

TERMINAL EVALUATION REPORT UNDP Poland:

AIDS and HIV Projects

POL1961003 Support to Civil Society Organisations
POL/97/003 Managing the Social and Public Health Consequences of HIV and AIDS

APR 30 2007

Aleksandra Duda
ErnstJan Stroes
Warsaw, Poland, March 2001

Terminal Evaluation Report

I Evaluation identification sheet

Bureau	UNDP Poland
Evaluated projects numbers	POL/96/003/A/01/99
	POL/97/003/B/99
Evaluated projects titles	Support to Civil Society Organisations
	Managing the Social and Public Health Consequences of HIV and AIDS
Type of evaluation	Final
Evaluators	Alexandra Duda
	ErnstJan Stroes
Term of evaluation	12/02/2001 till 09/03/2001

2 Executive summary

From 1996 till the end of 2000, UNDP Poland implemented activities aimed at managing the consequences of the HIV/AIDS epidemic in Poland. These activities were implemented in the framework of two projects "Support to Civil Society Organisations (POL/96/003)" and "Managing the social and public health consequences of HIV and AIDS (POL/97/003)". As a result of these two projects more than 7000 people were trained on behaviour which prevents infection, and more than half a million of booklets, leaflets, and reports were disseminated. Over the duration of the projects the attitude towards HIV/AIDS in Poland changed and has become more rational and the further spread of the epidemic came to a halt. The projects implemented by UNDP were very relevant and performed well within the nation wide effort to stop HIV/AIDS infection. Governments, sponsors and beneficiaries expressed their satisfaction with UNDP's activities.

One of the most relevant lessons concerning project management and design to be drawn from the projects is that working with two similar projects at the same time is not practical and does have negative implications on the evaluation of the projects, especially considering different quality of the two. The lack of narrative project updates made evaluation even more complicated as some activities formulated in the project documents were realised up to 10 times while the objectives were not changed. Such situations should be avoided in the future. Budget revisions should be accompanied by narrative project updates. Additionally, for reporting purposes, reports should be more closely linked to original project activities, and outputs identified and integrated in a project management database.

In the case of these two projects UNDP had a specific role to play in Poland. In a rather restrictive and over sensitive environment UNDP gave a voice to human rights, knowledge and advanced solutions of international community. This helped to advocate for more effective approaches, which fully respect human rights, as well as improved living conditions of those living with HIV/AIDS. It is recommended to continue the undertaken activities and concentrate them further at transfer of experience and knowledge to countries east of Poland, harm-reduction and prevention, NGO capacity building for becoming self-sustained, education for special groups such as policeman and prison guards, and creation of

POI/96/003uodPOL87/003

1	1 Evaluation identification sheet	
1	Executive summary y.....	
1		
3	Table of Contents	
2		
4	Description of projects - - - - -	3
5	Methodology ---.....	
3		
6	Relevance	
4		
(11	
4		
U	
4		
U	5
&4	Beneficiaries	
0		
(15 Conclusions - - - - -	
	6
7	
7		
7	
	7.1.1 Effectiveness of POLI% /003 "Support to civil "Support to 7 11.2 - - - - -	
	Effectiveness of P01J97/003 "Managing the social and public health consequences of { n/ and W8 - - - - -	
y		
7.1.3	National Policy view mueffectiveness ---.....	
n z1A	Donors view on ---.....	D
11.5	Beneficiaries view on effectiveness	
D		
72 7ZI		
12		
7W	EMAM a MMM3 "Managing the =11 and public health consequences of HIV and AIDS	
o		
7.2.3	12
7.2.4	National Policy view on efficiency	
a		
725	Cours Am	8
7.2.6	Beneficiaries view on efficiency	
13		
7.3	Timeliness	
13		
7A/	Government how motimeliness	
/^		
T92	I3ouumvim on timeliness	
14		
7.3.3	Beneficiaries' view on timeliness	
1^		
7.4	Conclusions	
14		

8 Lessons learned	15
8.1 Project design	15
8.2	15
8.3 Management	16
9 Impact and sustainability	17
9.1 Impact	17
9.2 Somtabability	17
10 Recommendations	18
lül Pifect design	18
IR2 Performance	18
}û3 Management	18

Terminal Evaluation Report
97/003

POL/96/003 and POL/

4 Description of projects

This terminal evaluation report covers two projects implemented by the Polish Government and UNDP Poland since 1996. These projects had a common aim, which was the prevention and management of the HIV/AIDS epidemic in Poland. Nevertheless there are some clear differences between the two projects. The first project, entitled "Support to Civil Society Organisations", aimed at "improvement of public awareness about HIV resulting in a reduction of the spread of HIV, a better understanding of the problem and acceptance in respect to those who are infected and their families". The second project, entitled "Managing the social Consequences of HIV and AIDS", aimed at "equipping governmental and nongovernmental organisations with the skills and support necessary to manage the social consequences of political and economic change, of which HIV/AIDS is one of the most visible phenomena¹. The working interpretation was that the first project concentrated on raising the capacity of NGOs dealing with harm reduction, while the second co-operated with the Ministry of Health to implement the "National Programme for the prevention of AIDS infection and care for people living with HIV and ill with AIDS 1996-1998". Although some of the activities of the projects terminated and no programme updates were made, the general objectives of both remained valid and therefore activities were continued. The projects' continued activities were based on contracts between the projects and the National AIDS Centre, which were never formally updated. These contracts did not

result in formal project updates. As both projects were closely linked in practice, a division between them was visible neither to beneficiaries nor to sponsors; this is the reason why only one terminal evaluation was undertaken for both projects.

