|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Project Name** | **SUSTAINABLE FUELWOOD MANAGEMENT** | | | | | | | | |
| **Type of Evaluation** | **MTR** | | | | | | | | |
| **Unit Responsible for providing management response** | **Nigeria** | | | | | | | | |
| **Recommendations** | | | | | | | | | |
| **1.** | | | | | | | | | |
| **Recommendation** | **The Forest Management Committees (FMCs) and/or woodlots sustainable land management committees (Woodlots SLMC) should oversee the management of the MFPs with the guidance of Local Government Councils (LGC) within the Local Government Area (LGA):** Given that the initial design/intent and communication to the communities was to have the communities manage the three established MFPs. The Forest Management Committees (FMCs) and/or woodlots sustainable land management committees (Woodlots SLMC) should oversee the management of the MFPs with the guidance of Local Government Councils (LGC) within the Local Government Area (LGA). | | | | | | | | |
| **Management Response** | Agreed. | | | | | | | | |
| **Key Actions** |  | | | | | **Responsible** | **Due Date** | **Status** | **Comments** |
|  | A Sustainable Fuelwood Management Committee (SFMC) was set up in each of the three States/LGAs. These Committees are directly overseeing the management of the Centers, while interested community members are using the facilities to carry out their jobs, thereby generating income and enhancing living standards in the community. | | | | | -ECN/PMU  -State governments  -LGA/LGC  -Private investors  -SFMCs  Committees | November 2019 | completed | The initial opposition has now been resolved by the Greenland Gold Fati Services and the Saminaka, the Community in Kaduna |
|  | | | | |  |  |  |  |
| **2.** | | | | | | | | | |
| **Recommendation** | **All the MFPs should be converted to Community Learning Centres (CLCs):** The CLC should then be comprised of the following compartments: Inquiry desk, information/ business centre with small library, ICT services were local pay reasonable charges, environmental video facility for the locals to learn on environmental conservation strategies / approaches, the CLC should also have an administration office, a room for showcasing various environmental products and services. | | | | | | | | |
| **Management Response** | Agreed. | | | | | | | | |
| **Key Actions** | **Key Actions** | | | | | **Responsible** | **Due Date** | **Status** | **Comments** |
|  | To achieve this, a 5 kVA Solar system was installed at two demo centers to supply reliable electricity to the Centers as well as computers and internet services. Information/ business centre; ICT services with environmental video facilities have also been installed at the Cross-River State (CRS) and Kaduna Centers. This has helped in turning the Centers into ICT and Environmental Training Centers. | | | | | -UNDP, PSC ECN/PMU  -State governments  -LGA/LGC  -SFMCs  Committees | August 2020 | Ongoing. 2 Demo Centers converted. | Provision of reliable electricity access is a pre-requisite for the operation of such ICT training Center. |
|  | | | | |  |  |  |  |
| **3.** | | | | | | | | | |
| **Recommendation** | **Establish one in each of the three states a state of the art clean cookstove parts fabrication factory**: The factory will be a clean cookstove parts fabrication factory with the best machinery to do so. The fabricator shall not be allowed to finish the cookstoves, but to supply best-made specific parts to the cookstoves to manufactures who will assemble the final products at their cottage industries. | | | | | | | | |
| **Management Response** | Partially agreed. This can only be done through counter-part funding in the form of private investment from private investors. Catalytic GEF funding is not sufficient for such investment. | | | | | | | | |
| **Key Actions** | **Key Actions** | **Responsible** | | | | | **Due Date** | **Status** | **Comments** |
|  | Business Forum was held to sensitize private investors on the need to establish a dedicated factory for the fabrication of specific cookstove’s parts. | -Private investors  -FMCs  -Wood SLM Committees  -MFIs & MFBs  -Federal Ministry of Environment  -Federal Ministry of Finance, Budget & Planning  -Development Partners -Other relevant federal states ministries and agencies | | | | | December 2022 | Ongoing. Private and local artisans and fabricators are currently doing this on a very small scale. | The industry is still evolving. |
