Annex 3: Notes from field visits to Osh, Batken, Issyk-Kul and Naryn oblasts by Gulnara Ibraeva, October-November 2014

Result 1

Within the framework of the project at the ayyl okmotu (local administration) level attention was primarily paid to the creation of service provision centers (SPCCs), where the "single window" format was promoted as a normative model. In majority of pilot ayyl okmotus the heads and employees perceive the SPC opening as a radical change in their relations with the population and essentially accountability realization. As it was noted by the Kyshtut ayyl okmotu of Batken oblast, Sagynbek Astanakunov, in his interview: "Earlier we managed people, but now we render services. Do you now understand what has changed? Everything changed!"

In the studies during the ayyl okmotu field visits the management of the local self-government authorities across-the-board attempted to locate the SPCs in separate spacious premises, having seated the specialists on one side of the table and giving the clients the opportunity to sit on the opposite side. In a number of ayyl okmotus – if resources allowed – counters with windows were specially built, in others they simply put in additional chairs for visitors. Only in a few ayyl okmotus the SPC opening did not lead to new organization of space in the local self-government offices: for example, in Kyshtut ayyl okmotu and, especially, Dary of Batken oblast due to limited space, admittance continues to take place in the offices of the social issues specialist and executive secretary.

Across-the-board in ayyl okmotus there are information boards with posters, information in various formats and leaflets with key information necessary for citizens to receive services (for example, a brief description of who and in which order may receive benefits, which documents and in what timeframe they can receive them, etc.), also the citizen visiting hours are clearly stated – by days and hours. In the majority of cases the place of visitation of each specialist is marked by sign plates, often stating not only their position, but also last names, first names and mobile telephone numbers. We were told by ayyl okmotu employees that it is not easy to accustom the population to following the working hours. The social issues specialist of Kyshtut ayyl okmotu Saltanat Gulzhigitova says: the notion of working hours has not yet taken root with people. They often come to our homes or call in the evening or at night. Refusals or requests to come during working hours are not accepted.

The set of specialists in the SPC "single window" was not unified within the framework of the project: if the ayyl okmotu is close to the district center there are rather broad opportunities to attract, at least from time to time, workers of the Civil Registry Offices, district administration for social protection of the population, etc. There are no such opportunities in more remote villages. However, sometimes even specialists present in the ayyl okmotu are yet providing their services according to the single window schedule; for example, in majority of ayyl okmotus land specialists "go door to door" in the old fashion. Thus, in Karabak ayyl okmotu the executive secretary, records manager and social issues specialist admit visitors; in Dary ayyl okmotu – the executive secretary and social issues specialist; and in Baetovo ayyl okmotu apart from the traditional "specialist set", visits are also handled by the heads of newly established municipal

enterprise on water supply (Taza suu) and waste removal (Taza aymak), tax specialist, housing and public utilities specialist, representative of the pasture committee, as well as a volunteer of the regional ombudsman office. There is also no unity in the approach in terms of functional responsibility for the SPC activities: in some ayyl okmotu this responsibility is laid on the executive secretary or social issues specialist, in others a special decree was issued and the responsibility is placed on another specialist; for example, on the information technologies specialist. Clearly assigned functional responsibility over SPC activities has, as shown by practice within the project, a critical value for effectiveness and stability of its performance.

Evidently, activities regulation, clarity of information on services as well as requirements on provision of quality services is a significant progress in citizens' access to services.

A comparison with a baseline study of access to ayyl okmotu services may demonstrate the difference in practices and norms in this sphere. At the same time it is worthwhile to note that a number of important elements were not implemented in the SPC activities to the full extent in accordance with the project's logframe. Particularly, the indicator for result 1 in the logframe is stated as follows: "percentage of ayyl okmotu that installed the "Ayyl" computer program, completed the creation of the database and conducted testing."

Field visits show that this indicator was not achieved in any ayyl okmotu, although in several ayyl okmotus (for example, in Batken oblast in all visited ayyl okmotus) the database has already been created but was not completed and is still almost not used, and in ayyl okmotus of other oblasts the residents database has not even been created. In these ayyl okmotus residents in the old fashion search for their register entries in journals, spending a significant amount of time¹. Moreover, it is indicative that in such ayyl okmotus as Kulatov, Baetovo, where they are proud of creation of the SPC and standardization of services rendered to the population, the absence of the database is not perceived as a big problem and conversations with specialists established that the management has not yet given instructions to create the database.

