 **Final Report**


## KUWAIT

### الكــــويت

**Government of Kuwait**

**Outcome Evaluation of Socioeconomic Portfolio of**

**Kuwait Country Programme 2009-2014**

 

**A. F. (Bob) Odeh**

**bob.odeh@gmail.com**

**September 2015**

**Table of Contents**

1. Acronyms and Abbreviation ………………………………………………………………… 3
2. Acknowledgments…………………………………………………………………………….5
3. Executive Summary…………………………………………………………………………...6
4. Introduction…………………………………………………………………………………..11
* Background………………………………………………………………………………11
* Purpose…………………………………………………………………………………...12
1. Evaluation Methodology……………………………………………………………………..12
* Design…………………………………………………………………………………...13
* Evaluation Questions …………………………………………………………………...13
* Data Collection and Analysis………………………………………………………… 14
1. Evaluation Findings-Socio Economic Portfolio……………………………………………..14
* SME Initiative……………………………………………………………………………15

* Woman Empowerment Projects…………………………………………………………16
	+ Woman Economic Empowerment……………………………………………… 16
	+ Woman Rights and Children Access to information…………………………… 16
	+ Woman Research and Studies Center………………………………………….. 17
* Social and Human Development Projects………………………………………………. 18
	+ Dar Al-Athar……………………………………………………………………. 18
	+ Early Learning Disabilities Challenges………………………………………… 18
	+ Engagement with Religious Leaders…………………………………………….18
	+ Long Term National Traffic and Transport Sector Strategy…………………….19
1. Monitoring and Evaluation…………………………………………………………………..20
2. Constraints and Opportunities (Conclusions)………………………………………………..20
3. Lessons learnt……………………………………………………………………………….. 21
4. Recommendations……………………………………………………………………………22

List of Annexes………………………………………………………………..............................25

 **I. Acronyms and Abbreviations**

AWP Annual Work Plan

CAWTAR Centre for Arab Women Training and Research

CO Country Office

CP Country Programme

CPAP Country Programme Action Plan

CPD Country Programme Document

CSR Corporate Social Responsibility

DRR Deputy Resident Representative

GIS Geographical Information System

GNI Gross National Income

GNP Gross National Product

GSSCPD General Secretariat of the Supreme Council for Planning and Development

ICT Information and Communications Technology

ILO International Labour Organization

IOM International Organization for Migration

IT Information Technology

KISR Kuwait Institute for Scientific Research

M&E Monitoring and Evaluation

MDG Millennium Development Goals

MDGR Millennium Development Goals Report

MfDR Management for Development Results

MoE Ministry of Education

MoFA Ministry of Foreign Affairs

MoH Ministry of Health

MoSD Ministry of Social Development

MTR Mid-term Review

NCC Net Contributing Country

NIM National Implementation Modality

NGO Non-governmental Organisation

NHDR National Human Development Report

OECD [Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development](http://www.oecd.org/)

PM Prime Minister

RBAS Regional Bureau for Arab States

RBM Results Based Management

ROAR Results Oriented Annual Report

RR Resident Representative

SBAA Standard Basic Assistance Agreement

SMART Specific, measurable, achievable, relevant and time-bounded

SME Small- and Medium-sized Enterprises

TOR Terms of Reference

UN United Nations

UNCT United Nations Country Team

UNDP United Nations Development Programme

UNHCR United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

UN HABIAT United Nations Human Settlements Programme

UNRC United Nations Resident Coordinator

UN Women United Nations Entity for Gender and the Empowerment of Women

WB World Bank

**II. Acknowledgements**

Thanks to all those who generously offered their time, reflections and experiences to this outcome evaluation process – UNDP CO staff, GSSCPD officials and stakeholders. The mission is grateful for your thoughtful engagement, despite your heavy workloads during the review period. The mission is particularly appreciative of the generosity, spirit of openness, and trust in readily confiding in this outcome evaluation mission and the transparency with which UNDP CO, GSSCPD and their partners participated in the evaluation process.

The mission is mindful that despite its best efforts, it may fall short of capturing the depth, diversity and richness of reflections and discussions which characterized the evaluation process. The mission asks for your forbearance, taking full responsibility for any inaccuracies and shortcomings in the report. While it marks the end of the evaluation process as such, it should not be viewed as a final product, but as one piece of “work in progress” – the ongoing and dynamic process of dialogue, reflection and learning in which UNDP CO Kuwait and its partners have engaged over the past several years and which will continue well beyond the final draft of this report. It has been my privilege to be an active partner of this process for a brief period of time. I emerge both humbled and inspired by the work of UNDP Kuwait, GSSCPD and their partners in the face of countless obstacles and creative challenges.

I extend special thanks to Dr. Mubashar Riaz Sheikh, UNRC/UNDP RR, and Ms. Dima Al-Khatib, DRR, for their insight and guidance when presenting my initial findings. I am also particularly appreciative of Mrs. Sahar Shawa, Head, Gender and Social Development Program, for being my continuous counterpart, facilitating the evaluation process all through.

The evaluation benefited tremendously from the extensive discussions and interactions with GSSCPD who provided comprehensive snap shot on the whole socio economic profile, particularly, the projects on women empowerment and human and social development. Sincere appreciation is here extended to Ms. Nerjis Mahmoud, Head, Coordination and Follow Up, and Ms. Rabab Mirza, Head, Applications and Studies, GSSCPD Technical Cooperation Department.

To all, I wish to convey sincere gratitude.

**III. Executive Summary**

In line with UNDP evaluation policy, this outcome evaluation aims to provide an independent and impartial report on the overall contribution of the socioeconomic portfolio towards achieving the outcomes of the third CPD 2009-2014. UNDP CO Kuwait and its Government partner GSSCPD, expect this evaluation to provide a comprehensive overall assessment of the relevance, efficiency, effectiveness and sustainability of the socioeconomic portfolio, as well as the issues and constraints faced in its implementation.

Guided by its TOR (Annex 1 attached), the scope of the evaluation focused on eight projects within the socio-economic portfolio. Three projects related to women empowerment, being WRACATI, WRSC, and WEE. Four projects dealing with human and social development, namely, ELDS, Religious Leaders, DAI, and Traffic. The SME initiative is not yet a project, but has already got approved in legislation.

The evaluation is based on desk review of key documents, face to face interviews with key informants, field visits to some projects, meetings with UNDP CO staff and main national counterparts. Meetings and discussions explored issues related to the efficiency and effectiveness of program implementation, the validity and relevance of the interventions; particularly, overall contribution to sustainability, and lessons learnt for deriving and applying best practices in the new CPD 2015-2018.

Preliminary findings indicate that only few projects, within the socioeconomic portfolio, have produced substantial results, in order to be considered successful, albeit in varying degrees in achieving results at the outcome level from their respective outputs. WEE project shines out as one of the success stories, with no obstacles faced in implementation, as attested by the national stakeholder. The CO, however, might disagree with this assessment. It is up to the main stakeholders to resolve their varying views. The other projects do not appear to fit in line with the Strategic National Development Plan. Projects ended with no evaluation as to sustainability or results (if any) achieved. Limited diligence was paid to the proper monitoring and evaluation undertaken vis-à-vis each project. Work plans and reporting, however, did take place by the CO as components of monitoring. It was also explained to the consultant that the CO is in the process of building the capacity of its staff in M&E via training workshops, in addition to retaining a M&E specialist in house. Projects were erroneously judged by amounts spent, with no regard to results achieved. Most stakeholders seem to have a mindset that projects should go on and on, from one CPD to another, with no sunset. The consultant pointed out that to keep projects perpetually renewed would be institutionalizing them, contrary to CPD strategic approach of achieving results, and moving on. For example, WSRC project has now moved on to be an institution within Kuwait University. That is fine, but there should be no a priori expectations from continuous funding from the CPD financial envelope.

Notwithstanding the above concern, it is fair to note that projects have come in at a difficult time in terms of their implementation, the frequent changes in government institutions, in terms of dissolving the Parliament three times since 2012, and four new Council of Ministers, with the constant staff changes in the public sector. There were also other constant changes that may have caused at times delays and disruption in communication between partners. UNDP has also some internal dynamics related to the changes of its senior staff being on rather short tenures. Such changes, no matter where they occur, may result with negative impact to UNDP operations, and the learning curve of all concerned. This point is noted as a concern and not necessarily as criticism.

The findings of this evaluation will hopefully contribute to furthering UNDP knowledge in results oriented programming by providing baselines from which to initiate broader program development through joint partnership of GSSCPD Kuwait vision on one side, and UNDP CPD 2015-2018 on the other side. This will be continuation of the significant change management process that UNDP has started undertaking when drafting the new CPD to support a program approach with a focus on upstream results based on lessons learnt from downstream interventions.

The report came up with a dozen lessons learnt for best practices and some two dozens of recommendations related to the two components of the socioeconomic portfolio, namely; women empowerment and human and social development. These two components are strategic and should be included in the new CPD. They could further be delineated, as pointed out by the stakeholders of the women empowerment projects, to include specific issues, such as combating female violence, and extending services for female and young girls victims of violence, be it domestic (inside the house by family members) and/or outside in the society at large.

This outcome evaluation of the socio economic portfolio of CPD 2009-2014 comes at the tail end of other evaluations that preceded it and covered all of CPD portfolios. This outcome evaluation does not attempt to re-invent the wheel, by simply reiterating the conclusions and recommendations of previous reviews. As such, this outcome evaluation has benefited and took into consideration the findings of the other reviews, without getting pre-empted by these findings, but hopefully will still have a value added by emphasizing the need for monitoring and evaluation framework and other RBM tools that could constructively be deployed into the evolving process in progress promulgating CPD 2015-2018.

The final evaluation of UNDP Kuwait Country Programme 2009-2014 has preceded this outcome evaluation in a relatively recent period of less than two years (November 2013). It has amply covered the whole CPD, including the socioeconomic portfolio of projects relevant to this outcome evaluation. The findings of that final evaluation elaborated on the portfolio’s relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability, partnership building, including Office Structure and Management Arrangements. Instead of reiterating the same findings, this outcome evaluation has attempted to supplement them, by a value added to each project in the socioeconomic portfolio.

The extent to which the current global changes, particularly the rise of the knowledge economy, and the wide use of cyber technology present constraints or opportunities to Kuwait calls for the GSSCPD to harness these challenging global dynamics into the Kuwait of the future, as envisaged in the State for Kuwait 2035 vision.

The 2035 vision calls for Kuwait to become a financial and trade center, attractive to investors where the private sector leads the economy. It is not unrealistic to believe that the vision will indeed be a reality, through pragmatically orchestrated series of CPDs, albeit fine tuning of the CPD thrust periodically per the global expected and unexpected changes of the day.

