

MANAGEMENT RESPONSE TO MIDTERM EVALUATION RECOMMENDATION FOR “ECOSYSTEM BASED ADAPTATION APPROACH TO MAINTAINING WATER SECURITY IN CRITICAL WATER CATCHMENTS IN MONGOLIA” PROJECT

Abbreviations:

DRRM project- “Strengthening Local Level Capacities for Disaster Risk Reduction Management and Coordination in Mongolia” MON 13/301 project

IGE-Institute of Geo-Ecology

LC-Local Coordinator

MEGDT-Ministry of Environment, Green development and Tourism

MoFA-Ministry of Food and Agriculture

MEU-Mongolian Educational University

NALGAC-National Agency for Land Affairs, Geodesy and Cartography

NAMHEM-National Agency for Meteorology, Hydrology and Environmental Monitoring

PIU-Project Implementation Unit

PTC-Project Technical Committee

RBA-River Basin Administration

SCRKh -Soum Citizen Representative Khural

UNDP-United Nations Development Program

WUG-Water user group

Recommendation 1: Restructuring Log frame/Corrective actions of Project Design					
Management response 1:	Key actions	Timeframe /Starting date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments
The project is planning to reflect recommendations into the log frame	- Indicators in the log frame are expected to be reviewed and revised in consultation with the PTC and UNDP.	10 March, 2015	PIU and MEGDT with collaboration of UNDP	Completed	The updated Logframe is shared with the RTA anticipating comments/clearance for presentation to and endorsement by the Project board in June.
	- The project technical committee members are expected to provide more detailed scientific guidance to restructure the log frame considering the above recommendations	16 March, 2015		Completed	
	- Updated Logframe to be endorsed by the RTA and the Project Board	June 2015		Started	
Recommendation 2: Report about the use of co-finance resources in more detail within the second half of the project					
Management response 2:	Key actions	Timeframe/Starting/due date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments
The project has initiatives through establishment of cooperation monitoring sheets with soum and aimag authorities in order to improve their ownership in terms of co-financing. Reporting and monitoring of the use of co-finance resources will be strengthened as per	Component based co-finance resources will be monitored by relevant officers and compiled and i) reported to relevant bodies/stakeholders at the end of year; ii) included in the PPR to AF	25 Dec 2014 June 2015	PIU with collaboration of UNDP CO	Started and ongoing	

recommendation.					
Recommendation 3: Introduce Benchmarks and Training Plan in addition to Work Plans					
Management response 3:	Key actions	Timeframe/Starting date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments
The project plans to have training plans with regard to EbA with clear benchmarks	- Capacity development plan including training plan drafted by PIU setting up benchmarks as baseline as per 2012 or 2013 as appropriate. It will be commented by UNDP and MEGDT for finalization	01 May, 15	PIU, MEGDT, UNDP	Started in April, 2015	Establish a separate training plan, which gives an overview of all trainings and other means for capacity development.
	-Annual assessment will be conducted on capacity improvement	4 th qtr of Each year	PIU	Start at end of the 2015	
Recommendation 4: Establish a vulnerability profile of women, especially with respect to cold weather conditions and discrimination in income generation options. With respect to coldness, water monitoring posts should be provided with small dwellings like the one which the post for glacier monitoring has already received. If possible provide in-door toilets in schools					
Management response 4:	Key actions	Timeframe /Starting date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments
The project will establish a vulnerability profile of woman in cooperation with relevant soum authorities	- Conduct vulnerability assessment of women with respect to cold weather conditions and income generation. - Facilitate follow up actions by soum authorities and local meteorological and hydrological offices as well as schools to deal with the issue of providing warm shelters/ heating options through allocating resources including from soum development fund.	01 March, 2015	PIU, MEGDT	Started	
Project will make efforts towards facilitation of soum level investment in schools to have recommended facilities		01 June, 2015		Started	

