



**EDUARDO MONDLANE UNIVERSITY
FACULTY OF ARTS AND SOCIAL SCIENCES
CENTRE OF POLICY ANALYSIS (CAP)**



THE CHIBUTO MILLENIUM VILLAGE

EVALUATION REPORT

**Evaluator:
Amílcar F. Pereira**

Maputo, January 2010

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abbreviations and acronyms

Executive Summary

I. INTRODUCTION

- A. Evaluation Context
- B. The Concept of Millennium Villages
- C. Approach and Methodology
- D. Evaluation Scope
- E. Evaluation main Questions
- F. Evaluation Constraints and Limitations
- G. Acknowledgements

II. MAIN FEATURES OF THE PROGRAM (DESIGN)

- A. Project Rationale and Strategy
- B. Project Area and Target Group
- C. Objectives and VM Project Components
- D. Implementation Partners and Organization
- E. Main policies and institutions changes during project implementation
- F. Project design changes during the implementation phase

III. SUMMARY OF THE FINDINGS

- 1. Education
- 2. Health
- 3. Water and Sanitation
- 4. Agriculture
- 5. Gender and HIV/AIDS and Social Action

IV. THE PERFORMANCE OF THE PNVM OF CHIBUTO

- A. Relevance
- B. Effectiveness
- C. Efficiency

D. Sustainability

V. CONCLUSIONS

VI. RECOMENDATIONS

VII. REFERENCES

ANNEXS

- I. Terms of Reference
- II. List of Interviewed People.

Executive Summary

This section presents a summary of key findings, conclusions and recommendations of the evaluation report of the National Program of the Millennium Villages in Mozambique.

Context

The Government of Mozambique in partnership with the UNDP and other development partners began in 2006 the implementation of the National Millennium Villages (PNVM) in Chibuto and Lumbo. This program fits in the government's strategy to accelerate the implementation of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs).

The PNVM is primarily intended to eliminate hunger and malnutrition, ensure access and attendance to primary school by boys and girls, improving the livelihoods of women and children, reduce HIV/AIDS infection rate, malaria, tuberculosis and other diseases, increasing the access to water, energy, clean air and sanitation to households, schools and health services and, to eliminate digital disparities through the provision of Information and Communication Technologies.

Approach and Methodology

To carry out this evaluation the researcher took into account the ToRs which on section 3 (evaluation scope) describe activities listed from point a) to q). It must be clarified that some aspects of this section refer to the objectives of the evaluation which are in line with the objectives of PNVM [e.g. b), c) and d)]. There are points that relate to the evaluation criteria [e.g. e), l)] and finally one can also notice that there is some repetition. This section was reworked more systematically to ensure greater clarity of issues raised during the presentation of the report.

Some key documents were reviewed to help on the evaluation:

- PARPA II (PRSP II),
- Government Five-Year (2005-2009) Program
- PES e OE's 2006-2009
- Balanços do PES 2006-2009
- AWP of the Millennium Villages (Chibuto), 2007, 2008, 2009 e 2010
- 2007, 2008, 2009 and 2010 Reports on the Implementation of the Millennium villages
- Memorandum of Understanding between the Government, UNDP and Cooperation partners.
- Other documents relevant to the study.

(a) The interviews were conducted with people involved in the implementation of PNVM at the following levels:

- Members and officials of the Ministry of Science and Technology; Managers at UNDP and development partners
- District level managers and;
- Beneficiaries of the Millennium Villages initiative.

I. The fieldwork included:

- 4 days visit to the Millennium Village Samora Machel. Annex B presents a detailed list of people interviewed in the context of this evaluation.

Conclusions

One of the assumptions for the implementation of the PNVM is its prospect to contribute for accelerating the fighting against poverty in order to achieve the MDGs. Given the initial conditions of the *VM of Chibuto*, we consider that the program has contributed significantly to improve the living standards of beneficiary communities. However, the discrepancy between the concept and its implementation methodology, in this case the criteria of 350,000 USD for 5000, forces us to conclude that some communities of the VM of Chibuto will not immediately benefit from the program.

We point out that the performances differ from sector to sector. The pillar of education contributed to the reduction in the illiteracy rate and expanded the access to primary education. The pillars of health, water and sanitation show significant results in particular a greater health care service delivery, covering the village's neighbouring communities. There is individuals' gradual increase in knowledge levels and attitudes about diseases as well as an improved community health quality. The completion of the Health Centre building will enhance the prospect for this village to have a health centre of reference.

Within the water and sanitation sector, the village has developed benchmarking practices in the treatment of water using natural means and resources. For instance, the use of Moringa has great benefits for the health and welfare of communities. However, it should be noted that despite the qualitative changes in this area, access to water still appears to be a major concern in the village.

The availability of computer trainings and access to information technologies represent an added value in employment opportunities for young people and help lifting up public officials' skills. However, this activity is still not significant in the village.

The Agriculture sector has a great potential for contributing to the improvement of living conditions of local populations. However, we note that despite the progress made so far, in fighting poverty, their performance is still below the expected potential; taking into account its favourable conditions for farming, such as soil fertility that could help in improve the productivity.

The program's approach seems quite relevant to the country's context. However, the current management style is reducing its effectiveness jeopardizing an opportunity for its sustainability as implementation continues to be very centralized and the role of the CRCT is insignificant. Decentralization process of the programme started in 2010, with the aim of improve the management capacity of the programme and coping with the new challenges.

The acceptance and adherence to the program by local communities is strong and there is good collaboration between the district government and the CVL. As a result many interventions of the village Samora Machel are already being incorporated into the activities of various government sectors in the district. Most activities undertaken by communities are demonstrating that they have potential to guarantee the sustainability of the program.

