United Nations Development Programme

Gaster Karen Greellent work

My E template for M ICT4D

Mynt appured. I Prease also get

Onners chan 4 Govb

Interoffice

Memorandum

Interoffice

Memorandum

An the work website as per

transpareny repurements, along Samoa

transpareny repurements, along Samoa

transpareny repurements, along Samoa

transpareny repurements, along Samoa

To: Ms. Naheed Haque

With the pudar, eval

Jahr Mg

Therefore

Ms. Easter Galuvao

Aland Alyfextension:

31 Mar CH

From:

Karen Komiti

File

Subject:

Endorsement of Draft Management Response on ICT4D Evaluation Report

BACKGROUND

The UNDP MCO as the ICT4D Evaluation commissioning unit is required to prepare a management response within one month after the evaluation report is finalized in close consultation with key stakeholders. Upon acceptance of the ICT4D evaluation report on 2 March 2009, the Evaluation Focal Team began preparation of the draft management response in compliance with Evaluation Guidelines for accountability, managing for results and learning. The draft presents the report's key issues and recommendations, follow-up actions and key follow-up by tracking on the ERC. To facilitate the responses from all stakeholders, namely the UNDP MCO, the ICT4D Implementing Partners in Cook Islands, Niue, and Samoa, the response provides an opportunity to hold dialogue with the relevant stakeholders, before it is tracked on the ERC, where the Regional Bureau monitors and oversees its overall follow-up and its implementation of proposed actions.

ASSESSMENT OF THE DRAFT MANAGEMENT RESPONSE

As the commissioning unit, the UNDP MCO, namely the Assistant Representatives: Ms. Easter Galuvao and Ms. Moana Luamanuvae, and Programme Support Unit: Ms. Veronica Levi were asked to reflect on the following dimensions of the response: whether the recommendations and/or issues are relevant and acceptable; whether the key actions proposed are concrete and who the key partners are carrying out the actions; and the identification of the responsible units and the timeframe for the implementation of the actions. Each provided comments on the template contents which were reflected on the draft response, and collectively endorsed for forwarding to the ICT4D implementing partners for their respective inputs.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the above, I recommend the draft dated 25 March 2009 be endorsed and forwarded to the ICT4D implementing partners for their input.

UNDP Management Response Template ICT4D Evaluation Date: 25 March 2009

Prepared by: Evaluation Focal Team

Cleared by:

Input into and update in ERC:

Position: Assistant Resident Representatives, PSU Unit/Bureau: UNDP MCO, Apia

Position: Unit/Bureau:

Position:

Unit/Bureau:

Overall comments: The ICT4D evaluation was commissioned by and conducted for the UNDP Multi-Country Office based in Samoa, between November 18 and December 20, 2008 by Robert Boase of Vancouver, Canada. The purpose of the evaluation was to draw lessons from the ICT4D projects in the Cook Islands, Niue and Samoa, nearing their end and to make recommendations to the implementing partners and UNDP MCO. The final report was accepted by UNDP MCO on 3 March, 2009 after relevant input from stakeholders was incorporated. The report recommendations were circulated to stakeholders for their response and appropriate actions, as follows:

COOK ISLANDS RECOMMENDATIONS

Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 1: Promotional campaign for e-government. There is still little awareness in the general public about recent e-government developments. Management Response: UNDP and GoCKI agree/disagree with this recommendation Key Action(s): A formal promotional campaign for e-	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Tra	cking*
government of the websites both domestically and overseas should be executed.			Status	Comments
1.1 This should be launched with the opening of the Cook Islands Portal, open-house whereby officials should demonstrate to the public how to access the portal and how to search for specific ministries or information or how to pose a question to a given ministry.		Office of the Prime Minister (OPM)		UNDP Management comments: Ideally this launch should be linked with the CKI portal opening. However, alternative funding for the launch should also be identified.
1.2 The campaign should include a public kiosk with computer for individual citizens to enter the portal and search for government information or assistance.		OPM		