In addition, the project will focus on providing assistance to water monitoring posts.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Facilitate a cooperative measure to build a small post (2mx2m) with local Meteorology and hydrology Agencies and RBAs. -Discuss project potential contributions with MEGDT and reflect in work plans -Support small grant proposals aimed at dealing with the issue 	15 April, 2015		Started	
Recommendation 5: Improving ecological economic valuation scope					
Management response 5:	Key actions	Timeframe/ Starting date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments
<p>PIU plans to reflect provided comments into the CBA</p> <p>More specifically, the project has already initiated Cost and Benefit analyses focused on comparing the economic impacts for different interventions. This is expected to include specific recommendations provided by MTR consultant.</p> <p>Economic valuation and CBA will base on survey results being conducted among local communities and households. For analysis of survey results, training on budgeting and financial calculation of income through household farming/ or herding is needed, sharing international practices.</p> <p>Since the National capacity with regard to ecological economic valuation is too weak, there is a high</p>	<p>-Finalize the CBA analysis reflecting the comments and ensure synergies among studies of economic evaluation, future CBAs and study on strengthening financial mechanisms of EbA adaptation measures</p> <p><i>Strengthen national capacity upon conducting Ecological Valuation:</i></p> <p><u>-Develop training handout on models and methodologies including INVESTS model by Natural capital project by Stanford university for project stakeholders</u> including representatives of national agencies, research institutes and local authorities and arrange training if required to</p>	<p>01 June, 2015</p> <p>15 March, 2016</p>	<p>MEGDT, PIU</p> <p>MEGDT, PIU</p>	<p>Started</p> <p>Will be initiated in February, 2016</p>	<p>Output related intervention</p> <p>Ecological economic valuation process is almost finalized based on approaches suggested by Yale university.</p> <p>(needs discussion for further action)</p>

demand to focus on strengthening national capacities on above issues.					
Recommendation 6: Linking spring protection with provision of water basins for livestock					
Management response 6:	Key actions	Timeframe/ Starting date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments
Project reflected this recommendation into Work plan 2015	-Improve previously protected springs considering technical recommendations (build small constructions to divert the water into surface water for drinking or build sink or small dam or collection tool)	15 April, 2015	PIU	Started	Set of Combined Activity
	-Consider recommendations for springs to be protected in 2015 and further years	5 April, 2015	PIU	Started	Biosan monitoring
Recommendation 7: Reducing Evatranspiration in Water Harvesting Schemes					
Management response 7:	Key actions	Timeframe/ Starting date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments
Project reflected the recommendation into Work plan 2015	-Cover water reservoirs and channels with plastic materials or improve irrigation channels in cooperation with Water User Groups in target basins	01 June, 2015	PIU, WUGs	Started	
	-Encourage use and maintenance of drip irrigation/tube/ and wells by establishing pilot funds to be charged by revenues of local farmers	01 Jul, 2016	PIU, SRKh, Soum Authorities	Will be started in April, 2016	
-Estimate evapotranspiration rate and propose relevant measures	Assess evatranspiration rates at both sites with and without interventions based on	01 Jul, 2016	PIU, relevant	Will be	

	internationally recognized methodologies and propose relevant measures		departments of MUST	started in July, 2016	
Recommendation 8: Pilot water regeneration schemes of higher density					
Management response 8:	Key actions	Timeframe/ Starting date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments
The project included recommended actions as pilot activities into Work plan 2015	<i>Initiate monitoring on creeks:</i> Project local coordinators will be responsible for conducting monitoring on protected/ecologically and economically important springs in cooperation with local meteorological officers.	01 April, 2015	LCs, local meteorological and hydrological units	Started from February, 2015	
	Initiate pilot rehabilitation of springs in one sub-catchment. As of 2014, 7 soum communities have been trained on spring protection techniques. Other 10 project soum communities have strong expectations to be trained on the same topic in this year. Therefore, the project is focusing on providing trainings for remaining soum officers, herders and farmers in 2015. Beyond 2015, the MTR recommendation is fully feasible to be implemented on the ground with strong engagement of local resource/trained persons.	01 March, 2016	PIU	Started	
Recommendation 9: Address snow hazards					

Management response 9:	Key actions	Timeframe/ Starting date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments
The project will focus on improving local knowledge and capacities with regard to prevention of snow hazard -Collaborate with DRRMIV project and NEMA to conduct demonstration training on snow harvesting and prevention of snow hazards for selected/vulnerable communities in Kharkhiraa Turgen sub-basin	Conduct demonstration training on snow harvesting and prevention of snow hazards for selected/vulnerable communities in Kharkhiraa Turgen sub-basin	01 Dec,16	PIU, Local emergency agency	Start in September, 2016	
Recommendation 10: Integration of fire management in EbA management					
Management response 10:	Key actions	Timeframe/ Starting date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments
Relevant activities have been conducted in 2014 and reflected in 2015 Work plan	-Build fire protection zone along Mongolian borderline for prevention from steppe and forest fires in cooperation with Fire fighting authority of relevant soums	01 April, 2015	PIU, Local emergency agencies	Started	Strategic intervention
	-Produce and publish educational and awareness raising materials on fire prevention	15 June, 2015		Started in April	
	-Share #9 and 10 recommendations to Disaster management Project for synergies	1 April 2015	PIU	Started	
Recommendation 11: Introduce sustainable intensification of pastures					
Management response 11:	Key actions	Timeframe/ Starting date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments

