

Terminal Evaluation of the Support to National E- government Strategy Project

Final Report

By
Katim S. Touray, Consultant
kstouray@gmail.com

August 27, 2012

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS	I
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	I
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1. EVALUATION SCOPE AND OBJECTIVES	2
1.1. EVALUATION SCOPE.....	2
1.2. EVALUATION OBJECTIVES.....	3
1.3. EVALUATION CRITERIA	3
1.4. EVALUATION QUESTIONS.....	3
1.5. EVALUATION APPROACH AND METHODS	4
2. FINDINGS.....	4
2.1. RELEVANCE.....	4
2.2. EFFECTIVENESS.....	5
2.2.1. <i>Web Portal</i>	6
2.2.2. <i>Government E-mail System</i>	6
2.2.3. <i>Capacity Building</i>	7
2.2.4. <i>Government Data Center</i>	7
2.2.5. <i>Study Tours</i>	7
2.3. CHALLENGES	8
2.4. EFFICIENCY	9
2.5. IMPACT.....	14
2.6. SUSTAINABILITY	15
2.7. LESSONS LEARNED.....	16
3. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	16
3.1. CONCLUSIONS	16
3.2. RECOMMENDATIONS	17
4. ANNEXES	19
4.1. TOR FOR THE EVALUATION	19
4.2. INTERVIEW QUESTIONNAIRES	19
1. <i>Management Arrangements</i>	19
2. <i>Project Management</i>	20
3. <i>Monitoring and Evaluation Procedures</i>	20
4. <i>Project Achievements and Impact</i>	20
5. <i>Lessons Learned</i>	21
6. <i>Additional Comments</i>	21
4.3. LIST OF INDIVIDUALS INTERVIEWED.....	21
4.4. LIST OF DOCUMENTS REVIEWED	22
4.5. BIOGRAPHY OF THE EVALUATORS	22

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

ACE	-	Africa Coast to Europe
AISI	-	African Information Society Initiative
CMS	-	Content Management System
CPAP	-	Country Programme Action Plan
DOSCIIT	-	Department of State for Communication, and Information Technology
GAMBIS	-	Gambia Biometric Identification System
GOTG	-	Government of the Gambia
GRA	-	Gambia Revenue Authority
HIS	-	Health Information System
ICT	-	Information and Communication Technologies
IFMIS	-	Integrated Financial Management System
IP	-	Implementing Partner
LAN	-	Local Area Network
MOBSE	-	Ministry of Basic and Secondary Education
MOCIT	-	Ministry of Communications and Information Technology
MOFA	-	Ministry of Foreign Affairs
MOHSW	-	Ministry of Health and Social Welfare
MOICI	-	Ministry of Information and Communications Infrastructure
MOTIE	-	Ministry of Trade, Industry, Employment, and Regional Integration
NICI	-	National Information and Communications Infrastructure
NITA	-	National Information Technology Authority
PB	-	Project Board
PD	-	Project Director
PRSP	-	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
SDM	-	Space Division Multiplexing
UNDAF	-	UN Development Assistance Framework
UNDP	-	United Nations Development Programme
UNECA	-	UN Economic Commission for Africa
UNV	-	United Nations Volunteers
WSIS	-	World Information Society Summit

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

NICI policy has laid out where ICT can contribute to the attainment of the poverty reduction strategy paper (PRSP). The e-government strategy is one of the components of the NICI policy, and is aimed at helping the country develop a multi-sectoral e-government program. Support projects prepared by the national technical committee with UNECA assistance, and in the AISI framework.

Against this background, UNDP supported MOCIT (as the present-day MOICI was then called) to implement the e-government strategy by establishing a government Web portal, and formulate a full-blown project document to implement the e-government strategy. The project was to be a preparatory assistance project and was to last six months. DOSCIIT, now called MOICI, was the implementing partner, and a project board was established to oversee the implementation of the project.

The terminal evaluation was conducted to assess the achievement of the project, and help develop the next CPAP, and future interventions. The Gambia government, UNDP, and other stakeholders are the primary audience and users of the information in the terminal evaluation.

The evaluation covered activities supported by UNDP in the project and, contributed to the achievement of the outputs. The evaluation is expected to generate lessons learnt, findings, conclusions and recommendations various aspects of project design and implementation.

The evaluation is aimed at assessing the progress of UNDP interventions in the national e-gov. strategy and to identify lessons learned, and challenges encountered during project implementation. The evaluation also makes recommendations for the development of the next CPAP and future interventions in this area.

Based on UNDP guidelines, the evaluation assessed the relevance of project interventions, as well as the effectiveness and efficiency of resource-utilization, and the sustainability of the project's outputs. Other criteria used in the evaluation include the impact of the project, and the lessons learned during its implementation.

The evaluation was conducted over a period of two months April and May, 2012, and involved various information and data collection strategies such as interviews and literature reviews. A number of additional interviews were also done in July, 2012 to gather additional information about the implementation of the project.

The evaluation shows that the project was highly relevant to national and local policies and priorities, and addressed the needs of intended beneficiaries. Specifically, the project helped the achievement of the WSIS targets, helped build confidence and security in use of ICTs, facilitates communication between government employees, and increased access to government information. The project also addressed the needs of beneficiaries, including government agencies and ordinary citizens.

The project also relevant because it responded to the UNDP corporate plan and human development priorities, helped attain the objectives of the UNDAF, and the Country Programme Document. However, the project was not highly relevant with regards to governance because it

largely left out local government and government agencies in rural areas. The project was also highly responsive to changing priorities and challenges by growing over time, and shifting focus with changing priorities.

The evaluation found that the project was highly effective. In particular, most activities in the work plan were achieved, although there were some delays in its implementation. The evaluation found that the project had significant achievements in establishing a government Web portal, a government e-mail system, in building the capacities of IT staff and government agencies, in building a government data center, in supporting a study tour to Ghana and Rwanda, and by supporting the preparation of a full-blown e-government project document. For a project that was initially conceived as a short-term intervention, these accomplishments are proof positive that the project achievements were beyond expectation. It must be pointed out that the project did not address cross-cutting issues such as gender, largely due to design flaw.

The implementation of the project faced numerous challenges, including the difficulty in getting content for the Web sites, low levels of awareness about the system, lack of trust in the e-mail system, low usage of the e-mail system, and shortage of computers at the E-government ICT Training Centre. These challenges significantly and adversely affected the implementation and impact of the project.

The evaluation found that the project was highly efficient, with resources being used appropriately to achieve the desired outputs. Almost all resources used in the project were provided by the UNDP from TRAC funds, while the government provided in-kind support such as office space, facilities, and personnel.

Although the initial budget for the project was \$45,000, the UNDP led efforts to mobilize additional resources for a final budget of \$161,900 or a 260 percent increase from the initial budget. A major reason for the efficiency of the project implementation is that the UNDP was responsible for disbursing funds, resulting in the judicious use of funds. Furthermore, the project also adopted various strategies such as providing training in-country, and co-locating the government data centre with the IFMIS project which helped reduce costs. The evaluation also found that the project funds were never under-utilized. Despite these significant achievements, the evaluation found that there was room for improvement, especially in terms of reducing the over dependence on UNDP resources.