3.1 by standing offer contract to a few Cook Island consultants		OPM		Comments
The early project start should be augmented.	rime Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Status	Comments
Key Action(s): The core project staff should be augmented:	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Tra	comment: Agree that a preferred solution would be engaging a firm from Samoa e.g. Computer Services Limited to offer these services, as a follow-on from Key Action 3.1 cking
In addition to training there is a need for consultancy web-site and IT systems services to government ministries and agencies. Management Response: UNDP and GoCKI agree/disagree with the recommendation				UNDP management
formulated and executed. Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 3: Consultant Support.		OFM		
2.1 This should target web-site operators and IT systems staff inside the government and those conversant with the computer in the general public 2.2 Based on the needs assessment, a training program should be		OPM OPM		
Key Action(s): A Training Needs Assessment should be carried out.	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Tra Status	Comments
further building of e-government capacity both inside government and among the general public. Management Response: UNDP and GoCKI agree/disagree with this recommendation				
government on-line. Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 2: Capacity Development for e-government. There is still a great need for				
1.3 Access to the government portal should be available in every school computer as well so that students can access their		OPM		



or offshore consultants if necessary to provide the volume and scope of consultancy services required on web-site and IT systems services. 3.2 The consultants should be required to work with the technical staff of the ICT Division to provide them with on-the-job training. Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 4: Outlying Island Pilots. Work has begun on two pilot e-government outlying islands under the final stage of the current project. But this work has only begun and will need to be continued in the next phase of the project. Management Response: UNDP and GoCKI agree/disagree with this recommendation		OPM		UNDP management comment: Agree to continue however, alternative sources of funds should be identified from non core plus Government
Key Action(s): In the next phase of the project, it is suggested	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Tracking	
that there be three pilot outlying islands.			Status	Comments
4.1: these three should be selected on the basis of: ensuring that both northern and southern islands are included; the necessary ICT infrastructure is in place on the island; the island is motivated and at a stage where it can take advantage of this project.		ОРМ		
4.2 the pilots should focus on the Office of the Island Secretary and his staff, the local school and its computer labs and courses, the local hospital and its Telehealth system and the private tourism sector.		ОРМ		
Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 5: E-government and the MDGs. The UNDP Country Programme Action Plan (CPAP) for the future envisages more effort in promoting achievement of the MDGs through ICT. Specifically, the CPAP says: '(h) best practices and lessons learned documented and				



for Development (ICT4D); (i) MDGs advocated through an "MDGs through Sports, Volunteerism and ICT4D" campaign in partnership with development partners, United Nations Volunteers (UNV) and other volunteer organizations. Management Response: UNDP and GoCK1 agree/disagree with the recommendation Key Action(s): More effort is required in promoting	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Tracking	UNDP management comment: Agree, but should be approached within the limited resources available to facilitate the promotional campaign, ideally linked to and with other initiatives rather than a stand- alone ICT4D project
achievement of the MDGs through ICT as envisioned in the	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Status	Comments
UNDP CPAP.			Status	Comments
5.1 This should involve a coordinated effort among the relevant UN agency and the relevant government ministry, e.g. Ministry of Education and UNICEF for primary school statistics.		OPM		
5.2 The logical place for e-government and MDG information is the future portal for the Cook Islands.		OPM		
5.3 Once this information is available, schools can use it for many of their courses to educate the next generation about the importance of reaching these goals for the Cook Islands.		OPM		
Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 6: Improve Internet connectivity and data transfer. The current level of Internet				
Service from TCI is slow compared to the other islands				



evaluated and is holding back the Cook Islands economy, education and tourism.				
Management Response: UNDP and GoCKI agree/disagree with the recommendation				UNPD management: Agree, however, this is a GoCKI initiative and
Key Action(s): The government should either instruct TCI to	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Tracking	
bring its Internet service up to that of Samoa and Niue or government should open up the Internet field to competition while leaving TCI with its phone system monopoly.			Status	Comments
6.1 The experience of other countries in this regard, e.g. Samoa will be valuable to the government in deciding on a course of action		OPM		
Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 7: Clarify Position of the Project Manager.				
Management Response: UNDP and GoCKI agree/disagree with the recommendation				UNPD management comment: Agree that the matter should be clarified by OPM
Key Action(s): The position of Project Manager should either	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Tracking	
be filled by a civil servant if a qualified civil servant can be identified and the post should then be paid by the government or the position should be described as a contracted position and someone from outside should be contracted. The current situation where the post is supposed to be filled by a civil servant according to the project document but is in fact filled by a contracted person paid by the UNDP makes for tension and discord in the PMO.			Status	Comments
NIUE RECOMMENDATIONS				
Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 1: ICT Technical				T
				-