5 Methodology

The Programme Manager for both projects gives an outline of the evaluation in the Terms of Reference (annex 1). The objective of the evaluation was to assess relevance, performance and success of both projects.

The evaluation team consisted of two evaluators; one from the side of the Polish Government appointed by the Office of the Committee for European Integration, which is the Polish Government counterpart of UNDP, and one appointed by UNDP Poland. The starting point of the evaluation was a prepared evaluation plan (annex 2). This plan covered a period of less than one month (February 12, 2001 till March 9 2001), and defined the following evaluation methods:

- Project documentation review
- Review of documents related to the implementation of the projects
- Inquiries and discussion with Government officials
- Inquiries and discussion with sponsors
- Inquiries and discussion with beneficiaries

The evaluation concentrated on the narrative aspects of both projects and not on the financial aspects. As the two evaluators had no earlier experience with the projects, the evaluation was external. The focus of the evaluation is in-line with the focus for terminal evaluations as defined in the UNDP handbook. D

¹ Project document: POL196/003/A/01/99

² Project document: POL/97/003B/99;

Special note: We understand the idea hidden beneath this statement however it is difficult to accept this kind of imprecise imagery of HIV/AIDS being one of the most visible phenomenon of the Polish transformation.

³ Results-oriented Monitoring and Evaluation (A Handbook for Programme Manager), UNDP, New York 1997.

6 Relevance

The key question in this chapter is, if the evaluated projects were relevant. This question is first evaluated in perspective on the UNDP areas of thematic focus under the SHD framework and the relevant Country Co-operation Frameworks. Furthermore this question is reviewed from the point of view of the Polish Government, the beneficiaries and the donors.

6.1 UNDP

UNDP defines the following thematic focuses: poverty eradication and sustainable livelihoods, gender considerations in development, sustainable environment and sound management of natural resources and sound government. The projects are relevant with respect to all three focuses. At the start of these projects, people suffering from HIV/AIDS were especially affected by poverty. The overall economic decline in Poland which followed the political transition of 1989 impoverished large parts of the population; it struck hardest the already weak social groups, among them HIV/AIDS patients who at the beginning of the HIV epidemic constituted a vast majority of HIV infected community. With respect to gender considerations, the project also took into account groups such as: prostitutes, young women and pregnant women.

The projects' relevance for sound governance is reflected in the assistance to the Polish Government in establishing relations with NGOs, training local authorities and reviewing compliance with EU regulations in this perspective. Conformity with the Country Cooperation Frameworks was complete, as the respective projects were part of the CCF.

UNDP Country Co-operation Framework

20. "UNDP is currently supporting CSOs working on HIV- and AIDS-related issues (health and prevention, sexual ethics, medical ethics, drug related issues, support to people infected with HIV, and family/support groups, etc.), and the Ministry of Health, in areas of publications and training for medical personnel and local authorities, and strengthening national capacity to deal with HIV/AIDS-related issues, in terms of prevention, care, employment, family support, non-discrimination, drug abuse, medical ethics, etc. Successful experiences in responding to the HIV epidemic will be expanded, thereby providing increased support to those directly and indirectly affected by the epidemic... "4.

6.2 Government

There are two governmental offices in Poland responsible for formulation of national policies in the field of drugs and HIV/AIDS as well as their implementation. These are the National AIDS Centre and the National Bureau for Drug Addictions. The National AIDS Programme for the years 1996-1998 had the following objectives: improvement of the existing system of HIV infection prevention, community education, creation of appropriate attitudes based on actual knowledge and human rights and assurance of an integrated system of care for people living with HIV and ill with AIDS⁵. The activities of the projects concentrated mainly on the first two objectives and to a lesser extent and mainly through NGOs on the third objective. The National AIDS Programme for the years 1999-2003 has the following objectives: limit the spread of HIV infection in Poland, improve the quality and access to care for people living with HIV and AIDS. Within the current Programme the projects mainly reflect the first objective. Both projects supported the activities of the National Bureau for Drug Addiction;

⁴ First Country Co-operation Framework 1997-1999 (DP/CCF/POL/1) Executive Board of the United Nations Development Programme and of the United Nations Population Fund, New York, March 1997. ⁵ National AIDS Programme 1996-1998 (Krajowy Program Zapobieganie Zakazeniom HIV i Opieki nad Zyj4cymi z HIV i Chorymi na AIDS 1996-1998) Ministry of Health and Social Welfare, Warsaw 1996.

from 1997 till 1999 this Bureau acted upon the National Law on Counteracting Drug Addiction, with the objective of education and preventive measures in which the projects participated. Since 1999 there exists an operational National Programme for Counteracting Drug Addiction. Relevant objectives of this Programme are: to improve access to preventive activities targeting children and teenagers, to improve the standard of preventive measures as well as various activities in the area of rehabilitation and social reintegration of drug addicts, to reduce the negative impact of the abuse of narcotics and psychotropic substances (harm reduction), to exercise strict control of compounds (precursors) and to strengthen the structures co-ordinating activities aimed at preventing and combating drug addiction at the national, regional and local levels. The two projects were especially relevant for the activities concerning harm reduction and the establishment of a network of NGOs for this purpose. In discussions with directors of both offices (Ms. Malgorzata Czerniawska - Ankiersztejn M.D. of the National Aids Centre and Mr Piotr Jabłoński of the National Bureau for Drug Addiction) and the advisor to the Minister of Health on Aids Prevention and Drug Addiction (ks. Arkadiusz Nowak) it became clear that co-operation with the projects was considered to be very relevant for the development of good practices in AIDS prevention and harm reduction. Its main thrust is reflected in the following figures: about 30% of drug addicts who do not participate in harm reduction programmes become HIV infected while only 2% of drug addicts who participate in harm reduction programmes become HIV positive. According to these offices the role of the projects was relevant to facilitate a discussion about most sensitive issues related to HIV and AIDs, such as safe sex and harm reduction programmes. The Director (Mr Tadeusz Kozek) and the Counsellor (Ms Barbara Mrówka) of the Office of the Committee for European Integration confirmed that the projects had a special role as they provided objective international knowledge to the aggravated public debate about HIV/AIDS and harm reduction.

