

Mid-Term Review of the

Partnership for Gender Equity Project Phase III (2011-2015)

Prepared by Helen Brereton, Independent Consultant

November 2013 - Phnom Penh, Cambodia

Table of Contents

Execut	ive Summary	2
Part 1:	Introduction	7
Part 2:	Results and Achievements	10
Part 3:	Issues and Challenges	24
Part 4:	Major Recommendations and Future Directions	36
Annex	es	
	1. Terms of Reference	40
	2. Documents Reviewed	45
	3. Stakeholders Consulted	46
	4. Progress made against by outputs and major activities	48
	5. List of Acronyms	55

Executive Summary

The objective of the Mid Term Review (MTR) of the Partnership for Gender Equality Phase III (2011-2015) project is to assess the overall progress towards the intended objectives of the project, and to inform Ministry of Women's Affairs and UNDP of necessary adjustments and future directions with a view to the improvement of the project's sustainability, relevance, effectiveness and efficiency. This report analyses the project's results and achievements to-date, considers the issues and challenges that presently confront the project, and offers recommendations for future directions for the consideration of the Ministry of Women's Affairs and UNDP.

The environment in which the project operates has changed rapidly in the past few years, and it is appropriate that the project responds to those changes. Cambodia currently is undergoing rapid transformation from a low income to a lower middle income country. The government has declared its intention to be self-reliant by the Year 2020 which implies that MoWA, and other ministries, will increasingly need to rely on the national budget. It also implies that UNDP, and other Development Partnerships, need to heighten efforts to support self-sufficiency. Moreover, it will be vital to ensure that MoWA, in the context of the whole national machinery for women, is organized in such a way that it can deliver good policy and legislative work, and persuade other ministries to allocate resources to implement these deliverables.

The major findings of the report are divided into three main chapters – results and achievements, issues and challenges, and major recommendations and future directions.

Results and Achievements. Overall, the project has made considerable achievements and appears to be largely on-track towards achieving a large number of the predetermined targets, as they are articulated in the programme results framework. There were ten predetermined output level targets set to be achieved by 2015, and of the ten a total of six were deemed to either have been achieved or 'on track'.

Evidence is presented to suggest that the project has made substantial contributions to the development in the areas of analytical, policy and strategy processes and documents; namely Cambodia Gender Assessment, Neary Rattanak IV, the Ten Year Gender Policy and the Millennium Acceleration Framework on Women's Economic Empowerment.

Building on previous phases of PGE, the project has progressively supported MoWA to mainstream gender into national policies and plans, into government reform programmes, and cross cutting issues. It has been observed that MoWA is now well positioned to lead on some aspects of this work, with less support from the project being required. While progress towards a Programme Based Approach (PBA) towards Gender Equality has been slow, important ground work has been established. The project has taken steps that have contributed to the development the capacity of MoWA, and a Capacity Development Strategy towards a PBA was developed to guide future work. Overall, MoWA and the PGE project team are to be commended for its progress as are UNDP and SIDA for their consistent technical and financial support.

Issues and Challenges. There are numerous issues and challenges confronting the project, as perceived by the MTR consultant. While substantial progress was made by MoWA and the PGE project team, it was found that the project design included numerous and disparate activities, some with high transaction costs, and it lacked a clear overarching strategy or clear impact as a project. Key deliverables were not sufficiently prioritised, and major works were delayed. The project's strength in macro policy and planning and institutional gender mainstreaming, has been somewhat undermined in the proliferation of micro activities. Despite progress being made toward a PBA, as it stands the project is one of several projects within MoWA

and is contributing to a project mentality and inefficient management practises. Furthermore, two key components were designed with a narrow focus with support from MoWA in service provision, which would not normally be within the remit of MoWA.

While progress is being made in policy development, the gap between gender policy development and implementation persists. There are issues with the project's strategy to support line ministries, with a general lack of limited systematic engagement by MoWA with priority sector ministries. Some achievements also have corresponding challenges. While the capacity of MoWA is reported to have developed, the project impact only extends to selected counterpart staff of MoWA. The development of the Capacity Development strategy also was delayed, and there has been little attention given to systematic organisational development. There are also several major issues with the institutional and programme management arrangements, and it is recommended they are re-considered.

Major Recommendations and Future Directions. Forty four recommendations are put forward as a response to the strengths and challenges that confront the project (as presented below). However the consultant came to the conclusion that there are major issues that must be addressed before these project oriented recommendations are considered. For this reason it is proposed that the project is given a major reformulation to ensure its relevance within the current reform agendas of MoWA and the government as a whole to ensure it progressively moves towards supporting a PBA. To that end, the report also presents several overarching recommendations and identifies three priority areas that can be explored in more depth in a project reformulation process. All recommendations presented are based on the assumption that the project be extended for five years (2014-2018).

As an extension of that proposal, it is recommended that the scope of the project is narrowed and the number of outputs and activities be significantly reduced. In some cases, this is justified because MoWA has demonstrated the capacity to lead the work with less, or minimal support from the project. In other cases, activities could be phased out because they are no longer relevant or effective, or because they have been completed. Implicit in this reduction in scope and the number of activities, is that the project ceases to support any form of direct service provision by MoWA, and thereby supports its transition away from direct implementation towards policy making and gender mainstreaming.

It is further proposed that the project focuses only on the macro dimensions of gender policy development and mainstreaming through research, policy development, coordination and capacity development. Indeed, the entire thrust of the project should be to support MoWA to focus on upstream policy analysis and formulation (rather than project implementation and service delivery), and to reach out across government in a systematic and carefully executed manner.

Three priority areas are proposed for the possible inclusion in the reformulated project for the next 5 years:

- Long term and high level gender policy, planning and programme development: post NRIV (2019-2029).
- Gender and Economic Policy Making, including support to the development a women's economic empowerment programme.
- A Core Programme for Capacity Development for a PBA, beginning with a full organisational development and institutional review exercise of the whole national machinery.

Each of the three priority areas would be major undertaking, and a determination will need to be made as to whether the project supports one, two or all three of them. Consideration must also be given to funding modality options, and how the project can best support the transition to a full PBA, which implies the use of national systems. Finally, recommendations are proposed for the UNDP Country Office to give consideration as to how UNDP more broadly can make strategic interventions to advance the gender equality agenda in Cambodia in pursuit of the CMDGs.

It is intended that the recommendations presented in this report will help MoWA and UNDP to reformulate the project, and be ready to support the government and its delivery on commitments to the realisation of women's rights and gender equality, while supporting the government's quest to become self-sufficient by 2020.

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

Output 1: Gender-responsive policies, plans and budgets of key sectors developed and their implementation monitored.

- That, for the remainder of the NRIV preparation period, the project intensifies efforts to strengthen the capacities of relevant MoWA Departments to take the lead to develop NRIV.
- That, for the remainder of the NRIV preparation period, that a comprehensive consultation process is undertaken, ensuring stronger outreach/participation to civil society groups and line ministries.
- That MoWA assumes full responsibility for managing the development of CGA4 and NRV.
- That the development of the next CGA be more cost effective with fewer consultants and that MoWA assumes responsibility for recruiting consultants. Consider also that the next CGA be fully funded by the project, be developed in a more cost effective way (e.g. as an 'update' with policy briefs), and that the CGA process starts at least 18 months ahead of next NSDP and NRV (2019-2023).
- That MoWA/UNDP considers scaling back its financial and technical support to engender the next NSDP (2019-2023) in light of MoWA's increased capacity.
- That for the remainder of the current NSDP preparation process, close attention is paid to ensuring a robust and coherent monitoring and evaluation framework is created, strengthening linkages between different sector strategies and policies, and that key gender actions are costed.
- That the project considers scaling back direct support to engendering national reform programmes to allow MoWA to fully assume responsibility. And that the project makes a budget provision for advisors/consultants to support contributions to reform programmes.
- That future work on gender responsive budgeting be synchronized with the budgeting work be conducted through NRIV and the NSDP processes, and there be a focus on supporting and monitoring line ministries to make allocations in accordance with these plans.
- That MoWA assumes full responsibility for its partnership with RSA, and the project phases out its financial support.
- That the partnership approach between RSA and MoWA be considered a good practice model which could be applied in other contexts, and with other institutions.
- That the project supports a review of the GMAGs as part of the proposed institutional review exercise.
- That the project identifies strategic ways to support gender mainstreaming, including only providing high level support to ministries with a national and sub national planning and budgeting oversight function i.e. Ministry of Planning, Ministry of Economy and Finance and Ministry of Interior.
- That an immediate priority is to ensure the NRIV formulation process includes opportunities for more robust dialogue between MoWA and the relevant ministries.

Output 2: Increased access to gender-sensitive business development services for women small-business entrepreneurs

- That the WEE component, in its current form be phased out by end of 2013. This means the project would no longer provide direct financial and technical support to the WDC in Kampong Speu.
- That MoWA/PGE considers exploring alternative options for the future management of the WDCs; ensuring consistency with MoWA's policy making mandate (e.g. establishing WDCs independent institutions, the feasibility of Public-Private Partnerships, or transferring management to MLVT).
- That project's approach to women's economic empowerment be re-oriented towards broader dimensions of gender and economic policy making and gender mainstreaming- research, policy development, coordination and capacity development.
- That an immediate priority is given for the project to support MoWA to engage in high level dialogue with each economic related ministry with a view to ensuring they make budget allocation to implement their actions identified in the MAF.
- That the project, in coordination with UN Women, JICA and other DPs, considers supporting the development of a WEE Programme which would be the basis of the PBA from 2016 onwards (when the MAF expires).
- That the project provides high level support to MoWA to assume a leadership and coordination role, including through the TWGG-WEE sub group, and continuation of the WEE Expert Group.
- That the project considers that support be given to MoWA and MEF to implement the UNDP high level tailor made capacity development programme for gender in economic policy: the Global Gender and Economic Policy and Management Initiative.
- That UNDP (not PGE) makes a determination as to whether it will assume the role of co-facilitator of the TWG-G WEE Sub Group. And if UNDP assume this role, it invest in its own internal capacity. Alternatively, UNDP should consider handing over the co-facilitator role to another Development Partner.
- That an informal meeting of DPs is held prior to the TWG-G sub group of WEE meetings, to promote coordination among development priors prior to the formal meetings.

Output 3: Preventive and remedial responses to Gender Based Violence are scaled up.

- That the GBV component is phased out, and that the financial and technical support to Community
 Capacity Enhancement initiative ends after the remaining 20 villages are completed and a report is
 prepared.
- That UNDP Country Office, separate from the project, identifies high level ways to promote women's
 personal and physical safety in its country programme and actively participates in government and nongovernment GBV related forums. And that additional measures be considered in the context of the CPAP
 review which is currently underway.

Overall effectiveness

- That the MOWA and the PGE project team is credited for achieving, or is on track in achieving, the
 majority of the pre-determined objectives and output of the project as they are articulated in the project
 document.
- That the future design of the project capitalises on the strength of the project in macro level policy making, monitoring of government commitments and institutional strengthening.
- That the project's scope and approach be redefined, consolidated, and based on a clearly articulated strategy.
- That the number of project supported activities is significantly reduced, and there is a corresponding reduction in outputs and deliverables.
- That the outcome indicators be revised as the project is reformulated to ensure they are fully relevant measures of outcome.

• That CPAP review process maintains gender an outcome and a cross cutting issue, and provides guidance on how PGE can best feed into UNDAF/CPAP outcomes in the coming years.

Capacity Development and Coordination

- That the project broadens the focus from individual level capacity development of selected MoWA staff, to include high level institutional development of the national machinery.
- That the strategy for capacity development presented in NRIV becomes the basis for the project's strategy for the coming years.
- That the project supports a full organizational development and institutional strengthening exercise which will provide possible re-restructuring recommendations across the national machinery, and clarity about the roles and responsibilities for each MoWA department.
- That the project progressively supports the development of a *Core Programme for Capacity* Programme for the national machinery for the advancement of women, which is fully costed for inclusion in NRV (2019-2024).
- That the project continues to provide high level guidance to the MoWA PBA Committee and Secretariat.
- That UNDP takes a more proactive role as co-chair of TWG-G in support of a PBA approach. And that UNDP initiates regular 'informal meetings' of DPs to promote coordination and harmonisation among DPs, and that they are held prior to the TWG-G meetings.
- That UNDP has sufficient human resource capacity to assume its' leadership role and support DP coordination towards a PBA.

Institutional and Programme Management Arrangements

- That the MoWA institutional management arrangements be reconsidered as part of the project reformulation process in terms of implementation modality and staffing schedule.
- That the UNDP project staffing arrangements are reconsidered as part of the project reformulation process.
- That the number of UNDP contracted staff based in MoWA is gradually reduced. And that prior to the UNDP Programme Management Specialist position being filled, the position description is reviewed to ensure there is no overlap with the MoWA Programme Manager position.
- That project funding be made available for expert national and international consultants to provide inputs at peak periods, and that these consultants are managed by MoWA.
- That the Policy Advisor should be recruited without further delay, and that the advisor is based full time in MoWA providing a high level planning and policy oversight function.
- That the staffing needs of UNDP are investigated during the project reformulation process to ensure it has sufficient capacity to perform its function.
- That beyond 2015 UNDP gives consideration to the different ways in which the project could be managed and delivered, including the creation of a pooled fund or a UN Joint Programme for Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment.

1. Introduction

1.1 About Partnership for Gender Equity Phase III

The Partnership for Gender Equity Phase III (PGE III) 2011-2015 is the third phase of a UNDP-SIDA cofinanced programme. Since 2001 PGE has provided continuous technical assistance to the Ministry of Women's Affairs (MoWA) in its endeavour to promote greater gender equality and impact in Cambodia. PGEIII has entered into the 3rd year of its operations in 2013 which means it is half way through Phase III implementation.

The purpose of PGE III (herein referred to as 'the project') was to ensure that the gender-sensitive policies and plans for Cambodian Millennium Development Goals (CMDG) acceleration are actually implemented and make an impact on the status, rights and choices of Cambodian women. The programme design is broad in scope and covers a wide range of complex activities. The scope of the project includes extensive gender mainstreaming aspects, and work on specific gender issues; namely women's economic empowerment and ending violence against women and girls.

The key strategies identified in the programme document are:

- Scale up support to key sectors such as environment and climate change, decentralization, gender-based budgeting in the Public Financial Management Reform Programme (PFM), Public Administration Reform, and labour, thereby contributing to recruit and retain more women in civil service at all levels; increase women's participation in decision making; include their voices and concerns in local development plans; increase women's access to decent work and economic opportunities; identify strategically 'smart' investments in sector budgets impacting on CMDG achievement; and to promote equal opportunity for men and women to access to and manage natural resources.
- 2. Increase access to gender-sensitive business development services for women small-business entrepreneurs providing them with technical and business skills (including adult women literacy)
- 3. Scale up preventive and remedial responses to Gender-based Violence (GBV) through a feasibility study on one-stop service centres and scaling up the GBV Community Capacity Enhancement methodology.

The project was designed to focus on three outputs that are intended to be mutually reinforcing:

- Output 1: Gender-responsive policies, plans and budgets of key sectors developed and their implementation monitored.
- Output 2: Increased access to gender-sensitive business development services for women small-business entrepreneurs
- Output 3: Preventive and remedial responses to GBV scaled up.

The project was established to be implemented by MoWA in line with UNDP's national implementation modality (NIM). The Programme Board is the main governing body of the Programme. A Secretary of State (who is one of 8 secretaries of States) is the 'National Programme Director' and is responsible for providing

direction and guiding overall management of programme activities that are led by the Programme Manager who is the Director of the Department of Gender Equality. Overall the Programme was designed to be coordinated by the Department of Gender Equality. However, Component 2 was intended to be led by the Department of Economic Development, Women's Development Centres (Kampong Speu and another centre) and the Department of Education. Component 3 was designed to be managed by the Department of Legal Protection with involvement of other technical departments. A review of these institutional arrangements can be found in Part 3.

1.2 Objectives of the Mid Term Review

This report documents the findings of the MTR of the project which was prepared by an independent consultant (Helen Brereton) who was recruited by UNDP Cambodia. The consultant worked total of 25 days between 16 August and 26 October 2013. In-country consultations took place between 25 September and 5 October, 2013. The consultant was tasked to design, implement and document the findings of the MTR and propose recommendations for the future. The terms of reference for the MTR are attached as Annex 1.