The evaluation found that the project had significant impact by increasing good governance, and access to information by building Web sites for government agencies, facilitating communications through e-mail services, and building capacity by training government IT officers. In addition, the project helped reduce costs by facilitating the electronic delivery of pay slips for salaries, and providing a government data center instead of using commercial services. Despite these benefits, the project is yet to benefit local government authorities and rural areas, and future interventions should aim to correct this.

The evaluation found that the project achievements are not yet sustainable, and that more time is needed to consolidate the achievements that have been had so far. For example, more time is needed to increase the number of users of the government e-mail system and the e-government platform, and to introduce more services. The evaluation also concludes that there is need to develop policies to ensure the sustainability of the impact of the project, especially

with regards to ensuring an adequate human resources base to sustain it. Furthermore, the evaluation found that continued UNDP funding is needed to sustain the project in the near future given the high cost of Internet connectivity.

The evaluation found that a number of lessons were learned during the implementation of the project over three-years (2009 – 2011). Among the key lessons learned are the need for more sensitization, especially at the highest levels; the need to have used a more holistic approach to project implementation; and the need for better coordination of ICT interventions in the country. In addition, it was found that collaboration helps reduce costs, and that it helped to have a dynamic UNV who also trained people. Finally, an important lesson learned is that UNDP and MOICI could have mobilized more resources to implement the project.

The evaluation found that the support to the national e-government strategy project had significant achievements, despite the various challenges faced during its implementation. Furthermore, the evaluation found that the project achievements were based on UNDP interventions, especially with regards to its resource-mobilization efforts, and management of project finances.

The evaluation also found that the UNDP's partnership strategy and approach were effective, and helped achieve project objectives. In addition, the project provides a good illustration of the importance of partnership-building and collaboration in such initiatives.

The evaluation report concludes with a series of recommendations on helping increase the benefits of the project, as well as ensuring its sustainability. Along these lines, the report includes recommendations to ensure a sound human resources base, strengthened partnerships, effective mobilization of resources, the development of a proper institutional framework, and implementation of lessons learned from other countries to continue implementing the project, and ensure its continued benefit to the country.

1 INTRODUCTION

The National Information and Communication Infrastructure (NICI) of The Gambia has laid out its policies and plans where information and communication technologies (ICT) can contribute to the attainment of the four strategic issues identified in the Poverty Reduction Strategy Programme (PRSP), namely:

- a) enhancing the productive capacity of the poor,
- b) enhancing access to and the performance of social services
- c) local level capacity building, and
- d) promoting participatory communication processes.

One of the components of the NICI policies, strategies and plans is the e-government strategy, which is aimed at:

- i). assisting the country in its efforts to develop multi-sectoral e-government program, and
- ii). within the African Information Society Initiative (AISI) framework, supporting the projects prepared by the national technical committee with the assistance of United Nations Economic Commission for Africa (UNECA).

It is against this background that UNDP supported the MOCIT to implement key priority areas of its e-government strategy through the establishment of a government web portal, and formulation of a full-blown project document to implement the E-government Strategy. The government Web portal was aimed at providing information about the government Ministries, as well as their plans, programs and services. The Web portal will also enable citizens to access government services and related information, and provide their feedback on various policies.

The project was supposed to be a preparatory assistance project, and initially had duration of six month. However, it was later extended to ensure the establishment of a government Web portal. The Web portal is a vital pre-requisite of other strategies identified in the National E-Government strategy and was therefore to be established to prepare the ground for subsequent activities. Another key output of this preparatory assistance project was the development of a fully fledged project to support the implementation of National E-Government Strategy of The Gambia. Other key outputs of the project included the establishment of an E-Government Data Centre and a Disaster Recovery Centre.

The Department of State for Communication, Information and Information (DOSCIIT), now called the Ministry of Information and Communication Infrastructure (MOICI), was the Implementing Partner (IP). A Project Board (PB) was established to oversee the overall implementation process and its membership consisted of representatives from MOICI, UNDP IFMIS. The Permanent Secretary of MOIC served as the Project Director (PD) and Accounting Officer and the Director of MOICI served as the Project Coordinator.

The terminal evaluation follows on the conclusion of the project, and was carried out to assess the achievement of the project objectives, and help develop the next Country Programme Action Plan (CPAP) and future interventions in this area.

The primary audience and users of the information in the terminal evaluation is the government of The Gambia, as well as the UNDP Country Office, and other stakeholders and development partners. It is expected that the evaluation results will help the GOTG, the UNDP and other

development partners to develop subsequent e-government programs, and consolidate gains brought about by the Support to the National E-government Strategy Project.

Toward this end, the terminal evaluation report is organized according to recommendations from the UNDP evaluation office. Specifically, the report starts with an introductory section, which discusses the background and context of the project, followed by a description of the project. The report also discusses the evaluation scope and objectives, as well as the questions that the evaluation sought to answer, the evaluation approach and methods, and the analysis of data collected. In addition, the report discusses the evaluation findings in terms of the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability, and the impact of the project. The report ends with a discussion of lessons learned, and ends with sections on conclusions and recommendations.

1. EVALUATION SCOPE AND OBJECTIVES

1.1. Evaluation Scope

The evaluation will cover all activities supported by UNDP in the project and, where appropriate, in collaboration with other development partners that have contributed to the achievement of the outputs. The evaluation is expected to generate lessons learnt, findings, conclusions and recommendations in the following areas:

1. An assessment of the adequacy of the project design, including adequacy of the situational analysis and indicators for achievement of outputs/activities;
2. An assessment and analysis of the outputs and outcomes: whether they have been achieved in part or full as was intended, the reason for any shortfall in their achievements and whether any unexpected results or outcomes have occurred. The evaluation should appraise their relevance to the intended overall project objectives;
3. An analysis of factors within and beyond UNDP's control that influenced performance and success of the project (including the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats) in contributing to the realization of the outputs;
4. An analysis of whether UNDP's interventions can be credibly linked to achievement of the overall objectives, including the key outputs and assistance provided, both soft and hard as well as how the support has influenced the capacity development;
5. Whether UNDP's partnership strategy has been appropriate and effective including the range and quality of partnerships and collaboration developed with government, civil society, donors, the private sector and whether these have contributed to improved project delivery. The degree of stakeholder and partner involvement in the various processes related to the objectives. How can synergies be built with other projects within the UNDP Country Programme and those of other development partners (donors);
6. Whether cross-cutting issues such as ICT, gender, etc were adequately addressed in the interventions and have contributed to the achievement of the objectives; and if not, establish the reasons for not addressing the cross-cutting issues and suggest the appropriate remedial measures to be taken into account under the next support;
7. Explore whether the activities being implemented would contribute to smooth exist strategy or/and sustainability.

1.2. Evaluation Objectives

The objective of the evaluation is to assess progress of UNDP's interventions towards achievement of priority areas of intervention areas identified in the national e-governance strategy in terms of its objectives and to evaluate the efficacy of the strategies employed in contributing to the achievement of the outputs and outcomes. In the addition, the evaluation is aimed at identifying lessons learned, and challenges encountered during project implementation, and make recommendations that could provide inputs or feed into the development of the next CPAP and any future interventions in this area.

