



United Nations
Eritrea

UNITED NATIONS DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME ERITREA

**UNDP Eritrea Country Programme Outcome 4:
“Selected government institutions have the capacity to
effectively and efficiently provide services to all”**

FINAL EVALUATION

Dr. Hamid R. Chaudhry – International Outcome Evaluation Consultant

August 2016

Acknowledgements

Many people contributed to the preparation of this evaluation report; their names are listed in Annex 3 with heartfelt thanks. Consultant wishes to express his gratitude to Ms. Rose Ssebatindira, Deputy Resident Representative UNDP Country Office Eritrea for her rational comments on this evaluation. Consultant also extends his sincere thanks to Mr. Habte Gebregziabher, Manager Governance for his valuable guidance.

The Consultant greatly appreciates Ms. Aster Ogbaslasie, Programme Analyst for her constant support and providing the needed input to the mission. Special thanks of the Consultant also go to Mr. Kibreab Gebremichael, Programme Analyst for his concerted efforts in convening meetings with the stakeholders, and collecting and providing required documents.

The cooperation extended by Mr. Eden Ali Operations Manager and his administrative staff for providing logistics support in undertaking this mission is gratefully acknowledged. Mr. Ghirmai Woldemicael, Senior Procurement Associate is also acknowledged for providing every support in undertaking this evaluation mission.

The completion of this evaluation became possible only because of the freely given time and consideration of the stakeholders and beneficiary groups.

In accordance with normal practice, the contents of this report are the sole responsibility of the author and can in no way be taken to reflect the views of the United Nations Development Programme.

Dr. Hamid R. Chaudhry
International Evaluation Consultant

CONTENTS

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS	iv
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	vi
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND	1
1.1. Background and context	1
1.2. Purpose of evaluation	2
1.3. Scope of evaluation	2
1.4. Methodology and Approach	2
1.5. Challenges encountered in undertaking evaluation	5
1.6. Country context	5
1.7. UNDP Assistance.	8
1.8. Challenges to the Country	9
CHAPTER 2. EVALUATION FINDINGS	10
<i>i. Development planning and data for development</i>	<i>10</i>
<i>ii. Implementation of International obligations and commitments</i>	<i>12</i>
<i>iii. Youth training and development</i>	<i>14</i>
<i>iv. National Commission for Higher Education</i>	<i>16</i>
<i>v. Capacity building of Ministry of Justice</i>	<i>17</i>
<i>vi. Gender equality and advancement of women</i>	<i>17</i>
<i>vii. Labour force and productivity survey</i>	<i>19</i>
<i>viii. Support to Ministry of Finance</i>	<i>20</i>
<i>ix. National Confederation of Eritrean Workers</i>	<i>21</i>
<i>x. Support to Ministry of Health</i>	<i>22</i>
CHAPTER 3. CONCLUSIONS & RECOMMENDATIONS	23
3.1. Conclusion	23
3.2. Relevance	23
3.3. Efficiency	24
3.4. Effectiveness	26
3.5. Impact	27
3.6. Sustainability	29
3.7. Lessons learnt	30
3.8. Recommendations	31
3.9. Best practices	33
3.10. Follow up actions	34
ANNEX 1: Terms of reference	36
ANNEX 2: Evaluation matrix	46
ANNEX 3: List of persons met	48
ANNEX 4: Documents reviewed and References	49

Acronyms and Abbreviations

AfDB	African Development Bank
AWP	Annual work plan
CO	Country Office
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination against Women
CoI	Commission of Inquiry
CPAP	Country Programme Action Plan
DHS	Demographic health survey
DIN	Department of Immigration Nationality
EIT	Eritrean Institute of Technology
EPHS	Eritrea Population and Health Survey
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GIS	Geographical Information System
GoSE	Government of State of Eritrea
ICU	intensive care unit
IFMIS	Integrated Financial Management Information System
ILO	International Labour Organization
IPs	Implementation partners
IWRM	Integrated Water Resources Management
LIMS	Library Information Management System
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MoF	Ministry of Finance
MoFA	Ministry of Foreign Affairs
MoH	Ministry of Health
MoJ	Ministry of Justice
MoLHW	Ministry of Land, Water and Environment
MoND	Ministry of National Development
MTR	Mid-term review
NCHE	National Commission for Higher Education
NCEW	National Confederation of Eritrean Workers
NCRVS	National civil registration and vital statistics system
NSO	National Statistics Office
NUEYS	National Union of Eritrean Youth and Students
NUEW	National Union of Eritrean Women
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
SMEs	Small and Medium Enterprises
SPSS	Statistical Package for the Social Sciences
SPCF	Strategic Partnership Cooperation Framework
ToR	Terms of Reference
ToT	Training of trainers
UBN	Unmet Basic Needs
UNAIDS	United Nations AIDS
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNEG	United Nations Evaluation Group
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Emergency Fund
UNFPA	United Nations Population Fund
UNHCR	United Nations High Commission for Refugees
UPR	Universal Periodic Reporting
USD	United States Dollars
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
VST	Vocational Skills Training

Map of State of Eritrea



Executive Summary

This report encompasses findings of the independent final evaluation of UNDP Eritrea Strategic Partnership Cooperation Framework (SPCF) 2013 – 2016 Outcome 4 “*Selected government institutions have the capacity to effectively and efficiently provide services to all*”. The evaluation was conducted from July 25 to August 26, 2016. The principal objective of the outcome evaluation was to generate lessons learned and recommendations for improvement in the SPCF, which will cover 2017-2021. The evaluation focused on outcome relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact, sustainability, lessons learnt and recommendations. The data was collected through review of the relevant documents, and interviews and discussions with staff of UNDP Country Office (CO), national institutions and UN agencies. The challenges encountered included nonavailability of updated and comprehensive information on progress of outputs, accessibility to implementation partners for interviews and lack of quantitative baseline and target indicators for measuring progress.

Outcome 4 was designed to support national capacity development efforts in the strategic areas, namely: i) development planning and data for development; ii) implementation of international obligations and commitments; iii) youth and development; iv) higher education; v) disaster risk reduction; and vi) gender equality and advancement of women. The efforts were made to strengthen the human and institutional capacity of the Ministry of Finance (MoF), Ministry of Justice (MoJ), Ministry of Health (MoH), Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MoFA), Ministry of Labour and Human Welfare (MoLHW), Ministry of Information (MoI), National Statistics Office (NSO), National Union of Eritrean Women (NUEW), National Confederation of Eritrean Workers (NCEW), National Union of Eritrean Youth and Students (NUEYS), National Commission for Higher Education (NCHE) and Department of Water Resources (DWR). The total budget allocated for Outcome 4 was US\$ 9,346,000.¹

Main findings of the programme evaluation

Relevance

Relevance of the outcome 4 objectives and the strategy to the national and UN priorities was strong. Within the framework of SPCF 2013 – 2016. The support provided under Outcome 4 is need-based and has targeted the weak areas of human and institutional capacity development of national institutions. This outcome provided support to GoSE to accelerate progress in achieving Millennium Development Goal (MDG) 3 and 8 on national capacity development and gender equality.² Capacity of MoF, MoJ, EIT and MoMR is also being strengthened, and the protection and provision of essential services to refugee communities in Eritrea are also taken into account.

Efficiency

Outcome 4 was highly focused on demand-driven and results-based approach to its interventions and covered a wide category of institutions. The activities undertaken and outputs achieved were efficient both in terms of financial and human resources utilization. Delivery rate remained nearly 100% throughout the implementation period of Outcome 4. The Project maintained robust financial management systems and strong accounting practices and the rule of law as key principles specified in the UNDP Automatically Tuned Linear Algebra Software (ATLAS) System and the UNDP Standard Operating Procedures. In certain cases transfer of funds was delayed that affected progress of projects. The national execution (NEX) modality adopted to implement outcome activities ensured maximum cost-effectiveness, flexible and tailored to the capacity development of the national institutions. Procurement of equipment and delivery was effective as implementing partners (IPs) were satisfied with the quality of equipment. NUEYS and NCEW exceeded their targets in 2015. M&E system was not in place within IPs except NUEW .

Effectiveness

- Overall effectiveness of the activities and programmes for outcome 4 shows mixed results. Some of the activities exceeded the targets (e.g. NUEYS trained 985 persons against a target of 900, Similarly, NCEW has completed majority of the tasks ahead of stipulated time.) while others either did not start or could not be completed due to various reasons, mainly the delayed approval of work plans and transfer of funds (e.g.

¹ CPAP 2013-2016, UNDP Eritrea.

² GoSE-UN SPCF 2013 – 2016, UNDP Asmara.

MoF), lack of availability/shortage of professional staff (e.g. NSO). Quantitative indicators show that the Outcome 4 projects' support to IPs has significantly contributed to the capacity building, improved working environment and enhanced the self-confidence level of staff.

- The progress on output '*Development Planning and Data for Development*' was slow. Gender responsive data management system and National Civil Registration and Vital Statistics System (NCRVS) could not be established. However, the training required to establish these systems was completed by NSO which has been effective in building the capacity of national participating institutions.
- The progress on establishing a Functioning National M&E system was unsatisfactory as the system was established only in NUEW. The training of staff of IPs in results-based monitoring and evaluation (RBM&E) was successfully conducted in collaboration with UNICEF, however, its application is yet to be seen.
- Progress of output '*Implementation of International Obligations and Commitments*' was highly satisfactory. The establishment of an implementation mechanism for functioning Universal Periodic Reporting (UPR) was quite effective in achieving the results. Government of State of Eritrea (GoSE) was supported in preparing the reports on Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) and MDG 2015. The acceptance of 92 UPR recommendations was a significant milestone in terms of the GoSE commitment in moving forward to implement the recommendations. The activity of informed and protected international refugees was also implemented successfully. Work did not start on updating and implementing communication strategy.
- Output '*Youth Training and development*' successfully contributed to the outcome 4. NUEYS implemented 13 trainings in various skills for 568 youth and students against a target of 500. The target for 2106 was set to train 700 youth. However, the targets are unlikely to be achieved as the Vocational Skills Training (VST) centres are under rehabilitation. The training of 417 persons with special needs was also completed successfully against a target of 400 persons. Managerial and leadership capacity of 88 managers and heads of work units was built through 10-day training programme. In total, 1,200 youths were directly accessed to create awareness and employment opportunities for women in the country.
- Overall progress towards achieving output '*Support to NCHE*' was quite satisfactory. Out of 37 projects selected on different topics for funding, 19 projects were completed and 4 research papers published in the journals. These research papers will be useful for students and other interested institutions including government organizations. Research scoping workshops were conducted by all 6 colleges of higher education except Orotha School of Medicine due to lack of timely approval and availability of the required budgets made available on time. Procurement of equipment for 2 colleges of persons (35) with special needs (vision impaired persons) brails, special computers, special printers, digital voice recorders, one server, etc.), was completed. The digital libraries establishment in the colleges will help the entire community of colleges and the students will be able to load academic material.
- Progress towards achieving Output '*Capacity building of the Ministry of Justice*' was highly satisfactory. Training was provided to 20 staff of the Ministry on archives and Library Information Management System (LIMS). Equipment required to implement this activity were installed. The digital library was established and functional. The Electronic books are loaded and work on digitization of court cases is in progress. Digitization of MoJ archives from 1991-1996 has been completed. MoJ is also establishing networking infrastructure to connect central office with different stakeholders. The progress of this activity is slow due to frequent interruptions of internet. This facility will create awareness among public about the justice and court system, and their rights.
- The progress towards achieving output '*Gender equality and advancement of women*' was good and satisfaction level rated as high, though some supporting agencies could not fulfil their commitments timely. NUEW carried out extensive training programme and awareness campaign effectively on various topics such as early marriages and consequences, gender equality, gender empowerment and leadership, awareness and law enforcement, around FGM/C and human rights, for Zoba and sub-zoba governors, baito leaders, students, adults and NUEW and PFDJ representatives. Coaching and mentoring of 139 women was undertaken to prepare them for leadership and decision making. Advocacy sessions on women advancement for decision

makers were conducted in all 6 zobas. The NUEW's Five Year Strategic Action Plan has helped NUEW to strengthen its leadership and coordination roles on gender equality promotion across departments and Ministries. NUEW influenced the Ministries of Education and Agriculture to have gender focal persons who shall strategically do in-house lobbying for gender equality promotion, and these ministries reviewed the gender mainstreaming strategies.

- The progress towards achieving the output '*Labour Force and Productivity Survey*' was satisfactory. MoLHW conducted labour survey of 7,000 conventional households in 491 villages or cluster stratified into 6 zobas by urban and rural areas. MoLHW pointed out that the labour survey was first of nature in Eritrea. The capacity of Ministry staff was built in designing questionnaire, collecting data and analysis enhanced by undertaking extensive training and participating in the labour survey. Overall progress towards achieving output '*Support to the Ministry of Finance*' was satisfactory. to improve the annual recurrent and development budget processing system, strengthen treasury operations system including disbursement, accounting and reporting of government transactions, upgrade and integrate Treasury systems and link it with budget and fiscal planning systems and/or work towards having IFMIS. The programme also targeted capacity enhancement in the development of new Public/Government property administration system and properly record, track and report public property. Assistance was also provided to analyze and review the existing system and identify all gaps in its functionality with respect to the collection of tax according to the laws and regulations of the IRD. This intervention is expected to have a positive impact on the effectiveness and efficiency in administering tax which include tax payers' registration, declaration, assessment, auditing, payment, clearance and reporting, as well as any other statistical and analytical works in the Inland Revenue Department.
- The delivery of equipment was complete but training programme did not start due to non-release of US\$56,584 that was remained unspent in 2015. A Study Report conducted with UNDP support reviewed and analysed capacity gaps in the management information systems on meeting the evolving needs of the departments in MoF and the government in general. The findings of this study have informed the design and approval of the \$2.5 million AfDB grant to the MoF for strengthening planning and treasury management frameworks and to establish a robust Integrated Financial Management Information System (IFMIS).
- Overall progress of Output '*National Confederation of Eritrean Workers*' was highly satisfactory. NCEW implemented project activities effectively and most of the targets set in the work plans were achieved ahead of time. A total number of 4,130 persons from trade unions that comprised 66% men and 34% women were trained in vital areas such as effective leadership, project cycle, and negotiation skills for member as well as ToTs, human rights and awareness about decent work. In addition, lobby and campaigns were launched on developing tripartite cooperation with professional associations.

Impact

At this stage it was too early to expect the real impact of outcome interventions on the national institutions, as the results appear after few years. However, through review of documents, extensive discussions with UNDP and government IPs' staff, interviews with key informants and other UN agencies, the mission has nevertheless availed the opportunity to have an approximation of the degree of programme impact.

The outcome projects have strengthened capacity of national institutions in priority areas enabling them to implement their annual work plans and mandates more efficiently. By constantly supporting GoSE in difficult times UNDP has emerged as a trusted partner of the government. An inclusive and joint approach adopted by UNDP in implementing Outcome 4 interventions has not only enhanced the credibility and image of UNDP among IPs but also of those IPs among the public and international communities. For instance, the conference and symposia organized by NCEW has not only elevated the image of Eritrea in international community but also opened the doors for ILO technical assistance. There was high praise by the IPs' representatives for UNDP support.

Extensive training programme undertaken by UNDP in collaboration with UNFPA and UNICEF and provision of equipment has made significant impact on the national institutions. The capacity of the staff has been strengthened in their respective areas of specializations, improved the working environment and raised the confidence of individual staff. Particularly, impact was reflected in the achievements of MoFA, NCEW, NUEW, NUEYS, MoJ and NSO.

Also, capacity of staff was built in research techniques and data collection that will help institutions in M&E of their programmes.