6.3 Donors

Donors significantly participated in both projects. The Levi Strauss Foundation aims at *risk* reduction education targeted to populations most at risk for HIV/AIDS, including injection drug users and their partners, minorities and gay and bisexual men and support services for people affected by HIV/AIDS, including individuals who are HIV-positive, as well as their families and caregivers. UNAIDS is a common programme of all UN agencies and has as its mission: "As the main advocate for global action on HIV/ADDs, UNAIDS leads, strengthens and supports an expanded response aimed at preventing the transmission of HIV, providing care and support, reducing the vulnerability of individuals and communities to HIV/AIDS, and alleviating the impact of the epidemic ". The SOROS Foundation International Harm Reduction Development programme's mission is to diminish the

individual and social harms associated with drug use - particularly the risk of HIV infection - through innovative measures based on the philosophy of harm reduction. This approach places an emphasis on human rights, common sense, and public health. The Dutch Embassy's programme has the following aims concerning welfare: developing volunteer work and private initiative; clubs, and children at risk; street children; children and AIDS; child prostitution; juvenile delinquency; child labour; and concerning health care: public health reform and revision of system; awarenessraising (education, information and prevention); care of addicts and *rights* of patients¹⁰. Both

⁶ National Programme for Counteracting Drug Addiction in Poland 1999-2000, Ministry of Health and Social Welfare, Warsaw

⁷ http://www.levistrauss.com/index_community.html

⁸ <http://www.unaids.org/about>

⁹ <http://www.soros.org/harm-reduction>

¹⁰ MATRA Grant Handbook, <http://www.minbuza.nl>

Terminal Evaluation Report
97/003

POL/96/003 and POL/

the SOROS Foundation and the Dutch Embassy were satisfied with the achievements of the projects in the field of harm reduction and with their efficient co-operation with UNDP. They confirmed that the projects were very relevant to their policies concerning Poland.

6.4 Beneficiaries

The beneficiaries, especially NGOs active in harm reduction and HIV/AIDS prevention, were asked to fill out questionnaires. Their answers indicated that the projects were relevant to them. All NGOs stated that the projects fitted very well into their own policies. The projects assisted more than 3500 drug-addicts in harm reduction, which is a large part of the population of drug addicts. Similarly, 2500 prostitutes were helped, although the actual number of the whole group of prostitutes is difficult to assess. Additionally, the questionnaires gathered from participants in training events and workshops, who were dentists, gynaecologists, nurses and doctors, indicated that the training programme was felt to be very relevant.

6.5 Conclusions

The projects proved to be relevant to UNDP's mission, the Government of Poland's policies, the donor community policies and the needs of the beneficiaries. To a large extent the final beneficiaries were reached and assisted. Co-operation between the two projects and the National AIDS Office as well as their close link to the National AIDS Programme significantly added to the fact that the projects were noted as practically and institutionally sound.

7 Performance

This chapter tries to provide an answer to the question of whether the projects performed well. This question is answered concerning the effectiveness, efficiency and timeliness of the projects. The question is approached from the point of view of all partners in the projects. It has to be noted that the lack of the projects' updates was a major problem in assessing performance of these projects thus leaving the main objectives of the projects as the only standards for evaluating performance (most activities and outcomes described terminated).

7.1 Effectiveness

The general question, which this chapter tries to answer, is whether the objectives of both projects have been achieved, outputs realised and activities implemented. The analysis of project reports indicates that most activities of both projects have been implemented. However some doubts can be raised in connection to POL/96/003 of which some activities were not realised. The reason for such a statement is that in some cases identical project activities and outcomes were mentioned in both projects thus raising a question of how many times they really were implemented. The lack of project update documents makes evaluation complicated but updated information can be found in operational documents such as consecutive agreements with the donors.

7.1.1 Effectiveness of POU96/003 "Support to civil society"

The project consisted of the measurable outputs shown in the underneath table.

A network of medical centres fire Voivodships
i"1

ltesim át9.47

lfin t

Ai" W

1.1

Implemented 3 in POL/971003
activities 5.1 and 1.1

2.1

Improved services for living with AIDS and vulnerable oom.
Support to kids, tests for kids, homes and medical care, drop-in centre, counselling for living with aids, youth co-ups for persons at risk, street-workers, prevention efforts, support to those living with HIV/AIDS
Methadone programmes in Zgorzelec, Katowice, HR Krakow, Sponsoring event for those living with HIV/AIDS in Krakow
HR Warsaw, HR Jelenia Góra, HR Kałowice, HR Lublin, HR Krakow, HR Poznan, HR and assistance in Warsaw, HR prisons
Drop in centre Krakow, Street-workers Wroclaw, prevention efforts, support to people with HIV in Wroclaw

Grant commission HR, Training for health care services in prisons, Street-workers, HR in brisons