|  |  | | | | |  |  |  |
| **4.** | | | | | | | | | |
| **Recommendation** | **Establish at least two clean cookstoves and alternative fuel manufacturers in each of the three states** | | | | | | | | |
| **Management Response** | Agreed. | | | | | | | | |
| **Key Actions** | **Key Actions** | | | | | **Responsible** | **Due Date** | **Status** | **Comments** |
|  | Using private investment as counter-part funding outside GEF financing, SFM project has encouraged and supported the following young entrepreneurs in Nigeria clean cookstoves manufacturing industries:   * Happy Amos: MD Roshan Global Services (Manufacturers of Happy Clean Cook Stove) [happyamos@gmail.com](mailto:happyamos@gmail.com), 09097311102 * Linus Mbu Ita: Ekwuk Stove. Alesi Community, Ikom, LGA, CRS 08067925811, [mfaminyen@yahoo.com](mailto:mfaminyen@yahoo.com) * Chris Obi, Nenu Engineering Nigeria Limited, Suleija Road, Niger State * Fati Yahaya, Greenland Fati Gold Services Nigeria Limited, Saminaka, Kaduna State * Methano-Green Clean Energy Nigeria Limited, Ushafa, Bwari LGA, Abuja | | | | | Private investors, PMU, Relevant Government Ministries | December 2023 | Ongoing. Over 5 private clean cookstove manufacturing industries exist in Nigeria and the SFM project is providing them with catalytic support. | All the industries are privately owned and managed. We are expecting more of such industries before the end of 2023. |
|  | | | | |  |  |  |  |
| **5.** | | | | | | | | | |
| **Recommendation** | **Establishment of National Clean Cooking Financing Mechanism / Fund and Financial Deepening Fund for supporting access of clean cooking technologies by industrial, institution and domestic users:** There is a need for the Management of the SFM Project to unreservedly seek consultative multi-stakeholders forums that will seek ground-breaking ways of mobilizing more human, financial and technological resources – especially using participatory rural appraisal (PRA) approaches. | | | | | | | | |
| **Management Response** | Partially agreed. While in principle we agree with this recommendation, the political and legislative process of establishing a dedicated financing deepening fund will likely take years to accomplish (if it ever happens). | | | | | | | | |
| **Key Actions** | **Key Actions** | | **Responsible** | | | | **Due Date** | **Status** | **Comments** |
|  | * We have drafted Payment for Environmental Services (PES) framework for Nigeria * In March 2020, Multi-Stakeholders Forum was held to present the draft PES for validation * Catalytic grant is given to MFIs/MFBs to enable them give soft loans to fuelwood value chain actors, | | -ECN/PMU  -State governments  -LGA/LGC  -Private investors  -FMCs  -Wood SLM Committees  -MFIs & MFBs  -Federal Ministry of Environment  -Federal Ministry of Finance, Budget & Planning  -Development Partners | | | | December 2023 | On-going | Establishing a dedicated national financing scheme is a process that takes many years to accomplish. |
|  | |  | | | |  |  |  |
| **6.** | | | | | | | | | |
| **Recommendation** | **Conduct more awareness creation and training:** More of training and awareness is required in order to enable the SFM Project to reach critical mass for creating the desired transformation. The fuelwood sector has huge a burden of traditional disempowering beliefs and practices and to transform the sector, more people need to be trained and sensitized on the ‘workings’ of sustainable, clean and affordable cooking technologies. | | | | | | | | |
| **Management Response** | Agreed. | | | | | | | | |
| **Key Actions** | **Key Actions** | | | **Responsible** | | | **Due Date** | **Status** | **Comments** |
|  | * Additional gender sensitive training and awareness is being undertaken for the existing and potential stakeholders and beneficiaries. * Innovative awareness raising approaches such as use of social media (WhatsApp) as well as print and electronic media are being used. * Road shows/market squares campaigns are being planned; * NOA and other NGOs/stakeholders are being used in advocacy and awareness creation in the country. | | | -ECN/PMU  -State governments  -LGA/LGC  -Private investors  -Development Partners  -Other relevant federal states ministries and agencies  - Civil and government agencies organizations  -Beneficiaries | | | December 2022 | On-going | Awareness, sensitization as well as gender sensitive trainings are part of our flagship activities |
