

UNDP Management Response

[Terminal Evaluation of the Project "Strengthening National Systems to Improve Governance and Management of Indigenous Peoples and Local Communities Conserved Areas and Territories"]

Date: JUNE 21, 2019

Prepared by: **SAMSON B. PEDRAGOSA**

Position: Project Manager
Unit/Bureau: Philippine ICCA Project

Cleared by: **RICARDO L. CALDERON**

Position: Assistant Secretary/Director
Unit/Bureau: Biodiversity Management Bureau

Input into and update in ERC:
MARIA THERESA V. ESPINO-YAP

Position: Programme Analyst
Unit/Bureau: Climate Action Programme Team

Evaluation recommendation 1. The ICCAs sustainability plan should be a long-term planning exercise involving a larger constituency, proposing strategic targets, implementation costs and concrete commitments to move the process forward.

Management response:

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
1.1 DENR Conference on Institutionalizing ICCAs	24 April 2019	DENR Regional and Field Offices, Local Responsible Partners (LRPs), and Partner Communities	The PMU organized this conference precisely for the purpose of discussing possibilities and strategies for institutionalizing ICCAs as an effective area-based conservation measure in addition to the existing protected areas estate of the Philippines.	Completed
			This is in light of the fact that this Project is limited	

			<p>in scale and time. There is no guaranty that the DENR, NCIP, and other concerned agencies will approve the draft policy recommendations submitted to them. The project implementation is due for completion in August 2019 and there is no assurance of continuity for the services and activities initiated under this Project.</p> <p>To address these issues, the Project initiated this Conference to pursue local actions that would de facto institutionalize ICCA activities in the DENR Regional and Field Offices.</p> <p>The DENR regional and field personnel, together with their respective partner communities and Local Responsible Partners (LRPs), crafted sustainability plans to continue the partnerships on ICCA and even expand to new</p>	
--	--	--	---	--

			sites and partners.	
Evaluation recommendation 2. Consider a closing event targeted to donors and key governmental agencies to present the sustainability plan and achieve commitments.				
Management response:				
Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
2.1 Third National ICCA Conference	09 – 11 July 2019	Local Responsible Partners, Partner Communities, PMU, CSO partners	<p>As early as 2018, the PMU has already planned to hold the 3rd National ICCA Conference as a culminating activity of the Philippine ICCA Project (PICCAP).</p> <p>This activity was conducted on 09 – 11 July 2019.</p> <p>Key project stakeholders participated in the conference. These include the IP leaders from BUKLURAN; government representatives from NCIP, DENR, and HLURB, NEDA, and DILG; non-government organization partners from PAFID, PEF, NTFP-EP, KEF, CIFP, ANGOC, FPE and Forest Foundation Philippines; congressional</p>	Completed

			<p>staff from the House of Representatives and the Senate; and representatives from the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), among others.</p> <p>They all expressed willingness to support the community's sustainability efforts in various capacities even after the project formally PICCAP formally closes in August 2019.</p> <p>The conference was held at the Pearl Hall of SEAMEO Innotech. It opened with a ribbon cutting ceremony led by UNDP Country Resident Representative Titon Mitra; Commissioner Norberto Navarro of NCIP; DENR-BMB Division Chief Norma Molinyawe; and BUKLURAN President Giovanni Reyes.</p>	
--	--	--	---	--

			<p>The first day of the conference was devoted to presenting the project accomplishments and best practices. There was also a symbolic turnover of the enhanced draft of the Philippine ICCA Bill to the representatives from the Senate and the House of Representatives.</p> <p>The second day of the conference concluded with a donors' forum. It was attended by a number of donor and support agencies and organizations including the PEF, FPE, FFP and the CIFP.</p> <p>The last day of the Conference focused on BUKLURAN's planning activities and steps moving forward based on the results of Days 1 and 2 discussions.</p> <p>Mr. Giovanni Reyes facilitated the discussion on conference</p>	
--	--	--	--	--

			<p>assessment, specifically the identification of opportunities for engagement and ways forward regarding the sustainability of existing ICCA sites and the documentation of other ICCAs.</p> <p>This was followed by the formalization of the Philippine ICCA Working Group; presentation of the Communications and Strategic Plan for the Lobbying and Advocacy of the ICCA Bill, courtesy of Ms. Kate Galido of NTFP-EP; and discussion facilitated by PAFID and BUKLURAN to create mechanisms for the interagency working group for ICCA policies.</p> <p>The three-day conference covered a lot of ground in terms of agenda and objectives.</p>	
--	--	--	---	--

Evaluation recommendation 3. Achieve a political agreement to clarify who will take the lead after the Project ends.

