

Management response**PIMS 5358: RK Government/UNDP project "Supporting sustainable land management in steppe and semi-arid zones through integrated territorial planning and agro-environmental incentives".**

UNDP Management response template

Terminal evaluation dates: January – April 2021

Prepared: **Zhumabayev Y.Y.**Position: **Project Manager**

Unit/Bureau: UNDP

Position: National Project Director, **Executive Director Analytical Center for Economic Policy in Agricultural sector under the Ministry of Agriculture of RK**

Unit/Bureau: MoA

Approved: **Mukashbekov A.K.**

Input into and update in ERC:

Position:

TE recommendations for the project or issue 1				
<i>Recommendation 1:</i> There have been a number of reports, technical guidance documents, and other publications produced during the project. However, many of the deliverables do not seem to be in final form. The key reports, technical guidelines, and other publications should be finalized, branded, disseminated to relevant stakeholders, and stored on an accessible platform.				
Management response: Accepted: the project has two reports to be finalized and 7 reports to be branded following the UNDP GEF requirement. All these documents are not yet published, and before getting them published, these documents will be finalized appropriately, marked, and branded.				
Key action (-s)	Time frame	Responsible Entities	Tracking*	
			Note	Status
The following publications will be finalized: 1. Training Module- Farm Business Management 2. Report for rehabilitation of salinized soil The following publications will be branded: (1) Report on the restoration of abandoned and saline lands in the Kyzylorda region; (2) No-tillage	May 2021	UNDP CO	-The project couldn't finalize those reports due to additional analytical works required upon the harvesting the	The project has started put a GEF UNDP logo in 7 publications and finalize two publication within 2 weeks.

GEF -UNDP "Agro-Incentive" Project
UNDP Kazakhstan

Terminal Evaluation

guidance book; (3) Minimum Processing Training Module; (4) Technological map of the cultivation of winter wheat with minimum tillage; (5) Green fertilizers and their application in cultivation of spring wheat; (6) Methodical recommendations for pasture farming and fodder production for a farm; (7) Training module: Organic Agriculture.			crops in the project supported demonstration plots in Kyzylorda region.	
TE recommendations for the project or issue 2.				
Recommendation 2: The records of equipment purchased and facilities constructed as part of the pilot activities should be documented in more detail, including the amount financed through the GEF project funds, co-financing contributions, and funding from other projects. The documentation should include signed asset transfer records.				
Management response: Accepted: The project has been strictly following the UNDP's rules and regulations to transfer the assets to the partners or beneficiaries following full support and the decision of the PBM.				
Key action (-s)	Time frame	Responsible Entities	Tracking*	
			Note	Status
The project has got clearance for transferring all the project's assets from the PBM and UNDP operations unit following approval from the UNDP RR. The project will transfer all the enlisted assets to the Analytical Center for Economic Policy in the Agricultural sector under the Ministry of Agriculture of RK.	May 2021	UNDP CO	The Analytical Center for Economic Policy in the Agricultural sector under the Ministry of Agriculture has confirmed to take the assets within a week.	The UNDP RR approved the transfer of the asset document.
TE recommendations for the project or issue 3.				
Recommendation 3: Several different types of agro-environmental incentives were demonstrated during the project and are available through various governmental programmes. An information sheet should be prepared and disseminated, specifically oriented towards small and medium size farmers, that provides details of available agro-environmental incentives.				
Management response: Accepted: The project will prepare 22 best practices following agro-environmental incentives demonstrated in 9 targeted demonstration plots during the project and disseminate them towards small and medium-size farmers that provide details of available agro-environmental incentives.				
Key action (-s)	Time frame	Responsible Entities	Tracking*	
			Note	Status

GEF -UNDP "Agro-Incentive" Project
UNDP Kazakhstan

Terminal Evaluation

Disseminate 22 best practices on agro-environmental incentives to 12 Agricultural extension centers to broadcast it to the SMEs.	May 2021	UNDP CO	The matrix is prepared	All 12 extension centers are pre-informed and ready to disseminate once the project shares the matrix.
--	----------	---------	------------------------	--

TE recommendations for the project or issue 4.

Recommendation 4: Pilot models implemented by the project should be documented and published (each separately) in open sources of information. The publication should include descriptions of the technologies introduced, their economic characteristics (payback period, etc.), as well as energy and resource efficiency potential. Documenting and disseminating the experiences and lessons from the pilots would increase the replication potential.

Management response: Accepted: The results generated from those pilot models, including descriptions of the technologies introduced, their economic characteristics (payback period, etc.) are already documents and will be shared through the following open sources. www.margin.kz; <http://zasuhi.gzi.kz/Default.aspx>; <http://climate.gzi.kz/>

Key action (-s)	Time frame	Responsible Entities	Tracking*	
			Note	Status
The project will prepare information materials on each pilot model and upload them to the above-mentioned open sources.	May 2021	The UNDP CO and partners	All the reports are compiled and made ready for upload.	The IT administrators of the above online platforms are aware and committed to upload all the information within the week.

TE recommendations for the project or issue 5.

Recommendation 5: Local extension offices are the primary source of information for many farmers. Specific training modules on implementation of sustainable land and water management practices and access to agro-environmental incentives should be developed, regularly updated by Ministry of Agriculture entities through partnerships with research and academic institutes.

Management response: Accepted: The UNDP CO will extend its cooperation with 12 targeted extension centers to disseminate documented sustainable land and water management practices and access agro-environmental incentives to all SMEs.