2.2

Common platform of people living with aids
Training activities, seminars workshops

Implemented 2 conferences in POL/971003 activity 2.6

Teacher training

Workshops in Jelenie Gora

Training with Education Academy in Warsaw, Training by Ministry of Education, Develop training standard by Ministry of Education
Training for 160 teachers additionally in 6 cities for about 150 teachers local workshops

3.2

Peer teaching programmes

Educational programme for youth in Jelenia Gora, Workshops in Praga-W-wa by Health and Ecology, Development of educational materials

Evaluate HIV/AIDS
training programmes by MEN

Educational set in presidential campaign

Workshop Marathon in Rydze

I

3.3

Priests training

Implemented for 100 priests in POU97/003 activity 2.3

Workshops for NGOs, translated guide, support access to Internet and contacts with internationals, International candlelight memorial

I

I

4.

Network of 30 NGOs assisting in implementing NAP

HR Network established

Management of NGOs

5.

Training on pre- and post test counselling

Training for people at drop-in centre

Training for people at dropin centre

Terminal Evaluation Report
POL/961003 and POL/97/003

hi %t 6isesiww

OUW

e!\$LA 9%

t tfr* g.9

peito 998

Rè*k1i~ lm

Community educators training . for refugees

Training Drugs and Drug addicts

Not implemented no access provided to amps

Evaluate NGO activity in NAP International contacts of National AIDS Office

Report on activities

Participation in conferences

Training and
workshops

(Bulgarian delegation in
Krakow, HR and evaluation in Russia, HR Kazakhstan and Kirgizia, Methadone Rumania, Health and HR in prisons,
International workshops people
living with aids.

The implementation related to the following objectives:

1. To assist medical personnel provide proper care for people living with HIV and change

behaviour to prevent infections in health care settings.

The above objective was, as a matter of fact, not reached in the framework of the project but by means of activities 5.1 and 1.1 under project POL/97/003 where the described outputs and the planned effects were reached.

2. Strengthening social and psychological support to people living with HIV and other vulnerable communities by outreach activities.

This objective has been achieved as an *effective* network for harm reduction was created, youngsters were educated, and a network of NGOs helping people with HIV/AIDS was established. HIV infected people moreover participated as trainers in the implementation of activities defined in POL/97/003. This objective relates to activities 2.6, 2.7, 2.8, and 3 numbers of POL/97/003.

3. Strengthening the network of educators/teachers of behaviour change based on UNDP's training module.

This objective strongly relates to activities 2.3 and 3.3 of POL/97/003. It was fully achieved. 4. Strengthening NGOs by improving their leaders' management skills, providing legal

assistance to organisations, support in fund raising and other administrative issues. Training for NGOs was provided, even more was done - harm reduction and street-workers organisations networks were established.

5. Assistance to the National AIDS Programme in design and wide implementation of a proper pre- and post-test counselling system based upon the principle of care for the patient.

Training was implemented for people at drop-in centres as well or 5980 medical personnel in activity 1.1 of POL/97/003

6. To prevent the spread of HIV in refugee camps in Poland and to provide assistance to those already infected.

This objective was not reached, as the organisations which run refugee camps did not provide access to them.

7. Monitoring implementation of the National AIDS Plan by evaluating the activities of the non-governmental organisations working in the field of HIV and their role in the implementation of the NAP.

A report on NGO activities was prepared in 1996; an earlier version comes from 1995.

8. To support the National HIV/AIDS Information Centre providing technical support to all

institutions, organisations and individuals working in the field of HIV In the years 1998 - 2000 needle and syringe exchanges were financed within the project, especially concerning international contacts with other CEE and NIS countries. This objective was not reached within the time frame of the project.

9. Mobilisation of the local authorities to respond to HIV epidemic in their local communities taking care to address all of the issues that arise in the specific parts of the country

This objective relates to activity 2.4 of POL/97/003 and was reached. 216 representatives of local authorities participated between 1997 and 2000 in events offered to them. Thus the main finding about POL/96/003 is that the project was effective as all but one objective were successfully realised

7.1.2 Effectiveness of POU97/003 "Managing the social and public health consequences of HIV and AIDS"

The project consisted of the measurable outputs shown in the underneath table.

t me i4eü lë E

R t im l199'

		Result in 1997	Result in 1998
1.1	3500 Health care staff in 1 day workshops	2160 med. Person. Trained	2900 med. Persons Trained
1.2	100 HIV educators	22 certified	25 certified & 1 Sanitary inspection certified
1.3	Sociological research	Evaluation NAP	Research on Doctors to AIDS
1.4	Support Aspekty	4 NR financed	
1.5	Distribute 1500 copies of former research	6950 p printed	
1.6	Support 7 people international conference.	2 persons	
2.1	Hotline	6079 used telephone	2 months 1242 people
2.2	Two day conference for journalists	Trained 22 journalists	
2.3	Clergy 500 trained reprint booklet 20.000	100 clergy trained, 200.000 pieces church and aids	
2.4	3 two day meetings for 30 LA rep.	1. Kraków 30, 2. Torun 20, 3. Plock 80, 4. Slupsk 26	1. Poznan 31, 2. Gdańsk 29
2.5	Two 3 day conferences for 80 psychologists and 80 social workers	Conference social workers and AIDS 200 participants 200	Conference no result mentioned two workshops for social workers 23 - < .
2.6	National conference for 150	2nd National conference 102 participants	3rd National conference 100
2.7	Direct grants to NGOs on preventive education	8 org supported	participants
2.8	Direct grants to NGOs people living with AIDS	8 org. Supported	6 org. Supported

