

**INNOVATIONS FOR WOMEN'S EMPOWERMENT
IN SOUTHEAST ANATOLIA
PHASE 2**

Final Evaluation & Impact Assessment

**Prepared by:
Bilgehan Öztürkcan**

January 2017



Abbreviations

BETAM	Bahçeşehir University Economic and Social Research Center
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women
ÇATOM	Multipurpose Community Center
DA	Development Agency
GAP RDA	Southeast Anatolia Project Regional Development Administration
GES-CO	Gender Equality Strategy of Turkey Country Office
İBB	İstanbul Metropolitan Municipality
İŞKUR	Turkish Labour Agency
KAMER	Foundation of Woman Center
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
SDG	Sustainable Development Goals
Sida	Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency
TURKSTAT	Turkish Statistics Institute
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNDCS	United Nations Development Cooperation Strategy

Table of Contents

1	Executive Summary	1
2	Introduction.....	5
2.1	Project Background.....	5
2.2	Purpose of Evaluation and Impact Assessment.....	5
2.3	Evaluation and Impact Assessment Methodology	6
2.3.1	Evaluation Criteria.....	6
2.3.2	Desk Research.....	7
2.3.3	Qualitative Survey	7
3	Final Evaluation Findings.....	8
3.1	Design Level Evaluation — Relevance.....	8
3.1.1	Problems and Needs	8
3.1.2	Project Design	10
3.1.3	Relevance to National Policies/Strategies, UNDCS and SDG	11
3.2	Process Level Evaluation	12
3.2.1	Efficiency.....	12
3.2.2	Ownership	13
3.3	Result Level Evaluation.....	14
3.3.1	Effectiveness	14
3.3.2	Sustainability.....	20
4	Impact Assessment — Achievement of Wider Objectives.....	24
5	Conclusions and Recommendations.....	28
5.1	Conclusions and Lessons Learnt	28
5.2	Recommendations	31
6	Annexes.....	33
6.1	Printed Sources.....	33
6.2	Interviews.....	34
6.3	Focus Groups	35

1 Executive Summary

'Innovations for Women's Empowerment in Southeast Anatolia – Phase 2 Project', hereinafter referred as IWEP-2, was built upon the results of the project's first phase and was funded by Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (Sida). Southeast Anatolia Project Regional Development Administration (GAP RDA) and United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) were the implementing partners of IWEP-2. Implementation of the project was planned to take place in the nine provinces of the GAP Region, namely Adiyaman, Batman, Diyarbakir, Gaziantep, Kilis, Mardin, Siirt, Şanlıurfa and Şırnak. The budget of IWEP-2 was approved as \$994, 550 and then increased to \$1,112, 810 during implementation.

The intended outcome for IWEP-2 was *"ensuring equal participation of women in all fields of public sector, private sector and civil society with strengthened institutional mechanisms to empower women's status"* as stipulated in the Country Programme prepared under the UNDP Millennium Development Goals (MDG). The wider objectives of the project were set out as:

1. Increasing women's individual productive and social capacities and enterprise level management skills to empower women within their communities;
2. Increasing women's income through entrepreneurship and increased employment opportunities; and
3. Building and disseminating knowledge for policy making while achieving results at the local level.

The specific objectives (components) were:

1. Increasing business management and entrepreneur skills of women in Southeast Anatolia with a view to strengthen their economic empowerment and empower them socially within their communities;
2. Increasing opportunities for employment and income generation of women in Southeast Anatolia with stronger market connections; and
3. Increasing income of women in Southeast Anatolia by engaging in production under the regional brand 'Argande', building a good example of PPP.

IWEP-2 took off in July 2012. Its activities were mainly built on training women for empowerment in social life and skill development; extending business development services to women owned enterprises; commencing public-private partnership (PPP); developing promotion and marketing models for crafts produced by women and the Argande brand; and insuring the sustainability of Argande.

Overall Evaluation

If Neil Armstrong, the first astronaut on the moon, had been evaluating IWEP-2 project he probably would have said *'That's one small step for the donors, one giant leap for women in Southeast Anatolia'*.

42 months of IWEP-2's 54-month implementation cycle took place within a slowly growing political and social instability that not only adversely affected daily life but also gave way to an economic instability; hindering/delaying the project's activities. Despite these unfavourable circumstances IWEP-2's first and the second objectives were achieved. However, employment of more women and hence increase in earnings by women under the Argande operation (Component 3) was partly achieved because of the turbulent environment in the region and the economic recession that hit the ready wear retail chains.

Components 1 and 2 of IWEP-2, despite the adverse circumstances in the region:

- were instrumental in addressing the needs of the south eastern women;
- their activities were efficiently implemented;
- their output targets were achieved with full ownership of the project's stakeholders;
- the benefits generated by them will be sustainable; and
- created the expected impact at micro and mezzo levels.

Component 3 that involved engagement of more women in the Argande operation and hence increase in their earnings:

- also addressed the needs of the female population in southeast Anatolia;
- but there were delays in some of its activities with some partly or never accomplished¹;
- the ownership of project stakeholders and the volunteers, and the PPP demonstrated were exemplary;
- its output targets were partly achieved; but the worth of achieved output was almost four times the fund allocated for it;
- absence of an institutional structure and the economic recession that hit the ready wear retail chains jeopardized its sustainability; and
- was a unique intervention in being able to create an economic impact in the GAP region before being able to fully achieve its specific objective.

Design Level Evaluation

The objectives of IWEP-2 were consistent with the final beneficiaries' and the South East Anatolia's needs; the activities were planned to address the needs and problems of the women; and the project complied with the national policies/strategies, UNDCS and the SDGs.

Process Level Evaluation

IWEP-2 was successful in transforming resources/inputs (funds, time, human resources, etc.) into outputs in its first and second components. It completed majority of its planned activities and exceeded the targeted outputs in many of its activities.

Some of the activities under component 3 could not be efficiently accomplished because of the political and social turmoil in the region causing delays and hence necessitating extension of the project period.

The governance structure in which GAP RDA, İŞKUR, governorates and special provincial administrations had roles facilitated efficient management and monitoring of the project. Allocation of ÇATOMs premises to the project also contributed to efficient implementation of the activities. The project management was also successful in sustaining the voluntary support of the fashion circles that began in the first phase of the project. The estimated worth of this voluntary support was more than sum of funds committed to IWEP-2.

All stakeholders of IWEP-2 took on active roles in implementation of the project. The final beneficiaries, i.e. women who have attended training programs, were participative and stated that they intended to continue going to ÇATOMs' programs. Dedication of the project's supporters was exemplary. A genuine solidarity existed between the main beneficiary, project management, voluntary supporters of the project and the local public administrations.

¹ Some of these activities were revised in the annual work plans.

Result Level Evaluation

The output targets in components 1 and 2 were fully attained except for the support planned for women owned enterprises – eight enterprises instead of the targeted 10. The training and skill development programs and the income generation schemes were able to reach out to higher number of women than envisaged by IWEP-2. Women benefiting from training and income generation programs implemented in the course of the project developed and strengthened their self-confidence; heightened their sense of self-worth; got involved in income generating activities, with some being employed by companies; and started contributing into their family budgets. Market connections established with fairs enabled sales of handicrafts produced at the ÇATOMs; and connections with prominent textile companies laid the ground for women to earn money from handwork they do for these companies.

The overall planning of the activities was carried out in an inclusive nature. Reproductive health and gender equality trainings were organized for men in the coffee houses. Syrian women were welcome in the design ateliers and skill development programs.

Organization of gender equality and reproductive health training sessions for men in the coffee houses positively affected the perception on IWEP-2 and convinced men that their wives, daughters and sisters were really benefiting from the programs they attended.

One of targeted outputs of Component 3, i.e. involving more women in production of Argande brand to increase income of female population in the GAP region was not achieved due to transfer of the atelier from Batman to Kilis and therefore the consequent fluctuation in production; and the contracting ready wear market. However, support extended by the public institutions and the private sector set a good example of PPP. In addition, the activities carried out for the brand's promotion ensured its market launching as a regional brand and attracted attention of prominent Turkish textile companies.

Sustainability of the benefits achieved in the first two components of IWEP-2 is highly likely as the ÇATOMs with their enhanced capacities will always be serving the region's women; and both the ÇATOMs and the women who attended the project's activities 'learned to fish'.

Sustainability of the Argande operation and therefore the likelihood of increasing women's income by engaging production under Argande are at risk. The operation does not have an institutional structure and cannot support itself financially as it is not able to generate the income necessary to meet its expenses. Argande will be able to financially sail through the next 3-4 months due to collection of the receivables from Mudo; the level of its fabric and auxiliary material stocks; and the designers' and PR companies' voluntary support promises; but the operation will not be able to continue after this period.

Impact Assessment

The outcomes of IWEP-2 intervention were evident at the micro, mezzo and macro levels. At the micro level women were socially and economically empowered within their communities. At mezzo level, Multipurpose Community Centers (ÇATOMs) under GAP RDA enhanced their training and market connection capacities and became focal points in initiatives targeting women. At macro level, the GAP region was promoted alongside with the introduction of products made in ÇATOMs to İstanbul market via the fairs and the promotion of the Argande brand in the fashion world; and attracted textile investments. Statistics on growth of women's labour force participation, growth in number of compulsorily insured women and growth in the number of establishments involved in textile products and ready wear are indications of IWEP-2's likely contribution to the social and economic progress of the region.

Other positive impacts of IWEP-2 materialized in promotion of GAP region's indigenous culture and the arousal of volunteerism and corporate social responsibility (CSR) in the fashion world. Argande's promotion and the use of the indigenous *Kutnu* fabric in the brand's collections enhanced fabric's quality and promoted it in the fashion world.

Lessons Learnt

The lessons learnt from IWEP-2's implementation were:

Lesson 1: Development interventions targeting women will easily reach their beneficiaries; will be efficiently implemented; and achieve the intended outputs that will be sustainable if they work with powerful regional administrations with local networks serving women.

Lesson 2: Increasing women's income by creation of a regional ready wear brand is a highly ambitious engagement and necessitates more resources (funds, personnel, time, etc.)

Lesson 3: Organization of training programs for men within interventions targeting women enhances the likely effectiveness of the project.

Lesson 4: Sustainability of a commercial operation requires more resources in terms of personnel and time which will necessitate provision of more funds. Voluntary input may/will be vulnerable during economic fluctuations.