The MTR is intended to assess the overall progress towards programme intended objectives, Country Programme Action Plan (2011-2015) and UNDAF outcomes and to inform MoWA and UNDP of necessary adjustments and future directions. The consultant was to examine both the general aspects and specific components of the programme and make recommendations regarding specific actions that might be taken to improve the project sustainability, efficiency and effectiveness and alignment to Government's policy framework and on-going reform programmes.

The MTR covers the implementation of the project for the period 2011- June 2013, or 2.5 years of implementation of the five year project.

The contents of this report reflect the author's own views, and not that of UNDP or MoWA.

1.3 Methodology

The MTR was designed to be participatory and consultative and informed by the ideas and experiences of PGEIII/MOWA. The consultation process was designed to allow for open and constructive dialogue about what is working well, what is not working well, and what should be done to ensure the future success of the project.

A series of guiding questions were developed and submitted to UNDP and MoWA prior to the in-country consultations taking place. They were used as the basis for all interviews and focus group discussions and covered four main areas:

- What was achieved in terms of the intended outcomes, outputs and deliverables (as stated in the programme document)? What are the unintended results?
- How were the results achieved? What were the critical success factors?
- What lessons have been learned?
- What should be the future directions for PGE in in support of MoWA?

The methodology consisted of three main components;

An extensive literature review. The review formed the basis of the MTR framework, work plan and guiding questions, all of which were approved by the UNDP and MoWA teams prior to commencing in-country

consultations. An audit of progress against the outputs and deliverables was prepared as a part of an Inception Report. Refer to Annex 2 for a list of documents reviewed.

Consultation meetings and focus group discussions. As noted above, the in-country consultations took place between 25 September and 4 October 2013. Key informant interviews took place with a range of stakeholders, namely MoWA personnel, Gender Mainstreaming Action Groups of Line Ministries (LM), Development Partners (DPs), NGOs and private sector representatives. Discussion questions were developed according to the expertise within these groups which in turn provided a catalyst for group discussion and input into the final analysis. Refer to Annex 3 for a list of people interviewed during the consultancy period.

Presentation of draft findings and recommendations to MoWA and UNDP. The draft findings and recommendations of the MTR were presented at three separate meetings in Phnom Penh, October 3rd-5th, 2013. These included debriefings with: H.E Kantha Phavi, Minister of MoWA, H.E Khim Chamroeun, Secretary of State and Director of PGEII, representatives of MoWA senior management team, UNDP Country Office, and with PGE/UNDP contracted staff based in MoWA.

1.4 Limitations of the Review

The undertaking of the MTR was constrained by a number of factors. First, the consultation period took place at a time when the government was forming. This led to delays in establishing meetings with line ministries. As a result some key meetings with Ministries did not take place, (e.g. meetings were not held with the Ministry of Economy and Finance, State Secretariat of Civil Service or Ministry of Commerce). In the end only three meetings took place with line ministries (Ministry for Rural Development, Ministry of Planning and Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training).

Second, due to delays in establishing meetings, meant there was insufficient time for the consultant to conduct any provincial visits. The meeting with the Director of the Women's Development Centre (WDC) Kampong Speu took place in Phnom Penh.

Third, the MTR was intended to provide recommendations for the remainder of project period i.e. for 2014-2015. Because it became apparent that a substantial reformulation of the project was needed, there was insufficient time begin a reformulation process. Rather section 4 proposes suggestions for what the scope of the project could look like, and issues to be considered in the reformulation process. This was discussed between the consultant UNDP during the consultation period, at which time the consultant recommended that a separate "project reformulation" process was needed, and that UNDP should allocate resources for that process in coordination with other UN agencies (especially UN Women and UNFPA) and relevant Development Partners (DPs).

2. Results and Achievements

The major results and achievements, as seen by the consultant, are outlined below. In each case, individual recommendations are proposed to further capitalise on the strengths of the project. These project recommendations need to be considered in the context the broader recommendations on the future direction which are presented in Part 4.

This section is presented in two parts. Part A provides an assessment of progress made towards the three project output level and the pre-determined output targets. Part B provides an assessment of progress made towards UNDAF and CPAP outcome and outcome the pre-determined outcome targets. Each section includes a table which presents the output, indicators and targets (as stated in the programme document), and a 'progress update for 2013' (where the information was available) which indicates progress at the time of the MTR.

It is important to note that some achievements listed also have accompanying issues and challenges which are explored in Part 3: Issues and Challenges. It should be further noted that many of the achievements presented are based on anecdotal evidence based on a short consultation period, and do not necessarily represent evidence-based changes in the situation.

This section is to be read in conjunction with Annex 4 which contains a detailed description of the status of 'major activities' by output and deliverable.

A. Assessment of progress towards project outputs

Output 1: Gender responsive policies, plans and budgets

The strength of the project is the work undertaken under Output 1, *Gender-responsive policies, plans and budgets of key sectors developed and their implementation monitored.* This is the largest component of the project and is the most relevant as it is directly aligned with the core mandate of MoWA. Output 1 focused on two related deliverables:

- MoWA has improved capacity for sector gender analysis and strategic advocacy for engendering national and sectoral policies, plans, budgets and reform programmes;
- Key selected sector ministries are able to implement their plans and integrate gender in their respective sector plans and budgets for CMDG acceleration

Output 1 includes a wide range of complex activities. A total 15 major activities were identified – some of which are major initiatives or projects into themselves. There were five pre-determined performance indicators for output 1. Table 1 shows, that 4 of the 5 target indicators are 'on track' to meet the 2015 target.

Table 1: Progress made towards Output 1 Indicators

Output 1: Gender-responsive policies, plans and budgets of key sectors developed and their implementation monitored				
Output 1 Indicators (as stated in programme document)	Baseline	Progress as of 2013	Target 2015	MTR Status
No. of sector plans with gender-specific targets and budget allocation	0 (2010)	3	5	On track
No. of RSA civil servant trainees receiving training on gender equality by MoWA	n/a	2011 - 200 2012 - 0 2013 – 200 Total: 400	1750 or 350 annually	On track ¹
Gender-sensitive curriculum of RSA developed	No	Yes	Yes	On track
Capacity Development Strategy of MoWA developed	No	Yes	Yes	On track
PBA on gender equality and partnership agreement drafted	No	No	To be completed	Needs Attention

The major achievements of output 1 are as follows:

2.1 The project has made substantial contributions to development of major pieces of analytical, policy and strategy documents; namely Cambodia Gender Assessment, Neary Rattanak IV and the Ten Year Gender Policy.

PGE is supporting MoWA in producing several major pieces of work of analytical, planning and policy work, namely the *Cambodia Gender Assessment (CGA3)*, *Neary Rattanak IV (NRIV)* and the *Ten Year Policy for Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment* (the Ten Year Gender Policy). All of these are major pieces of work in their own right, and something many countries do not have. They are of the utmost importance since they constitute the foundation for all gender equality and gender mainstreaming work in the country. It is the view of the MTR consultant that this work is the centre piece of the project, and the project should also be credited for consistently providing technical and financial support to their development for more than a decade.

The *CGA3* is currently under preparation and is expected to be completed by the end of 2013. It provides the analytical basis for gender equality and women's empowerment work in Cambodia. For this reason, it was intended that CGA be developed before NSDP and NRIV development to ensure up to date analysis work that informs their development. However, the process to develop the CGA was delayed, and is not available for NSDP or NRIV preparation. This was a missed opportunity. Further, the process to develop CGA is overly complicated and expensive, with up to 13 different consultants involved in its drafting.

Neary Rattanak IV (2014-2018) is also under preparation and an international consultant has been hired. A draft strategy has been prepared which is currently being reviewed by MoWA. It builds upon findings of a comprehensive MTR of NRIII which was conducted with the support of the project in 2012. This Five Year Strategic Plan is significant as it now represents the first stage implementation plan of the new Gender Policy. It is also significant because it provides the framework, and concrete action, to support a transition to support the transition from project to a programme based approach.

year. The target of 350 per year needs to be revised. Progress of this indicator is considered to be 'on-track' since the project has provided support to RSA training. It should be noted that in 2012, MoWA re-negotiated with RSA to integrate gender training into the RSA training programme more systematically, and MoWA then prepared master trainers for the expanded nature of the gender related training.

¹ In 2011 350 civil servants were trained by RSA, and hence the target of 350 per year. However, this amount was reduced to 200 per year. The target of 350 per year needs to be revised. Progress of this indicator is considered to be 'on-track' since the project has

However, similar to CGA, the process to commence development of NRIV was delayed and there appears to be minimal ownership and leadership by MoWA Department of Gender Equality. Moreover, the consultative process to develop the first draft was limited (in part, due to the elections).

MoWA, with support of the project, is also in the process of developing *Ten Year Policy for Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment (2014-2024)* (herein referred to as the 'Gender Policy') which is currently in draft form. This is a major a milestone. It signals a commitment by the government to taking a longer term view. It defines the country's vision and states what it plans to do to achieve the vision. This is important because while RCG commitment to gender equality is enshrined in numerous national policies and laws, the implementation of these commitments has been affected by a lack of a coherent framework and institutional mechanism to guide implementation at the highest level. As noted above, the policy is significant as it is now constitute the basis for a PBA².

While the development of CGA, NRIV and the Gender Policy are major achievements, there are issues with the way in which they were developed, and there were serious delays in their development. And while it is significant that the documents are developed, there is a gap in implementation. These issues are further explored in the Part 3: 'Issues and Challenges'. While it is recommended that the project continues to support for these policy and planning processes in the coming years, more consideration can be given to long term planning and costing processes. It could be desirable, for example, that MoWA leads the development of a comprehensive Ten Year "Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment programme" (similar to the Sub National Democratic Development model). These points are explored in more detail in Part 4: Major Recommendations and Future Direction.

Recommendations

- 1. That, for the remainder of the NRIV preparation period, the project intensifies efforts to strengthen the capacities of relevant MoWA Departments to take the lead to develop NRIV.
- 2. That, for the remainder of the NRIV preparation period, that a comprehensive consultation process is undertaken, ensuring stronger outreach/participation to civil society groups and line ministries.
- 3. That MoWA assumes full responsibility for managing the development of CGA4 and NRV.
- 4. That the development of the next CGA be more cost effective with fewer consultants and that MoWA assumes responsibility for recruiting those consultants. Consider also that the next CGA be fully funded by the project and be developed in a cost effective way (e.g. as an 'update' with policy briefs), and that the CGA process starts at least 18 months ahead of next NSDP and NRV (2019-2023).

2.2 Building on previous phases, the project has progressively supported MoWA to mainstream gender into national policies and plans.

MoWA, with the support of the project, is providing timely and high level support to engender national policies and plans. Gender is now a centrepiece of the Rectangular Strategy, National Strategic Development Plan (NSDP), Cambodia Millennium Development Goals (CMDGs). Engendering national policy agenda has provided vital platform to engage line ministries to institutionalize gender perspectives across their institutions and programmes, and for the non-government sector. They demonstrate RGCs commitment to gender equality, and act as accountability points which serve as building blocks for the next five years. Overall, MoWA (and the project) should be commended for its responsiveness to the development of government policies and processes. Work undertaken in the 2011-2013 period builds on work previously undertaken in previous phases of PGE.

² The guidance note by the Council of Development Cambodia provides the parameters of PBA towards gender equality which are: national policy framework (commonly defined objectives and priorities), annual work plans with detailed costing and budgeting and performance parameters, the use of national systems and capacity development.

MoWA, with the support of the project, is in the process of engendering the *National Strategic Development Plan* (NSDP) 2014-2018 which is currently under preparation. The NSDP is a major entry point for gender mainstreaming. While it was a missed opportunity not to have CGA to inform this vital process, MoWA has provided timely inputs into the process thus far. These supports were provided through coordination by MoWA/ Technical Working Group on Gender (TWG-G), the Ministry of Planning (MoP) and sector ministries, through support on policy analysis and strategic advocacy and communications. Meeting with MoP officials reported that MoWA is an active stakeholder. Importantly MoP has taken steps to ensure the sector/line ministries inputs into the NSDP are engendered. At the time of writing, MoP reported that it is about to cross check sector inputs with gender inputs provided by MoWA, and it will be seeking MoWA input into the months ahead. It is noteworthy that MoP requires line ministries to cost their NSDP inputs. While there was insufficient time to review this process in any depth, this could be a valuable entry point for MoWA to ensure priority actions identified in NRIV are costed. Unless funding is made available by line ministries, little progress can be made by way of implementation.

A major priority for MoWA and the project for the remainder of 2013 will be to ensure the NSDP creates a robust and coherent monitoring and evaluation framework for gender equality, and t strengthens linkages between different sector strategies and policies. The M&E framework will provide a platform for systematic monitoring of gender related actions across the government over the next 5 years.

It was observed during the MTR that MoWA has demonstrated capacity to lead the process of engendering government policies and planning processes, and needs less financial and technical support from the project. This is a good sign and one would expect that after 13 years of consistent project support that this would be the case. It is for this reason, it would be strategic if the project scales back its support to fully enable MoWA staff to step up and take the lead. Expert consultants may need to be hired for high complex tasks but it would be desirable if these consultants can be hired by MoWA and not through UNDP. This would further ensure full ownership and leadership by MoWA, and hopefully associated costs will be fully covered by the governments' own National Budget.

Recommendations

- 5. That MoWA/UNDP considers scaling back its financial and technical support to engender the next NSDP (2019-2023) in light of MoWA's increased capacity.
- 6. That for the remainder of the current NSDP preparation process, close attention is paid to ensuring a robust and coherent monitoring and evaluation framework is created, strengthening linkages between different sector strategies and policies, and that key gender actions are costed.
- 2.3 The project has supported MoWA to mainstream gender into government reform programmes and cross cutting issues, with less support from the project being needed.

The project document identified a major activity of the project was to support MoWA to engender government reform programmes and cross cutting issues. Three national reform programmes were identified: Public Administration Reform (PAR), Public Financial Management reform PFM (PFM) and Decentralization and De-concentration (D&D) reform. These reform programmes are strategic entry points for gender equality.

It was observed that MoWA, with varying degrees of support from the project, has kept in step with changes and developments in these reform programmes. Internal MoWA Working Groups have been established to

provide Ministry-wide support. The extent to which MoWA was able to make a substantial contribution varied depending of the reform processes themselves. While effort has been made to engender PAR, for example, the reform process itself remains slow.

The intention of the projects work in *Public Administration Reform* was 'to increase, retain and empower women civil servants'. This work is to be measured by the pre-determined outcome indicator: "*Proportion of civil servants who are female*". The project target was to support to an increase in the proportion of female civil servants to 40% by 2015. The percentage increased to 35% in 2012 (from 34% in 2010) and the potential to increase the proportion of female civil servants to 40% remains possible if concerted efforts are still made.

While the PAR reform is reported to be slow, MoWA needs to stand ready to collaborate and provide substantive policy input into the work of the Council of Administration Reform and State Secretariat of Civil Service (SSCS). Future entry points may include development gender-responsive legislation on the civil service at the sub-national level, using the D&D channel, the public administration reform's policies on Human Resource Management.

Building on previous work, MoWA/PGE III has put emphasis on mainstreaming gender into the *Public Financial Management Reform Programme* (*PFM-RP*)³. The approach taken by the project was to mainstream gender into the process of budget planning and budget execution through the application of Gender Responsive Budgeting (GBR) tools. An expert trainer was hired in 2012 to develop "A Practical Guide on Gender-Responsive Budgeting" and a series of trainings/orientations were delivered for planning officials of MoWA, Ministry of Economy and Finance and other sector ministries including Cambodian National Council for Women in order to strengthen their capacity on GRB.

Unfortunately no interview was held with the Ministry of Economy and Finance during the MTR consultation process which makes an assessment of this initiative difficult. However it was observed that the project is supporting a GRB initiative at a time when full costing of gender related activities identified in NR (by sector) have not been completed. This gives rise to the relevance and timing of GRB initiative, and whether it would be more strategic for MoWA to work with MEF in a systematic way to ensure relevant ministries make budget provisions for the costed action in their respective plans and budgets.

The project design also identified D&D reform as a key entry point. The 10-year National Program for Sub National Democratic Development (SNDD) is considered to be one of the more advanced reform programmes of the government. MoWA has taken a proactive role in engendering this reform agenda and should be commended for its high level and timely input. MoWA has been an active player in D&D reform agenda for more than a decade, and while it was anticipated PGE would provide support, in reality little was needed. This should be considered an achievement.

MoWA, with the support of the project, has also supported the development of gender mainstreaming strategies in emerging cross-ministerial areas such as *Climate Change and Green Growth*. The project provided financial support to the MoWA's Gender and Climate Change Committee (GCCC) to build the

poverty reduction and gender implication statement into the BSP and PB."