**Key Words:** outcome evaluation, socioeconomic portfolio, women empowerment, gender equity, capacity building, small and medium enterprise, RBM, MfDR, performance indicators, sustainable development, UNDP Kuwait, GSSCPD.

**1. Introduction**

The outcome evaluation of the socioeconomic portfolio of UNDP CPD 2009-2014 is in response to the intention of GSSCPD and UNDP to conduct an independent evaluation that can provide a comprehensive overall assessment of the: (a) relevance, (b) efficiency, (c) effectiveness and (d) sustainability of the projects in that portfolio. The evaluation will also address the issues and constraints faced during implementation, in accordance with the specific TORs (Annex 1 attached).

The outcome evaluation presented in this report has been drafted by a senior international consultant (Evaluator Bio Note, Annex 9). The mission consultant visited Kuwait during the period 23 August to 10 September 2015. During that period, the consultant met with key stakeholders, particularly, UNDP Kuwait Country Office, and GSSCPD, and visited a number of projects (See Annex 6). National coordination was capably and efficiently facilitated by UNDP staff from the Country Office, who collectively played the role of “shadow” local consultant, under challenging circumstances.

**Background**

The evaluation of the socioeconomic portfolio of the UNDP Kuwait Country Program 2009-2014 assesses the results of the program by considering the following elements as identified in the TOR (Annex 1 attached):

* To review, evaluate projects per their achievements, effectiveness, efficiency, impact, timeliness, and sustainability;
* Meet and discuss with relevant project team, UNDP and relevant stakeholders the project results, impact and challenges;
* Propose recommendations and corrective actions to UNDP and GSSCPD with regards to the management of the project, its continuity and orientations;
* Level of incurred changes; enabling environment, organizational and individual change;
* UNDP strategic positioning on achieving the outcomes;
* Relevance of the outcomes and outputs;
* Partnership strategy; and,
* Sustainability: where there is ownership and capacity to maintain and manage development in the outcomes.

**Purpose**

The purpose of this evaluation is to assess the relevance and effectiveness of UNDP strategy in achieving outcomes related to the socioeconomic portfolio of CPD 2009-2014.

The scope of the evaluation is to assess the overall progress and relevance of UNDP strategy in achieving the outcomes and provide concrete recommendations for stakeholders’ cooperation. The assessment will examine the impact of previous interventions; identify factors in the development context hindering or accelerating performance. The evaluation will underscore the significant political, social, and economic challenges to UNDP’s efforts and identify lessons learnt for best practices to drive future interventions under a program framework.

**2. Evaluation Methodology**

The evaluation is based on UNDP Results Based Management system in assessing progress towards outcomes and beyond that to impact and how results contribute, together with the assistance of partners, to a change in development conditions leading to sustainability. In that sense, outcome evaluations have shifted away from the classical approach of assessing project results against set project objectives towards impact of results on overall sustainable development and empowerment of men and women to optimize their capacities. Therefore, a number of variables beyond projects need to be considered by the evaluation. The evaluation must provide evidence-based information that is credible, reliable, and useful, making it easy to understand by UNDP partners.

**Design**

Outcome evaluation, unlike project evaluation, does not require collecting volumes of primary data, but rather follows methodological approaches in assessing quantitative and qualitative data. The path of the evaluation starts with the outcome and works backwards, analyzes factors contributing to progress and then assesses UNDP and its partners’ contributions. The evaluation considers, to the extent possible, the relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, the degree of change and sustainability of outputs and results.

This evaluation is future oriented, conducted in a dynamic setting, to assess snap shots of comparatively static situation of projects that have already been completed. As such, the evaluation is like examining a picture in detail, then viewing a film made of many pictures. This is in line with the quantum shift that outcome evaluations have moved away from the limited old approach of assessing project results against project objectives towards an assessment of how these results contribute to a change in development conditions.

 **Evaluation Questions**

Guided by the evaluation matrix (Annex 7 attached), the evaluation, informally and in a collegial manner, tabled the following questions (Annex 8 attached) to each project focal point, and/or stakeholder, to determine the relevance of UNDP’s interventions and strategy in achieving progress towards results:

1. Summary of project.
2. Was the project successful, if yes, why, if not, why not?
3. How and where the project fits into the fabric of CPD 2009-2014
4. Did the project meet any obstacles and/or constraints in implementation?
5. Should the project be show cased as success story and lesson learnt for best practices?
6. How helpful was UNDP in achieving the objectives of the project.
7. What else should UNDP do or can do to further ensure achieving the desired outcome of the project.

Replies to the above questions, and the summary of the discussions, as shown in the evaluation findings below, covered the following areas:

* Validity and relevance of interventions to the overall socioeconomic portfolio
* Contributions of interventions in strengthening responsive socioeconomic institutions
* How the performance of socioeconomic institutions was strengthened in areas of responsiveness, particularly in promoting women empowerment and private sector
* How the program design, implementation and monitoring addressed crosscutting themes of specific needs of different populations, capacity development, youth, transparency and integrity
* Areas in which gender sensitive approaches were considered
* Lessons learnt for future best practices applications
* **Data Collection and Analysis**

The analysis results from discussions with key stakeholders examining their perceptions of phenomena, a comprehensive desk review of key documents (attached in Annex 3) and observations during field visits to projects’ venues. Data used as existed, as there was no time or scope to venture into new data, in the absence of a national consultant who would normally have been relegated to that role. This did not dilute from the depth of the evaluation, as the existing data was sufficiently ample to probe into relevance and impact of projects under examination.

**3. Evaluation Findings – Socio Economic Portfolio**

 The eight projects within the socio economic portfolio have produced some results, albeit absence in most cases of base line data and target indicators. Based on the desk review and field visits, they do not appear to be structured to support the Strategic National Development Plan.

Within the area of Human and Social Development, the three key areas for Kuwait are: women empowerment, capacity building, and civil society partnerships. These orientations should figure prominently in the new CPD 2015-2018.

Women empowerment continues to be a relevant strategic intervention, particularly in terms of improving the legal framework to empowerment and advancing further the existing legislation, conceptualizing draft laws, with input from WRACATI (Waraqati proposal). Support should also be given to various NGOs and CSOs involved in women’s issues, particularly, CEDAW implementation for improving the existing services dealing with violence against women.

While the Traffic strategy is another relevant strategic orientation, it needs to be coupled by an awareness campaign of safe driving habits and due respect of traffic regulations.

The projects in the socioeconomic portfolio have come in a difficult time in terms of their implementation, the political instability, and the constant changes in the public sector. UNDP had also some internal dynamics related to the changes to senior management short tenures.

**Socioeconomic Portfolio Overview**

A brief synopsis of each project within the socioeconomic portfolio illustrates constraints faced, and in some cases opportunities to capture for the new CPD 2015-2018 as follows:

Evaluation findings are in italics, following a brief description of each project.

**SME Draft Law**: The UNDP, in partnership with the Ministry of Trade and Industry, and with support of the Kuwait Economic Society and other business professionals, UNDP Kuwait created the “Proposed SME Law”. The processes to issue the proposed law required meeting with all government and concerned parties including entrepreneurs in Kuwait. The proposed law addresses the challenges and issues to SME development in Kuwait, and discusses possible legal interventions.

***Now that the SME draft legislation has just become a law, financing mechanisms have to get in place to provide loans and grants for small and medium enterprises. It is too early to evaluate the impact of the new law.***

**Economic Empowerment of Kuwaiti Women**: The programme aims at contributing to the economic and social development of Kuwait, with a particular focus on empowerment of Kuwaiti women, by addressing the problem of unemployment among women. Unleashing their entrepreneurial potential, the programme will support the establishment and growth of enterprises, owned/managed by women, thereby providing employment opportunities for self and others. In a wider context, the programme will also support the establishment and growth of small and medium enterprises in general in order to generate additional employment opportunities for the people of Kuwait, including youth and men. In doing so, the programme will develop and strengthen national institutional capacities in order to sustain the programme in the long run.

***This project has been successful with no constraints so far, in the national stakeholder view. It is relevant and in line with sources of income generation, other than depending on oil as main revenue source.***

**Promoting Legal Empowerment of Women in the State of Kuwait**

The project aims to promote the advancement of women through legal empowerment. Building on the experience and insights gained during the implementation of the WRACTI initiative (Women’s and Children’s Rights through Access to Information), the project aims to facilitate and provide access to relevant laws and regulations for women and to raise awareness of women’s legal rights among women and key partners as well as the general public. Project activities include the development of relevant legal information in digital format and its dissemination through CDs, website, video and audio radio messages, booklets and telephone hotlines as well as through other means. The project also aims to strengthen women’s support mechanisms in order to reinforce their capacity to better access legal information through ICT and to use this information effectively in directing and counselling women. This will be achieved through the training of key stakeholders, in particular representatives from civil society organizations, legal professionals, journalists and MPs in the use of the legal information. A media campaign will ensure that awareness of women’s legal rights among women, key partners and the general public is enhanced.

***Proliferation of projects related to women empowerment calls for collaboration among these projects, and possibly presenting them all in one common project of establishing data base about Kuwait women implemented by Kuwait University Women Research and Studies Centre, described below.***

**Establishment of the Women Research and Studies Center**: This project aspires to establish and build the technical capacity of the Women Research and Studies Centre (WRSC) for the benefit of students, statisticians, researchers and other academics including policy-makers and civil society organizations. The WRSC will be equipped with a state-of-the-art digital database housing all the information and data relating to women in Kuwait and will be disseminated on the internet to ensure its ubiquity for ease of access. The WRSC will also provide a forum for local and regional institutions dealing with women related issues to share resources and seek knowledge and advice through networking and capacity development initiatives provided by the centre. It is envisaged that the WRSC through these interventions will play a big role in contributing to achieving the national outcome relating to enhancing and expanding the scope of women's participation in economic activities, political decision-making, and gender equality, in consistency with national plans and the long-term strategic vision to support attainment of MDG3.

***The project has yet to prove its sustainability. It has value added to keep women issues upfront. The project is constrained by drying up of funding sources. In order to optimize the scarce funding sources, the project should consider establishing virtual networks (on the screen) catering to various aspects of women issues. Network membership need not be limited to Kuwait gender balance specialists, but branch out to other Gulf countries to cover the whole Arab region. UNDP offices in Gulf countries and the RBAS can deploy human resources to set up the networks.***

**Social and Human Development Projects**

**Dar Al-Athar Al-Islamiyah**: This project is a continuing project for the preservation and display of selected artifacts from the Dar Al-Athar Al-Islamiyah (DAI) collection at the Kuwait National Museum. The objectives of the project are to train Kuwaitis to become professional museum and laboratories employees working to international standards.