Recommendations

The project specific recommendation developed in the final evaluation is the continuation of funding for the Argande operation with special care given to activity planning to ensure achievement of the specific objective and sustainability of the achieved results. The main activities and the sub activities are recommended as the following:

1. Preparation of dossier setting out Argande's current position and its business plan
2. Recruitment of a project personnel for promotional activities
3. Establishment of an institutional structure
 - a. Identifying and contacting potential founders for establishment of a foundation or for operation under an existing foundation
 - b. Official establishment of a foundation or preparation of an MoU for transferring Argande operation to an existing foundation
4. Putting the communication and advocacy strategy into writing and contracting a PR agency
5. Preparation of collections
6. Preparing a web portal for promotion and on-line sales
7. Identifying and contacting potential domestic and international buyers

Recommendations specific to development interventions are:

1. Development interventions targeting south eastern women should be implemented in cooperation with GAP RDA that facilitates efficient and effective implementation via its ÇATOMs, the local network serving women.
2. Development interventions including commercial operations should plan and prioritize activities that would ensure achievement of specific objectives and their sustainability; allocate funds accordingly; and not be heavily dependent on private sector's voluntary support.
3. Development interventions targeting empowerment of women should also include parallel activities for men to increase the effectiveness of the projects.

2 Introduction

2.1 Project Background

The intended outcome of 'Innovations for Women's Empowerment in Southeast Anatolia Project' designed under the Country Programme that targets to achieve UNDP Millennium Development Goals (MDG) is '*ensuring equal participation of women in all fields of public sector, private sector and civil society with strengthened institutional mechanisms to empower women's status*'. The first phase of the project aimed at:

1. Increasing women's individual productive and social capacities and enterprise level management skills to empower women within their communities; and
2. Increasing women's income through entrepreneurship and increased employment opportunities.

and was implemented between March 2008 and May 2012.

'Innovations for Women's Empowerment in Southeast Anatolia – Phase 2 Project'; hereinafter referred as IWEP-2, that has been built upon the results of the first phase maintains the above mentioned aims of the project and additionally targets:

3. Building and disseminating knowledge for policy making while achieving results at the local level.

IWEP-2 kicked off in July 2012. It is being financed by Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (Sida). GAP RDA is the main beneficiary and the implementing partner of the Project. UNDP, also as an implementing partner, provides technical support to IWEP-2.

IWEP-2 activities are focused on the following three components (outputs):

1. Increasing business management and entrepreneur skills of women in Southeast Anatolia with a view to strengthen their economic empowerment and empower them socially within their communities.
2. Increasing opportunities for employment and income generation of women in Southeast Anatolia with stronger market connections.
3. Increasing income of women in Southeast Anatolia by engaging in production under the regional brand 'Argande', building a good example of PPP.

IWEP-2 will end on 31 December 2016. The budget of IWEP-2 stands at \$1,112,810 and the project activities were implemented in the nine provinces of GAP RDA through 39 of the 44 ÇATOMs.

2.2 Purpose of Evaluation and Impact Assessment

The final evaluation aimed at assessing the overall performance of IWEP-2 based on criteria of relevance, efficiency, effectiveness and sustainability and assessment of social and economic impact it created for the final beneficiaries and the region; and sought to:

1. Measure to what extent IWEP-2 had fully implemented the planned activities, delivered intended results and attained outcomes, specifically measuring development results ;

2. Generate substantive evidence based knowledge by identifying best practices and lessons learnt that could be useful to other development interventions at national (scale up) and international (replicability) level; and
3. Evaluate findings with one or more of the related Sustainable Development Goals (SDG) thematic windows.

The specific objectives of the final evaluation comprised:

1. Measuring to what extent IWEP-2 has attained the goals of the project, as well as the development results on the targeted population, beneficiaries, participants whether individuals, communities, institutions, etc.;
2. Measuring to what extent the IWEP-2 has contributed to solve the needs and problems identified in the design phase;
3. Measuring IWEP-2's degree of implementation, efficiency and quality delivered on outputs and outcomes, against what was originally planned or subsequently officially revised; and
4. Identifying and documenting substantive lessons learnt and good practices on specific topics of IWEP-2 and the SDGs with the aim to support the sustainability of the project or some of its components.

The specific objective of impact assessment was to analyse and identify the extent the final beneficiaries, i.e. the women who participated in training programs, benefited from the project activities in social and economic terms; and if and how the society in Southeast Anatolia as a whole took advantage of IWEP-2.

2.3 Evaluation and Impact Assessment Methodology

2.3.1 Evaluation Criteria

The objective of final evaluation was to analyze the use of resources, the effectiveness and efficiency of interventions and their impact as well as their usefulness and duration. The following evaluation criteria grouped by the levels of project process have been made use of:

Relevance (design level evaluation): The extent to which the objectives of the project are consistent with beneficiaries' requirements and interests, country's needs, and SDGs.

Efficiency (process level evaluation) is the criterion that concerns how well the various activities transformed the available resources/inputs into the intended results (outputs), in terms of quantity, quality, funding and timeliness. It measures the **outputs (results)** in relation to the **inputs**.

Ownership (process level evaluation): The extent of effective exercise of leadership by the country's national/local partners in the development interventions and the interest of the final beneficiaries.

Effectiveness (result level evaluation) is the criterion that concerns how far/well the project's results were attained, and the project's specific objective(s) achieved, or are expected to be achieved. It is used to assess how well the project's **results** were used and contributed to achieve the planned **purpose**.

Sustainability (result level evaluation) is the criterion that relates to whether the positive outcomes/changes of the project and the flow of **benefits are likely to continue** after external funding ends or after voluntary support interventions.

2.3.2 Desk Research

All the relevant project documents, such as the project document, progress reports, annual reports, project amendments, planned/revised/actual budget, business plans, etc. were systematically reviewed and referred to during all phases of the evaluation process. In addition, relevant SDG indicators and national strategy and policy documents of the government and UNDP were studied.

2.3.3 Qualitative Survey

In-depth Interviews: In depth face-to-face interviews were conducted with the representatives of project stakeholders at both the local and national levels in Ankara, Şanlıurfa, Gaziantep, Kilis, Mardin and İstanbul. The list of interviewees is provided in Annex 7.2.

Focus Groups: Three focus group meetings were organised in Şanlıurfa, and Gaziantep. A total of 95 women attended to these meetings and shared their experiences and expectations.

3 Final Evaluation Findings

3.1 Design Level Evaluation — Relevance

3.1.1 Problems and Needs

Turkey ranked 71st among 155 countries according to the 2014 Gender Inequality Index which set forth gender disparities in reproductive health, empowerment and labour market participation. The Economic Policy Research Foundation of Turkey (TEPAV) in its March 2014 report 'Social Gender Equality Report Card for 81 Provinces'² sets out that Batman (51st), Şırnak (56th), Mardin (57th), Şanlıurfa (71st), Siirt (77th), Gaziantep (78th) and Kilis (79th) take place among the worst performing 30 provinces as regards to gender equality while Diyarbakır (33rd) and Adıyaman (40th) are observed to be in the mid-range.

According to the World Economic Forum's 2015 Gender Gap Index Turkey ranked 130th among 145 countries. Such national and international indices are indicators of considerable inequalities. Turkey has been performing relatively well in closing gender gaps in health and education, but it scores lower in the area of economic empowerment and has the least progress towards closing gender gap in women's political participation.

	Selected Indicators of Gender Inequality in Turkey	
	number/ratio/percentage	
	Women	Men
Time allocated for household responsibilities and family care (time use survey, workers)	3 hours 41 mins	46 mins
Participation into labor force	31.5 %	71.6%
Unpaid family laborers in agricultural sectors	80.7%	19.9%
Breakdown of textile workers	43.6 %	56.4 %
Proportion of high level civil servants	9.0%	91.0%
Breakdown of ministers in the government	4.7 %	95.3%
Breakdown of governors	2.5%	97.5%
Breakdown of mayors (2014-metropolitan, provincial and district)	3.6%	96.4%
Breakdown of ambassadors	12.1%	87.9%
Breakdown of public prosecutors	6.6%	93.4%
Breakdown of judges	36.3%	63.7%
Breakdown of police officers	5.5 %	94.5%
Breakdown of parliament members	14.7%	85.3%
Breakdown of members of the ruling party	10.7%	89.3%
Breakdown of representatives in Turkey's Higher Judicial Bodies	26.8%	73.2%
Breakdown of rectors	9.7%	90.3%
Secondary level of education (adults)	39.0 %	60.0 %
Illiteracy ratios for the age bracket 25 and above	9.2%	1.8%
Sources: http://www.tuik.gov.tr/PreHaberBultenleri.do?id=18627 Labor Force Statistics, 2015 , TURKSTAT, http://www.turkstat.gov.tr/PreHaberBultenleri.do?id=16015 http://www.dpb.gov.tr/tr-tr/istatistikler/kamu-personeli-istatistikleri https://www.tbmm.gov.tr/develop/owa/milletvekillerimiz_sd.dagilim http://kadininstatusu.aile.gov.tr/uygulamalar/turkiyede-kadin Shadow NGO Report on Turkey's Seventh Report to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women prepared for Submission to the 64th Session Of CEDAW July 2016		

² TEPAV's gender equality index is based on criteria of education level, participation in decision making, employment and services available for women.

According to UNDP Gender Equality Strategy (2014-2017) empowerment is a sense of self-worth; right to have and to determine choices; right to have the power to control one's own life, both within and outside the home; ability to influence the direction of social change to create a more just social and economic order, nationally and internationally. The strategy document describes empowerment as having equal access to education, health, ownership of land, employment and representation in political institutions.

Labour participation and employment rates of the Turkish women are well below the level of their European counterparts and less than half of that of the Turkish men. Although there has been some progress the situation is worse in the GAP region with only 17.8% of the women participating in the labour force and only 15.3% employed.

Female Labour Force and Employment in GAP Region, 2015		
NUTS II Regions	Labour force participation rate (%)	Employment rate (%)
TRC1 (Gaziantep, Adiyaman, Kilis)	18.9	16.8
TRC2 (Şanlıurfa, Diyarbakır)	20.2	17.8
TRC3 (Mardin, Batman, Şırnak, Siirt)	12.2	9.0
Total GAP Provinces	17.8	15.3
Turkey	31.5	27.5

Source: Turkstat Labor Force Statistics

A recent survey carried out by Turkish Statistics Institute (TURKSTAT) reveals that compared to the national average, the percentage of unhappy women is higher in the GAP region. The unhappiest women of the region live in Diyarbakır, Şanlıurfa and Mardin.