UNDP support under outcome 4 enabled MoFA to strengthen the ties with international and donor community and meet country's international obligations. UNDP facilitated the UNCT/GoSE dialogue and support on implementation of the UPR recommendations. The acceptance of the recommendations was a significant milestone in terms of the GoSE commitment in moving forward to implement the recommendations. UNDP support enabled GoSE to produce 2015 MDG report.

In relation to promotion of gender equality, the capacity of NUEW was strengthened in planning, advocacy, human rights issues, income generating activities, and female genital mutilation has been reduced, enhancing women's participation in the economy and leadership positions. NUEW enhanced consolidation of its influence by producing Five Year Strategic Action Plan that has helped NUEW to strengthen its leadership and coordination roles on gender equality promotion across departments and Ministries. Sustained community mobilization led by women and supported by legal reforms has achieved systemic action resulting in behavioral change. The most effective initiative under FMG mapping was targeting the practitioners, influential people, elderly women, religious leaders, and parents. A mapping study conducted in 2015 in two zobas revealed that FGM/C prevalence for under 5 and 15 years decreased from 95% in 1995 to 7 and 19%, respectively in 2014. NUEW with its strengthened capacity ably exercised compliance with international reporting obligations on gender such as the Beijing+20 and the 5th CEDAW Report.

Support to the MoF resulted in recommendations of frameworks to establish a robust Integrated Financial Management Information System (IFMIS) and Eritrea Tax Administration Information System (ERITAS). As a result, the GoSE has requested for support from the African Development Bank (AfDB) to implement the IFMIS and further support in these areas that will improve public financial management systems, the revenue base of the country, and the overall economic progress.

The revamping increased capacity of NUEYS to provide market matching training and to absorb more youths. 52 graduates (30% of total trained) got various jobs and 6 of them were employed in Keren zoba, Ministry of Information and NUEW. In order to alleviate the poor economic conditions fueling illegal migration of the youths, NUEYS provided training and skills development for vulnerable and people voluntarily repatriated from abroad. The project has also created a much needed forum for dialogue on youth and migration issues. Cognizant of the role played by youth, in 2015, the Government of Norway approved an additional US\$590,000 for the youth project.

With the UNDP support an efficient and effective Library Information Management System (LIMS) in place that will benefit the MoJ staff, students of Law and other stakeholders. This facility has enhanced the capacity of MoJ, working environment and working efficiency of the MoJ staff. The system has introduced paperless technology and will enhance research capacity of law students through the provision of an easy access to the related documents and reference material. Eritrean living in diaspora will also be linked with this system.

Sustainability

Commitment and ownership of the programmes initiated under outcome 4 are strong in the participating national institutions. However, financial sustainability of the interventions will be a challenge unless firm financial commitments are made by the donors and government. Sustainability factor was strong in NCEW, NUEW, NUEYS, MoJ and MoH. However, sustainability of the programme is a major concern for MoF as the training programme planned could not be implemented due to non-availability of budget.

Rigorous training programme has built the capacity of the staff of national institutions to carry on their work more efficiently after the termination of UNDP support. Experience has been acquired to conduct national surveys and prepare country level reports. This contributes to sustainability of NSO and the line ministries capacity in producing and sharing data. Commitment of the NUEYS management shown to continue expanding the programme is good sign of sustainability. Rehabilitation of vocational schools has not only ensured the sustainability of the programme but also the expansion of programme activities following the termination of UNDP assistance. Inspired by UNDP interventions, NUEYS has planned to establish a revolving fund for micro-credit for small enterprises. Sustainability is not a likely problem in the case of digital library of the MoJ because it has the human and technical capacity to run

the digital library and to digitalize its archives. It is less threatened by staff turnover due to incentive systems that have been introduced to retain its staff.

Main focus of the outcome 4 has been on developing individual capacity and provision of equipment. Sustainability is also dependent to a large degree on the establishment of an institutional and organizational structure that is dynamic and conversant with modern technological changes.

Main lessons learned

- National institutions need the human and institutional capacity to cope with the systems and procedures of donor community, international organizations and to meet the global obligations. There are mainly human resources and institutional capacity constraints which seem to cut across most partner institutions, particularly governmental IPs. This situation imposes considerable pressure on institutions to do the maximum with what is available in terms of human, financial and other resources. Capacity problems, high turnover and low retention of workers have thus been common for implementing institutions.
- Human capacity alone cannot achieve the objectives of sustainable economic development, efficient service delivery and sustainable development goals (SDGs). Institutional capacity needs to be strengthened simultaneously that encompasses institutional reforms and incentives, policies and procedures, internal structure, organizational transformation, accountability framework, mandates, vertical and horizontal hierarchy, coordination/networking, ToR and job description.
- The procedures and regulations for disbursement of funds were cited by many IPs as the main constraints to effective implementation of programmes (e.g. NCHE), and adversely affected the performance. Also, procurement procedures both local and foreign also contributed to delays.
- When dealing with various levels of government in programme and activity delivery, care must be taken to endeavour to engage with a broad range of executive decision makers, especially the apex management. This is critical for the success and sustainability of programme interventions. For example, involvement of MoND and sector ministries in the preparation of SPCF 2013 – 2016 promoted the integration between the participating ministries.
- Well-defined set of quantitative baseline indicators and targets of outcomes and outputs are vital for measuring the periodical progress, monitoring and evaluation of programmes. Also, inputs, activities, outputs, outcomes and goals are interlinked through results chain. Government policies of allowing limited access to IPs have hampered joint, timely and inclusive planning and M&E. Similarly, government's restrictions on inclusive and independent evaluative and analytical surveys/studies, and timely release of reports continues to limit availability of reliable baseline data for results monitoring and reporting.
- NUEW - Providing training on an integrated approach created great opportunities for the participants and sharing their experiences and discovered great potential for the campaign. Supporting poor students will be a path to their participation in economic development activities and income stability.

Recommendations

The following set of recommendations for outcome 4 evaluation is provided based on the analysis and the implementation progress outlined in this report.

- UNDP, with its strong partnership with the Government, is in a unique position to galvanize development efforts in Eritrea. UNDP should leverage this strength to developing its programmes based on national development needs and on its own mandates. Many activities of outcome are either in progress or could not be started due to reasons mentioned in the previous sections. UNDP may continue support to complete the unfinished agenda.

- Outcome 4 support was mainly focused on individual level capacity building through training while little was done to develop institutional capacity. Institutional capacity is a little broader area that embraces institutional reforms, review and adjust mandates, hierarchy, establish a system of horizontal and vertical coordination within the institutions, review and readjust ToR of staff, accountability, performance measurement system and incentives. UNDP may, therefore, endeavour to conduct a comprehensive institutional capacity assessment to identify the real needs for institutional capacity development of the national institutions without which the desired results would not be achieved..
- In the context of resources efficiency, generally UNDP's main focus remains on the maximization of spending to achieve the financial delivery targets. This is not the only criteria for measuring performance of the programme. Emphasis should equally be placed on measuring programme performance and change, and on the results of programme interventions.
- UNDP's indicators in its current programme are not necessarily the optimal indicators for the particular development interventions that UNDP is pursuing. Good quality results—that is, well formulated impacts, outcomes, outputs, activities and indicators of progress—are crucial for proper monitoring, evaluation and measuring results. If results are unclear and indicators are absent or poorly formulated, monitoring and evaluating progress will be challenging, making it difficult for staff and decision makers to know how well plans are progressing and when to take corrective actions. The next SPCF should be based on improved indicators and baseline data and in particular it needs to be strengthened and take into account local and international standards. Too often in the design of UNDP projects and programs throughout the world, there is a tendency to develop indicators as an afterthought to the narrative rationale, contents and change management theories of programme documents. Following the SMART criteria, UNDP may design appropriate and detailed indicators that are properly scaled, measurable and achievable during the next programme cycle.
- Flexible and simpler rules are required to avoid delays and for day to day and routine activities and key agenda related to policy issues, budget revisions and other important issues remain to be the responsibility of MoND that needs to be strengthened. UNDP may provide technical assistance to MoND to develop a guidebook on a harmonized process of project management cycle to be followed by all national institutions. The guidebook should provide guidelines on the process, producers and requirements of project identification and preparation, annual work plans, budgets, approval and implementation. Each activity should be assigned a timeline. To follow these procedures and timelines should be made mandatory for the all national institution. The institutional capacity of MoND may be developed to meet these requirements.
- UNDP could consider strengthening its results-based (RB) M&E capacities, and support the Government to do the same. This would help in supporting UNDP and government institutions to establish RB M&E systems that would be based on SMART indicators to assess results of development interventions and improvements in institutional capacity. Similarly, UNDP may continue to promote improvements in data collection and analysis, especially since the lack of disaggregated statistical data remains an obstacle for more sophisticated, targeted interventions. Efforts can build on the Social Card – Social Welfare Information System (SWIS), which generates data for analysis, reporting, and monitoring the impact of social policies, and strengthens evidence-based policy decision making.

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

1.1. BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT

According to evaluation plan of the UNDP County Office (CO) in Eritrea (hereinafter UNDP Eritrea), final evaluation was planned in 2016 for Strategic Partnership Cooperation Framework (SPCF) 2013 – 2016 Outcome 4 “*Selected government institutions have the capacity to effectively and efficiently provide services to all*”. UNDP-funded projects in support of this outcome are to be completed at the end of 2016, and there as a need to assess how and why an outcome is or is not being achieved in the country context, and the role that UNDP has played. This outcome evaluation will also help to clarify underlying factors affecting the situation, highlight unintended consequences (positive and negative), recommend actions to improve performance in future programming and partnership building, and generate lessons learned.

In addition, similar programmes are currently being supported by other UN agencies, such as, United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA), United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), UNAIDS, United Nations Children’s Emergency Fund (UNICEF) and Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO). In addition, the Government of State of Eritrean (GoSE) and United Nations in Eritrea are in the process of developing a next SPCF 2017-2021.

UNDP Eritrea Country Programme Outcome 4: “Selected government institutions have the capacity to effectively and efficiently provide services to all”.

Human and institutional capacity development is critical to the national development agenda and to the achievement of the MDGs. During the past GoSE-UNDP cooperation, efforts were made to strengthen the capacities of targeted public institutions such as the Ministry of Justice, Civil Service Administration, Ministry of Finance, National Union of Eritrean Women and Department of Immigration Nationality (DIN) amongst others. This support resulted in improved delivery of services in the targeted institutions and pointed to the need to expand to other public institutions.

UNDP carried forward this success and continue to support national capacity development efforts in following strategic areas, namely:

i) Development planning and data for development; ii) implementation of international obligations and commitments, iii) youth and development; iv) higher education; v) disaster risk reduction; and vi) gender equity and advancement of women.

In this programme cycle efforts were made to strengthen the human and institutional capacity of the Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Justice, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Labour and Human Welfare, Ministry of Information, National Statistics Office, National Union of Eritrean Women, National Confederation of Eritrean Workers, National Union of Eritrean Youth and Students, National Commission for Higher Education and Department of Water Resources. The total budget allocated for Outcome 4 was US\$ 9,346,000.³

³ Ibid 2.

1.2. PURPOSE OF EVALUATION

The main purpose of the outcome evaluation was to generate lessons learned and recommendations for improvement in the ensuing SPCF 2017-2021. This outcome evaluation was aimed to provide timely and valuable contribution to support strategic decision-making of UNDP Eritrea in the development of upcoming programme interventions and discussions with national counterparts as well as prioritization of UNDP support towards achievement of other expected Country Programme outcomes.

1.3. SCOPE AND OBJECTIVES OF THE EVALUATION

The main objectives of this assignment are to:

- Provide appraisal on the validity/relevance of the outcome for UNDP assisted interventions, and the extent to which the set objectives and envisaged outcomes have been achieved;
- Assess the level of efficiency and relevance of the UNDP assisted interventions;
- Identify gaps and weaknesses in the strategy, and what could be recommended regarding the achievement of the envisaged outcomes;
- Identify lessons learnt from ongoing interventions in this area with a view to ascertaining suitability of such interventions for continuation; discontinuation, refining and adoption in future work;
- Take into consideration Gender issues in the evaluation process.

The main deliverables listed in the ToR are as follows:

- i. Inception report
- ii. A draft evaluation report
- iii. Final evaluation report

ToR of the outcome evaluation are given as **Annex 1**.

1.4. METHODOLOGY AND APPROACH

The final outcome 4 evaluation undertaken by a independent International consultant⁴ from 25th July to 26th August 2016. In-country mission commenced with a briefing at UNDP Country Office (CO) on 9th August and concluded on 19th August 2016 with a debriefing with UNDP CO on the evaluation findings.

The evaluation provides evidence-based, credible, reliable and useful information. The evaluation will adopt a mixed and multiple method approach to satisfactorily respond to the requirements of the evaluation. Triangulation of data and sources were used to minimize possibility of errors and discrepancy. The data was collected through in-depth desk review of the all relevant documents available and on-site interviews and consultations. The evaluation exercised a client-oriented and participatory approach consistent with UN rules and principles to ensure close engagement and

⁴ Hamid R. Chaudhry- International Outcome Evaluation Consultant.

consultations with all stakeholders. Impartiality and independence was strictly observed in data collection.

The evaluation mission followed ToR and UNDP's evaluation guidelines⁵ to set the framework for data collection and analysis. United Nations Evaluation Group (UNEG) Evaluation Norms and Standards of Evaluation and Ethical Standards⁶, principles and guidelines were strictly adhered to in conducting this evaluation. While collecting information the evaluation respected the stakeholders' rights, dignity, security, privacy and self-worth in accordance with UN Universal Declaration of Human Rights⁷. Reliability and quality of information/data, and impartiality and independence was ensured while conducting interviews and collecting the data. The evaluation methodology was designed on the basis of key questions outlined in TOR and adopted good practices in evaluation, encompassing the key evaluation principles – relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability and lessons learned.

1.4.1. Information and Data collection

The evaluation will adopt a mixed and multiple method approach to satisfactorily respond to the requirements of the evaluation. Both qualitative and quantitative data were collected and analyzed for this evaluation. Questionnaires were developed on the basis of evaluation questions listed in ToR. Reliability and quality of information/data was ensured through critical review and analysis and cross checks while collecting the information on Project activities.

The following sources, tools and approaches were used for purposes of gathering data for evaluation and analysis:

a) Primary sources: interviews and consultations

The consultant conducted an in-country mission to the selected ministries, departments and organization in Eritrea. Vigorous interviews were held with the UNDP, UNFPA, and Ministry of National Development (MoND), staff of the participating ministries, departments and agencies.

- i. Separate questionnaires were developed for key informants for interviews and data/information collection on outcome performance, results and problems encountered.

⁵ UNDP Guideline for Evaluators, 2002; and *UNDP Handbook on Planning, Monitoring and Evaluating for Development Results*, 2011

⁶ UNEG, 'Code of Conduct', June 2008.

⁷ Declaration was proclaimed by the United Nations General Assembly in Paris on 10 December 1948 [General Assembly resolution 217\(III\) A](http://www.un.org/en/universal-declaration-human-rights/) as a common standard of achievements for all peoples and all nations. It sets out, for the first time, fundamental human rights to be universally protected.
<http://www.un.org/en/universal-declaration-human-rights/>

- ii. Vigorous consultations and one-on-one interviews were conducted with participating ministries, departments and organizations and UNFPA to seek their perceptions and collect information.
- iii. Focus Group discussions were held involving stakeholders and decision makers.
- iv. Direct observations, judgement and rapid appraisal were made to validate reported results in the progress reports and documents.

A list of persons met in the course of the evaluation is attached as **Annex 3**.

b) Secondary sources - desk review:

Consultant reviewed all the available documents to draw the evidence-based secondary data for evaluation. Desk review of documents met two main purposes:

- i. Enhance the consultant's comprehension of the Programme component (logical link from inputs, activities, outputs, outcomes and expected impact), operational modalities. Desk review laid the basis for draft report and the development of appropriate primary data collection tools.
- ii. Provide insights into the Programme implementation processes, changes in course (if any), achievements and challenges among others.