***The project has been ongoing for some twenty –three years, being implemented by the same mechanism and with the same outcome. In response to UNDP South-South Cooperation, DAI is giving consideration to the prospect of becoming a recognized Centre of Excellence. The proposal is still in the drafting stage.***

**Early Learning Disabilities and Challenges**: The aims of this Program are to remove barriers to inclusion of individuals with disabilities in Kuwait, to empower persons with disabilities in Kuwait to achieve their full potentials and to enable them to fully contribute to the society in which they form a part. This Program, therefore, compliments the efforts of the Government of Kuwait to include persons with disabilities in the society in line with its international commitments and obligations specified in the United Nations’ International Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities which Kuwait signed in 2009.

***The total reliance on the expert, as expressed with concern by the national stakeholder, has substantially reduced the transfer of knowledge to national involved in the project. This unacceptable situation can be reversed by clearly stipulating that transfer of knowledge to nationals is a critical requirement of the expert.***

**Promotion of inclusive and sustainable development through engagement with Religious Leaders Project**

The project was implemented with the Ministry of Awqaf and Religious Affairs. This project aims at increasing the capacity of religious leaders to contribute to a positive social dialogue on human rights and inclusive development in all aspects of life through: 1. Providing a platform for religious leaders to explore developmental and human rights challenges in Kuwait and develop a more comprehensive understanding of the need to address these challenges in all aspects of life; 2. Increasing awareness of the inherent harmony between the core principles of religion and the human rights based approach to development; 3. Identification of a core group of religious leaders committed to promoting inclusive development principles and build their capacity to serve as community educators among their peers and the public; 4. Production of materials, including a training manual, documentary film and educational toolkits on the issues to be covered in the training sessions.

***The Ministry has now a department that continues to engage with the thirty religious leaders identified as a core group of community educators among their peers and the public.***

**Implementation of the Comprehensive and Long Term National Traffic and Transport Sector Strategy for Kuwait**:

The project aims to 1. Build a national integrated road safety information system (NIRSIS) which will enable the gathering and analysis of road accidents data, traffic features, geographical information, and related issues, to provide decision makers and practitioners with reliable data for efficient policy development and implementation schemes; 2. Establish national accident black spot system, to facilitate identification and treatment of frequent road accident locations to minimize the social and economic cost; and 3. Develop capacity building and human resources development program which will provide training and better skills, to strengthen institutional performance, learning and transfer of modern techniques and improve ability to implement work plans efficiently. The project will improve planning and design process; reduce the severity, frequency, and cost of road accidents to the community; alleviate congestion; optimize movement of people and goods; enhance public transport service; strengthen law enforcement; and contribute to the reduction of gasses which contribute to climate change.

***The project was not implemented according to plan, due to a number of constraints, some of which are management changes on the part of the implementing agency, and the lack of meeting the needs of the project in terms of equipment.***

***Also, for such project to achieve its objective of safe traffic movement, it needs an awareness campaign addressed to the driver regarding observing rules and regulations in place.***

**4. Monitoring and Evaluation**

An effective M&E system depends on the factors included in the planning stage, and particularly, the inclusion of baseline data and SMART objectives. Given UNDP unique role and comparative advantage as neutral advocate with no agenda of its own other than the national program, the impact of UNDP interventions should be included under indicators.

UNDP has developed a project planning, reporting, monitoring and evaluation manual that includes guidelines to help ensure results based management throughout the program cycle. The manual also includes a check list for quality programming that establishes the procedures to be followed by stakeholders and project managers. The checklist identifies fifteen areas for review prior to approval of any program intervention. This check list includes factors related to the stakeholder participation, governance, gender equity, capacity development, sustainability and results orientation. The results orientation component requires adequate base line data, indicators, benchmarks, measurements and M&E mechanism.

As already suggested by the previous CPD 2009-2013 evaluation, UNDP CO has now started to scale down on its project approach and move towards strategic programming approach, evidenced in CPD 2015-2018. Strategic interventions focusing on programme approach, integrating results based management, would replace the fragmented project approach.

**5. Conclusions**

Human and social development, women empowerment and private sector development are the three areas of focus for this outcome evaluation, as stated in its TOR. The conclusions presented are based on assessment areas covering eight projects in the three areas in accordance with the criteria in Section 2 of the evaluation report entitled Evaluation Methodology, particularly evaluation questions. The evaluation explored progress towards achievement of outcomes through outputs, in a systematic and programmatic manner. Guided by an evaluation matrix (Annex 7), questions were addressed to each project in a progressive manner to arrive at the impact of these projects. The questions were simple, clear, and specific in their point of entry to assess how results contribute to a change in development conditions.

Outcome evaluation is not rocket science or brain surgery. But a probe into project impacts on overall sustainable development by using elementary logical sequencing assessment to provide evidence-based information that is credible, reliable, and useful. It must be easily understood and readily compelling to UNDP staff and all partners in development cooperation. Evaluation, as such, is after all a judgement made of relevance and appropriateness, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and – most importantly – sustainability of development efforts, based on set criteria and bench marks among key partners and stakeholders.

**6. Lessons Learnt for Best Practices**

* One of the key lessons learnt from enhancing the development of efficient and accountable institutions aiming at strengthening inclusive participation is the case of WEE project, particularly it off shoot Boutique 33. The project was successful with no obstacles, as GSSCPD attests. Major lesson learnt from this is that buy-in into an initiative, micro or small enterprise, ensures commitment to the success of the project and commitment to implementation.
* Ownership and buy-in of end users should be sought from the pre-planning stage. This involves the end users to identify appropriate projects relevant to their interests and capabilities.
* Proliferation of ad hoc assignments by all sides during CPD 2009-2014 led to mismatch between UNDP country program and real needs of stakeholders.
* Sunset approach to projects life cycle should be adhered to; projects cannot continue endlessly, as is the case in DAI project that has been running for twenty-three years with the same implementation and same objectives.
* Independent evaluation is a must at the mid-term and at the end of the project, in order to assess results achieved, and establish whether or not a project should be renewed. It is human nature, that a manager would want a project renewed. Thus, the need for independent evaluation is undertaken.
* Where other things are equal, appointments for casual, short term, and at times permanent appointments, preference should be given to underrepresented segments of civil society, women, young girls, physically and mentally challenged individuals, and the elderly, with due regard to the merit principle.
* Advocacy approach should be deployed, as the Traffic project adopted successfully. This approach should be deployed in UNDP instead of the classical communication approach which at best results with humble impacts.
* Useful to strike a balance between the need for appropriate contracting modality for project managers and the time horizon and budget allocation of a project. A stable context of work contributes to high productivity.

These are some of the lessons learnt derived from the outcome evaluation. The majority of lessons learnt fall in the category of doing better on a job well done, to the credit and credibility of the UNDP Kuwait program.

**7. Recommendations**

Based on the findings of the evaluation embodied in assessing eight projects in the socioeconomic portfolio of CCF 2009-2014, the following are some salient recommendations for consideration when polishing the new CCF 2015-2018:

* UNDP should continue to build partnerships with civil society organizations to work within the social fabric of Kuwait at large.
* A gender equity strategy will re-enforce the family system, while at the same time, addressing the needs of women during different life stages, pre and post fertility, social isolation, and the needs of women without male partners (the equivalent of single mothers in Western societies.
* Do not forget the local NGO sector and local civil society organizations, as well as academia and development think tanks.
* When all said and done, the private sector is the main engine of growth for sustainable development. The SME initiative is a step in the right direction.
* UNDP should support moving Kuwait into the knowledge global economy, in addition to its development efforts in the other portfolios within the CPD.
* UNDP has recently taken a visionary and innovative approach to building a communication culture, within its own ranks, internally and externally with its donor partners for furthering the goals and objectives of its strategic interventions. It is recommended that UNDP transform its communication strategy from one built on traditional passive public relations role, to one embracing strategic and affirmative communication.
* UNDP Kuwait should adopt and internalize UNDP Corporate Results Based Management, which is still in the early stages. Major achievements have been realized in the creation of comprehensive databases. Because the RBM is relatively new to most staff, it is important that program advisors ensure that the SMART criteria are included in the planning stage to support and effective M&E system.
* UNDP should steer away from dispersed, ad hoc assignments, but most of its support be provided within the framework of specific, and target driven programs, to ensure sustainability.
* Formulating the next CPD/CPAP should include broad consultation with line ministries, and be in harmony with the Development Plan for the State of Kuwait at various levels.
* CPD 2015-2018 should be conceptualized on the basis of a solid and harmonized structure, embodying impacts, outcomes, outputs and activities, accompanied by sets of indicators for monitoring and follow-up relevant to outcomes and outputs, with defined baseline data and targets for indicators.
* UNDP support should be centered within the framework of specific, results oriented programs, and not in the form of dispersed ad hoc assignments.
* The new CPD should be based on crystal clear understanding of the respective roles of the partners involved; UNDP, implementing side, and the executing partner.
* UNDP should focus more on getting involved in upstream activities, so that it can provide advice to policy makers on strategic development issues.
* A proactive approach should complement and outweigh the reactive and responsive role to the demands of government agencies. A programme oriented approach will be translated into a set of coherent and mutually supportive activities.
* Relevant UN agencies should be associated, along with UNDP, in the process of preparing the new CPD.
* Experts and consultants should be subject to full scrutiny in a transparent manner, so that those who are selected and eventually recruited would be made aware and fully agree with their conditions of employment before signing their respective contracts.
* Capacity development and update of the skills and applied knowledge of GSSCPD staff and those of beneficiary agencies should always be upgraded, particularly in the area of M&E and RBM.
* Joint training of UNDP staff with their counterparts at GSSCPD and beneficiary agencies would lead to increasing the effectiveness in managing the project cycle, in addition to enhanced cooperation.
* Documentation of project implementation should be always available electronically, with frequent updates, to stakeholders involved in that particular project.
* Mid-term evaluation by a tripartite committee should be undertaken for each project, coupled with a terminal evaluation.
* Periodic tracer studies for some completed projects would ensure that lessons learnt and the experience gained is deployed for the benefit of new projects or initiatives. Reports should be posted on UNDP Kuwait website. Tracer studies are a form of post evaluation of projects and are conducted for projects that have long been completed to track if the outcome of the project was sustained.
* The new CPD should expand on partnering with CSO and NGOs wherever it is possible.
* UNDP CO should enhance advocacy for increased political participation, for an increased and diversified role of civil societies, and engaging the private sector institutions.