Province	Level of Female Happiness by Province %		
	Happy	Not happy or unhappy	Unhappy
Adiyaman	65.8	23.7	10.5
Batman	56.4	30.0	13.5
Diyarbakır	53.3	25.5	21.2
Gaziantep	59.1	26.7	14.2
Kilis	60.7	25.5	13.8
Mardin	54.1	29.3	16.7
Siirt	75.4	16.4	8.2
Şanlıurfa	60.8	20.0	19.2
Şırnak	72.2	19.9	7.9
Turkey	61.9	28.5	9.6

Source: TURKSTAT, Life Satisfaction Survey, 2013

IWEP-2's objectives addressed the problems and needs summarized above and the planned activities catered to achievement of the objectives.

Activities carried out under the first component of IWEP-2 were planned to contribute to social empowerment of women and resulted in individuals with heightened self-esteem and self-confidence. Activities under the second component were designed to pave the way to economic empowerment with women participating in income generating work in their homes and/or in

the ÇATOMs. Activities under the third component were planned to increase women's empowerment by strengthening the regional brand Argande created in the first phase of IWEP.

3.1.2 Project Design

IWEP-2 was built on the results of its first phase, the duration and funding of which was not deemed sufficient to enhance the economic and social empowerment of women and to strengthen the institutional structures and brand identities built up. A second phase was agreed to be designed and funded to improve the impact and insure the sustainability of the results achieved in the first phase.

Sida's intermediate evaluation of the first phase in June 2011 contributed to the sound design of IWEP-2. The focus of the second phase was determined in line with the recommendations in the evaluation report as:

- increasing capacities through intensive trainings on communication, human rights and gender equality, labour rights, marketing and design, institutional structures, etc.;
- delivering continuous and systematic business development support;
- supporting leadership skills;
- increasing employment opportunities for women through facilitation of new private investments;
- enhancing income generation opportunities through market connections;
- institutionalizing Argande brand and ensuring its sustainability; and
- developing policy recommendations.

The design of IWEP-2 was gender sensitive as the objectives and the intended results addressed the gender inequality indicated above. Project activities were planned to socially and economically empower women in the region. Inclusion of a child care center and the in-kind support extended to the children's play rooms within the project's activities was a strong sign of mainstreaming gender into this intervention. Indicators of achievement of the project's results were also based on improving the women's status.

Selection of ÇATOMs as centers for IWEP-2's activities also ensured the sustainability of the responses to development challenges. The longstanding presence of the ÇATOMs in the region; their accumulated and proven experience in dealing with women's needs and problems; and the dedicated attitude of their managers have increased the outreach of the project and eased the achievement of the results.

IWEP-2's Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) practice involved preparation of quarterly progress reports for GAP RDA and annual progress reports for SIDA and UNDP. An interim evaluation was not included in the project document and hence not carried out. Annual progress reports described at length the progress of the activities and comprised the comparison of actual results with targeted outputs. The indicators were specific, measurable and timely and therefore facilitated evaluation of the progress to date.

The increase of \$135,000 in IWEP-2 budget for establishment of an office and warehouse in Istanbul and the recruitment of a procurement and brand expert was a necessary step in promotion and sales of Argande products and the procurement of the supplies (fabric, thread, packaging materials, etc.) used in production. Budget planning for the third component was based on the assumption that the voluntary support extended by the fashion designers, models, photographers, PR companies and Mudo, the sales company, in the first phase of the project

would also continue in the second phase. This was a big risk to take despite the fact that this support continued to be extended during IWEP-2. GAP RDA's Deputy President stated that the monetary equivalent of the support for collection preparation, PR, promotion and sales could not have been less than one million Turkish Lira (~\$350,000 at \$1=TL3) per annum. Even if one tenth of this amount were to be paid Argande brand could have never continued to have a presence in the market.

IWEP-2's project document did not include a communication and advocacy strategy. The lack of such a written strategy was overcome with the strategy developed by the stakeholders during the project period and generated the expected outcome.

3.1.3 Relevance to National Policies/Strategies, UNDCS and SDG

9th Development Plan (2007-2013) that covered the first phase of the project and the design and first year of IWEP-2 aimed active participation of women in the social life, economy and politics under the development axis of strengthening of human capital development and social solidarity. 10th Development Plan (2014-2018) also aims empowerment of women in the social and cultural environment and in economy.

In addition, IWEP-2 complies with the strategic aims and axis of the GAP Master Plan and GAP Action Plan (2014-2018) that envisage facilitating the entry of women to the labour market and enhancement of the quality and quantity of the activities that will serve empowerment of women.

The project's compliance with the UN Development Cooperation Strategy (UNDCS) 2011-2015 is under the theme of 'Disparity Reduction, Social Inclusion and Basic Public Services' at Result No 5 that stipulates ensuring equal participation of women in all fields of public sector and civil society with strengthened institutional mechanisms to empower women's status. The specific aims relating to the project are increasing labour force participation and creating opportunities for employability of women. IWEP-2 is also aligned with 'Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment' theme in UNDCS 2016-2020.

IWEP-2 also serves to UNDP's Sustainable Development Goals (SDG) No 5 and its targets 5.4, 5.5 and 5.6.³; the planned activities of the project either directly comply with these targets or are the initial steps in the long journey toward their achievement.

The current initiatives of the UNDP, EU and other development interventions in the region focus on the prevailing problems of the Syrian refugees and have kicked off in 2016 when IWEP-2 has neared its finalization. IWEP-2 has complementarities and created synergy with 'Support to Adaptation of Syrian Women Living in Southeast Anatolia to Social and Economic Life' that aims

³ Goal 5. Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls

5.4 Recognize and value unpaid care and domestic work through the provision of public services, infrastructure, and social protection policies and the promotion of shared responsibility within the household and the family as nationally appropriate

5.5 Ensure women's full and effective participation and equal opportunities for leadership at all levels of decision-making in political, economic and public life

5.6 Ensure universal access to sexual and reproductive health and reproductive rights as agreed in accordance with the Programme of Action of the International Conference on Population and Development and the Beijing Platform for Action and the outcome documents of their review conferences

at strengthening the social and economic skills of Syrian women living in selected locations of the GAP region. The beneficiaries include the Syrian women as primary beneficiaries and the host communities/systems that provide services to Syrian women as indirect beneficiaries. The experience accumulated in IWEP-2 has cast light on to the efficient and effective implementation of this project as some of IWEP-2's final beneficiaries were Syrian women.

3.2 Process Level Evaluation

3.2.1 Efficiency

IWEP-2's management model was in line with the governance structure planned in the project document. Project steering committee and the local advisory board were instrumental to following up implementation and extending support where and when necessary. Presence of İŞKUR in the committee and the board facilitated smooth and timely employment of women with İŞKUR supports while and governorates allocated public buildings for use of the project activities. The projects outreach was heightened with GAP RDA, as the main beneficiary and the project board member, furnishing ÇATOMs as centers for implementation of the planned activities.

Information flow in IWEP-2 was realized by quarterly progress reports submitted to GAP RDA and by annual progress reports to all of the three project partners (SIDA, GAP RDA and UNDP) by the project manager. Project steering committee and local advisory board meetings also served to efficient information flow; while also assisting in provision of the necessary local support and in taking corrective actions for the project.

IWEP-2's intervention enhanced the efficiency of training programs in ÇATOMs by training their trainers; connected ÇATOMs with commercial world by enabling their participation in trade fairs and initiating corporate social responsibility (CSR) connections with leading players of the Turkish fashion world. These efforts brought forward income generation opportunities for women⁴. In addition, more women were able to participate in training programs as children's play rooms in ÇATOMs were better equipped by the project's in-kind supports and therefore able attract more children freeing women of their child care responsibilities. Finally, development of the Argande brand improved public perception of the region and attracted textile investors to the region.

The governance of IWEP-2 was carried out by GAP RDA that ensured both the national and the regional ownership. The accumulated experience due to GAP RDA's presence in South East Anatolia since 1989 and the ÇATOMs under the administration since 1994 and the relations they have built up with the public and private institutions in the region have positively affected the efficiency of the project; particularly in convening the project steering committee and local advisory board and in embracing more women than that was targeted by the project. In addition, recruitment of the project manager of IWEP's first phase also as the project manager of IWEP-2 ensured smooth and effective flow of accumulated experience and established connections/relations in the first phase into the second phase.

IWEP-2 was programmed to be implemented between 01 July 2012 and 30 June 2015 but the completion date was extended by 18 months to 31 December 2016. Time efficiency of the

⁴ According 2015 Activity Report of ÇATOMs 6,197 participants raised around one million TL income as the result of skills development programs; 393 women found jobs; and 52 women established their own ateliers.

project cannot be evaluated independently of the political and social climate in Turkey and in the region. The regional elections in March 2014, presidency elections in August 2014 and the general elections of June and November 2015 slackened the economic and administrative activity in the country for almost two years. The Syrian influx continuing since 2011 and the terrorist activity that kicked off in summer of 2015 adversely affected the daily life in the GAP region. Such a climate in the region inevitably slowed down IWEP-2's activities in 2014 and 2015. The project management responded to these delays by extending the completion date, at first, one year to 30 June 2016; then, six months to 31 December 2016. However, the extension of the project by 18 months was a significant strain on the project budget by necessitating transfer of funds from project activities to remuneration of the project personnel stationed in the field and in UNDP Ankara Office.

IWEP-2's original budget was \$949,550. It was increased by \$135,000 to \$1,084,550 in July 2013 to strengthen Argande operation by recruiting procurement and sales responsible and an experienced production foreman; and renting an office/warehouse in İstanbul. A further rise (\$28,260) to \$1,112,810 took place in 2015 due to valuation of Swedish Krona (SEK) against the US \$.

The table below shows the commitment and disbursement of the funds. The funds were fully used in each component. The activities under components 1 and 2 were interrelated and the annual work plans revised the use of funds to the favour of component 1. The combined disbursement for these two components shows 99% use.

