20 10 606 3686  Email: <a href="mailto:haytham.osman@yahoo.com">haytham.osman@yahoo.com</a></p>	<p>22 August 09 6 Sept 09</p> <p>09 Sept 09</p> <p>09 Sept 09</p>
<b>Sub-Contractors</b>	<p><b>Mr. Salah Soliman</b>  Chairman  El Nakib Center for Training and Democracy Support  70 26<sup>th</sup> Lebanon Square  Giza, Egypt  Tel.: +202 3344 1430  Fax: +202 3344 1433  Mobile: +20 10 6055 110  Email: <a href="mailto:salah_soliman9@hotmail.com">salah_soliman9@hotmail.com</a></p>	20 August 09
<b>NGOs</b>	<p><b>Mr. Mohsen Awwad</b>  Secretary General  Arab Organization for Human Rights (AOHR)  91 Merghani St., Heliopolis,  Cairo, Egypt  Tel.: +202 2418 1396  Fax: +202 2418 5346  Cell: +20 10 528 0069  <a href="mailto:Ala.shalaby@hotmail.com">Ala.shalaby@hotmail.com</a></p> <p><b>Mr. Alaa Shalaby</b>  Senior Advisor  Arab Organization for Human Rights (AOHR)  91 Merghani St., Heliopolis,  Cairo, Egypt  Tel (00202) 4181396 – 4188378  Fax (00202) 4185346  Cell 002 010 6488987  <a href="mailto:Ala.shalaby@hotmail.com">Ala.shalaby@hotmail.com</a></p> <p><b>Mr. Nasser Amin</b>  General Director  Arab Center for the Independence of the Judiciary and the Law  Profession (ACIJLP)  10 Mathaf El Manial Street  Cairo, Egypt</p>	<p>22 August 09</p> <p>22 August 09</p> <p>1 Sept 09</p>

	<p>Tel.: 02 25310027  Email: <a href="mailto:acijip@thewayout.net">acijip@thewayout.net</a>  Web site: <a href="http://www.acijip.org">www.acijip.org</a></p> <p><b>Mr. Hafez Abu Seada</b>  Secretary General  The Egyptian Organization for Human Rights (EOHR)  8/10 Mathaf El-Manial Street  Cairo, Egypt  Tel.: 02 23636811  Email: <a href="mailto:eohr@link.net">eohr@link.net</a>  Website: <a href="http://www.eohr.eg">www.eohr.eg</a></p>	1 Sept 09
<b>Specialized National Councils</b>	<p><b>Amb. Mokhles Kotb</b>  Secretary General  National Council for Human Rights (NCHR)  1113 Corniche El Nil,  Cairo, Egypt  Tel.: +202 2574 5830  Fax: +202 2574 7670  Email: <a href="mailto:nchr@nchr.org.eg">nchr@nchr.org.eg</a> and <a href="mailto:nchr-egypt@nchr-insan.org.eg">nchr-egypt@nchr-insan.org.eg</a></p> <p><b>Amb. Hussien El Sadr</b>  NCCM Advisor/ Authorizing Officer  National Council for Children and Motherhood (NCCM)  Cornice Al Maadi, Cairo, Egypt  Tel.: + 202 2524 0277  Fax: + 202 2528 2310  Email: <a href="mailto:Helsadr@NCCM-EU.com">Helsadr@NCCM-EU.com</a></p>	26 Aug 09
		08 Sept 09
<b>International Organizations</b>	<p><b>Judge Cherif Atlam</b>  Country Director  International Committee of the Red Cross (ICRC)  Jeddah Street  Giza, Egypt  Tel.:  Fax:  Mobile: +20 12 319 5402  Email: <a href="mailto:le_caire.cai@icrc.org">le_caire.cai@icrc.org</a></p> <p><b>Ms. Laura Gonzales</b>  Rule of Law Program Specialist  United States Agency for International Development  1/A Ahmed Kamal Street  New Maadi, Cairo, Egypt  Tel.: +202 2522 6822  Fax: +202 2522 7042  Mobile: +20 18 151 1335  Email: <a href="mailto:lgonzales@usaid.gov">lgonzales@usaid.gov</a></p> <p><b>Mr. Ahmed Zohny</b>  Human Rights Legal Advisor  Administration of Criminal Justice Project  63 Syria Street  Mohandssien, Giz, Egypt</p>	07 Sept 09
		17 Sept 09
		1 Oct 09