**List of Annexes**

Annex 1 Terms of Reference……………………………………………………………..........26

Annex 2 List of Officials Met………………………………………………………………….38

Annex 3 Documents Reviewed ………………………………………………………………..41

Annex 4 Socioeconomic Project Profiles………………………………………………………45

Annex 5 Socioeconomic Project Portfolio (Arabic)……………………………………………48

Annex 6 Summary Records of Meetings and Interviews………………………………………55

Annex 7 Evaluation Matrix –Guiding Road Map………………………………………………59

Annex 8 Questionnaire for Project Focal Points and Stakeholders…………………………….63

Annex 9 Evaluator Bio Note……………………………………………………………………64

**Annex 1**

**Terms of Reference**

Socioeconomic Portfolio Outcome Evaluation

Independent Outcome Evaluation for the “Social and Economic Portfolio”

Location: Kuwait

Application Deadline: June 20, 2015

Additional Category Planning and development

Type of Contract : Government Contract

Post Level : International Consultant

Languages Required : English

Starting Date: July 1, 2015

Duration of Initial Contract : 1 month

Expected Duration of Assignment : 1 month

Brief and Program Context

Kuwait’s commitment to sustainable Economic growth and employment is of particular importance in the light of its dependence on oil production. Diversification away from oil revenue is the challenge of the Kuwaiti government. Addressing these issues, the Kuwaiti government is empowering the private sector and the SME sector to enable them to become the leaders in driving Kuwait diversification strategy and lead the economy to more sustainable means.

Kuwaiti SMEs can play a major role in the economic diversification and the enabling of the private sector. Even Larger, is the role of the private sector in the economy, the less depended it becomes on oil and thus government as the source for economic growth and employment. Successful SMEs can also contribute positively to gender and social inclusion, human rights and environmental sustainability. The nature of economic change will have a great impact on income and equality. It is needless to say that the two will have strong bearing on social development and transformation. Improvement in the living condition as a result of economic and social transformations will protect the environment.

In 2010 Kuwait Parliament passed the national development plan 2009-2013 law. (SPC, 2009). The Plan has a state vision for Kuwait 2035 to become “..a financial and trade center, attractive to investors where the private sector leads the economy, …”[[1]](#footnote-1) Main objectives of the plan were: Economic diversification, reviving the role of the private sector and supporting human and social developments. The plan outlined several economic policies to enhance economic growth, support and expand the role of the private sector, diversify the production base, developing the infrastructure and development of public finance policies. The Plan also has a set of policies for human and social development: these policies relate to balancing population, labor, education, health, social development and environment.

UNDP is working in parallel with the Kuwaiti government and our counterpart the General Secretariat of the Supreme Council for planning and Development (GSSCPD)to address its issues. The social and economic portfolios have established multiple projects to support the Kuwaiti government, and have established connections with many ministries, authorities and NGOs.

The oil sector contributed KD 32.2 billion to Kuwait’s Gross Domestic Product in 2012 that is about 63% of the total GDP of KD 51.2 billion. With increase in production and prices, Oil revenues continued to rise: from KD 8.17 billion in 2004/5 KD 28.570 billion in 2011/12. On the other hand government expenditure followed the same pace; it increased from KD 6.31 billion to 17.0 billion in the same periods. (IMF, 2013). Kuwait is increasing its reliance on oil where all economic indicators and strategies placed are suggesting diversifying away from it.

Wages and salaries have been increasing at an alarming rate and account for a good portion of the government’s expenditure. In the 2004/2005 budget it amounted to KD 2.732 billion and increased to KD 4.718 billion in 2009/2010 almost doubling in 5 years. As long as the government remains the major employer for Kuwaitis who are increasing by an annual growth rate of 3%, it is expected that wages and salaries will continue to increase. With this backdrop, Kuwait still faces several Social challenges such as alarming rate on subsidies expenditures, which includes Kuwait Labor Support in the Private sector, increased from KD 1.5 billion in 2001/2002 to KD 3.3 Billion in 2009/2010. Kuwaiti labor support is included in the government subsidies. Source (MOF, 2011). The Social portfolio at the UNDP is addressing the Social impact of Kuwait’s challenges.

The favorable circumstances of rapid economic growth in the Kuwaiti economy, and prevailing globalization and transnational linkages have been increasingly affecting all areas of human life in the State of Kuwait. These global processes gave rise to major social transformations in the country, as they did throughout the world. From a policy perspective, paying close attention to social transformations that inevitably accompany growth and globalization can be very insightful as policy-makers seek ways to promote sustainable development. Nowadays, the principal goals of development can no longer be defined in terms of just economic growth and few other indicators on prosperity and average living standards. Development plans, policies, programmes, initiatives, and interventions would not be effective if both the symptoms and the causes of social transformation deficiencies are not encompassed in them. Their impact and effectiveness are likely to be undermined by the absence of the social transformation dimension.

The State of Kuwait also has given its greatest attention to the human element with a focus on promoting social advancement and well-being. As it reports on progress achieved in realizing the MDGs, and according to the 2010 UNDP “State of Kuwait, The Millennium Development Goals Progress Report”, progress seems to be on track on a number of goals. In fact, three goals are assessed to have already been achieved (goals 1, 4, and 8). In relation to the goal in direct connection with social transformation (Goal 3: Promoting Gender Equality and Empowering Women), while the report indicates that this goal “can be achieved”, it still highlights “the fact that the eventual achievement of the country in this respect is highly sensitive to the dynamics of the political process in the given cultural context of Kuwait”.

Kuwait falls in the “high human development category”—positioning the country at 54 out of 187 countries and territories) with HDI value for 2012 is 0.790. The State of Kuwait assumes primary responsibility for the welfare of its citizens. Kuwaiti citizens are provided a wide range of generous services and welfare programs with weak “efficiency boosters”, which in turn contributes to the prevalent widespread social attitude of amplified dependency by the citizen on the state as opposed to an enabling attitude.

Progress is being made towards the empowerment of women and the reduction of the gender gap. Kuwaiti women constitute more than half of the Kuwaiti ‘national’ population. The 2012 Global Gender Gap Report compiled by the World Economic Forum ranks Kuwait in the 109th position in the world in terms of the global gender gap index. Still, Women in Kuwait are gradually attaining more rights. Since 2005, it has become customary for the government to have at least one female minister. Women have been elected regularly into the Kuwaiti parliament since 2009. With the educational opportunities that the government makes available, women have been able to pursue their studies to high levels. Data from the Ministry of Higher Education show that over 70% of the students at the tertiary level are females. However, in the job market, the career advancement for women remains significantly slower than that of males, with only a limited number of female civil servants occupy leadership positions in the Civil Service. On the other hand, and with respect to the private sector, changes in the Kuwait society have yielded a number of female entrepreneurs who are slowly changing the image of the Kuwaiti women to one of successful entrepreneurs.

Despite the generous budget allocation to the education sector (about 13% of the total Government budget, according the World Bank Data), the quality of education has not been properly oriented towards the needs of the labor market, and is not yet up to international standards in terms of empowering and enabling graduates to allow them to develop a strong consciousness of the value of excelling in the job, the virtue of proficient contributions to the society, and the merit of the practice of volunteerism.

The state of Kuwait plays a leading role amongst Arab states in terms of awareness, advocacy and recognition of disabilities and inclusion. The country has a “Disability Law” and a council “The Higher Council for the Disabled Affairs (HCDA)” that provides a range of benefits to registered persons with disabilities.

The Kuwaiti society enjoys a relatively well developed civil society comprising of trade unions, women’s organizations, cultural and diverse professional associations. These groups regularly engage in the political process and in debates about corporate social responsibility initiatives however many of these continue to scatter their efforts in multiple activities without a strong strategic focus or specialization.

The extent of youth civic participation in driving development is rather weak in spite of the establishment of a Youth Ministry. The lack of civic engagement among young people is in part due to the lack of a comprehensive youth strategy and the reliance on welfare at a young age in a way that does not encourage them to develop the economic and personal skills that they will need to acquire to succeed in a global economy. The spread of the consumerism behavior is clear in Kuwait as people became accustomed to a lifestyle of frequently visiting markets, restaurants and cafes.

Kuwait suffers from numerous traffic problems, due in part to lack of respect to traffic laws, and an inadequate enforcement of these laws, in addition to an infrastructure development that has not put up with an increasing demand for use of road networks and transport services. The 2010 WHO data estimate the road traffic death rate (per 100 000 population) to be 16.5 (compared 4-6 in developed nations). Recent figures provided by the National Traffic and Transport Strategy estimate the “cost of traffic problems” in Kuwait to be 2.7 billion Kuwaiti Dinar per annum (including congestion, accidents and vehicle emissions). Currently, there is a national traffic strategy that was developed to determine the causes, propose suitable solutions, and adopt effective national policies to reduce traffic accidents and congestion.

Within the framework of cooperation between UNDP and the General Secretariat of the Supreme Council for planning and Development (GSSCPD), Social and economic portfolios are transformed in several dedicated outcomes and translated into two active projects aiming to ensure the compliance of public and private institutions in economic and social regulations.

The ministries and authorities in Kuwait mandated with Social and Economic policies are:

* Ministry of Commerce and Industry
* Chamber of Commerce
* Accounting Bureau
* Ministry of Social Affairs and Labor
* Ministry of Education
* Ministry of Health
* Ministry of Interior
* Ministry of Awqaf and Religious Affairs
* Public Authority for People with Disabilities
* Women Affairs Committee
* The Social Development Office
* Kuwait University

The Social and Economic portfolios are currently completing their final year of implementation. The GSSCPD and UNDP are seeking to conduct an independent outcome evaluation which will provide a comprehensive overall assessment of the relevance, efficiency, effectiveness and sustainability of the Socioeconomic Portfolio as well as the issues and constraints facing its implementation.

Purpose of Evaluation:

This outcome evaluation exercise is commissioned by UNDP Kuwait, the evaluation will cover the Socioeconomic portfolio outcomes. The evaluation will assess the impact and over all contribution of the Socioeconomic portfolio toward achieving the CPD outcomes.

The evaluation will:

* Analyze the progress of the project activities, quality of results and impact vis - vis its expected outcomes
* Evaluate the Project management, coordination arrangements Highlight lessons learned in implementation and Project management and identify challenges for eventual corrective measures.
* Generate evidence based findings, conclusions and recommendations regarding the results, challenges, sustainability and cost-effectiveness.
* Analyze the reasons for deviations, if any, from the project goals and outcomes
* Meet with all stakeholders related to the projects under the Environment Portfolio.
* Further reflect on developments brought about by internal or external events and the possible resulting change in priorities
* Review the added value of UNDP support or cooperation with local and government authorities and local civil society actors in achieving the outcomes
* Provide concrete recommendations towards the sustainability of the results.
* Provide recommendations on improving strategies and suggest mechanisms and orientations for new phase of support as part of new CPD (2015-2018).