3.1	Expand street-worker programme to 4 new cities	Programme now in five cities	Programme continued in five cities 12 streetworkers, 9000 prostitutes, 3000 gay, 12000 youngsters
3.2	Young women and aids 30.000	150.000 pieces	
3.3	200.000 copies for youngsters (b ...)10.000 on STD	150.000 packages with condoms, leaflet on STD, 1000 T-shirts, cardboard packages	
3.4	Expand programme for gay	Supported 3 org. In 3 comes	
4.1	Sanitary Inspection for 50 med. Staff	AIDS day conference	
4.2	reduction 3 day conference on term International	HR developed on conference in June	

Certification update 57 educators, Sanitary Inspection conference 100 part., HN/AIDS for schools 100 participants
Two publications one 1500 copies one 2000 copies
Courses for TADA, Training for Ukrainian

Meeting with AIDS prevention units from CEE end NIS, 33 part 6 countries
TADA continues training for 15-20 staff
I three day psychological conference

Training on needle exchange LinerKraków

Network established

Pregnant women and aids 160.000 copies Participation in presidential campaign against drug addiction, 160.000 leaflets, education pack prepared National network established

Reprint 107500 pieces

Terminal Evaluation Report POL/96/003 and POL/97/003

	Most r able ou uE>	me in 1991
4.3	Reprint work on AIDS and criminal law	Resigned
4.4	Comp. Review of polish law	Review of Polish Law.
4.5	World AIDS day conference 150 NGO8	1-3 December Res-Humane
5.1	2 sites for anonymous Testing	Szczeczn, Koszain, Tamów
5.2	Purchase of protease inhbito s for 30 patients	6 Clinics assisted for 10 persons
5.3	Education pack for Doctors	Package prepared
5.4	Guide for Nurses	Guide 27600 pieces
5.5	Guide for Healthy living with AIDS	8000 pieces

esuNin 1598

Résuit in 1909

eSUR 2000

Research on legal aspects of HIV
Szczecin 274 tested 6 positive, Koszafm 84 tested 4 positive, Tamów 22 tested 0 positive
person

Leaflet not published

Distributed through Sanitary Inspection'

The implementation related to the following objectives:

1. To use human and material resources better in policy and programme development and

implementation, with particular attention to governmental and non-governmental sectors

related to the social and health consequences of HIV infection.

The project was able to integrate activities of the governmental sector with those of the nongovernmental sector. It made the implementation of the National AIDS Plan much more effective. The National AIDS plan for 1999-2000 states this clearly "The program was most completely and effectively implemented by the Ministry of Health and its units as well as by non-governmental organisations active for people living with HIV and ill with AIDS". Worthwhile to mention is that in the framework of this objective more than 6000 people were trained.

2. To build capacity of institutions and individuals by providing training, technical assistance and direct support to communities, community leaders, opinion formers, nongovernmental organisations and professionals in order to help them respond with operational approaches to the management of social change, with greater advocacy and to facilitate democratic dialogue.

The project improved the understanding of the implications of the HIV epidemic by means of training, conferences and workshops amongst 22 journalists, 100 clergy, 216 representatives of local authorities, 223 psychologists and social workers and assisted more than 20 nongovernmental organisations. Additionally, it helped in the emancipation of those living with HIV and ill with AIDS by means of two conferences attended by more than 100 people. A sound base was build for the process of change, which took place over the project's duration. The process of change meant that the unjustified negative attitude of the general public towards HIV/AIDS changed over time, significantly improving the situation, treatment and perspective of those living with AIDS. The negative aspect of the situation for NGOs active in the field of HIV/ADDS is that they grew neither in budgets or staff. The positive noticeable aspects of their situation are: some rise in the number of volunteers working in the field, a rise in the number of networks amongst NGOs and financing which shifted from foreign to domestic funding.

3. To increase knowledge, broaden choices and improve services for women, especially pregnant women, and vulnerable groups; to enable them to make informed decisions about their life and health; and to provide greater support to gay men.

¹¹ National AIDS Plan 1999-2003 (Krajowy Program Zapobieganie Zakazeniom HIV, Opieki nad Zyj&cymi z HIV i Chorymi na AIDS na lata 1999-2003) Ministry of Health, Warsaw 1999.

The project improved significantly the knowledge of youth, young women, pregnant women, drug addicts, prostitutes and gay men. All together 700 000

printed materials were targeted at these groups by street workers and educational programmes were made available. 4. To place Polish legislation and thinking about ethics and human rights in a European

Union context and to enable local practice-based expertise relevant to governance and

HIV ta.be_made_more- widely_available,_with increased_ networking and promotion of

issues surrounding HIV/AIDS.

Within this objective Polish law was reviewed, and two conferences were prepared. Harm reduction advocacy was of special importance among these activities. Nevertheless, in the final assessment of the results it has to be admitted that these steps were not ultimately effective, as the Polish parliament passed in the end of the year 2000 a law which will negatively affect the efforts on harm reduction.

5. To increase efficiency and effectiveness of social services and health care through improved delivery and better informed staff.

Except for the training under objective 1, manuals were distributed amongst doctors and nurses. Additionally, a guide was prepared for people living with HIV and ill with AIDS and 3 sites were established for anonymous testing and 20 people with HIV underwent medical treatment. In general the project was very effective, most objectives were reached and activities were implemented as planned.