|  | | |  | | |  |  |  |
| **7.** | | | | | | | | | |
| **Recommendation** | **Establishment and Development of Woodlot/ new forestlands should be carried out as a first priority in State Forest Reserves, and in second priority in the Community Lands and third priority in Private Lands:** | | | | | | | | |
| **Management Response** | Agreed. | | | | | | | | |
| **Key Actions** | **Key Actions** | | | | | **Responsible** | **Due Date** | **Status** | **Comments** |
|  | We have commenced the establishment of SFM Woodlots in State’s Forest Reserves, Community and Private Lands with appropriate framework for sustainable harvesting of firewood and other forest resources In Delta and Kaduna States. | | | | | -ECN/PMU  -State governments  -LGA/LGC  -Private investors  -Development Partners  -Other relevant federal states ministries and agencies  -Beneficiaries | December 2019 | On-going | This is the approach adopted in the 2020 annual work plan. |
|  | | | | |  |  |  |  |
| **8.** | | | | | | | | | |
| **Recommendation** | **SFM Project Management should consider and roll-out various innovative ways to reducing clean cookstoves prices:** This will ensure that that the entrepreneurs are selling the cook stoves and are at least making meaningful profit margins for their business sustainability. Mechanisms like establishment of a financial deepening financing mechanism for the clean cooking supply chain and subsidizing the retailing of clean cookstoves should be sort and implemented. | | | | | | | | |
| **Management Response** | Agreed. | | | | | | | | |
| **Key Actions** |  | | | | **Responsible** | | **Due Date** | **Status** | **Comments** |
|  | * Market-based approaches are being adopted. * MFIs/MFBs are engaged to provide financing models for SFM; * Cookstoves financial products are developed to encourage end-users to form small groups where they can contribute money among themselves, thereby supporting one another to buy the stoves | | | | -ECN/PMU  -State governments  -LGA/LGC  -Private investors  -Development Partners  -Federal Ministry of Finance, Budget & Planning  -Other relevant federal states ministries and agencies  -Banks, MFBs & MFIs  -Beneficiaries | | January 2020 | On-going | Cookstoves produced under this project are distributed to trained business agents who sell the stoves at reduced prices. |
|  | | | |  | |  |  |  |
| **9.** | | | | | | | | | |
| **Recommendation** | **Scale-up project implementation supervision, monitoring and evaluation:** More inspection and timely capture of data for woodlots, tree nurseries establishment and cook stoves distribution should be ensured. PMU/ECN should have at all time the real-time data and information on the SFM Project Progress towards Results. Using innovative Project real-time data and information like GIS, GPS, Remote Sensing as well as Integrated Database Management Systems should be introduced to enable creation of a real-time dashboard visualization and analysis of the Project progress on implementation of various interventions.  Inspection, Monitoring, Evaluation, Accountability and Transparency at the state level should be enhanced, more especially if the state forest reserves (FR) are taken as the main approach to achieving the new forestlands and woodlots targets. | | | | | | | | |
| **Management Response** | Agreed. | | | | | | | | |
| **Key Actions** |  | | | | | **Responsible** | **Due Date** | **Status** | **Comments** |
|  | In addition to PSC meetings, PSC and PMU regularly embark on M&E exercises to supervise the project’s activities.   * In 2020, we have engaged a local consultant to facilitate the development of a simplified SFM integrated database management system (real-time dash-board visualization & analysis system) to capture real-time data and information to monitor and evaluate the establishment of woodlots & tree nurseries in the 3 states * In 2020, we have engaged a local consultant for the facilitation of the movement, allocation, distribution, supervision, monitoring and evaluation of SFM clean cookstoves deployed in Cross River, Delta and Kaduna states * In 2020, we have engaged a local consultant for the creation of a real-time dash-board visualization & analysis system for the SFM clean cookstoves deployed in the 3 states | | | | | - Federal Ministry of Environment  -ECN  -PMU | January 2020 | On-going | M&E at various levels is a routine exercise under this project. 2020 PSC’s M&E is delayed due to the outbreak of COVID-19.  The systematic monitoring and evaluation of the “energy-efficient” wood/charcoal cookstoves deployed as well as the woodlots established in the 3 States is imperative. |