³ The PFM-RP Stage 2 was launched officially by the Cambodian Prime Minister in December 2008. It is one of the key elements of the Rectangular Strategy and its aim is to build an International standard of public financial management system by 2015. The Consolidated Action Plan 2 (CAP2) of the PFM-RP, gender consideration was clearly integrated into the Objective 32.1, "Develop policy on integration of the budget. Continue to improve integration of recurrent and capital budgets through such ongoing initiatives such as Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF), Budget Strategic Plan (BSP), and Programme Budgeting (PB). Integrate

capacity of its members on gender and climate change. A series of Training of Trainers on Climate Change Vulnerability and Adaptation/Mitigation Capacity Analysis, and Planning from Gender Perspectives were provided to GCCC members, resulting in improved knowledge and capacity. This support is a steppingstone as GCCC is in the process of developing the Cambodia Climate Change Strategic Plan (CCSSP) so that they have the capacity implementing it effectively.

Given there is evidence that MoWA has internal capacity to increasingly take the lead in engendering national reform programmes, it is recommended that this work, as it is currently articulated in the programme document and is updated to reflect the current realities. It is also proposed that consideration be given to gradually reducing direct financial and technical support for this work. Instead, contingency should be made for external advisors/consultants to support MoWA during peak times. For example, a consultant could be hired by MoWA to conduct an audit of PAR, SSCS and provide recommendations for a reduction in gender gaps in the civil services (remuneration, recruitment, access to training etc.). However, over time it would be desirable for MoWA to assume a technical lead and that finances for these processes come from the National Budget (and not from the PGE project).

Recommendations

- 7. That the project considers scaling back direct support to engendering national reform programmes to allow MoWA to fully assume responsibility. And that the project makes a budget provision for advisors/consultants to support contributions to reform programmes.
- 8. That future work on gender responsive budgeting be synchronized with the budgeting work be conducted through NRIV and the NSDP processes, and there be a focus on supporting and monitoring line ministries to make allocations in accordance with these plans.

2.4 The project has progressively contributed to development the capacity of MoWA and a Capacity Development Strategy was developed to guide future work.

MoWA has continued to make progressive steps to establish itself as a credible ministry. Key informants interviewed for the MTR reported that the capacity of MoWA has improved, albeit slowly. It was reported that MoWA has been particularly instrumental in engendering national policies and programmes, and that this provided a vital platform to engage line ministries and the nongovernment sector to institutionalize gender perspectives across their institutions and programmes.

There is evidence to suggest that the project has provided significant technical and financial support MoWA to perform its gender mainstreaming oversight functions at the national level. And that this project has made a major investment in this regard since 2001 when the project first began. While it is not possible for the MTR to make an evidence based assessment about MoWAs enhanced capacity, it is interesting to note that when MoWA staff were asked "what would happen if PGE ceased to exist?" the consistent message MoWA could undertake the work itself, but things would move more slowly.

The programme design rightly identified the need for a capacity development strategy to frame the projects capacity development efforts. In the regard, an achievement of the project was the *Capacity Development Strategy for Programme-Based Approach towards Gender Equality (2014-8)* (herein referred to as the "Capacity Development Strategy") which was completed in May 2013. The development of this document is a milestone as it is the first comprehensive strategy to develop organizational capacities of national machinery (i.e. not only MoWA) for the promotion of gender equality using a PBA.

While progressive steps have been made by the project to develop the capacity of MoWA, some major issues and challenges lie ahead. As would be expected, major capacity gaps remain, civil services reform has stalled, institutional issues within MoWA persist, and there are flaws in the project's approach to capacity development. While the development of the capacity development strategy is an achievement, its delivery was delayed (according to the project document it was meant to be completed in 2011) and meant there was not strategy framing the project capacity development efforts. These issues are further addressed and recommendations provided, in Part 3: "Issues and Challenges".

2.5 The project has supported MoWA to progress towards a Programme Based Approach towards Gender Equality and important ground work has been laid.

The development of the Programme Based Approach (PBA) towards Gender Equality is a major opportunity and risk for MoWA⁴. A PBA has the potential to completely transform MoWA over the coming years, and the ground work that is laid over the next few years will be vital to ensuring its long term success toward enabling MoWA to strengthen its overall coordination, management, monitoring, and reporting in a coherent manner.

Overall, it can be said that progress is slowly being made toward a PBA on Gender Equality, and that the project has provided technical and financial support to the process. It is also fair to say that the Programme Document (which was designed in 2010) did not anticipate the complexity of this work, nor did it provide the project with a clear road map.

In 2012 MoWA established the PBA Committee and Secretariat with a view to introduce policies and procedures on PBA on development policy, planning, public finance, human resource and monitoring and evaluation. The PBA Committee and Secretariat are expected to be the main vehicle for progressing internal work for a PBA. The project is providing high level support to the PBA Committee (chaired by H.E Kim Chamroeun who is also the Project Director of PGE). At the time of writing the project is planning a 'Communities of Practice' to enable MoWA staff learn and share best practices and lessons learnt on new aid modalities such as Sector-Wide Approaches, PBA and TWGs from the other sectors. From all reports sharing the common understanding of PBA in the context of gender equality is considered a high priority by MOWA. Efforts like Communities of Practices can be useful way for MoWA staff to fully comprehend the implication of a PBA, and what action is needed over the coming years and even decades.

It was decided by the Minister of MoWA that the PBA modality be piloted through two "sub-PBAs". They are Women's Economic Empowerment, using the Millennium Acceleration Framework (MAF) and National Action Plan on Violence against Women (NAP-VAW). The recent experiences two 'sub PBAs' demonstrate the potentials of MoWA and DPs working together to define common development objectives and to coordinate the delivery to achieve them more effectively and efficiently than they do so alone. Progress towards a PBA is also evidenced by the development of the Capacity Development Strategy for PBA which is also intended to form the basis of a core programme for PBA for implementation purposes.

While some progress has been made toward a PBA, there are, as is to be expected, many issues and challenges which are analysed in Part 3. Part 4 for also presents recommendations related to how the project and UNDP can support a PBA over the next five years.

domestic resources and external development assistance. At this time, Gender was identified as one of the key thematic areas to be used for PBA in Cambodia.

⁴ Programme-based approaches (PBAs) are the Government's preferred tool for implementing sector strategies and core reforms. PBAs are regarded as the optimal mechanism to promote national ownership of development programmes, and thus are the official mechanism of aid effectiveness in Cambodia, to ensure coherent programming of resources, strengthen national capacities and systems, and, most important, to deliver development results more efficiently and effectively. In June 2010, the RGC and its development partners endorsed and agreed to move forward with the PBA approach in order to maximize the combined impact of

2.6 The project supported an effective and cost efficient partnership between MoWA and Royal School of Administration to provide annual gender training to civil servants.

MoWA, with the support of the project, has taken action to strengthen the capacity of the civil services in two ways. First, the project took steps to engender the curriculum of the Royal School of Administration (RSA) and as a result each year gender training programmes are delivered to current civil servants. This activity was considered to be important as it was to be measured by the output indicator: "No. of RSA civil servant trainees receiving training on gender equality by MoWA" with a target that 350 students are trained each year. The actual figure was 200 per year – this is dependent on the number of people enrolled in the RSA training program. Gender is now firmly part of the RSA training, and MoWA requires very limited support from the project. This is a positive sign. It should also be noted that this partnership approach has proven to be both effective and cost efficient with the cost to MoWA being only USD1,000 per year. This partnership approach can be used as a good practice model for using existing mechanisms to deliver effective results, which can be applied in other contexts, and with other institutions.

Second, as a measure to enhance the capacity of female civil servants, the project also supported leadership training to women, senior and middle managers in public administration. A 2013 target was that "Leadership and Management Training programme is developed and at least 60 female senior and middle managers from 28 line ministries get trained". This was achieved in the first quarter of 2013 when women from 26 ministries/institutions were trained by VBNK with funding from the project.

The project strategy to support women in decision making is focus on the promotion of women into public decision-making in the civil service. However, it is recommended that UNDP (separate from the PGE project) is well placed to engage with the other relevant actors (political parties, non-government organisations, parliamentarian etc.), and that a more innovative and broad based approach to engage with the women's movement across the board would be desirable. Refer to Part 4 for further information.

Recommendations

- 9. That MoWA assumes full responsibility for its partnership with RSA, and the project phases out its financial support.
- 10. That the partnership approach between RSA and MoWA be considered a good practice model which could be applied in other contexts, and with other institutions.

Output 2: Women's Economic Empowerment

Overall it is the consultant's view that the WEE component was poorly designed from the outset. It is largely focused on micro level activities, including support to a single Women's Development Centre (WDC) in Kampong Speu province. As Table 2 below shows it is the consultants view that progress toward the 2015 targets are 'off track'. For this reason analysis on component two is dealt with in Section 3: Issues and challenges.

There were however several significant and commendable 'unplanned achievements' in the WEE component. They are unplanned because they were not indicated in the programme design and its performance framework, yet they are achievements of the project.

Table 2: Progress made towards Output 2 Indicators

Output 2 Indicators	Baseline	Progress as of 2013	Target 2015	MTR Status
No. of WDCs that are fully functional (2010: 0, 2015: 2)	0 (2010)	1	2	Off track
No. of women trained on market oriented business and technical skills	0	75 (Only 25 women are trained in the WDC each year)	800 ⁵	Off track

2.7 The project contributed to women's economic empowerment policy development and planning through the costed Millennium Acceleration Framework.

A significant 'unplanned achievement' of the project was the development of the *Millennium Acceleration Framework/Action Plan on Women's Economic Empowerment (MAF-WEE)* (2013-2015) which was developed by MoWA with support from UNDP. UNDP Country Office and PGEIII under the leadership of the Minister and with the initiative by the former Policy Advisor delivered Millennium Acceleration Framework (MAF) focusing on WEE as the strategy for the achievements of CMDGs.

The MAF focused on women's economic empowerment as it is envisaged to contribute to the achievement of other Cambodian Millennium Development Goals (CMDGs). The intention of the MAF-Cambodia Action Plan was intended to assist the participating actors to consolidate, focus and intensify CMDG progress by identifying bottlenecks that prevent MDG progress and applying effective solutions to achieve concrete improvements in the areas which are key to achieve CMDG 3.

Significantly the MAF-WEE provide presents clear actions that are costed in a detailed way. A total of \$4,882,978 is needed to fully implement actions in MAF for the 2013-2015 period. It is estimated that \$1,269,000 has already been mobilized, with \$3,613,978 needed.

The project supported the formation of an "expert group" which was formed to promote national ownership of MAF itself and to steer the process of developing the MAF. From all reports the expert group functioned well, and it is recommended that MoWA continues to support the expert group to act as a key policy compact to further shape policy development, planning and monitoring of implementation of the WEE Policy, MAF and a WEE programme.

The MoWA has announced that it will use the MAF the PBA until 2015. A major challenge facing MoWA is how to persuade economic related ministries to take action and allocate the necessary resources to implement the MAF. So far, outreach by MoWA to economic related ministries has been minimal. Unless a more proactive approach is taken, the risk is the MAF will be another action plan that is not implemented. For this reason is recommended that, following the launch of MAF in November, high level meetings should be initiated by MoWA with each of the relevant ministries. The purpose would be to present the MAF and to clearly identify the actions they need to take to implement the MAF, and the resources they will need to attract (or re-allocated) to support implementation.

Overall, it is recommended that the project phased out support to micro level activities at the WDC, and that the component is reformulated to focus on macro level policy development and programming.

⁵ According to the programme document the WDC Kampong Speu was to train 500 women, and an additional 300 trainees by another WDC, were to be identified.

Recommendations

- 11. That an immediate priority is for the project to support MoWA to engage in high level dialogue with each economic related ministry with a view to ensuring they make budget allocation to implement their actions identified in the MAF.
 - Refer also to part 3.5 and 2.6 for further recommendations on WEE.
- 2.8 The project supported a number of high level dialogue and national forums to promote women's entrepreneurship.

The project has supported several high level dialogue and national forums to promote women's entrepreneurship. This was achieved by supporting the establishment of women's business networking and associations for small and medium women-led enterprises. Work was undertaken to engender the Cambodia Government—Private Sector Forum by facilitating for the inclusion of the women entrepreneurs' voice/associations into the Forum. This in an achievement as this forum is a useful platform for improving the business environment and the only formal mechanism in the country for firms or individuals that want to raise business-related issues with the government in an effort to seek solutions. It was reported that women entrepreneurs critical constraints were raised and discussed with relevant line ministries and other stakeholders which is an important step in a long process create more opportunities for women's economic empowerment.

2.9 The project supported MoWA and the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training to develop a guideline on 'Gender Mainstreaming in Technical Vocational Training Programmes' and has worked to develop the capacity of a range of government, non-government and private sector stakeholders to apply the guide.

The project supported MoWA to develop the capacity of MLVT's vocational training centres on gender mainstreaming in skills training services, through the development and publication of a "Guideline on Gender Mainstreaming in Technical Vocational Training Programmes". The guideline was intended to be a useful tool to assist creating gender responsive technical vocational education training provided by line ministries, NGOs, private institutions. Capacity development for line ministries, private sector and NGOs was provided on how to mainstream gender into their technical vocational programmes. It should be noted however, that there was insufficient time for the MTR consultant to explore how MLVT's vocational training centres and other stakeholders actually to apply the guide and the impact of it.

Output 3: Gender Based Violence (GBV)

It is opinion of the MRT consultant that the some aspects of the GBV component were poorly conceived in the project document. A key aspect of the design was focused on implementation of Community Capacity Enhancement (CCE) at the village level this work is neither consistent with the mandate of MoWA nor sustainable or cost effective. This is explored in the analysis in Part 3 "Issues and Challenges". However, some important research, coordination and technical advisory services were provided which have now been assumed by other development partners (especially GIZ) and in the National Action Plan on Violence Against Women (2013-17).

While there is a concern about the relevance of some aspects of the GBV component, if one is to compare what was set out in the programme document and what has been achieved so far, it can be said that progress has been made. As the table 3 shows progress is being made with respect to two of the three targets (data for the second indicator is unavailable).

Table 3: Progress made towards Output 3 Indicators

Output 3: Preventive and remedial responses to GBV scaled up				
Output 3 Indicators	Baseline	Progress as of 2013	Target 2015	MTR Status
Feasibility study report on establishment of One Stop Service Centre	No	Completed	Yes	On track
Proportion of population in 100 target villages who are aware that GBV is wrong and criminal act	TBD	n/a (refer to CPAP Outcome)	100%	Unknown ⁶
No. of village and commune chiefs, CWCC members, CSO representatives receiving TOT on GBV CCE skills and methodology	0	2011-0 2012 -10 2013 - 30	2015: 100	Slightly off track

The achievements of output 3 against pre-determined indicators are:

2.10 The project support for a One-Stop Service Centre for Gender Based Survivors Feasibility Study led to the development of a coordinated response mechanism initiative to respond to cases of GBV.

A One-Stop Service Centre (OSSC) feasibility study was initiated by MoWA with the support of the project and was completed in 2012. This study was conducted in a participatory manner with robust discussion about the merits of an OSSC approach. As part of the feasibility study of OSSC, a 'programme formulation' was developed which further examined ways to support implementation. In 2012 the project facilitated high level discussion within MoWA and through the Technical Working Group on GBV to discuss ways to discuss how MoWA could move forward the implementation of OSSC's recommendations. The project also supported OSSC Study Tour to Bangladesh in 2012 for 14 relevant government officials including 5 Secretaries of State and 3 Under-Secretaries of State from MoWA. The study tour was also supported by UNFPA, GIZ and UNICEF with PGE assuming a lead coordination role.

This work subsequently led to the GIZ funding the programme which is currently being implemented in two provinces with the possibility of further expansion beyond 2013. In 2013, MoWA conducted numerous workshops and consultation meetings on the 2nd NAPVAW (which was endorsed by the TWGG-GBV on May 21, 2013). Those OSSC recommendations are now officially incorporated into the National Action Plan on Violence against Women (2013-17). The project team took a proactive role in ensuring these recommendations were widely understood and incorporated into this important national plan.