	<p>Tel.: +202 3304 7031 Fax: +202 3304 6964 Mobile: +20 10 193 0041 Email: <a href="mailto:azohny@aocj.org">azohny@aocj.org</a></p> <p><b>Mr. Sherif El Diasty</b> Legal Advisor Administration of Criminal Justice Project 63 Syria Street Mohandssien, Giz, Egypt Tel.: +202 3304 7039 Fax: +202 3304 6964 Mobile: +20 16 550 6945 Email: <a href="mailto:seldiasty@aocj.org">seldiasty@aocj.org</a></p>	1 Oct 09
--	--	----------

## Annex 4: Questionnaires

إستمارة تقييم دورات تدريبية حول حقوق الإنسان

- تاريخ الدورة التدريبية التي شاركت فيها:
- مكان إنعقاد الدورة:
- الجهة التي كانت تقوم بالتدريب:
- أسلوب العمل: (مُحاضرات) (تدريب عملي) (كلاهما)
- ما هي أبرز الموضوعات التي تم تدريسها؟  
—  
—
- هل كان هناك أية موضوعات ترى أنه كان من الضروري تدريسها؟  
—
- هل كان هناك إستفادة من الجانب النظري؟
- هل كان هناك إستفادة من التدريب العملي؟
- هل كان هناك مُحاضرات حول أي من قضايا المرأة؟ وهل كانت ذات تأثير على تغيير مفهومك حول دور المرأة في المجتمع؟  
—  
—
- هل كانت الدورة على مستوى توقعاتك؟
- هل ساهمت الدورة في تطوير مفهوم حقوق الإنسان لديك؟

- هل كان هناك أي تأثير للتدريب أو تعيُّ في طريقة أدائك لوظيفتك عقب المشاركة في الدورة؟
- هل كان هناك أية تواصل بينك وبين المشروع أو الجهة التي قامت بالتدريب عقب انتهاء الدورة؟
- إذا طُلب منك حضور دورة ثانية مُماثلة، ما هي تطلعاتك بالنسبة للمحتوى التدريبي أو أية مسائل أخرى؟

### استمارة تقييم دورات تدريبية حول حقوق الإنسان

- تاريخ الدورة التدريبية التي شاركت فيها: مكان إنعقاد الدورة:
- أسلوب العمل: (مُحاضرات) (تدريب عملي) (كلاهما)
- ما هي أبرز الموضوعات التي تم تدريسها؟  
—  
—  
—
- هل كان هناك أية موضوعات ترى أنه كان من الضروري تدريسها؟  
—  
--
- ما هو تقييمك للمحاضرات؟ (مقبول) (جيد) (جيد جداً)
- ما هو تقييمك للمُحاضرين بصفة عامة؟ (مقبول) (جيد) (جيد جداً)  
— أية ملحوظات خاصة بشأن المُحاضرين (سواء سلبية أو إيجابية):
- هل كان هناك إستفادة من الجانب النظري؟



- هل كان هناك إستفادة من التدريب العملي -إن وُجدَ-؟
- هل تم توزيع أية مراجع أو كُتبيات تحتوى على المعايير الدولية والإقليمية لحقوق الإنسان أثناء الدورة؟
- هل كان هناك مُحاضرات حول أي من قضايا المرأة أو حقوق الطفل أو أي من الفئات المُستضعفة؟ وهل كانت تلك المُحاضرات ذات تأثير على تغيير مفهومك حول دور تلك الفئات في المُجتمع؟
- هل كانت الدورة على مستوى توقعاتك؟
- هل ساهمت الدورة في تطوير مفهوم حقوق الإنسان لديك؟
- هل كان هناك أي تأثير للتدريب أو تعيُّ في طريقة أدائك لوظيفتك عقب المُشاركة في الدورة؟
- هل كان هناك أية تواصل بينك وبين المشروع أو الجهة التي قامت بالتدريب عقب انتهاء الدورة؟