The documents included CPAP 2013-2016, Eritrea CPD 2013-2016, Strategic Partnership Cooperation Framework (SPCF) 2013-2016, Annual Progress Report SPCF Outcome 4 (Capacity Development) 2014, and reports and documents of the line ministries, departments and organizations. List of documents reviewed is given in **Annex 4**.

Data analysis involved synthesizing, organizing, classifying, consolidating, summarizing, rating and interpreting the findings and results, using the thematic content analysis approach. Data from the different primary sources were triangulated with data obtained from secondary sources, observations and any other data sources to produce a outcome evaluation report that adequately addresses the assessment and analysis requirements as per the TOR.

The contents and structure of the report are designed to reflect the approach set out in the ToR. It comprises the introductory section (Chapter I) setting out the objectives of the evaluation and the methodology employed, and presenting the context for the assistance and a brief outline of the description of the outcome 4 and country context. Chapter 2 covers the overall assessment of the outcome performance and the key questions on adhering to the evaluation criteria in the ToR. Chapter 3 examines issues of sustainability and presents the overall conclusions based on the evaluation findings, and contains some key practical recommendations in the context of outcome strategy for future consideration.

1.5. CHALLENGES ENCOUNTERED IN UNDERTAKING THE EVALUATION

Various challenges encountered by the evaluation mission in conducting this evaluation are summarized below:

- The updated data (for 2016) on progress of outputs were not available from implementing partners and UN agencies or any other sources, such as progress reports and updates. Hence, the mission had to mostly rely on data for 2015 for measuring the performance and evaluation.
- Access to participating ministries' staff and some UN agencies was a daunting task. Some IPs were available for interviews according to agreed schedule, while others were accessed with a great difficulty. The Ministry of Health, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and UNICEF could not be reached for interviews despite many attempts, due to their busy schedule, hence secondary data and information were used for evaluation.
- Due to limited time available with the mission and time consuming process of obtaining travel permit from the concerned GoSE agency, any site out of Asmara could not be visited. Therefore, mission has to rely on the information available in the secondary sources and that provided by the IPs during interviews at Asmara.
- In the priority areas matrix quantitative baseline data and targets were not determined for some of the outputs and were indicated as Tbd (e.g. Output 1.3. Support to NUEYS). The SPCF document and in particular the Priority Areas Matrix faced problems both of baseline data and key indicators. Priority Area Matrix did not clearly articulate and inter-relate outcomes, outputs and activities. The priority areas matrix although it was revised, it did not contain the indicators that were easy and adequate to measure degree of progress made towards achieving the outcomes through the outputs.⁸ Thus it was a situation which posed difficulties in measuring output performance.

1.6. COUNTRY DEVELOPMENT CONTEXT

Eritrea is located in the Horn of Africa region bordered by Sudan to the North-West, Ethiopia to the South, Djibouti to the south-east and Red Sea to the north and north-east, stretching about 1,200 km. It has an area of 124,000 square km with an economy largely undiversified and limited by small internal market. Administratively, Eritrea is divided into six regions (Zobas), namely, Maekel, Anseba, Gash-Barka, Debub, Northern Red Sea and Southern Red Sea.

A complete population census is pending. However, the estimated official population in 2016 was estimated as 3.75 million, with a fertility rate of 4.8%.⁹ According to the 2010 Eritrea Population and Health Survey (EPHS) conducted in 2010, the population under 15 constitutes 47% while the population of 65 years and above accounts for only 7% of the total population.

⁸ Mid-Term Review, SPCF 2013 -2016, Eritrea, September 2015.

⁹ Ministry of National Development, GoSE 2016.

While majority of the population (65%) of the population still lives in rural areas, the urban population is growing rapidly due to high rural-urban migration.

In Eritrea arid and semi-arid climatic conditions prevail and rainfall in the country ranges from less than 200 mm per annum in the Eastern Lowlands to about 1,000 mm per annum in a small pocket of the escarpment. As the result it is therefore, vulnerable to adverse effects of climate variability, recurring droughts and environmental degradation, hampering development efforts. The economy is largely based on subsistence agriculture, with 80% of the population depending on farming and herding yet arable land accounts for only 12% of land use. Persistent drought has had adverse effects particularly on the vulnerable communities, groups and households (especially the female-headed). This is in spite of a variety of interventions supported by the UNDP, such as construction of micro dams and provision of improved seeds and application of improved farming methods. As a result and due to inadequate rains, food harvests are reported to be lower as compared to 2014.¹⁰ The country's socio-economic conditions (livelihoods, food security, and national budget), human capital, infrastructure, energy, industries, environment (land degradation, desertification) all suffered due to the thirty year war of independence.

Eritrea's development aspiration is to achieve rapid, balanced, home-grown and sustainable economic growth with social equity and justice, anchored on the self-reliance principle. The Government places emphasis on community and individual rights as well as issues of social justice, such as access to education, health, food and equitable access to services regardless of locality. Soon after independence in 1991, Eritrea formulated and implemented socio-economic development policies and strategies, attaining an average annual growth in Gross Domestic Product (GDP) of 7%. Marked improvements were made in key sectors for the period up to 1997. However, a border dispute with neighbouring Ethiopia (1998-2000), which escalated into a full-scale war, reversed the gains and GDP dropped sharply to an estimated 1-2% for the period 2007/2008. Largely driven by the mining sector, the UNDESA and the World Bank estimate economic growth of the Eritrean economy in 2015 at 7.3% and 3% respectively, while the IMF estimates the growth at 2.1%. Inflation is projected at 12.3% in 2015 up from 12% in 2014 due to food supply shocks, high demand for foreign exchange and high international commodities prices.¹¹ The unresolved no-peace-no-war border stalemate remains a major impediment to the Government's developments efforts as a number of possible national socio-economic initiatives and resources remain tied to the border stalemate. However, more recently, there have been signs of good economic prospects as investments in the mining sector continue to grow, with GDP growth projections of 6% in 2012 and 7% in 2013.¹²

With regard to the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and MDGs, after the adoption of the Post-2015 Development Agenda at the UN General Assembly, the GoSE allowed a panel discussion on the SDGs to take place in the country with a wide coverage in the state media, an event which would not have happened 2-3 years back when the relationship between the UN and the GoSE was not favourable from 2010 to 2012. Based on the MDG Report 2015, the poverty level measured by Unmet Basic Needs (UBN) approach has reduced from 66% in 2003 to a projected 58% in 2015. The country is also believed to have made good progress on environmental sustainability while much while much remains to be done as regards to MDGs 1 and 2 in

¹⁰ Cabinet of Ministers holds meeting, Asmara 20 November 2015.

¹¹ Results Oriented Annual Report 2015, UNDP Asmara.

¹² <http://country.eiu.com/Eritrea>.

eradication of extreme hunger and poverty and attainment of universal primary education. Eritrea is one of the few African Countries that has made steady progress towards achieving the health related MDGs 4, 5 and 6, i.e. reduction of child mortality, reduction of maternal mortality and combating HIV and AIDS (MoH 2014). There has been reduction of under-five mortality to 50% per 1,000 live births by 2013. The maternal mortality ratio also decreased to 380 per 100,000 live births in 2013 compared to 480 in 2010 (UNICEF 2014). Eritrea's Human Development Index in 2015 remained at 0.38 with a ranking of 182 out of 187.¹³ However, the human development component of the Ibrahim Index of African Governance improved to 46.5% from 44.5%.¹⁴

Eritrea made progress in its engagement with the international community to address issues of isolation. GoSE demonstrated commitment and willingness to engage on human rights promotion and protection. The Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) was invited in Eritrea twice on human rights issues. In addition, Eritrea finalized and published four new sets of permanent legal codes in mid-2015 including the civil code, penal code, civil procedure code and criminal procedure code¹⁵. However, assessment reports of the Commission of Inquiry (CoI) on Eritrea and the Special Rapporteur for Human Rights in Eritrea allege wide-spread human rights violations in the country.¹⁶ In spite of the COI Report however, the GoSE continued to engage the UN on the Universal Periodic Review recommendations. The UN Sanctions on Eritrea were renewed in 2015¹⁷ and this is likely to continue to negatively affect the country's economic conditions and advancement of external relations and stability.

Largely driven by the mining sector, the United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UNDESA) and the World Bank estimate economic growth of the Eritrean economy in 2015 at 7.3% and 3% respectively¹⁸, while the IMF estimates the growth at 2.1%. Inflation is projected at 12.3% in 2015 up from 12% in 2014 due to food supply shocks, high demand for foreign exchange and high international commodities prices. The business environment has retrogressed and remains fragile as assessed by the Ease of Doing Business Index; which ranked Eritrea no. 184 out of 189 countries in 2013 to no.189 in 2015¹⁹. This business situation could further be weakened by the recent (November 18 - December 30, 2015) redemption of the country's currency notes in circulation, which has been followed by restrictions on the amount of cash individuals can withdraw from the banks. Pushed by the poor economic and political conditions in the country, Eritrean migrants are now one of the largest groups crossing the Mediterranean Sea. According to the Economist Intelligence Unit, Eritreans were the second highest number of entrants to the European Union after Syria in 2015. This includes a significant number of Eritrean youth. However, currently there is no locally known formal mechanism of tracking the migration rate from Eritrea²⁰.

¹³ Ibid 11.

¹⁴ <http://mo.ibrahim.foundation>

¹⁵ <http://www.nyulawglobal.org/globalex/Eritrea1.html%20visited%20on%2014%20January%202016>.

¹⁶ Report of the Commission of Inquiry on Human Rights in Eritrea, OHCHR

¹⁷ [tps://www.un.org/press/en/2015/sc12094.doc.htm](https://www.un.org/press/en/2015/sc12094.doc.htm) visited on 2014January 2016

¹⁸ World Bank Global Economic Prospects Report: Quick note on Eritrea's 2015-2017 Outlook, <http://www.madote.com/>

¹⁹ Doing Business 2016 Measuring Regulatory Quality and Efficiency, World Bank Group, Washington DC.

²⁰ Ibid 11.

1.7. UNDP ASSISTANCE

The UN assistance affected due to interruption in relation between GoSE and international community from 2010 to 2012. Eritrea is a donor orphan and UNDP is the lead development agencies that has stayed and supported the country during difficult times and has thus established itself as a trusted partner, similarly, UNDP is a partner of choice for development partners whose embassies closed but wish to re-establish relations/support programmes in Eritrea. UNDP has in this regard facilitated various missions and dialogue leading to some thawing of relations between the government and the international community. The migration crisis has peaked at a time when there's such an enabling environment, therefore, the success in mobilization of Norway funding (\$1.3m), for example, is a cumulative result of the various efforts by the CO over the years.

The preparation of the GoSE-UN SPCF started in 2012 with the renewal of working relation with UN and the GoSE building on the past UNDAF (2007-2011). This framework is nevertheless based on key considerations applicable for UNDAF in general and it follows the basic UNDAF programming principles and provides a succinct overview of the main areas of intervention and collaboration of the UN system in Eritrea. UNDP and the GoSE agreed that the sector plans, policies and strategies, most of which end in 2016, would form the basis for formulating programs. Correspondingly, the SPCF runs for four years, 2013-2016.

The SPCF clearly outlines the main areas of intervention and collaboration of the UN system in Eritrea. Its development process was guided by various international goals and commitments such as the MDGs and other internationally agreed commitments and obligations, including the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) and the CEDAW. The national priorities and developmental needs of the country were guided by the MoND and articulated in the sectoral plans. The objectives were derived as national priorities from various government documents which provided the basis for the formulation of the SPCF 2013-2016 (UNDAF) outcomes. Some of the documents include; the National Health Policy; Health Sector Strategic Development Plan 2012-2016; Eritrea Water Proclamation 162/2010; Action Plan for Integrated Water Resources Management (IWRM); draft MoLWE Sector Plan: 2012-2015; Rural Sanitation and Strategy Directions for Eritrea, 2007; Agricultural Development Program, 2008-2013; draft Education Sector Plan, 2012-2016; Strategic Plan of the MoLHW, 2013-2017; National Strategic Plan for Injury, Violence and Disability Prevention and Control, 2012-2016; and the National Policy and Gender, 2004.

The context in which SPCF 2013 – 2016 outcomes were being pursued is rapidly changing. In recent times, external shocks of rising food and fuel prices, climate change and global economic slowdown, have altered the perceived responsibilities of some UN Agencies. In this context, the SPCF 2013-2016 sought to build on and sustain the gains and progress achieved by GoSE in the MDGs as well as address that still need to be facilitated. Along these lines, lessons learned from UNDAF 2007 – 2011 evaluation reveals that the UN has a role to play in accelerating the progress towards the MDGs while supporting the integration of key supportive activities programming; such as capacity development, data management, effective monitoring and evaluation as well as building the institutional capacity of the government to manage and respond to risks, disasters and emergency situations.

1.8. CHALLENGES TO THE COUNTRY

Eritrean economy is encountered with some serious challenges that affect its development. Eritrea is located in the Horn of Africa region, where arid and semi-arid climatic conditions prevail. The country is therefore, vulnerable to adverse effects of climate variability, recurring droughts and environmental degradation, hampering development efforts. The economy is largely based on subsistence agriculture, with 80% of the population depending on farming and pastoralism yet arable land accounts for only 12% of land use.

Persistent drought has had adverse effects particularly on the vulnerable communities, groups and households (especially the female-headed) and food security. The country's socio-economic conditions also suffer from drought effects. Furthermore, the border conflict has left large areas of land unused due to unexploded landmines especially the prime fertile agricultural regions of Gash-Barka and Debub considered as the "bread baskets" of Eritrea.

The continued border dispute with Ethiopia gives no indications on time and strategies for a lasting solution. There are also fears that the Yemen conflict could lead to refugees fleeing into the Horn of Africa, leading to a possible humanitarian crisis.

The business environment has retrogressed and remains fragile as assessed by the Ease of Doing Business Index; which ranked Eritrea no. 184 out of 189 countries in 2013 to no.189 in 2015²¹. This business situation could further be weakened by the recent (November 18 - December 30, 2015) redemption of the country's currency notes in circulation, which has been followed by restrictions on the amount of cash individuals can withdraw from the banks. Pushed by the poor economic and political conditions in the country, Eritrean migrants are now one of the largest groups crossing the Mediterranean Sea. According to the Economist Intelligence Unit, Eritreans were the second highest number of entrants to the European Union after Syria in 2015²². This includes a significant number of Eritrean youth. However, currently there is no locally known formal mechanism of tracking the migration rate from Eritrea.

²¹ Doing Business 2016 Measuring Regulatory Quality and Efficiency, World Bank Group, Washington DC.

²² How many migrants to Europe are refugees? Sep 7th 2015, 23:50 BY T.N. Economist

CAPTER TWO

FINDINGS OF THE EVALUATION

2.1. OUTCOME PERFORMANCE – QUALITY OF OUTCOME AND OUTPUT EFFECTIVENESS

Outcome 4 focused on support to human resource development and institutional strengthening in the areas of data for development, communication, diplomacy and international relations, human rights, trade and investment. Support was also given to human resource development in the higher education sector. Overall progress towards achieving Outcome 4 is found to be satisfactory.

i) Development Planning and Data for Development

This intervention was aimed to support the Government in data collection, analysis, dissemination and utilization of gender-disaggregated data including the introduction of comprehensive National Civil Registration and Vital Statistics System (NCRVS). Support was meant to conduct national and sectoral surveys and in the establishment of a comprehensive and gender responsive national data management system and strengthened human and institutional capacities of NSO at sectoral and regional levels to collect, analyse and disseminate gender-disaggregate data to inform national development planning and management.

This project was implemented by NSO and was supported jointly by UNDP and UNFPA.