The MCT through the new Centre for Investigation and Technology Transfer for Community Development (CITT) has an important role in fostering the use and dissemination of science, technology and innovation at the service of communities, particularly the poorest segment of society. Despite the effort undertaken, the use and application of science and technology to

boost up the fighting against poverty is still one of the challenges of the programme and below the expected potential. Many activities in the VM should in principle serve as a scale of excellence to ensure its rapid replication to other locations. However, what we observed in many areas suggest the need for more investments in new technologies and innovation to improve the programme capacity of achieving their results. For example, in the agriculture sector, apart from the distribution of inputs there is also a basic extension work. It's necessary for that sector to improve the use of technologies to increase productivity and developing value chain production.

Recommendations

According to the analysis and conclusions presented above there are a number of key recommendations to improve the performance of the Chibuto millennium village:

- Given the nature of the program, which seeks to bring about meaningful changes in communities it is imperative to revise the program in order for each village to have a clear and logical plan for each year, which includes objectives and performance indicators. This will allow knowing what key findings of the program are and how to achieve them.
- It is essential that steps be taken to design a system for monitoring and evaluation to accurately measure the progress and impact of the program. The same system will contribute for various program's partners to know the results achieved so far in a transparent and objective ways.
- Given that the vision of PNVM establishes that each village must work as a referral centre that will serve as an example and share its experiences, it is imperative that the village identifies activities with great potential to meet its objective.
- To enhance transparency in the management of funds and strengthen the decentralization and autonomy of the CVL, as envisaged in the ECTIM, the budget of the village must be clear with regard to the volume of resources going to the CNPVM in its oversight function and the amount that goes to the CVL.
- The roles of the CNPVM, CRCT and CVL must be clarified to ensure better communication and coordination in the implementation of the program. Additionally, the role of the CRCT must be strengthened and more resources allocated to the CVL so that it has better participation in the program implementation.
- The CNPVM should review how it conducts supervision by identifying more efficient ways. Currently the program presents higher supervision and travel expenses. Probably the CRCT overseeing role should be strengthened in order to reduce supervision costs.
- Considering that the village of Chibuto works with a population of 13,000 inhabitants there is a need to rethink on a strategy to raise more funds and partnerships to respond to the growing number of beneficiaries in various components of the program.
- The program must develop effective mechanisms for participation via the CDL in order to strengthen community involvement.

I. INTRODUCTION

A. Evaluation Context

The Government of Mozambique in partnership with the UNDP and other development partners began in 2007 the implementation of the National Millennium Villages (PNVM) in Chibuto and Lumbo. This program fits in the government's strategy to accelerate the implementation of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs).

The PNVM is primarily intended to eliminate hunger and malnutrition, ensure access and attendance to primary school by boys and girls, improving the livelihoods of women and children, reduce HIV/AIDS infection rate, malaria, tuberculosis and other diseases, increasing the access to water, energy, clean air and sanitation to households, schools and health services and, to eliminate digital disparities through the provision of Information and Communication Technologies.

The implementation of the PNVM is coordinated by the Ministry of Science and Technology (MCT) and other ministries have focal points in their areas of competency, e.g. the Ministries of Health, Education and Agriculture, etc. The United Nations are also participating under their new approach to deliver as one.

According to the Terms of Reference (TOR), the main focus of this evaluation is to show the progress in the implementation of the Millennium Villages of Chibuto and its impact on achieving the MDGs. Moreover, document lessons learned and experiences in view to accelerate the implementation of the MDGs. Therefore, the focus of this report is on the evaluation of the millennium village of Chibuto.

B. The Concept of Millennium Village

According to the PNVM a VM represents "a practical demonstration of an integrated rural development project based in the community, using better science, technology and available experience in order to ensure the achievement and maintenance of communities' economic development" (MCT, 2006: 3)

C. Approach and Methodology

To carry out this evaluation the researcher took into account the ToRs which on section 3 (evaluation scope) describe activities listed from point a) to q). It must be clarified that some aspects of this section refer to the objectives of the evaluation which are in line with the objectives of PNVM [e.g. b), c) and d)]. There are points that relate to the evaluation criteria [e.g. e), l)] and finally one can also notice that there is some repetition. This section was reworked more systematically to ensure greater clarity of issues raised during the presentation of the report.

Some key documents were reviewed to help on the evaluation:

- PARPA II (PRSP II),
- Government Five-Year (2005-2009) Program
- PES e OE's 2006-2009
- Balanços do PES 2006-2009
- AWP of the Millennium Villages (Lumbo), 2007, 2008, 2009 e 2010

- 2007, 2008, 2009 and 2010 Reports on the Implementation of the Millennium villages
 - Memorandum of Understanding between the Government, UNDP and Cooperation partners.
 - Other documents relevant to the study.
- (b) The interviews were conducted with people involved in the implementation of PNVM at the following levels:
- Members and officials of the Ministry of Science and Technology; Managers at UNDP and development partners
 - District level managers and;
 - Beneficiaries of the Millennium Villages initiative.
- II. The fieldwork included:
- 4 days visit to the Millennium Village Samora Machel. Annex B presents a detailed list of people interviewed in the context of this evaluation.

D. Evaluation Scope

The PNVM started in 2007 and this evaluation aims to examine objectively the relevance, performance and success of the program to date and put forward recommendations based on the lessons learned. Based on these premises the evaluator reviewed the following aspects of the program:

- The formulation and program design;
- The implementation and ongoing strategies to achieve the objectives of the program;
- The management of the program.

The evaluation considered the criteria's of efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability. Additional details on the scope of the evaluation are presented on the ToRs.