7.1.3 National Policy view on effectiveness

The representative of the National Office for Drug Addictions expressed the opinion that there were several positive impacts of the projects visible. The establishment of a harm reduction network was the most important of them. To date it assists in contacts of addicts and prevents further spread of HIV/AIDS among them. It is important to mention that drug addicts in Poland were the group that indicated the biggest HIV/AIDS incidence. Additionally, the dissemination of international knowledge in this field occurred to be very important in advocating more open methods of working with drug addicts and HIV/AIDS patients. The Representatives of the National AIDS Centre assessed that the two projects resulted in confinement of HIV/AIDS in Poland. The projects played an important role in establishing co-operation between the Centre and NGOs, raising awareness about the HIV/AIDS epidemic, a more open sexual education was created, local initiatives were enhanced and the general development in Poland was harmonised in this field with developments abroad. The Director and the Counsellor of the Office for the Committee of European Integration commented that the projects were a success. The Secretary of State at the Chancellery of the President (Ms. Barbara Labuda) additionally stated that the projects added an element of openness to the Polish approach to these issues and established certain activities, such as street-workers, which proved effective and concrete.

7.1.4 Donors view on effectiveness

The representative of the "SOROS Foundation" expressed the view that the projects effectively used their resources. The representative of the Dutch

MATRA KAP Fund (Ms Kamala Lagathe) expressed that the reliability of UNDP was an important argument for participating in the projects. It gave them a higher ranking, information was disseminated in an easier way and was therefore more effective.

7.1.5 Beneficiaries view on effectiveness

NGOs active in the field of harm reduction, HIV/AIDS and education saw especially, improvement in needle exchange, methadone programmes, the use of condoms and assistance to HIV/AIDS patients. Additionally they mentioned that due to these activities the spread of

Terminal Evaluation Report
7/003

POL/96/003 and POL/9

the epidemic amongst drug addicts, prostitutes, youngsters and gay groups came to a halt. The NGOs benefited from funding, training on harm reduction as well as improved their management skills. The trained health service personnel evaluated the training as very effective in improving their knowledge on the issue - more than 90% made further use of the knowledge.

7.2 Efficiency

The question to be discussed is whether the project interventions were efficiently implemented i.e. if the objectives of the projects were achieved in the cheapest way. The overall assessment is that the engagement of UNDP as a relatively expensive implementation agency was fully justified as a majority of the people contacted noted that UNDP, as an international agency without any political or ideological bias, was irreplaceable in this specific case.

7.2.1 Efficiency of POU96/003 "Support to civil society"

The project POL/96/003 from 1996 till 2000 spent 1,039,859 USD. The cost consisted only in 5,18% of general project management costs including all staff and administration. Concerning additional funding this project generated over the years 763,454 USD from sources outside UNDP or the Polish Government. Nevertheless the total costs seem rather high for this project as some activities terminated or were included into POL/97/003. In addition to that, the outputs of this project were not very well defined and therefore an evaluation on efficiency creates certain problems. In our opinion the fact that this project was not terminated when

POL/97/003 started raises a question of how efficient it was. It seems that this project served as a counter weight to POL/97/003, which was mainly financed by the government. In this way the project involved in activities that could have been implemented within the responsibility of the government. The situation is, however, more complex as there were more activities implemented under this project than can be seen under effects, especially concerning NGOs and harm reduction. Therefore we estimate the overall efficiency of the project as rather high.

7.2.2 Efficiency of POU97/003 "Managing the social and public health consequences of HIV and AIDS"

The project POL/96/003 from 1997 till 2000 spent 1,405,953 USD. The cost consisted only in 10% of general project management including all staff and administration costs. Efficiency of this project was above expectations. The costs of large outreach campaigns in which the project participated were completely covered by other sponsors and were not reflected in the budget, as they constituted "in kind" contributions. The activities performed under this project were mostly efficient to very efficient. The project generated events in which almost 7 000 people participated and almost half a million leaflets, booklets, reports and guides were distributed. As the project performance report prepared in 1998 indicates, the events were organized in a relatively cheap way.

7.2.3 Efficiency of both projects

The underneath table provides an overview of the costs of both projects together and the percentages of indirect costs.

Project	Direct project costs	Indirect costs	Total costs	Percentage of indirect costs
POU96/003	985,938	53,921	1,039,859	5%
POU97/003	1,264,794	141,159	1,405,953	10%
TOTALS	2,250,732	195,080	2,445,812	8%

Terminal Evaluation Report
POL/96/003 and POL/97/003

This shows that overall indirect costs were at a rather low level and that most money was spent on activities.

The table below shows the incomes of the projects and the division between the different project partners.

Entity	POU96/003 in USD	POL1971003 in USD	TOTALS in USD	POU961003	POL1971003	TOTALS
Government	10824	788190	799014	1,04%	56,06%	32,67%
Third parties	763454	207399	970853	73,42%	14,75%	39,69%
UNDP	265581	410364	675945	25,54%	29,19%	27,64%
TOTALS	1039859	1405953	2445812			

This shows that definitely the projects have been a good investment for the Polish Government and Poland itself, as they were able to generate about 40% of additional funding from other sources besides the UNDP contribution.

7.2.4 National Policy view on efficiency

The participation of the projects in the national policies on drug prevention and HIV/AIDS has considerably improved the efficiency of implementation of the National AIDS Plan. This was done by means of developing efficient relations between government offices and local NGOs interested in the issue. Moreover NGOs were provided with training to improve their management and efficiency. The projects provided valuable know-how on drafting programmes, evaluation and training. Moreover a representative of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Director Wojciech Ponikiewski) and other above mentioned government officials stressed that, within these projects with the international expertise of UNDP certain politically sensitive issues for the Polish public opinion were taken care of. Therefore the role of UNDP was irreplaceable at that time. For this reason, from the perspective of the national policy, the efficiency of the

projects should be estimated as very high because no other organisation could have done the same.