Human and institutional capacity strengthened to establish gender responsive data management system

The database has not yet been established. During SPCF 2013-2016, the main focus under this programme remained on capacity building of NSO, ministries and statistical units of regions. A series of trainings were organized and equipment provided to the sector ministries.

- An intensive training on survey methodology: questionnaire and sample design was given for two weeks (27th May - 6th June, 2014) at NSO. In total of 29 experts representing sector ministries and zobas (12) participated in the training workshop. The participants were mainly those in- charge of planning, design and development, and implementation of surveys in their respective zobas and sector ministries.²³
- Training on Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS) was organized by NSO for 18 participants from various sector ministries and NSO.
- Training was conducted for 34 staff of sector ministries and regions on Result-Based M&E by UNICEF. Training on survey methodology was also carried out for 28 experts by NSO. Moreover, two NSO staff received Master level training in Geographical Information System (GIS) and demography through distance learning with an institution abroad.

²³ Report On Training on Survey Methodology: Questionnaire and Sample Design, 27th May-6th June, 2014
Ministry of National Development, National Statistics Office, Asmara..

- With the technical support from UNFPA, NSO has provided training to representatives from the line ministries on DeriInfo programme related to national database development.
- With respect to improving data utilization among sector ministries, with the support of UNICEF an integrated DevInfo database was developed by NSO packaging the data generated from demographic health survey (DHS) 1995, DHS 2002 and Eritrean Population and Health Survey (EPHS) 2010. National and regional factsheets were prepared using the data generated for EPHS 2002 and 2010. It is expected that the user-friendly factsheets with summary data will be useful in programme planning and evidence-based policy advocacy. Preparation for the forthcoming EPHS 2015 has been made and at the time of evaluation preparation was underway for conducting fourth round EPHS in 2016.
- UNFPA could not implement its 2015 AWP, as the implementing partner – NSO had been fully engaged in National Nutrition Survey which was a priority to the country, and it was not possible for NSO to simultaneously carry out the implementation the implementation of data for development activities planned for the first half of year 2015.²⁴ UNFPA also noted limitations both in human and institutional capacity of NSO. At the same time MIS data from ministries such as HMIS, EMIS are not processed, published and distributed on time. Moreover there limitations in HMIS in particular it does not include data on prevalence of FGM and early child marriage.

Functioning National Civil Registration and vital statics System established

The workshop for Training of trainers (ToTs) on CRVS - Methods and Procedures, which followed the Advocacy Workshop, was organized from 22 – 24 August, 2014 at NSO Asmara and attended by 33 NSO staff.²⁵ The main purpose of the workshop was to familiarize participants with the fundamental requirements of a functioning civil registration system. But NCRVS is still not implemented. The road map has been established for functional CRVS but there is critical staff shortage in the field of demography in particular.

In addition other activities have been accomplished and in 2014, NSO organized awareness raising and advocacy workshop for high-level national and sub-national government officials on CRVS. A total of 36 higher level officials and relevant experts from regional administration office and sector ministries as well as staffs from UNFPA and UNICEF attended the workshop. The workshop covered very relevant topics on CRVS.²⁶ Evaluation was informed that NSO has developed a Strategy Paper on CRVS in October 2015 and presented in a workshop to key ministries for review and approval.

Overall progress on this intervention remained slow. NSO remained fully engaged in carrying out the National Food Security and Livelihood Assessment Study in 2015. UNFPA also noted that there was a critical shortage of higher level experts at NSO, hence it was not possible for NSO to

²⁴ Progress Report of the AWP for JP on Data for Development (ER14U706), UNFPA, Asmara, Eritrea, 2015.

²⁵ Technical Assistance for Civil Registration and Vital Statistics (CRVS), Mission Report by Grace Bediako, Country Director of UNFPA Asmara, Eritrea, 11-22 August 2014.

²⁶ NSO, Asmara, Eritrea, August 2016.

simultaneously carry out the implementation of CRVS related activities. An important gap is the absence of a legal base for CRVS. The NSO is not mandated to supervise regions on civil and vital statistics. Hence, there is a need for holding a high level advocacy workshop for ministers with objective of creating awareness and securing their support. This can then be followed by a similar advocacy workshop at a technical level.²⁷

Evaluation was informed that as a normal procedure, NSO collects data from other sources. i.e. ministries, departments and regional offices. The delayed transmittal of data by these sources in turn causes delays in consolidation, publishing and dissemination of data by NSO.

Trainings offered in the areas of database establishment and maintenance and CRVS has improved the capacity of participating institutions. The completion of survey maintenance and database upgrading work as well as provision of ICT equipment has improved the capacity of the NSO. Establishment of a comprehensive national data base which consolidates relevant data of all line ministries and relevant institutions is still at its early stages.

Thus progress under this component was slow.

Functioning National M&E system established

In 2013, all of the activities related to the development of monitoring and evaluation network in the country were not implemented and postponed for 2014. In 2014, training in survey methods was provided to 28 experts from ministries and zobas, and 36 high level officials and experts were trained in M&E data base. During the same period, a three days training workshop on RBM&E was offered to 34 experts from regional administration offices and sector ministries by a senior expert on RBM&E from UNICEF-Eritrea country office. NSO server maintenance was undertaken. The main objectives of the training workshop were to strengthen the capacity of the sectoral departments to demonstrate the results, to track the progress of the interventions and to monitor and evaluate its own progress.

M&E system has been established within NUEW. However, evaluation noted that efforts for the establishment of nationally functioning M&E system in the past three years have made little progress.

The overall progress of this programme is rated as unsatisfactory.

ii) Implementation of International Obligations and Commitments

The support involves assisting the GoSE to design a programme to fulfil its reporting requirements under international and regional treaties, conventions and laws. Besides, the programme was intended to support the Government's ongoing efforts in the establishment of a well-functioning office to coordinate and follow-up on treaties, agreements and conventions signed by Eritrea. It also assisted the GoSE in tapping the skills of Eritrean professionals in the Diasporas to contribute meaningfully to the development process of the country; and establish a mechanism to help implementation of the UPR recommendations.

²⁷ UNDP Eritrea SPCF Outcome 4 Progress Report, 2014.

- **Updated and implemented communication strategy**

As reported in MTR Report of SPCF 2013-2016, this programme did not start.

- **Functioning Universal Periodic Reporting (UPR) implementation mechanism established**

A holistic approach was followed in conducting key activities in this area and as the result two country reports were prepared by GoSE and defended: Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination against Women - CEDAW and MDG. The GoSE produced MDG Report in 2015, although absence of up-to-date, reliable and accurate data in Eritrea hinders an up-to-date assessment of the current development progress, as the MDG Report used data from 2013 or earlier years. MDG Report has enhanced availability of critical data for development planning and assessment of development results. It has also informed participation of Eritrea in the Post-2015 development agenda. For example, in 2015, the GoSE allowed a panel discussion on the SDGs to take place in the country with a wide coverage in the state media Section A.1.1. A safe event was organized and MDG health related issues were reported with high participation rate in New York. A Window for constructive engagement and expanded opportunities for more UNDP and GoSE cooperation were created and strengthened.

In the UPR process, dialogue between the GoSE and the UNCT was strengthened in order to support efforts to implement the UPR recommendations and mainstream human rights across all line ministries to improve the human rights situation in the country.

- **Informed and protected international refugees**²⁸

The GoSE with the support of UNHCR provides the necessary services and protects the refugees in Eritrea. ORA and UNHCR provide food supply to the refugee communities and distribution of food is based to meet the 2,200 calories per person per day. To accommodate the varying needs and tastes of refugees cash is provided for each member of the family for the purchase of food stuff (rice, pasta, meat, wheat flour, oil, sugar, etc.). In addition, 300 Nakfa was provided for a family for the purchase of fire wood and kerosene.

Supply of water to the refugees is from Dogali a few km from the refugee camp and two water tanker/trucks make four trips per day to deliver water to the refugee community to meet the requirement of 20 litres per day per person. There was no problem with the water delivery system and there are plans to deliver water to Umkulu camp through pipeline from Massawa city.

Health services are provided through a clinic, which formerly had three nurses while during MTR only one nurse was providing health services to the community. MTR found out that there had been reduction in staff employed in the refugee camp (including in the clinic) due to budgetary reasons. Medical supplies are provided through the collaboration of MoH and UNHCR. Basic medical services to children, mothers and other refugee communities are provided at the refugee camp while they also have access to hospitals and to other special medical services in the national health facilities.

²⁸ Ibid 8.

In 2015, there were about 1,152 refugee students at all levels or grades. The MTR found that enrolment of girls was high in elementary and junior levels but their proportion declines sharply at the secondary and college level education. In collaboration with the Ministry of Education and support of UNHCR, ORA provide summer training courses to teachers as well as training on computer skills.

With the help of ORA and UNHCR the refugee communities have been engaged in income generating activities, such as backyard vegetable production, poultry and herding sheep and goats. According to ORA the results of sheep and goat herding are encouraging and 28 families have improved their livelihoods and there is a plan to support additional 35 families. But the progress on vegetable and poultry production has not been satisfactory.

Overall progress on this programme is highly satisfactory.

iii) Youth training and development

This project was designed to assist the GoSE in developing training programmes for young Eritreans in various technical fields and entrepreneurship aimed at increasing their employability in the economy; and will include but not limited to vocational training in micro-enterprises such as textile, leather, marble and granite production.

This programme is implemented by the NUEYS in 6 zobas with the financial support from UNDP, Norwegian Government and Government of Japan. During the initial period of project, preparatory work was done such as, training needs assessment, baseline survey, identification of beneficiaries and resource mobilization but activities gained momentum in 2015. Most of the activities were undertaken in 2015. Project activities could not have implemented effectively in 2016 as the VST centres are being renovated. Main achievements are given below:

- NUEYS's Vocational Training Centres were revamped with revised curriculum, modern training equipment, and attachment of trainer of trainers to each centre and updated training manuals.
- In 2013 only one small project on training of young journalists was undertaken by NUEYS. With the project support training was provided to about 20 young journalists representing all the six Zobas. Outputs of the projects are high in priority in meeting NUEYS needs and the training of young journalists was satisfactory.
- The Union organized overall 13 trainings for youth and students with vocational and entrepreneurship skills for employment in various areas including, wood works, fishing net repairing, water pump repairing, hand looms, etc. Five hundred sixty-eight (568) persons comprising 300 men (53%) and 268 women (47%) obtained training that was against a target of 500. The target for 2106 was set to train 700 youth. However, the targets are unlikely to be achieved as the Vocational Skills Training (VST) centres are under rehabilitation trainees set for 2016.

- The training of 417 persons (11% women) with special needs was successfully completed. That was against a target of 400 persons.
- Managerial and leadership capacity of 88 managers and heads of work units was built through 10-day training programme. Total number comprised 18% female staff from the headquarters, regional and sub-regional offices.
- Training has created the employment opportunity for youth who have been trained by NUEYS. Fifty-two (52) graduates (30%) got engaged in various jobs and 6 of them being employed in Keren zoba administration, Ministry of Information and NUEW. Few of them started SMEs (e.g. in beekeeping). Target of establishing 250 SMEs could not be achieved due to lack of financial resources.
- Rehabilitation of Shebab Computer Training Centre in Asmara, and the Keren and Barents Metal and Woodwork Shops is underway and will enhance the capacity for VST, such as basic computer, graphics, leadership, entrepreneurship and youth resource services.
- To ensure increased gender responsiveness of project activities and inclusion of both males and females, NUEYS, in collaboration with NUEW, launched gender sensitization campaigns in all sub-zobas. In total, 1,200 youths were directly accessed to create awareness and employment opportunities for women in the country.
- UNDP supported the NUEYS in conducting a needs assessment and market analysis study and in the establishment of baseline on Employment/Labour Market in order to tailor skills training programs and enhancement of the Vocational Training centres to appropriate needs and job markets.
- With UNDP support MoLHW is undertaking a Labour Market survey, the first in many years. The report will be finalised 2016 and is expected to also further inform UNDP approach to creating youth employment and livelihoods.

ToT programme to deliver the training that was planned could not be started in 2016 because centres are being renovated and due to the non-availability of NUEYS partners.

Evaluation noted that UNDP support has improved the working environment and enhanced the capacity to offer VST with modern equipment and accommodate more number of students in the technical schools. Management capacity and working efficiency of the staff has also been enhanced following the training. By providing VST and creating awareness about job market among graduates, this initiative will minimize out-migration.

Overall progress of the project activities was highly satisfactory. Further progress greatly depends upon the availability of sufficient number of training centres with requisite human resources.

iv) National Commission for Higher Education (NCHE)

The development of technical and human resources is a key priority of GoSE under national capacity development. GoSE through UNDP support for capacity development places a strong emphasis on sustainability and national ownership. Thus programme is relevant to support colleges of higher education in the country to produce skilled manpower required for the country's development. The achievements under this project are narrated below:

- Through UNDP support to NCHE in the area of research capacity building, out of 46 research proposals 37 projects on different topics were selected for funding. Nineteen (19) projects have been completed and submitted the reports and 4 research papers have been published in the journals. These research papers will be useful for students and other interested institutions including government organizations.²⁹
- Research scoping workshops were also supported and colleges were involved in a number of activities before conducting the workshops. Among these identification of research areas was conducted and research agenda discussed with their stakeholders so that the research conducted is aligned to national priorities. Research scoping workshops were conducted by all colleges (6) of higher education except Orotha School of Medicine due to lack of timely approval and availability of the required budgets made available on time.
- Procurement of equipment for the following 2 colleges of persons with special needs (vision impaired persons) brails, special computers, special printers, digital voice recorders, one server, etc.), was completed:
 - College of Arts and Science – 20 students
 - Community College of Teachers' Education – 15 students
- With the UNDP support, establishment of digital libraries in the colleges (desktop computers, printers, laptops) has been completed. These digital libraries will help the entire community of colleges and the students will be able to load academic material.
- With the assistance of UNDP, Ministry of Finance (MoF) and Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MoFA), the NCHE organized an International Conference on broad areas from 20 – 22 July 2016. Four hundred fifty (450) persons from 26 countries including Germany, Italy, USA, Fiji, participated and 120 research papers were presented in this conference. UNDP has financed the publication of the conference proceedings, which is in the process.
- New and relevant curriculum for selected courses was introduced and implemented. Several mining companies are engaged in exploration activities and Bisha mining company and others are already in operation. Thus, due to the importance of this sector, the development of human resources in particular in the field of mining engineering is crucial. In Eritrean Institute of Technology (EIT), the Department of Mining Engineering and Process engineering was established in 2010. UNDP funded the recruitment of a mining expert from the Sudan to work in the Department who taught three courses for two months and reviewed the curriculum of the Department.

²⁹ Second Report on Eritrean Research Fund, National Commission for Higher Education, Asmara, August 2015.

Recruitment of 9 experts for EIT could not be completed due to non-availability of suitable candidates.

Evaluation noted that UNDP support has enabled the NCHE to institutionalize research and create a vibrant culture of research in institutions of higher education. By organizing research workshops, in which institutions of higher education discuss their research agenda with their stakeholders, the NCHE has ensured that research done by academics are properly aligned with national policies and priorities. The NCHE is in the process of creating a critical mass of researchers that will lead dialogue on issues of national importance. Digital libraries will make the access to information and knowledge, easy for the students and teachers alike.

Despite some slow pace of activities in 2015, the overall progress towards achieving this output was highly satisfactory.

v) Capacity building of the Ministry of Justice (MoJ)

This programme was designed to assist MoJ to develop training programmes for community courts judges, replicate pilot case-flow management information system in other regions, and provide support to the implementation and coordination of civic education programme in the country.