Capacity Development. The Information Services Office (ISO) where the UNDP project is located has an IT Manager and three new staff just graduated from high school under training. More training is urgently required in server maintenance and repair, network administration, data communications and network security. Management Response: UNDP and GoNIU agree/disagree with the recommendation. Key Action(s): Training could take the form of an attachment	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Tec	UNDP management comment: Agree, however this is a GoNIU decision
to a system that is operating well and where maintenance and	Time Frame	Responsible Offices)	Status	Comments
repairs are routine 1.1 The logical place for an attachment is the New Zealand consulting firm SAFI because it know the Niue ICT situation intimately and can be more effective than other organizations without this familiarity. Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 2: Computer Literacy Training. A major advance in computer literacy has taken place		ISO		
under the project with the on-line Wintec computer training being provided www.wintecactive.co.nz out of New Zealand.				
Management Response: UNDP and GoNIU agree/disagree with the recommendation.				UNDP management comment: Agree, however this should be part of the sustainability programme for the ICT project in Niue
Key Action(s): The next steps should include a campaign to				ncking
raise awareness about this programme and to register more public servants, students (they must be 16 years old to register for the program) and the general public to take advantage of this			Status	Comments



effective training.				
2.1 Training management should make more celebration of those who pass the training and to have a graduation ceremony with graduation certificates so that the programme gains more prominence and momentum.		ISO		
2.3 A roster of graduates who can serve as tutors should be created to assist new registrants to the on-line programmes or indeed, anyone who wants to know more about operating the computer.		ISO		
Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 3: E-Government. Much progress has been made to date but there is more work to be done as only four government agencies have a website.				
Management Response: UNDP and GoNIU agree/disagree with the recommendation				UNDP management comment: Agree, if it supports Niue's ICT Strategy
Key Action(s): There is a need to develop websites for all other	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Tra	cking
government departments and agencies.			Status	Comments
3.1 There is also a need for departments to load up information onto the Intranet for access by other departments and agencies.		ISO		
Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 4: UNESCO Small Islands Voices (SIV) Programme. The SIV is a programme that links up the world's small island states in a forum and dialogue and these states no matter where they are located share many similar experiences and challenges. The UNDP was expected to link up one primary school to the SIV so that the children could participate in this interesting forum but it did not happen.				
Management Response: UNDP and GoNIU agree/disagree with the recommendation.				UNDP management comment: Agree, if it can be done under the OLPC programme given the



				additional funding from UNDP
Key Action(s): Now that the One Laptop per Child (OLPC)	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Tracking	
programme is operational in Niue, it would be useful if the SIV were installed for teachers and students to participate and take advantage of the rich learning experience from other small island states.			Status	Comments
Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 5: ICT Policy for Government. A draft ICT policy was prepared some years ago. The stimulus for this policy was apparently the controversy over the nu.domain.				
Management Response: UNDP and GoNIU agree/disagree with the recommendation				UNPD management comment: Agree, and add that the ICT4D project experience should contribute to the formulation of the Niue ICT policy
Key Action(s): It is important for the country's development to	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Tracking	Te i panej
have a comprehensive ICT policy in place and it should be knitted into Niue's national development plan.			Status	Comments
5.1 The logical body to oversee this exercise is the National ICT Committee.		ISO		
5.2 The 2005-2008 Samoa ICT policy and strategy is an excellent reference for Niue to examine as a checklist of what should go in the Niue document.		ISO		
5.3 This exercise should have access to an international advisor to help with the scope, table of contents, and technical side.		ISO		
SAMOA RECOMMENDATIONS				
Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 1:				



Recommendations for the Government of Samoa.