In the ayyl okmotus of Batken district, the databases for all ayyl okmotus were created in district centers where specialists delivered their journals of record logs and registration, financial reports, etc. But presently ayyl okmotu data specialists are only beginning to work with these databases and are experiencing a number of problems:

- on the one hand, it is discovered that the information in the database does not always correspond with reality (the database often includes information on deceased citizens, or there are citizens who are not included in the registry);
- on the other hand, local specialists lack the skills of working with the program adding new names, deleting outdated ones, etc. For instance, in Kyshtut ayyl okmotu the IT specialist Almaz was interested in the database, but he did not know whom to address with questions on changing or updating the database. Among all the ayyl okmotus visited, only in Dary a/o did the social issues specialist reply that she had began working with the software and that it has made her work much easier, decreasing the work time spent on rendering services to each citizen. At the same time, some inaccuracies and incompleteness of information about residents were revealed in the local database.

2

¹ During the visit of Kulatov a/o during my half-hour presence at the SPC two high school girls were trying to find records of their family in order to receive a local municipal statement of residence to receive a passport.

Another problem related to the creation of SPCs is the fact that the changes only affect the population of the central part of the ayyl okmotus, while residents of remote villages still unjustly have limited access to basic state and municipal services. Residents of remote villages have to turn for help to their own ayyl bashy [ayyl head], who according to the changed regulations should not and cannot give certificates, but in practice does so in many villages². In the course of field visits, the survey of residents of several villages remote from the aiyl okmutu has shown that frequently they are not even informed about the changes in rendering services.

The SIAP (service improvement action plans) developed in pilot ayyl okmotus have brought to light the most important gender-sensitive issues across the board, for instance, insufficient access of school children to pre-school education and nursery education, limited access of vulnerable groups of the population to medical services, weak awareness among parents and children about reproductive health, etc. Moreover, issues of putting in order the information flows in the community, provision of clean drinking and irrigation water, condition of roads in the village, etc., were also brought to the forefront in the SIAPs.

Development of SIAPs turned out to be a difficult task for all ayyl okmotus because very few ayyl okmotu employees and WGGG (working group for good governance) activists possessed skills and experience in strategic planning. As was recalled during the interview with the ayyl okmotu social issues specialist S. Gulzhigitova, the WGGG chairman Mubarak Yuldasheva of Uch Korgon ayyl okmotu, Batken oblast, even after special training it was not easy to apply the received knowledge in development of specific project proposals for the SJ Demomonstration Fund (SJDF) competition, and in a number of ayyl okmotus the SIAP plans had to be redeveloped during the process of mini-projects creation.

It had a great significance for activeness of a community in the SJDF competition if the ayyl okmotu head him/herself had an experience in development of projects and programs of development and fund raising. In places where the heads had such experience they were orienting at promoting their plans from the beginning and successfully solved them, as for instance in Baetovo and Kulatov a/o. Furthermore, in many pilot a/o the GGSJ (good governance and social justice) project began working with one a/o head and finished with another one, which created problems of management continuity and presented clear evidence for project "efficiency" paradigm change depending on how motivated a leader was.

Current head of Kulatov ayyl okmotu Nuridin Madimarov recalled: "I became the head only 1.5 years ago when the opportunities of promoting the initiatives on village development in the first DF tranche were already lost. Since prior to that I personally had the experience of working with ARIS, I quickly got the work on project development up and running. When I became the head I did a property inspection and found office equipment provided by UNDP for SPC at the warehouse in the former museum premises (in the a/o building). At first, among ayyl kenesh [village council] deputies there were many who objected: they objected to allocating 4 million soms for a new museum, to doing repair works in ayyl okmotu for 120 thousand soms, to financing their contribution in the DF projects. I had to prove that due to not being subsidized ayyl okmotu can spend 5-6 million soms a year on solving persistent problems and on

_

² In two villages during visits they could observe this process

strategic development. Gradually the opponents understood the importance and possibilities provided by these initiatives. Six projects were submitted under the DF's second and third tranches, only two did not pass, the initiative groups did not prepare all the documents. It is important that group leaders who became WGGG members, organized the work on project development."

For Abdimitalip Ahmatzhanov, ABD regional specialist in Batken oblast, the process of determining the priority problems of the community and development of projects project development turned out to be significant and to a degree unexpected: unlike in previous years, village residents began identifying issues of children's education, especially early childhood education, as pressing, and not issues of bad roads or absence of access to quality drinking water.