Training was provided to 20 staff of the Ministry on archives and Library Information Management System (LIMS) and the MoJ has 4 local IT staff to support in the work. An expert from Italy provided training on how to convert to digitalization. Equipment required to implement this activity (computers, scanners, servers, printers and software) were in place. The digital library has been established and is functional.

The Electronic books are loaded and work on digitization of court cases is in progress, and digitization of MoJ archives from 1991-1996 has been completed. The aim of this activity is to introduce paperless communication and provide access on information to law students and other stakeholders. MoJ is also establishing networking infrastructure to connect central office with different stakeholders. The progress of this activity is slow due to frequent interruptions of internet. This facility will create awareness among public about the justice and court system, and their rights. This will build the trust of public on justice system and improve the accountability level of MoJ.

The progress towards achieving this output is rated as highly satisfactory.

vi) Gender equality and advancement of women

Recognizing that gender is a cross-cutting issue, UNDP assisting Government in its efforts to close the wide gender disparity gaps by mainstreaming gender policy and providing both technical and financial support in various gender related area.

This is a joint programme between the GoSE, its implementing partner, NUEW, and the UN agencies (i.e. UNDP, UNFPA, UNICEF, UNHCR and UNAIDS). The programme is aligned with the priorities of the National Gender Action Plan and National Policy on Gender, as well as those of Outcome 8 of the SPCF2013-2016.³⁰ This intervention started aggressively in 2013. The main achievements are given below:

- During various periods of time in 2013, training and awareness campaign were carried out on various topics such as early marriages and consequences, gender equality, gender empowerment and leadership, awareness and law enforcement, around FGM/C and human rights. About 2,308 persons comprising 53% women and 47% men participated in the training. The participants included, Zoba and sub-zoba governors, baito leaders, students, adults and NUEW and PFDJ representatives.
- In 2015, NUEW influenced 2 out of 17 Ministries to have gender focal persons who shall strategically do in-house lobbying for gender equality promotion. Gender mainstreaming strategies of Ministry of Education and Agriculture were reviewed.
- UNDP assisted in conducting mapping exercise of 14 FGM free villages of Zoba Debub, and sensitized and empowered the communities on abandoning harmful traditional practices. Results of the mapping exercise revealed that a significant decrease in the prevalence for under 5 and 15 years of age from 12.4% and 33% to 6.9% and 18.8% respectively in 2014 compared to 95% in 1995. These achievements were made through about 2,745 anti-FGM committees those were established nation-wide in 2006.
- Coaching and mentoring of 139 women were conducted to prepare them for leadership and decision making. Advocacy sessions on women advancement for decision makers were conducted in all 6 zobas.
- As part of its strategy to advance women in leadership and decision making positions, a total of 83 selected women in civil service were equipped with skills and knowledge on assuming responsibility in senior decision making positions. This was done through UNDP's support to NUEW's leadership coaching programme that has prepared the women to take up higher level leadership position.
- Training programme conducted on creating awareness and law enforcement in FGM, early marriages, HIV/AIDs, violence against women (VAW) for community judges, local governors, NUEW including refugee religious and community leaders, refugee youth groups and Somali refugee women association at different level in two regions. As part of global campaign, in 2015 NUEW organized programmes from community level to National level in solidarity to eliminate VAW all over the world, to also acknowledge and institutionalize the achievements accomplished in the past.
- The NUEW's Five Year Strategic Action Plan was prepared and widely discussed among stakeholders for validation in 2016. The Strategic Action Plan has helped NUEW to

³⁰ 2015 Standard Progress Report for the JP on Gender Equity and Advancement of Women (ER14U505), UNFPA Asmara. Eritrea

strengthen its leadership and coordination roles on gender equality promotion across departments and Ministries.

- NUEW produced the 5th CEDAW report, the Beijing +20 report, CRVS report and the 2nd National Gender Action Plan. The reports provide important information for use in advocacy and performance tracking of the country's efforts in promoting and protecting gender equality. The 5th CEDAW report translated into local language and widely disseminated to the communities through the seminars. South to South cooperation on gender and women empowerment promoted at the International Symposium attended by women leaders from 7 countries and regional bodies. This has created a platform for knowledge sharing and networking where by an agreement on exchange of experience and mutual collaboration in the domains of education, as well as health was signed by the NUEW and Sudanese Women's General Union.
- A high level representative from NUEW and UN participated in 59th session of the Commission on the Status of Women and a side event was organized where a paper was presented on "Empowering Women: Eritrea's Achievements and Experience".
- The capacity of NUEW HQ and regional offices has been enhanced by establishing M&E unit within NUEW and provision of data processing equipment, thereby increasing prominence of the gender equality and women empowerment agenda among indicative development priorities for the government from 2017 -2021.
- In relation to promotion of gender equality, NUEW enhanced consolidation of its influence by producing a five year Strategic Action Plan. The Strategic Action Plan has helped NUEW to strengthen its leadership and coordination roles on gender equality promotion across departments and Ministries.

Satisfactory level of progress of this programme was high.

vii) Labour Force and Productivity Survey

As to the marked objective of the Labour and Productivity Survey being to study and understand the labour market situation of the country focusing on both demand and supply components of the labour market. The survey was conducted to collect data on the economic activities of the population that includes detailed information on employment, unemployment, underemployment, and economically inactive persons and its causes according to background characteristics.

With the financial assistance of UNDP, the MoLHW has conducted the labour force survey in collaboration with NUEYS in 2015. Before the start of survey, a two-day workshop was organized from 25-26 August, 2016 at NCEW to discuss the questionnaire with the users. The sample of 7,000 conventional households was drawn in 491 villages or cluster stratified into 6 zobas by urban and rural areas. The field work was carried out by 10 teams, each team comprising 5 field staff (3 interviewers, one field editor and one supervisor).³¹

³¹ Eritrea Labour Force and Productivity Survey 2015, Ministry of Labour and Human Welfare, Government of State of Eritrea, Asmara, August 2016.

Both the fieldwork and data entry personnel were provided with 20-day training by MoLHW and NSO from 26 October to 13 November 2016 before despatching the teams to their respected zobas. Beside, briefing about the survey was also given to the six Ministry of Local Government's administrators since they were the member of technical committees.

The Ministry plans to undertake a productivity survey in 2016. In collaboration with NUEYS, MoLHW also plans to conduct a survey skills shortage and need of labour.

MoLHW pointed out that the labour survey was first of nature in Eritrea. The survey results will provide information on labour force to the entrepreneurs and employers. The capacity of Ministry staff was built in designing questionnaire, collecting data and analysis enhanced by undertaking extensive training and participating in the labour survey. Selected staff of MoLHW also attended the results-based M&E training provided by UNICEF.

The progress towards achieving this output is satisfactory

viii) Support to the Ministry of Finance (MoF)

MoF is a key government institution that mobilizes controls and administers the country's financial resources and acts as a custodian of government property. Under, the SPCF 2013-2016, the project was aimed at supporting MoF in strengthening the human and institutional capacity by enhancing the MIS. This support was designed to contribute to the capacity of MoF in providing services effectively and efficiently thus ensuring customer satisfaction and public awareness of taxes and other obligations by improving employees' productivity and working environment and its human and property management information system.

Project implementation started towards the end of the second quarter due to delays in the finalization and signing of the 2014 AWP. UNDP support strengthened the capacity of the MoF through the provision of technical support, and modern and adequate ICT equipment. The assistance was provided to build the capacity of MoF to improve the annual recurrent and development budget processing system, strengthen treasury operations system including disbursement, accounting and reporting of government transactions, upgrade and integrate Treasury systems and link it with budget and fiscal planning systems and/or work towards having IFMIS. The support also embraced capacity development to develop new Public/Government property administration system and properly record, track and report public property. In addition, assistance was provided to the Inland Revue Department to analyze and review the existing system and identify all gaps in its functionality with respect to the collection of tax according to the laws and regulations of the IRD. This intervention is expected to have a positive impact on the effectiveness and efficiency in administering tax which include tax payers' registration, declaration, assessment, auditing, payment, clearance and reporting, as well as any other statistical and analytical works in the Inland Revenue Department.

In addition, with UNDP support a Study Report was produced that reviewed and analysed capacity gaps in the management information systems on meeting the evolving needs of the departments in MoF and the government in general. The report also included recommendation on frameworks to build future public financial management and tax administration systems. The findings of these

two studies have informed the design and approval of the \$2.5m AfDB grant to the MoF for strengthening planning and treasury management frameworks and to establish a robust Integrated Financial Management Information System (IFMIS).

Through this project, UNDP provided to MoF 105 desktop computers, 5 laptops, 75 heavy duty black and white printers, 28 photocopiers, 4 servers, 5 caners, 12 fax machines, 10 networking switches and other supplies. Over the last four years power outages in Eritrea have been very erratic, thus adversely affecting the operations of the Ministry of Finance (MoF). This situation threatened the day-to-day operation of the MoF. Realizing the seriousness of the problem, the UNDP supported the Ministry with solar energy technology. These IT Equipment and solar power will support the Ministry to improve its operations and provide quality public service.

Training on software development for 30 IT staff and on networking and for 50 non-IT staff of MoF could not be undertaken due to non-release of US\$56,584 that remained unspent in 2015. UNDP may review the funding proposal and release this unspent budget for carrying out planned training.

The delivery of equipment was complete but training programme on the use of did not start due to non-availability of funds. The support has created improved working conditions which motivated employees to enhance their performance and efficiency in the delivery of public services, leading to customer satisfaction.

Overall progress towards achieving this output was satisfactory.

ix) National Confederation of Eritrean Workers (NCEW)

The overall objective of the UNDP support was to strengthen the capacity of NCEW to promote, decent work, effective and strong social dialogue and workers industrial skill, as well as, to foster tripartite alliance between the Government, Trade Unions and employers organizations in order to make contribution for the growth of the national economy.

Despite some delays, NCEW implemented project activities effectively and most of the targets set in the work plans were achieved. Total 4,130 persons from trade unions that comprised 66% men and 34% women, were trained in various vital areas such as effective leadership, project cycle, negotiation skills for member as well as ToTs, human rights and awareness about decent work. In addition, lobby and campaigns were launched on developing tripartite cooperation with professional associations. An important event, “International Symposium on strengthening bilateral relations” was successfully organized by from 22 -25 February 2015 by NCEW. Prominent delegates from 52 countries from Africa and other regions, including representative from ILO, Cairo participated in this symposium. NCEW organized the ‘International Trade Union Conference’ from 23 – 25 March 2016, jointly with the African Regional Organization of International Trade Union Confederation (ITUC-Africa) and the International Trade Union Confederation (ITUC). The conference was very successful in promoting the solidarity of over 35 national, regional and international trade unions for a common cause that of promoting a decent work agenda. The participants were drawn from across the three continents, namely Africa, Asia and Europe, among them prominent veteran trade union leaders. The conference also raised the image of Eritrea in international community and opened the doors for ILO technical assistance.

Evaluation noted that the project activities were implemented in accordance with the annual work plans within the envisaged time. Majority of the tasks were accomplished ahead of stipulated time, demonstrating good efficiency.

Evaluation found that overall progress of NCEW was highly satisfactory.

Table 1: Training conducted by NCEW and participants

Topic of training/workshop/seminar	Total Participants	Gender desegregation	
		Mae	Female
Management skills for effective leadership	1,200	660	540
Project cycle	20	12	8
Negotiation skills	480	NA	NA
Negotiation skills for TOTs	160	104	56
Training on administration and management system and procedures to HQ and zoba staff	210	155	55
Workshop on of existing constitution and organizational structure	36	NA	NA
Decent Work Agenda	720	558	162
Sensitization and awareness creation on Decent Work	90	65	25
Seminar on human rights	560	380	180
Lobbying and advocacy for tripartite and cooperation workshop	234	146	88
Campaign to extend cooperation and affiliation of professional associations	420	315	105
International Symposium on strengthening bilateral relations (22-25 February 2015)	Trade union leaders from 52 countries (Africa, China, Italy and Turkey)		
Total	4,130	2,395	1,219 (34%)

Source: NCEW, August 2016

x) **Support to Ministry of Health (MoH)**³²

The project focused on enhancing the existing training centres, medical services unit and developing capacity of the M&E Unit of the MoH and finalizing the procurement of ICU equipment carried over from 2102.

UNDP support to MoH was basically limited to procurement of equipment and supplies for intensive care unit (ICU). This support has enhanced the efficiency of the ICU, minimized risks and increased number of people getting ICU services.

³² Ibid 8.

CHAPTER THREE

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

3.1. CONCLUSION

Evaluation found that SPCF 2013 – 2016 outcome 4 programmes were strongly anchored in the development priorities of the country, articulated in Eritrea's long-term and medium-term national development frameworks, as well as in emerging needs of the Government. By leveraging its strong relationship with the Government, UNDP played an important role bringing the Government closer to the donor and meeting its international obligations and commitments. Outcome 4 addressed the country's widely recognized weakness in institutional capacity in its programmes and made important contributions, such as by building the skills of personnel and strengthening capacity by providing required equipment. These efforts require continuous follow-up to ensure lasting institutional capacity.

Most of the targets were achieved, while progress on some was slow and some programmes could not be implemented due to various reasons including delayed approvals and transfer of funds, non-availability of funds and lack of staff and expertise. Programme efficiency could be further strengthened.

3.2. RELEVANCE

Relevance of project activities and initiatives concerns the extent to which a development initiative and its intended outputs or outcomes are consistent with national and local policies and priorities and the needs of intended beneficiaries. Relevance also considers the extent to which the initiative is responsive to UNDP corporate plan and human development priorities of empowerment and gender equalities issues.

Handbook on Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation for Development Results, UNDP, 2011.

- The support provided under Outcome 4 is need-based and has targeted the weak areas of capacity development of national institutions, both in terms of human and institutional those are of paramount importance for the country's economic and social development. This outcome focused on providing support to GoSE to accelerate progress in achieving MDGs 3 and 8 on national capacity development and gender that were lagging behind. MoND also identified the gaps in capacity, both human and institutional, of the national institutions to deliver on key public sector services and as a key area for UNDP support.³³
- The establishment of database, conducting national surveys, dissemination and dissemination of vital data and information for informed decision making is found to be highly relevant.

³³ Ibid 27.

- Moreover, capacity of MoF, MoJ, EIT and MoMR is also being strengthened and the protection and provision of essential services to refugee communities in Eritrea improved.

3.3. EFFICIENCY - Delivery of Project outputs

Efficiency measures how economically resources or inputs (such as funds, expertise and time) are converted to results. An initiative is efficient when it uses resources appropriately and economically to produce the desired outputs. Efficiency is important in ensuring that resources have been used appropriately and in highlighting more effective uses of resources.

Handbook on Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation for Development Results, UNDP, 2011.

- The activities undertaken and outputs achieved under Outcome 4 were efficient both in terms of financial and human resources utilization.
- Delivery rate was highly satisfactory in all years, e.g. in 2014 – 99.93%; 2015-100.1%. However, the delivery figures for 2016 will change from the current level of 23% in the end of year. Despite the slow start and capacity issues of IPs, and National Execution (NEX) modality, the use of funds was efficient.
- Procurement of equipment and delivery was effective. (For instance, in the case of NUEYS no cost over runs occurred in 2013 because prior adjustments and contingencies for price increases were made.) IPs were satisfied with the quality of equipment. Equipment supplemented by the technical support has contributed positively to the efficiency of the staff and institutions.
- There were mixed feeling about the speed of approval and transfer of funds. For, instance, NUEW and NCHE could not implement their AWP activities due to delay in approval by MND that in turn delayed transfer of funds.
- In the case of protection of refugees it has been found that the budget is fully utilized and no fund is returned unutilized. Plans are approved on time and no significant delays occur in implementation. The system allows some flexibility such as the transfer of up to 15% of the funds from one budget category to another category when need arises. (MTR).
- However, NUEYS exceeded its targets in 2015 and National Confederation of Eritrean was also able to achieve its targets. (In the case of projects of MOJ and MOF there was no significant delay in project approval and release of funds – MTR).