7.2.5 Donors view on efficiency

The donors evaluated the interventions of the projects as very efficient. The SOROS Foundation stated that this was due to the highly qualified staff of UNDP. The representative of the Dutch Embassy was not able to make such an assessment but she pointed to the fact that the projects had the trust of the involved NGO community.

7.2.6 Beneficiaries view on efficiency

The NGOs in turn evaluated that the efficiency of the projects for them lay mostly in very clear reporting and accounting procedures. Moreover they mentioned that there was very clear and good information available. The openness towards the NGOs and immediate reaction to changes of their needs were mentioned as positive aspects of co-operation, together with assisting in efficient implementation. In addition, the projects were very supportive and gave the organisations the needed backstopping in implementing their *difficult* task, and unexpectedly provided assistance in-kind in the form of condoms and needles. One negative point was mentioned; funding was not always made available by UNDP in appropriate timing which caused delays in undertaking certain actions. In general, though, the NGOs were very satisfied with their co-operation with the projects under evaluation.

7.3 Timeliness

The overall assessment of the evaluation team is that the implementation of the projects was timely. Due to the lack of individual project plans it was impossible to evaluate them individually on their timeliness. It has to be mentioned that both projects were prolonged without appropriate narrative project plans and thus, from a project planning point of view,

Terminal Evaluation Report
97/003

POL/96/003 and POL/

cannot be considered timely any more. It is however relevant if the two projects were timely from a practical point of view. The question of if the appropriate actions were undertaken at the appropriate time has to be answered. Opinions of the partners of the projects on this matter are provided underneath.

7.3.1 Government view on timeliness

The Office for the Committee of European Integration stated in this respect that the project managers provided most of the reports on time and that there was a good stream of information over the time of the implementation of the projects. In the assessment of most other Government agencies the activities of the programmes were realised at the right time and in this perspective co-operation was perfect.

7.3.2 Donors view on timeliness

The SOROS Foundation answered the question on reporting and timeliness with

a clear yes. The Dutch Embassy, *though*, pointed out some reports that did not fulfil certain standards and could not have been approved; however, most of the projects reported on time. There is evidently a place for improvement in the field of timeliness.

7.3.3 Beneficiaries' view on timeliness

The involved NGOs noted that in their opinion most interventions were timely and that there were no problems in this respect. Only some financing of their successive projects activities were not done on time, which caused certain delays in implementation.

In general, the UNDP supported programmes conform to the policy of the Polish government as well as thematic areas proposed in CCF. UNDP had a unique position, as it was perceived as a neutral partner which allowed it to play a bridging role between national and local authorities, governmental bodies and NGOs. Its unique role was perceived also in successful resource mobilization in the course of realization of the projects.

7.4 Conclusions

The projects under consideration were nationally executed and supervised by the programme officer of UNDP in an effective, efficient and timely manner. The fact these two projects were run in the same time posed difficulties in assessing their performance. All but one activity were implemented and of all set objectives only one was not achieved. All significant outputs were generated and efficiency was perceived as very high. Due to the fact that there were no formal programme updates, some activities were realised 2 times and others even 10 times while objectives did not change: this creates some doubts about efficiency. There is also some room for more timeliness.

Terminal Evaluation Report
97/003

POL/96/003 and POL/

8 Lessons learned

This chapter summarises the lessons learned from the projects concerning their design, implementation and management.

8.1 Project design

There is a large difference in project design between POL/96/003 "Support to Civil Society Organisations" and POL/97/003 "Managing the social and public health consequences of HIV and AIDS". The design of the first project is not very well done. This project consists of *a* whole list of rather inconsistent and open-ended activities, which make it difficult to implement, report and finally evaluate this project. One of the possible examples is: Objective 1 of the project sounds "To assist medical personnel provide proper care for people living with HIV and change behaviour to prevent infections in health care settings" this objective which further worked out in training activities is inconsistent as assistance is definitely something more than training only. One of the activities

mentioned under this objective is: "Ongoing training sessions in the five Voivodships conducted by trained professionals, covering all their major clinics and hospitals" such an activity is not measurable as the result is not quantifiable. Only 3 of the 13 activities have a clearly defined output. The second project is very well designed and as such it should have replaced the project POL/96/003 after becoming operational. This would prevent doubts about its effectiveness and efficiency from occurring. The fact that POL/97/003 was well designed resulted in clear reporting and consequently it was easy to review. The fact that the project management did not prepare narrative project updates only budget revisions should be seen as a lack of awareness on their side concerning the practical consequences for evaluation and monitoring of the projects. It should be strongly recommended in the future to work with only one project which has a clear set of measurable activities both in quantitative as in qualitative sense and prepare narrative project updates as budget modifications are prepared.

8.2 Implementation

In general implementation of the evaluated projects has been effective, efficient and timely. The projects played a very specific role in the Polish public opinion. They provided an independent and informed voice from the international community which seems to be an exclusive role for UNDP. This was mentioned by all Polish Government agencies. Cooperation with the most involved Government agencies was practical and improved international co-operation and co-operation with NGOs as well as developed networking on the issue at stake. The strength of the projects lies in providing Polish public opinion with independent international views and establishing working relations between Government agencies and NGOs. Although in not all cases the objectives and activities were clear the overall implementation was evaluated positively by the Government, sponsors and beneficiaries.