Measures on organization and carrying out public hearings were also significant in result 1 of the project; as a rule local budgets (more often plans for the next year) were chosen as the subject of hearings. In majority of ayyl okmotus briefings on local budget were prepared and presented by ayyl okmotu accountants, who based on their understanding and with the agreement of the head announced certain aspects of the budget plan. Only in one of the visited places (Kulatov a/o) hearings were conducted in order to inform the population about the budget implemented during the past year and not only an accountant but also activists from a youth initiative group participated in budget analysis and the preparation of a presentation.

Although it is difficult to expect that budget hearings would quickly become a practical mechanism of citizens' participation in governance, even a one-time experience helped in several a/os to change the attitude of both the local authorities and citizens themselves towards the issues of financing on a local level, principles and procedures of the budget, as well as good governance. Particularly, in Zherge Tal a/o some critical comments by participants in the hearing became a positive mechanism to governance optimization for the leadership of the a/o. For instance, as recalled by Kubanych Tagaev, one of the female participants made them critically think about expense items that are usually accepted without a doubt as necessary, not subject to reconsideration. In particular, the organizers announced that as usually an amount of over 400 thousand soms was planned for heating the school during the winter season. One of the female participants said that it is useless to heat a premise with such a high heat wastage due to cracks in the windows and leaky roof, and the whole gathering agreed to reconsider the planned sum in order to take measures on decreasing the loss of heat, having allotted money on roof repairs and changing windows and doors. It is clear that the expenses on heating will have to rise significantly in the next year, but strategically it will lead to decreasing expenses already in one year. According to K. Tagaev, in Chui oblast thanks to budget hearings the heads of local self-government authorities could critically reconsider the policy on FRF (farmland redistribution fund) land distribution in order to provide a more fair access to land for the most vulnerable families in the village: young families, the poor, etc.

In organization of budget hearings it turned out to be problematic to provide the opportunity and motivation for participation of villagers in them. On the one hand, the tradition of distrust towards local authorities, on the other hand, a lack of understanding of the concept of citizen participation became the reasons for low level of presence of various groups of ayyl okomut population at the seminar. In some ayyl okmotus in order to ensure larger coverage of residents, hearings were conducted in all villages separately, even though this is a highly costly event. In other cases they tried to inform

in a targeted way and specially attract village activists. In such case the high risk of non-participation of more vulnerable groups increases. Sometimes the simplest reasons pose barriers for citizens' participation in hearings: no resources to get to the central village and back on public transport, hearings may coincide with certain personal events, or weather conditions also may prevent residents from coming from remote villages.

Creating a feed-back mechanism, organizing a channel for grievances and appeals is of prime importance in conducting reforms on local level and promoting good and socially just governance. Within the framework of the project a special component that includes special measures on cooperation of local self-government authorities, Ombudsmen institution and expert NGOs was implemented; it included counseling services and legal support in courts and other state bodies, training of population, village activists in civil monitoring and appealing procedures, etc. When equipping the SPCs, the opportunities for receiving grievances and appeals in the mode of strict information confidentiality were taken into consideration. The statistics produced by this project component provides evidence that the population is still very wary and reluctant to use formal channels of submitting grievances, it yet does not have the political culture of using the existing procedures and mechanisms in relation to service providers, etc.

Result 2

One of the most important, not only for achieving result 2, but all other results of the project, was the task of GGIWG (good governance initiative working group) formation and capacity buiding. Project subcontractors, "Ayyl Demilgisi", that worked on WGGG development with the aim of enhancing the capacities to influence the processes of local development and increasing the stability of new institutions, developed model regulations together with the WGGG members from the pilot ayyl okmotus and assisted in its securing by ayyl keneshes [village councils]. Thus, the WGGG institution received its normative consolidation in the structure of decision-making on local level. At the same time, despite the existence of a regulatory document in the form of a model regulation, WGGG formation happened in each pilot ayyl okmotu in a different manner.