Table 2: UNDP Eritrea Outcome 4 supported projects planned budget and actual expenditure from 2013 to 2016

IP name	Project #	2013		2014		2015		2016		Aggregate planned budget	Aggregate actual expenditure	Percentage
		Planned budget	Actual expenditure	Planned budget	Actual expenditure	Planned budget	Actual expenditure	Planned budget	Actual expenditure			
National Statistics Office	00061922	100,000	100,000	174,131	174,131	166,952	166,537	150,000	0	591,083	440,668	74.552643
National Union of Eritrean Women (Gender Equality)	00056800	215,870	215,000	561,796	570,274	250,000	249,999	1,498,164	226,514	2,525,830	1,261,787	49.96
National Union of Eritrean Youth and Students (vocational skill development)	00092244	0	0	387,720	387,720	648,791	653,126	1,745,579	235,761	2,782,090	1,276,607	45.89
Ministry of Finance (DIM)	00088549	0	0	673,600	670,336	608,402	608,693	639,676	509,972	1,921,678	1,789,001	93.10
Ministry of Finance (NIM)	00072724	213,807	213,756	0	0	0	0	0	0	213,807	213,756	99.98
Ministry of Health	00081657	612,000	614,462	109,784	107,972	0	0	0	0	721,784	722,434	100.09
Ministry of Justice	00059865	650,000	650,000	867	867	0	0	0	0	650,867	650,867	100.00
Strengthening Capacity of Water Resources Department	00079991	169,600	53,804	369,846	364,778	0	0	0	0	539,446	418,582	77.59
National Board of Higher Education	00072514	250,000	252,019	200,000	200,000	119,568	120,173	152,884	0	722,452	572,192	79.20
Ministry of Labour and Human Welfare	00072514	0	0	0	0	692,079	692,079	20,000	15,829	712,079	707,908	99.41
National Confederation of Eritrean Workers	00072514	0	0			876,200	875,896	464,423	199,735	1,340,623	1,075,631	80.23
Ministry of Information	00072514	0	0	0	0	461,206	460,902	0	0	461,206	460,902	99.93
Capacity Building for Public Audit in Eritrea - Office of the Auditor General	00072514							924,161	85,119	924,161	85,119	9.21
South South	00085581	0	0	0	0	2,494	2,494	0	0	2,494	2,494	100.00
Ministry of Foreign Affairs	00047963	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.00
Total		2,211,277	2,099,041	2,477,744	2,476,078	3,825,692	3,829,899	5,594,887	1,272,930	14,109,600	9,677,948	68.59

3.4. EFFECTIVENESS

Effectiveness is a measure of the extent to which the initiative's intended results (outputs or outcomes) have been achieved or the extent to which progress toward outputs or outcomes has been achieved.

Handbook on Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation for Development Results, UNDP, 2011

- Overall effectiveness of the activities and programmes for outcome 4 shows mixed results. There are some activities that either did not start or could not be completed due to various reasons, mainly the delayed approvals and transfer of funds (e.g. MoF), lack of availability/shortage of professional staff (e.g. NSO).
- Quantitative indicators show that the Outcome 4 projects' support to IPs has significantly contributed to the capacity building, improved working environment and enhanced the self-confidence level of staff. With the support of UNDP, UNICEF and UNFPA extensive training programme was carried out for IPs in their respective areas of specializations that has started yielding results. For instance, in the case of NUEYS training for youth was undertaken effectively that resulted into getting employment for 52 youths (30%). 985 persons were trained against a target of 900. Similarly, in case of NCEW majority of the tasks were completed ahead of stipulated time. Also, through establishing working relations with the International Trade Unions and holding international symposiums, it has raised the image of Eritrea in the international community and opened doors for ILO support.
- In collaboration with UNFPA, through implementing its programme NUEW effectively created awareness about gender issues and gender equality among government epic management, zoba and sub-zoba level administration, leaders and rural and urban communities.
- In the UPR process, collaboration between the GoSE and the UNCT was strengthened in order to support efforts to implement the UPR recommendations and mainstream human rights across all line ministries.
- Support to the NCHE and the EIT was also effective in strengthening the capacity of the department of Mining Engineering and Process Engineering and development of research capacity in higher educational institutions. Capacity has been strengthened of the two colleges for persons with special needs by providing special equipment that will improve the ability and productivity of the impaired persons enabling them to actively contribute to the social and economic activities.
- Activities towards establishing a gender responsive national data base have been slow and less effective due to non-availability of professional staff in NSO. Functional M&E system also was not established in most of the IPs except NUEW. NUEYS could not fully implement its 2016 training programme because of non-availability of training centres.

NCHE could not recruit experts for EIT due to non-availability of experts. MoF could not implement its training programme due to non-approval of unspent budget (US\$56,584 in 2015)

- Gender mainstreaming was appropriately taken into account in all programmes. For instance 47% and 11% women in training programme by NUEYS; 34% women participated in training programme by NCEW.

3.5. IMPACT

Impact is referred to measures changes in human development and people's well-being that are brought about by development initiatives, directly or indirectly, intended or unintended. Evaluation of impact generates useful information for decision making and supports accountability for delivering results.

Handbook on Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation for Development Results, UNDP, 2011

At this stage it was too early to expect the real impact of outcome interventions on the national institutions, as the results appear after few years. However, through review of documents, extensive discussions with UNDP and government IPs' staff, interviews with key informants and other UN agencies, the mission has nevertheless availed the opportunity to have an approximation of the degree of programme impact.

The overall objective of the outcome is geared to support selected government institutions in enhancing human and institutional capacity which are critical to the overall development agenda. The outcome projects have built capacity of national institutions in priority areas enabling them to implement their annual work plans and mandates. t.

By constantly supporting GoSE in difficult times UNDP has emerged as a trusted partner of the government. Implementation of Outcome 4 activities adopted an inclusive approach that involved IPs and communities at national as well as zoba levels. This has raised the image of UNDP among the national institutions. This was evident during interviews held with representatives of those institutions; there was high praise by these representatives for UNDP support. This approach has also enhanced the credibility of national institutions among the public. For instance, the conference and symposia organized by NCEW has not only elevated the image of Eritrea in international community but also opened the doors for ILO technical assistance.

UNDP in collaboration with UNFPA and UNICEF undertook an extensive training programme for national institutions supplemented with required equipment. This support has built the capacity of the staff in their respective areas of specializations, improved the working environment and raised the confidence of individual staff. Particularly, impact UNDP support was visible in the achievements of NCEW, NUEW, NUEYS, MoJ and NSO. The capacity of staff was built in research techniques and data collection that will help institutions in M&E of their programmes.

UNDP support under outcome 4 enabled MoF to strengthen the ties with international and donor community and meet country's international obligations. These resulted to the production of two

country reports by GoSE and defend (Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination against Women - CEDAW and MDG 2015). In the UPR process, dialogue between the GoSE and the UNCT was strengthened in order to support efforts to implement the UPR recommendations and mainstream human rights across all line ministries to improve the human rights situation in the country. In 2015, the GoSE accepted 92 UPR recommendations out of 200 recommendations raised towards human rights protection and promotion. This was achieved with UNDP's support on active engagement and lobbying of the GoSE to participate in the UPR process. For instance, UNDP facilitated the UNCT/GoSE dialogue and support on implementation of the UPR recommendations. The acceptance of the recommendations was a significant milestone in terms of the GoSE commitment in moving forward to implement the recommendations. UNDP support enabled GoSE to produce 2015 MDG report.

In relation to promotion of gender equality, the capacity of NUEW was strengthened in planning, advocacy, human rights issues, income generating activities, and female genital mutilation has been reduced, enhancing women's participation in the economy and leadership positions. NUEW enhanced consolidation of its influence by producing a five year Strategic Action Plan. The Strategic Action Plan has helped NUEW to strengthen its leadership and coordination roles on gender equality promotion across departments and Ministries. The most effective initiative under FMG mapping was targeting the practitioners, influential people, elderly women, religious leaders, and parents. A mapping study conducted in 2015 in two zobas revealed that FGM/C prevalence for under 5 and 15 years reduced from 95% in 1995 to 7 and 19%, respectively in 2014, as a result of community sensitization and empowerment. Sustained community mobilization led by women and supported by legal reforms has achieved systemic action resulting in behavioral change. NUEW with its strengthened capacity ably exercised compliance with international reporting obligations on gender such as the Beijing+20 and the 5th CEDAW Report.

Support to the MoF resulted in recommendations of frameworks to establish a robust Integrated Financial Management Information System (IFMIS) and Eritrea Tax Administration Information System (ERITAS), as well as the development of three years actions Plans. As a result, the GoSE has requested for support from the African Development Bank to implement the IFMIS and further support in these areas will improve public financial management systems, the revenue base of the country, and the overall economic progress.

The revamping increased capacity of NUEYS to provide market matching trainings and to absorb more youths than previous years. 52 graduates (30% of total trained) got various jobs and 6 of them were employed in Keren zoba administration, Ministry of Information and NUEW. In order to alleviate some of the poor economic conditions fueling illegal migration, especially of the youth, NUEYS was supported to provide training and skills development for vulnerable people, such as the youth, women and girls in the country and people voluntarily repatriated from abroad. The project has also created a much needed forum for dialogue on youth and migration issues. In 2015, the Government of Norway approved an additional US\$590,000 for the youth project.

With the UNDP support an efficient and effective Library Information Management System in place that will benefit the MoJ staff, students of Law and other stakeholders. This facility has enhanced the capacity of MoJ, working environment and working efficiency of the MoJ staff. The system has introduced paperless technology and will enhance research capacity of law student

through the provision of an easy access to the related documents and material. Eritrean living in diaspora will also be linked with the system.

3.6. SUSTAINABILITY

Sustainability measures the extent to which benefits of initiatives continue after external development assistance has come to an end. Assessing sustainability involves evaluating the extent to which relevant social, economic, political, institutional and other conditions are present and, based on that assessment, making projections about the national capacity to maintain, manage and ensure the development results in the future.

Handbook on Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation for Development Results, UNDP, 2011

- An attempt has been made in the outcome design and implementation mechanism to ensure sustainability through developing individual capacity and institutional strengthening. Commitment and ownership of the programmes started under outcome 4, the two important pre-requisites of sustainability are strong in the participating ministries and other IPs. However, financial sustainability of the interventions will be a challenge unless firm financial commitments are made by the donors and government.
- Sustainability factor was strong in NCEW, NUEW, NUEYS, MoJ and MoH. However, sustainability of the programme is a major concern for MOF as the training programme planned could not be implemented due to non-availability of budget.
- Rigorous training programme has built the capacity of the staff of IPs to carry on their work more efficiently after the termination of UNDP support. Experience has been acquired to conduct national surveys and prepare country level reports. This contributes to sustainability of NSO and the line ministries capacity in producing and sharing data.
- Commitment of the NUEYS management shown during interview to continue expanding the programme is good sign of sustainability. Rehabilitation of vocational schools has not only ensured the sustainability of the programme but also the expansion of programme activities following the termination of UNDP assistance. Inspired by UNDP interventions, NUEYS has planned to establish a revolving fund for micro-credit for small enterprises.
- Sustainability is not a likely problem in the case of digital library of the MOJ because it has the human and technical capacity to run the digital library and to digitalize its archives. It is less threatened by staff turnover due to incentive systems that have been introduced to retain its staff.
- Main focus of the outcome 4 has been on developing individual capacity and provision of equipment. Sustainability is also dependent to a large degree on the establishment of an institutional and organizational structure that is dynamic and conversant with modern technological changes.

3.7. LESSONS LEARNED

- Ownership and buy-in of end users, i.e. national institutions, should be sought from the pre-planning stage, as in case of SPCF 2013 – 2016. This involves the end users to identify appropriate projects relevant to their needs, interests and capabilities.
- National institutions need the human and institutional capacity to cope with the systems and procedures of donor community, international organizations and global requirements. There are mainly human resources and institutional capacity constraints which seem to cut across most partner institutions, particularly governmental implementing partners. This situation imposes considerable pressure on institutions to do the maximum with what is available in terms of human, financial and other resources. Capacity problems, high turnover and low retention of workers have thus been common for implementing institutions.
- Human capacity alone cannot achieve the objectives of sustainable development, efficient service delivery and sustainable development goals (SDGs). Side by side institutional capacity also needs to be strengthened that includes institutional reforms and incentives, policies and procedures, internal structure, organizational transformation, accountability framework, mandates, vertical and horizontal hierarchy, coordination/networking, adjustment of ToR and job description.
- The procedures and regulations for disbursement of funds have been cited by many partners as main constraints to effective implementation because they caused unnecessary delays in the implementation of annual work plans (e.g. NCHE), and adversely affected the performance. Procurement procedures and processes both local and foreign also contributed to delays in the implementation of programme components. The shortages of funds and the difficult external socio-political environment have their influence at a time when additional resources were required to scale up and sustain project activities. For instance there are a few funding gaps which require immediate attention, to avert reversal of progress made on this outcome
- When dealing with various levels of government in programme and activity delivery, care must be taken to endeavour to engage with a broad range of executive decision makers, especially the apex management. This is critical for the success and sustainability of programme interventions. For example, involvement of MoND and sector ministries in the preparation of SPCF 2013 – 2016 promoted the integration between the participating ministries.
- Well-defined set of quantitative baseline indicators and targets of outcomes and outputs are vital for measuring the periodical progress, monitoring and evaluation of programmes. Also, inputs, activities, outputs, outcomes and goals are interlinked through results chain.
- Joint programmes approach produces better results as it economizes resources, avoids duplication of activities and promotes experience/knowledge sharing by the development partners and participating national institutions.
- Government policies of limited access to IPs have hampered joint, timely and inclusive planning and M&E. Similarly, government's restrictions on inclusive and independent

evaluative and analytical surveys/studies, and timely release of reports continues to limit availability of reliable baseline data for results monitoring and reporting.

- M&E is a weak area and M&E system does not exist in the national institutions. The progress of this initiative remained slow during the period of SPCF 2013 – 2016, except implementation of training programme related to data collection. M&E are two the integral parts of the project cycle that provide vital data for informed decisions. Without an effective M&E system the results, achievements and issues of the programmes cannot be reflected and disseminated. M&E system could not be established within the IPs except NUEW.
- Collection of data only does not serve any purpose. The analysis, classification and dissemination of data are crucial for effective planning and decision making. Labour survey conducted by MoLHW has produced very valuable data on labour market and demand that will be used in future strategy by the ministry and private sector employers. Periodical (every 3 years) updating of data will provide information on changes occurring in the labour market.
- NUEW - Providing training on an integrated approach created great opportunities for the participants and sharing their experiences and discovered great potential for the campaign. Supporting poor students will be a path to their participation in economic development activities and income stability.
- Eritrean women face ccultural challenges due to customary and religious laws, backward cultural attitudes and social pressure, reluctance of women to pursue their rights in court. They also face Economic challenges including poverty, lack of resources hinders access to social services, lack of education and medical services which keep them trapped in the vicious circle of poverty. More efforts and advocacy may change the backward and traditional believes and attitudes.

3.8. RECOMMENDATIONS

The outcome 4 evaluation provides the following set of recommendations, based on the analysis and the implementation progress outlined in this report. A few of the recommendations are strategic in nature, but majority are based on the constraints and challenges, as well as the lessons learned in this evaluation:

- UNDP, with its strong partnership with the Government, is in a unique position to galvanize development efforts in Eritrea. UNDP should leverage this strength to continue developing its programmes based on national development needs and on its own mandates.
- Outcome 4 support was mainly focused on building capacity at the individual level through training and little was done to develop institutional capacity. Developing individual capacity alone cannot improve the efficiency and service delivery by the national institutions. Institutional capacity little is a broader area that encompasses institutional

reforms, review and adjusts mandates and hierarchy, establish a system of horizontal and vertical coordination with a ministry/institution, review and readjust ToR of staff, performance measurement system and incentive system. UNDP may, therefore, endeavour to conduct a comprehensive institutional capacity assessment study to identify the real needs for institutional capacity development of the national institutions.