- إذا طُلبَ منك حضور دورة ثانية مُماثلة، ما هي تطلعاتك بالنسبة للمحتوى التدريبي أو أية مسائل أخرى؟

## **Annex 5: Project response to the Evaluation**

### **Remarks and Observations of the Human Rights Capacity Building Project on the Final Report**

This document covers remarks and observations on the Final Report of the Mid Term Evaluation of the Human Rights Capacity Building Project – BENAA and Gender Analysis:

In the Executive Summary of the Report, it is noted in the conclusion that the Basic workshops should include a practical training component. It is worth mentioning that in every basic workshop there is a practical training which is the pre and post exams that cover the entire agenda of the workshop. This could be the only practical component since the objective of the basic workshop is to give actual idea about human rights and its application from different perspectives. Accordingly, three different lecturers in each day present their lectures on human rights. Meanwhile, they leave the floor for interactions and extensive discussions. Nevertheless, the in-depth practical components, such as working groups, case studies, and others are being applied in the advanced and specialized workshops, and that is what makes a difference between the basic and advanced/ specialized workshops (theoretical vs. practical).

The objective of the basic workshop is to give an idea on human rights and its application from different perspectives. The pre and post exams as well as discussion questions seem enough to be a kind of practical component in the basic workshop since the advanced and specialized workshops are mainly practical case studies, etc. Technical exams are conducted of approx 60 questions before & after the workshops that follow discussions.

The Report recommends that the number of participants in the basic should not exceed 24 and that of the advanced should not exceed 14 which although will entail more expense, the Project will try to implement in consultation with our partners. According to BENAA's mandate, the basic workshop aim to train as much Human Rights Practitioners in Egypt on the basic human rights principles in order to achieve the outcome in the Project document which states "*Human Rights to be applied in Egypt*", and thus participants do not need specialization in this very basic level, since BENAA just aims at spreading Human Rights knowledge and culture, while specialization should come in the advanced workshops helping the experts and trainers to engage in a more dynamic dialogues and discussions.

It is also stated that the "*course material should be tailored according to the needs of every sector*". It is important to pinpoint that BENAA tailors the material even within the same sector,

i.e., the agenda of police officers of Investigation units is different from the agenda of the police officers for prison wardens, and the agenda designed for Public Prosecutors is different than that of Administrative Prosecutors, bearing in mind the very basic and general human rights topics that need to be delivered to the various sectors of the Project.

As for the materials of the advanced workshops, BENAA is already recruiting an external consultant on a permanent basis, who is an international expert in different UN Agencies, and who has designed the first Training Manual to be used by BENAA on the International Criminal Justice and Human Rights which is entirely used in the 3 training days of the advanced workshops. Furthermore, according to the needs assessment conducted in the advanced workshops and filled up with the participants, BENAA responded by designing a manual on combating corruption after organizing a roundtable with all experts of the field. Accordingly, a training manual is designed by an external expert, Dr. Soliman Abd El Monem, a Law Professor at Faculty of Law- Alexandria University together with BENAA external permanent consultant which constitutes more than 150 practical questions and case studies, and currently in print.

BENAA had issued a book in 2008 under the name of “International Standards of Human Rights and Public Freedoms in the Egyptian Judiciary-V.2” compiling all the lectures given to the different sectors within the Judicial bodies in 2007 & 2008. This book is distributed in the basic workshops for the purpose of awareness and as previously mentioned it contains lectures from within all the subsectors of Judiciary (Admin Pros, Public Pros, Law Suits Authority, State’s Council, and Family Courts) and thus it makes sense to distribute it to all our subsectors in the basic workshops. Unlike the training manual issued in 2008, International Criminal Justice and Human Rights, which serves as the training guide for the three days of the workshop, and not just for awareness.