1.3. Evaluation Criteria

Based on the evaluation objectives and the UNDP evaluation guidelines¹, a number of criteria were used to evaluate the project. In particular, the evaluation focused on the relevance of the project interventions, the project's effectiveness in reaching its objectives, as well as the efficiency with which the resources available were used. In addition, the evaluation reviewed the sustainability of the project's outputs in terms of the extent to which its benefits will continue after the cessation of external development assistance.

Another important criterion considered is the impact of the project, i.e. the changes in human development and the well-being of people brought about, directly or indirectly, by design or accident, by the project interventions. The evaluation also reviewed the lessons learned in the implementation of the project to help better implement, and increase the benefits accruing from future projects.

1.4. Evaluation Questions

The evaluation addressed the following questions:

1. Was the project design, including adequacy of the situational analysis and indicators for achievement of outputs/activities adequate?
2. Whether the outputs and outcomes of the project were achieved in part or full as was intended, as well as the reason for any shortfall in their achievements and whether any unexpected results or outcomes have occurred.
3. What factors within and beyond UNDP's control influenced performance and success of the project (including the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats) in contributing to the realization of the outputs?
4. Can UNDP's interventions be credibly linked to the achievement of the overall objectives, including the key outputs and assistance provided, both soft and hard as well as how the support has influenced the capacity development?
5. Was the UNDP's partnership strategy appropriate and effective, and did they contribute to improved project delivery?
6. What was the level stakeholder and partner involvement in the various processes related to the objectives, and how can synergies be built with other projects within the UNDP Country Programme and those of other development partners (donors)?
7. Were cross-cutting issues adequately addressed in the interventions, and did contribute to the achievement of the objectives?
8. Would the activities implemented contribute to smooth exit strategy or/and sustainability?

¹UNDP. 2011. *Handbook on Planning, Monitoring, and Evaluating for Development Results*
<http://web.undp.org/evaluation/handbook/documents/english/pme-handbook.pdf>

1.5. Evaluation Approach and Methods

The evaluation was conducted over a period of two months, April and May, 2012, using various techniques for collecting data and information on the implementation of the project.

The first task of the consultant was to conduct a review of project literature and background documents. Examples of documents reviewed include the Project Document, project progress reports, financial reports, the 2009, 2010, and 2011 Annual Reports, the Study Tour report, and other background documents the UN Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF). A list of various documents consulted is shown in Annex 4.4.

The consultant also obtained information about the project by interviewing individuals, and using self-administered interview questionnaire (Annex 4.2). The response rate for the interview questionnaire was very low, with only 2 questionnaires out of about 10 distributed. A total of 15 people who were either involved in the implementation of the project, directly benefited from the project, or whose institutions benefited from the project were interviewed in person by the consultant (Annex 4.3)

The interview questionnaire covered various topics, ranging from the management arrangements of the project to financial management, resource mobilization, and its effectiveness, efficiency, impact, and sustainability. The information collected from these interviews and the documents reviewed proved valuable in helping answer the various evaluation questions mentioned earlier, and discussed in more detail in the findings section of this report.

In view of time and resource constraints, the data and information collection exercises of the evaluation was focused on the Greater Banjul Area. The consultant did not visit rural areas to evaluate the extent to which they participated in, or benefited from the implementation of the e-government project. There is no doubt that residents of rural areas, and agencies in these areas have significant challenges in accessing various services.

It is thus obvious that a relatively small number of people provided their opinions on the implementation of the project. Despite this small number of respondents, the information gained was valuable because the people interviewed were mostly directly involved in the implementation of the project, or were direct beneficiaries. In addition, the evaluation findings were reviewed by other stakeholders and beneficiaries, further helping validate the findings of the evaluation.

2. FINDINGS

2.1. Relevance

The evaluation findings show that the project was highly relevant in a variety of ways. First, the project outputs and outcomes are very much consistent with national and local policies and priorities, and addressed the needs of the intended beneficiaries. In particular, the project helped the country achieve World Summit on Information Society (WSIS) targets. Thus, the project helped achieve 5 of the 11 WSIS Action Lines, including the facilitating the development of ICT infrastructure, promoting access to information and knowledge, and human resource development. Furthermore, the project helped build confidence and security in the use of ICTs, and promoted the use of ICT applications that benefit e-government, and e-health. In particular,

many government employees now use the government e-mail system, while the government Web portal and Web sites increase access to information.

The project also was relevant to the needs of its beneficiaries, including government agencies, and ordinary citizens. When the project proposal for the development of a Web portal for the government was prepared in 2008, only 5 out of 17 Departments of State (now renamed Ministries) had a Web presence. In addition, there was no standardization of the format or amount of information published on the Web sites of the 5 Departments of State. The existence of a number of privately-owned Web portals added to the confusion, often making it difficult to distinguish the official sites from the private ones. The government Web portal (<http://gambia.gov.gm>) has addressed all of these problems, by providing a links to 20 government Web sites. The Web sites also use a common template, thus making it easier for users to get information from the sites. As such, it can be concluded that the government Web portal is highly relevant to the needs of government agencies and the general public.

The project also helped provide a common platform for government Web sites, and e-mail addresses for government agencies and employees. Government agencies now have the option of hosting their Web sites on government servers, and government employees beyond a certain level are now provided e-mail addresses that are hosted on government servers, and end in "gov.gm.

The project was also relevant because it was responsive to the UNDP corporate plan and human development priorities. In particular, the project helped the attainment of the governance components of the UNDAF (2007 – 2011), and the Country Programme Document (2007 – 2011). It must be pointed out, however, that the project mostly focused on national government agencies, as well as agencies mainly in the urban areas of the country. For this reason, the relevance of the project with regards to governance is less than optimal because local government agencies, as well as government agencies in rural areas were largely left out of the project's interventions. In the same vein, the project could have been implemented in a more gender-sensitive manner by giving the Women's Bureau, and female ICT professionals in government agencies priority in its interventions.

The project was also highly responsive to changing priorities and challenges. For this reason, the mandate of the project grew over time from being focused solely on developing a Web portal for government agencies and formulation of a full-blown e-government project document, to include the development of a government data center, providing and hosting e-mail addresses for government employees, training government staff in the use of the e-mail system and Web site development, and conducting study tours to Rwanda and Ghana to learn about best practices. This flexibility increased synergies in the impact of various interventions, increased opportunities for partnerships between various stakeholders, and helped increase the number of direct beneficiaries from the project.

2.2. Effectiveness

The evaluation findings indicate that the project was highly effective, and achieved its intended outputs or outcomes. Indeed, the project was rated "Very good" in terms of achievements by interviewees. Given that the scope of the project was expanded beyond the originally intended scope, the evaluation also concludes that the project was able to achieve more than its originally intended outputs.

Most activities in the work plan of the project were achieved, even though there were delays in some instances. In addition, the UNDP adapted to changing environments, and there was a Technical Coordinating Committee with membership from various government ICT projects helped ensure the effective implementation of the project.