- In the context of financial resources efficiency, generally UNDP's main focus remains on the maximization of spending to achieve the targets of delivery. This is not the only criteria for measuring performance of the programme. More emphasis should be placed on measuring programme performance and change, and results of interventions.
- UNDP's indicators in its current program are not necessarily the optimal indicators for the particular development interventions that UNDP is pursuing. Good quality results—that is, well formulated impacts, outcomes, outputs, activities and indicators of progress—are crucial for proper monitoring and evaluation. If results are unclear and indicators are absent or poorly formulated, monitoring and evaluating progress will be challenging, making it difficult for staff and decision makers to know how well plans are progressing and when to take corrective actions. The next SPCF maybe be based on improved indicators and baseline data and in particular it needs to be strengthened and take into account local and international standards. Too often in the design of UNDP projects and programs throughout the world, there is a tendency to develop indicators as an afterthought to the narrative rationale, contents and change management theories of program documents. Following the SMART criteria, UNDP should design appropriate and detailed indicators that are properly scaled, measurable and achievable during a particular programming cycle.
- Delays in approval and transfer of funds were cited as major constraint to AWP implementation and for not achieving the targets. Flexible and simpler rules are required for day to day and routine activities and key agenda related to policy issues, budget revisions and other important issues remain to be the responsibility of MoND that needs to be strengthened through capacity building. UNDP may provide technical assistance to MoND to develop a guidebook on a harmonized procedure of project management cycle to be followed by all national institution. The guidebook should cover guidelines on the process and producers of project identification and preparation, annual work plans, budgets, approval and implementation. Each activity should be assigned a timeline. To follow these procedures and timelines should be made mandatory for the all national institution. The institutional capacity of MoND may be developed to meet these requirements.
- UNDP's support to digitalization and e-services was hugely successful and can be a model for the entire country programme. Increasingly, UNDP should strive to exploit its comparative strengths and become a knowledge-based organization.
- UNDP could consider strengthening its results-based (RB) M&E capacities, and support the Government to do the same. This would help in supporting UNDP and government institutions to establish RB M&E systems that would be based on SMART indicators to

assess results of development interventions and improvements in institutional capacity. Similarly, UNDP could continue to promote improvements in data collection and analysis, especially since the lack of disaggregated statistical data remains an obstacle for more sophisticated, targeted interventions. Efforts can build on the Social Card – Social Welfare Information System (SWIS), which generates data for analysis, reporting, and monitoring the impact of social policies, and strengthens evidence-based policy decision making.

- Refocusing the efforts of its governance program with a greater orientation to decentralization at all levels (see above notes on streamlining local governance) and addressing the inter – ministerial and intergovernmental overlap and duplication of authority and roadblocks to the effective delivery of services to citizens at the local level taking a socio— legal perspective. UNDP must do a better job of emphasizing the logic of interdependence of policy, institutions and finance and continue to support synergies

3.9. BEST PRACTICES OF OUTCOME

Best Practice for NUEYS

Good coordination framework created with Ministry of Information, NUEW, MoLHW. Under Outcome 4, 985 youth were trained in various technical areas, Fifty-two (52) graduates (30%) got engaged in various jobs. This is a good initiative to minimize outmigration of youth and can be upscaled. Using local funds and initiatives training in Civics annually for 700 youth with cooperation of Eritrean institute of technology (EIT) and teachers Training Institute (TTI) is also a good practice.

Best Practice for NUEW

The NUEW structure and its community base is very effective to reach women even in the remote areas. Membership in NUEW in all zobas increased reaching a total of 295,528 in 2013.³⁴ This structure has also been useful to other activities such as MoH EPI and other services as well as MOE literacy and adult education programs.

Best practice by NCEW

NCEW strategy to establish networking and collaboration with international trade unions and fora through conference and symposia is good practice to raise the image of Eritrea and open the door for support from donors, such as ILO.

Joint programmes

³⁴ Ibid 8.

Implementation and monitoring of programmes not only saves financial and human resources but also minimizes the chances of duplication by development partners. Implementation of gender equality programme jointly by UNDP, UNFPA, UNICEF and NUEW is a good example to be followed.

3.10. FOLLOW UP ACTIONS

- MoF could not implement its training programme in software development and networking for its staff, as unspent budget of US\$ 56,500 in 2015 was not readjusted for training. UNDP may look into this issue. Training on software development for 30 IT staff and on networking and for 50 non-IT staff of MoF not undertaken and is considered for follow up.
- NCHE could not implement some activities of its AWP due to delays in approval and transfer of funds. This issue needs to be addressed.
- The Digital library that has been established in MoJ requires continuous updating and improvement with new systems and technology and digitization of court cases from the Italian era is expected to go beyond 2016 and thus there is a need to speed up the work.
- There is a need to follow up the establishment a harmonized of M&E system at the national level as well as within IPs. UNDP and IPs may consider to shift from traditional M&E to results-based M&E system as desired by the donors and international partners.
- NCHE may expedite the recruitment of 9 experts for EIT.
- The preparation for conducting 2015 EPHS is underway and needs follow up to be finalized by end of 2016

A N N E X E S

TERMS OF REFERENCE
Consultant for Outcome Evaluation

UNDP Eritrea Country Programme Outcome:

“Selected government institutions have the capacity to effectively and efficiently provide services to all”

1. BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT

According to evaluation plan of the UNDP Country Office in Eritrea (hereinafter UNDP Eritrea), outcome evaluation is to be conducted in 2015 for the following Country Programme outcome “Selected government institutions have the capacity to effectively and efficiently provide services to all”. 2014 is the second year of UNDP Eritrea Country Programme cycle. UNDP-funded project in support of the above mentioned outcome is to be completed at the end of 2016, and there is a need to assess how and why an outcome is or is not being achieved in a country context, and the role that UNDP has played. This outcome evaluation will also help to clarify underlying factors affecting the situation, highlight unintended consequences (positive and negative), recommend actions to improve performance in future programming and partnership building, and generate lessons learned.

In addition, similar programmes are currently being supported by other UN agencies, such as, UNFPA, UNHCR, UNAIDS and UNICEF. In addition, the Government of Eritrea and United Nations in Eritrea are developing a new Strategic Partnership Cooperation Framework (SPCF), which will cover 2017-2021.

UNDP Eritrea Country Programme Outcome: “Selected government institutions have the capacity to effectively and efficiently provide services to all”

Human and institutional capacity development is critical to the national development agenda and to the achievement of the MDGs. During the past GoSE-UNDP cooperation, efforts were made to strengthen the capacities of targeted public institutions such as the Ministry of Justice, Civil Service Administration, Ministry of Finance, National Union of Eritrean Women and Department of Immigration Nationality (DIN) amongst others. This support resulted in improved delivery of services in the targeted institutions and pointed to the need to expand to other public institutions.

UNDP carried forward this success and continue to support national capacity development efforts in following strategic areas, namely: 1) Development planning and data for development; 2) Implementation of International Obligations and Commitments, 3) Youth and Development; 4) Higher education; 5) Disaster Risk Reduction; and 6) Gender Equity and Advancement of Women. In this programme cycle efforts are made to strengthen the human and institutional capacity of the Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Justice, National Union of Eritrean Women, National Confederation of Eritrean Workers, National Union of Eritrean Youth and Students, Ministry of Labour and Human Welfare, Commission for Higher Education, Department of Water Resources, and Ministry of Health. The total budget allocated for Outcome- 4 (CPAP) for the year 2013-2016 is USD9, 346,000.

- i. **Development Planning and Data for Development:** The intervention comprises support to the Government in data collection, analysis, dissemination and utilization of gender-disaggregated data including the introduction of comprehensive civil and vital registration system. Support will also be provided to conduct national and sectoral surveys and in the establishment of a comprehensive and gender responsive national data management system and strengthened human and institutional capacities of the National Statistics Office (NSO) at sectoral and regional levels to collect, analyse and disseminate gender-disaggregated data to inform national development planning and management.
- ii. **Implementation of International Obligations and Commitments:** The support involves assisting the GoSE to design a programme to fulfil its reporting requirements under international and regional treaties, conventions and laws. Besides, the programme will support the Government's ongoing efforts in the establishment of a well-functioning office to coordinate and follow-up on treaties, agreements and conventions signed by Eritrea. It will also assist the GoSE in tapping the skills of Eritrean professionals in the Diasporas to contribute meaningfully to the development process of the country; and establish a mechanism to help implementation of the UPR recommendations.
- iii. **Youth Training and Development:** This intervention will assist the GoSE in developing training programmes for young Eritreans in various technical fields and entrepreneurship aimed at increasing their employability in the economy; and will include but not limited to vocational training in micro-enterprises such as textile, leather, marble, and granite production.
- iv. **Higher Education:** The GoSE has embarked on a programme to enhance its human resource capacity in key sectors of the economy, including higher technical institutions. As such, the intervention will assist the Goseyun these institutions to enhance instructional and teaching capacity at all levels including the sciences (natural and social), digital information systems, and engineering, with special focus on geology and mining. The Orotta School of Medicine will also be supported to enhance its human and institutional capacity.
- v. **Capacity Building in the Ministry of Justice (MoJ):** This program will assist the MoJ to develop training programmes for community courts judges, replicate pilot case-flow management information system in other regions, and provide support to the implementation and coordination of civic education programme in the country.

- vi. **Gender Equity and Advancement of Women:** Recognising that gender is a cross cutting issue, UNDP will assist Government in its efforts to close the wide gender disparity gaps by mainstreaming gender policy and providing both technical and financial support for the following interventions: (i) strengthening institutional capacities of line ministries in gender management system, which includes gender analysis and gender mainstreaming into their respective policies and programmes; (ii) advocacy and awareness-raising on gender equity and equality among the general public and authorities with a special focus on the behavioural and attitudinal change with regard to deep rooted harmful traditional practices such Female Genital Mutilation, early marriage, test of virginity, etc.; (iii) strengthening the implementation and reporting capacity on international and regional human rights instruments such as CEDAW; (iv) Institutional capacity building of NUEW and its regional branch offices; and (v) finalization and implementation of the National Gender Action Plan.

- vii. **Labor Survey:** The objectives of the survey are to collect data on the economic activities of the population that includes detailed information on employment, unemployment, underemployment, and economically inactive persons and its causes according to background characteristics. This will provide current picture of the labour market across the country that could be used to develop, manage and evaluate labour market policies. The labour force survey in Eritrea will be undertaken at national level in 2015 taking sample of 5,000 households. The survey will cover the population living in private households and excluding Persons living in collective quarters, and Nomads.

- viii. **Support to the Ministry of Finance:** The project is designed to contribute to the achievement of the SPCF and CPAP outcomes and is targeted at building the capacities of the Ministry of Finance and the UN system in Eritrea to be more effective. It is expected that by strengthening the capacity of MOF to undertake more effectively its aid coordination role, this project will enable the GOE to mobilize increased external resources that are critical for the implementation of national development goals in general and the SPCF in particular, as well as the full attainment of the MDG goals and targets.

- ix. **National Confederation of Eritrean Workers:** One of the objectives of the NCEW is to ensure that labor education serves as an efficient means of improving the knowledge and skill capability of members to cope with the growing social, economic, political and cultural challenges that confront members and society at large. Thus, the project involves three major components for enhancing the capacity of the NCEW to enhance its labor education activities to train and raise the awareness of Eritrean workers on employment related issues. These three components are building the human resource/technical implementation capacity of the Confederation, Federation and base unions (affiliated membership), capacity building of the training centres in terms of strengthened structures and capacity to conduct and extend training programs to the other Regions/Zobas as well as integration the existing membership as well as potential members into structured training programs related

to employment and labour such as productivity, rights at work, social dialogue and trade unionism

- x. **Support to Ministry of Health:** Although not included as an area of intervention in the CPAP 2013-2016, the annual plan for 2013 was prepared to support the Ministry with focus on enhancing the capacity of the existing training centres, medical services unit and developing the capacity of the M&E unit of the Ministry and for finalizing the procurement of ICU equipment carried over from 2012.

2. EVALUATION PURPOSE

The timing of the outcome evaluation is very important in order to generate lessons learned and recommendations for improvement. This outcome evaluation will provide timely and valuable contribution to support strategic decision-making of UNDP Eritrea in the development of the upcoming programme interventions and discussions with national counterparts as well as prioritization of UNDP support towards achievement of other expected Country Programme outcomes.

3. EVALUATION SCOPE AND OBJECTIVES

The main objectives of this assignment are to:

1. Provide appraisal on the validity/relevance of the outcome for UNDP assisted interventions, and the extent to which the set objectives and envisaged outcomes have been achieved;
2. Assess the level of efficiency and relevance of the UNDP assisted interventions
3. Identify gaps and weaknesses in the strategy, and what could be recommended regarding the achievement of the envisaged outcomes.
4. Identify lessons learnt from ongoing interventions in this area with a view to ascertaining suitability of such interventions for continuation, discontinuation, refining and adoption in future work.
5. Take into consideration Gender issues in the evaluation process.

Expected output: The consultant is expected to produce a report that highlights the findings, recommendations and lessons learnt, and give a rating of performance. This might be summarized into an Action List – with a description of best practices in selected areas or in the appropriate niche for UNDP interventions.

The report should include the following sections:

- a. Summary including Action List
- b. Background Information
- c. Description of Approach/Methodology

- d. Analysis of the situation with regard to outcome, outputs, resources, partnerships, management and working methods and/or implementation strategy
- e. Rating on programme towards outcomes and progress towards outputs
- f. Recommendations including those related to:
 - i. Strategies for continuing/concluding assistance towards the outcome
 - ii. Lessons learned – good practices in producing outputs, and linking them to outcomes and using partnerships strategically, as well as suggested action plan for follow-up.

4. EVALUATION QUESTIONS

Key issues

The outcome evaluation is based upon a set of very clear goals:

- Assess organizational and operational effectiveness of the projects in terms of their contribution to Outcome 4- Selected government institutions have the capacity to effectively and efficiently provide services to all
- Provide a platform for evidence-based strategic decision-making by UNDP
- Build knowledge, learning and ownership amongst all stakeholders

Principally these goals should be pursued through the prism of the following criteria

- ☐ **Relevance:** whether the activities are in line with local needs and national priorities (as well as with donor policies);
- ☐ **Efficiency:** to what degree the outputs achieved derive from efficient use of financial, human and material resources;
- ☐ **Effectiveness:** the extent to which objectives have been achieved, or can be expected to be achieved;
- ☐ **Impact** which includes an assessment of the positive and negative effects of the projects to date;
- ☐ **Sustainability:** assessing whether the right kind of approach has been taken to provide the highest chance of long-term impact and durability of interventions.

The evaluation will need to address the following issues in depth taking into consideration the Gender Issues.

1. Progress towards the outcome

- ☐ Are the stated outcome, indicator and targets appropriate for the situation in Eritrea and UNDP's programme of assistance in this field?

- ❑ What is the current status and prospects for achieving the outcome with the indicated inputs and within the indicated timeframe?
- ❑ What are the main factors (positive and negative) within and beyond UNDP's interventions that are affecting or that will affect the achievement of the outcome? How have or will these factors limit or facilitate progress towards the outcome?
- ❑ Are UNDP's proposed contributions to the achievement of the outcome appropriate, sufficient, effective and sustainable?