2.11 The project supported Community Capacity Enhancement initiative is reported to have had a positive impact of village level understanding of and attitudes towards domestic violence

The GBV component was largely focused on implementation of Community Capacity Enhancement (CCE) at the village level by going through the channel of MoWA's decentralized structures, namely PDWA and DDWA. This was identified as a key result area and an output level indicator was created to measure progress made. A CCE concept note and a manual developed and implemented in one targeted province (Odormeanchey). It was a strategic move to contract Legal Aid Cambodia to conduct the training. The process has now been completed in 10 villages and the PGE team has started to implement the CCE activity in another 20 villages. The CEE is being monitored with a pre-test completed for all 30 villages and a post-test in the 10 villages have been completed. There is now evidence to suggest CCE is making significant impact on people's comprehensive understanding of and attitudes towards domestic violence specifically as a result of trainings among its target populations.

⁶ Plans are underway to measure this indicator through a WHO prevalence study and/or through the next CDHS. PGE is providing technical support to this process.

While this report suggests that implementation of CCE model is not consistent with MoWA policy making mandate, it can be said that the project, through the Department of Legal Protection, has followed the programme document and has carefully planned, implemented and monitored the CCE initiative. It can also be said that the CCE model is recognized to be an important prevention activity, and is noted as such in the Partnership for Prevention's studies including the recent "Why Do Some Men Use VAW and how can we prevent it" study.

Refer to Part 3 for recommendations related to the future direction of the GBV component.

B. Assessment of progress towards UNDAF and CPAP Outcomes

The project was designed to be central to the UNDAF. Apart from being a cross-cutting theme, gender equality was identified as one of the five UNDAF outcomes⁷. Outcome 3: by 2015, women, men, girls and boys are experiencing a reduction in gender disparities and progressively enjoying and exercising equal rights.

2.12 Overall, there is evidence to suggest that progress is being made by the project to achieve UNDAF and CPAP outcomes, outputs and targets. However, the indicators themselves require revision.

The project was designed to contribute to UNDAF Country Programme Outcomes 1, 2, 3 and 5 through improving the enabling environment and enhancing the capacity of the authorities to promote and protect women's human rights. The third UNDAF outcome aims at reducing gender disparities and more equal enjoyment of rights by men and women through i) strengthening existing gender mainstreaming mechanisms, ii) improving women's working conditions, iii) increasing their public participation, iv) addressing gender-based violence, and v) creating a harmonized aid environment that promotes gender equality.

While it was beyond the scope of MTR to conduct an impact assessment, it can be said that the project, in varying degrees, is consistent with the approach detailed under UNDAF outcome 3. The pre-determined outcome indicators for project were derived from the UNDP CPAP. The project is intended to contribute to UNDP CPAP Outcome 6: *By 2015, gender disparities in participation and economic growth reduced*. Five accompanying outcome indicators were identified.

Through an analysis of the results at this mid- way point, it can be said that the project is making progress in achieving the CPAP on the pre-determined indicators (refer Table 4 below). However, some indicators are inadequate measures of the project's impact. More specifically:

• Proportion of GMAGs accessing national budget to implement activities. It was previously reported that in 2013, that to date, 23 GMAGs of line ministries have received the financial support to implement their gender activities or their GMAP either from the government or development partners but challenges remain in terms of capacity and limited budget. Only 10 are reported to receive national budget. It is the view of the MTR that this is a poor measure of gender mainstreaming, since the GMAPs tend not to be linked in to sector/plan and budgets. It is recommended that the indicators be removed and that a more relevant indicator is developed. A more relevant measure was identified under output 1: "No. of sector

21

The five UNDAF Outcomes are i) economic growth and sustainable development, ii) health and education, iii) gender equality, iv) governance and v) social protection

See Outcome 3 of the UNDAF (2011-2015)

plans with gender-specific targets and [national] budget allocation". This should be measured in two ways: budget allocation from National Budget and DP financing.

- *Proportion of PBA to Gender funded.* This indicator is unclear, and needs to be updated in accordance with the direction the MoWA is taking. Refer to part 2.5 for more information.
- Ratio of literate females to males 25-44 years. Literacy rates have improved and MoEYS, strong support
 from DPs, is to be credited for this result. MoEYS is also reported to have the strongest GMAG in the
 RGC. MoEYS is operating well and little support from MoWA/PGE has been provided. Therefore this
 indicator is directly relevant to PGEIII since little support provided to MoEYS. This is a good sign; however
 the project cannot be credited for the progress made in this regard.
- The Proportion of civil service who are female is narrow measure of promoting women in decision making. However, as Table 4 demonstrates, there is a position trend with a growing number of women in the civil service. It can also be said the project has contributed to this result as highlighted in section 2.6 above. The UNDP CPAP review consider how UNDP (through PGE and direct implementation) can provide more strategic, broad based impact to promote women in decision making.
- There was no indicator related to women's economic empowerment despite the fact it was a key output. It is recommended the economic related indicators included in NRIV and the Gender Policy as used.

Table 4: Progress made towards CPAP/PGEIII Outcome Indicators

CPAP Indicators/ PGEIII Outcome indicators	Baseline 2009	2013 estimate	Target 2015	MTR Status
Proportion of GMAGs accessing national budget to implement activities	20%	36% in 2011 36% (or 10 ministries) in 2013	60%	Slightly Off track
Proportion of the PBA on Gender funded	0	0	30%	Needs attention
Proportion of Cambodians aware that violence against women is a wrong and a criminal act	67%	No figures available	100%	Unknown
Ratio of literate females to males 25-44 years	85.9	91.3% (2011) 2013 – not available	100	On track
Proportion of civil servants who are female	34%	35% (2011) 35% (2012) 39% (2013)	40%	On track

Recommendations

- 12. That the MoWA and the PGE project team is credited for achieving, or is on track in achieving, the majority of the pre-determined objectives and output of the project as they are articulated in the project document.
- 13. That the future design of the project capitalises on the strength of the project in macro level policy making, monitoring of government commitments and institutional strengthening.
- 14. That the outcome indicators be revised as the project is reformulated to ensure they are fully relevant measures of outcome.
- 15. That CPAP review process maintains gender an outcome and a cross cutting issue, and provides guidance on how PGE can best feed into UNDAF/CPAP outcomes in the coming years.

Box 1: Summary of Achievements

- The project has achieved, or is on track to achieve, the majority of the pre-determined objectives and outputs of the project as they are articulated in the project document.
- The project has made substantial contributions to development of major pieces of analytical, policy and strategy documents; namely Cambodia Gender Assessment, Neary Rattanak IV and the Ten Year Gender Policy.
- Building on previous phases, the project has progressively supported MoWA to mainstream gender into national policies and plans.
- The project has supported MoWA to mainstream gender into government reform programmes and cross cutting issues, with less support from the project being needed.
- The project has progressively contributed to development the capacity of MoWA and a Capacity Development Strategy was developed to guide future work.
- The project has supported MoWA to progress towards a Programme Based Approach towards Gender Equality and important ground work has been laid.
- The project supported an effective and cost efficient partnership between MoWA and Royal School of Administration to provide annual gender training to civil servants.
- The project contributed to women's economic empowerment policy development and planning through the costed Millennium Acceleration Framework.
- The project supported a number of high level dialogue and national forums to promote women's entrepreneurship.
- The project supported MoWA and the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training to develop a guideline on 'Gender Mainstreaming in Technical Vocational Training programmes' and worked to develop the capacity of a range of government, non-government and private sector stakeholder to apply the guide.
- The project support for a One-Stop Service Centre for Gender Based Survivors Feasibility Study led to the development of a coordinated response mechanism initiative to respond to cases of GBV.
- The project supported Community Capacity Enhancement initiative is reported to have had a positive impact of village level understanding of and attitudes towards domestic violence
- Overall, there is evidence to suggest that progress is being made by the project to achieve UNDAF and CPAP outcomes, outputs and targets. However, the indicators themselves require revision.

Issues and Challenges

The project's achievements accomplished so far, as listed in Part 2, are significant and commendable, but progress has not been free of issues and challenges. The major issues and challenges that currently confront the project, as seen by the MTR consultant, are outlined below. In each case, individual recommendations are proposed. These project recommendations need also to be considered in the context the broader recommendations on the future direction which are presented in Part 4. This section is presented in two parts. Part A analysis the issues and challenge from the perspective of the overall project effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability. Part B reviews the issues and challenges associated with the institutional and programme management arrangements that were established for the project.

A. Overall project effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability

3.1 The project design included too many activities with high transaction costs, and lacked a clear overarching strategy or clear impact as a project.

The project design (as presented in the programme document) included a wide range of complex and disparate activities. While MoWA and the project team has been diligent in following the programme document, in practice this led to the implementation of disparate and micro activities with high transaction costs that lacked a clear overarching strategy or clear impact as a project. In total 31 major activities are identified in the project document. While the project staff were careful to follow the programme document and ensuring all activities were implemented, key deliverables were not sufficiently prioritised, and several major pieces of work were delayed, which had an adverse impact on project's overall effectiveness.

The project's strength in macro policy and planning and institutional gender mainstreaming, has been somewhat undermined in a proliferation of micro activities. Key outputs of the project - CGA and NRIV - which an emblematic analytical and policy pieces of the RCG, were delayed and not sufficiently prioritized in the broad mix of activities. Moreover, the current modality of implementation for key pieces is not efficient. As noted in part 2.1, the process to develop the CGA was delayed, and overly complicated and costly with up to 13 consultants (mainly international) being recruited by numerous DPs. This makes development of CGA an unnecessarily large and costly coordination exercise.

Recommendations

- 16. That the project's scope and approach be redefined, consolidated, and based on a clearly articulated strategy.
- 17. That the number of project supported activities is significantly reduced, and there is a corresponding reduction in outputs and deliverables.
- 3.2 Despite progress being made toward a PBA, the project continues to contribute to a 'project mentality' in MoWA and is contributing to ineffective and inefficient practices.

It was noted in part 2.5, that progress is slowly being made toward a PBA. However, there was also concerned expressed by some, that the process is been confusing and that it was time to move away from discussion of concepts to concrete action. During the consultations held for the mid-term review it was also apparent there is a shared concern between MoWA and DPs current practices of development planning have been ineffective and inefficient if they are examined from a perspective of national ownership, system and

processes. Despite the progress being made toward a PBA, as it stands, the PGEIII project contributes to 'project mentality' within MoWA. And the project, like all others operating in the ministry contributed to efficient planning and management processes, and distorts ministries planning processes. These issues are not new to MoWA and development partners, but they are noted here because these processes have an adverse impact on the effectively and sustainability of the project. More dialogue needed among donors (outside the TWG-G) to process what it means and how far DPs can realistically support us of national systems. It is later recommended in point 3.11 that UNDP needs to build its own capacity to assume this lead role.

The transition to a full PBA in terms of use of national systems will take several years, and it remains to be seen if DP will ever commit to the use of national systems. Clearly major investment is needed in administration, planning, reporting, financial management and audit systems if this is to become a reality. In the interim more thought needs to be given as to how MoWA, UNDP (through the PGE project) and other DPs can progressively support this transition. For example, what steps can be taken now to create pooled funding modalities? Alternatively UN Country Team could consider the design of a UN Joint Programme to support gender equality and women's empowerment which would include UNDP, UN Women, UNFPA and others. This would likely be a mixed implementation modality – NIM and direct implementation.

Recommendations

- 18. That beyond 2015 UNDP gives consideration to the different ways in which the project could be managed and delivered, including the creation of a pooled fund or a UN Joint Programme for Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment.
- 19. That the project continues to provide high level guidance to the MoWA PBA Committee and Secretariat. *Refer also to recommendations under part 3.4.*

3.3 There is a gap between gender policy development and implementation, which is partly due to limited systematic engagement by MoWA with priority sector ministries.

Advances in policy and institutional mechanisms are not necessarily translating into measurable changes in the status, rights and choices of Cambodian women. While a significant achievement of the project was is the development of CGA and NRIV, there is a gap in implementation. This implementation gap was key finding of the MTR of NRIII which concluded that that the five year strategic plan was not being systematically implemented, and that MoWA lacked the capacity to systematically monitor the implementation of NRIV across the government. While this may be well be true, it is also the consultants view (based on experience working for other women's ministries/offices) that this is extremely challenging work, and it is rarely easy to persuade other ministries to allocate budget to implement gender related actions.

Nevertheless, this is a concern given the project has been providing intensive support to the MoWA to undertake gender mainstreaming for over a decade. There appears to be a lack of a clear strategy or consistent approach within MoWA to build the capacity of line ministries, as a result the project, in supporting MoWA, also has lacked a clear strategy. The approach taken by the project is problematic for several reasons.

First, the project is focused on supporting the development of GMAPs, but it is reported that GMAPs are often not linked to NR, or their own sector plans and budgets⁹. Unless GMAPs are being developed as an input to broader to sector/ministries and plans and budgets they have little added value. There is a risk is they become an isolated activity which is neither sustainable nor effective.

A key outcome indicator of the project was: "proportion of GMAGs accessing national budget to implement activities". As explained in point 2.11, while some GMAGs have successfully attracted national budget to implement their GMAPs¹⁰, the question is what is this funding used for? While there was insufficient time to explore this point in any detail, given it is reported that GMAPs tend not to sector/plan their budgets, it would appear that the small amount of the national budget used (e.g. Ministry of Rural Development received approx. USD10,000 for its national budget), is not to be used to support implementation of key gender actions in sector plans, which can further contribute to GMAPs being implemented as an isolated activity within the line ministries. In order words, the project, could potentially risk undermine the very intent of the GMAGs, unless this issue is addressed.

Second, the project provides general support to Department for Gender Equality in its attempts to provide support for GMAGs in 28 ministries. There is not a shared understanding of what the priority ministries are. In interviews with some MoWA staff is was apparent that they think the ministry should support all 28 Ministries, especially those not are not performing well. It is the consultants view that it is unrealistic to expect that MoWA can provide high quality technical advice to all 28 ministries, nor that it have in-house technical expertise in each technical area of the government. Overall, MoWA is struggling in the absence of a cohesive strategy support gender mainstreaming across sectoral ministries. And the project, in supporting MoWA, also lacked a clear strategy and sense of prioritization.

Third, there is little on-going engagement between MoWA technical departments and the priority line departments. It was noted that this was something the previous International Policy Advisors (under phases I and II) supported MoWA staff to do. But for this phase, there is a lack of systemic relationship building with key ministries. The MTR of NRIII further found that 'neither the Department for Gender Equality nor the technical departments are paying insufficient attention to the expected outputs of the gender mainstreaming program at the technical level' (p5). Related to this point, is the overlapping function of the Department for Gender Equality and the technical departments (e.g. Department of Economic Development) creates internal confusion as to which department is responsible for which ministry (refer to point 3.10 for more information).

Fourth, it is the view of the consultant while there is high level gender analysis work in the CGA, and clear actions identified in NRIII, these documents tend to be under-utilized by both MoWA and line ministries. Both these documents clearly present the gender priorities by sector, and matching indicators. There is a concern (albeit an unsubstantiated one) that a failure to use CGA and NRIV can led to Line Ministries reinventing the wheel. Again, unless GMAPs are being developed as an input to broaden the

¹⁰ To date, 23 GMAGs of line ministries have received the financial support to implement their gender activities or their GMAP either from the government or development partners. Only 10 are reported to receive national budget.

⁹ As noted in part 1.4 "Limitations of the MTR" key meetings with Ministries did not take place, and only three meetings took place with line ministries (Ministry for Rural Development, Ministry of Planning and Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training). This meant a thorough analysis of the GMAGs and GMAPs was not possible and the findings and recommendations presented here are based on feedback from other stakeholder, and secondary sources (e.g. the MTR of NRIII).

sector/ministries and plans they have little added value, and there is a risk is they become an isolated activity and counterproductive.

There is great scope for the project to support MoWA to strengthen its engagement with Line Ministries. An immediate opportunity is to ensure that the NRIV is developed in a participatory way with full involvement with line ministries. There is also scope for MoWA to 'sell' the strategy after it is developed, through a systematic engagement strategy with priority ministries. As an aside, it was also observed that the CGA and NRIV are presented in "MoWA documents" (and not RGC documents) which could contribute to a perception that they pertain to MoWA only.

A major challenge and opportunity for MoWA is to persuade, often more powerful ministries, to integrate gender perspectives into their respective plans and programmes in line with NR, and to mobilize resources to implement the planned activities. This is a challenging proposition for any national women's machinery around the world. As it stands, the projects have focused too much on broad support to GMAGs to develop GMAPs, and too little focus on on-going and systematic engagement with priority ministries.