|  | | | | |  |  |  |  |
| **10.** | | | | | | | | | |
| **Recommendation** | **Grant and co-financing administration by MFBs and MFIs to beneficiaries should be robustly monitored and assessed.** | | | | | | | | |
| **Management Response** | Agreed | | | | | | | | |
| **Key Actions** |  | | | | | **Responsible** | **Due Date** | **Status** | **Comments** |
|  | * GreenBank platform was created by SMEFund during the initial disbursement to help them monitor their performance. * In 2020, we are engaging a local consultant to facilitate the inspection, monitoring and performance evaluation of loans disbursed by MFBs/MFIs to the last mile/ base-of-pyramid (BoP) beneficiaries in Cross River, Delta and Kaduna states. | | | | | PMU, UNDP, PSC members, MFIs/MFBs, FCCPC) | January 2020 | On-going | Due to the COVID-19 outbreak, virtual meetings and phone calls are used to reach out to the financial institutions. |
|  | | | | |  |  |  |  |
| **11.** | | | | | | | | | |
| **Recommendation** | **GHGs baseline assessment should be undertaken in order to establish practical target of reduction per state.** | | | | | | | | |
| **Management Response** | Agreed. | | | | | | | | |
| **Key Actions** | **Key Actions** | | | | | **Responsible** | **Due Date** | **Status** | **Comments** |
|  | In 2020, we are engaging a local consultant to facilitate the assessment and monitoring of GHG emissions avoided from clean cookstoves deployed under the SFM project (CCM tracking tool). | | | | | UNDP, PMU, PSC | January 2020 | On-going | PSC approved this activity in the 2020 AWP |
|  | | | | |  |  |  |  |
| **12.** | | | | | | | | | |
| **Recommendation** | **More consultation with stakeholders and beneficiaries** should be undertaken at the state and national levels to close gaps on expected outcomes and targets in the next phase. | | | | | | | | |
| **Management Response** | Agreed. | | | | | | | | |
| **Key Actions** | **Key Actions** | | | | | **Responsible** | **Due Date** | **Status** | **Comments** |
|  | Stakeholders’ Consultations held more frequently. We held a 3-Day Multi-Stakeholders’ Consultative/ Planning Forum on the Implementation of SFM project in Nigeria: MTR Report: Past Achievements, Challenges and Way Forward + Payment for Environmental Services (PES) Validation at Channel View Hotels, Calabar, Cross River State from 9th to 11th March 2020. | | | | | UNDP, PMU, PSC | January 2020 | On-going | This is part of our routine activities. These consultations will continue in the coming years. |
|  |  | | | | |  |  |  |  |
| **13.** |  | | | | | | | | |
| **Recommendation** | **Continue the M & E Exercise by PSC**: Members of the Project Steering Committee (PSC) should continue undertaking regular M&E visits to project sites and the PSC and PMU should continue to enhance Project coordination and communication among various stakeholders, beneficiaries, governments and development partners. | | | | | | | | |
| **Management Response** | Agreed. | | | | | | | | |
| **Key Actions** | **Key Actions** | | | | | **Responsible** | **Due Date** | **Status** | **Comments** |
|  | PSC’s M&E exercise was planned for 2020, but due to the COVID-19 outbreak, it has been delayed. | | | | | PMU, UNDP, PSC members | January 2020 | On-going | This is part of our routine activities. These project site visits will continue in the coming years. |
|  | | | | |  |  |  |  |
| **14.** | | | | | | | | | |
| **Recommendation** | **Consumer and environmental protection, safety and quality of cookstoves should be improved**: Aspects of technology safety and compliance to environmental quality standards of cookstoves should be monitored and where necessary enforced or enterprises guided or supported in complying with the requirements. good.  **An effective surveillance or certification framework for the clean cookstoves should be put in place by the federal or state governments.** | | | | | | | | |