Management Response: UNDP and GoS agree/disagree with the recommendation.				
Key Action(s): Recommendations for the Government of	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Ti	racking
Samoa:			Status	Comments
1.1 A major computer literacy training initiative is required to enable the people of Samoa to capitalize on the significant ICT infrastructure already in place: a) do a country-wide training needs assessment covering public servants, students, drop-outs, teachers, village men & women and technical support people to establish a baseline; b) set an ICT goal for each target group of people and measure success of the training effort toward that goal; c) design ICT training as an ongoing process rather than one-shot effort; d) exploit to the maximum on-line training, e.g. International Computer Driver's Licence (ICDL), WINTEC, etc.; e) use volunteers as trainers, e.g. Peace Corps, UNVs, students, public servants and university students visiting their village; f) ensure that all major government initiatives have an ICT training component to them; g) implement urgently: 2 planned ICT training centers in Savaii and Upolu and team up with SchoolNet programme for financing, for trainers and for trainees for those two centers; and the mobile computer van with trainers to train up remote teacher in computer literacy.		Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (MCIT)		
1.2 Part of the next ICT Strategic Plan for the period 2009- 2012 should involve putting the MDGs onto the government's portal under development so as to raise awareness and build commitment for MDG achievement and ensuring that an overview of the ICT Strategic Plan is stated in the Government's overall Development Plan;		MCIT		
1.3 Government should coordinate its Telecenter and SchoolNet expansion programme to avoid wasteful duplication by a) Telecenters and SchoolNet facilities should be		MCIT		



located so as to serve distinct population markets; b) the decision to choose a SchoolNet or a Telecenter in a given area should be based on the relative strength and sustainability of the two options, and this strength should be assessed according to – the motivation of the key stakeholders, i.e. the school principal or the head of the women's committee; and the current and potential capacity of key stakeholders to launch, operate, develop and sustain the facility. Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 2: Recommendations for the Telecenter Development: Management Response: UNDP and GoS agree/disagree with the recommendation.				UNDP management comment: Agree, however UNDP is only liable for activities within the available/approved budget
Key Action(s): Recommendations for the Telecenter	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)		Fracking
Development:			Status	Comments
2.1 Training of the administrators of the telecenters needs to be ongoing both in terms of how to manage their telecenter, how to market it, computer literacy and how to diagnose and correct simple computer operation problems;		MCIT		
2.2 A sustained promotional campaign should be carried out for each of the centers;		MCIT		
2.3 Computer down time should be cut down either by more frequent visits by the MCIT technician or by contracting persons locally who can repair the computer system		MCIT		
2.4 The focus at this time should be on strengthening the level of operation and effectiveness of the existing telecenters		MCIT		
Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 3: Recommendations for the MDG Scoreboard:				
Management Response: UNDP and GoS agree/disagree with the recommendation.				UNDP management comment: Agree,



Man Anthony December 1 of the MDC				that GoS and UNDP review the scoreboard for options and a decision on next steps
Key Action(s): Recommendations for the MDG Scoreboard:	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Status	Tracking Comments
3.1 Government should disassemble the MDG scoreboard infrastructure in front of Government House as it is putting both government and the UN in a bad light.		MCIT	Status	Comments
3.2 OR Government should make the MDG scoreboard infrastructure in front of Government House come alive a) To make the site come alive would require significant resources and energy, and would require the full-time attention of a public affairs officer to lay on regular weekly events to showcase individual MDGs, to show films relating to individual MDGs and to put on pieces of theatre by students that make the MDGs real. b) Part of this option would involve deliberation as to whether and where the MDG scoreboard should be moved to and whether to replace the current LED sign with a digital sign that is legible both day and night. c) Before a decision is made a costing of keeping it going should be done and its funding assured.		MCIT		
Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 4:				
Recommendations for the Project Management in the MCIT: Management Response: UNDP and GoS agree/disagree with the recommendation.				UNDP management comment: Agree, but within the existing budget to support the remaining activities. MCIT would have to decide on how to sustain the project



				beyond the ICT4D project timeframe. Additionally, if UNDP were to provide additional funding, it would be in UNDP's best interests to support the recruitment of a project manager to concentrate only on progressing the project, and not coordinating other MCIT projects.
Key Action(s): Recommendations for the Project Management in the MCIT:	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Tracking	Comments
4.1 The current project manager of the ICT4D is		MCIT	Status	Comments
overburdened with other projects as well as a number of important government initiatives and committee and is the explanation in part for many of the incomplete ICT4D activities. Although she has delegated responsibilities to her team members, there is room for much more delegation such as: a) Project budgets, expenditures and reporting to be delegated to the Manager of Corporate Services b) Executive Assistant to the CEO to set up same correspondence and email tracking system used by the Ministry for all MCIT projects and to train the Project Coordinator for the ICT4D Project to operate the system; c) Australian Volunteer to assist remaining ministries without websites in developing their request for proposals and to oversee execution of these contracts by the private sector; d) Project Coordinator to be made coordinator for all MCIT projects and to take over responsibility for the Telecenters and to make regular trips to visit these centers and resolve problems.				