The project had significant achievements in the following areas:

2.2.1. Web Portal

Among the major achievements of the project has been the development of a government Web portal (<http://gambia.gov.gm>). Although there were delays in the implementation of the portal because the first contractor had to be replaced by another contractor, in the end, a Web portal was delivered, and at a price that was the same as was originally budgeted for. Despite the delays, the Web portal is now online, and receiving a healthy number of visitors from around the world. Furthermore, the site links to the Web sites of 20 government agencies, as well as those for the National Assembly, and the judiciary, thus providing an easy access to government Web sites.

The project also supported the development of Web sites for 23 Ministries and Departments. The Web sites have a common format, and use the same content management system (CMS) to help make it easier to manage them. In addition, 50 ICT focal points of the Ministries and Departments were trained in the use of the CMS and the management of the Web sites.

Despite these efforts, there are significant challenges in the management of the Web sites. First, the Web sites often do not have much content, and are not regularly updated. One reason for this is that it is sometimes difficult for Web site managers to get information to publish. In other cases, Web site managers are encumbered by a lack of policy (both at a general and Ministry level) on the publication of information on the Web.

2.2.2. Government E-mail System

The project also established an e-mail system for government agencies and employees, using its own servers hosted at the Integrated Financial Management System (IFMIS) data center. Over 1,600 email addresses have been created, and the number of users continues to increase. Given that the number of eligible users is about 3,000, almost 50 percent of eligible government employees have already been provided e-mail addresses. Furthermore, MOICI staff provide technical and backstopping support to the ICT Focal Points at the various Ministries, who in turn support end users in their Ministries.

The evaluation found that the effectiveness of the e-mail system is seriously compromised by lack of use. Although a few Ministries reported that many of their staff used the e-mail system regularly, some Ministries reported that very few staff used the e-mail system. One reason for this low usage of the e-mail system is lack of trust; with many having the perception that their e-mails would be monitored if they use the government e-mail system. Despite this, it was found that where the senior leadership of a Ministry used, and encouraged other staff to use the e-mail system, the number of e-mail system users was greater.

2.2.3. Capacity Building

The project also built the capacities of government agencies and employees (Table 1). Thus, both MOICI and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MOFA) were provided local area networks (LANs), while MOICI was provided computers and related equipment to launch an E-government ICT Training Centre to train government employees on the new e-mail system, and on Web site management. As of the end of the 3rd Quarter of 2011, 224 staff were trained in out of 260 that was planned for 10 Ministries (i.e. 26 staff per Ministry); indicating a relatively high success rate (86.2 percent).

Table 1: Capacity-building activities conducted by the project

SUBJECT	NUMBER OF TRAINEES	DURATION OF TRAINING	COMMENTS
Content Management System (CMS)	50	5 days	Training was conducted in two batches, with 25 trainees per batch, and each batch trained for 5 days
Microsoft Exchange 2010	224		Training on new e-mail system
Re-orientation on Web portal	19	1 day	Re-orientation provided for Focal Persons at Ministries
CMS training (on-going)	10	3	In-house training on e-mail and the Web conducted by MOICI staff for users at Ministries
Training for ICT graduates from Taiwan	10	3	

2.2.4. Government Data Center

The Web portal, Web sites, and e-mail accounts are hosted by MOICI on servers located at the IFMIS data center and disaster recovery center. The servers and related equipment and installation were purchased by the project, following the realization of the need for MOICI to have its own infrastructure for the e-government program. Furthermore, the decision was made to house the servers at the IFMIS data center and recovery center to help reduce the cost of deploying the facilities, and increase the collaboration between the two initiatives.

The e-government servers now host Web sites for various Ministries, and government agencies. For example, the National Assembly and Judiciary Web sites and e-mail addresses are hosted, while the Ministry of Health and Social Welfare (MOHSW) is contemplating migration their Health Information System (HIS) to the platform. The MOICI data center is also provided a high-speed leased line connecting it to the Internet. However, the Internet connection is still not accessible to IFMIS, although discussions are underway for this happen. Opening the Internet connection to IFMIS would make sense given that they are hosting the e-government servers, and providing technical support to MOICI.

2.2.5. Study Tours

The project also supported study tours of MOICI and IFMIS staff to Rwanda and Ghana, two countries that are renowned for the impressive strides they have made in ICT development in general, and e-government in particular. The study tours were conducted

in December, 2011 (Rwanda), and January, 2012 (Ghana). A total of 9 staff (5 from MOICI and 4 from IFMIS) participated in the tours, with four people (two each from MOICI and IFMIS) participating in both tours.

Participants on the Rwanda study tour visited government ICT agencies and e-government projects such as their online visa application system, the national ID project office, the Open Medical Records systems, and HIV tracking system. In Ghana, tour participants visited the National Information Technology Agency (NITA), the Pilot Data Center and National Data Center, as well as other ICT initiatives. Tour participants also had valuable discussions with personnel in both countries.

The study tours yielded valuable lessons including the need for top management and the political leadership to support and have a sense of ownership of ICT initiatives, the need for a donor conference on ICT, and the fact that capacity-building has to be done on a continuing basis in order to be effective. Other lessons learned include the need to set up a national ICT development agency, and the importance of securing strong government support for the development of national data center. The study tour also revealed that the on-going GAMBIS project is a positive development that is making progress commensurate with similar efforts in Rwanda.

Against this background, it can be concluded that the project achieved a lot of its objectives, and indeed far exceeded its original objectives. Furthermore, the UNDP, MOICI and other stakeholders were able to adjust to changing realities and respond to new needs as the implementation of the project progressed. For this reason, new activities such as setting up a data center and disaster recovery center, building capacity, and conducting study tours were added to the portfolio of activities to be implemented by the project. The UNDP also mobilized additional resources, over and beyond the original budget, to implement the additional activities.

Despite the achievements of the project, it should be pointed out that the cross-cutting issues such as gender were not addressed by the interventions. This is mainly a function of the design of the project, given that neither the original project document, nor the formulation of additional interventions made any reference to gender issues. Admittedly, it is very difficult, if not impossible to address gender issues on activities as setting up a data center and disaster recovery center.

2.3. Challenges

The evaluation found that the implementation of the project faced a variety of challenges, including:

1. Difficulty in getting adequate content for, and regular updates of the Web site
2. Low level of awareness about the system, and hence, lack of trust in the system
3. Lack of awareness at the senior level about the role of ICTs in their work
4. Getting people to trust the e-mail system
5. Getting people to use the e-mail system
6. Low usage of the e-mail system
7. Getting a proper place for the data center
8. Getting access to computers and the Internet for focal points in the Ministries
9. Shortage of computers at the E-government ICT Training Centre

10. Delays in the implementation of some activities

These challenges had significant effects on the implementation and impact of the project. For example, the difficulty in getting content for the Web sites of the various Ministries and government agencies, means that government Web sites are often not updated frequently, resulting in stale and outdated information on these sites. On the other hand, many people do not trust the e-mail system, thinking that they are being monitored, and hence, do not use their government e-mail addresses as much as they should. To make matters worse, there are reports that the government e-mail system has some technical problems, making it difficult for people to send e-mails to addresses other than those for government agencies.