E. Evaluation main Questions

This evaluation sought to answer the following questions:

1. To what extent the activities implemented contributed to the achievement of the objectives of the Millennium Village of Chibuto
2. To what extent the arrangements established for the implementation of the Millennium Village of Chibuto took into account the need to ensure its efficiency, effectiveness, impact, institutional and economic sustainability?
3. From the lessons learned during the implementation of the Millennium Village of Chibuto what are the possibilities of replicating this experience to other contexts?

F. Evaluation Constraints and Limitations

The main constraint and limitation of this evaluation is the fact that during the period of data collection, both at central (National Office) and local levels (implementation team in each village) there was no sufficient archive information covering the implementation of the program since its inception. At the National Office a new management team has started functions and was still getting familiarized with the program. Moreover, at the local level the coordinator of the project could not provide information for the year 2007 and part of 2008, period during which there was another coordinator in office. In effect, the evaluator had to rely on information provided largely through semi-structured interviews with key

stakeholders of the program. It was also not possible to contact the focal points at the ministries that work in areas related to the implementation of the PNVM.

G. Acknowledgements

To carry out this evaluation it was essential the direct and indirect contribution and collaboration of many people which I can not mention them all. First, I thank all UNDP staff, particularly members of the PNVM team; PNVM staff members from the MCT, the Chibuto village implementation team, and finally the local authorities of the Chibuto.

III. THE MAIN FEATURES OF THE PROGRAM (DESIGN)

A. Project Rationale and Strategy

The PNVM as already mentioned above is intended to be a leading initiative in ensuring that the government can accelerate the implementation of the MDGs. To this end the Government of Mozambique has appointed the MCT as the focal point for the Millennium villages' project to foster science-based innovations and help bringing solutions for poverty reduction.

In its project implementation mission, the MCT of Mozambique has defined the Millennium Village as:

"The space to functional and structurally build, a Centre for Transfer of Technology and Human Development based on the introduction of active elements (research, technology and innovation) on the pillars of national development (agriculture, education, health and gender equity)

MCT (2006:21)

As a result, the MCT has developed a methodology for identifying and implementing the millennium villages contributing for the acceleration of the fight against poverty. There ought to use 'capabilities, initiatives and resources of local communities to spread the use of science, technology and knowledge management with a view to promote sustainability.

Based on this methodology the MCT conducted a national assessment on human development conditions to identify problems related to low Human Development Index (IDH) in the country and serve as an indicator of progress towards combating absolute poverty.

B. Project Area and Target Group

The choice of each site for the implementation of the Millennium Villages was based on certain requirements which are: i) the potentiality and existing local resources, ii) poverty and disadvantages and iii) education and illiteracy index. Each village should thus represent a low-income population with at least 5000 inhabitants.

In the case of Chibuto, during the installation phase the coordinating team realized that in the area lived more than 13,000 inhabitants which made it difficult to target only 5000 people as established in the millennium village criteria's. This situation posed some constraints to the program performance.

The choice of the village Samora Machel which is composed by four *bairros* was due to serious problems in water supply, public sanitation, defecation in open places, and spread of diseases like malaria, HIV / AIDS among others which delay the fighting against poverty in the village. The VM of Chibuto is located near the Limpopo valley and it is inside an area of a municipality. Therefore, in the near future this area will witness a progressive urbanization.

C. Objectives and the VM Project Components

The specific objectives of the PNVM include the following:

- To eliminate hunger and malnutrition in communities;
- To improve the livelihoods of women and men and increase their income;
- To ensure complete primary school attendance for both sexes (boys and girls) and eliminate gender disparity, including the rehabilitation of infrastructure

- To improve access to medical services;
- To reduce the infection rates of HIV / AIDS, malaria, tuberculosis and other diseases;
- To increase the access to energy, clean air, water and sanitation for households, schools and health services;
- To eliminate the digital disparity through the provision of communication technologies benefits, especially the access to Internet services and mobile telephone.

These PNVM objectives were viewed in the context of the village of Chibuto by considering five main pillars: I) Education; ii) Health; iii) Water and Sanitation; IV) Agriculture and v) HIV / AIDS.

The VM of Chibuto was launched at the end of 2006 as a pilot village and it was expected that ideas generated by its interventions on the five pillars could produce lessons and experiences to be replicated to other communities and contexts.

D. Implementing Partners and Organization

An International Coordinating Committee (CD) for Consultation was created to ensure the implementation of the PNVM. This committee consists of the MCT, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Cooperation (MINEC) and UNDP. Additionally, a central unit at the level of the MCT and a Local Village (CVL) were established to guarantee supervision of the implementation of the program as well as coordination with the Regional Centre for Science and Technology (CRCT), district authorities, and local community leaders.

At the beginning of the program technical responsibilities for the staff were defined. The National Program Coordinator of the Millennium Villages (CNPVM) was granted responsibilities to coordinate and ensure the implementation of the plan of activities of the VMs and their management structure. In its turn the CRCT should ensure the coordination of all activities on the VM in their areas of jurisdiction. In principle each CVL should ensure the implementation in their respective village.

Still in its implementation strategy, the program developed partnerships relevant to the achievement of its objectives. For instance, at the local level, the program should ensure the integration of local governments, NGOs, private sector and local associations of farmers and breeders. At the national level, the program also aimed at developing partnerships with the private sector, civil society and research institutions in various areas. Finally, at regional and international level it should ensure synergy and exchange of experiences.

The Government of Mozambique created a Trust Fund (TFVMM) to finance the villages and it should be managed by the UNDP. Moreover, other contributions could be made in foodstuffs and goods. However, the main donor of the VM of Chibuto is the Japanese government

E. Major changes in policies and Institutions

The PNVM initially started with Chibuto village in 2006, and it grew very fast. What had originally been conceived as a project has reached the size of a large program creating difficulties in terms its human and financial resources management. Furthermore, the government began to include activities that were not planned within the project.