Relevant activities have been reflected in 2015 Work plan	-Organize consultation with relevant officers of Ministry of Food and Agriculture on policy and priority plans.	15 April, 2015	PIU	Started	
	-Organize consultative meetings on conventional and innovative livestock husbandry techniques among soum land managers and herder communities	15 April, 2015	PIU NALACaG	Started	
	-Conduct on-the-job training for soum level officers/land managers on sustainable pastoral management	15 April, 2015	PIU NALAGaC	Started	
	-Establish fodder production workshops in 2 soums and improve haymaking area	01 May, 2015	PIU, MoFA	Started	
Recommendation 12: Take a Mosaic Landscape approach					
Management response 12:	Key actions	Timeframe/ Starting date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments
It has been in our focus since 2012. Further, it will be one of the main priorities of the project	<p>-Mosaic landscape approach will be applied in crop production/ecologically oriented agriculture sites with consideration of biodiversity requirements. (Integration of strips of strips of fields (layers of trees with different heights) ecotourism sites, pastures and haymaking areas with fences or without).</p> <p>-Springs/ riverbed protection using ecologically friendly approaches will be linked to pasture use around the water resources and tree plantation, where adoptable, and to ecotourism, forest restoration and protected areas.</p> <p>Based on findings of Managed Resources of Protected Areas Project, UNDP on connectivity needs and assessments</p>	01 June, 2015	PIU	Started	Str.appr on Project level

	(important key species, argali sheep, goitered Mongolian gazelles, white naped cranes and ungulates that can serve to determine areas) and facilitate soum land use planning and consider in EBA measure implementations.				
Recommendation 13: Streamlining poverty reduction targets with environmental targets					
Management response 13:	Key actions	Timeframe/ Starting date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments
Project plans to focus on harness the environmental activities of the project to reduce poverty. Relevant activities have been reflected in Work plan 2015 -Seek to expand /diversify herder group focus (Biological Diversity, forest user group, eco tourism etc.,)	1. Collection of baseline data on herder families/user groups' income and living standards prior to the measures and skill development.	01 June, 2015	PIU	Started	SA on Pr. level
	2. Monitoring of effects of the Project interventions on livelihoods improvements (such as biological diversity, ecotourism, small scale water harvesting measures, market compatible vegetable and fruits using water saving approaches , wool products making and crafts using woods from cleaned forest with engagement of forest user groups etc)				
	3. Conduct surveys on supporting activities for additional income generation options (tree nurseries in Uvs lake –Tes river basin, community based ecotourism development etc.)	01 June, 2015	PIU	Started	
	4. Develop selection criteria in order to				

	streamline poverty reduction targets with environmental targets for communities to be trained. (identify environmental hotspots; key areas in the watershed etc. and user groups' readiness to keep the number of livestock or reduce the number.)	01 August, 2015	PIU, "Irvs Enterprise" NGO	Will be started in June, 2015	
	5. Second level/advanced training on wool processing training aimed at improving design and quality to reduce poverty	15 May, 2015	PIU	Started in April 2015	
	6. Link cooperatives to domestic and foreign markets with support of <u>Irvs enterprise NGO</u> which specialized in exporting handicraft products to connect the environmental activities of the Project to reduce poverty	01 August, 2015	PIU, MEGDT	Started in June 2015	
Recommendation 14: Strengthening wool/sheep/ pasture value chain					
Management response 14:	Key actions	Timeframe/ Starting date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments
Relevant activities have been reflected in Work plan 2015	-Second level/advanced training on wool processing training aimed at improving design and quality. Ensure production of woollen products where provision of raw wool by herders/or families possess sheep to product makers to encourage value chain and to keep more sheep. -Link NGOs to domestic and foreign	01 June, 2015	PIU	Initiated	SA on Pr. Level it could act as an economic incentive to keep more sheep in the herd, it would have also positive impacts on pastures, as


	markets with support of "Ives enterprise" NGO which specialized in export-oriented handicraft business and on its experiences and best practices.	01 August, 2015	PIU, "Ives enterprise" NGO	Will be started in June 2015	currently on an average the proportion of goats to sheep in herds is 70:30.
Recommendation 15: Introduce collection of water fees for maintenance of structures					
Management response 15:	Key action	Timeframe/ Starting date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments
Relevant activities have been reflected in Work plan 2015	<p>Establish WUGs in target soums</p> <p>Facilitate introduction of water fees based on "willingness to pay survey" findings to be conducted.</p> <p>Establish pilot funds to be collected from water User group members (at least 2 soums) for maintenance of engineered and hand dug wells, protection of rain and snow water traditional and mini catchments and springs and irrigation channels etc.</p>	<p>01 April, 2015</p> <p>01 May, 2016</p>	PIU, RBAs for Ulz and Uvs lake-Tes river basins	<p>Initiated</p> <p>Started</p>	<p>2015 is considered as a preparatory year for implementing the recommendation and it is expected to be initiated after formation of WUG-s in target basins/sub-basins and finalization of assessment on strengthening financial mechanisms of EbA measures .</p>
Recommendation 16: Strengthening Inter-sectoral Collaboration among ministries					