A major question for the project is how it can most effectively support MoWA in this regard. One option could be for example, that the project only supports economic related ministries in order to support implementation of the MAF/WEE Programme (refer point 3.4 below). And/or the project could support ministries with mandates for cross government planning and financial management i.e. Ministry of Planning, Ministry of Economy and Finance, the Ministry of Interior and CDC. Working with these 'vertical ministries' effectively means all line ministries are effectively covered. This will need to be careful consideration during the project reformulation process. Refer also to Part 4: Major Recommendations and Future Direction.

Recommendations

- 20. That the project supports a review of the GMAGs as part of the proposed institutional review exercise (refer point 3.4 for more information).
- 21. That the project identifies strategic ways to support gender mainstreaming, including only providing high level support to ministries with a national and sub national planning and budgeting oversight function i.e. Ministry of Planning, Ministry of Economy and Finance and Ministry of Interior.
- 22. That the project considers supporting economic related ministries only, ensuring implementation of MAF and WEE Programme (also refer recommendations under section 3.6).
- 23. That an immediate priority is to ensure the NRIV formulation process includes opportunities for more robust dialogue between MoWA and the relevant ministries.
- 3.4 The project approach to capacity development of MoWA is limited to selected individuals, is affected by delays in civil service reform, and there has been little attention given to systematic organisational development.

The programme document places a strong emphasis on the developing the capacity of MoWA to plan, implement and advocate for gender equality. As noted in point 2.4, the Capacity Development Strategy was intended to be developed in 2011, as a means to 'underpin the implementation of NR III through further examination of skills and needs for a more precise strategic direction of the Ministry's roles'. However the Capacity Development Strategy was not completed until May 2013 which meant there was no clear strategy to guide the capacity development efforts of the project. Moreover, the Capacity Development Strategy is broad in its focus in covering the whole national machinery, and does not provide precise recommendations for the development of the skills, roles and functions of MoWA, as was anticipated in the programme document and the MoWA staff.

While some progress has been made to build the capacity of the MoWA (as presented in part 2.4), the absence of a well-defined strategy has meant efforts have been ad hoc and limited in scope. Efforts are focused on individual capacity development of few MoWA staff. The PGEIII project, like other projects operating from within MoWA, are assigned 'counterpart staff' (10 MoWA staff were assigned to the project) but they are often counterpart staff for other projects. This arrangement has meant the project capacity development reach is limited to a few, often overburden, MoWA staff.

Delays in civil service reform have a profoundly negative impact on MoWA, and on the effectiveness of the project. MoWA, like other ministries, face tremendous challenges in recruiting, training, retaining suitably qualified staff. Low levels of civil service remuneration have an adverse impact on the effectiveness of MoWA, and subsequently the project. According to the MoWA Capacity Development Strategy for a PBA towards Gender Equality, high staff turn-over, absenteeism and low morale have contributed to the reduction of efficiency and effectiveness not just of MoWA, but the entire civil service. The Capacity Development Strategy also notes that the lack of recognition of good performance in the absence of official framework that regulates the civil service competency, career progression and performance-incentive systems are also absent.

The Priority Operating Costs¹¹ payment was eligible for the project's counterpart staff when it began in 2011 but this arrangement ended on 30 June 2012 when POC payments ceased. Now, project staff receive no form of incentive. Daily subsidence rates of the government are also considered inadequate, and a disincentive for staff to travel to the provinces. Meanwhile it is reported that the civil service reform programme of the government has stalled. While this area is well beyond the scope of the project, it is a fundamental issue that impacts on MoWA, which is why it is presented here. From a project management perspective, it means there is simply not enough suitably qualified, full time and dedicated MoWA staff for the project, which makes any capacity development strategy extremely difficult and potentially ineffective.

Finally, little attention has been paid to organizational strengthening, including addressing overlapping functions of the Department for Gender Equality and technical departments which have been an issued (refer to point 3.10 for more information). The limitations of the capacity development efforts can be partly attributed to the absence of the international Policy Advisor for large period of time and with UNDP contracted staff tending to undertake the work of MoWA, rather than systematically efforts to build their capacity (refer part 3.11 for more information).

Moving forward, a major challenge ahead will be the development of a *Core Programme for Capacity Development for a PBA*. This is of the utmost importance since it will be the foundation of the whole NRIV, and will underpin management and implementation of all the strategic areas identified in the strategic plan. It is further recommended that, consistent with the draft NRIV, that the project supports an organisational development institutional review exercise. For more information, also refer to Part 4.

Recommendations

24. That the project broadens its focus from individual level capacity development of selected MoWA staff to include high level institutional development of the national machinery.

25. That the strategy for capacity development presented in NRIV becomes the basis for the projects' strategy for the coming years.

¹¹ On 12 July 2010 the government introduced a new salary incentive mechanism, Priority Operating Costs (POC). UNDP viewed POC as a positive step in harmonizing and aligning incentive payments to one mechanism and one grid. The POC payments ceased on 30 June 2012.

- 26. That the project supports a full organizational development and institutional strengthening exercise which will provide possible re-restructuring, recommendations across the national machinery, and clarity about roles and responsibilities for each MoWA department.
- 27. That the project progressively supports the development of a Core Programme for Capacity Programme for the national machinery for the advancement of women, which is fully costed for inclusion in NRV (2019-2024).

3.5 The project's women's economic empowerment component was narrowly defined and focused on micro level activities that are not consistent with the mandate of MoWA.

As previously noted, some of the activities designed under this component relate to 'service provision' which would not normally occur within the mandate of a women's ministry. From the outset the rationale for the choice of activities under the WEE component, are neither consistent with MoWA's strategic policy oversight function, nor the comparative advantage of UNDP. The design presents a narrowly defined approach to WEE, and no action at the macro policy development was anticipated.

A central part of the project design was to support Women's Development Centre (WDC) in Kampong Speu to a 'sustainable institutional model'. Building on the work which began in 2007 (under PGEII), the project planned to support the implementation of selected components of its business plan¹². However, after seven years of project support, the availability of skills training at the WDC remains very limited, and still reflects traditional gender roles (e.g. sewing and weaving). The training is still supply-driven rather than market-led. The project aim to 'create a sustainable institutional model that would enable WDCs to deliver demanddriven and client-centred services' has not been achieved. There is no indication to suggest that the WDC in Kampong Speu is on track to become a sustainable institutional model. Interviews with development partners also indicated there is a shared concern about the effectiveness and efficiency of WDC, and the relevance of MoWA directly managing the WDCs. It is for these reasons, it is recommended that the project ends its support to the WDC in Kampong Speu. The budget for training activities comes from MoWA budget (not the project) which means the existing training activities will continue and not be affected by the cessation of PGE support.

There is no question that the provision market orientated training for women is critical, and is a central part of any countries women's economic empowerment strategy. What is at issue is how the Cambodian government, and the private sector, can most effectively deliver relevant, market-led training for women, especially in remote areas. To this end, it is recommended that the project considers supporting MoWA to identify alternatives ways to support the provision of market orientated training to Cambodian women. This could include establishing WDCs independent institutions or transferring management to MLVT.

Recommendations

28. That the WEE component, in its current form be phased out by end of 2013. This means the project would no longer provide direct financial and technical support to the WDC in Kampong Speu.

29. That MoWA/PGE considers exploring alternative options for the future management of the WDCs; ensuring consistency with MoWA's policy making mandate (e.g. establishing WDCs independent institutions, the feasibility of Public-Private Partnerships or transferring management to MLVT).

¹² The WDC Kampong Speu Business plan identified the 1) provision of market-oriented technical training skills, 2) training for micro, small and medium enterprise management and 3) providing gender advocacy and life skills courses. These three 'core education streams were intended to be integrated, complementary and mutually reinforcing, and provide a holistic education experience that will enable trainees to fully develop their entrepreneurial talents'.

3.6 The process to develop the PBA on Women's Economic Empowerment has been unclear, and Development Partner coordination has been limited.

It was noted in part 2.8 that a significant 'unplanned achievement' of the project was the development of the *Millennium Acceleration Framework/Action Plan on Women's Economic Empowerment (MAF-WEE)* (2013-2015). There have, however, been some issues in the way in which the MAF was developed. It remains to be seen if the MEF will be a help or a hindrance to the evolving PBA process.

MoWA (with the support of UN Women) is in the process of developing a *Ten Year Women's Economic Empowerment Policy*. A usual scenario would be that a policy is developed first, and then WEE programme (preferably 5-10 years) would be developed to support implementation of the policy. The programme would be based on a clear analysis of the realities in Cambodia and a clear theory of change. Instead, the MAF Action Plan was completed before the WEE policy has been completed. While MAF is useful as it provides clear action plan and costing for 2013-2015 period, it is not based on sound analysis nor embedded in a policy framework, and it lacks a clear theory of change.

MoWA has announced that the WEE Policy will become the overarching policy document of the government, and the MAF-WEE will be the basis of the PBA for 2013-2015. This raises fundamental questions about the long term plan for PBA on WEE given the MAF will expire at the end of 2015. The following questions will need to be addressed as part of the reformulation process is:

- o How will a WEE Programme be developed? What will be its timeframe (5 or 10 years)?
- o How will it relate to the MAF (2013-2015)?
- Would it be preferable to follow the NSDD model and develop a 10 year WEE programme, with three year implementation plans?
- O How will costing the WEE programme be undertaken? How can it build upon the costing work undertaken in MAF?
- o How will Development Partners (UNDP, UN Women and JICA, and others) ensure coordinate they work to support the development and implementation of the WEE Policy and Programme?
- o Will a pooled funding arrangement be established to support implementation of the WEE Programme? How will this be done?
- o Will UNDP assume its position as co-chair of TWG-G WEE sub-group? Or would it be preferable for this role to be assumed by another DP (e.g. ADB, World Bank or UN Women)?
- o How will the WEE Policy relate to the 10 Year Gender Policy? Would it be strategic if they are combined?

Answers to these questions are important given WEE has been selected a pilot for a full PBA approach. The answers are also important since it could be potentially confusing to line ministries about how the WEE Policy, MAF and WEE Programme relate to each other. This can be addressed by clear positioning of the three documents and clear communication to ministries, private sector, relevant NGOs and development partners.

It will also be critical that UN agency (especially between UNDP and UN Women) and DP coordination more broadly, is improved. At present coordination in this thematic area is poor. To date, only one TWG-G sub group has been called for by MoWA for the purpose of establishing it. The sub group is to be co-chaired by UNDP and JICA. Several stakeholders were concerned that UNDP has yet to take a lead role in DP coordination toward a PBA on WEE. Also as previously noted, UNDP needs to make a determination as to whether it assumes the co-facilitator role of both the main TWG-G as well as the sub technical working group on WEE. One scenario could be UNDP remains as co-chair of the TWG-G but hands over role as co-facilitator, and only supports MoWA through the PGE in the policy making project. Regardless of whether UNDP decides to pursue one or both positions, it needs to develop its internal capacity to deliver, in this time consuming and complex coordination process.

Overall, it is major recommendation of this MTR that project continues to support gender mainstreaming at macro level policy and programming development, but some major questions need to be addressed before success is assured. Refer also to Part 4: Major Recommendations and Future Direction for more information.

Recommendations

- 30. That project's approach to women's economic empowerment be re-oriented towards broader dimensions of gender and economic policy making and gender mainstreaming- research, policy development, coordination and capacity development.
- 31. That an immediate priority is given for the project to support MoWA to engage in high level dialogue with each economic related ministry with a view to ensuring they make budget allocation to implement actions identified in the MAF.
- 32. That the project, in coordination with UN Women, JICA and other DPs, considers supporting the development of a WEE Programme which would be the basis of the PBA from 2016 onwards (when the MAF expires).
- 33. That the project provides high level support to MoWA to assume a leadership and coordination role, including through the TWGG-WEE sub group, and continuation of the WEE Expert Group.
- 34. That the project considers that support be given to MoWA and MEF to implement the UNDP high level tailor made capacity development programme for gender in economic policy: the Global Gender and Economic Policy and Management Initiative.
- 35. That UNDP (not PGE) makes a determination as to whether it will assume the role of co-facilitator of the TWG-G WEE Sub Group. And if UNDP assume this role, it invest in own internal capacity. Alternatively, UNDP should consider handing over the co-facilitator role to another Development Partner.
- 36. That an informal meeting of DPs is held prior to the TWG-G sub group of WEE meetings, to promote coordination among development priors prior to the formal meetings.
- 3.7 The project strategy for the Community Capacity Enhancement model is focused on village level awareness raising which is not consistent with MoWA's policy mandate, and operates in parallel to the governments sub national system.

As noted in Part 2, the strategy for GBV was poorly conceived in the programme document. In practice, this had led to the project to support MoWA to directly implement a village level awareness raising activity which is not normally the remit of a national women's ministry. While the Community Capacity Enhancement (CCE) initiative is reported to have raised the level of awareness about domestic violence at the village level; this has meant MoWA Legal Protection Staff are supporting village level activities, when the department primary function should be supporting policy and legislative processes with respect to GBV.

It is therefore recommended that CCE initiative is removed from the scope of the project, and that the CCE initiative is phased out by the end of 2013 (or when the 20 villages are completed and the results documented through consistent post testing for all villages). This is consistent with the draft NRIV which promotes a progressive reduction of MoWA's involvement in implementation of smaller service-delivery and awareness-creation projects at the community level.

UNDP's comparative advantage would normally be to support the government in macro policy and legislative development. However, the development of NAPVAW is well now advanced, and well supported by UN Women and GiZ (with the support of AusAID). The TWG-G Sub Group on VAW is co-facilitated by UN Women and GiZ and from all reports this sub group is functioning well. Moreover, UN Women would be the lead UN agency supporting GBV efforts. Given these conditions, it is recommended that GBV is no longer a priority and key result area of the project.

However, it is recommended that the UNDP Country Office can play a key role in addressing GBV in country programme, and this should be considered as part of the CPAP review process. Moreover, the UNDP Country office (not PGE) should be an active participant and voice in government and non-government forums (including the Technical Working Group on GBV), and contribute to efforts to support action on Cambodia's alarmingly high levels of GBV.

Recommendations

- 37. That the GBV component is phased out, and that the financial and technical support to Community Capacity Enhancement initiative ends after the remaining 20 villages are completed and a report is prepared.
- 38. That UNDP Country Office, separate from the project, identifies high level ways to promote women's personal and physical safety in its country programme and actively participates in government and non-government GBV forums. And that additional measures be considered in the context of the CPAP review which is currently underway.

B. Institutional and Programme Management Arrangements

3.8 The project is managed through the Department for Gender Equality, yet the projects scope of work cuts across the whole Ministry of Women's Affairs.

Gender mainstreaming is core function of MoWA but it has a discrete Department for Gender Equality (which has its own Office for Policy), and this department is considered to be responsible for gender mainstreaming. And yet, the Department of Gender Equality is only one of 11 'vertical' departments of MoWA, and all technical departments should technically have a responsibility for gender mainstreaming.

This organizational issue has a flow on effect to the project's management arrangements. The Director of the Department Gender Equality is the 'Programme Manager' of the PGEIII, which means this position is responsible for managing aspects of the project (i.e. outputs 2 and 3) which are the responsibility of other Secretary of States and other technical departments. In other words, the Programme Manager is based with one department, with responsibility for project work in other departments for which she technically has no authority. Similarly, the "Project Director" of PGEIII, is one of 8 Secretaries of State and she is effectively responsible for managing project related work which is the responsibility of other Secretaries of State.

This impacts of the effectiveness of the project, for example the Department for Economic Development, appears to be unclear of their gender mainstreaming function and viewed 'gender mainstreaming' as the responsibility of the Department of Gender Equality. As a result, they do not have a consistent engagement with line ministries (e.g. around implementation of the MAF), rather it focuses on managing donor financed projects. This is a major issue which is one of the reasons why an institutional and functional review of MoWA is needed.

Overall, the current institutional arrangements have flaws and need to be re-considered as part of the project reformulation process¹³.

¹³ It is noteworthy that UNFPA also supports implementation of a project across departments, reported not to have this issue as the 'project director' position is held by an advisor of the Minister, and not at the Secretary of State level.

Recommendations

39. That the MoWA institutional management arrangements be reconsidered as part of the project reformulation process in terms of implementation modality and staffing schedule.

3.9 PGE/UNDP contracted staff tend to perform core duties of MoWA staff which can result in limited capacity development and leadership by MoWA staff.