2. Output analysis

- What are the key outputs that have been or that will most likely be produced by UNDP to contribute to the outcome?
- Are the UNDP outputs relevant to the outcome?
- Are the monitoring and evaluation indicators appropriate to link these outputs to the outcome, or is there a need to improve these indicators?
- Is sufficient progress been made with regard to UNDP outputs?

3. Resources, partnerships, and management analysis

- Is UNDP's partnership strategy in this field appropriate and likely to be effective in achieving the outputs and ultimately the outcome?
- Are the resources available adequate for achieving these objectives
- Are UNDP's management structures and working methods appropriate and likely to be effective in achieving the objectives?
- Overall, assess the scope, relevance, efficiency and sustainability of UNDP's partnership and management arrangements in achieving its objectives.

4. Recommendations

- Based on the above analysis, how should UNDP adjust its programming, partnership arrangements, resource mobilization strategies, working methods and/or management structures to ensure that the outputs and proposed outcome is fully achieved by the end of the programme period (31 December 2016).

5. METHODOLOGY

Information on the methodologies is given in Guidelines for Evaluators, issued by Evaluation

Office, UNDP. The evaluators are expected to use all relevant methods to obtain data and information for their analysis and drawing up of findings, conclusions, lessons learnt and recommendations. These include:

- a) Documentation review: Begin with the Country Programme Document for a description of the intended outcome, the baseline for the outcome and the indicators and benchmarks used. Examine contextual information and baselines contained in corresponding project documents, their evaluation reports and other sources;
- b) Use interviews, field visits, questionnaires and meetings to validate information about the status of the outcome; also use to the extent possible and appropriate the data collected and analysis undertaken by the country office prior to the outcome evaluation; and examine local sources of knowledge about factors influencing the outcome;
- c) Identify the major contributing factors that “drive” change. Do not identify or elaborate all conceivable factors;
- d) Probe the pre-selected outcome indicators, go beyond these to explore other possible outcome indicators, and determine whether the indicators have actually been continuously tracked;
- e) Undertake a constructive critique of the outcome formulation itself; determine whether or not individual outputs are effective in contributing to outcomes, drawing the link between UNDP outputs and outcomes.
- f) Analysis of intended or unintended effects of the interventions.
- g) Determine whether or not the UNDP strategy and management of overall country operations appears to be coherently focused on change at the outcome level. Examine whether UNDP’s in-house planning and management of different interventions has been aligned to exploit synergies in contributing to outcomes.
- h) Determine whether or not there is consensus among UNDP actors, stakeholders and partners that the partnership strategy designed was the best one to achieve the outcome; Look at how the partnerships were formed and how they performed; Look at how the partnership strategy affected the achievement of or progress towards the outcome.

6. EVALUATION PRODUCTS (DELIVERABLES)

The evaluation team will be accountable for producing:

- **Evaluation inception report**—An inception report should be prepared by the evaluators before going into the full-fledged data collection exercise. It should detail the evaluators’ understanding of what is being evaluated and why, showing how each evaluation question will be answered by way of: proposed methods, proposed sources of data and data collection procedures. The inception report

should include a proposed schedule of tasks, activities and deliverables, designating a team member with the lead responsibility for each task or product. The inception report provides the programme unit and the evaluators with an opportunity to verify that they share the same understanding about the evaluation and clarify any misunderstanding at the outset.

- **Draft evaluation report**—The programme unit and key stakeholders in the evaluation should review the draft evaluation report to ensure that the evaluation meets the required quality criteria
- **Final evaluation report.**
- **Evaluation brief and other knowledge products** or participation in knowledge sharing events, if relevant

At the end of the mission period, the draft Outcome Evaluation Report will be shared with UNDP Country Office, the Ministry of National Development, and other key stakeholders for comments. Draft report comprising especially the findings, outline lessons, conclusions and recommendations should be made available one working week prior to the scheduled completion date of the evaluation mission. This draft report will be discussed with stakeholders and UNDP management to validate findings, lessons and recommendations. A wrap up meeting will be held two working days prior to the scheduled completion date of the evaluation mission. Final Outcome Evaluation Report and any other associated documents should be submitted to the Resident Representative, UNDP Eritrea within two weeks of completion of the evaluation mission

7. EVALUATION TEAM COMPOSITION AND REQUIRED COMPETENCIES

Qualifications:

- Master's degree or higher level relevant academic training in public administration, economics, development management, or other relevant field
- At least 5 years hands-on experience in the evaluation and/or management of complex programmes in relevant field
- Experiences in gender analysis
- Experience in programme design

Competencies:

- A demonstrated capacity for strategic thinking
- A good knowledge of public sector capacity building

- Knowledge of results-oriented evaluation principles and methodology and familiarity with UNDP operations and knowledge of relevant UNDP policies
- Strong analytical skills
- Good interpersonal skills and ability for team work
- Fluency in written and spoken English.
- Negotiation skill

8. EVALUATION ETHICS

The evaluations will be conducted in accordance with the principles outlined in the UNEG 'Ethical Guidelines for Evaluation'⁶⁴ and should describe critical issues evaluators must address in the design and implementation of the evaluation, including evaluation ethics and procedures to safeguard the rights and confidentiality of information providers, for example: measures to ensure compliance with legal codes governing areas such as provisions to collect and report data, particularly permissions needed to interview or obtain information about children and young people; provisions to store and maintain security of collected information; and protocols to ensure anonymity and confidentiality.

9. IMPLEMENTATION ARRANGEMENTS

The principal responsibility for managing this evaluation rests with the UNDP CO Eritrea, which will contract the consultant and ensure timely provision of travel (including per diems) arrangements within the country for the review team. The Unit Head for the Strategic Governance under the guidance of the Deputy Resident Representative will be responsible to set up stakeholder interviews, arrange field visits and coordinate with the Implementing Partners (IPs).

10. TIME FRAME FOR THE EVALUATION PROCESS

The mission will commence on 11 January, 2016. The duration of the mission is 21 days. The mission has to prepare an Inception Report (Work Plan).

Evaluation design, methodology and detailed work plan 11 – 14 January (3 days)

Desk review 14- 16 January 2016 (3 days)

Field visits, interviews, consultations 17 - 21 January 2016 (14 days)

Submission of draft evaluation report prior to debriefing January 24, 2016

Debriefing management 25 January 2016

Submission of the final evaluation report 27 January 2016

11. COST

The total resources available for the evaluation is USD 20,000.00

12. ANNEXES

ANNEXES I Key stakeholders and partners

ANNEXES II Documents to be consulted

ANNEX III. EVALUATION TERMS OF REFERENCE

Annex 2: Evaluation Matrix

Evaluation criteria	Key questions	Data collection methods / tools	Data sources
Relevance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Whether the activities are in line with the local needs and national priorities (as well as with donor policies) • Was the Programme and project designed to address the priority needs identified in UNDAF and CPAP 2013-2016? • To what extent the progress was made towards the achievement of the outcome? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In-depth desk review of relevant documents and literature • Semi-structured interviews with key informant, partners and stakeholders • Vigorous consultations 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project document. Annual work plans and periodical progress reports, Results Framework, MTRs • Strategic Partnership Cooperation Framework (SPCF) 2013-2016 • UNDAFs, CPAP 2013-2016 and other UNDP CO reports, government reports
Efficiency	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To what extent the outputs achieved derive from efficient use of financial, human and material resources? • How much time, resources and effort it took to manage the portfolio and where were the gaps, if any. More specifically, how do UNDP practices, policies, decisions, constraints; capabilities affect the performance of the outcome 4? • To what extent M&E contributed to increased programme efficiency? What were the roles, engagement of and coordination among various stakeholders in the Sector in programme implementation? • To what extent Programme was successful in developing synergies between national institutions for UNDP support in programming and implementation including between UNDP and donors. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In-depth desk review of documents and literature relevant to projects • One-on-one interviews • In-depth consultations • Interview protocols and questionnaires • Vigorous consultations • Field visits verification • Personal observations and judgment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Periodical progress reports (annual, quarterly), annual work plans, budget revisions, project files, minutes of PSC meetings, UNCT • SPCF 2013-2016 MTR and other assessments • Perceptions of key informants, and stakeholders, government staff members • Budget revisions • Audit and evaluations

Evaluation criteria	Key Questions	Data collection methods / tools	Data sources
Effectiveness	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The extent which objectives have been achieved? • To what extent UNDP's been effective in producing results at the local levels in alignment to CPAP, and MDG/SDGs? • To what extent initiatives were successful in the capacity development of public and private institutions? • What are the achievement in terms of positive changes in the knowledge, attitude, practices and skills of the government staff at national as well as provincial level? • What are the foreseen restraints on sustaining the achievements at the national, provincial and local levels? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In-depth desk review of project documents • One-on-one interviews • Interview protocols and questionnaires • Vigorous consultations • Personal observations and judgment • Focus group discussion with target beneficiaries • Field visits verification 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Annual work plans and periodical progress reports (annual, quarterly) • MTR of SPCF 2013-2016. • UNDP CO, government line ministries, agencies and departments, academia, other projects and target beneficiaries
Impact	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What are the positive and negative, intended and unintended effects of projects to date? • What were the contributing factors and impediments and extent of the UNDP contribution to the achievement of the outcomes through related Programme outputs? • What are the major lessons learned to guide future planning? • To what extent has the Programme contributed or is likely to contribute to long-term positive or negative economic, social and technical changes for government ministries, departments, CBOs, CSOs and communities that participated in the Programme? What are those changes? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In-depth desk review of project documents • One-on-one interviews • Interview protocols and questionnaires • Vigorous consultations • Personal observations and judgment • Focus group discussion with target beneficiaries • Field visits verification 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Annual work plans and periodical progress reports (annual, quarterly) • MTR of SPCF 2013-2016. • UNDP CO, government line ministries, agencies and departments, donors, academia,
Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Whether the right kind of approach has been taken to provide the highest chance of long-term impact and durability of interventions? • To which extent Programme was successful in establishing mechanisms to ensure sustainability of the interventions? • To what extent Programme contributed to human and institutional capacity building of partners as a guarantee for sustainability beyond UNDP interventions? • What and to what extent are the outputs that may be sustained and mainstreamed or used for future programming? • To which extent have the government ministries departments, institutions, CSOs taken ownership of the UN initiatives? Are they committed to continue working towards these objectives once the Programme support has ended? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A. In-depth reviews B. One-on-one interviews C. Vigorous consultations D. Field visits and surveys E. Focus groups discussion F. Direct observations and personal judgment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevant documents, other donor reports • Perceptions of the participating ministries' staff, donors, CSOs, target beneficiaries • Internal assessments • Evidence from project technical reports • Mid-term review and assessment reports

Annex 3: List of persons met

United Nations Development Programme Asmara

- Ms. Rose Ssebatindira, Deputy Resident Representative
- Mr. Habte G., Manager Governance ,
- Ms. Aster Ogbaslasie, Programme Analyst
- Mr. Kibreab Gebremichael, Programme Analyst
- Mr. Aden Ali, Manager Operation

Government of State of Eritrea

Ministry of National Development

- Mr. Nemariam Yohannes, UN Coordination Office
- Mr. Afewerki Tesfay, Director of the Minister's Office

Ministry of Justice

- Mr. Daniel Semere, Director of the law drafting division
- Mr. Robel Weldemichael, IT head

Ministry of Finance

- Mr. Mohamed Nur Aman, Director General, Administration and Finance
- Mr. Efrem Tesfai – Director International Relations

Ministry of Labour and Human Welfare

- Mr. Woldeyesus Elisa, Director General

National Commission for Higher Education

- Dr. Zemenfes Tsighe, Director, Bureau of Higher Education Administration and International Linkages

National Union of Eritrean Youth & Students

- Mr Salih Ahmedin –Chairperson
- Mr. Yosief Ghirmatsim, Head for Project Department

National Statistics Office

- Mr. Ainom Berhane, Director General
- Mr. Hagos Ahmed

National Union of Eritrean Women

- Ms. Senait Mehari Ghebremedhin, Head of Socio-Economic Services
- Mr. Asmeron Goitom, Project Coordinator

Department of Water Resources and Environment

- Mr. Mebrahu Lyassu

National Confederation of Eritrean Workers

- Mr. Tzeggai Mogos, Deputy General Secretary
- Mr. Tekeste Baire, President

UNFPA

- Ms. Yordanos Mehari - ARR

Annex 4: References and literature cited

- Economic Intelligence Unit. (<http://country.eiu.com/Eritrea>)
- Eritrea CEDAW Report (2014), consideration of reports submitted by states parties under article 18 of the convention CEDAW, fifth periodic reports of states parties due in 2012.
- Ghebremedhin Haile (2015). 2014 Annual Review of 2014, CPAP 2013-2016, GoSE AND UNDP, Asmara, Eritrea.
- GoSE, Cabinet of Ministers holds meeting, Asmara 20 November 2015.
- GoSE (2014). Report On Training on Survey Methodology: Questionnaire and Sample Design, 27th May-6th June, 2014, Ministry of National Development, National Statistics Office, Asmara, June, 2014
- GoSE/UNDP (2014). Programme Document, Asmara, Eritrea.
- GoSE and UN. Report on the first year of implementation of the SPCF (2013-2016), Asmara, Eritrea.
- GoSE (2014). Report on the implementation of the Beijing declaration and platform for action (1995) and the outcomes of the twenty-third special session of the general assembly (2000), country report, Asmara, Eritrea.
- GoSE (2016). NSO, Asmara
- MoH/UNA (2015). SPCF, Joint Mid-Year Review, Asmara, Eritrea.
- MoLHW, Eritrea Labour Force and Productivity Survey 2015, Ministry of Labour and Human Welfare, Government of State of Eritrea, Asmara, August 2016.
- MoND (2014). Joint annual review 2013 minutes, Asmara, Eritrea.
- NCHE Second Report on Eritrean Research Fund, National Commission for Higher Education, Asmara, August 2015.
- NSO (2014). SPCF for the period 2013-2016: joint program on data for development (d4d), 2014 quarter i, ii, and ii work report 4d), Asmara, Eritrea.
- NSO (2013). Situational assessment of CRVS system in Eritrea, Assessment team report; Asmara, Eritrea.
- Tesfay Haile (2013). CPAP 2013-2016, Annual review of 2013 final report, GOE and UNDP. 99
- UNDP Results Oriented Annual Report 2015, UNDP Asmara.
- UNDP (2016). ToR of Outcome 4 Evaluation, Asmara, Eritrea,
- UNDP, CPAP 2013-2016, UNDP Eritrea.
- UNDP (2015). Mid-Term Review of SPCF 2013-2016, Asmara, Eritrea
- UNDP (2015). SPCF outcome 4 (environmental sustainability), final progress report 2014, Asmara, Eritrea.
- UNEG Guideline for Evaluators, 2002; and UNDP Handbook on Planning, Monitoring and Evaluating for Development Results", 2011.
- UNEG, 'Code of Conduct', June 2008.
- UN Declaration was proclaimed by the United Nations General Assembly in Paris on 10 December 1948.
- UNICEF (2014). Strategic intent memo 2015-2016, Asmara, Eritrea.
- UNFPA (2015). 2015 Progress Report of the AWP for JP on Data for Development (ER14U706), Asmara, Eritrea.
- UNFPA (2014). Technical Assistance for Civil Registration and Vital Statistics (CRVS), Mission Report by *Grace Bediako*, Country Director of UNFPA Asmara, Eritrea, 11-22 August 2014.
- UNFPA 2015 Standard Progress Report for the JP on Gender Equity and Advancement of Women (ER14U505), UNFPA Asmara. Eritrea.
- UNICEF(2014). Annual report 2014, Asmara, Eritrea.
- UNICEF(2013). Annual report 2015, Asmara, Eritrea.
- World Bank, Doing Business 2016 Measuring Regulatory Quality and Efficiency, World Bank Group, Washington DC.
- World Bank Global Economic Prospects Report: Quick note on Eritrea's 2015-2017 Outlook.