Key action (-s)	Time frame	Responsible Entities	Tracking*	
-----------------	------------	----------------------	-----------	--

GEF -UNDP "Agro-Incentive" Project
UNDP Kazakhstan

Terminal Evaluation

			Note	Status
The CO will disseminate leaflets on sustainable land and water management practices, access agro-environmental incentives to all 12 extension centers.	May 2021	12 extension centers and project agriculture economist		The 12 extension centers are informed and ready to support the initiative once the project shares leaflets.
TE recommendations for the project or issue 6.				
Recommendation 6: The sustainability of the Inter-Agency Working Group is unclear. Formalizing this working group should be considered, for example, operating as multi-stakeholder advisory group for other projects, and serving as the national working group for implementation of the national action program (UNCCD) and the national Land Degradation Neutrality (LDN) Target Setting Programme.				
Management response: Accepted: The MOA leads the working group; the working group consists of the experts from the different research institutes subsidized by the Government of RK through the MOA. Thus, the MOA will run the working group in the future.				
Key action (-s)	Time frame	Responsible Entities	Tracking*	
			Note	Status
Following the latest communication with the MOA, UNDP Staff member will continue to act and provide technical support on behalf of the UNDP. All the official communications with the MOA are mutually agreed upon and consolidated.	May 2021	MoA and UNDP	A formal letter from the MOA to include the UNDP representative in the working group is received.	- A formal response letter from the UNDP is signed and submitted to the MOA with the responsible staff member.
TE recommendations for the project or issue 7.				
Recommendation 7: There is a need for strengthening flow and access of information for qualified small and medium size farmers to be linked up with opportunities to participate in green value chains. The feasibility of expanding the existing Margin.kz platform or developing a separate mechanism should be investigated, and feasible options should be operationalized.				
Management response: Accepted: the UNDP CO will strengthen the flow and access of information for qualified small and medium-size farmers through any other interlinked national projects connected with green value chains and management.				
Key action (-s)	Time frame	Responsible Entities	Tracking*	
			Note	Status
The UNDP CO will pass over the project's analytical information and materials to Margin. kz to strengthen further flow and access of information	May 2021	Margin. kz and UNDP	The administration of the Margin. kz is aware of the	The UNDP CO is preparing a list of analytical

GEF -UNDP "Agro-Incentive" Project

UNDP Kazakhstan

Terminal Evaluation

for qualified small and medium-size farmers to be linked with opportunities to participate in green value chains.			anticipated assessment and agreed to provide all necessary support to the project to ensure its sustainability for the long run.	documents to share with margin.kz platform.
TE recommendations for the project or issue 8.				
Recommendation 8: The statistics maintained by the MoA do not provide information on incentive mechanisms that promote sustainable land management, and there are no available statistics on differentiating small and medium-size farmers from large farmers who receive incentives. Understanding the significant differences in farm size and structure across Kazakhstan, it would still be advisable to provide more information breakdowns of delivered incentives, e.g., possibly on a regional basis.				
Management response: Accepted: The UNDP CO will further work with the MOA to enhance its statistic and information delivery methods to clear out small and medium-size farmers from large farmers who receive incentives and detail the figures on agro incentives.				
Key action (-s)	Time frame	Responsible Entities	Tracking*	
			Note	Status
The UNDP CO will present at the next meeting of the MOA's working group new methods of data collection and statistics to clear out small and medium-size farmers from large farmers who receive incentives and detail the figures on agro incentives.	May 2021	MoA and UNDP	The UNDP has requested the MOA to give a time slot for the UNDP's presentation in the next meeting of the MOA's working group.	The UNDP CO is preparing a presentation with its recommendation to improve statistics and information delivery methods on agro incentives .
TE recommendations for the project or issue 9.				
Recommendation 9: The capacities of the Kazhydromet and the Center for Space Research should be further utilized and developed in creating tools for identifying and monitoring LDN hotspots in the country, e.g., using Normalized Difference Vegetation Index (NDVI) imagery tools or similar.				
Management response: Accepted: The UNDP CO will be further coordinating and networking the Kazhydromet and the Center for Space Research with the NOAA, Eyes of Earth US-based leading companies to identifying and monitoring LDN hotspots in the country, e.g., using Normalized Difference Vegetation Index (NDVI) imagery tools or similar.				

GEF -UNDP "Agro-Incentive" Project
UNDP Kazakhstan

Terminal Evaluation

Key action (-s)	Time frame	Responsible Entities	Tracking*	
			Note	Status
The UNDP CO is in touch with Eyes on Earth and NOAA to share bridge the Kazhydromet and the Center for Space Research.	May 2021	Space Research Institute, Kazhydromet, and UNDP	Contacts are received focal points from Kazhydromet, and the Center for Space Research is yet to be determined	The request is sent to Kazhydromet and the Center for Space Research to provide their focal points.
TE recommendations for the project or issue 10.				
<i>Recommendation 10:</i> Consistent with the 2018 national LDN Target Setting Programme, the identified LDN hotspots should be integrated into national land use planning and provide scientific-based guidance for prioritizing funding allocation for implementing sustainable land management interventions.				
Management response: Accepted: All the updated LDN targets are already well defined. The UNDP CO will cooperate with the MOA and the Forestry Committee, and Wildlife to include those LDN targets into the national NAP and report to UNCCD.				
Key action (-s)	Time frame	Responsible Entities	Tracking*	
			Note	Status
The UNDP CO will share the updated LDN targets to the MOA and the Forestry Committee, and Wildlife	3 weeks	MOA and the Forestry Committee, and Wildlife		The LDN is being updated