Portfolio Overview:

The evaluation will assess the impact and contribution of the following projects towards the achieving the Country Program Outcome on the Socioeconomic portfolio.

SME Draft Law: The UNDP, in partnership with the Ministry of Trade and Industry, and with support of the Kuwait Economic Society and other business professionals, UNDP Kuwait created the “Proposed SME Law”. The processes to issue the proposed law required meeting with all government and concerned parties including entrepreneurs in Kuwait. The proposed law addresses the challenges and issues to SME development in Kuwait, and discusses possible legal interventions.

Economic Empowerment of Kuwaiti Women: The programme aims at contributing to the economic and social development of Kuwait, with a particular focus on empowerment of Kuwaiti women, by addressing the problem of unemployment among women. Unleashing their entrepreneurial potential, the programme will support the establishment and growth of enterprises, owned/managed by women, thereby providing employment opportunities for self and others. In a wider context, the programme will also support the establishment and growth of small and medium enterprises in general in order to generate additional employment opportunities for the people of Kuwait, including youth and men. In doing so, the programme will develop and strengthen national institutional capacities in order to sustain the programme in the long run.

Promoting Legal Empowerment of Women in the State of Kuwait (WRCATI): The project aims to promote the advancement of women through legal empowerment. Building on the experience and insights gained during the implementation of the WRACTI initiative (Women’s and Children’s Rights through Access to Information), the project aims to facilitate and provide access to relevant laws and regulations for women and to raise awareness of women’s legal rights among women and key partners as well as the general public. Project activities include the development of relevant legal information in digital format and its dissemination through CDs, website, video and audio radio messages, booklets and telephone hotlines as well as through other means. The project also aims to strengthen women’s support mechanisms in order to reinforce their capacity to better access legal information through ICT and to use this information effectively in directing and counselling women. This will be achieved through the training of key stakeholders, in particular representatives from civil society organizations, legal professionals, journalists and MPs in the use of the legal information. A media campaign will ensure that awareness of women’s legal rights among women, key partners and the general public is enhanced.

Establishment of the Women Research and Studies Center: This project aspires to establish and build the technical capacity of the Women Research and Studies Center (WRSC) for the benefit of students, statisticians, researchers and other academics including policy-makers and civil society organizations. The WRSC will be equipped with a state-of-the-art digital database housing all the information and data relating to women in Kuwait and will be disseminated on the internet to ensure its ubiquity for ease of access. The WRSC will also provide a forum for local and regional institutions dealing with women related issues to share resources and seek knowledge and advice through networking and capacity development initiatives provided by the center. It is envisaged that the WRSC through these interventions will play a big role in contributing to achieving the national outcome relating to enhancing and expanding the scope of women's participation in economic activities, political decision-making, and gender equality, in consistency with national plans and long-term strategic vision to support attainment of MDG3.

Dar Al-Athar Al-Islamiyah: This project is a continuing project for the preservation and display of selected artifacts from the Dar Al-Athar Al-Islamiyyah (DAI) collection at the Kuwait National Museum. The objectives of the project are to train Kuwaitis to become professional museum and laboratories employees working to international standards.

Early Learning Disabilities and Challenges: The aims of this Programme are to remove barriers to inclusion of individuals with disabilities in Kuwait, to empower persons with disabilities in Kuwait to achieve their full potentials and to enable them to fully contribute to the society in which they form a part. This Programme, therefore, compliments the efforts of the Government of Kuwait to include persons with disabilities in the society in line with its international commitments and obligations specified in the United Nations’ International Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities which Kuwait signed in 2009.

Promotion of inclusive and sustainable development through engagement with Religious Leaders Project: The project was implemented with the Ministry of Awqaf and Religious Affairs. This project aims at increasing the capacity of religious leaders to contribute to a positive social dialogue on human rights and inclusive development in all aspects of life through:1. Providing a platform for religious leaders to explore developmental and human rights challenges in Kuwait and develop a more comprehensive understanding of the need to address these challenges in all aspects of life; 2. Increasing awareness of the inherent harmony between the core principles of religion and the human rights based approach to development; 3. Identification of a core group of religious leaders committed to promoting inclusive development principles and build their capacity to serve as community educators among their peers and the public; 4. Production of materials including a training manual, documentary film and educational toolkits on the issues to be covered in the training sessions.

Implementation of the Comprehensive and Long Term National Traffic and Transport Sector Strategy for Kuwait: The project aims to 1. Build a national integrated road safety information system (NIRSIS) which will enable the gathering and analysis of road accidents data, traffic features, geographical information, and related issues, to provide decision makers and practitioners with reliable data for efficient policy development and implementation schemes; 2. Establish national accident black spot system, to facilitate identification and treatment of frequent road accident locations to minimize the social and economic cost; and 3. Develop capacity building and human resources development program which will provide training and better skills, to strengthen institutional performance, learning and transfer of modern techniques and improve ability to implement work plans efficiently. The project will improve planning and design process; reduce the severity, frequency, and cost of road accidents to the community; alleviate congestion; optimize movement of people and goods; enhance public transport service; strengthen law enforcement; and contribute to the reduction of gasses which contribute to climate change.

The evaluator shall consider the following:

* review, evaluate projects under the Socioeconomic Portfolio and its achievements, effectiveness, relevance, efficiency , impact, timeliness, and sustainability:
* Meet and discuss with relevant project team, UNDP and relevant; stakeholders the project results, impacts and challenges;
* Propose recommendation and corrective actions to UNDP and GSSCPD with regards to the management of the project, its continuity and orientations
* Level of incurred changes; enabling environment, organizational and or individual change
* UNDP strategic positioning on achieving the outcomes
* Relevance of the outcomes and outputs
* Partnership strategy
* Sustainability: where there is ownership and capacity to maintain and manage development in the outcomes

The outcome evaluation should address, but not be limited to, the following questions and issues:

* Are the outcomes and associated project relevant, appropriate and strategic to the national goals and the UNDP mandate?
* Where the actions to achieve the outputs and outcomes effective and efficient?
* Where there multi-level interventions conducted (environment, organization, individual) how many?
* Are the outcomes and outputs leading to the benefits beyond the life of the project?
* Which findings may have relevance for eventual adjustments and /or future programing?
* What is the current status and prospects for achieving the outcome with the indicated inputs and within the indicated time frame?
* What are the main factors (positive/negative) within and beyond UNDP’s interventions that affected or are affecting the achievement of the outcome? How has these factors limited or facilitated progress towards the outcome?
* Were UNDP’s proposed contributions to the achievement of the outcome appropriate, sufficient, effective and sustainable?
* Are UNDP’s management structure and working methods appropriate and affective in achieving this outcome?
* What are the key outputs that have been produced by UNDP to contribute to the outcome?
* Are the UNDP outputs relevant to the outcome?
* Are the monitory and evaluation indicator appropriate to link these outputs to the outcome, or is there a need to approve the outcome?

Main partners to be involved in the evaluation are the General Secretariat Of Supreme Council for Planning And Development (GSSCPD) and the Ministry of Social Affairs and Labor, Ministry of Interior, Ministry of Awqaf and Religious Affairs, Kuwait University, Women Cultural and Social Society, and NGOs working with people with disabilities.

Deliverables and schedule:

The evaluator will be expected to produce the following:

* Evaluation Work Plan and Time Frame;
* Inception Report;
* Documented Records of Interviews and Observations with Stakeholders;
* Draft Evaluation Report;
* PowerPoint Presentation of the Draft Evaluation Report; and
* Final Evaluation Report

**Annex 2**

**List of Officials Met**

**UNDP Kuwait Country Office**

Dr. Mubashar Riaz Sheikh UNRC/UNDP RR

Ms. Dima Al-Khatib DRR

Ms. Sahar Shawa Head  Gender and Social Development Programme

Mr. Qaiss Dashti Programme Analyst – Economic Development

Ms. Asmae Aitssi Executive Associate

Mr. Adam Aba-Husain Programme Associate

Ms. Heba Ghuneim Programme Associate

Ms.Kayla Keenan Monitoring and Evaluation Officer

Mr. Marzouq Al-Nusif Programme Associate

Ms. Dalal Alp-Buseiri Procurement Officer

Ms. Nouf Alazmi Administrative Assistant

Mr. Michel Musomba Finance Officer

Mr. Ahmed Gibril Protocol Officer

**UNDP Project Technical Directors**

Dr. S. Jayasseelan GIS Consultant, Traffic Project

Mr. Salem Mohamed Ajmi Traffic Project Team Leader

Dr. Robert Fabri Project Manager, DAI Project

**Supreme Council for Planning & Development**

Ms. Narjess Mahmoud Technical Cooperation Department

Ms. Rabab Mirza Technical Cooperation Department

Ms. Lulwa Al-Khaled Technical Cooperation Department

**Dar Al-Athar-Al-Islamiyyah**

Roberto Fabri Expert/ Project Manager

**Women’s Cultural and Social Society**

Ms. Lulwa S. Al-Mullla Chairman of the Board

Ms. Ghada Y. Al-Ghanim Board Member

Sheikha Jlaibi Lawyer – Lawyers Association

Ms. Athraa Refai Lawyer – Lawyers Association

Ms. Asmae Al-Ghanem Lawyer – Lawyers Association

Ms. Israa Al-Amiri Lawyer- Lawyers Association

**Women’s Research & Studies Center**

Dr. Lubna Alkazi Director, WRSC

Dr. Fatma Ayyad Professor, College of Social Sciences, KU

Dr. Salwa Al-Jassar Professor, College of Social Sciences, KU

**ELDC Project**

Dr. Samira Al Saad Director, Kuwait Center for Autism

Ms. Faten Al-Badr Centre for Child Evaluation & Teaching

Mr. Mohammed Al-Qatami Kuwait Dyslexia Association

Dr. Gad Elbehari ACK – PM ELDC Project

Dr. Ali Al-Sanousi Public Authority for Disabled

**Persons interviewed by Telephone/Skype**

UNDP Country Office

Ms. Sahar Shawa Head - Gender and Social Development Programme

Ms. Heba Ghuneim Programme Associate

**Annex 3**

**Key Documents Reviewed**

-Technical Assistance Board  - Government of Kuwait; Revised Standard Agreement – 1962.

-United Nations development Programme – Exchange of letters between the Government of Kuwait and the United Nations Development Programme – 19 November 1968.

-Country Programme Action plan between the Government of Kuwait and the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) 2009-2013.

-Country Programme for the State of Kuwait (2008-2012)

-UNDP Country Office Kuwait – Ministry of Planning – Evaluation of the Second Country Cooperation Framework – Rajaa Makharita – Novemner 2006.

-General Secretariat of the Supreme Council for Planning and Development  - Mid Range Development Plan of the State of Kuwait 2009/2010 – 2012/2013.