The activeness and efficiency of the group were especially affected by the level of democracy in ayyl okmotu governance, presence of authority delegation mechanism. Thus, in some avyl okmotu, the IWGGG were headed by the heads themselves, in others initiative groups were headed by local civil society activists, in yet others these authorities were delegated to ayyl okmotu employees. In Uch Korgon ayyl okmotu, for instance, a local activist Mubarak Yuldasheva was elected as the WGGG head, but had little or no influence on the decision-making level. Particularly, discussing the issue of completion of the project on organizing a kindergarten in Boz village, in which significant project investments were maid, the WGGG head told us that she made a formal request to the head of the ayyl okmotu about the necessity of putting this kindergarten on the books and payment of employee wages from the local budget. However, she did not know whether the a/o head had taken any steps in solving this issue, and in her opinion neither she nor WGGG could further influence the situation with the incompleted project to open a kindergarten. (A similar situation took place with construction of a feldshermidwife station building in Nizhniy Kakir village, where there are still prospects of starting work in the station because the (female) chief doctor of the district hospital promised to "scoop out" a staffing position through the Ministry of health of the KR).

At the same time, the work plans andrecords of WGGG meetings in this a/o were in complete order and according to this documentation they took place regularly. In other ayyl okmotus the WGGG remained still-born structures that did not bring a significant impulse to local development. For example, in Karabak a/o the executive secretary represented the WGGG, was the head of the YIG (youth initiative group), and was also responsible for organizing the SPC activity - all in one! He admitted in his interview that he was not able to perform all these duties - which is why neither the YIG nor the WGGG operated as planned in this location.

In those ayyl okmotu where the heads/deputy heads or representatives of ayyl keneshes became leaders of the WGGG, the group more often was in reality active and participated in solution of set tasks, attracting financial and other resources from the municipality when necessary.

While commenting on the creation and activities of WGGGs, YIGs and sectoral committees, several project employees, including Kubanych Tagaev and Abdimitalip Ahmatzhanov, expressed the opinion that despite the fact that each project tries to create new structures - action agents, majority of whom are non-durable, live only during the project timeline. During our conversations with representatives of several WGGG from Batken and Naryn oblasts they voiced ideas that the WGGGs are, on the contrary, very important for project realization, but this should be a continuously working (termless) group responsible for all initiatives in the ayyl okmotu. Most likely they needed ad hoc working groups aimed at solving each specific priority task. That way a group would have a clear target and satisfaction from the results achieved. Whereas, if they work in all directions they inevitably experience psychological fatigue and decrease in work motivation, especially in a situation when several initiatives do not find support in the DF project competition. Thus, Saltanat Gulzhigitova told that at first the WGGG members were inspired, began to work actively, but then it turned out that working on projects requires both time and skills. Several people left the group and they had to find others to replace them...

Sectoral groups uniting women from rural areas according to blocks and streets of residence were planned to monitor, improve recognition of social problems and those who need help as well as track quality of rendered services, and eventually were supposed to influence the empowerment of women in the community and improve the relation between groups of women and local authorities. However, after a short-term process of mobilization and training for women, several of these women's groups gradually lost their dynamism. In some ayyl okmotus the very understanding of the point and tasks for mobilization among leaders of the sectoral committees turned out to be distorted: thus, during the conversation with the leader of women's monitoring network in Karabak a/o, Kanyshai Abdivalieva, it turned out that she had only a rather vague idea about what women united into groups should be doing, the network did not have a drawn work plan. "We united women to more effectively spread information among the population. I generally tell them all: come to ayyl okmotu more often, maybe they have some information for you." To the question "what information?" she implies the woman became confused and replied that she does not know but she is sure that ayyl okmotu may have some useful information for them. It is indicative that being a group leader for project of FAO-UN Women, where she has to mobilize women and distribute seeds and other resources she enthusiastically told us about the activity and successful results of the project. She proudly told that women in the village call her nothing else but "auntie seeds" and very much respect her. The narration about the activity within the framework of this project was limited by recollections on how hard it was to deal with women's mobilization, what kind refusals they received and pressure from men, how they went to Issyk-Kul for a seminar (she found it difficult to give the name of the topic and only said that they studied the law on state services and talked about the project). Kanyshai-eje was also smilingly remembering how women's football competitions were organized by WGGG members on a sports field landscaped within the SJ DF mini-project³.

Although SPCs were the engine in the movement towards good governance, allocation of a separate line in a local budget for improvement of the quality of rendered services was and remains impossible due to legislation having a fixed budget classification and codes of expense items of the local budget, which does not allow to distinguish this expense item. Hence, tracing the planned indicator 4 "percentage of local budget planned for improvement of rendering services to the population" is impossible. At the same time, on the practical level one can state with certainty that in the process of project implementation, and particularly in SPC activity, the local population received information regarding the types of social benefits that they may receive, and a large number of children and adults who have not had personal documents could receive them, which allowed them to receive access to social benefits and other state targeted aid in the future. As was stated by the executive secretary of Dary ayyl okmotu, Zhumagul Toktomusheva, for many village residents receiving passports and for their children – birth certificates helped resolve problems that accumulated for many years. The head of Kulatov a/o stated that he is sure that the SPC will be consistently reproduced in their ayyl okmotu as an effective model of provision of services to the population according to state standards regardless of who would come to the leadership of ayyl okmotu or ayyl kenesh. He said: "People have already seen a different model and understood how convenient and effective it is for them. Now they will not allow us to return to the old format of governance on a local level."