	Committed, \$	Disbursed, \$	Disbursement Ratio
Component 1	232,700	452,054	193%
Component 2	302,250	79,420	26%
Components 1 and 2 Total	534,950	531,474	99%
Component 3	577,860	554,617	96%
Total	1,112,810	1,086,091	98%

Should the monetary worth of input by volunteers and the in-kind contributions by GAP RDA, the governorates and special administrations during the project period be taken into consideration total disbursement for Component 3 would be over \$2 million. On this basis, it will not be wrong to conclude that IWEP-2 implemented over \$2.5 million worth of activity with \$1.1 million fund committed by SIDA.

3.2.2 Ownership

Ownership for IWEP-2 was observed at all levels. GAP RDA was well informed on the project and meeting its responsibilities with a problem solving attitude and in timely manner. ÇATOM managers and staff are hardworking and dedicated; and strong believers of the cause. A genuine solidarity exists between ÇATOM staff, trainers mobilized by Halk Eğitimi, and/or other staff seconded to ÇATOMs from other public establishments. UNDP's project manager is dedicated to the project and was able to build efficient and effective relations with GAP RDA and the ÇATOMs. UNDP Ankara Office also demonstrated a strong ownership until the last year of the project when an organizational restructuring took place and adversely affected the smooth communication and coordination. The strong ownership in the field helped to overcome weakened ownership of Ankara Office in the last year until the new team were in full grasp of the project.

All activities are carried out with a positive attitude and smiling faces. Discrimination between the local population and the Syrian refugees was not observed in any of the eight ÇATOMs visited during the final evaluation exercise.

The supporters of the Argande brand in design, promotion and sales demonstrated a dedicated volunteerism. Hatice Gökçe, a renowned designer and design coordinator of the Argande brand, says that the backbone of IWEP-2 is volunteers' efforts. She stated that 16 collections created in 8 years were prepared with the support of 30 designers.

3.3 Result Level Evaluation

3.3.1 Effectiveness

Output Targets and Their Achievement

The targeted outputs and their achievement performance by activities planned in IWEP-2 are summarized in the table below. The comparison of targeted outputs of the project with their actual achievement shows that training programs on social issues and skill development were highly successful with the outreach well exceeding the intended number by implementation of the activities in components 1 and 2. Syrian women also participated in these programs. In addition, training programs on gender equality and reproductive health were organized for men in the coffee houses. Men who attended training programs in the coffee houses were positively affected and stated that their views changed in favour of these programs. They felt thankful because there was a center where their wives, daughters and sisters could safely attend, learn and produce.

Business support as recommended by the 2011 evaluation report and planned under **Component 1** for the commercial enterprises, mainly women cooperatives and women owned enterprises was extended to only five instead of the targeted 10. Festivals and forums planned for women never took off because of the political and social turmoil⁵ in the region as receipt of official permissions would have been difficult, if not impossible, and participation would have been very low. The policy note planned to be prepared for dissemination to actors on experiences and policies to increase women's labour force participation was not ready in late November 2016 when the final evaluation of the project was being conducted. UNDP said they were going to draft it by the end of the project on 31 December 2016.

Women cooperatives, although a few in number, also became more effective in their operations and in employing women by the support they received from IWEP-2. They enlarged their product ranges; increased their market penetration by finding new clients; and started participating in fairs. Funding of the food processing and packaging and the sewing machinery enabled the cooperatives to employ women, other than their members, seasonally and/or when the order quantities placed with them require more labour input. For example, Mesopotamia Women Cooperative employs up to 30 women on seasonal basis for production of pomegranate juice, dried vegetables, tomato paste, etc. Gaziantep Women Cooperative developed new products from *Kutnu*, the indigenous fabric of Gaziantep, and also started producing children's

⁵ UN DSS fully restricted entry of UN personnel to several provinces and/or districts in the region or limited the entry to or exits from these to certain hours of the day. In addition, deliveries and/or collections of the materials/products for Rumisu and Argande by logistics companies were either not possible or delayed due to security reasons.

stuffed toys. The cooperative employs 8-10 women when the orders for their textile products exceed the capacity that can be produced by their members.

The effectiveness of the social empowerment programs are vividly expressed by women who joined focus group meetings. Their comments on how their daily lives changed following the training programs and sales of handicrafts they produced may be summarized as:

- increase of self-confidence, sense of security and sense of self-worth;
- heightened self-pride;
- developed skills; and
- increased awareness of their abilities.

Some said that they had started making their own voting decisions in the local and general elections. Women also underlined the effectiveness of the economic empowerment programs as they claimed that they:

- invested their earnings into gold coins;
- paid their debts;
- purchased goods such as mobile phones, clothing, etc. for their own use;
- supported their children's, particularly daughters', education;
- were able to make savings in clothing and household textile expenses due to their attained and developed sewing skills; and
- opened bank accounts – although a few examples to date.

Activities	Outputs	
	Target	Actual Achievement
Component 1: Increasing business management and entrepreneur skills of women in Southeast Anatolia with a view to strengthen their economic empowerment and empower them socially within their communities		
Training programs on gender equality, reproductive health, civil rights, participation, etc Empowerment and training services by ÇATOMs	300 women in year 1 and 30% increase over 300= 90 women in year 2= 390 women in total	👍 577 women and 106 men until end-Sep 2016
Skills development for income generation	20% increase over 572 women and 30% in year 2=~900 women in total	👍 ~300 women participated in design workshops 👍 ~4,000 women participated in sewing/needlework ateliers supported by provision of machinery and supplies
Business support to commercial enterprises employing women	At least 10 enterprises	👍 3 women cooperatives were given in-kind support in form of machinery and supplies and received trainings 👍 5 women owned businesses received business development support 👍 Business plan prepared for one enterprise
Women's forums and festivals	In 2 nd year of project	🚫 Could not be organized because of the political turmoil and social unrest in the region
Policy note on increasing women's labour force participation	In 2 nd year of project	👍 Will be prepared by end of project on 31 Dec 2016

There also exist cases of women establishing their own small businesses such as retail sales of readymade garments, opening a garment alteration atelier, etc. Other positive effects of IWEP-2 are pointed out by ÇATOM managers as the attention women started giving to their appearance and their improving attitudes in time management. They have become more careful with what they wear; clean and more in-fashion clothes. Fewer women leave the programs before its completion hour. More women respect deadlines in delivering handicrafts they produce. In addition, the trainers claimed an increasing participation by women in the discussions they hold during classes. Their participative attitude was also observed in the focus group discussions carried out during final evaluation of IWEP-2.

The achievement of outputs in **Component 2** except for the childcare center was well over the targets. Between 2014 and 2016 nearly 900 women generated a total of TL250,000 by doing piecemeal work for İstanbul based companies Rumisu⁶ and Koton⁷. Various handicrafts, textile items, home accessories, etc. produced in the ateliers of ÇATOMs supported by IWEP-2 were sold in the fairs organized by İstanbul Metropolitan Municipality (İBB) and raised a total income of TL820,000 for 2,500 women. Several women attending skill development programs claimed to be also preparing household textiles for themselves and their neighbours making use of ÇATOM facilities and some said that they even were able to raise some income from the work they do in their neighbourhoods.

Activities	Outputs	
	Target	Actual Achievement
Component 2: Increasing opportunities for employment and income generation of women in Southeast Anatolia with stronger market connections		
Marketing through direct sales, fair participation, trade fairs	Women generating income Increase from 300 to 500	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 👍 ~2,500 women generated TL820,000 in İstanbul Fairs between 2013 and 2016 👍 ~80 women generated TL70,000 from production of Rumisu 's amigurumi in 2014-2016 👍 ~800 women generated TL180,000 from beadwork on Koton's t-shirts 👍 ~200 women sewing household textiles for their neighbours on fee per piece basis 👍 3 women cooperatives participated in fairs 👍 ~20 members of women cooperatives and ~100 women employed on seasonal and/or need basis generating income
	Increase number of women with increased income to 450 women in year 2	
Children day care model developed	In 1 st year of project	☺ Children's play room came on board in Kilis Ekrem Çetin ÇATOM in 1 st quarter of 2016 instead of the facility planned in Batman
Pilot childcare facility operationalized	In 2 nd year of project	
Source: Project Document, Progress Reports, Interviews		

⁶ Rumisu's (<https://istanbul.rumisu.com/>) owners organized design workshops and trained women for production of amigurumi. In 2014 and 2015 amigurumis were produced in Viranşehir, İdil and Nusaybin ÇATOMs. In 2016, the production was transferred to Kilis Ekrem Çetin ÇATOM because of the social and political unrest in the former production centers.

⁷ Koton (<http://www.koton.com/>) placed orders for doing beadwork on 19,000 t-shirts under its 'Inclusive Business Models' (<http://www.kotonelemegi.com/>) project (a CSR project) in 11 ÇATOMs in Adıyaman, Gaziantep, Kilis, Mardin and Şanlıurfa in 2016. These are being sold in Koton's 50 sales points in Turkey.

Targeted outputs in **Component 3** were based on the institutional development of the Argande brand; and broadening and strengthening of its market penetration in the domestic and international domains. Argande was well promoted and became a known brand in the fashion circles as result of the volunteer contribution by the designers, PR companies, etc. Such contribution yielded seven collections and the catalogues for these collections; all produced by meagre allocations for travel from IWEP-2's budget. Mudo's still continuing and Markafoni's 2013-14 supports in sales of Argande products generated a total of ~TL647,000 income in the project period. However, new domestic buyers and international buyers did not come aboard as intended.