-UNDP Kuwait ROAR 2012

-Evaluation of the Role of UNDP in the Net Contributor Countries of the Arab Region – Evaluation office, May 2008.

-Second country Cooperation Framework for Kuwait (2002-2006) – United Nations- 2002.

-CPAP Results Resource Framework Matrix

-Kuwait Country Programme Performance Summary – 2008-2012, UNDP Kuwait.

-Vision Kuwait 20135 GSSCPD

-UN Common Strategy 2011 – 2014 – UN Country Team – Kuwait- Office of the UNRC – 2012

-List of certified NGOS in Kuwait

-List of Ministries and Institutions in Kuwait

-Project document: Promotion of inclusive and sustainable development through engagement with religious leaders.

-Project document: Economic Empowerment of Kuwait Women

-Project document: Training for Restoration and Display of the Dar-Al-Athar Al Islamiyah collection at the Kuwait National Museum.

-Project document: Promoting Legal Empowerment of Women in the State of Kuwait

-Project document: Establishment of the Women Research and Studies Center in Kuwait.

-Project document: Early Learning Disability Challenges Programme.

-Project document: National Traffic &Transport Sector Strategy for Kuwait 2009

-Project document: Training for Restoration and Display of the Dar-Al-Ahtar Al Islamiyah collection at the Kuwait National Museum.

-Project Promoting Legal Empowerment of Women in the State of Kuwait

-Project of Economic Empowerment of Kuwaiti Women; Annual Work plan 2012

-Project of Economic Empowerment of Kuwaiti Women; Power point EEW project – Arabic

-Project Training for Restoration and Display of the Dar-Al-Athar Al Islamiyah collection at the Kuwait National Museum; 2013 Yearly work plan presentation

-Project Training for Restoration and Display of the Dar-Al-Athar Al Islamiyah collection at the Kuwait National Museum; Board meeting presentation May 2013.

-Project Training for Restoration and Display of the Dar-Al-Athar Al Islamiyah collection at the Kuwait National Museum; Annual work plan 2012

-Project Training for Restoration and Display of the Dar-Al-Athar Al Islamiyah collection at the Kuwait National Museum; 2013 annual work plan

-Project Training for Restoration and Display of the Dar-Al-Athar Al Islamiyah collection at the Kuwait National Museum; Board meeting presentation May 2013.

-Comparison of draft SME law and law on SME development Fund.

-Draft law on the support of micro, small and medium sized enterprise.

-Challenges to SME Development in Kuwait – UNDP Kuwait Report – November 2011 – Dr. Ernest Koch, UNDP SME Legal Advisor.

-Project Establishment of the Women Research and Studies Center in Kuwait; Annual Work Plan 2013-2014.

-Project Establishment of the Women Research and Studies Center in Kuwait; Power point Presentation

- Project Early Learning Challenges and Disability; Project Annual Progress Report 2012.

- Project Early Learning Challenges and Disability; Progress Report August 2012

- Project Early Learning Challenges and Disability; Arabic Progress Report May 2010/Dec 2012

- Project Early Learning Challenges and Disability; 2013 Annual Work Plan.

- Project Early Learning Challenges and Disability; States Update January 2013

-Project Promotion of inclusive and sustainable development through engagement with religious leaders; Annual Work Plan 2013

-Project Promotion of inclusive and sustainable development through engagement with religious leaders;   Annual Progress Report April December 2012.

-Project Promotion of inclusive and sustainable development through engagement with religious leaders; Power point presentation

-Project Promoting Legal Empowerment of Women in the State of Kuwait; Project Annual Report 2012.

-Project document National Traffic &Transport Sector Strategy for Kuwait 2009-2019; National Traffic Strategy and Transport Strategy 2010 -2020 for Kuwait

-Project document National Traffic &Transport Sector Strategy for Kuwait 2009-2019; Work plan for 2013.

-Project document National Traffic &Transport Sector Strategy for Kuwait 2009-2019; Progress Report January 2012/December 2012

**Annex 4**

**Socioeconomic Project Profiles**:

 SME Draft Law: The UNDP, in partnership with the Ministry of Trade and Industry, and with support of the Kuwait Economic Society and other business professionals, UNDP Kuwait created the “Proposed SME Law”. The processes to issue the proposed law required meeting with all government and concerned parties including entrepreneurs in Kuwait. The proposed law addresses the challenges and issues to SME development in Kuwait, and discusses possible legal interventions.

 Economic Empowerment of Kuwaiti Women: The programme aims at contributing to the economic and social development of Kuwait, with a particular focus on empowerment of Kuwaiti women, by addressing the problem of unemployment among women. Unleashing their entrepreneurial potential, the programme will support the establishment and growth of enterprises, owned/managed by women, thereby providing employment opportunities for self and others. In a wider context, the programme will also support the establishment and growth of small and medium enterprises in general in order to generate additional employment opportunities for the people of Kuwait, including youth and men. In doing so, the programme will develop and strengthen national institutional capacities in order to sustain the programme in the long run.

 Promoting Legal Empowerment of Women in the State of Kuwait

The project aims to promote the advancement of women through legal empowerment. Building on the experience and insights gained during the implementation of the WRACTI initiative (Women’s and Children’s Rights through Access to Information), the project aims to facilitate and provide access to relevant laws and regulations for women and to raise awareness of women’s legal rights among women and key partners as well as the general public. Project activities include the development of relevant legal information in digital format and its dissemination through CDs, website, video and audio radio messages, booklets and telephone hotlines as well as through other means. The project also aims to strengthen women’s support mechanisms in order to reinforce their capacity to better access legal information through ICT and to use this information effectively in directing and counselling women. This will be achieved through the training of key stakeholders, in particular representatives from civil society organizations, legal professionals, journalists and MPs in the use of the legal information. A media campaign will ensure that awareness of women’s legal rights among women, key partners and the general public is enhanced.

 Establishment of the Women Research and Studies Center: This project aspires to establish and build the technical capacity of the Women Research and Studies Centre (WRSC) for the benefit of students, statisticians, researchers and other academics including policy-makers and civil society organizations. The WRSC will be equipped with a state-of-the-art digital database housing all the information and data relating to women in Kuwait and will be disseminated on the internet to ensure its ubiquity for ease of access. The WRSC will also provide a forum for local and regional institutions dealing with women related issues to share resources and seek knowledge and advice through networking and capacity development initiatives provided by the centre. It is envisaged that the WRSC through these interventions will play a big role in contributing to achieving the national outcome relating to enhancing and expanding the scope of women's participation in economic activities, political decision-making, and gender equality, in consistency with national plans and the long-term strategic vision to support attainment of MDG3.

 Dar Al-Athar Al-Islamiyah: This project is a continuing project for the preservation and display of selected artifacts from the Dar Al-Athar Al-Islamiyah (DAI) collection at the Kuwait National Museum.  The objectives of the project are to train Kuwaitis to become professional museum and laboratories employees working to international standards.

 Early Learning Disabilities and Challenges: The aims of this Program are to remove barriers to inclusion of individuals with disabilities in Kuwait, to empower persons with disabilities in Kuwait to achieve their full potentials and to enable them to fully contribute to the society in which they form a part. This Program, therefore, compliments the efforts of the Government of Kuwait to include persons with disabilities in the society in line with its international commitments and obligations specified in the United Nations’ International Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities which Kuwait signed in 2009.

 Promotion of inclusive and sustainable development through engagement with Religious Leaders Project

The project was implemented with the Ministry of Awqaf and Religious Affairs. This project aims at increasing the capacity of religious leaders to contribute to a positive social dialogue on human rights and inclusive development in all aspects of life through: 1. Providing a platform for religious leaders to explore developmental and human rights challenges in Kuwait and develop a more comprehensive understanding of the need to address these challenges in all aspects of life; 2. Increasing awareness of the inherent harmony between the core principles of religion and the human rights based approach to development;  3. Identification of a core group of religious leaders committed to promoting inclusive development principles and build their capacity to serve as community educators among their peers and the public; 4. Production of materials, including a training manual, documentary film and educational toolkits on the issues to be covered in the training sessions.

 Implementation of the Comprehensive and Long Term National Traffic and Transport Sector Strategy for Kuwait: The project aims to 1. Build a national integrated road safety information system (NIRSIS) which will enable the gathering and analysis of road accidents data, traffic features, geographical information, and related issues, to provide decision makers and practitioners with reliable data for efficient policy development and implementation schemes; 2. Establish national accident black spot system, to facilitate identification and treatment of frequent road accident locations to minimize the social and economic cost; and 3. Develop capacity building and human resources development program which will provide training and better skills, to strengthen institutional performance, learning and transfer of modern techniques and improve ability to implement work plans efficiently. The project will improve planning and design process; reduce the severity, frequency, and cost of road accidents to the community; alleviate congestion; optimize movement of people and goods; enhance public transport service; strengthen law enforcement; and contribute to the reduction of gasses which contribute to climate change.

**Annex 5**

**Socioeconomic Projects Portfolio**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| اسم المشروع | الجهة المستفيدة | نبذة عن المشروع | المعوقات |
| دعم التمكين الإقتصادي للمرأة | وزارة الشئون الإجتماعية والعمل  | -تعزيز وتوسيع نطاق مشاركة المرأة في الأنشطة الاقتصادية وصنع القرار السياسي والمساواة بين الجنسين* إنشاء حاضنة أولى للمشاريع الصغيرة الحرفية (Boutique 33) لعدد 38 مشروع نسائي محتضن .
* تغطية إعلامية للمشروع وطباعة بروشورات تعريفية عن الحاضنة وأنشطتها .وبروشورات بمنتجات الحاضنة .

- دورات تدريبية للجهاز الإداري للحاضنة وللمبادرات لتطوير وتعزيز القدرات  في المجالات التقنية والمؤسسية لإنشاء المشروع والعمل على إنمائه ، وغرس ورفع مستوى الوعي حول المبادرة بتنظيم المشاريع ومساهمتها في التنمية الاقتصادية وتعزيز قدرة المرأة الكويتية على تصور ووضع وتنفيذ المشاريع المدرة للدخل . | لا يوجد كان مشروع ناجح |
| مشروع قاعدة معلومات عن المرأة الكويت  | جامعة الكويت  | * مشروع إنشاء أبحاث المرأة ومركز الدراسات  في الكويت
* جمع جميع البحوث التي أجريت للمرأة تأسيس مركز الدراسات
* تطوير موقع قاعدة بيانات رقمية ديناميكية للمرأة
* تطوير قدرات منظمات المجتمع المدني النسائية
* جمع جميع البحوث التي أجريت للمرأة لتأسيس مركز الدراسات
* إنشاء موقع قاعدة بيانات رقمية ديناميكية للمرأة.
* عمل ورشات تدريبية لتطوير قدرات منظمات المجتمع المدني النسائية .
* عمل دليل لتدريب المدربين في مجال حقوق النساء و آليات الحماية في الكويت
* عمل ورشات التدريبية حول بناء القدرات الوطنية حول حقوق النساء بالكويت .
* عمل ورشات تدريبية في مجال تدريب الخبراء المحليين .
* عمل حملة إعلانية لإطلاق الموقع الإلكتروني لقاعدة بيانات  عن المرأة .