Youth initiative groups turned out to be the weakest link in majority of ayyl okmotus, except for the activity of Mobile Community Multimedia Centers (MCMC). The situation in Kyshtut a/o seems symbolic, where the recently built and equipped youth center was locked because no one from among the youth wanted to be involved in community service. As a rule, almost all boys-school graduates leave for labor migration, and girls either get married or leave to study to get a profession. As was sadly noted by the (female) specialist on social issues: "We used to think that young people have nowhere to gather, no resources to help them become active. EFCA and the Osh youth organization "Youth of Osh" helped to open this center, trained young people - but still there is no work as before." It is worthwhile to mention that during the conversation she said that it is difficult to work in the single window mode: because the room is rather small and when people visit, it becomes cramped and noisy. And to the question why they could not use the empty youth center she answered with a surprise: "yes, by the way, that would be good. I should tell the head to move the SPC there."

The most "visible" project component for the local population were mini-grant initiatives within the framework of the SJDF. Across the board members of the public, village

³ Later the specialist of the UNDP ABD regional office Abdimitalip Ahmatzhanov told us that the local initiative appeared in response to a suggestion made by a member of one of the monitoring missions to more actively include women in the process of change. When women started playing football, the local male community was agitated by the what they saw as a violation of cultural traditions and women's inappropriate behavior. The UNDP representative noted that it is very important for international development agents to understand and accept local cultural traditions.

⁴ in the logframe for result 2

leaders and a/o heads talked about the significance of solving the projects that earlier were not solved on a local level for decades. In the opinion of respondents such changes triggered trust of the population towards the local authorities and readiness to engage in community service to a greater degree. Thus, for example, opening community kindergartens promoted more active participation of parents, kindergarten parent committee in community issues. In Dary a/o, parents did not limit themselves to investment of funds in provision of a basic comfort and convenience for children that go there, but they began to control more actively the process of education and upbringing. In other words, interrelations between the parent committee, the head of the initiative project of the newly opened kindergarten and workers serves as the basis for further development and good governance.

Construction of a certain section of rural roads, laying on water supply and electricity, repairing youth clubs and sports grounds – all these and other project initiatives of SJDF in the eyes of the community demonstrate improvements in governance procedures, consideration of project target groups' needs and provision of quality service supply.

It not a coincidence that in some a/o the heads that understand the opportunities of fund raising, leaders of WGGG have prepared six or more project proposals. As it was admitted with regret by the head of NGO "Gulmaidan" of Kenesh a/o, Tursunai Kadyrova, and ayyl bashy (ayyl head) of Kuumaidan village, Abdurashit Kadirberdiev, in the first phase of DF they did not manage to mobilize the local activists to promote project ideas and this tardiness is considered as lost real opportunities of territorial development.

At the same time significant changes achieved with the help of project activity of SJDF may be at risk if planned tasks would not be achieved and corresponding monitoring of results sustainability would not be organized⁵ (in other UNDP projects/activity and all other partners). Thus, for example, the kindergarten building in Boz village⁶, which could not accept children as it was planned and is virtually in critical condition, despite the repair works conducted within the framework of SJDF project, may serve as evidence to careless management and ineffective interaction among development partners. Furthermore, for instance, if mechanisms of social order will not be spread to the level of local self-government authorities, current SIAP plans, or future plans, would not be possible to implement. If special training for secondary school teachers according to the interactive board work method and resources for lessons are not provided, the e-boards could become a formal, "façade" attribute of modern technology use...

Result 3

The population's lack of awareness and understanding of the requirements and results of democratic governance were determined by the project "Operationalizing good governance for social justice" as a key factor in the absence of good governance and as a key indicator of project achievements. In order to solve this problem within the

⁵ Within the framework of the project it was not possible to find the final analysis of the project components, including the ones according to the results of the SJ Demo Fund implementation, where it was clearly stated how many projects have been implemented but not reached the set goals

⁶ This incomplete project is apparently not the only one, but the assessment of effectiveness and performance conducted during field visits does not represent all pilot a/o.

frameworks of the project, UNESCO in partnership with "Kloop media" public association established a communication infrastructure of eight pilot ayyl okmotus and prepared 100 village correspondents to collect data and produce quality and publicly significant information to promote effective self-government.