Some focal points at the Ministries also had problems getting access to computers and the Internet, thus making it difficult for them to use the system effectively. Fortunately, this problem was alleviated when the UNDP helped provide some of them with computers. The shortage of computers at the E-government ICT Training Centre also means that a relatively small number of people can be accommodated in a class, and trainees frequently have to share computers, thus reducing the effectiveness of the instruction they are provided.

The project also suffered delays in the implementation of some activities. For example, there were delays on the part of Gamtel, the service provider, in the installation of the fiber optic cable and modem to connect the data center to the Internet. In the same vein, there were delays in the delivery of equipment for the data center, mainly because of the difficulty in getting a competent local vendor, and mis-communication in providing specifications for the equipment needed. Despite these challenges, the project was largely able to accomplish most of its objectives, and implement the activities it was supposed to.

2.4. Efficiency

With regards efficiency, the evaluation found that the project was highly efficient, and that resources were used appropriately and economically to achieve the desired outputs. In the first place, the almost all resources used by the project were from the UNDP, which provided resources from its TRAC funds. The government, on the other hand, provided in-kind support such as office space and facilities, as well as personnel.

Although the original budget for the project was \$45,000 to develop a government Web portal, and the preparation of a project document on the Support to the National E-government Strategy, other interventions such as the government data center, disaster recovery center, e-mail system, and study tour were added after project implementation started. For this reason, the UNDP led efforts to mobilize additional resources resulting in a final project budget of \$161,900; a 260 percent increase on the original budget (Table 2).

The project management Unit of the Governance program of the UNDP was responsible for disbursing funds. Request for Service Support (RSS) and Request for Direct Payment (RDP) disbursement modalities were used following a recommendation of a Harmonized Approach to Cash Transfer (HACT) micro assessment. This arrangement worked well for the project, although it had its advantages and disadvantages. For example, there was no need to go through government procurement procedures, thus helping expedite purchases. However, there were disadvantages such as some delays in procurements, and the fact that MOICI staff never knew how much funds were available for the project.

Table 2: Outputs, budgets and expenses for the project

Intended Output/Planned Activities	Output indicator/Activity Target	Achievement/Result/Output	Approved Budget	Resource Status
Output 1. Design, development and capacity building for an Official Government Web Portal and formulation of project document	Government Web Portal established	Improved Capacity for Implementation of Local Government Legislation and Policies		
Activity 1.1. Conduct technical training for e-Government data centre personnel on Microsoft Certified Technology Specialization	10 data centre personnel to complete the 35-days training	35-days training completed as scheduled	\$15,700	Satisfactory
Output 2. The communication infrastructure and capacity of MOFA improved for greater efficiency	Latest applicable and cost effective communication infrastructure established and capacities enhanced	Improved capacity and infrastructure for communication effectiveness		
Activity 2.1. Establishment of LAN for MOFA	LAN design and specs (equipment and materials)	LAN for the main building of MOFA completed by contractor	\$7,000	Satisfactory
Activity 2.2. Procurement of LCD projector for MOFA conference room	One (1) LCD projector delivered and installed	Conference room equipped for internal communication purpose	\$800	Satisfactory
Activity 2.3. Expansion of LAN for the New Annex Building	LAN design and specs (equipment and materials)	LAN for the Annex building of MOFA completed by contractor	\$5,500	Satisfactory
Output 3. Building the essential connectivity infrastructure of the e-Government network	Fully-operation and secured e-Government network with users fully sensitized	Improved access and sharing of information and capacity of users enhanced and the use of resources optimized		
Activity 3.1. Design and implementation of Disaster Recovery Centre	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Design submitted and approved by technical committee 	Disaster Recovery Centre fully operational.	\$39,800	Satisfactory
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Procurement of equipment and accessories 	(Equipment installed according to specs, configuration and simulation completed, training for		

Intended Output/Planned Activities	Output indicator/Activity Target	Achievement/Result/Output	Approved Budget	Resource Status
		MOICI staff in- charge completed)		
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Contract services awarded 			
Activity 3.2. Sensitization and training program to gain the trust and confidence of users and optimize the use of services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • One (1) day training/ orientation program for all Ministries and selected departments 	Increased knowledge and awareness on the use of .gov.gm e-mail and government web portal	\$12,000	Very Satisfactory
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Development of sensitization materials and toolkits 			
Activity 3.3. Expansion of e-government ICT training centre	Procurement of 10 desktop computers, 1 laptop, 1 network printer and furniture.	Increased capacity of the training centre and services to cover more trainees	\$13,300	Satisfactory
Activity 3.4. Managing the efficient operation and administration of e-Government Data Centre.	Procurement of 4 laptops to manage the operation of servers remotely	Efficient operation of e-government data centre	\$6,800	Satisfactory
Activity 3.5. Procurement of Digital Security Certificate for the eGovt Data Centre services	Procurement of one (1) digital security certificate for e-mail and web services	Security of e-govt data centre services is ensured at all times	\$1,500	Satisfactory
Activity 3.6. Installation of internet connectivity at the Disaster Recovery Centre	One 256 Kbps connection and expandable to 1 Mbps anytime when needed including 1 static IP address	Uninterrupted operation and security of e-govt data centre services is ensured at all times	\$2,800	Satisfactory
Activity 3.7. Installation of internet connectivity at the e-Govt ICT Training Centre	Installation of Bantaba 3G to augment the existing wireless Jamano router	Increased internet bandwidth for effective training delivery	\$1,400	Satisfactory
Activity 3.8. Upgrading of e-Govt Data Centre servers	Procurement and installation of 9 units memory module – to expand from 8 Gb to 16 Gb	Efficient e-Govt Data Centre services	\$6,000	Satisfactory
Activity 3.9. Procurement of Microsoft Office 2010 Professional Edition	Procurement 10 licenses Microsoft Office Professional edition for the ICT Training	Software operation of the ICT Training Centre is ensured	\$4,800	Satisfactory

Intended Output/Planned Activities	Output indicator/Activity Target	Achievement/Result/Output	Approved Budget	Resource Status
	Centre			
Activity 4.0. Procurement of Windows Server 2008 R2 Enterprise Edition for the Disaster Recovery Centre servers	Procurement three (3) licenses for Disaster Recovery Centre servers	Efficient operation of Disaster Recovery Centre is ensured	\$3,500	Satisfactory
Activity 4.1. Procurement of additional equipment for ICT Training Centre & Web Portal project	Procurement one (1) heavy duty network printer and one (1) DSLR digital camera	Efficient delivery of training service and efficient updating of official government web portal	\$6,500	Satisfactory
Activity 4.2. Study tour of e-Government Technical Committee to Ghana and Rwanda	Visit and study successful e-government projects and initiatives by 4-member technical committee	e-Government success stories and best practices documented	\$32,000	Satisfactory
Activity 4.3. Allowance of trainees and training staff involve in the .gov.gm e-mail training for ministries and departments	Provision of allowance for 5 training staff involve in the .gov.gm e-mail training	Cost effective implementation of the training programme	\$2,500	Satisfactory
TOTAL			\$161,900	

The evaluation found that resources were judiciously used, and that the funds were never under-utilized and had to be returned. Indeed the delivery rates were very high, averaging 95 percent, and sometimes exceeding 100 percent due to the mobilization of resources beyond what was initially budgeted (Table 3). For these reasons, the project was highly efficient, with resources being put to effective use. For example, it was estimated that co-locating the government data center and disaster recovery centers with IFMIS reduced costs by 80 to 90 percent. In the same vein, the project saved a lot of money by having local training, and bringing in trainers from India, rather than sending trainees overseas. The E-Government ICT Training Centre also helped reduce costs given that it would have cost D1,000 per computer per day to rent computers from commercial providers. The project also received good quality equipment, thus further increasing its efficiency.