As the village was gaining more visibility, it attracted more attention from the provincial government which had shown an interest to learn about its functioning. This brought difficulties in the logical structure of accountability.

In 2010 the Government created in the PNVM the Centre for Investigation and Technology Transfer for Community Development (CITT) with the aim of improve the efficiency and sustainability of PNVM.

F. Changes in Design During Implementation

In the concept of the VM it is recommended that each is composed of at least 5000 people and with a budget of 350,000 USD a year, where 70% should be guaranteed by partners and donors and 30% by the government. It must be noted that the government's contribution was in infrastructure and human resources. The village of Chibuto targeted a universe of 13,000 inhabitants.

One of the main assumptions of the PNVM is the strong collaboration among the project local team, local authorities and other partners, as a strategy to strengthen its future sustainability. For instance, some activities of the village could be integrated in district plans and budget. However, the way the program has been implemented does not contribute to an effective coordination due to the concentration of implementation activities at the central level. By 2010 the programme started a process of decentralization of planning and financial management with the aim of improve the involvement of local level in programme implementation.

Another factor which has affected the implementation of the program is the lack of an efficient communication between the central and local staff. Often there are situations on which the local team shows great inertia in decision making as there are no resources or no means to implement certain activities.

A major drive of the PNVM is founded on the decentralization policy as established in the Strategy for Science, Technology and Innovation for Mozambique (ECTIM) which also seeks to ensure the dissemination of science in disadvantaged communities. In designing the program it was expected that the CNPVM, CRCT and the CVL to operate in strict cooperation to materialize the implementation of the objectives. However, what happened in practice is that coordination at the central level focused heavily on implementing the program activities, reducing the role of the CRCT and with little interaction with the CVL. This style of management resulted in little resources channelled to the CVL. Many of the activities implemented at the central level could be better performed by the CVL.

IV. SUMMARY OF THE FINDINGS

In this section are presented the activities implemented and results achieved in each area. One of the conditions to assess the outcome of any evaluation program is that key findings and their respective indicators must be clearly identified at beginning. This requires that a database or baseline is in place. These components are essential to establish monitoring and evaluation of outcomes of any program.

It was difficult to analyze data collected in Chibuto because there was no precise and systematic connection between what had been planned with the results. This information could make the analysis more accurate. Thus, much of the information collected was based on perceptions of key stakeholders of the program. To overcome this gap and secure some accuracy a cross and triangulation of information from various sources was undertaken. In what follows we present the activities and results of the five pillars of the program

1. Education

With the installation of the village at the end of 2006 there was a strong grip on the registration of residents for the literacy courses, reaching a total number of 641. The program also contributed by providing school supplies. In the second year of the implementation of the literacy program the lack of teaching materials for learners aggravated leading to higher drop out rate. The program has not had sufficient budget to meet the needs of the village schools. This is a major constraint to the performance of this sector.

To meet the needs of the literacy program, literacy centres were also established in the *barrios* (quarters of the districts). In addition to literacy classes the majority of learners were attending a course in dressmaking.

Still within education four classrooms for primary education and improved latrines were built at unity C and D. In every school there are four classrooms distributed for computing, cutting and sewing, courses for small business, and education. The program has ensured in this way, that each year (2007-2010), approximately 2,000 school-age children may have access to education.

The program conducted training activities, which benefited 66 teachers from 2008 to 2010. In 2009 a library was installed in the millennium village, run from 7:30 to 15:30 from Monday to Friday. This has been attended not only by students from the village but also by others from the neighbourhoods.

According to data from the SQPI¹ literacy activities have benefited 406 adults over the period 2007 to 2010. These literacy activities are carried out in coordination with District Services of Education, Youth and Technology (SDEJT), which provide five facilitators for technical and pedagogical support. There are currently 6 literacy classes running throughout the village.

As part of Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs), the village of Chibuto in partnership with the Company Mozambique Cellular (mCel) graduated since 2007 to date 140 people. Computing training is provided by two technicians in a room which is equipped

¹ MVP: shortlisted Quarterly Performance Indicator (SQPI). Reading the program reports and documentation, we noticed some inconsistency on the data presented. For instance, in the same sector the figures on the beneficiaries differ. As a result we caution the readers to see these figures as estimates.

with 10 computers. There is also a system for Internet access that is powered by solar panels. Additionally, four mobile phones were distributed and are under community management, to ensure access to information and communication in the village.

Among graduates in computing there are 28 teachers. The Internet service is very much sought after by students, public and private officials. However, public officials are the largest group to use the service. The internet has enabled users to carry out research to assist them in their students and professionals activities.

Findings

In general we can say that the VM of Chibuto is significantly contributing to reduce the illiteracy rate in the district. This is illustrated by the fact that women are the largest number of beneficiaries of literacy. The VM is also ensuring access to education for boys and girls but the access to Information and Communication Technologies is still less effective.

2. Health

Before the installation of the village the area was struggling with serious health problems, including frequent cases of malaria, HIV / AIDS, tuberculosis and other diseases. One of the first measures of the program was to carry out home visits to identify seriously ill patients, conduct outpatient treatment and refer serious cases to health centres.

To meet the health needs of the population, 86 activists were trained in 2007 and divided by areas of interventions. Each area had seven activists: I) HIV / AIDS, ii) malaria, iii) social affairs, IV) Water and sanitation. These activists provided information and knowledge about health to the inhabitants in the village.

Accordingly, public and home talks were held on the issues such as malaria, Tuberculosis, Sexually Transmitted Diseases (STDs) and HIV / AIDS. Alongside the talks and awareness campaigns it was introduced the testing for HIV / AIDS, which had in the early years (2008 and 2009) a wide adherence, which helped to identify patients needing treatment. Additionally, a monitoring and administration of treatment for chronic illnesses was carried out.