Management response:

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
3.1 9 th Project Board Meeting	11 September 2019	Philippine ICCA Project Board, PMU	During the 9 th Project Board (PB) Meeting on 11 September 2019, the PB has agreed that the NCIP will be taking the lead after the Project. The rest of the partner agencies will just play the supporting roles.	Completed
3.2 Formation of the Philippine ICCA Working Group of Civil Society Organizations (CSOs)	11 July 2019	NTFP – EP, BUKURAN, PAFID, ANGOC, FPE, ALG, KAISAHAN, PMU	<p>In December 2019, the PMU has initiated a series of meetings with its Civil Society partners to explore the possibility of forming a working group that will continue to push for the institutionalization of ICCAs in the Philippines after the closure of the Philippine ICCA project.</p> <p>The formation of the working group was supported by the Forest Foundation of the Philippines (FFP). The group is comprised of representatives from the Asian NGO Coalition (ANGOC),</p>	Completed

			<p>BUKLURAN, PAFID, NTFP-EP, Haribon, Alternative Law Group (ALG), KAISAHAN, Conservation International Philippines Foundation (CIPF), Foundation for the Philippine Environment (FPE), and the Global ICCA Consortium, among others. The group agreed to have Mr. Teddy Baguilat as the Convener, and the NTFP as the Secretariat. Ms. Kate Galido of NTFP-EP was also chosen as coordinator.</p> <p>The Philippine ICCA Working Group was formalized during the 3rd National ICCA Conference where the group presented its Communications and Strategic Plan for the Lobbying and Advocacy of the ICCA Bill and the other related policies, courtesy of Ms. Kate Galido of NTFP-EP.</p>	
--	--	--	--	--

Evaluation recommendation 4. Find opportunities to include in new Project's and donor's budgets resources to keep alive key spaces such as BUKLURAN, Project Board, RIAC.

Management response:

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
4.1 Formation of the Philippine ICCA Working Group of Civil Society Organizations (CSOs)	10 July 2019	NTFP – EP, BUKURAN, PAFID, ANGOC, FPE, ALG, KAISAHAN, PMU	<p>The PMU initiated and organized meetings with CSO partners to explore the possibility of establishing partnerships to continue providing support to BUKLURAN in the advocacy for institutionalizing ICCAs in the Philippines.</p> <p>After a series of meetings, the Philippine ICCA Working Groups of CSOs has been formed to support BUKLURAN. The members of the working group include the Asian NGO Coalition (ANGOC), KAISAHAN, NTFP – EP, ALG, FFP, FPE, PAFID, and BUKLURAN. The Convener of the group is former Rep. Teddy Baguilat, who is also the incumbent President of the Global ICCA Consortium.</p>	Completed

			<p>NTFP-EP has also accepted the challenge of being the lead organization in the advocacy for the Philippine ICCA Bill.</p> <p>The formation of the Philippine ICCA Working Group was reaffirmed on the last day of the 3rd National ICCA Conference on 11 July 2019.</p>	
4.2 DENR Conference on Institutionalizing ICCAs	24 April 2019	DENR Regional and Field Offices, Local Responsible Partners (LRPs), and Partner Communities	Part of the sustainability plans that were crafted during the DENR Conference was the commitment to continue hosting and holding the meetings of the RIACs. The DENR Regional offices has expressed that the RIAC has been instrumental in coordinating the partnerships with indigenous peoples and other agencies.	Completed
4.3 Inter-Agency Working Group on ICCAs (IAWG)	14 February 2019	DENR, BMB, DILG, NEDA, HLURB, DA-BFAR, NCIP, PMU	The initial meeting of the IAWG was conducted on 14 February 2019 when the names of the members and alternate representatives from the partner agencies and organization have finally been completely submitted to the	Completed and signed on September 18, 2019 as DENR Special Order No. 2019 - 677