RECOMMENDATIONS FOR UNDP

Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 1: ICT4D to play a prominent cross-cutting role in making the new UNDP Flagship Programme thrusts successful by: Management Response: UNDP and GoS agree/disagree with the recommendation				UNDP management comment: Disagree. UNDP's existing website can be revisited to reflect corporate requirements and reviewing its content to consolidate and capture all the main MCO programmes. UNDP disagree with the establishment of a new UNDP website, or 4 different websites, to reflect the four flagship programmes
Key Action(s): (a) Establish a UNDP website for the four	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Tracking*	
programmes and train UNDP officers how to input to the			Status	Comments
website for its development and currency; (b) ensure that all stakeholders are involved in the website design and development and are encouraged to provide feedback for its				

further development – to ensure the websites are focused on		
government and community needs rather than being internally driven;		
1.1 South-South Capacity building website ideas:	UNDP Multi-Country	
a) On-line courses to be developed and available on	Office (MCO)	
the website for building management capacities, e.g. PRINCE, RBM IDL, WINTEC, etc;		
b) MDPD advocacy messages promoted on the		
website:		
c) Lessons learned available on the website and		
searchable by key words;		
d) Profile of all consultants/trainers in the South-South		
programme available for students to contact with		
question or to seek assistance;		
e) Link to the SIV programme for participants to learn		
and share small island experience from around the		
world;		
f) the three counties reviewed on this mission i.e.		
Cook Islands, Niue and Samoa each have unique		
features to their ICT4D status, and it would be		
valuable to share their experience with other countries in the South Pacific as well and easily available to all		
on the website. For example, Niue's experience with		
the OLPC, Samoa in creating a competitive		
environment for telecom leading to lowered costs and		
improved Internet services, and Cook Islands has an		
effective approach for assisting ministries in creating		
their websites.		
1.2 MDGS through sports and volunteers & ICT4D website	UNDP MCO	
ideas:		
 a) Basic information on the MDGs, and what they are, 		
what is the MDG status in each country? And on		
which MDGs is effort most needed and what kind of		
effort will be successful?;		
b) Instructions for how a community or group of		
individuals such as sports club can raise MDG		
awareness and push toward MDG achievement n their		
community? c) Help each country put the MDG status of the		
country on its government portal and into the schools		
county on its government portar and into the schools		





reviewed in the evaluation have had problems with delays in securing their financial advances which slow down project implementation and lower disbursement rates. This indicates a problem inside the UNDP MCO. Management Response: UNDP agrees/disagrees with the			UNDP
recommendation			management comment: This is a shared problem between UNDP and project implementing partners. UNDP's financial system was recently upgraded and cause of delays are two-fold: i) lack of guidance from UNDP to implementing partners on operational, procedural, and reporting requirements ii) lack of proper planning and sufficient documentation from
Key Action(s): UNDP must be able to give clear and quick	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	implementing partners Tracking



managers.			Status	Comments
Key Action(s): Ensure clear accountability for project	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Tracking	
Management Response: UNDP agrees/disagrees with the recommendation				UNDP management comment: Agree that roles and responsibilities of project managers should be made very clear at the outset.
Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 4: Ensure clear accountability for project managers. There were problems with accountability in all 3 projects reviewed and with unclear or conflicting accountability, the result is project implementation is impacted.		UNDP MCO		
2.3 Training will be required for relevant project and UNDP MCO staff so that they know how to operate the new work process.				
2.2 Once identified then the work process can be altered to eliminate the delays.		UNDP MCO		
2.1 A work process study is in order to determine what the existing system is for issuing quarterly advances and for making direct payments and to determine where the problem/delays are.		UNDP MCO		
budgets, expenditures, direct payments and balance left in the budget: It is recognized that UNDP has centralized financial management system called ATLAS and that there are challenges in using this system but these challenges need to be overcome, and the whole financial system needs to be simplified, streamlined, and responsive to project needs:				
responses to recipient countries for such things as financial advances, enquiries from recipient countries about project			Status	Comments

^{*} The implementation status is tracked in the ERC.