Another way in which project efficiency was optimized is the management of contracts. Specifically, the project ensured that delays in the implementation of various activities did not increase costs. For example, the delay in the development of the Web portal did not increase its cost because the second consultant to develop the portal did so while maintaining the cost that was agreed to with the first consultant.

Despite the effective resource mobilization and management, and high efficiency of resource utilization for the project, the evaluation found that there still is room for improvement. Specifically, the over-dependence on UNDP resources while important to kick start the project, should be reduced in the future to increase the sustainability of project activities and impact, and increase national ownership. Furthermore, there should be better coordination of resource mobilization efforts to ensure that more funds are raised, and that resources are used effectively.

The evaluation also found that there is need to better inform MOICI about procurements. Furthermore, it would help if MOICI handles financial management and disbursement as the project grows in the future. Finally, it will help to provide government agencies with proper networking and connectivity to increase the efficiency of the implementation of the project.

Table 3: Summary of Expenditures: 2010 - 2011

ACTIVITY	Budget		Expenditure		Delivery Rate (%)	
	2010 - 2011	2012	2010 - 2011	2012	2010 - 2011	2012
Support to Development of Government Web Portal	113,487.00	13,646.75	99,767.47	11,435.78	87.9	83.8
MOFA IT and Infrastructure Support	17,150.00	0.00	33,178.67	0.00	193.5	
UNDP & IPs Online Platform	70,950.00	22,000.00	58,674.46	22,267.69	82.7	101.2
Total	\$201,587.00	\$35,646.75	\$191,620.60	\$33,703.47	95	95

2.5. Impact

The evaluation found that the project had significant impact in increasing access to information, reducing costs, increasing good governance, facilitating communications, and helping build capacity. With regards to access to information, the evaluation found that the project has helped people to access information from government agencies through the government Web portal and Web sites developed with assistance from the project. In addition, researchers abroad (including Gambians) are able to get documents via the Web sites. The Web sites have also helped increase awareness about government agencies, and their work.

The project has also helped reduce costs. For example, the e-mail facilities reduce the cost of exchanging documents, compared to sending drivers to deliver those documents manually. One particularly good example of this is the use of the e-mail system by MOFEA to deliver pay slips (used to pay salaries to government staff) to offices around the country, thus making it easier, and faster to pay salaries. The project has also helped reduce costs by providing a government data center, instead of using commercial services to host e-mail services for government employees and agencies.

The net effect of all these impacts is that the project has helped improve governance. In the first place, there is greater coordination between MOICI and IFMIS, and other ministries. In addition, the Web sites have helped increase the visibility of government, and reduced processing time for many government services. However, it must be noted that the local government authorities and rural areas are yet to benefit from the project. As such, it will be important to consider extending the project to these agencies in the next phases of its implementation.

The e-mail system and communications platform built on Microsoft Exchange has also had a significant impact on communications between government employees. Thus, more and more people are using government e-mail address, although the uptake rate can be made even more. In addition, the system allows people to send alerts to each other, making it possible to notify colleagues of changes in meeting plans, and other issues.

The evaluation also found that the project made a significant impact on the capacities of various government agencies, and individuals. The training provided in the use of the e-mail system, and on Web site development and management have helped build the capacities of these beneficiaries (including new graduates from ICT training programs in Taiwan). The capacities of government agencies were also enhanced by providing them with better qualified and skilled staff that they would not otherwise have had. In the same vein, the project developed the capacities of MOICI staff through study tours and training programs, and has built a pool of certified trainers to conduct various trainings on the use of the e-mail system, and the management of Web sites. Similarly, the project provided 20 computers to the MOICI ICT Training Center, thus making it possible to train people in the various aspects of Web site management, the e-mail system, and other aspects of ICT.

One area in which the impact of the project was not as much as it could have been is with regards the LAN that was built for the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MOFA). The evaluation found that the LAN was only used for sharing networked printers, and not much else. As such, there is no sharing of documents or information through the network. It is expected that the situation

will, however, improve in the near future, given that there are plans to install a server in the LAN, and increase the services available to users.

2.6. Sustainability

Given the significant impact the project has had, the next logical question to ask is whether or not these gains would be sustainable, especially in the event of the cessation of external support. The evaluation found that in as much as it is possible and desirable to attain project sustainability, there are real challenges that need to be overcome in this regard.

In the first place, the evaluation concludes that the achievements are not yet sustainable, and that more time is needed to consolidate the gains that have been made. In particular, there is need to have more users and Ministries on the e-government platform to develop cost-recovery mechanisms. In addition, there is need to introduce additional services to further increase the utility of the platform, and hence make it more attractive to more users, thereby increasing prospects for its sustainability.

There is also need to develop institutional policies to ensure the sustainability of the impact of the project. Presently, such policies do not exist, and hence, there is no basis for mobilizing resources from various Ministries to help defray the cost of providing the e-government services such as Web site and e-mail hosting.

The present human resource base do not allow for the sustainability of the project activities and their impact. Although efforts have been made to retain key staff (e.g. by absorbing the former national UN Volunteer that worked on the project into MOICI), and 9 of 25 ICT graduates from Taiwan have been absorbed into various Departments and Ministries, there still is need for additional personnel, and to ensure that those in the service are not lost to other sectors. Already, the PMO has reported loss of staff who were trained in the e-mail system, and the Web site content management system, indicating the need to factor attrition in the capacity-building program of the project. Fortunately, there are plans to train more people, and get trainers from India. Additional support for capacity building is also expected from the ACE project, as well as the Commonwealth.

The evaluation found that continued UNDP funding is going to be critical to the sustainability of the project – at least for now. Although the full-blown e-government project document has been forwarded to the Office of the President to seek funding, and other funding sources are being explored, UNDP funding has to continue at least until additional funding has been secured. The reason for this is the relatively high cost of (about D900,000 per year) for the leased line for the data center, and the need to upgrade the servers and related equipment. Hopefully, the bandwidth costs will be drastically reduced, if not eliminated, when the Africa Cost to Europe (ACE) fiber optic project provides the 3 SDM 1 (about 160 MB) of bandwidth for e-government and social services.

There are a number of options for ensuring the sustainability of the project's activities and impact. First, there is need for an independent ICT agency to implement the e-government program. Such an institution will also be responsible for mobilizing additional resources, and helping introduce new services such as online applications for passports, ID cards, etc. Such an agency will also be able to embark on an outreach and awareness-raising campaign, and coordinate efforts to develop content for the Web sites.