## **Evaluation of BENAA Activities**

### **1. Human Rights Training for Law Enforcement Sector**

#### **Workshops for Judges, State Council, Supreme Constitutional Court and Law Suit Authority**

The Report noted that BENAA did not train any regular judges. However, the Project conducted several training workshops for Judges in the past and cooperated with the Judicial Centre in organizing training workshops. However in the last two years we are concentrating on other branches of the judiciary.

The Report stated that *"the curriculum used for the basic training for the members of the Law Suits Authority is the same for Judges of the State Council"*. However, only the general lectures

on Human Rights (principles, International Treaties, HR declaration, etc) are the same, but, the lectures related to the core “Application” are different according to the target group. As for the curricula of the advanced, as stated by the Report, they are the same in all workshops, this is because preparing a training manual on one specialization only takes not less than one year, and BENAA sees that it is an important topic that is being required by the partners and target groups themselves. However, at present, BENAA uses two different training manuals and is now preparing its third Training Manual on Human Trafficking. Same was mentioned for the Public Prosecutors workshops.

### **Workshops for Administrative Prosecutors**

Referring to the trainings conducted to the Administrative Prosecutors, the Report stated that the participants mentioned that *"the topics were a bit far from their specialty"*. However, BENAA always manages to have partnership with the beneficiary to add one lecture each day related to their work.

In addition, meeting a sample of 4 people out of 852 Participants can never give the full image and cannot be the only tool for evaluation, however, all the topics tailored for the Admin prosecutors can be a more concrete tool to judge whether the topics delivered to them were far from their specialty or not.

It is also mentioned in the Report that the Alumni noted *"the Study Tour was very motivating and effective, however, human rights was not the focus of the study tour"*. However the study tour for 2008 was entirely on Human Rights while the study tour for 2009 was on Combating Corruption which is basically related to Human Rights. Moreover, the aim of the Study Tour in the Project document was only exposure and visits, such as courts, prisons, etc, and didn't include any training material. However, BENAA added lectures to give it more weight and strength. In addition the focus group met by the Consultant was those participants who had joined 2009 study tour and who participated in our different level of workshops.

### **Workshops for Police Officers**

The Project's activities are various and covering different categories, each of them has its own requirements and constraints. It is difficult to apply the same criteria or methodology on all groups without taking into consideration this fact. In conducting its working programmes, the Police sector tried to use different methodologies according to the level of participants. While lectures and discussions were the main methodology of basic training courses; lectures, presentations and workshops, have been used during advanced training sessions for those who have already passed what we can call "preparatory stage". The methodology applied to specialized training courses, depends on the individual work of participants and the discussions among them. All these methods are within the framework of international standards.

In this section, the Report comments that *"the curriculum and publications used for Advanced Training are the same in all advanced training activities"*. However, using the same publication for same training level is meant to create a uniformed source of knowledge of all participants on such levels, so we can run a fair impact assessment. Nevertheless, the sector updates the publications from time to time.

Concerning the interviews with the Alumni police officers, the Report mentions *"Lack of motivation and practical training in the Basic Courses"*. It is worth mentioning that the advanced training level addresses focused aspects on Human Rights and is tailored in relevance to the targeted groups' mission. This type of workshops guarantees a good space of discussion and allows participants to work in groups.

It is also mentioned that *"there are no lectures tackling gender issues or rights of any of the vulnerable groups"*. Almost all conducted workshops for the Police beneficiaries included topics on vulnerable groups' rights such as woman & children. Moreover, such aspects were tackled implicitly through other topics like globalization and Human Rights. Same is for the role of civil society in promoting HR concepts had been always highlighted to all sector beneficiaries (80% of the organized training workshops included this topic).

Another comment was that there were no lectures on the *"Rights of police officers"*. Although the Project is not mandated to address the issue of police officers' rights, however it's been raised in indirect way through the aspect of citizenship and the rights and duties of citizen, although in many workshops it was raised by participants directly in dialogue with their superiors. Further, there is no reference in either national or international human rights material on this topic.