Activities	Outputs	
	Target	Actual Achievement
Component 3: Increasing income of women in Southeast Anatolia by engaging in production under the regional brand 'Argande', building a good example of PPP		
Develop and strengthen Argande as a regional brand	Increase in employment by Argande from 35 to 50 in year 1 and to 75 in year 2= 40 new recruits	☹️ Employment of 15 women in Batman and 15 in Kilis. Employment of 4 new staff in İstanbul, Batman and Kilis as of end-2015. ☹️ Situation as of November 2016: 20 employees in Kilis atelier and 1 in İstanbul
	Increase in number of women generating fee based incomes from 150 to 200	☹️ Situation as of November 2016: 5-6 attendees of Kilis İsmet Çetin ÇATOM supporting production in case of high order quantities and 25 women doing piecework for Argande collections
	30% sales increase on TL 85,000=TL110,500 in year 1 and 35% increase=~TL150,000 in year 2	👍 designs for 7 seasonal collections prepared generating 2013: TL85,751 2015: TL166,843 2014: TL194,413 2016: ~ TL 200,000 income
	Increase in number of institutional buyers to 4 with new international market connections	⊗ two buyers, Mudo and Markafoni, in 2013-14 and one buyer, only Mudo, since then ☹️ several contacts made with international fashion fairs and domestic exporters but no tangible output
	Use of local fabrics	👍 Gaziantep's indigenous fabric <i>Kutnu</i> used in Argande collections
Promote Argande brand	PR strategy	☹️ PR strategy developed by volunteering fashion professionals ☹️ no PR company contracted but voluntary contribution by 4 PR companies
	Web portal	⊗ no web portal prepared
	At least 120 media appearances annually	👍 promotional video prepared 👍 participation in 2013 and 2014 Mercedes-Benz Fashion weeks in İstanbul 👍 7 catalogue shootings organized and 7 catalogues printed 👍 A total of 750 media appearances
Increase management capacity of Argande brand	Business development and professional management services	👍 Business plan prepared in end-2012 👍 Search conference on the future and sustainability of the brand in Feb 2015 👍 Brand identity analysis in Apr 2016
Source: Project Document, Progress Reports, Interviews		

Steps toward institutionalization of the brand were taken with preparation of a business plan at the end of 2012; and the subsequent search conference on the future and sustainability of the brand in 2015 and the study conducted on the brand identity in 2016. The discussions on the legal status of the Argande operation focused on establishment of a foundation or an association. However, further steps were not taken.

Argande operation was affected by two unfortunate circumstances. The procurement and sales responsible recruited in the third quarter of 2013 proved to be incompetent and caused harm to the relations with the buyers and the suppliers until a new employee was recruited in March 2014. The moving of the Argande atelier from Batman to Kilis in early 2015 adversely affected production and the sales causing a 14% decrease in sales income. Sales picked up in 2016 but were able to reach only to their 2014 level because of deteriorating political and economic climate of the country since 2015 summer. These developments also impeded the intended increase in employment of women. However, the 35 employees of the Batman atelier were able to find jobs in other textile plants. The current labour force in the Kilis atelier is employed under the İŞKUR's scheme of trainee support for periods varying between three to nine months. This practice results in high turnover of personnel and weakens the human capital of the atelier but offers new opportunities for the trained women. 15 of the 50 women trained to date in the Kilis atelier were recruited by other ready wear establishments.

As mentioned in Section 3.1.2 IWEP-2 did not have a written communication and advocacy strategy. The strategy developed by the volunteers was reaching the fashion world as a first step and to the buyers via the fashion world as a second step. The implementation of this strategy required engagement of a PR company and preparation of a web portal for the brand. A PR agency was never officially contracted because the committed funds were not sufficient to finance a PR contract that would annually drain \$20,000-32,000. Instead, voluntary support was received from four PR agencies. However, as Ms Gökçe puts it, paying business always took precedence over the voluntary contribution by these agencies; i.e. their input was not regular and not always in synchronization with the promotion needs. However irregular they may be, PR activities were able to embrace 300 players of the fashion world. Argande will be taking place in the 2017 İstanbul Fashion Week in January; again by voluntary contribution, the cost of which is around \$10,000,

The web portal was not prepared and the existing website of Argande was not updated as the project partners decided that a web portal without an institutional structure would not be efficient and effective.

Multiplier Effects

Ms Akbaş, the General Coordinator of Social Projects at GAP RDA, believes that IWEP-2 has also enhanced the capacity of ÇATOMs, the meeting and training centers for women. They now house strengthened sewing and food processing ateliers and are able to offer higher value added services. Their trainers have improved their training capabilities as result of being trained by the expert trainers mobilized by IWEP-2. These expert trainers funded by the project are regarded to be competent in teaching and communication

The product design and quality improvement trainings recommended by the 2011 evaluation report paved the road to new markets. Women started realizing that there exists an economic potential for the items they make. Managers of some ÇATOMs started taking initiatives – as also was one the recommendations of the 2011 evaluation report – in searching new markets and extending effort to strengthen their already existing markets for the handicrafts produced by

their attendees. Some others organized teams for production of household textiles, needlework, etc., market their capacities and receive orders; thus creating opportunities for income generation.

Other multiplier effects of IWEP-2 were the introduction of Gaziantep's *Kutnu* and and Şırnak's *Şelşepik* fabrics, the indigenous products of the region, to wider markets; and establishment of women cooperatives to ensure legal, financial and operational continuation of the production process. *Kutnu* and *Şelşepik* is being used in Argande collections. The leading *Kutnu* manufacturer in Gaziantep says involvement in Argande encouraged him to improve the quality of the fabric he produces.

Instigation of volunteerism among key actors of the domestic fashion market should also be considered as a substantial multiplier effect. Renowned fashion designers and models, PR companies, photographers, etc. contributed to the preparation and promotion of the Argande collection free of charge and state that they will continue to do so.

SDG Relation

In relation to SDG of achieving gender equality and empowering women and girls, IWEP-2's activities resulted in the following changes:

- Women has taken steps in understanding of gender equality and civil rights and in building up their self-confidence;
- They have been sparing less time for 'unproductive and time consuming' house chores; instead allowing more time for training programs and production at the ÇATOMs; and thus feeling psychologically empowered; and
- They feel economically empowered because of their improved skills and the income they have been able to generate from the piecework they have produced and sold via the ÇATOMs; and because of freedom of spending their own money.

The Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness and the Accra Agenda for Action Relation

IWEP-2 has made strong contribution into improving the implementation of the principles of The Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness and the Accra Agenda for Action.

- The project is aligned with Turkey's national development strategies set out in the country's national development plans.
- The involvement of GAP RDA as the project partner has assured the use of aid for agreed purposes. The ownership demonstrated by the Ministry of Development and GAP RDA has been a significant factor in successful implementation of the project.
- GAP RDA has managed IWEP-2 for achieving results; and although the administration was not liable for co-financing, its in-kind contribution; i.e. the allocation of office space to the project together with free utilities, the appointment of a driver to the project, the cost of the utilities in the Argande Atelier in Kilis etc.; has rendered reasonable savings in the project budget.
- IWEP-2 has been very successful in building partnerships with the other public administrations such as İŞKUR, Special Provincial Administration; the governorates; and, most important of all, with the leading companies and actors of the Turkish fashion world active in design, production, promotion and sales. The volunteer contribution of the Turkish fashion world has increased value for money. The project was also a good example of attracting textile manufacturers such as Koton and Rumisu to practice their CSR.

Gender Sensitivity

The implementation of IWEP-2 was gender sensitive and complied closely with UNDP's gender mainstreaming principles. Training programs were designed for the needs and according to the capacities and expectations of women; income generating initiatives for women were organized; women cooperatives were supported; and women were employed in the Argande Atelier. In addition, gender equality and reproduction health trainings were arranged for men to ensure gender sensitiveness.

The organization structure of the project was also gender sensitive; the project coordinator of GAP RDA, the project manager and the ÇATOM managers were all women; and the project's volunteers were women by majority.

According to Gender Equality Strategy (2016-2020) of UNDP Country Office (GES-CO), partnership and collaboration with other UN agencies, governmental bodies, civil society organizations, academia, communities, and private sector is one the four objectives of the strategy to build a strong policy dialogue. The cooperation among the designers, PR companies, etc. as members of the private sector; and the governorates, İŞKUR and the special provincial administrations has been exemplary. Establishment of the children's play room in Kilis Ekrem Çetin ÇATOM; support extended to the play and reading rooms in other ÇATOMs; and the relations with the Syrian Ayşe Kadın Association were reinforcing activities for implementation of the GES-CO, the third objective of which is 'creation of tools and mechanisms to a gender sensitive approach in programme/project management'

3.3.2 Sustainability

Components 1 and 2

GAP RDA has been in the region since 1989 and carried out many social and economic projects for the region's development. It is a highly respected administration due to its success in boosting the region's economy and contributing to betterment of the social issues. The government of Turkey, aware of the difficulty of minimizing social and political problems unless economic problems are resolved, has guaranteed use of all budget allocated to GAP RDA to be spent in the region; i.e. not to be transferred to projects outside the region. ÇATOMs under GAP RDA have contributed to social and cultural development of the women since their establishment in 1995. They will be there as long as GAP RDA is in the region. Moreover, several international donors such as the European Commission, UNICEF, ILO, etc. and development agencies of many western governments have funded and are still funding development interventions in which GAP RDA was and still is the main beneficiary. Its experience in the region, its project management capacity and the ownership it demonstrated will insure the sustainability of the achieved results.

Achieved results are also likely to be sustained due to high ownership of the final beneficiaries who express their loyalty as:

- 'There is still a lot I need to learn, I will continue attending the training programs.'
- 'I will continue attending to the ÇATOM even if there is no money earning activities.'
- 'I will keep attending to the ÇATOM despite the transportation cost it generates for me.'
- 'I encourage my neighbours/friends to participate in ÇATOM activities.'
- 'I plan to bring along my daughter next year when she will be attending school in the first half of the day and be free in the afternoon.'

The signs that indicate economic empowerment achieved by women via the ÇATOMs will be sustainable are:

- Women have started doing piecework in their neighbourhoods against a fee.
- Rumisu's, a scarves/shawls maker also exporting its products, and Koton's, a leading ready wear retail chain, are pleased with production of crocheted items/embroidery/beadwork made by ÇATOMs' participants and stated that they will continue placing new orders. Koton decided to increase the number of its sales points where products made by ÇATOM attendees from 50 to 150⁸.
- Participation in İBB's İstanbul Fair will continue as long as it is organized.
- Design workshops have triggered new designs and product diversification in both the ÇATOMs and the women cooperatives and have thus caused them to become more market oriented.
- Awareness for the south eastern women's skills have risen in the fashion world due to connections made above and promotion of the Argande brand and therefore new business requests will continue to flow in.
- The attendees of ÇATOMs have started pushing their managers for initiating new market connections and will continue to do so as they are now highly satisfied with the economic power they have gained; as little as it may be.

However, the financial sustainability of the women cooperatives, despite their enhanced creativity in initiating new business lines and developing new products, is at risk because of the high operating costs and the comparatively low income the members are able to generate.

The annual net income per member was said to be TL1,200-1,500 (\$400-500⁹) in Mesopotamia Women Cooperative active in production of foodstuff from local produce. The cooperative's building was allocated by the Municipality that also paid the utilities and provided the transportation of the raw materials. The municipality has been taken over by trustees who may not continue supporting the cooperative.