The project has a large number of 'project staff' which was deemed necessary due to the complexity of the activities. UNDP contracted staff (based in MoWA), have been a feature of the project design since it began. At the time of writing 6 of the 8 positions are currently filled¹⁴. There are several issues with the current arrangements which include:

- UNDP contracted staff and consultants, while valued by MoWA, have a tendency to lead and
 implement work which should be led by staff of MoWA. This creates a situation where UNDP
 contracted staff are managing key activities, like the CGA and NRV, which should be led by MoWA.
- As noted in part 2.1 and 2.2, MoWA staff now have capacity to key aspects of the work themselves.
- The UNDP "Programme Management Specialist" is reported to have an overlapping function with the MoWA Programme Manager, which can create unnecessary tension and unclear lines of reporting.
- The Economic Empowerment Specialist and Gender-Based Violence Specialist, are physically located in PGE project office, and not within the departments they are supposed to support (these departments are in a different building), and they do not report to the respective heads of departments. Again, this has created confusion in lines of reporting.
- The UNDP contracted staff have dual lines of reporting to MoWA and the UNDP Country Office which can create confusion.

Recommendations

40. That the UNDP project staffing arrangements are reconsidered as part of the project reformulation process.

41. That the number of UNDP contracted staff based in MoWA is gradually reduced. And that prior to the UNDP Programme Management Specialist position being filled, the position description is reviewed to ensure there is no overlap with the MoWA Programme Manager position.

42. That project funding be made available for expert national and international consultants to provide inputs at peak periods, and that these consultants are managed by MoWA.

3.10 Project implementation has suffered due to the lack of strong technical oversight from a full time Policy Advisor based at MoWA.

The project also has a provision for a resident international Gender and Policy Advisor (as was the case for previous PGE phases). This position is intended to provide high-quality policy advisory and institutional development support to MoWA, and strategic direction and technical support to the implementation of programme activities, in the context of the aid effectiveness/PBA.

However, there have been long periods where there has not been a Policy Advisor. A Policy Advisor was hired in late 2011 until September 2012, but the focus of her work was limited to the development of MAF.

¹⁴ At the time of writing the project team consists of an acting Programme Management Specialist/ Policy and Aid Effectiveness Specialist, a Gender Mainstreaming and Budgeting Specialist, an Economic Empowerment Specialist and a Gender-Based Violence Specialist which is currently held by UNV. There are also a Technical Assistant, Administrative Assistant, and Driver.

It was reported that she did not provide strategic policy advice to the project. After her resignation in September 2012, UNDP then assigned an "Interim Policy Advisor" who assumed the post in December 2013 at which time progress on key project activities (like CGA, CDS and NRIV) did improve.

Overall, the project implementation has suffered due to the lack of strong technical oversight from a Policy Advisor. This has contributed to delays in the most important aspects of the project (namely CGA, NRIV and the Capacity Development Strategy) and high level support to MoWA to support implementation across the government. At the time of writing the recruitment of a permanent Policy Advisor appears to have been stalled despite the fact MoWA and UNDP recognised that the recruitment should proceed as a matter of priority.

Recommendation

43. That the Policy Advisor should be recruited without further delay, and that the advisor is based full time in MoWA providing a high level planning and policy oversight function.

3.11 Project implementation has been hampered by a high turnover of staff at UNDP Country Office.

Under the programme management arrangements, the UNDP Country Office is tasked with undertaking a 'programme assurance' role and supports the Programme Board by carrying out objective and 'independent programme oversight and monitoring functions'. Within UNDP, Governance Cluster holds this quality assurance role. There has been a high turnover of staff at the UNDP Country Office which is reported to have an adverse impact on the project. Moreover, the Governance Cluster currently lacks staff with technical expertise in policy development and gender mainstreaming which is needed to provide high level programme oversight. Under the current arrangement, UNDP is also responsible for hiring UNDP contracted staff and consultants. There have prolonged the recruitment of key project personnel and consultants, which has also had an adverse impact on the delivery of the project.

Recommendations

44. That the staffing needs of UNDP are investigated during the project reformulation process to ensure it has sufficient capacity to perform its function.

Box 2: Summary of Issues and Challenges

Overall project sustainability, efficiency and effectiveness

- The project design included too many activities with high transaction costs, and lacked a clear overarching strategy or clear impact as a project.
- Despite progress being made toward a PBA, the project continues to contribute to a 'project mentality' in MoWA and is contributing to ineffective and inefficient practices.
- There is a gap between gender policy development and implementation, which is partly due to limited systematic engagement by MoWA with priority sector ministries.
- The project approach to capacity development of MoWA is limited to selected individuals, is affected by delays in civil service reform, and there has been little attention given to systematic organisational development.
- The project's women's economic empowerment component was narrowly defined and focused on micro level activities that are not consistent with the mandate of MoWA.
- The process to develop the PBA on Women's Economic Empowerment has been unclear, and Development Partner coordination has been limited.
- The project strategy for the Community Capacity Enhancement model is focused on village level awareness raising which is not consistent with MoWA's policy mandate, and operates in parallel to the governments sub national system.

Institutional and programme management arrangements

- The project is managed through the Department for Gender Equality, yet the projects scope of work cuts across the whole Ministry of Women's Affairs.
- PGE/UNDP contracted staff tend to perform core duties of MoWA staff which can result in limited capacity development and leadership by MoWA staff.
- Project implementation has suffered due to the lack of strong technical oversight from a full time Policy Advisor based at MoWA.
- Project implementation has been hampered by a high turnover of staff at UNDP Country Office.

Major Recommendations and Future Directions

A series of recommendations have been proposed to capitalize on the strengths of the project, and as a response to the confronting issues and challenges. As the MTR progressed, the consultant reached the conclusion that the project, in order to be relevant and effective in the coming years, requires a substantial reformulation. This section presents the major recommendations and proposed future direction of the project which should be considered before a determination is made about the 44 recommendations that are presented throughout the report. These recommendations are based on the assumption that the project be extended for five years (i.e. beyond 2015).

The environment in which the project operates has changed rapidly in the past few years, and as the environment changes, so must the objectives of the project. Cambodia is currently undergoing rapid transformation from a low income to a lower middle income country. The government has declared its intention to be self-reliant by the Year 2020 which implies that MoWA, and other ministries, will increasingly need to rely on national budget. The project can support the increasing self-sufficiency of MoWA in the coming years. And it is in this context, two key recommendations of the MTR are:

First, it is recommended that the **scope of the project is narrowed and the number of outputs and activities be significantly reduced.** Many recommendations that have been proposed throughout this report call for the phasing out or scaling back of many activities, and that two of the three components no longer exist (with output 2 refocused toward policy making and gender mainstreaming, in line with output 1). In fact, only approximately 10 of the 31 'major activities' included in the current programme document could now be deemed relevant.

In some cases, this is justified because MoWA has demonstrated the capacity to lead the work with less, or no support from the project, e.g. collaboration with MoP on NSDP development, TWG-G Secretariat functions, collaboration with MoI on D&D, and the RSA led gender training of civil servants. This is a sign of the project's success and it would be desirable for MoWA to assume a leadership role, without being dependent on the project, and that over time funding for these processes come from the National Budget (and not from the PGE project).

In other cases, it has been recommended that activities could be phased out because they are no longer relevant or effective such as support to WDC Kampong Speu and CCE initiative. While some activities are now completed including the OSSC study and GRB initiative.

Implicit in this reduction in scope and the number of activities it supports, is that the **project ceases to support any form of direct service provision by MoWA**, and thereby supports its transition away from direct implementation towards policy making and gender mainstreaming. This is consistent with the broad direction proposed in the current draft of NRIV.

The second major recommendation is that the project focuses only on the macro dimensions of gender policy development and mainstreaming through research, policy development, coordination and capacity

development. Indeed, the entire thrust of the project should be to support MoWA to reach out across government and focus on upstream policy analysis and formulation (rather than project implementation and service delivery). This is consistent with NRIV which places emphasis on the need for MoWA's promoting social accountability for women and the provision of high level strategic policy advisory services, through a programme based approach.

In this context the **three priority areas** have been identified for the possible inclusion in a reformulated project.

Priority Area 1: Long term and high level gender policy, planning and programme development: post NRIV (2019-2029)

A major strength of PGEIII has been its support to the development of key analytical, planning and policy work, namely the *Cambodia Gender Assessments, Gender Mainstreaming Strategies (Neary Rattanak)* and the *Ten Year Policy for Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment*. All of these are major pieces of work in their own right and they are of the utmost importance since they constitute the foundation for all gender equality and gender mainstreaming work in the country.

Over the coming years the project can build upon this work, and take it a step further through long term government-wide planning. Beyond NRIV, more consideration can be given different options for the development of the government's gender policy framework, coordinated programmes, and budgets. It is proposed, for example, that NRV could take the form of a 10 year Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment programme (2019-2029), to support the implementation of the overarching gender policy. Similar to the National Programme for the SNDD, the programme could then be comprehensively costed through implementation plans developed in three phases (3+3+4 years).

Regardless of whether or not MoWA decides to pursue another 5 year strategy plan (NRV 2018-2024) or a 10 year programme, a significant investment of technical and financial resources should be allocated by the project to allow for a comprehensive, participatory development and costing processes¹⁵. A lesson learnt from PGEIII experience so far that more time and consultation is needed to ensure full buy-in and understanding of NR across the government. Costing is a highly complex and time consuming process, and ample time must be allowed if it is to be carried effectively. A minimum of two years should be allowed for this which would mean the process should begin as early at 2016.

Priority Area 2: Gender and Economic Policy Making

A key entry point for the project would be to provide high level support to MoWA to act as a catalyst and provider of technical advice on gender mainstreaming in the economic sector. The project approach should be re-oriented away from service delivery at the WDC, towards broader dimensions of gender and economic policy making and gender mainstreaming, research, policy development, coordination and capacity development.

The goal of this work, as articulated in NRIV, will be to ensure Cambodian women have improved levels of formal employment, increased incomes, livelihoods and social protection, and enjoy equal economic and social rights and opportunities to improve their status and contribution to development. The draft NRIV

¹⁵ Recommendations have also been made with regards to the costing of NRIV, and that it was the consultants' view that it was overly ambitious for NRIV to be fully costed, especially given the process is due to end in a few months' time.

provides clear basis for this work, and should be basis for the reformulation of the project. In this context suggested high level interventions could be:

- Support the development of a Women's Empowerment Programme to support implementation of the WEE Policy.
- Support for a comprehensive and participative costing exercise of the WEE programme for inclusion in NRV.
- Support for MoWA to undertake intensive engagement and partnership building with economic related line ministries (including MIME, MoLVT, MAFF, MoC, MoTourism, MoTrade) the Private Sector and Chambers of Commerce, and other civil society organizations.
- Development of the WEE programme in a way that ensures it can be used for the basis for PBA, including the defining of mutually agreed principles, actions and targets among stakeholders.
- Support a monitoring system to measure progress made in implementing the WEE programme, including national budget and DP allocation to implement the WEE programme.

The development of the WEE programme would be a major undertaking and it would be important to take the time to ensure it is comprehensive, feasible, practical and can be funded, rather than have rushed, partial and uncoordinated attempts that may be destined to fail. Moreover, heightened coordination is needed among relevant Development Partners, beginning with UNDP and UN Women which are both mandated to work in this domain.

This proposed priority area is consistent with UNDP's mandate, as reflected in the 'zero draft' of the new UNDP Global Gender strategy which states that: 'UNDP will work with national partners who are responsible for economic policy making, including ministries of finance, planning, rural and urban development and parliaments to contribute to policy reforms that recognize the barriers, often invisible and undifferentiated, to women's empowerment' (p.4).

Priority Area 3: A Core Programme for Capacity Development for a PBA

A key message of this report has been that the project should re-orient itself away from individual capacity development of counterpart staff with MoWA, towards systemic institutional strengthening of the national machinery, with MoWA as the driving force to implement across all relevant parts of the machinery and network. It will be important to ensure the entire national machinery for gender equality is organized in such a way that it can deliver good policy and legislative work, and persuade other ministries to allocate resources to implement them.

To this end, a potentially strategic and high impact project intervention could be the support a full organisational development and institutional review exercise of the whole national machinery (as recommended in the current draft of NRIV). The purpose of the exercise would be to examine the structure and current capacity of the national machinery and related institutions¹⁶, and provide recommendations for improvement. The results can inform any future re-structuring and/or re-configuration of MoWA, and of the national machinery's organizational structure and division of labour.

Concurrently, the project could progressively support the development of a *Core Programme for Capacity Development for PBA to Gender Equality*. This core programme is key, as it the foundation of the whole delivery of NR. It would underpin the management and implementation of all the strategic areas identified in

¹⁶ E.g. the TWG-G and GMAGs and linkages to other key entities (e.g., other TWGs, MEF, MoP, CDC)

the strategic plan. The draft NRIV provides a clear strategy for the progressive development of the PBA for the Capacity Development Programme. Given the centrality and complexity of this, sufficient time should be allowed to do this thoroughly¹⁷, with full buy-in from line ministries to identify key actions and costings.

The goal of this work (in accordance with the current draft of NRIV) would be: to develop the capacity of the national machinery for gender equality, ensure government ownership and leadership, effective coordination with all key stakeholders, reduced transactions costs in the areas development management for gender equality, and ensure that the policy for gender equality is implemented in a holistic and sustainable way with the efficient use of long term technical, human and financial resource support.

Each of the three priority areas would be major undertaking, and a determination will need to be made as to whether the project supports one, two or all three of them. It is reasonable to assume that if implemented, these major recommendations will help the process to reformulate the project. It is recommended that the Project Board makes a determination of about the broad orientation of the project, and these three priority areas, before the 41 project-based recommendations are considered.

Finally, the recommendations throughout this report have been made specifically for consideration by the **UNDP Country Office**¹⁸. They can be summarises as followed:

- The PGE project should be considered to be one aspect of UNDPs approach to gender equality and women's empowerment in Cambodia.
- More attention be given to how gender issues can be addressed in UNDP Country Programme Action Plan (which focuses on poverty, governance, energy, environment and climate change).
- UNDP is well placed to promote women in decision making through engagement with the relevant actors - political parties, non-government organisations, parliamentarians. The UNDP Country Office, beyond PGE (and in partnership with UN Women) could consider developing a more innovative and broad based approach to promoting women into decision making positions, and engage with the women's movement across the board.
- The UNDP Country Office, separately from PGEIII project, should identify high level ways to promote for women's personal and physical safety in its country programme, and to advocate for more action to be taken on the alarming high levels of GBV in Cambodia.
- UNDP has a unique role as co-chair of the TWG-G to support coordination among DPs towards a full PBA on Gender Equality, and it needs to ensure it has the capacity to effectively act in this role.
- Within UN system alone, UNDP can play a proactive role in coordinating with UN Women, UNFPA (and others) and consider reformulating PGEIII as UN Joint Programme.

The review of Country Programme Action Plan (2009-2015) is an ideal opportunity for UNDP Country Office to consider how the PGEIII project, and UNDP more broadly, can make strategic intervention to advance the gender equality agenda in Cambodia in pursuit of the CMDGs.

¹⁸ Providing recommendations to UNDP was beyond the scope of the MTR for the PGE project. However, these issues did come up during consultations and so are included here. It is hoped they can stimulate discussion within UNDP, especially as it undertakes its CPAP review process.

¹⁷ It is view of the MTR consultant that the capacity development programme cannot be realistically costed for NRIV (as was the view of some MoWA staff). Rather progressive steps should be made over the coming years to comprehensively develop and cost the Capacity Development Programme for inclusion in NRV (2019-2024).

Annex 1: Terms of Reference

1) Position Information

Post Title:	Consultant to conduct Mid-Term Review (MTR) of a project titled
	Partnership for Gender Equity Phase III (2011-2015)
Practice Area:	Gender Equality and Democratic Governance
Post Level:	International Consultant
Duration of the	25 working days (5 working days for Home-Based)
Assignment:	
Duty Station:	Phnom Penh, Cambodia (Ministry of Women's Affairs)
Expected Places of Travel	With possible travel to at least one province
Cluster/Project:	Democratic Governance Unit/ Partnership for Gender Equity Phase III
	(PGE III)
Supervisor:	Team Leader of Governance Cluster

2) Project Description

UNDP is the UN's global development network, an organisation advocating for change and connecting countries to knowledge, experience and resources to help people build a better life. UNDP Country Programme Action Plan (2011-2015) focuses on poverty, governance, energy, environment and climate change and particularly gender which is a cross cutting issue of all programme interventions. In support to current UNDAF, gender is one of the six strategic outcomes aimed to ensure that gender sensitive policies and plans for CMDG acceleration are actually implemented and make great impacts on the status, rights and choices of Cambodian women and girls.