To ensure the prevention and control of malaria in the village, mosquito nets were distributed to 3,500 families. In 2008 was introduced the vaccination with vitamin A supplementation in children and including Mebendazol to combat malnutrition of children. These vaccinations were applied by mobile teams. An evaluation of the emotional state of children in the village was also performed.

Still related to the vaccination campaign there was an administration of vaccines to pregnant women and in reproductive age (15 to 49 years). Children from 0 to 9 years were administered vaccines against tetanus, measles and polio. In effect, the District Health Services, Women and Social Action (SDSMAS) provided the health post with vaccines and a respective glacier.

With regards to social affairs there were activities on moral education, in which families were made aware not to abandon their children and old people in a situation of dependency.

Under the National Health Service (NHS) the health post operating in the village uses a kit of type A. Given the high demand of health care services in the village, there is an ongoing transformation of the health post into a Health Centre which will include a maternity service. For such purpose the construction of the health post building has already started. Currently, the health post works with a staff of three people namely: one responsible for healing, the second in charge of the Vaccination Expanded Program and the third in the area of water and sanitation. The health post is attending not only the village's local community but it is also assisting surrounding communities. The following table summarizes the actions undertaken in the health sector from 2007 to 2010 in the VM of Chibuto.

Table: health sector beneficiaries per activity.

Nr	Activities implemented	# of Beneficiaries (2007-2010)
1	Patients under malaria treatment	1035
2	pregnant women tested for HIV / AIDS to	420
3	Children vaccinated against measles	1842
4	Pregnant women under prenatal care	778
5	Births	270
6	Home visits to patients	869
7	Individuals tested for HIV / AIDS	1294
8	People under Tuberculosis treatment	387
9	Tuberculosis cases successfully treated	22
	Total	6917

Source: Adapted MVP: SQPI (2010)

One of the main constraints for health sector staff is the lack of transport to carry out missions in the village, when doing home visits and vaccinations. It is not possible to access some parts of the village using bicycles.

Findings

In general we can say that the quality of community health has improved significantly since the enhancement of health care, the increased availability of information and knowledge about disease and also the change in attitude. There is a strengthening of measures for disease prevention by communities.

The area where the village is located is very marshy, which contributes to the prevalence of many cases of malaria. However there has been a decrease of malaria cases in the village.

3. Water and Sanitation

For the launching of the program in 2007 some committees were established to study the five pillars. The water and sanitation committee was established in coordination with local structure community groups to promote individual and collective hygiene. Moreover, community committees and nuclei of sanitation were also created.

Some of the activities of this pillar were undertaken within the public health program through talks to demonstrate the utility of using Moringa in water purification. A total of 16 improved latrines were built and distributed in four schools to promote health and hygiene education. In these schools there were established health nuclei comprising 15 students and a teacher as a facilitator. As a result in 2008 approximately 7000 seedlings of Moringa were produced to

purify water; 16 talks were held on the proper use of latrines targeting 388 families (CRCT-South, 2009).

One impact of the use of moringa in water treatment is the replication of this practice in other areas of the district. When health fairs are organized staff from the village perform demonstration of water treatment and sanitation to promote the practice.

The program in coordination with the WHO has installed a demonstration centre of technological options for water and sanitation. Additionally, it was built a yard for the production and sale of improved latrines, and undertaken a training of local artisans. In total the program trained ten community health workers and eight community activists from the neighbourhoods.

To promote the consumption of potable water and sanitation the program rehabilitated six open wells and constructed a factory of tank lavatories for public baths, where people can wash clothes.

A blue library specializing in primary education on public health was installed to contribute to knowledge in public health. Most library users are adults, which include activists and officials of the village.

To ensure its optimum performance the program undertook training activities in the management of water supplies, sanitation and public health, domestic violence and on the functioning of the blue library.

However, the investment in the sector of water supply is still not very effective as compared to the needs of the village. The program has not proceeded with the construction of more waterholes, limiting its intervention on the rehabilitation of existing ones. The village of Chibuto consists of 13000 inhabitants and their need in terms of access to water is quite acute. There are many families which still need to improve sanitation, in terms of having a latrine and improved conditions for domestic waste disposal.

Again in terms of water and sanitation, the District Services of Planning and Infrastructure (SDPI) undertook an inventory of all water sources in the district and installed a low-cost hand pump (brand Afri-pump) in the village.

Findings

There is behaviour change in the village in relation to hygiene and sanitation, when comparing the initial and current situations. There are noteworthy changes particularly people now recognize the importance and necessity of treating water as a way to prevent diseases. The conservation of improved latrines and domestic waste disposal has contributed to improved hygiene conditions. The community benefited greatly from education for sanitation. The only constraint is the program limited resources to effectively assist the 13,000 villagers.

4. Agriculture

With regard to agriculture several actions were undertaken in order to contribute to the elimination of hunger and malnutrition in the village.

In terms of agricultural extension in the period from 2007 to 2009, the program assisted 2073 families through the acquisition of agricultural inputs and their distribution to the beneficiaries. The program distributed plough and animals and, also bought a tractor with its trailer and tools.

The village has an area of 300 ha for the practice of agriculture. There is a farmers association constituted by ex-miners in the Republic of South Africa. This association has been working in an area of about 10 ha and with the start of the millennium village program it benefited from other inputs such as pump provided by the IMF, to assist in their irrigation system. According to the farmers the existing pipes can cover an area of 20 ha.