Members of the Gaziantep Women Cooperative involved in the production of local needlework *Antepişi* items and household textile from *Kutnu* are able to earn TL3,000 (\$1,000) per head per year. The production atelier is currently in one room of the hotel owned by the cooperative's founder who cannot guarantee this arrangement if the tourism sector picks up in Gaziantep.

However, aware of their financial weaknesses the cooperative members have built a strong will power and determination to continue their operations. They are trying very hard to expand their product ranges and find new markets for their products.

Component 3: Argande's Sustainability

Argande's sustainability in the medium and long term will be based on:

- Formation of an institutional structure
- New designs and their promotion
- Strengthening of the production facility
- Increase in number of domestic buyers and the inclusion of foreign buyers

⁸ ÇATOM made products will be sold in 56% of Koton's 270 sales points in Turkey in 2017.

⁹ Based on \$1=TL3

Institutional Structure: The purpose of Component 3 was to institutionalize the Argande brand to ensure a regular income flow for the south eastern women. In the search conference organized in February 2015 the participants united for establishment of a non-profit organization such as a foundation. The main beneficiary GAP RDA, as a public administration, cannot establish a foundation. The founding capital as of 2016 is TL60,000; an amount that cannot be easily raised unless there exist financially powerful believers in the brand. Another possibility is stated as joining to one of the strong foundations owned by prominent businessmen. To date, discussions were carried out on several potential candidates but none of them have been approached.

Operational Sustainability: Operational sustainability stands on the pillars of design, production, promotion and sales. Continuation of the design process will be ensured by the designers who voluntarily supported IWEP-2. They are dedicated and determined to continue their voluntary contributions.

Continuation and expansion of production can only be ensured with well trained/experienced labour. The current labour base comprises the women financed by İŞKUR's vocational training supports¹⁰. Kilis Ekrem Çetin ÇATOM where the Argande atelier is located also lends their İŞKUR supported staff if and when the orders exceed the production capacity of the atelier. This arrangement is very vulnerable as the turnover rate of labour is high and hinders experience accumulation and hence the quality and quantity of production. The production foreman says that their current production capacity stands at 15-20 pieces as against the atelier's installed daily capacity of 60-80 pieces.

Promotion of the brand is likely to continue as two PR companies have already approached IWEP-2's project manager expressing their interest in voluntary support. The models posing for the catalogue shootings and the photographer are also willing to continue their voluntary supports. However, as experienced before, regular voluntary support of PR agencies cannot be guaranteed.

Sales of Argande products are currently made by Mudo in their 11 sales points in İstanbul, Ankara, Antalya, Bursa, İzmir, Mersin and Gaziantep and also in their on-line store. The economic recession over the past 18 months has forced Mudo to decrease the number of sales points from 17 to 11. The intention to increase the number of buyers to four with new international market connections did not materialize over the course of IWEP-2. Consequently, the market vulnerability of the brand is still a major issue weakening its operational sustainability.

Financial Sustainability: Sustaining Argande operation financially seems to be the weakest point. In the 2012-2014 period, the operation has been fully financed by the funds allocated from IWEP-2's budget, by GAP RDA and by İŞKUR as set out in the table below. In 2015 and 2016 the income flowing in from sales of Argande products were used to purchase the necessary fabric, auxiliary and packing materials, transportation, etc. Design for collections and catalogue preparation has always been voluntarily contributed by the supporters of the brand, so were the PR activities. Mudo ceased its fully voluntary support in October 2016 and started subtracting a 20% commission on sales.

The feasibility study prepared at the end of 2012 had estimated annual fixed expenses at approximately \$200,000 and variable expenses at \$108,000 (end-2012 rate of currency

¹⁰ The participant is paid a daily fee by İŞKUR for the days she attends. No cost incurs for the employer.

\$1=TL1.78) for a production level of 9,000 pieces and sales of 8,000 pieces. On this basis, total annual expenses would have been \$268,000 (assuming no inflation on \$ basis) for the 5,000 pieces sold in 2016 if there were no support. The expected income for 2016 stands at around TL200,000 (\$67,000 at \$1=TL3); one quarter of the likely operational cost. The sales income is not sufficient even to meet the cost of 20 employees in the atelier. Were they paid the minimum wage, the total annual cost of labour would have been TL480,000¹¹; more than twice the annual sales income. Kilis İŞKUR Manager says that the support that has been continuing since early 2015 needs to end and Argande should start bearing the cost of labour.

Cost Item	Source of Financing
Fabric	IWEP-2 in 2012-2014 Argande sales income in 2015-2016
Auxiliary materials (sewing thread, buttons, zippers, etc.)	
Packing materials	
Transportation	Argande sales income (Aras Kargo quotes discounted rate)
Rent and utilities for the atelier	GAP RDA
Personnel (production and sales)	IWEP-2
Labour	İŞKUR
Lunches and tea	Argande sales income
Collection preparation (design, photography, modelling, etc)	Voluntary support by private sector
Catalogue printing	IWEP-2
PR and promotion (fashion shows, TV, press, etc.)	Voluntary support by private sector Billboards by İBB Free participation in 2013 and 2014 İstanbul Fashion Week
Sales point expenses	Mudo (no commission until Oct 2016, 20% since then)
Source: Interviews	

Mudo places significant importance on supporting the brand and considers their efforts to be CSR approach. However, the problems Mudo has been experiencing for one year also affected Argande with a decrease in number of sales points as mentioned above. Moreover, the contraction of the sales volumes in the stores located in shopping centers changed the balance of sales to the favour of discount store where products are sold with significantly reduced prices. It is estimated that 50% of the 5,000 pieces sold in 2016 were from Mudo's discount store. Such a sales breakdown by type of store caused the expected income to decrease by at least 25%.

Argande operation has fabrics and auxiliary materials in stock and TL 115,000 receivables to collect from Mudo. Therefore it is likely that the operation will be able to continue in the first 3-4 months of 2017 with the voluntary supports and İŞKUR's incentives. The financial sustainability of the brand in the next 2-3 years will still be dependent upon continuation of subsidies by the public institutions, voluntary support by the designers/models/photographers and the likely donor support for a third phase funding. The concept note submitted to Government of Japan

¹¹ The monthly cost of one worker being paid the minimum gross wage of TL1,600 is ~TL2,000 by the time allocations are made for employer's share of social security premium.

envisages continuation of IWEP-2's activities in Gaziantep, Kilis and Şanlıurfa ÇATOMs under its 3rd component: Support to Women's Socio-economic Empowerment in Southeast Anatolia.

4 Impact Assessment — Achievement of Wider Objectives

Outcome 5 of the UNDCS 2011-15 stipulates "equal participation of women ensured in all fields of public sector, private sector and civil society with strengthened institutional mechanisms to empower women's status" and sets one of the indicators as the increase in labour force participation of women. Result 5.1.1 is about women's enterprises in Southeast Anatolia having production and marketing skills to generate incomes and improve their life standards. IWEP-2 is designed under this outcome and the intended result and has the wider objectives (outcomes) of;

1. Increasing women's individual productive and social capacities and enterprise level management skills to empower women within their communities;
2. Increasing women's income through entrepreneurship and increased employment opportunities; and
3. Building and disseminating knowledge for policy making while achieving results at the local level.

Micro Level Impact

An 2010 article¹² by Assistant Professor Nilay Çabuk Kaya of Ankara University had concluded that the training programs in the ÇATOMs were limited to enhancement of women's intentions and motivation to participate in the communal life; basing this on interviews with 2,187 women living in the seven provinces of the GAP region. The following six years; two of IWEP's first phase and four of IWEP-2; contributed significantly to women's social and economic empowerment. The four focus group discussions conducted with women participating in ÇATOM training programs and production ateliers revealed that they had improved their productive and social capacities; generated income as result of their developed skills; were being employed by the business establishments in the region; established companies/cooperatives to sell their products; and therefore were feeling powerful and confident (see Section 3.3.1 above).

Mezzo Level Impact

The impact of IWEP-2 on institutions in the GAP region has basically been the enhancement of ÇATOMs' capacities. ÇATOMs' activities were focused on social and cultural activities and skill development programs until IWEPs intervention. IWEP introduced the concept of economic empowerment into the ÇATOMs and not only trained the women attending these centers but also the managers and the trainers employed there. Design workshops and participation in fairs were organized during IWEP-2 in addition to continuing training programs on gender equality, reproductive health, rights, etc. The managers and trainers now pay attention to the likely economic value of their programs and try to teach new designs and develop saleable products; and take initiatives in developing new markets and strengthening these. The improved capacities of ÇATOMs were particularly instrumental in creating the expected impact in relation to the first two outcomes of IWEP-2 listed above.

¹² 'Empowerment of Women by Awareness Rising: A Development Model in the GAP Region', published in Journal of Sociological Research, Fall 2010 edition

Macro Level Impact

A project's macro level impact is often not immediately visible. Moreover, achievement of outcomes usually formulated at a macro level requires progress in areas beyond the scope of a single project. Therefore it is difficult to fully attribute the growth of the female labour force in the GAP region or measure the extent to which IWEP-2 had directly impacted such growth. However, IWEP with its two phases spread over eight years is likely to have positively affected the growth of female labour force participation. In 2010, female labour force participation and employment rate were 27.6% and 24% respectively in Turkey while the average for the GAP region was less than half of these rates. In 2015, the same rates for the GAP region rose to more than half of those for Turkey. Şanlıurfa and Diyarbakır were the key provinces accelerating this growth.