In Cambodia, UNDP has been in long support to the Ministry of Women's Affairs (MoWA) since 2000 through a number of its initiatives, named "Partnership for Gender Equity Programmes Phase I, II and III". The Partnership for Gender Equity Phase III (PGE III) 2011-2015) is the third phase of UNDP-SIDA co-financed programme providing continuous technical assistance to the MoWA in its endeavour to promote greater gender equality and impacts in Cambodia. Through PGE III, our support mainly focuses on the MoWA's organizational capacity to effectively fulfil its mandate of coordinating and monitoring gender mainstreaming into national policies, strategies, plans and programmes including Cambodian Millennium Development Goals, Rectangular Strategy National Strategic Development Plan and more recently engaging in the Government's on-going reform programmes (Public Finance Management-Reform Programme, Deconcentration & Decentralisation and Public Administration Reform).

It is obvious that PGE III is central to the UNDAF Outcome 3: by 2015, women, men, girls and boys are experiencing a reduction in gender disparities and progressively enjoying and exercising equal rights. It also aims to contribute to UNDAF Country Programme Outcomes 1, 2, 3 and 5 through improving the enabling environment and enhancing the capacity of the authorities to promote and protect women's human rights. The entire Programme contributes to UNDP CPAP Outcome 6: By 2015, gender disparities in participation and economic growth reduced. PGE III focuses on three outputs that are mutually reinforcing:

Output 1: Gender-responsive policies, plans and budgets of key sectors developed and their implementation monitored.

Output 2: Increased access to gender-sensitive business development services for women small-business entrepreneurs

Output 3: Preventive and remedial responses to Gender-Based Violence scaled up

To this date, MoWA/PGE III has made significant progress such as:

- MTR of the Five Years Gender Mainstreaming Strategic Plan 2009-2013, named Neary Rattanak Phase III
 NR III including costing and resources mapping was carried out in 2011 as part of developing Programme-Based Approach on Gender Equality (PBA-GE).
- The PBA-GE strategy, so-called "PBA towards Gender Equality" is being developed and implemented progressively by the MoWA with support from UNDP and partners who are supporting gender. In this regard, PBA mechanism was established within the MoWA and the ministry has recently initiated the next Five Years Gender Mainstreaming Strategic Plan 2014-2018, named Neary Rattanak Phase IV NR IV.
- Draft Capacity Development Strategic Plan has been developed for capacitating the MoWA and five selected Gender Mainstreaming Action Groups of line ministries to support the implementation of PBA-GE.
- Millennium Acceleration Framework/Action Plan on Women's Economic Empowerment (MAF-WEE) was fully developed by the MoWA with support from UNDP and is ready for launching in the third quarter 2013.
- A Practical Guide on Gender-Responsive Budgeting (GRB) was completely developed and a series of trainings/orientations were delivered for planning officials of MoWA, Ministry of Economy and Finance and other sector ministries including Cambodian National Council for Women in order to strengthen their capacity on GRB.
- Gender curriculum was completely developed and integrated into the academic programme of the Royal School of Administration (RSA). It is obvious that Gender Sensitive Courses are now mandatory for all RSA students, which are the Government's senior officials.
- Gender Mainstreaming Action Plans of concerned line ministries were formulated and updated with technical support from MoWA/PGE teams annually.
- High level dialogue and a number of national forums were held to promote women's entrepreneurship by establishing women's business networking and associations for small and medium women-led enterprises.
- The feasibility study was carried out to explore the possibilities for the establishment and functioning of GBV One-Stop Service Center. A programme thereof was developed and being implemented by MoWA/GIZ in two targeted provinces.
- Community Conversation Enhancement (CCE) concept note developed and CCE manual revised and implemented in one targeted province (Odormeanchey) through a subcontracting NGO. The CEE activities are now expanded to other high incident areas within the said province.

In 2013, UNDP continues to support the development of PBA-GE, which is one of emerging initiatives of the MoWA for gender, capacity development and aid effectiveness:

- To Support MoWA on the development and implementation of PBA-GE;
- To develop and implement a comprehensive capacity development (CD) strategy for MoWA and for selected GMAGs in support of a better aid effectiveness through PBA-GE;
- To support MoWA on the development of the Neary Rattanak IV; and Cambodia Gender Assessment III (CGAIII).

As stated in the programme document, MTR will be carried out in the third year of programme operation. The MoWA, in close partnership with UNDP, is looking for a highly qualified international consultant who has

senior knowledge and experience on gender programme monitoring and evaluation to carry out MTR of PGE III.

3) Objective and Scope of the work

The MTR is mainly intended to assess the overall progress towards programme intended objectives, CPAP and UNDAF outcomes and to inform MoWA and UNDP necessary adjustments and future directions. Therefore, consultant shall examine both the general aspects and specific components of the programme and shall make recommendations regarding specific actions that might be taken to improve the project sustainability, efficiency and effectiveness alignment to Government's policy framework (Rectangular Strategy, National Strategic Development Plan & NR III) and on-going reform programmes (PFM-RP, D&D & PAR)

In consultation with multiple stakeholders and relevant partners, the consultant will introduce how the MTR could be carried out towards critical expectations of the assignment. Therefore, scope of the assignment will cover:

- To review and assess the overall progress to date in the implementation of PGE III for <u>each of the three complimentary outputs as above mentioned</u>. In this effort, consultant shall carry out desk review on programme document, annual work plans and budgets, annual progress reports and other relevant documents (to be advised by MoWA/PGE team) and examine to what extent the project outputs are achieved or on/off track against project objectives, UNDAF and CPAP outcomes;
- To initiate and conduct interviews, meetings or consultations with MoWA, relevant line ministries and key stakeholders such as development partners and CSOs to look at relevance, effectiveness and sustainability arrangement of the programme;
- To review and assess the effectiveness of MoWA's institutional arrangement established to implement and manage PGE III as well as cooperation and partnership being established for the development and implementation of PBA-GE;
- To assess the overall capacity of MoWA in coordinating and monitoring gender mainstreaming activities in national policies and plans as well as providing technical assistance and support to GMAGs
- To identify and analyse factors that influenced performance of the project such as project ownership, partnership and coordination with other agencies, etc.
- To identify major institutional and operational issues that impacted on the achievement of the project objectives as well as MoWA's capacity development issues;
- Review the effectiveness and efficiency of support provided by UNDP contracted project staffs, international advisors or consultants towards emerging policy issues, strategic directions and overall coordination and management of the programme;
- Review and assess UNDP's supporting and oversight roles and provide recommendations
- To assess the project's relevance and its alignment with Government reforms, policies and strategies on gender equality, as well as with UN-wide and UNDP corporate strategy and vision on gender equality and empowerment of women
- To identify key challenges the project has encountered to date and assess the progress in addressing these.
- To develop programme framework in terms of key milestones and strategic priorities and required core personnel or consultants for rest of programme lifespan 2014-2015;

- To provide recommendations for adjustments and future direction of the project, possible cooperation mechanisms, partnerships and funding modalities, taking into account priorities and emerging issues, on-going government reforms and policy in Cambodia as well as UN reform

4) Final Products or Deliverables/Outputs

The consultant shall manage to deliver the following outputs:

Deliverables/Outputs	Estimated Duration to Complete	Target Due Dates	Review and Approvals Required
Desk review ¹⁹ conducted providing outline for the MTR report and assignment process	5 working days (home-based)	2nd week of August 2013	Team Leader, Governance
Submission of inception report and detailed Work Plan for the assignment with endorsement from MoWA	5 working days	4th week of August 2013	Team Leader, Governance
After consultations with relevant stakeholders, submission of draft MTR report with 30 pages in minimum including summary page (3) and annexes and presented to MoWA and UNDP for substantive comments and feedbacks	10 working days	1 st week of September 2013	Team Leader, Governance
Final Consolidated MTR Report finalised and approved by MoWA	5 working days	4 th week of September 2013	Team Leader, Governance

5). Institutional Arrangement

The consultant must be based in Cambodia following a 5-day desk review from his/her home country. A more detailed timeframe will be further elaborated with MoWA and UNDP once the consultant is selected. An orientation meeting will be provided to the consultants in order to provide background information and to share in more details supporting elements for the assignment. The consultant will report to Team Leader of UNDP Governance Cluster. S/he will works closely with PGE III management team comprised of National Programme Director, Management Specialist, Programme Manager and Programme Analyst of UNDP's Governance Cluster.

The consultant will be responsible for developing appropriate methodology for the review. As this is a review and not an evaluation, it is envisaged that this would include a consultative and participatory methodology making full use of the experience and ideas emanating also from the PGE team, UNDP and key government and donor counterparts:

1. Review of project related documents and other relevant documents, if necessary.

¹⁹ Project related documents, work plan and reports to be advised and provided by PGE team

- 2. Conduct interviews or focus group discussions with key stakeholders.
- 3. Present the findings and key recommendations to PGE team and UNDP before submission of final report.

MoWA/PGE team will facilitate the review by participating in consultations and interviews, by providing project documents, by identifying stakeholders, project beneficiaries and sources of information. PGE will support the consultant in organising some meetings with relevant stakeholders, partners and beneficiaries, if necessary.

6) Duration of the work

The consultant will carry out the review activities over a period of 25 working days from 2nd week of August 2013 till last week of September 2013. It is expected that the final report be submitted no later than 30 September 2013 and with approval from PGE/MoWA.

7) Duty station

The incumbent is required to be in the country for at least 20 working days after 5 days desk review from home and perform field work, data collection and consultations with relevant stakeholders and to present the findings and recommendations. He/she will be based in the MoWA.

Annex 2: List of Documents Reviewed

General:

- Project document and project factsheet
- PGE Annual Work Plans
- PGE Annual Reports
- Minutes of Board Meetings
- Previous PGE MTR and final evaluation

Component 1: Gender Mainstreaming in national and sectoral policies, programmes and budget

- Concept note and report for High Level Gender Policy Dialogue in 2011
- Neary Rattanak 4 (draft 2014-2018)
- Draft 10 year Gender Policy
- Course Outline for training on gender at the Royal School of Administration
- Leadership and management training program and Training Report 2013
- Gender-Responsive Budgeting's Practical Guide and training report 2013
- Final report MoWA's capacity assessment in 2010
- Capacity Development Strategic Plan for PBA on Gender
- Concept Note for Cambodia Gender Assessment 2014
- Report or materials developed for 4th East Asia Ministerial Meeting on Gender Equality in 2011
- NR3 MTR Report (optional)
- Select minutes from TWG-G meetings
- MoWA Strategic Plan Neary Rattanak III 2009-2013

Component 2: Women's Economic Empowerment

- Millennium Acceleration Framework (MAF) on WEE (CMDG3)
- Women's economic forums (2 reports in 2012) and round table discussion (2013)
- Guideline on GM in Vocational Skills Training Program (of TVET)
- Guideline to integrate Gender Aspects into SME programs
- PPP-APRC mission briefings or reports (3 missions conducted, one in 2012 and 2 in 2013)
- Field assessment report on WDC support to self-help groups and producers groups
- Mapping paper on easy access to microfinance services

Component 3: Gender-Based Violence

- OSSC Program Formulation Report
- Study Tour Report to Bangladesh
- Feasibility Study on OSSC
- Inputs paper for new NAP VAW as part of PBA on Gender
- CCE concept note and CCE manual (revised)
- CCE field monitoring reports carried out by PGE team
- LAC final report on the completion of CCE contract

Cross-Sector Support

- National Strategic Development Plan (NSDP) 2009-2013
- MoWA inputs for NSDP 2014-2018
- CMDG Annual Reports
- Rectangular Strategy
- The Cambodia Aid Effectiveness Report 2010
- Input paper for 10-Year National Program for Sub-National Democratic Development (optional)
- Select Gender Mainstreaming Action Plans of line ministries (optional)
- Policy on Women Economic Empowerment (draft under UN Women)

Annex 3: Stakeholders Consulted

MoWA

H.E Dr. Ing Kantha Phavi, Minister of MoWA

H.E Kim Chamroeun, Secretary of State and Director of PGE

H.E Sy Define, Secretary of State, Legal Protection and Information

HE Kim Siphat, Deputy Director-General for Gender Equality

Mr. The Chhun Hak, Deputy Director-General, Gender Equality

Mrs. Nhean Sochetra, Director, Dept of Gender Equality and Programme Manager, UNDP-MoWA PGE III

Ms. Keth Mardy, Director, Department of Legal Protection

Ms. Soth Sithon, Deputy Director of Department of Economic Development

Ms. Te Vouchlim, Director, Planning and Statistics Department

Ms. Kany Virya. Deputy Director of Gender Equality Department

Dr. Andreas Selmeci, Programme Manager, Access to Justice for Women, GiZ

UNDP

Ms. Setsuko Yamazaki, Country Dirctor

Mr. Napoleon Navarro, Deputy Country Director

Mr. Velibor Popovic, OIC of Governance Cluster

Ms. Kasumi Nishigaya, Interim Policy Advisor

MOWA - PGE/UNDP Contracted Staff

Mr. Bory Pen, Policy and Aid Effectiveness Specialist

Mr. Thavrith Chhuon, Gender Responsive Budgeting Specialist

Ms. Heng Seltik, Women's Economic Empowerment Specialist

Ms. Haruka Ishall, Gender Based Violence Specialist

Ministry of Planning

Mr. Poch Sovanndy, Deputy Director General, General Directorate of Planning

Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training

Mr. Laov Him, Director General of TVET

Ministry of Rural Development

H.E. Lach Samorn, Under Secretary of State, Deputy Chair, GMAG

Mr. Mr. Nedy Kimsen, GMAG member

Mr. Touch Siphat, GMAG

Ms. Chan Sopea, GMAG member

UN Agencies and Development Partners

Ms. Sarah Knibbs, Deputy Representative, UNFPA

Ms. AING Sokroeun, Gender Analyst, UNFPA

Ms. Wenny Kusuma, Country Director, UN WOMEN

Mr. Erik Wllin, First Secretary – Democratic Governance, Embassy of Sweden

Mr. Suzuki Junsuke, Project Formulation Advisor (Governance), JICA

Ms. Nadamoto Satoko, Project Formulation Advisor (Governance and Gender), JICA

Mr. Juan Pita, General Coordinator, Spanish Cooperation in Cambodia

NGOs and Private Sector Representatives

Ms. Seng Takakneary, President, Cambodia Women's Entrepreneurs Association (CWEA)

Mr. Kao, Legal Aid Cambodia

Ms. Ros Sopheap, Executive Director, Gender and Development for Cambodia, CWEA

Mrs. Thida Khus, Executive Director, Silika

Ms. Caroline McCausland, Country Director, ActionAid

Ms. Nanda Pok, Women for Prosperity

Ms. Christine Gauthier, Founder, Waterlilly, Member CWEA

Ms. Sned Takakneary, Member CWEA

Ms. Norm Bannak, Member CWEA

Annex 4: Review of Progress by Output and Major Activities

Output 1: Gender-responsive policies, plans and budgets of key sectors developed and their implementation monitored

Deliverable 1.1: MoWA has improved capacity for sector gender analysis and strategic advocacy for engendering national and sectoral policies, plans, budgets and reform programmes

Major Project Activities (as listed in the programme document)

Description of Status/Progress Made by the Project for the 2011-2013 period (as determined by the MTR)

Activity 1: Engender the three reform programmes 1) the guideline on government's budget strategic and annual plan, 2) legislation on civil service at sub-national level, Human Resource Management, Human Resource Development, Capacity Development of Civil Servants and Redeployment, and 3) D&D systems, procedures, guidelines and its operational tools

- PGEIII programme design anticipated that work would be undertaken to engender three key reform programmes of the RCG.
- Plans were made to mainstream gender in the 'draft statute for the sub-national civil servants' but this did not happen because it is not yet to be released for consultation.
- Progress was made by MoWA to engender D&D reforms however this required minimal technical or financial assistance from the project.
- A draft concept note of Gender Mainstreaming into the Public Financial Management Reform Programme: Gender Responsive budgeting Initiatives were developed in 2011.
- Civil Service reform progress has been minimal as the reform agenda itself is reported to have stalled.

Unplanned achievement:

 UNDP/PGE provided financial support to the MoWA's Gender and Climate Change Committee (GCCC) to build the capacity of its members on gender and climate change. Upon the funding, a series of ToTs on Climate Change Vulnerability and Adaptation/Mitigation Capacity Analysis, and Planning from Gender Perspectives were provided to GCCC members, resulting in improved knowledge and capacity. This support is essential and a stepping stone as GCCC is in the process of developing the Cambodia Climate Change Strategic Plan (CCSSP) so that they have the capacity to implement it effectively.