عمل دراسة قانونية لأربع قضايا تخص المرأة لعرضها على الجهات المختصة . | تم الإعتماد على المشروع، ليس هناك إستدامة |
| مشروع ورقتي (معالجة القضايا القانونية ذات الأولوية  للمرأة في الكويت) | الجمعية الثقافية  الاجتماعية النسائية الكويتية | * معالجة المسائل القانونية والمؤسسية والأولوية للنساء في الكويت
* إنشاء موقع قاعدة بيانات رقمية ديناميكية للمرأة.
* عمل ورشات تدريبية لتطوير قدرات منظمات المجتمع المدني النسائية .
* عمل دليل لتدريب المدربين في مجال حقوق النساء و آليات الحماية في الكويت
* عمل ورشات التدريبية حول بناء القدرات الوطنية حول حقوق النساء بالكويت .
* عمل ورشات تدريبية في مجال تدريب الخبراء المحليين
* عمل حملة إعلانية لإطلاق الموقع الإلكتروني لقاعدة بيانات  عن المرأة .

-عمل دراسة قانونية لأربع قضايا تخص المرأة لعرضها على الجهات المختصة . | تعدد المشاريع تمكين المرأة على الرغم من إمكانية إدراجها بمشروع واحد مشترك مع مشروع قاعدة معلومات عن المرأة |
| توجيه الثقافة الاسلامية لدعم التنمية | وزارة الاوقاف | يهدف المشروع الى بناء قدرات القادة الدنيين و المؤسسات الدينية وتعزيز قدراتهم وامكانياتهم على استخدام الخطاب الديني في مواجهة التحديات التنموية و دعم إمكانياتهم كي يتسنى لهم ادراج الرسائل الايجابية المتعلقة بحقوق الانسان و التنمية في خطابهم الديني .* عمل ورشات تدريبية خاصة بالأعلام الديني
* عمل ورشات تدريبية خاصة بالداعيات
* عمل ورشات تدريبية الخاصة بالدعاة .

- عمل الدليل الإرشادي لتطوير الخطاب الديني من أجل التنمية المستدامة | بعد إنتهاء المشروع لم يكن هناك إستمرارية له. |
| مشروع صعوبات التعليم المبكر والاعاقة | جميع الجهات ذات العلاقة بالتعليم المبكر | تقوية المؤسسات التعليمية للتعامل مع تحديات التعليم في مرحلة الطفولة.* زيادة مستوى التوعية المجتمعية بتحديات القراءة المبكرة من خلال سلسلة من المحاضرات والندوات والإصدارات والتغطية الصحفية
* وضع دراسة إستراتيجية لتحسين أداء الجمعية الكويتية للتوحد.
* وضع دراسة إستراتيجية لإنشاء مركز معلومات خاص بالأشخاص ذوي الإعاقة وخدمتهم بوزارة التربية
* مؤتمر دولي متخصص في الإعاقات التعليمية.
* دراسة حول العنف ضد الأطفال ذوي تحديات التعلم.
* وضع معايير الإعاقة السميعة في الكويت.
* وضع معايير الإعاقة الحركية
* وضع دليل للمؤسسات العاملة في مجال الإعاقة في الكويت
* تدريب الكوادر الوطنية (اختصاصيين نفسيين) على توفير خدمة التشخيص والعلاج للأشخاص ذوي الإعاقة.
* تدريب الكوادر الوطنية لقيادة و إدارة مشروعات رعاية ذوي صعوبات التعلم بمنطقة مبارك الكبير التعليمية.
* تدريب الكوادر الوطنية لتأهيلهم في مجال التعامل مع التوحد
* تدريب موفري الخدمة الخاصة ببرامج التدخل العلاجي والتدريس
* تدريب الكوادر الوطنية (مرشدين نفسيين) لدى وزارة التربية على كيفية مواجهة العنف ضد الأطفال
* وضع أسس منهج للأشخاص بطيء التعلم لمرحلة ما بعد المتوسط.
* تقنين اختبارات بالكمبيوتر لفرز ذوي صعوبات القراءة في المرحلتين المتوسطة والثانوية.
* بناء اختبارات تشخيصية باللغة العربية للتعرف على ذوي تحديات التعلم
* وضع برنامج باللغة العربية لتدريس ذوي صعوبات التعلم
* تطوير برنامج بتقنية الأي فون للفرز المبدئي للدسلكسيا.
 | تم الإعتماد على الخبير إعتماد تام لم يكن هناك نقل للمعرفة |
| دعم دار الاثار الاسلامية  | دار الاثار الاسلامية | * تدريب الموظفين الكويتيين على حفظ وعرض القطع الاثرية في متحف الكويت الوطني الذي تم ترميمه .
* بناء قدرة المهنيين الكويتيين في تصميم و تنفيذ المعارض وصيانة القطع الفنية في المتحف ، جميع مهام عمل امناء المكتبات .
* تدريب المهندسين الكويتيين على ترميم وصيانة المباني ، بما في ذلك الاشراف على اعمال البناء والصيانة .-
* إنجاز العديد من المعارض الناجحة لعام 2013 .
* عقد اليوم العالمي للمتاحف لسنة 2014 .
* تم الانتهاء من تدريب 5 متدربين ضمن برنامج المرشدين الصغار.
* الاستعانة بخبيرين في مجال الحفظ والتعليم  .
* عمل حملة توعوية  لتعزيز قدرة دار الآثار الإسلامية على جذب الزوار المحليين والاستعانة بخبير إعلامي .
* إعادة تأهيل متحف الكويت الوطني:-
* -تم الانتهاء من إعداد خطة لصيانة المبنى
* تجديد مشروع مسرح الميدان في المتحف
* تم الانتهاء من العمل على تجديد المسرح في ديسمبر 2013
* تم إضافة مختبر عمل جديد بالمركز الأمريكاني ووضع برنامج تدريبي جديد
* انجاز العديد من البرامج المكثفة للتدريب في مجال حفظ الآثار

الاستعانة بخبير في مجال الحفظ . | مشروع منذ 23 عام بنفس التنفيذ وبنفس الأهداف |
| تنفذ الاستراتيجية الوطنية للمرور وقطاع النقل | وزارة الداخلية | * بناء نظام موحد يربط معلومات الحركة المرورية وحوادث الطرق والمخالفات والمعلومات الجغرافية لمساعدة متخذي القرار والوزارات المعنية في خلق قطاع نقل مستدام.
* تشخيص ومعالجة ”النقاط السوداء“ أو مواقع حوادث الطرق المتكررة لتحسين تصاميم الطرق والحركة المرورية والحد من كلفة المشاكل المرورية.
* تدريب الكوادر الوطنية لبناء قوة عمل متخصصة ومستدامة.
* إعداد برنامج تدريب الكوادر الوطنية بالخارج.
* التعاقد مع عدد من الخبراء في مجال المشروع
* عمل 7 ورش تدريبية لكوادر الجهات المعنية في المرور و قطاع النقل بالاستعانة بخبراء عالميين بالتعاون مع برنامج الأمم المتحدة الإنمائي
* توعية مرورية بتوزيع 500 كتيب حول توصيات معالجة المشاكل المرورية في الدولة و سير إنجاز المشروع
* توزيع 500 CD’s لتعزيز التوعية المرورية
* إنشاء المركز الوطني للتطوير المروري  و تطوير نظام إدارة المراسلات إلكترونيا

-تطوير نظام تحديد مواقع الازدحام الكترونيا | لم يتم تنفيذه بشكل الصحيح لوجود عدة معوقات منها التغيرات الإدارية في الجهة، وكذلك احتياجات المشروع من أجهزة ومعدات. |

**ملاحظات أخرى:-**

1. المشاريع السابقة كانت لا تتوافق مع خطة التنمية.
2. بعد إنتهاء المشروع ليس هناك تقييم لإستمراريته ونتائجه.
3. لم يتم تطبيق الرصد والتقييم بالشكل الصحيح.
4. لم يكن من الصحيح ربط مدى إنجاز المشروع بكمية المبلغ المنصرف.

**Annex 6**

**Summary Record of Interviews and Observations with Stakeholders**

- ELDC Project – Autism Center – Field Visit – 24 August 2015

Field visit was undertaken to the Center, where Dr. Samira Al Saad, The Director, made a presentation about the Center activities and accomplishments. The Center fulfills an urgent need for autistic boys and girls from the age of 5 to 35.

They are happy with collaborating with UNDP. More financial resources will enable me to provide more services for their students.

- WEE Project – Boutique33 – Field Visit – 25 August 2015

Mrs. Shuaa Qusaibi explained the nature and support that Boutique 33 receives from MOSA. Some 18 Boutique owners attended the presentation. Each boutique owner made a short presentation on her shop and the type of products she produces. All boutique owners expressed satisfaction and noted the support of the MOSA, especially for the Ministry providing free space.

- WRACATI – Women Cultural and Social Society – 25 & 30 August 2015

Ghada Al-Ghanim, Member of Board of Directors provided a summary of the main activities of the project, whose main purpose is to raise awareness about the legal rights of women, and how to navigate their way through legal issues facing women.

They are disappointed that their project is not renewed into the new CPD 2015-2019. But still, they are not giving up. They plan to seek aggressively other funding sources. Embassy of France and Al-Qabas newspaper extended some help for producing their brochures on their strategy to empower women by enlightening them about their legal rights, and how to access legal services.

(Additional points were provided by e-mail message under the project heading). The project is not extended to the new CPD 2015-18.

- Traffic Project – 31 August 2015

Met Dr. S. Jayaseelan, GIS consultant to the project, and Moqadem Salem Mohamed Ajmi, Traffic Project Team Leader.

Issues facing the project:

Absence of data base, as accidents records are reported on ad hoc bases and just hand written, with no compilation of accident reports for corporate memory safe keeping.

The project is appreciative of UNDP partnership.

Constraints: long and protracted process of hiring consultants, contract duration is rather short (one year being the longest). The Director has been on annual contracts for the last five years. There is a risk of losing him if he gets better opportunities. The project managed to get funding from the Ministry of Interior for the coming five years. Consideration should be given for renewing the Director’s contract for the same duration.