Growth of Female Labour Force and Employment in GAP Region, 2010-15			
	NUTS II Regions	Labour force participation rate (%)	Employment rate (%)
2010	TRC1 (<i>Gaziantep, Adıyaman, Kilis</i>)	17.6	15.9
	TRC2 (<i>Şanlıurfa, Diyarbakır</i>)	9.8	9.3
	TRC3 (<i>Mardin, Batman, Şırnak, Siirt</i>)	10.2	9.4
	Total GAP Provinces	12.4	11.5
	Turkey	27.6	24.0
2015	TRC1 (<i>Gaziantep, Adıyaman, Kilis</i>)	18.9	16.8
	TRC2 (<i>Şanlıurfa, Diyarbakır</i>)	20.2	17.8
	TRC3 (<i>Mardin, Batman, Şırnak, Siirt</i>)	12.2	9.0
	Total GAP Provinces	17.8	15.3
	Turkey	31.5	27.5
Growth 2010-15	increase in points		
	TRC1 (<i>Gaziantep, Adıyaman, Kilis</i>)	1.3	0.9
	TRC2 (<i>Şanlıurfa, Diyarbakır</i>)	10.4	8.5
	TRC3 (<i>Mardin, Batman, Şırnak, Siirt</i>)	2.0	-0.4
	Total GAP Provinces	5.4	3.8
	Turkey	3.9	3.5

Source: Turkstat Labour Force Statistics

Registered labour statistics also show the growing importance of female labour. Between 2013 and 2015, the number of the compulsorily insured women in the GAP region increased by 29% as against Turkey's average of 19%. The table below also sets out that the growth of registered female labour in all provinces of the GAP region, except for Adıyaman and Şırnak was above that of Turkey. Batman, Kilis, Şanlıurfa and Siirt recorded higher growth rates than that of the region.

Growth of Registered Female Labour in GAP Region 2013-15			
Provinces	No of Compulsorily Insured		Growth 2013-15
	2013	2015	
Adiyaman	4,906	7,579	18%
Diyarbakir	34,178	43,904	28%
Gaziantep	57,439	70,774	23%
Mardin	13,440	16,890	26%
Siirt	5,029	6,515	30%
Şanlıurfa	29,125	40,212	38%
Batman	10,190	15,659	54%
Şırnak	6,259	7,397	18%
Kilis	4,092	5,968	46%
Total GAP Provinces	174,658	224,898	29%
Turkey Total	4,618,448	5,494,347	19%

Source: SGK Activity Reports

Textile sector that provided the setting for many of IWEP-2's activities registered substantial growth in the GAP region between 2010 and 2015 compared to its average growth rate in Turkey. The growth in number establishments involved in ready wear and the number of registered labour in those was higher in all provinces, except for Siirt, than the Turkey's average. Mardin, Şanlıurfa, Batman and Kilis had higher growth rates than the average for the GAP region. Here again, it is difficult to measure to which extent IWEP-2 boosted the development of the textile industry in the region; but Mr Yunus Çolak of Karacadağ (Diyarbakir and Şanlıurfa) DA underlines the project's impact saying 'Argande made Batman a textile city.'

Growth of the Textile Sector in GAP Region, 2010-15								
Provinces	2010				2015			
	No of establishments		No of Compulsorily Insured persons		No of establishments		No of Compulsorily Insured persons	
	Textile Products	Ready wear	Textile Products	Ready wear	Textile Products	Ready wear	Textile Products	Ready wear
Adiyaman	63	73	3,201	2432	57	110	3,164	3,414
Diyarbakir	74	31	1,183	513	56	56	1,187	1,020
Gaziantep	910	386	37,793	1786	1,021	856	52,999	3,377
Mardin	19	3	249	205	20	29	741	1,957
Siirt	7	8	39	53	5	10	10	211
Şanlıurfa	39	10	2,140	99	56	51	2,560	3,154
Batman	22	8	415	201	19	56	1,045	4,772
Şırnak	3	6	34	69	1	3	107	21
Kilis	4	0	150	0	8	9	284	291
Total GAP Provinces:	1,141	525	45,204	5,358	1,243	1,180	62,097	18,217
Growth 2010-15					9%	125%	37%	240%
Turkey Total	16,047	30,325	392,550	413,218	17,050	33,265	420,927	482,816
Growth 2010-15					6%	10%	7%	17%

Source: SGK Activity Reports

'Southeast Anatolian Project – State of Affairs', a report published by GAP RDA in May 2016 states that textile industry has entered into an accelerated growth in the region. Karacadağ DA's study for Şanlıurfa verifies this growth with 30 of the 217 investments made by state incentives

in the province between 2009 and 2015 were in the textile and ready wear industries. These 30 textile and ready wear plants accounted for 30% of the total fixed investments made by; and 40% of the labour employed in these 217 establishments.

The official statistics do not provide the number of compulsorily insured persons by gender but Mr Mehmet Açıkgöz, Vice President of GAP RDA, claimed that women trained in the ÇATOM ateliers were preferred to be employed by the business establishments.

Argande's Impact

The voluntary support IWEP-2 received for Argande from the designers and PR companies not only promoted the brand in the Turkish fashion industry but also increased the awareness of the GAP region and the likely potential it offered for investments. Moreover, attention was drawn to the capacities of ÇATOMs and the women attending these centers. Consequently, textile investments in the region surged as illustrated above and textile companies in western Turkey started looking into the possibility of mobilizing the trained women of the region in their operations. Collaborations with the ÇATOMs and their attendees flourished in form of CSR projects.

Rumisu and Koton both came across IWEP-2 via the designers preparing collections for the Argande brand. Rumisu got involved in the project in 2012 and started organizing design workshops in İdil, Nusaybin, Viranşehir, Dargeçit, Cizre and Sur ÇATOMs. In 2013, amigurumis and small linen bags used for packaging scarves were already being produced in the İdil, Nusaybin and Viranşehir ÇATOMs generating income for women. Koton's 2016 involvement in IWEP-2 was late but provided higher benefits for more women.

5 Conclusions and Recommendations

5.1 Conclusions and Lessons Learnt

Conclusions below are based on the data and information collected in the desk research carried out on project documents, strategy papers and national plans; internet search on sectoral, labour, etc. statistics; the interviews held with IWEP-2's stakeholders; and focus group discussions conducted with the women benefiting from the project's activities.

Relevance

IWEP-2 was highly relevant in addressing the needs and problems of women in the GAP region and its activities catered to achievement of the objectives. In addition, it responded to the development challenges stipulated in the national plans and UNDC; and served to SDG. It was also designed as gender sensitive as its objectives and the intended results addressed the gender inequality.

Selection of ÇATOMs as centers for IWEP-2's activities increased the efficiency of the activities and ensured the sustainability of the responses to development challenges.

The monitoring of the project was carried out by quarterly and annual progress reports; however, the lack of an interim evaluation weakened the likely effectiveness and sustainability of the third component in which Argande operation was included.

The budget for Component 3 took into account the continuation of the voluntary support that was received in the first phase of the project. This was a precarious approach in ensuring the implementation of the planned activities. The voluntary support by the PR agencies and Mudo slackened in 2015 and 2016 when the political and social turmoil started affecting the economic activity.

Lesson 1: Development interventions targeting women will easily reach their beneficiaries; will be efficiently implemented; and achieve the intended outputs that will be sustainable if they work with powerful regional administrations with local networks serving women.

Lesson 2: Increasing women's income by creation of a regional ready wear brand is a highly ambitious engagement and necessitates more resources (funds, personnel, time, etc.)

Efficiency

IWEP-2 was successful in turning resources/inputs (funds, time, human resources, etc.) into outputs in its first and second components. It has been able to complete majority of its planned activities and exceeded the targeted outputs in many of its activities.

The political and social turmoil in the region hindered the efficient implementation of the activities under component 3 causing delays and hence necessitating extension of the project period.

The governance structure in which the main beneficiary GAP RDA, İŞKUR, governorates and special provincial administrations had roles facilitated efficient management and monitoring of the project. Allocation of ÇATOMs premises to the project also contributed to efficient implementation of the activities. ÇATOMs also benefited from this partnership by achieving higher efficiency in their own training programs as result of increased capacities of their managers and trainers.

The project management was successful in sustaining the voluntary support of the fashion circles that began in the first phase of the project. The estimated worth of this voluntary support was equivalent to the total of funds committed to IWEP-2.

Ownership

All stakeholders of IWEP-2 took on active roles in implementation of the project. There was not only institutional ownership but also personal ownership demonstrated by the project manager, ÇATOM managers and the project volunteers. The final beneficiaries, i.e. women who have attended training programs, are dedicated and have plans to continue making use of ÇATOMs' programs. Excitement, enthusiasm, and; admiration and appreciation for the benefits delivered by the project were observed at all levels. Dedication of the project's supporters was exemplary. A genuine solidarity existed between the main beneficiary, project management, voluntary supporters of the project and the local public administrations.

Effectiveness

IWEP-2 fully achieved the objectives of its first and second components. The activities were able to enhance women's skills; empowered them socially within their communities; and laid the road to their economic empowerment.

The goal of increasing women's income by strengthening the regional brand Argande (Component 3) has not been fully achieved during IWEP-2. Genuine efforts with substantial voluntary support were mobilized for the project but the intended strengthening did not come through. Economic climate did not support the expected growth of the brand, particularly in 2015 and 2016; an institutional structure was not established; the number of buyers did not increase; and promotion was not a regular activity because it was voluntary.

Despite its failure to fully achieve its specific objective, Argande was successful in attracting textile investors to the region and was therefore able to indirectly increase women's labour force participation. In addition, ÇATOM attendees also benefited from the attraction Argande created with many of them doing piecework for textile companies and/or producing promotional items for other companies against a fee.

IWEP-2 took steps toward achieving the SDG for gender equality and empowering women and girls by training them on the equality and rights issues; developing their skills; and initiating market connections for sales of handicrafts they produced.

Trainings organized for men in the coffee houses increased the likely effectiveness of the intervention.

GAP RDA's in-kind support to the project and the ownership it demonstrated; and the exemplary PPP built during the project period were in line with the principles of The Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness and the Accra Agenda for Action.

IWEP-2 was also effective in promoting the *Kutnu* fabric and *Antepişi* needlework, the indigenous products of the region.

Lesson 3: Organization of training programs for men within interventions targeting women enhances the likely effectiveness of the project.

Sustainability

The achieved results in components 1 and 2 are likely to continue because of the high ownership demonstrated by GAP RDA and the ÇATOMs under the administration and the women who benefited from the activities in these components; the market connections established with private sector companies and fair participations; and the continuing support of the fashion circles for design and promotion the Argande brand. However, financial sustainability of the women cooperatives is at risk because of the comparatively low annual income the members are able to generate.

The sustainability of the Argande operation has a higher risk ratio because an institutional structure is still not in place; the current capacity of the atelier is low due to incompetency of the labour; products are being sold via one buyer who has recently decreased the number of its Argande selling points; and the sales income cannot meet the operation costs.

Lesson 4: Sustainability of a commercial operation requires more resources in terms of personnel and time which will necessitate provision of more funds. Voluntary input may/will be vulnerable during economic fluctuations.