In production areas the peasants organized in shifts of 30 people are carrying out various activities such as cleaning of dike, weeding and irrigation of canals. There are demonstration areas for cabbage, onions, tomatoes, peppers and aubergines. Part of the production is used for consumption and the other is taken to the village market. As a result of the introduction of various techniques of planting and production, the productivity of the fields is increasing contributing to improved diet and incomes of families. Daily, as a result of selling of products on the market the association is able to deposit in its account between 2000 to 3000 Mtn. Prices are set by the market and there is a great demand for tomatoes. In 2008 the production of vegetables was as follows: 5428 kg of tomatoes in 1ha, 2511kg in 0.75 ha of onion, 248kg of lettuce at 0.2 ha and 280 kg of cabbage at 0.125 h.

In terms of training, 248 farmers have been targeted acquiring skills through the demonstration of correct application of mineral and inorganic fertilizers; 315 Farmers received extension worker assistance; a demonstration field for rice was organized and 47 cashew nut trees were pulverised against diseases.

In terms of pisciculture, two tanks were built measuring 25X15 meters each with a production capacity of 1000 fish of 0.5 kg each. To that end, 28 people (8 women and 20 men) were trained in areas of fish production and management (VM of Chibuto, 2008 Report). However, the production of fish in 2009 was estimated at 150kg which was below the expected results. The low production was attributed to insufficient water and non compliance with certain technical recommendations.

An activity that has shown great impact on the village is related to chicken production. This activity is developed by a group of 60 ladies distributed in 4 poultry-yards. There is also a group of four orphaned children who assist the program managing a small aviary. The production they obtain is placed on the market and the income is used for their livelihood. In 2008, chicken production has hit 13,000 units.

An agro-processing CTTDH centre was created in 2007 and benefited about 21 people received training in agro-processing. This activity allows ensuring the conservation and consumption of food out of their seasons. However, its use is not sufficiently enhanced.

Recently, a Local Development Committee (CDL) has been created in the village and according to our respondents this body has contributed to more participatory management of the village strengthening the links between the community and the management team of the village.

Findings

Given its location the VM of Chibuto has the possibility of transforming agriculture into higher productivity activity. The introduction of new sowing and production techniques have contributed to increased production by peasants and consequently raising their incomes. While the production of chickens by its nature will soon reach its sustainability, farming and agro-processing have not yet achieved significant results with a positive impact on life of communities.

5. Gender and HIV / AIDS

The structure of the program shows that gender and HIV / AIDS are cross-cutting issues. The results achieved here should be viewed in parallel with the activities of other sectors or pillars of the program. This implies for instance, ensuring that in all activities of the program there is an equal benefit to women and men. A main objective of this pillar is to ensure improved livelihoods for women and men.

Under this component were carried out awareness campaigns through talks on HIV / AIDS and domestic violence. Equally a Committee for HIV / AIDS and Gender was created and performed several activities in this regard. The program carries out the distribution and promotion of condoms use, counselling activities to HIV positive people and voluntary testing as a means of preventing and combating HIV / AIDS. Therefore, most activities are related to the pillar of health.

The program has developed initiatives and training in the management of small business as well as providing micro-credit in order to promote the empowerment of women. So far 17 beneficiaries mostly women received small loans amounting to MZN 1500 to start small businesses. This credit is refundable to allow its use by other beneficiaries. As a way to ensure repayment and business success, the committee keeps track of the beneficiaries. There are more success stories which highlight the relevance of this initiative.

The production of chickens which was highlighted on the pillar of agriculture is also one of the activities that emphasis the empowerment of women in the village. Also the training project in dressmaking (cutting and sewing) within the CTTDH graduated 80 people, including 63 women.

Findings

The benefits of the program are increasingly reaching equally men and women. There is clearly an effort to strengthen the empowerment of women. Also a focus on HIV / AIDS has allowed many patients to benefit from treatment and improve their quality of life.

V.THE PERFORMANCE OF THE PNVM OF CHIBUTO

A. Relevance

The fighting against absolute poverty in Mozambique is described as a national priority in different documents such as the Government Five-Year Plan (QGP), the Action Plan for the Reduction of Absolute Poverty (PRSP) and the 2025 Agenda.

Mozambique is one of the countries that adhered to the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), and since then the country structured its planning process to ensure the accomplishments of the MDGs goals. This aspect is evident in many policy and planning documents of the country. For instance, the MCT (2006) states that the millennium villages are in line with government priorities, which is why the country decided to adhere to this initiative promoted by Professor Jeffrey Sachs.

There is no doubt about the relevance of the PNVM for Mozambique and it is being implemented with a great sense of innovation by investing in the potential that science and technology can offer. Therefore, the program emphasis is on a rapid expansion and popularity of science as well as the deployment of science solutions and innovations to benefit the poorest. For that reason, the millennium villages are seen as points of reference in terms of changes in fighting poverty and achieve the MDGs. However, the concept of Millennium Village as adopted in Mozambique is somewhat ambitious given the political and socio-economic reality of the country. For example, the village of Chibuto, after five years of existence, is not yet effectively functioning as a referral centre for best practices and experiences which can be replicated. Chibuto still need to consolidate its activities in order to replicate their best practices.

B. Effectiveness

The analysis on effectiveness or efficiency shows how far the program has achieved or expects to achieve its objectives, according to their order of importance. The possibility of carrying out a systematic analysis of achievements depends on the existence of a good monitoring system, which must clearly indicate the qualitative and quantitative input and output, expected results and impact indicators of the program.

Analyzing the PNVM of Chibuto it is not possible to understand from existing documents clear and logically the order and sequence of objectives and their performance indicators. While there is an effort to present data on performance indicators in a systematic way, there is still little clarity and consistency connecting the program objectives, indicators and activities. To overcome this gap the evaluation was based on accounts and perceptions of stakeholders and beneficiaries of the program. As a result, we triangulated the objectives of the program as presented above with the areas of the VM of Chibuto and the MDGs.