The Report indicated that *"some of the lectures were repeated more than once which created a negative atmosphere"*. Repeating same lectures never happens in the same workshop. However it is logical to repeat the same lecture concerning a particular issue to different groups of participants such international conventions on human rights which Egypt signed and ratified therefore constitute an integral part of Egyptian legislation and should be implemented.

In addition, when tracking the entire agendas of all workshops, it would be visible that different experts are assigned to deliver same topics for different groups who belong to same sub-sector in MOI. For example, the topic of the role of Civil society in promoting HR was delivered to participants from central security forces once by Dr. Iman Hassan, Professor of political science, 6 October University and in another workshop for the same sub-sector by Dr. Gamal Salama, Suez Canal University.

The Report recommends *"selecting officers for training courses, there is a need to make sure all of them are at the same rank and level of education i.e. those with PHD degree should not be in the same course with those with only law degree"*. However this is not controllable by the Project but depends on the Ministry of Interior. Furthermore there are a lot of requests by participants

that different ranks should be included in the same workshop. Meanwhile, the MoI cannot release officers according to requirement since they are on duty.

The Report comments on the *"Rules of selecting experts and the need to use experts from outside the MoI"*. It is important to indicate that the Project does cooperate with different segments of experts and trainees to run training workshops for police officers, such as diplomats, academics from universities (which represent 45 % of the lectures date base) and even from the media and civil society (reference is made to the progress reports ad workshop agendas of 2008-2009). The training agendas are formed to devote 70% civil lecturers and 30% police lecturers.

Referring to the comment in the Report that *"no follow up with Alumni took place after completing the course"*, the police sector designed refreshment training courses for police officers alumni so as to keep in touch with old participants.

Regarding the number of trainees it is important to note that in advanced trainings, the participants are divided into two working groups.

## **2. Human Rights Training for Other Sectors**

In this section, the Report mentions that *"there are no practical training offered during the Basic training"* as mentioned in the Alumni meeting. However, some participants during that meeting mentioned that the practical session was very useful (especially in those trainings organized for NGOs and Students). BENAA decided to implement the Participatory Training Technique, which depends on practical sessions during 2009 (reference is made to the First Quarterly report of the sector).

Further, referring to the journalists workshop attended by the Consultant, it is mentioned that *"two admin assistants were monitoring the training"*, however the only staff member who monitors trainings is the Program Assistant, in case the head is not available. As Sector activities are many and sometimes concurrent, the head is unable to monitor all activities; therefore they are monitored by the staff. To overcome this, BENAA have designed monitoring and follow up mechanisms to help the Program Assistant to conduct their work professionally as it was mentioned in the First Quarterly Report of the Sector 2009.

The report did not refer to the volunteers experience of students, which was discussed in the first alumni meeting and in the Quarterly Report submitted to the Consultant.

Regarding the Human Rights Day, the report did not mention the Human Rights Caricature Exhibition Competition and the number of publications produced by BENAA on the occasion of this day. That played an important role in increasing BENAA's visibility. The Project also distributed EU publications, displayed BENAA's Documentary Film. The report also did not mention that BENAA conducts competition after each advanced training activity.

**Evaluation Findings:**

In the visibility and outreach section, the Report states that *"there is no cooperation with national centers concerned with human rights"*. However, cooperation was initiated with the NCW, but there was a delay on their side. There was also cooperation with the NCCM. H.E. Minister Moshira Khattab herself participated in many workshops during which the NCCM's publications were widely distributed. The Project conducted training workshops for Women Leadership in Upper Egypt in cooperation with the National Council for Women.

**Gender Analysis**

The report mentioned that *"there is a need to increase the awareness of BENAA's staff on gender issues"*. Sufficient to say for instance, one of BENAA's team members studied Gender, Social Justice and Citizenship at the University College London- UK and Women's rights at Lund University- Sweden.

The report suggested *"Women's issues to be discussed in separate sessions"*. However, the Media Sector has provided agendas of different trainings, which indicate the presence of gender and women's rights in all the sector's activities. It also organized training workshops for editors responsible of gender issues in different media



## **Annex 7: Tables**