			<p>BMB and the PMU.</p> <p>The draft SO was immediately prepared to formalize the group. The members agreed to change the name from the Inter-Agency Working Group on the Philippine ICCA Project to the Inter-Agency Working Group on ICCAs. This decision was made to reflect that the working group will not be co-terminus with the Philippine ICCA Project, but would continue to exist as a body to push for the institutionalization of ICCAs in the Philippines.</p>	
--	--	--	--	--

Evaluation recommendation 5. Mainstream the ICCA establishment process (resource inventory, IKSP, mapping and boundary setting, community mapping, documentation, registration), in the line budgets of NCIP and DENR. Look for support from BIOFIN to prepare a business case and provide support for mainstreaming ICCAs in governmental budgets.

Management response:

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
5.1 Training on ICCA Documentation for DENR Personnel	12 – 18 August 2018	DENR, BMB, PMU	<p>This training was conducted on 12 – 18 August 2018.</p> <p>A total of 25 DENR regional and field office personnel were provided</p>	Completed

			<p>with the skills to properly conduct an effective and culturally sensitive ICCA mapping and documentation.</p> <p>They were trained on the various PRA tools and methodologies that could be useful and appropriate for community profiling and a comprehensive discussion of the history, practice and ethics of community-based participatory mapping. These include the whole cycle of a community mapping exercise and technical inputs on the proper data input and lay-out of maps, resources inventory, and IKSP documentation.</p> <p>The objective of the training is to enable the DENR personnel to respond should there be any requests from IP communities for the documentation and mapping of their ICCAs.</p>	
--	--	--	---	--

<p>5.2 Training on ICCA Documentation for NCIP Personnel</p>	<p>01 – 06 September 2018</p>	<p>NCIP, PAFID, PMU</p>	<p>This training was conducted on 01 – 06 September 2018.</p> <p>A total of 22 NCIP regional and field office personnel were provided with the skills to properly conduct an effective and culturally sensitive ICCA mapping and documentation.</p> <p>They were trained on the various PRA tools and methodologies that could be useful and appropriate for community profiling and a comprehensive discussion of the history, practice and ethics of community-based participatory mapping. These include the whole cycle of a community mapping exercise and technical inputs on the proper data input and lay-out of maps, resources inventory, and IKSP documentation.</p> <p>The objective of the training is to enable the NCIP personnel to respond should there be any requests from IP</p>	
--	-------------------------------	-------------------------	--	--

			communities for the documentation and mapping of their ICCAs.	
Evaluation recommendation 6. There is a need to achieve an inter-institutional commitment to take the lead after the Project is over, to follow up on key decision-making processes such as the ICCAs Bill, ADSDPP guidelines, ICCAs Registry.				
Management response:				
Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
6.1 Formation of the Philippine ICCA Working Group of Civil Society Organizations (CSOs)	11 July 2019		<p>The PMU initiated and organized meetings with CSO partners to explore the possibility of establishing partnerships to continue providing support to BUKLURAN in the advocacy for institutionalizing ICCAs in the Philippines.</p> <p>The working groups has already begun supporting BUKLURAN. As a matter of fact, ANGOC and PAFID just started a new project with BUKLURAN aimed at enhancing the participation of IP communities under the ENIPAS Act.</p> <p>The working group has taken the lead and has begun working</p>	Completed