Management response 16:	Key actions	Timeframe/ Starting date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments
It is reflected in Work plan 2015	Organize a series of discussion/workshops including Agriculture, Water, Tourism, Mining & energy sectors to gather input for reflection of EbA principles into sector planning & policies	01 May, 2015	PIU, MEGDT, MoFA	Started	
Recommendation 17: Promoting traditional Water Harvesting					
Management response 17:	Key actions	Timeframe/ Starting date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments
It is reflected in Work plan 2015	Establish 2 traditional snow and rain water harvesting structures for application of snow/water to the field in order to increase moisture absorption of soil.	15 Sept, 2015	PIU, MEGDT, RBAs	Started	
	Relevant experts of RBA-s will conduct required technical inspection for construction works	01 May, 2015	PIU	Started	
	In addition, the project will prioritize topics with regard to traditional water harvesting through its Small grant program.				
Recommendation 18: Paying more attention to snow and green water as part of the hydrological cycle					
Management response 18:	Key actions	Timeframe/ Starting date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments
It will be reflected in further Work plans	-Demonstration training on snow harvesting techniques	01 Feb, 2016	PIU, IGE	Will be initiated in the end of 2015	
	-Establish pilot snow harvesting structure	01 Dec, 2016	PIU, IGE	Will be started in	Need to be


	-Initiate snow monitoring in areas where no network of Meteorology and Hydrology with cooperation of user groups. (I find it is a good idea, if the budget allows)	01 Dec, 2015	PIU, NAMHEM	September 2016 Will be started in September, 2015	discussed
Recommendation 19: Small grant proposals					
Management response 19:	Key actions	Timeframe/ Starting date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments
Proposals under recommended topics will be encouraged more involvement of communities and local stakeholders in EBA activities	Recommended topics will be more encouraged by project during 2 nd provision of small grants. (Specially, establishing of water harvesting, fire management and other emerging issues critical for EBA at a local level, etc)	01 August, 2015	PIU	Will be started in June, 2015	
	As a preparatory work, LC-s plan to conduct trainings on "How to write small grant proposals addressing and preventing CC impacts for better adaptation" for interested communities in their respective soums	15 April, 2015	PIU	Started	
Recommendation 20: Promoting environmental Journalism					
Management response 20:	Key actions	Timeframe/ Starting date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments
The project will focus more on supporting environmental journalism further	Organize context competition among local journalists during events for "World environmental day" with cooperation of Environment journalists club at Press institute	05 June, 2015	PIU	Initiated	
	Conduct Regional training on Environmental	15 May, 2016	PIU	Initiated	

	journalism for local journalists as per specific capacity development programme				
Recommendation 21: Conduct exchange visits of beneficiaries among different Aimags and target river basins					
Management response 21:	Key actions	Timeframe/ Starting date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments
It has been reflected in Work plan 2015	-Organize local community events on experience sharing on Adaptation measures between target aimags	01 August, 2015	PIU, LCs	Will be started in June, 2015	
	-Conduct experience sharing tours between project target soums/aimags: best practices of eco-schools, Spring EbA protection, water saving and harvesting techniques, establishment of nurseries, strawberry planting	01 Sept, 2015	PIU, LCs	Will be started in July, 2015	
Recommendation 22: Add traditional ecological knowledge into environmental education of eco-schools					
Management response 22:	Key actions	Timeframe /Starting date	Responsible unit	Status	Comments
It will be reflected in actions directed at supporting eco-schools in target soums	-Incorporate traditional environmentalism into EbA textbook as one chapter being developed by professor's team of Mongolian Educational University	15 May, 2015	PIU, MEU	Initiated	Work closely with Education for Sustainable Development programme funded by SDC.
	-Integrate 2 credit EbA subject containing traditional environmentalism to biology and natural sciences study programme at the	01 Sept, 2015	PIU, MEU	Will be started in July 2015	

	<p>Teacher's University for transferring knowledge to local children and young generation</p> <p>-Develop and publish a special booklet on traditional ecological education in form tales on nature respect, tradition and folk observations on weather for instance.</p>	01 May, 2016	PIU	Will be started in early 2016	
--	---	--------------	-----	-------------------------------	--

Prepared by:  Tuya. Ts (NPC), Date: 20 May, 2015

Reviewed by:  Buyandelger.U (M&E Analyst), Date: 20 May 2015

Cleared by:  Bunchingiv.B (Team leader), Date: 27 May 2015

Approved by:  Thomas Eriksson (DRR), Date: ... 27 May 15