2.7. Lessons Learned

The e-government support project has been implemented over a three period (2009 – 2011). During this time, a number of important lessons have been learned, including:

1. There should have been more sensitization, especially at the highest levels. The importance of outreach to the success of the project is indicated by the fact that many people signed up to the e-mail system after MOICI staff sensitized them about the system.
2. There should have been a more holistic proposal. Although the original project document called for the development of a Web portal, and the formulation of a full-blown project document, other activities such as the data center, E-government ICT Training Centre, e-mail and Web hosting, capacity building, and study tour were all added after project implementation started. The flexibility in the program helped them adjust to changing environments and needs.
3. There is need for proper coordination of ICT interventions. This especially so given the fact that the World Bank is providing connectivity to GRA, MOBSE, and MOHSW without involving MOICI. Furthermore, they have found the Technical Committee very helpful in managing the collaboration between MOICI, IFMIS, and other stakeholders.
4. Collaboration helps reduce costs, as exemplified by the collaboration with the IFMIS project. Thus, the project saved a lot of money that would have been spent on fibre, equipment, housing, etc had the collaboration not been possible. Collaboration has also resulted in the emergence of a team spirit between the institutions, and helps increase the number of people seeing the benefits of the project. As a result, more and more people are joining the e-government platform.
5. It helped to have a dynamic UNV who also trained people. This is a best practice since UNDP/UNV collaboration led to a skills transfer that was sustainable, because the people trained continued with the work after the UNV left.
6. UNDP and MOICI could have mobilized more resources to implement the project.

3. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

3.1. Conclusions

The evaluation of the support to the national e-government strategy project found that significant achievements were made, and that the project provides a solid base on which future interventions can be built.

The evaluation found that the project design was adequate, and flexible, allowing for the expansion of its mandate after implementation started. Thus, what started as a project aimed at developing a government Web portal grew into a multi-faceted project that included training programs, a government e-mail system, study tours, and building a data center and disaster recovery center.

The evaluation also found that the outputs of the project were achieved, with few areas in which the objectives were not achieved. Although there were some delays in the implementation of some activities (e.g. delays in the procurement of equipment for the data center, and in the development of the Web portal), these delays did not have any adverse effects on the cost of the project activities.

There is no doubt that the achievements of the project were based on UNDP interventions. The UNDP mobilized resources not only for the initial budgeted sum, but also for additional activities and programs which were added after the start of the project. Indeed the final budget for the project increased 260 percent to \$169,100 from the \$45,000 originally planned. The UNDP provided all of the additional increase in the budget of the project.

The evaluation also found that the UNDP's partnership strategy and approach were effective, and helped achieve project objectives. Specifically, the UNDP worked closely with MOICI, and other stakeholders, and mobilized resources for the implementation of the project. The UNDP also managed the finances of the project as well as procurement of various products and services. In light of the capacity challenges faced by government Ministries, the UNDP support was without doubt critical to the attainment of the project objectives.

The project was implemented in the context of various challenges beyond UNDP's control. For example, the capacity gaps in both the private and public sector resulted in delays in the implementation of some activities, and increased costs. A case in point here was the need to get trainers from India to help train government staff in Microsoft technologies, and the delay in the delivery of data center equipment because of difficulties in getting local companies who could supply the equipment. These capacity gaps also present a significant constraint to the sustainability of the project, and the difficulty for the UNDP to exit from its involvement in the project.

The project provides a good illustration of the importance of partnership-building and collaboration in such initiatives. Much of what has been achieved is based on the solid partnership that exists between UNDP, MOICI, IFMIS, and the various other Ministries and government agencies. Thus, the UNDP provided funding and project management services (financial management and M&E), MOICI hosted the project office, and provided staff and leadership, while IFMIS provided space, resources, expertise and services for the establishment of the data center and disaster recovery center. For their part, the other government agencies provided their staff who were trained in the use of the e-mail system, and the management of the Web sites. As a result a quiet, but profound transformation of the way government does business is underway. If the trend continues, there will be significant improvements in the delivery of government services, and by implication, better governance.

3.2. Recommendations

Based on the findings of the evaluation, the following recommendations can be made:

1. Human Resources

1. Retain key staff to ensure the smooth continuity of the project, and build on the experience they have accumulated over the years. In this regard, it is worth noting that the former National UNV for the project has now been absorbed by MOICI.
2. Strengthen MOICI staff by adding more personnel, and providing them more opportunities to build their capacities. MOICI is presently too weak in terms of technical competence, and this should be alleviated, especially given the key role it has to play in ICT development in the country.
3. Build an ICT cadre to serve Ministries and government agencies. This cadre should also be provided adequate incentives and motivated to ensure an effective implementation of the e-government program.

2. Partnership

4. Continue and strengthen the collaboration with IFMIS. In particular, IFMIS should be allowed to access the Internet connectivity provided for the e-government data center. This would be desirable, and reciprocate the services and facilities being provided by IFMIS to the e-government project.
5. Get more government agencies and employees to migrate their Web sites and e-mail addresses to the e-government platform.
6. Move services such as the health information system, and education management information system to the e-government platform.

3. Resources

7. UNDP should fund the project for at least another 5 years. During this time, additional sources of funding would be sought, and government agencies would be encouraged to include the provision of e-mail and Web hosting services to their annual budgets.
8. Mobilize additional resources to ensure the sustainability of the projects activities.
9. MOICI should take over the management of the project finances from the UNDP.

4. Institutional Development

10. Set up an ICT implementation agency, and/or implement the institutional development objectives articulated in the recently-prepared e-government project document.

5. Implement Lessons Learned from Study Tours to Rwanda and Ghana

11. Implement ICT initiatives such as the HIV tracking system, and online vehicle registration system in Rwanda
12. Increase efforts to sensitize the public about the Web portal and government Web sites
13. Sensitize end-users of the government e-mail system to increase its user base
14. Develop high-level ownership of the ICT agenda in the country
15. Organize a stakeholders and donors conference on ICTs to better coordinate ICT initiatives, and reduce duplication of efforts
16. Implement initiatives to increase access to ICTs in rural areas

4. ANNEXES

4.1. ToR for the Evaluation

Additional methodology-related documentation, such as the evaluation matrix and data collection instruments (questionnaires, interview guides, observation protocols, etc.) as appropriate

4.2. Interview Questionnaires

INTRODUCTION

The National Information and Communication Infrastructure (NICI) of The Gambia has laid out its policies and plans where ICT can contribute to the attainment of strategic issues identified in the Poverty Reduction Strategy Programme (PRSP). One of the components of the NICI policies, strategies and plans is the e-government strategy, which is aimed at assisting the country in its efforts to develop multi-sectoral e-government programme, and supporting projects prepared by the national technical committee with the assistance of ECA.

It is against this background that UNDP supported the MOCIT to implement key priority areas of its E-Government strategy through the establishment of a government Web portal. Other key outputs of this project were the development of a fully fledged project to support the implementation of National E-Government Strategy of The Gambia, and the establishment of an E-Government Data Centre and a Disaster Recovery Centre.

The objective of the evaluation is to assess progress of UNDP's interventions towards achievement of priority areas of intervention areas identified in the national e-governance strategy in terms of its objectives and to evaluate the efficacy of the strategies employed in contributing to the achievement of the outputs and outcomes as well as generate lessons, challenges and recommendations that could provide inputs or feed into the development of the next CPAP and any future interventions in this area.