The participants of the media component of the project, who are predominantly adolescents and youth engaged in studies, received a unique opportunity to get a short-term training and begin working as village correspondents covering the most important social events and problems of their ayyl okmotu.

The CMC (Community multimedia centers) created in the pilot ayyl okmotus even today became a serious professional school and civic school for dozens of young people, high school students. CMC volunteers and leaders from various pilot ayyl okmotus proudly told how after their addressing a local issue heads of local self-government authorities and other decision-making persons began "reacting" to the problematic situation. Thus, in Kara Suu ayyl okmotu of the Zhayyl district, volunteers Elina Azarkulova and Gulzada Beishenbekova told that kids from the center prepared a news item about a burst sewer pipe and problems as a consequence of flooding of a part of the village. It turned out that the kids' action was more effective than personal appeals from adult residents of the village to the ayyl bashy (head of the village) and ayyl okmotu head. It was only after the news coverage that the leadership began repair works. The head of the CMC, Soltonaly Chakchagaev, told us that community media centers are not only an instrument of informing and lobbying the heads of local authorities but also an instrument of engagement of ordinary village residents in the processes of decision-making, creation of village news and even communication.

The head of the Mobile Community Multimedia Center (MCMC) in Kulatov a/o, R. Mamatov, thinks that "the Center's direct function is production of publicly significant information, which is the main factor in provision of effective self-government. Also, community multimedia centers provide the local community an information platform where people can freely express their opinion on social and economic processes in remote villages."

Motivation and abilities of the project participants allowed to rather quickly create a core group of activists that turned out to be capable of competing with professional journalists. Thus, when the results of the competition in November, 2013, in the "Community mass media" nomination were announced the winners were the authors of a cycle of journalistic stories and information in other genre on the topics of labor migration, problems of school and early childhood education, problems with access to key social benefits and services – clean drinking water, sanitary conditions, medical and education services, and the blogbook presenting the works of volunteers and employees of the MCMC in 2013 consisted of more than 300 print pages; best works could be found a text and podcast format on the media platform "Kyrgyz media" created within the framework of the project and in "Golos ayyla" [Voice of the village] Android app. In certain cases articles created by the MCMC are also available on the local self-government authorities' webpages in which MCMC volunteers work (e.g., in Uch Korgon village).

MCMC activity turned out to be the most favorable for promoting youth and youth groups' participation in decision-making. As Rysbek Mamatov put it: "Prior to this project there was nothing even remotely close similar: youth did not have an opportunity to engage in the process of decision-making, did not have any opportunities for development and organization of leisure time."

Along with a large number of positive changes and broadening of young villagers' opportunities, a number of problematic aspects were revealed in the course of field visits:

- 1) Low level of acknowledgement/trust in the community, among ayyl okmotu heads towards the capacity of volunteer correspondents' articles to influence the decision-making persons/structures. In particular, in Uch Korgon a/o, during the collective interview a WGGG (female) member, initiator of the kindergarten opening project (school preparation courses) in Boz village told how she wanted to go on a work trip to Bishkek to try to personally influence the decision of the ME KR representatives in favor of allocating budget financing of kindergarten employees. To the question why not use their local correspondents as a voice and a lever, who could create a necessary informational pressure on the MO KR through social networks and other online and offline sources the members of GGIWG answer that didn't see these opportunity.
- 2) Domination of school pupils in the work of the CMC has its advantages and drawbacks. Speaking of drawbacks one should mention in the first place the high level of staff turnover. In some a/os the continued functioning of media centers are in doubt because of staff changes (e.g., Uch Korgon a/o where the only leftover activist of center (Aripov Atabek) has limited opportunities to visit the village because he is a full time student at University in Kyzyl Kiya. At the time of our visit to the village he came home for the first time in three weeks and did not know about the state of the center after moving from school to home culture.)
- 3) There is no permanent stability in the location of CMCs no certainty that they will stay in the same place after the completion of the project eg in an ayyl okmotus building or school. There have already been examples when a center was relocated to a less suitable place and material resources (Internet, electricity, heating during cold periods) begin to be an issue for the CMC.