A general assessment of the effectiveness of the program with regard to the period 2007 to the present lead us to conclude that its efficacy is satisfactory although there is a mismatch between the concept and methodology applied to achieve the desired results. In particular, the fact that the villages in their design have a budget of 350,000 USD for a target group of 5000 people and not 13,000 as is the case of Chibuto. Therefore, even if the program is operating on its full capacity it can not operate all the necessary transformations to achieve the MDGs

within the duration of the project. There will be certainly some groups that are excluded or can not enjoy fully the benefits of the program. Nevertheless, the program has great potential to produce synergies that if properly explored may help to some extent to overcome the limitation in terms of resources.

The performance of the program varies according to the pillars. The pillar of education has a remarkable contribution in literacy campaigns and the expansion of primary education. There are very positive results in the health sector, water and sanitation. For instance, the village is about to become in a near future a centre of reference of best practice in terms of health care, promotion of hygiene and education for sanitation. In particular, the practice of treating water with natural means such as the use of moringa.

Although there is a remarkable progress in the agriculture sector in terms of increasing production, this activity has not yet achieved its full potential. Except the creation of chicken, there is a lot to be done. In relation to gender and HIV / AIDS, there has been progress in the fighting against HIV / AIDS, but little clarity about the approach that the program follows on the gender component.

Despite limited resources and delays in disbursing funds, one of the factors that have contributed to the efficient performance of the program is the effective cooperation of the district government and various others partnerships created locally.

C. Efficiency

The Millennium Village of Chibuto as indicated above is funded by UNDP and for the year 2008 the amount was 300,000 USD. According to the program's principles of resource allocation, these funds were disbursed in four trimesters according to the village's annual plan as well the requests by areas of intervention. In addition to the amount of 350,000 USD, which corresponds to the millennium village concept, there were contributions to the village budget from public, private and other partnerships. For example, the project of water purification using moringa was granted 5000 USD by the National Research Fund of the MCT in 2008.

It was difficult for the evaluator to accurately determine the program's performance in terms of efficiency. Most reports and documents of the program do not provide a detailed budget for each year. What we have seen in some reports was only the statement of expenditures made in a given year.

The Millennium Village approach implies that annually each village has a budget of at least \$ 350,000 for a population of 5000 people. The funds are channelled through the UNDP to the MCT and 10% of this budget is allocated to the central office and the remaining is used for the implementation of the village. The village of Chibuto presented a number of 13,000 people. As noted above it would be impossible on this basis to effectively meet the needs of 13,000 people.

One aspect that deserves reflection on the efficiency of the program relates to the way the management, organization and implementation of the program was undertaken from the beginning. There were no clear roles for management, supervision, organization and implementation on the interaction between and among the CNPVM, CRCT and CVL. This lack of clarity resulted in the CNPVM concentrating on itself the implementation functions,

leaving the CRCT and CVL with marginal roles. This affected partly the efficiency of the program, considering that many activities could have had a greater impact if conducted by the CVL. The most worrying situation was when the CVL started facing difficulties to pay current expenses including delays in paying salaries among others. The table below shows how many resources the CVL spent directly.

Table of Disbursements

Year	Currency	Amount
2008	USD	43,500,00
2009	USD	24,000,00
2009	MZM	249,975,00
2010	MZM	2,020,114,52

Source: Table of Disbursements of the VM of Chibuto (2010)

Many of our interviewees pointed out that the difficulty of coordination and communication has constrained the implementation of the program. This means that most activities of the program would have been carried out more effectively at the local level.

D. Sustainability

Because the program has a strong alignment with other country's development strategies, in particular the decentralization process, this allows a strong collaboration with local governments. As a result, within the district planning most of the VM's activities are being integrated into government sector plans such as health, education and agriculture. These sectors have provided human resources, medicines and other supplies for the well functioning of the village.

Some income-generating projects have become sustainable and can continue without the need for resources from the budget of the Millennium Village. Additionally, one of the main achievements of the VM of Chibuto was the strengthening in cooperation and trust capital, as manifested through the establishment of various local associations. These associations can also benefit from the Investment Fund for Local Initiatives, known as 7 million, for the implementation of their projects.

Still under the sustainability strategy it is planned to integrate the local management structure into the CRCT. However, until recently the CRCT has played a less visible role in terms of its activities in the village.

The major element for improving the sustainability of VMs is their capacity to mobilize local communities to have ownership of the initiative. However, this factor may be affected by less efficient and effective management, which is characterized by centralization and less effective communication between the local (the VM's office and local authorities) and central (central office at the MCT). The new challenge of the programme is to create mechanisms that will assure the sustainability of investments made and reinforce the decentralization process ongoing in the village.

VI. CONCLUSIONS

One of the assumptions for the implementation of the PNVM is its prospect to contribute for accelerating the fighting against poverty in order to achieve the MDGs. Given the initial conditions of the *VM of Chibuto*, we consider that the program has contributed significantly to improve the living standards of beneficiary communities. However, the discrepancy between the concept and its implementation methodology, in this case the criteria of 350,000 USD for 5000, forces us to conclude that some communities of the VM of Chibuto will not immediately benefit from the program.

We point out that the performances differ from sector to sector. The pillar of education contributed to the reduction in the illiteracy rate and expanded the access to primary education. The pillars of health, water and sanitation show significant results in particular a greater health care service delivery, covering the village's neighbouring communities. There is individuals' gradual increase in knowledge levels and attitudes about diseases as well as an improved community health quality. The completion of the Health Centre building will enhance the prospect for this village to have a health centre of reference.