Activity 2: Deliver gender equality training to Royal School of Administration trainees (350 per year)

- Supporting RSA to design and implement gender equality training was a strategic and sustainable move.
- The Gender Equality training curriculum has been finalized and sessions at the RSA have commenced.
- Already the project has met the 2013 target of "100 newly recruited civil servants are trained on gender issues". As of June 31, 2013 98 civil servants (68 female) were trained.

Activity 3: Engender the curriculum of the Royal School of Administration and deliver

- In 2012, 231 trainees of Royal School of Administration (RSA) received gender training.
- In 2012, one hundred newly-recruited civil servants (57 of whom were female) were trained on gender concepts and gender dimensions in the civil service through a two-day training course jointly delivered by

annual gender training for 350 new and	MoWA and the State Secretariat for Civil Service.
current civil service students	The target in the programme document is that 350 people are trained per year is unlikely to be met. This number is beyond the control of MoWA/PGEIII as it depends on how many civil servants attend the RSA training each year.
Activity 4: Provide leadership training programmes for women senior and middle managers in the public administration at national and sub-national levels	 A 2013 target was that a "Leadership and Management Training programme is developed and at least 60 female senior and middle managers from 28 line ministries are trained". This was achieved in the first quarter of 2013 when women from 26 ministries/institutions were trained by VBNK. At the time of writing VBNK was conducting a follow-up process to assess the effectiveness of the training.
Activity 5: Develop the MoWA and TWG-G Secretariat's autonomy and leadership in leading and coordinating the TWG-G	 PGE has provided continued and high level support to the TWG-G over 2011-2013 period. It is reported by Dept. Gender Equality that PGE is supporting 'TWG-G Secretariat autonomy and leadership in leading and coordinating TWG-G' which was identified as a priority activity in the programme document.
Activity 6: Conduct a donor mapping and draft the PBA for gender equality for approval by the concerned stakeholders.	 The development of a PBA for gender equality is a major development which could change the face of MoWA in the coming years and even decades. Already considerable progress has been made which demonstrates a high level political support within MoWA and the government more broadly. UNDP/PGE has been credited with raising an additional \$1.5M 2012/13 for the PBA from SIDA which is a major investment. A MoWA PBA Committee, chaired by the Minister, and its Secretariat were established in 2012. A "PBA roadmap on Gender" was prepared in 2011/12. A major achievement is the development of a "Capacity Development Strategy for PBA towards Gender Equality" which received high level endorsement. Work has also commenced on "common management arrangements" (refer also to Activity 11).
Activity 7: Identify and integrate gender indicators in key CMDGs and NSDP Update mid-term review and NSDP 2014-2018	 This is an extremely important activity and good progress appears to have been made. MoWA, with PGE support, submitted inputs on gender for the NSDP (2014-2018). MoWA also sent a letter to line ministries to encourage them to mainstream gender into their sector inputs for NSDP. Prior to this, in 2011, PGE supported MoWA in reviewing NSDP indicators for the mid-term review of the NSDP. PGE worked with the counterparts to prepare comments and inputs for the 2012 Annual Report for NSDP (2009-2013), which was fully accepted by the MOP. Further exploration of the NSDP process will be explored during consultations to assess future plans to ensure the NSDP is fully engendered. It will be particularly important to ensure a robust and coherent monitoring and evaluation framework for gender equality is created and to strengthen linkages between different sector strategies and policies.
Activity 8: Support the development of	Progress is being made with a draft NRIV inception report having been prepared for consultations. This was

MoWA's five-year strategic plan - Neary	informed by a 'data collection process' which was undertaken in 2011.
Rattanak IV (2014-2018)	A mid-term review of Neary Rattanak 3 Mid-Term Review was completed in 2012.
(• However, the process to develop NRIV started late and the consultation process thus far has been limited.
	• It is significant that a 10 year gender policy is being pursued. It is noted a gender policy is not included in the programme document, but is a major achievement of the PGEIII.
Activity 9: Support the development and publication of the Cambodia Gender Assessment 3	
Activity 10: Set up M&E tools for monitoring and reporting on progress on gender equality	• The intention of this activity is not clear. This should be re-considered in the programme reformulation process.
Activity 11: Support the development of capacity development strategy of MoWA	 It is significant that a "Capacity Development Strategy for PBA towards Gender Equality" (CDSP) has been prepared. This is a major achievement of the PGE/MoWA. The process to develop the strategy appears have been consultative with the participation of senior management and DPs and high-level meeting between the Minister and DPs. The CDSP is significant as it outlines how MoWA will develop its organizational, institutional and human resource capacities to deliver for gender equality in the context of aid effectiveness for gender equality. The CDSP was informed on a Capacity Assessment of MoWA which was approved in 2011. Work has commenced on the "common management arrangements" for MoWA to implement the PE (M&E, and compilation of national operations systems). This activity is not explicitly referred to in the programme document.
Deliverable 1.2: Key selected sector ministries acceleration	s are able to implement their plans and integrate gender in their respective sector plans and budgets for CMD0
acceleration Activity 1: Train and mentor GMAG members	From reading the progress reports, it was unclear what the strategy has been to support GMAGs and hor
and sector ministries' PFM working groups on	
sector gender analysis and integration of	
gender considerations into their ministries' planning and budgeting	initiative to mainstream gooder into the DEM DD Budget Ctrotogic Dlan and particularly to mal
	• To support this process, "A Practical Guide on Gender-Responsive Budgeting" was developed and a series trainings/orientations were delivered for planning officials of MoWA, Ministry of Economy and Finance ar other sector ministries including Cambodian National Council for Women.
	1

• Capacity development needs of five GMAGs were assessed and incorporated into MOWA's CDSP.

Activity 2: As a result of the above training, up to 5 ministries conduct results-based sector budget review and integrate the analysis in the budget review and planning process	 As noted under Activity 1, considerable work has been done on Gender Responsive Budgeting and a "GRB's Practical Guide" has been drafted and finalized. The training for the 3 selected ministries (MRD, MLVT, and MLMUPC) was conducted as planned. Practical exercise on their Budget Strategic Plan and Program Budgeting was given into which gender has been mainstreamed. Importantly, the Budget Plans 2014-2018 of MRD, MLVT and MLUPC are reported to be 'gender responsive with specific gender response targets' through "practical exercise'. It remains to be seen if these Ministries actually attract funding. This is being monitored by PGE and a result expected by year end. It should be noted that most ministries have developed their GMAPs, but many of them have not been well-implemented due to financial constraints. MoWA has been giving advice to line ministries as to how to seek financial support both from within their own ministries and from development partners, and in turn, line ministries are now working on its operational plan and seeking financial support from different sources.
Activity 3: Up to five sector ministries update GMAPs that contain measurable baseline, indicators and targets	 A thorough review of the GMAPs was not within the scope of the MTR. This review will be important as an Output 1 Indicator is "No. of sector plans with gender specific targets and budget allocations (2010:0, 2015: 5)". The GMAPs of Ministry of Rural Development, Ministry of Commerce and Ministry of Industry, Mine and Energy were updated, printed and disseminated. PGE also supported the development, printing and dissemination of the Ministry of Cults and Religion's GMAP. This support not only helped the four Ministries to have a gender strategic plan within their own sector, but also improve the capacity of key relevant officials in result-based planning and gender mainstreaming through their participation in the planning process.
Activity 4: MoWA and line ministries take steps independently to initiate review with NIS of CSES rolling surveys (contents, methods and analysis)	 A key achievement in 2011 was engendering the CSES 2012 resulting in gender related questions being included in the survey. There was insufficient time for the consultant to review the quality of MoWA/PGE supported inputs into these processes. MoP expressed satisfaction at MoWA's contributions to these processes.
Activity 5: Establish a national pool of gender specialists and survey data analysts for CSES, the Agriculture Census, Demographic and Health Survey (DHS) and other survey instruments and data exercises.	MoWA, with support of PGE, has contributed to the development of surveys. However, a national pool of gender specialists was not supported by PGE. UNFPA is providing direct support to MoP in this regard.

Output 2: Increased access to gender-sensitive business development services for women small business entrepreneurs

Deliverable 2.1: Contributions to knowledge

Activity 1: Partnership and explore possible stuilliteracy, its root causes and existing facilities Activity 2: Partnership with relevant stakeholders national campaign for female adult literacy, based Activity 3: Partnership and explore possible studinformal sector	responsibility of MoEYS and not of MoWA. to develop and implement a joint d on the study
Deliverable 2.2: Business development services f	for women entrepreneurs
Activity 1: Engender MLVT's vocational training programme in Kampong Speu and one other province (to be determined) Activity 2: Implement WDC Kampong Speu 3-Year Business Plan	 Work was undertaken in 2013 to develop the capacity of MLVT's vocational training centres on gender mainstreaming in skills training services, through the publication of a "Guideline on Gender Mainstreaming in Technical Vocational Training Programme". The guideline is intended to be a useful tool to assist creating gender responsive technical vocational education training provided by line ministries, NGOs, private institutions. There was insufficient time to how MLVT's vocational training centres actually to apply the guide. A range of work has been undertaken to support the development, implementation and monitoring of the WDC Kampong Speu 3-Year Business Plan. PGE has provided support WDC Kampong Speu to establish Self Help Groups for their target group. According to the April 1-June 31, 2013 Progress report, "172 women in Kampong Speu have access to financial resources for their business purposes after they joined Self Help Groups formed by Women's Development Centre with support from PGE/MoWA. A monitoring system to measure progress of the groups was developed. During first three months of 2013, it is reported that the "total amount of their savings are \$5,637.00, dividends earned \$296.00 through loans provided to their members." In addition, a study to map out financial services provided by microfinance institutions, banks and line ministries in Kampong Speu was conducted this year. WDC will share key findings with their target groups in the second half of 2013 "so that they can make informed decisions when selecting financial product/services for their business purposes".
Activity 3: Based on WDC Kampong Speu experience, support other WDC (TBD)	It was decided that another WDC not be supported until after the MTR process has taken place.
Activity 4: Engage with the World Bank to look at feasibility of establishing a women-friendly business environment linked with proposed	This engagement with the World Bank has not been pursued.

business incubator projects.	
Output 3: Preventive and remedial responses	to GBV scaled up
Deliverable 3.1: Research for evidence-based	GBV programme
Activity 1: Commission study to document and analyze current data and information systems for storing, sharing and using GBV- related information	 This is a broad activity and it's not entirely clear what the intention was. However, it was reported that GIZ conducted a data collection study which meant that PGEIII did not pursue this activity. PGEIII project staff did provide technical support to the GIZ study through a national working group.
Activity 2: Commission study on knowledge and attitudes of key implementers towards VAW, in partnership with P4P	• In 2011 technical support was provided to Partners for Prevention's (P4P) study "Political analysis on the implementation of the national action plan". Technical support was also provided to two other P4P studies; a national report on GBV prevention and masculinities and the recently published "Why some men use VAW and How to Prevent it".
	 It is reported that the study was important for developing next National Action Plan (NAP) on VAW. It is also reporting that the P4P studies provide sufficient evidence and data to support prevention efforts including CCE.
Activity 3: Commission feasibility study on the establishment of GBV OSSC	 This deliverable is completed. The OSSC Feasibility Study was completed in 2011. As part of the feasibility study of OSSC, a 'programme formulation' was developed.
Activity 4: Facilitate consultations among key stakeholders toward the establishment of OSSCs	 It is reported that in 2012 PGE had facilitated a high level discussion within and outside of MoWA to discuss ways to discuss how MoWA move forward the implementation of OSSC's recommendations. The feasibility study was carried out to explore the possibilities for the establishment and functioning of GBV One-Stop Service Center. The programme is currently being implemented by MoWA/GIZ in two targeted provinces and it will be included into the GIZ next phase of programming as well. It is reported that in 2013 MoWA conducted numerous workshops and consultation meetings on 2nd NAPVAW (which was endorsed by the TWGG-GBV on May 21, 2013). Based on the technical support from PGE, OSSC recommendations are now officially incorporated into the National Action Plan on Violence against Women (2013-7).
Activity 5: Coordinate and support south- south exchanges with other countries in the region (including study tours to countries	• An OSSC Study Tour to Bangladesh was organized from March 11-16, 2012. 14 relevant government officials including 5 Secretaries of State and 3 Under-Secretaries of State from MoWA and line Ministries participated.
where OSSCs are successfully operational)	This was a joint initiative of UNFPA, UNICEF and GIZ, with PGE take a lead coordination role.
Deliverable 3.2 - Preventive response	
Activity 1: Train and coach 300 selected local	• Progress is being made to advance activity 1, however the activity did not commence in 2011 as had been

authorities and CSO members on Community Capacity Enhancement (CCE) skills and methodology (10 modules) to become CCE facilitators

Activity 2: Conduct community conversations in 100 villages

- Community conversations have been successfully conducted in 10 target villages; representing a total of around 3000 villagers who have participated.
- MTR process will explore feasibility of reaching the target of 100 villages by 2015.
- More information will be sought on any impact assessment or evaluation of the CCE model which may have been conducted.

Activity 3: Establish 100 CCE networks/
groups and link them with other networks of
service providers and referral services
(prevention, protection, counselling, health
and legal advices etc.)

- anticipated, which has meant the targets for the number of people to be trained have not yet been met. Given the implementation delays the targets would need to be revised.
- A CCE concept note and manual developed and implemented in one targeted province (Odormeanchey)
 through a subcontracting NGO, Legal Aid Cambodia It was a strategic decision to contract this work to an
 NGO in this manner.
- Training and coaching has been delivered to 30 selected village chiefs, CCE volunteers, CCWC members in CCE.
- In addition, it is reported that 60 selected village chiefs, CCE volunteers and CCWC members are trained and coached in CCE.
- According to the most recent progress report the LAC contract has ended, and the PGE team has started to implement the CCE activity in the next 20 villages.
- MTR process will explore the CCE model in more detail and conduct an assessment of progress made, challenges and next steps in order to achieve the target of "300 village chiefs, CWCC members, CSO representatives receiving TOT on GBV CCE skills and methodology".
- The progress report of 2012 notes that CCE has been 'making significant impact on people's comprehensive understanding of and attitudes towards domestic violence specifically as a result of trainings among its target populations'. It will be possible to report more complete results after the post-test when the target population finishes the whole CCE process in 2013.
- There is minimal information on the progress made to establish CCE networks and information on how many CCE networks have been established.
- It is reported that PGE also supported LAC to organize the CCE network meeting with 80 stakeholders represented. The meetings aimed to 'create better referral network to meet needs of survivors of DV more effectively in the community".
- More information and analysis on this activity and MoWA's role in it will be pursued during MTR consultations.

Annex 5: List of Acronyms

AusAID Australian Agency for International Development

CAR Council for Administrative Reform

CDC Council for the Development of Cambodia

CCE Community Capacity Enhancement
CGA Cambodia Gender Assessment

CMDG Cambodian Millennium Development Goals
CNCW Cambodia National Council for Women

CoM Council of Ministers

CPAP Country Programme Action Plan (of UNDP)

CSES Cambodia Socio-economic Survey
D&D Decentralization and Deconcentration

DP Development Partner

GAD/C Gender and Development for Cambodia

GBV Gender-based violence

GIZ German Department for International Cooperation

GMAG Gender Mainstreaming Action Group
GMAP Gender Mainstreaming Action Plans
GRB Gender Responsive Budgeting

IP3 Three-year Implementation plan of the NP-SNDD

JICA Japan International Cooperation Agency
MAF Millennium Acceleration Framework
MDG Millennium Development Goals
MEF Ministry of Economy and Finance
MoEYS Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport
MoLVT Ministry of Labor and Vocational Training

MoP Ministry of Planning

MoU Memorandum of Understanding MoWA Ministry of Women's Affairs MRD Ministry of Rural Development

MTR Mid Term Review

NGO Non-governmental organization
NIS National Institute of Statistics

NR Neary Rattanak (gender mainstreaming strategy)

OSSC One Stop Service Center

NSDP National Strategic Development Plan

PAR Public administration reform
PFM Public financial management

PFM-RP Public Financial Management Reform Program

PBA Programme Based Approach
PGE Partnership for Gender Equity
RGC Royal Government of Cambodia
RSA Royal School of Administration

SIDA Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency

SSCS State Secretariat of Civil Service

TWG-G Technical Working Group on Gender
UNDP United Nations Development Programme

UNFPA United Nations Population Fund

UN Women United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women

VAW Violence against Women

WDC Women's Development Centre
WEE Women's Economic Empowerment