<p>6.2 Consultation-Workshop on the Preparation of the Manual of Operations for the Revised ADSDPP Guidelines</p>	<p>06 – 07 June 2019</p>		<p>with legislators at the Senate of the Philippines and House of Representatives for the re-filing of the Philippine ICCA Bill in the 18th Congress.</p> <p>This workshop consultation was conducted at the B Hotel in Quezon City.</p> <p>A total of 30 participants from the NCIP Central and Regional Offices participated in this workshop. They included the Executive Director, Bureau Directors, and Regional Directors.</p> <p>The workshop discussed and drafted the proposed Manual of Operations (MOO) for the NCIP Revised ADSDPP Guidelines.</p> <p>The participants agreed that they will take the lead in making sure that the draft MOO will be submitted and approved by the relevant NCIP authorities.</p> <p>This activity was conducted at the</p>	<p>Completed</p>
<p>6.3 NCIP Validation Workshop on the</p>	<p>16 – 17 July 2019</p>		<p>This activity was conducted at the</p>	<p>Completed</p>

draft Manual of Operations (MOO) of the NCIP Revised ADSDPP Guidelines			<p>Sulo Riviera Hotel to validate the draft MOO.</p> <p>It was attended by at least 18 NCIP personnel who took the challenge of owning and presenting the draft MOO to the relevant authorities in their agency for the approval of the Manual.</p>	
--	--	--	---	--

Evaluation recommendation 7. The different participation spaces such as the Project Board and RIAC should be kept alive and operational to ensure Projects sustainability. This suggest the need to institutionalize these spaces and handle the lead to governmental authorities.

Management response:

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
7.1 DENR Conference on Institutionalizing ICCAs	24 April 2019	DENR Regional and Field Offices, Local Responsible Partners (LRPs), and Partner Communities, BMB, PMU	<p>Comments</p> <p>As part of the sustainability plans crafted during the conference, the DENR has committed to continue hosting the RIAC and sustain the engagement with the partner communities to support the ICCAs. The plans even included expansion sites. These will be part of their regular programs and activities.</p>	Completed

Evaluation recommendation 8. The exit strategy should consider the need for continuous support and follow up to realize the different guidelines, manuals as well as the Bill. Assuming these will be politically approved, there should be a period to generate capacities, teams and institutional structures for supporting implementation.

Management response:

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
8.1 Formation of the Inter-Agency Working Group (IAWG) on ICCAs	18 September 2019	DENR, BMB, PMU	<p>The formation of the IAWG is originally part of the strategy to push for the approval of the draft policies that will be produced under Outcome 1 of the Project.</p> <p>It is composed of representatives from the partner agencies</p>	<p>Completed</p> <p>The DENR issued Special Order 2019 – 677 creating the IAWG on 18 September 2019.</p>
8.2 Formation of the Philippine ICCA Working Group of CSOs	11 July 2019	NTPF – EP, BUKURAN, PAFID, ANGOC, FPE, ALG, KAISAHAN, PMU	<p>The Philippine ICCA Working Group of CSOs has started working with the 18th Congress of the Philippines. The Philippine ICCA Bill has already been re-filed for consideration in the Senate and in the House of Representatives.</p> <p>This working group is also working with the DENR and the NCIP to ensure that IP participation in conservation as manifested in their ICCAs will be</p>	Completed

			given due recognition and support under the ENIPAS Act.		
Evaluation recommendation 9. Engage the Biodiversity Friendly Enterprises Program to explore scaling up and sustainability opportunities for the livelihood initiatives.					
Management response:					
Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)		Tracking	
				Comments	
				Status (initiated, completed or no due date)	
9.1 Evaluation of the livelihood activities implemented under the Philippine ICCA Project	October 2019	PMU, BDFE Group	BMB, Core	This was part of the work plan for 2019. The evaluation was supposed to have been conducted in January 2019 but did not push through. The evaluation is included again in the project closure activities in October 2019. Hopefully the DENR-BMB BDFE Core Group will be available.	Completed
Evaluation recommendation 10. Continue to link the ICCAs to other BMB Projects that facilitates the establishment of Payment for Ecosystems Services (PES) for Projects included in the CCPs. The revenue flows from PES offers opportunities to sustain or expand the conservation and protection of ICCA areas.					
Management response:					
Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)		Tracking	
				Comments	
				Status (initiated, completed or no due date)	
10.1 Formation of the Inter-Agency Working Group (IAWG) on ICCAs	18 September 2019	DENR, BMB, NCIP, HLURB, DILG, NEDA, DA-BFAR, BUKLURAN, PAFID		The formation of the IAWG is primarily for the purpose of creating a forum for discussing all matters related to	Completed. The DENR issued Special Order 2019 – 677 creating the