| **Management Response** | Agreed. | | | | | | | | |
| **Key Actions** | **Key Actions** | | | | | **Responsible** | **Due Date** | **Status** | **Comments** |
|  | In 2020, a local consultant has been engaged to conduct a rapid assessment and gap analysis review of Nigerian standards for clean cookstoves vis-à-vis ISO 19867, in collaboration with SON, NACCs, ECN and the Technical Committee on Standards. Based on this review, the project will sensitize domestic cookstove manufacturers on compliance with quality and safety in the production of low cost, energy-efficient SFM wood/charcoal cookstoves. | | | | | SON, NACCs, TEC, ECN, PMU, UNDP | January 2020 | On-going | Local manufacturers are part of the reviews for ease of enforcement and compliance. |
|  | | | | |  |  |  |  |
| **15.** | | | | | | | | | |
| **Recommendation** | **Promote Energy-Efficient Charcoal Production Technology:** More technology and licenses should be availed in order to spur production of sustainable charcoal, that efficient and effective technology for carbonization of wood fuel to charcoal. | | | | | | | | |
| **Management Response** | Agreed. | | | | |  |  |  |  |
| **Key Actions** | **Key Actions** | | | | | **Responsible** | **Due Date** | **Status** | **Comments** |
|  | Working with a local consultant, the project has partnered with a private firm, Roshan Global Services, to procure the license for the selected designs from the UK. We are promoting the design and construction of an energy-efficient charcoal production system in Nigeria.  The “improved” /efficient charcoal production kilns are highly economic with better efficiency of approx. 35% to 45% as against the traditional method’s efficiency of less than 18% efficiency. It is a system that saves up to half (1/2) of the wood needed compared to traditional carbonization and burns most of smoke with up to 75% reduction of harmful greenhouse gas emissions, thereby contributing significantly to climate change mitigation and the reduction of deforestation. | | | | | UNDP, PMU, Private investors | January 2020 | On-going | This will be the first time in Nigeria where such a system would be built. |
|  | | | | |  |  |  |  |
| **16.** | | | | | | | | | |
| **Recommendation** | **Sustainability of the SFM Project outcomes: The SFM Project Management, Government of Nigeria and development partners could consider extending the SFM Project to Phase 2 and expand to other states.** SFM Project phase 1 to be considered as a pilot phase. This will enable the Projects gains to be consolidated as the Project gear up to entrenching sustainable changes in the fuelwood supply chain in the focus states as it expands to other states. | | | | | | | | |
| **Management Response** | Agreed but not for immediate action | | | | | | | | |
| **Key Actions** | **Key Actions** | | | | | **Responsible** | **Due Date** | **Status** | **Comments** |
|  | May be considered for future action after the end of this current project. | | | | | Government of Nigeria | 2022 | Pending | Stakeholders’ consultation is needed for the development of SFM Phase 2. It may be considered in the future. This is not within the scope of the present project. |
|  | | | | |  |  |  |  |
| **17.** | | | | | | | | | |
| **Recommendation** | **Clean cooking products manufacturers, wholesalers and retailers should be guided on how to diversify their enterprises** in order to create sustainable clean cooking business models. The entrepreneurs could seek to include clean cooking fuels, food and other consumer products in the list of items traded by their enterprises. | | | | | | | | |
| **Management Response** | Agreed. | | | | | | | | |
| **Key Actions** | **Key Actions** | | | | | **Responsible** | **Due Date** | **Status** | **Comments** |
|  | Energy-efficient charcoal production technology is being introduced to the local manufacturers of cookstoves in Nigeria. The project is implementing on-going activities in this area in collaboration with some of the cookstove manufacturers, who are also diversifying their enterprises to include charcoal briquetting. | | | | | PMU, Private investors | January 2020 | On-going | Most charcoal producers have started diversifying into efficient charcoal production. At the same time, cookstove retailers are also retailing charcoal. |