Impact

The micro level impact of IWEP-2 is the social and economic empowerment of women within their communities. On mezzo level, the project has been able to enhance the capacities of ÇATOMs which are centers for empowerment of women. The macro level impact of IWEP-2 is evident in the flow of textile investments to the GAP region and the increase in women's labour force participation rate.

Overall Evaluation

The political and social turbulence Turkey has been experiencing since mid-2013 needs to be taken into consideration when evaluating IWEP-2. Such turmoil not only affected the general course of daily life but also gave way to an economic recession. Southeast Anatolia (GAP) region has suffered the most in this commotion in which Syrian influx also bore some share. Safety has been on thin ice in several of the region's provinces and districts, namely Batman; Kilis; Dargeçit and Nusaybin districts in Mardin; Suruç and Viranşehir in Şanlıurfa; Sur in Diyarbakır; and Cizre and İdil in Şırnak; hindering/delaying the project's activities.

Components 1 and 2 of IWEP-2, despite the adverse circumstances in the region:

- were instrumental in addressing the needs of the south eastern women;
- their activities were efficiently implemented;
- their output targets were achieved with full ownership of the project's stakeholders;
- the benefits generated by them will be sustainable; and
- created the expected impact at micro and mezzo levels.

Component 3 that involved engagement of more women in the Argande operation and hence increase in their earnings:

- also addressed the needs of the female population in southeast Anatolia;
- but there were delays in some of its activities with some partly or never accomplished;
- the ownership of project stakeholders and the volunteers, and the PPP demonstrated were exemplary;

- its output targets were partly achieved; but the worth of achieved output was almost four times the fund allocated for it;
- absence of an institutional structure and the economic recession¹³ that hit the ready wear retail chains jeopardized its sustainability; and
- was a unique intervention in being able to create an economic impact in the GAP region before being able to achieve its specific objective.

5.2 Recommendations

IWEP Specific

The necessity of funding a third phase of IWEP is obvious as the region is crowded with unskilled refugees in deep poverty and improvement of the economic climate in the short term is not expected. To address these problems UNDP submitted a concept note to Government of Japan for a new intervention. The project entitled ‘Increased Resilience for Higher Human Security for Syrians in Turkey during the Crisis’ aims to:

- Enhance capacities for active labour market policies in favour of the Syrian community including skills and competency development;
- Improve employability of the Syrians under temporary protection through skills/competency development interventions;
- improve labour absorption capacities of the local economic ecosystems through value chain/cluster and SME capacity/capability improvement;
- improve social infrastructure for Syrian women’s economic empowerment contributing to social stability in Southeast Anatolia; and
- improve municipal infrastructures as well as service delivery capacities of the municipalities serving the local economy in an inclusive manner.

The 3rd component of the project, namely ‘Support to Women’s Socio-economic Empowerment in Southeast Anatolia’, has a specific objective of improving the entrepreneurial capacities and socio-economic status of Syrian and host community women in Southeast Anatolia through interventions targeting their productive engagement in social and economic life in Gaziantep, Kilis and Şanlıurfa. It will be implemented in cooperation with GAP RDA and rely on ÇATOMs.

UNDP regards the third component of this intervention as the third phase of IWEP and plans to make use of the funds to continue delivering the activities of IWEP-2 that are in continuous need for empowerment of more women including the Syrians. The actions for effectiveness and sustainability of IWEP-2’s first two objectives are straightforward and will be continuation, in the new intervention, of what had been done to date. Addition of the designing and piloting financing schemes for women entrepreneurs to the envisaged activities has been crucial as it will fill the gap left in IWEP-2. However, actions for achievement of the goals under the Argande component need to be planned carefully with a view to ensure their sustainability.

Continuation of support to Argande is essential; otherwise eight years of hard work is likely to be wasted. However, the activities to be planned to achieve the specific objective and ensure

¹³ The shopping appetite has been receding as demonstrated by the private consumption statistics by TURKSTAT. Private consumption expenditure accounted for 68.4% of the GDP and recorded 7.7% growth rate in 2011. In 2015, its share in GDP was 66.7% and growth rate 4.8%. BETAM’s estimate for the third quarter of 2016 indicates 1% decline. Ready wear retail chains, with most of their sales points in shopping malls, are crushed under heavy rents often paid in \$ or € while their sales volumes are contracting.

sustainability need to be focused and prioritized. The main activities and the sub activities are recommended as the following:

1. Preparation of dossier setting out Argande's current position and its business plan – to be used in contacting potential founders and potential domestic and international buyers
2. Recruitment of a project personnel for promotional activities
3. Establishment of an institutional structure
 - a. Identifying and contacting potential founders for establishment of a foundation or for operation under an existing foundation
 - b. Official establishment of a foundation or preparation of an MoU for transferring Argande operation to an existing foundation
4. Putting the communication and advocacy strategy into writing and contracting a PR agency
5. Preparation of collections
6. Preparing a web portal for promotion and on-line sales
7. Identifying and contacting potential domestic and international buyers

Development Intervention Specific

Development interventions targeting south eastern women should be implemented in cooperation with GAP RDA that facilitates efficient and effective implementation via its ÇATOMs, the local network serving women.

Development interventions including commercial operations should plan and prioritize activities that would ensure achievement of specific objectives and their sustainability; allocate funds accordingly; and not be heavily dependent on private sector's voluntary support.

Development interventions targeting empowerment of women should also include parallel activities for men to increase the effectiveness of the projects.

6 Annexes

6.1 Printed Sources

1. 9th National Development Plan (2007-2013), State Planning Organization, 2006
2. 10th National Development Plan (2004-2018), Ministry of Development, 2013
3. UN Development Cooperation Strategy Turkey 2011-2015, March 2010
4. GAP Action Plan (2014-2018), GAP RDA, December 2014
5. Gender Mainstreaming in Practice: A Toolkit, 2007
6. UNDP Gender Equality Strategy 2014-2017
7. Gender Equality Strategy 2016-2020, Turkey Country Office
8. Report of the Inter-Agency and Expert Group on Sustainable Goal Indicators, Statistical Commission, UN Economic and Social Council, 8-11 March 2016
9. The Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness (2005) and the Accra Agenda for Action (2008)
10. Annual Reports, SGK
11. Labour Statistics, MoLSS
12. Southeast Anatolian Project – State of Affairs, GAP RDA, May 2016
13. IWEP-2 Official Project Document
14. IWEP-2 Progress Reports, May 2013, Nov 2013, Sep 2014 and Jan 2016
15. Review of Turkey Gap Region Innovations for Women’s Empowerment Project, Caroline Pinder, June 2011
16. Argande Businesss Plan and Feasibility Study, Ercan Yılmaz, 2012
17. Argande Search Conference Report, Oğuz Babüroğlu, Feb 2015
18. Argande Situation Analysis and Brand Identity, Bülent Fidan, Apr 2016

6.2 Interviews

Date	Institution	Category	Interviewee(s)	Position
04/11/2016	UNDP	Project partner	Bülent Açıköz	Cluster Lead
			Gökçe Bayrakçeken	Gender Equality Adviser
	SIDA		Linda Eriksson	Second Secretary
21/11/2016	Şanlıurfa Parmaksız ÇATOM	Final beneficiary	Ayşe Çağlar	ÇATOM Manager
	GAP RDA	Main beneficiary and the implementing partner	Mehmet Açıköz Adalet Budak Akbaş	Deputy President General Coordinator of Social Projects
22/11/2016	Karacadağ DA	Advisory Board member	Yunus Çolak	Şanlıurfa Representative
	KAMER	Local NGO	Gülseren Kaplan	
	Mezopotamya Women Cooperative	Final beneficiary	Aygül Kaplankıran	President
23/11/2016	Şanlıurfa Suruç ÇATOM	Final beneficiary	Hacer Karakuş	ÇATOM Manager
	Gaziantep Women Cooperative		Jale Özarslan	Founder of the Cooperative
			Serpil Uyar	Coop Member and Antepişi Production Responsible
24/11/2016	Kilis İslambey ÇATOM	Final beneficiary	Nimet Taş	ÇATOM Manager
	Kilis Ekrem Çetin ÇATOM		Sultan Karakurt	ÇATOM Manager
	Argande Atelier		İbrahim Aktaş	Production Foreman
	İşkur	Steering Committee member	Emin Yücekaya	Province Director
	Special Provincial Administration		Kenan Taş	Responsible for Procurement Tenders
25/11/2016	Eldemir Tekstil	Indigenous <i>Kutnu</i> Producer	Muhittin Eldemir	Owner
	Gaziantep Merkez ÇATOM	Final beneficiary	Leyla Bayburtlu	ÇATOM Manager
29/11/2016	UNDP	Project partner	Berna Bayazit Baran	Portfolio Manager
02/12/2016	Argande brand developers	Volunteers from private sector	Bilge Tuğsuz	Creative Director
			Hatice Gökçe	Design Coordinator
			Zehra Zülfikar	Designer
			Jerry Stolwijk	Photographer
	Bülent Fidan		Brand Consultant	
Mudo		Zeynep Canbeyli	Business Development Manager	
Argande İstanbul Office	Final beneficiary	Nazife Gökboğa	Procurement and Sales Responsible	
06/12/2016	Rumisu	Private sector supporter	Pınar Yeğın	Shareholder
08/12/2016	Koton	Private sector supporter	Evrım Demirtaş	Merchandising Manager
15/12/2016	Mardin Gülmedrese ÇATOM	Final beneficiary	Dilek Sınava	ÇATOM Manager
	Mardin Women Cooperative			Founding Partner and President
	Mardin Meydanbaşı ÇATOM		Leyla Gün Altıntaş	ÇATOM Manager
	Dicle DA	Advisory Board member	Mehmet Emin Paça Enes Ateş	Coordinator of Investment Support Office Research and Planning Expert
16/12/2016	Mardin Ömerli ÇATOM	Final beneficiary	Hülya Akgül	ÇATOM Manager
21/12/2016	İstinye Park Mudo City	Private sector supporter	Mystery Shopping	

6.3 Focus Groups

Date	Location	Number of Participants
21/11/2016	Şanlıurfa Parmaksız ÇATOM	25 women majority of whom working on Koton products
23/11/2016	Şanlıurfa Suruç ÇATOM	45 women majority of whom working on Koton products
25/11/2016	Gaziantep Merkez ÇATOM	25 women from hairdressing and sewing classes and working on Koton products