10.2 Formation of the Philippine ICCA Working Group of CSOs	11 July 2019		ICCAs, including the support for implementing the CCPs and other schemes such as the PES to provide benefits to communities contributing to biodiversity conservation. The Philippine ICCA Working Group of CSO has been working with the partner communities on these and other related advocacies.	IAWG on 18 September 2019. Completed.
Evaluation recommendation 11. Continue M&E of the implementation of the Community Conservation Plans including the priority livelihood Projects supported by the Project or incorporated in the plans/budget of the LGUs or supported by national government agencies, and NGOs/CSOs.				
Management response:				
Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
11.1 Meeting with DENR field offices	05 August 2020	PMU, CENRO, PENRO	The PMU has been meeting with the respective PENRO/CENRO personnel to pursue the collaboration with the partner communities. Among the agreements is for the PMU to provide these agencies with copies of the Community Conservation Plans (CCPs) so they will have a	Completed under the initiative of the DENR-FASPS. The meeting with the concerned Regional offices, BMB and the former Project Management Unit was conducted online on August 5, 2020.

			<p>reference for further support and monitoring the progress of the plans, including the implementation of the livelihood activities.</p> <p>In some project sites, the LRPs have also agreed to continue collaboration with the partner communities and monitor the progress of the livelihood activities. This is true for Magpet (PEF), AGMIHICU (NTFP), Tinglayan (MCCI), and KEF.</p>	
--	--	--	--	--

Evaluation recommendation 12. Avoid last minute execution of livelihood funding in sites where resources were not allocated. Assist the local community in Dipaculao, Aurora to enter into partnership with private sector or NGO partner for the planned livelihood project (coffee production).

Management response:

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
12.1 PMU Meeting with Daluhay	05 June 2019	PMU	<p>Following this recommendation, the PM communicated with DALUHAY that implementation can no longer commence given that the project is in the closing stage.</p> <p>DALUHAY sent a direct petition to</p>	Completed

			<p>UNDP complaining that the PM is not allowing them to implement livelihood activities. It even prepared a petition signed by the DETA chieftains.</p> <p>The PM brought up the matter with the Project Board (PB). The PB advised the PM to negotiate. Hence, this meeting.</p> <p>The PM agreed to have a no-cost extension for DALUHAY until 30 June 2019 to buy them time to implement the livelihood support activities.</p> <p>THE BMB Director approved the no-cost extension.</p>	
--	--	--	--	--

Evaluation recommendation 13. Mobilize PMU to provide hands-on site-based support to ensure quality reporting and delivery in less advanced LRPs.

Management response:

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
13.1 Philippine ICCA Project Site Report Writeshop and Monitoring	20 to 25 May 2019	LRPs, PMU	This activity was conducted with the LRPs in the Mindanao to provide technical assistance to the Local Responsible Partners (LRP).	Completed

			<p>This is in line with the objective of the Project Management Unit (PMU) to help the LRPs meet the required outputs, reports, and other deliverable.</p> <p>The PMU has intensified efforts to make the outputs and deliverable compliant with requirements of the project as indicated in the Terms of References (TOR) of the LRPs. This write shop and technical assistance activity is intended to provide a venue for the LRPs and the PMU to work together on improving the quality of the outputs and reports.</p> <p>As a direct result of this intervention, the LRPs in Mindanao was able to has satisfactorily complied with the requirements of the Project.</p>	
--	--	--	--	--

Evaluation recommendation 14. CCPs would need to be upgraded to become adequate negotiation tools, providing a proper budget for implementation as well a description of the sectors benefitting from the environmental services produced by these territories.

Management response:

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
14.1 Review of the CCPs	30 September 2019	LRP, BMB, PMU	The Project has laid down the minimum requirements and contents of the CCPs. Only those plans that have complied with these requirements are accepted and approved for payment.	Completed

* Status of implementation is tracked electronically in the ERC database.