8.3 Management

Concerning management of the projects it is important to mention that the existence of the two projects did not benefit the management. It was unclear how to evaluate the projects and reporting was in many cases not done according to the defined groups of activities. Due to this the narrative accountability for the projects was not transparent. Moreover, from the projects' records it wasn't always clear if contributions of sponsors were accounted for and if the final narrative and financial reports were sent out. There is a large amount of information on the implementation of both projects but often the most basic records are not immediately available. It seems that implementation was the main focus of the management rather than the essential project information. A good example of this excessive focus on implementation is that all NGO activities are recorded very well, whereas a database on the measurable effects of the activities, contracts and reports to the funders of the projects are not always available. More attention should have been paid to those records. The projects employed about 5 persons at different stages, which was appropriate for the scale of the project.

9 Impact and sustainability

Underneath the main findings of whether the activities of the projects created a significant impact and if these impacts and the results were sustainable are presented.

9.1 Impact

The projects in the widest perspective improved the understanding and awareness of the Polish public concerning HIV/AIDS as well as caused its better recognition. They advocated sexual education, drug prevention and harm reduction practices, which were not fully understood and accepted at the beginning of the projects. They have improved the behaviour and knowledge of medical personnel in the perspective of HIV/AIDS as well as created safer hospital practices. Due to the accumulated actions of both the projects and relevant government agencies the epidemic has come to a halt and most public funds can now be spent on HIV/AIDS prevention. The care for HIV/AIDS patients has been considerably improved and is now continued by Government agencies and NGOs. Another area where UNDP's projects made an important contribution to developing Polish civil society is creation of a platform for co-operation between NGOs and Government agencies and enabling direct financing of NGO activities by relevant agencies. This impact can not only be seen on national but also on local level where now most local authorities provide significant funding for NGO activities in the field of HIV/AIDS and prevention on drug addiction. Additionally, the projects improved outreach to the local community's level of national programmes making their activities more effective by means of networking - networks for street-workers and harm reduction have been developed.

9.2 Sustainability

It is difficult to assess whether sustainability of the above-mentioned impacts has been achieved. In 2000, more than 35% of financing for the active NGOs came from the projects under evaluation, which remains a relevant portion of their budget. Nonetheless, the institutionalised co-operation between Government agencies, local governments and NGOs will probably occur sustainably and all partners seem to be satisfied with this co-operation. It should however be said that further UNDP involvement in this field would remain important. Especially relevant is the fact that the established networks of street-workers and harm reduction activities are still weak and need further support. The change in public attitudes towards HIV/AIDS, which kept improving over the duration of the projects, will probably be sustainable. But the situation concerning harm reduction seems to worsen rather than to get better. Educational activities in this field are still very much needed. Further action is especially needed concerning sexual education and drug prevention. Drug use in Poland is on the rise. However the number of newly HIV infected drug addicts has stabilised. Due to ineffective preventive education and little reliable information on usage of drugs

there is still a danger of the number of HIV infections to rise in the nearest future. Moreover import of the virus by drug addicts and prostitutes from Ukraine and Belarus starts to occur which may create new dangers for the Polish community.

Terminal Evaluation Report
97/003

POL/96/003 and POL/

10 Recommendations

The recommendations underneath reflect views of both the evaluation team as well as the involved government offices, sponsors and beneficiaries.

10.1 Project design

Concerning project design we have the following recommendations:

- The project design as set by project POL/97/003 should be used as an example of good practice and a good example of project design.
- In the future it would be better to avoid a situation of two similar projects being run at the same time.
- If objectives and activities of a project have to be modified, this should be done in the form of a project update and not as a budget revision; every budget revision should be accompanied with a narrative project revision.

10.2 Performance

The main findings of the evaluation team are summarised below in form of the following recommendations

- Transfer Polish knowledge on HIV/AIDS and harm reduction to other Central and Eastern European countries with special attention to Poland's closest eastern neighbours.
- Assist in temporary treatment of patients from the eastern neighbours of Poland in Polish detoxification clinics. Consider possible creation of specific centres for the growing numbers of Russian speaking patients.
- Provide further education for the police force, prison guards and social services on harmreduction and HIV/AIDS prevention. Actively search for other social/professional groups, which need to be trained but have not been reached yet.
- Assist in creation of a larger number of methadone programmes.
- Raise the qualifications of NGOs staff with special attention to fund-raising abilities and co-operation with volunteers.
- Help establish new NGOs or help develop new organisations with seed money.
- Create more educational materials for drug addicts and targeted at some groups at risk as gay communities.
- Further invest in the development of the street-workers and harm reduction networks.
- Maintain activities especially concerning harm reduction
- Make further use of UNDP international experience and prestige in the field

of

H V/AIDS. Help initiate adequate modern approaches to the problems of HIV/AIDS.

- Carefully monitor responses of the Polish public opinion especially to most sensitive issues of prevention and harm-reduction.
- Make an effort to help establish a platform for national co-operation within HIV/AIDS based on the National Programme on HIV/AIDS. Maintain good co-operation with the national AIDS Centre and the Bureau for Drug Addiction.

10.3 Management

Concerning management we have the following recommendations:

- Keep a flexible management approach towards different NGOs. On one hand respecting autonomy, and on the other hand assisting those who are in need of assistance.
- Keep records of essential measurable project events and narrative accountancy separate from the bulk of a more specific information on the project, this will allow for easier reporting and timely realisation of reporting requirements. A project database may be a good tool to organise this.