This questionnaire is aimed at collecting information from project stakeholders to help the evaluation of the project. It is meant to be self-administered, and respondents are only expected to focus on those sections they are knowledgeable of, and are comfortable completing.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Interviewee Name: _____

Institution: _____

Title: _____

Role in the Project (e.g. beneficiary, technical committee member, staff of host agency, or UNDP staff etc.): _____

Phones:

Fixed: _____

Mobile: _____

E-mail: _____

1. Management Arrangements

1. What are your thoughts on the institutional management arrangements for the implementation of the project?
2. What do you think of the following, and their relationships with project beneficiaries?
 - Host Agency (MOICI)
 - Project Steering Committee
 - UNDP

2. *Project Management*

Financial Management

3. Are you familiar with, or knowledgeable about the financial management of the project? (If “No”, please jump to Question 6) _Yes _No _____
4. What are your thoughts on resource mobilization and utilization during the project?
5. Do you think the funds were disbursed in:
 - i) a timely manner
 - ii) adequate amounts
6. How do you see the modalities for disbursement of funds?
7. In what ways can the financial management system of the project be improved?

Targeted Project Achievements (work plan indicators)

8. How would you rate (Excellent, Very good, Good, Poor, Very Poor) the project in terms of meeting the work plan targets?Excellent
9. What were the major constraints to meeting the project work plan?
10. How could the implementation of the work plan have been improved?

3. *Monitoring and Evaluation Procedures*

11. Did the project M&E procedures adequately conform to UNDP guidelines?
12. What were the major challenges and constraints to meeting the guidelines?
13. What were the major challenges in the M&E system of the project?
14. How can the M&E system be improved in the future?

4. *Project Achievements and Impact*

i) Relevance

15. Was project and its intended outputs or outcomes are consistent with national and local policies and priorities and the needs of intended beneficiaries? If so, how, and to what extent?
16. Was the project responsive to UNDP corporate plan and human development priorities of empowerment and gender equality issues?
17. Was the expectations of the planners about what is needed the same as what the intended beneficiaries think is needed?
18. Was the UNDP able to respond to changing and emerging development priorities in a timely and effective manner?

ii) Effectiveness

Effectiveness measures the extent to which the initiative’s intended results (outputs or outcomes) have been achieved or the extent to which progress toward outputs or outcomes has been achieved.

Activities:

19. What are your thoughts on the following planned activities? Were they done as scheduled, done well, and were resources effectively used doing them?
 - i) National UNV recruited to understudy the International UNV and render IT support services to MOICI
 - ii) Government Web Portal (GWP)
 - iii) Advocacy campaign and sensitization of GWP to all Ministries and the Public
 - iv) At least 34 staff of the Ministries provided Hands-on training for government web portal administrators and Ministries’ web maintenance
 - v) The web portal officially registered in gm ccTLD domain
 - vi) Fully fledged project proposal on Implementation of the E-Government Strategy of The Gambia established
 - vii) E-Government ICT Training Center
 - viii) MOICI’s LAN rehabilitated and Operational
 - ix) ICT Support to MOFA
 - x) Government Data Center including Disaster Recovery Site established and running

iii) Efficiency

Efficiency measures how economically resources or inputs (such as funds, expertise and time) are converted to results.

20. Were resources used appropriately and economically to produce the desired outputs
21. Please list the activities that were efficiently implemented

22. Which activities were not efficiently implemented, and why were they not efficiently implemented.

iv) Sustainability

Sustainability measures the extent to which benefits of initiatives continue after external development assistance has come to an end.

23. Which project outputs and activities are sustainable, and which are not?

ACTIVITY	SUSTAINABLE? (YES OR NO)	REASON
1. International and National UN Volunteers	Yes	
2. Advocacy campaign and sensitization of GWP to all Ministries and the Public	Yes	
3. At least 34 staff of the Ministries provided Hands-on training for government web portal administrators and Ministries' web maintenance	Yes	
4. The web portal officially registered in gm ccTLD domain	Yes	
5. Fully fledged project proposal on Implementation of the E-Government Strategy of The Gambia established	Yes	
6. E-Government ICT Training Centre	Yes	
7. MOICI's LAN rehabilitated and Operational	Yes	
8. Government Data Center including Disaster Recovery Centre established and running	Yes	

24. Was a sustainability strategy, including capacity development of key national stakeholders, developed or implemented?

25. Are there any financial and economic mechanisms in place to ensure the ongoing flow of benefits once the assistance ends?

26. Have suitable organizational (public or private sector) arrangements have been made? Please specify if so.

27. What policy and regulatory frameworks are in place to support the continuation of benefits?

28. Do the requisite institutional capacity (systems, structures, staff, expertise, etc.) exist to sustain the gains of the project?

29. What are the constraints to sustaining project outputs and activities?

30. What suggestions do you have for increasing the sustainability of project outputs and activities?

v) Impact

Impact measures changes in human development and people's well-being that are brought about by development initiatives, directly or indirectly, intended or unintended.

31. What impact has the project had in the country?

5. Lessons Learned

32. What lessons have been learned in implementing the project?

6. Additional Comments

33. Please provide any additional comments you have on the project.

4.3. List of Individuals Interviewed

1. Aji Oulaye Ceesay, ICT Officer, MOTIE (face-to-face and by inter view questionnaire)
2. Amadou Nyang, ICT Officer, MOICI

3. Amie Janneh, ICT Officer, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
4. Baboucarr Mboge, Director of ICT, Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs
5. Benjamin Kofi Kujabi, ICT Officer, Ministry of Agriculture
6. Bubacarr Barry, ICT Officer, MOICI
7. Dembo Sankareh, Principal ICT Officer, MOICI
8. Edgardo C. Villena, International UNV (by interview questionnaire only)
9. Lamin Camara, Deputy Permanent Secretary, MOICI
10. Mamadi Ndow, Programme Assistant, ICT, UNDP
11. Momodou Lamin Bah, Project Manager, IFMIS Project
12. Pateh Jah, Deputy Permanent Secretary, Programmes and Policies, Personnel Management Office
13. Simon P. Mendy, ICT Officer, Ministry of Petroleum
14. Sirra Horeja Ndow, Programme Associate, Governance & Human Rights, UNDP
15. Yunusa Njie, ICT Officer, Directorate of National Treasury

4.4. List of Documents Reviewed

1. Support to National E-government Strategy Project Document
2. Various Project progress reports
3. Gambia UNDAF 2007-2011
4. 2011 Annual Progress Report E-government Project

4.5. Biography of the Evaluators

The evaluation was conducted by Katim S. Touray, Ph.D., a Gambian international development consultant based in The Gambia. Dr. Touray has conducted numerous consultancies in The Gambia and other African countries for government and UN agencies, as well as NGOs. Areas he has conducted consultancies in include surveys and mapping exercises, HIV/AIDS, information and communication technologies, preparation of national MDG reports, project and program evaluations, as well as preparation of project documents and country programs. He has also conducted project and program evaluations for the UNDP, UNEP, UNFPA, Action Aid International The Gambia.