Within the water and sanitation sector, the village has developed benchmarking practices in the treatment of water using natural means and resources. For instance, the use of Moringa has great benefits for the health and welfare of communities. However, it should be noted that despite the qualitative changes in this area, access to water still appears to be a major concern in the village.

The availability of computer trainings and access to information technologies represent an added value in employment opportunities for young people and help lifting up public officials' skills. However, this activity is still not significant in the village.

The Agriculture sector has a great potential for contributing to the improvement of living conditions of local populations. However, we note that despite the progress made so far, in fighting poverty, their performance is still below the expected potential; taking into account its favourable conditions for farming, such as soil fertility that could help in improve the productivity.

The program's approach seems quite relevant to the country's context. However, the current management style is reducing its effectiveness jeopardizing an opportunity for its sustainability as implementation continues to be very centralized and the role of the CRCT is insignificant. Decentralization process of the programme started in 2010, with the aim of improve the management capacity of the programme and coping with the new challenges.

The acceptance and adherence to the program by local communities is strong and there is good collaboration between the district government and the CVL. As a result many interventions of the village Samora Machel are already being incorporated into the activities of various government sectors in the district. Most activities undertaken by communities are demonstrating that they have potential to guarantee the sustainability of the program.

The MCT through the new Centre for Investigation and Technology Transfer for Community Development (CITT) has an important role in fostering the use and dissemination of science, technology and innovation at the service of communities, particularly the poorest segment of society. Despite the effort undertaken, the use and application of science and technology to

boost up the fighting against poverty is still one of the challenges of the programme and below the expected potential. Many activities in the VM should in principle serve as a scale of excellence to ensure its rapid replication to other locations. However, what we observed in many areas suggest the need for more investments in new technologies and innovation to improve the programme capacity of achieving their results. For example, in the agriculture sector, apart from the distribution of inputs there is also a basic extension work. It's necessary for that sector to improve the use of technologies to increase productivity and developing value chain production.

VII. RECOMMENDATIONS

According to the analysis and conclusions presented above there are a number of key recommendations to improve the performance of the Chibuto millennium village:

- Given the nature of the program, which seeks to bring about meaningful changes in communities it is imperative to revise the program in order for each village to have a clear and logical plan for each year, which includes objectives and performance indicators. This will allow knowing what key findings of the program are and how to achieve them.
- It is essential that steps be taken to design a system for monitoring and evaluation to accurately measure the progress and impact of the program. The same system will contribute for various program's partners to know the results achieved so far in a transparent and objective ways.
- Given that the vision of PNVM establishes that each village must work as a referral centre that will serve as an example and share its experiences, it is imperative that the village identifies activities with great potential to meet its objective.
- To enhance transparency in the management of funds and strengthen the decentralization and autonomy of the CVL, as envisaged in the ECTIM, the budget of the village must be clear with regard to the volume of resources going to the CNPVM in its oversight function and the amount that goes to the CVL.
- The roles of the CNPVM, CRCT and CVL must be clarified to ensure better communication and coordination in the implementation of the program. Additionally, the role of the CRCT must be strengthened and more resources allocated to the CVL so that it has better participation in the program implementation.
- The CNPVM should review how it conducts supervision by identifying more efficient ways. Currently the program presents higher supervision and travel expenses. Probably the CRCT overseeing role should be strengthened in order to reduce supervision costs.
- Considering that the village of Chibuto works with a population of 13,000 inhabitants there is a need to rethink on a strategy to raise more funds and partnerships to respond to the growing number of beneficiaries in various components of the program.
- The program must develop effective mechanisms for participation via the CDL in order to strengthen community involvement.

VIII. REFERENCES

- CRCT-Sul (2009) Balanço Anual das Actividades na VM Chibuto 2008
Governo de Moçambique (2005) Plano Quinquenal do Governo 2005-2009
MCT (2006) Programa Nacional das Vilas do Milénio, Maputo
MCT (2009) Plano Operativo da Vila do Milénio de Chibuto
MCT/PNVM (2009) Vilas do Milénio, revista, Edição número 1, Setembro, Publicação Anual
MCT (2010) Plano da Vila de Milénio de Chibuto
MVP/Chibuto (2010) Shortlisted Quarterly Performance Indicator (SQPI)

ANNEXS

- I. Terms of Reference
- II. List of Interviewed People.

B List of interviewed people.

A. Maputo, 19.11.2010

Vitoria de Jesus Langa- MCT

B. Chibuto 02.12.2010

Focal Group – Extension workers and Facilitators

1. Alberto Vasco Chambule- Extensionist for Agricultura
2. António Chavice- Extension worker for Education
3. Horácio Salomão Gomes- Extensionist for Health
4. Hortência Artur Chauque- Facilitator for Education
5. Narciso José Uthui- Extension worker for water and Sanitation
6. Rafael Jonas Mate- Extensionist for Health on PAV (Programa Alargado de Vacinação).

C. Chibuto 02.12.2010

1. Tereza Fernando Mazive- Member of the CDL;
2. Artur Chauque- President of the Local management Committee e Presidents of Ex-miners farmers associations;
3. Ernesto C. Nuvunga- President of CDL
4. Laura Gabriel Massingue- Member of Local management Committee

D. Chibuto, 02.12.2010- 12:00 H

José Paulino- District Permanent Secretary of Chibuto

E. Chibuto 02.12.2010

Rafael Carmona- District Director of Planning and Infra-structures

F. Chibuto- 02.12.2010

Moises Maló- District Director of Women ad Social Action

G. Chibuto- 02.12.2010

District Director of Education, Youth and Technology

H. Chibuto- 03.12.2010

District Services for Economic Activities

1. Paulo Bacar
2. Milagre Simbine