The project is trying to staff a Technical Director since March 2015 experiencing one delay after another. They would like UNDP to accelerate the hiring process. The GIS Director is performing carrying out the duties of the Technical Director in addition to his own duties.

- Dar Al-Athar Al-Islamiyeh Project, 31 August 2015

Dr. Robert Fabri, DAI project director made a presentation on the history of the project, that was followed by a tour of the premises to view some of the displays.

Constraints: too many layers of bureaucracy with interference in drafting project related documents and reporting. Management staff changes hamper the smooth running of the project. Contracts duration is rather short (one year maximum).

Reporting is too frequent and often repeating the same information in monthly, quarterly, and annual reports. The project is caught between two entities of two different bureaucracies, the government (GSSCPD and UNDP.

- GSSPCPD – 1 September 2015

Met Mrs. Nerjis Mahmoud, Observer of Technical Cooperation, along with Rabab Husein Mirza , Head, Follow up Department, and Lulwa Al-Khalid, Administrative Researcher.

SCPD feels that none of the socio-economic projects under evaluation are (or were on line) with the SCPD plans. There was no need for any of these projects. UNDP imposed these projects on SCPD and the previous management of SCPD unwillingly went along.

Notwithstanding the above view, SCPD stated that both Traffic project and DAI are renewed and will appear in CPD 2015-2018. The ELDC project is also renewed but under a different emphasis. The same applies to Religious Leaders project. RL project has already organized some 25 training workshops. SCPD feels that is enough. It was felt that in many of the socio-economic portfolio projects, too much reliance is relegated to the consultants who are supposed to be technical resources and not managing the projects. This is why SCPD is against offering consultants contracts longer than one year. It is felt that the consultant is there to provide a service. Once the service is delivered, the national management should carry on with the project on its own. So the fact that the project financial resources are for the coming five years, this should not be used as justification for the consultant’s contract to be also for five years. Consultants seem to have false expectations as to the duration of their contracts. They have to realize that they are there to provide a service with fixed time duration. Once the service is delivered and transfer of knowledge to the national counterpart is fulfilled, the consultant’s contract should not be renewed, unless it is needed for other services.

SME initiative should be given high priority as it contributes to diversification of income resources.

GSSCPD feels that UNDP should not dictate projects, but should leave that function to GSSCPD, and act as technical advisor to the latter. Recruitment procedures of UNDP are complicated and take too long. Quite often by the time a consultant is offered a contract, he/she is nor more available. Thus the whole recruitment process restarts with further delays.

- Religious Leaders – 2 September 2015

The meeting was attended by four officers from Ministry of Awgaf and Religious Affairs. They were: Suad Bu Hamra, Khaleda A Majed, and Allaa, and Hiyam Al-Zamili.

The project focuses on capacity building of religious leaders to contribute to a positive social dialogue on human rights and inclusive development.

While the project is already engaged in south-south cooperation, it would like UNDP to facilitate provision of south-north dialogue.

It is felt that the budget of the project is way too small relative to the services the project provides (insert email 2 Sept 15 from Allaa).

- WEE- 2 September 2015

The representatives from MoSAL and Boutique 33 did not show up and did not notify UNDP that they will not be able to attend. GSSCPD believes no obstacles faced the project. It is considered a successful project.

- WRSC – 7 September 2015

Dr. Lulwa Al-Qazi provided an overview of the major initiatives of WRSC. It will likely become a unit in the Social Science Department of Kuwait University, GSSCPD feels the project lacks sustainability.

**Annex 7**

**Evaluation Matrix (Guiding road map for the evaluator)**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Evaluation Questions** | **Data Sources** | **Data Collection and Analysis Techniques** | **Related Issues and Additional Questions** |
| **Relevance** |
| To what extent are the objectives of the project consistent with country needs?* To what extent was UNDP's selected method of delivery appropriate to the development context?

  | Project documents National policies and reports Media reportsKey Informants | Desk ReviewKey Informants InterviewsUNDP Kuwait Staff |   |
| To what extent is UNDP's engagement a reflection of strategic considerations, including UNDP's role in a particular development context and its comparative advantage? | Project documents; monitoring reportsKey Informants | Desk ReviewKey Informants InterviewsUNDP Kuwait Staff |  |
| Is the project strategic? Is it coherent with ongoing initiatives (with other UN Priorities)? How is this coherence demonstrated? | Project documentsKey informants | Desk ReviewKey Informants InterviewsUNDP Kuwait Staff  |   |
| Does it address what the stakeholders require (NGOs, government, private sector, media, donors)? | Project documentsNational policies and reportsKey informants | Desk ReviewKey Informants InterviewsUNDP Kuwait Staff |  |
| What percentage has the project achieved its intended objectives?  | Project documentsKey informants | Desk review and interviews |  |
| Is the project design logical and consistent?  | Project documents | Desk review and interviews |  |
| **Effectiveness** |
| Has the project achieved its intended outputs and activities?  | Project documents, Key informants  | Desk review, meetings, interviews,  |   |
| What challenges did the project face that affected achievement of objectives?  | Project documents; Key informantsNational Policies | Desk review, interviews and focus group |  |
| What is the role of the stakeholders in the implementation of the project? And did they participate effectively in the implementation? | Project documents; Key informants | Desk review, interviews, meetings,  |   |
| Were the day to day activities of the project well managed in terms of operational work planning and implementation (input delivery, activity management, delivery of outputs)?  | Project documents; key informants  | Desk review, interviews  |   |
| Was the coordination with local partners, beneficiaries, stakeholders, and other donors well managed? | Project documents; Key informants | Desk review, interviews, and  |   |
| **Impact** |
| Have the projects objectives been achieved as intended? | Project documents; Key informantsNews reports  | Desk review, interviews and  |   |
| Have the effects of the project been facilitated or constrained by external factors? | Project documents;National Policies, media reports and key informants  | Desk review, interviews  |   |
| Has the project improved stakeholder capacity and coordination?  | Project documents and key informants  | Desk review, interviews,  |   |
| Have the effects of the project produced any unexpected impacts? So, how have this affected the overall impact? | Project documents and key informants | Desk review, interviews,  |   |
| Has this project produced lasting results among the participants?  | Project documents and key informants | Desk review, interviews,  |   |
| Has this project produced material and information to share with the country? | Project documents and key informants | Desk review, interviews |   |
| * + How can UNDP and Kuwait build on the impact?
 | Key Informants | Desk Review and interviews  |  |
| **Efficiency** |
| To what extent have the programme or project outputs resulted from economic use of resources? | Project documents and key informants | Desk review and interviews |  |
| Review links/joint activities with other UNDP Programmes and other partners and how these have contributed to the achievement of the outcome  | Project documents and key informants | Desk review and interviews |  |
| Through this evaluation UNDP Kuwait seeks to understand and articulate the key contributions that the Democratic Governance programme has made in the enhancement of sustainable natural resources planning and management system. | Project documents and key informants | Desk Review and interviews |  |
| * + Was UNDP transparent in its relationship with the partner? Did UNDP provide accountability to the partner?
 | Project documents and key informants | Desk review and interviews  |  |
| **Sustainability** |
| * + Has the capacity of the staff involved improved?
 | Project documents and key informants | Desk review and interviews  |  |
| * + Has internal and external processes improved?
 | Project documents and key informants | Desk review and interviews  |  |
| * + Policy and regulatory frameworks are in place that will support continuation of benefits.
 | Project documents and key informants | Desk review and interviews  |  |
| * + Suitable organizational (public or private sector) arrangements have been made.
 | Project documents and key informants | Desk review and interviews  |  |
| **Lessons Learned** |
| What would you do any differently in the design and implementation of the project?  | Project documents and key informants | Desk review and interviews  |   |
|
|
| In your opinion what are the issues that you would address in a new initiative?How would you improve on the relationship with stakeholders?  | Project documents and key informants | Desk review and interviews  |   |
|
|
| Are there specific activities that you would change? | Project documents and key informants | Desk review and interviews  |   |
|
| What are the lessons that you think you learned from this project?  | Project documents and key informants | Desk review and interviews  |   |
|
| How would you manage the project next time?  | Project documents and key informants | Desk review and interviews  |   |
|
|
| What are the strengths and weaknesses in this project?  | Project documents and key informants | Desk review and interviews  |   |

**Annex 8**

**Questionnaire for Project Focal Points and Stakeholders**

1. Can you kindly summarize your project as a start point to our discussion?

2. Do you feel your project was successful?

 If yes, Why

 If no, Why not

3. How and where does the project fit into the fabric of CPD 2009-2014?

4. Did the project face any obstacles and/or constraints during implementation?

5. Would you like to show case the project as success story and lesson learnt for best practices?

6. How helpful was UNDP CO in achieving the objectives of your project?

7. What else should UNDP CO do or can do to further ensure achieving the desired outcome of the project?

 Thanks so much for your participation which will be helpful for the evaluation.

 **Annex 9**

**Evaluator Bio Note**

 **A. F. (Bob) ODEH**

Mr. Odeh is Lead Socio-Economic Advisor for sustainable development with Canadian Executive Service Organization (CESO) and Freelance Senior Consultant on monitoring and evaluation (M&E) and results based management (RBM) with United Nations Development Program (UNDP).

 Mr. Odeh has devoted his entire career to sustainable development and international cooperation. He has been in Canadian - International Development Agency (formerly CIDA) - and international public service for more than thirty years. His tour of duty includes three years posting in Kuwait, with the World Bank, as Economic Advisor to the Kuwait Fund for Economic Development, seven years in Geneva with the International Telecommunication Union (ITU), as Chief Economist, for Resource Mobilization, one year in Sultanate of Oman, also with the World Bank, as Economic Advisor for the Minister of State for Development, and one year in Baghdad, with UN Coordinator for Humanitarian Affairs (UNOCHA), as Chief of Multi- Disciplinary Observation of Oil for Food program, during UN Security Council sanctions on Iraq. This is in addition to leading and/or participating in numerous multi-disciplinary monitoring and evaluation missions, and results based management (RBM) in some seventy developing countries and thirty advanced countries in south Asia, Southeast Asia, the Arab States, Africa, and Central/Eastern Europe with CIDA, CESO and UNDP, as well as with various UN specialized agencies.

Mr. Odeh educational background includes B.A. in Economics from the American University of Beirut, and M.A. in Development Economics from the University of Toronto, a postgraduate diploma in International Cooperation from the University of Ottawa, and Country Program Director (CPD) Diploma in International Aid Delivery and Development Co-operation from formerly CIDA.

 Mr. Odeh is proficient in English, Arabic and French. He is married and has three adult children and three grandchildren He lives with his wife in Ottawa, Canada, and consults globally on current issues related to sustainable development.

1. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)