1. Recommendation:

In general, the Project needs ***to plan a better-focused final phase*** ***to ensure the sustainability*** of its main interventions. In this regard, all systems and standards established are in need for continuous monitoring, further expansion as needed (scope, territory), and more in-depth, on-the-job assistance to ensure their overall execution, functionality and sustainability.

**Management Response:**[Added: 2019/09/04]

This is a valid recommendation. STAR 2 has worked out to develop a series of tools, products and methodologies necessary for enhancement of capacities at local level, improvement of services and consolidation of local governance and democracy, i.e. adopting of Standard Operating Procedures (SOP), development of Local Revenue Action Plans, One Stop Shop Information System (OSSIS), assessment and reorganization of public services, benchmarking, participatory development of Transparency Plans, etc. However, due to a prolonged inception phase that caused implementation delays, delivery of some of the aforementioned products coincides with the project completion, and not enough time is dedicated to ensuring their proper internalizing, functionality and sustainability.

**Key Actions:**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Key Action** | **Responsible** | **DueDate** | **Status** | **Comments** | **Documents** |
| Organize a workshop to wrap up all best practices and experiences established. Make use of PR and communication means to ensure information and knowledge sharing. *[Added: 2019/09/04]* | UNDP CO Management | 2019/12 | Not completed | Due to the situation created by the November 2019 earthquake, and the later Covid related measures, the action was adopted towards the dissemination of instruments and best practices to all 61 municipalities directly, as a full package. |  |
| For the ongoing activities, design a detailed plan to parallel support their implementation by offering on-the-job assistance until project closure. *[Added: 2019/09/04] [Last Updated: 2021/08/24]* | UNDP CO Management | 2019/12 | Completed | Completed as per plan. [History](https://erc.undp.org/evaluation/managementresponses/detail/9080) |  |

2. Recommendation:

In case of ***future support***, the Project needs to ***focus on the few key components*** with an entire national coverage and introduce more lobbying at central government level for structural / legislative changes affecting LGUs. Also, the Project should intensify efforts to strengthen capacities of central level institutions in charge of LG, (ASLG) to take the ownership of LG national systems and standards.

**Management Response:**[Added: 2019/09/04]

STAR 2 has been a very complex project, applying a multi-dimensional approach and designed to introduce and implement innovative approaches. Although STAR 2 has been successful in improvement of service delivery modernization, institutional and capacity development for municipal administrations, and promoting civic participation, the need is still to continue the support for deepening, expanding and sustaining the developed models and practices for a more efficient local governance. The next phase of STAR2 will provide due care to some of the unfinished activities and focus on few components that ensure national coverage and scaling up, such as OSSIS, benchmarking and standardization of public services and further consolidation of local democracy through participatory and integrity practices. The new project will be developed following a participatory approach and will be actively consulted with both local and central governments and agencies, partners, donors, ongoing projects, and CSOs active in this field.

**Key Actions:**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Key Action** | **Responsible** | **DueDate** | **Status** | **Comments** | **Documents** |
| Develop a project proposal that will deepen, expand and sustain the key processes started during STAR 2, aiming to ensure effective and efficient institutional capacities, systems and processes for local government. *[Added: 2019/09/04]* | UNDP CO Management MoI | 2019/12 | Completed | UNDP is implementing STAR3 – Sustaining and Advancing Local Governance Reform. |  |

3. Recommendation:

The Project needs to further incorporate gender perspective in all project interventions in order to contribute to women’s empowerment. Gender perspective should be considered in the following dimensions: representation and involvement within the administration, incorporation of women and vulnerable groups in LG service delivery and standards, public engagement and participation, as well as in data gatherings and statistics.

**Management Response:**[Added: 2019/09/04]

Relevance of this recommendation is recognized. Although for STAR 2 it has been important to achieve equal opportunities for women and men in public life and governance, especially regarding the female participation in capacity building activities, there is still need and opportunities to extend assistance to more gender mainstreaming in planning, public engagement aiming equality and women empowerment.

**Key Actions:**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Key Action** | **Responsible** | **DueDate** | **Status** | **Comments** | **Documents** |
| Ensure gender mainstreaming in the ongoing processes as the piloting of integrity planning processes; roll out of OSSIS in the remaining municipalities; benchmarking system as well as the LG Mapping process. *[Added: 2019/09/04]* | UNDP CO Management | 2019/12 | Completed | Completed as planned. |  |
| Mainstream gender since the initial phase of new project concept, ensuring equal opportunities for capacity building through on-line access to capacity building resources, as well as conceptualizing activities facilitating participation of vulnerable groups and women in local decision-making. *[Added: 2019/09/04]* | UNDP CO Management | 2020/12 | Completed | Gender mainstreaming is integral to STAR3, as is the inclusion of vulnerable groups. A section of the pro doc is dedicated to that gender mainstreaming. Considerations on gender mainstreaming and inclusion of vulnerable groups are part of any ToRs developed. |  |

4. Recommendation:

The Project needs to continue to ***enhance collaboration with key stakeholders and partners***. ASPA in cooperation with MoI/ASLG might be a close collaborator to identify LG administration training needs in order to design and deliver the capacity building assistance.  Also, ASPA might be a close collaborator in order to design and deliver the orientation course to the Mayors without prior experience. The Project needs to keep coordination and consultation with public institutions to ensure sustainability by applying integrated approaches: ASPA, DoPA, ADISA and others affecting LG.

**Management Response:**[Added: 2019/09/04]

Relevance of recommendation to enhance coordination and collaboration with key stakeholders and partners is acknowledged. STAR2 project, reflecting STAR1 recommendations, has intensified and structured cooperation and collaboration with main stakeholders and partners that play a role in local governance.  Following this experience, the new project concept is developed in close consultations with the key national institutions in charge of local government, i.e., the Ministry of Interior and the Agency of Support for Local Government, and in complementarity with the ongoing assistance provided by other development partners.  Public agencies such as ASPA, DoPA, Associations of Municipalities will be involved not only during project development phase, but also in implementing activities together, exploring innovative ways of knowledge transfer and sustaining developed systems at these institutions

**Key Actions:**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Key Action** | **Responsible** | **DueDate** | **Status** | **Comments** | **Documents** |
| Clear roles and responsibilities of ASPA, ASLG, Associations of Municipalities are well defined in the new project *[Added: 2019/09/04]* | UNDP CO management | 2020/12 | Completed. | All partners are duly identified in STAR3 project document, as are roles and responsibilities. |  |

5. Recommendation:

The Project needs to continue ***investing in*** ***institutional development and capacity building of human resources at LG***. In this regard, it is necessary to systemize and standardize sustainable training programs for municipal staff, and to strategize and invest in motivating, cultivating, and sustaining human resources - especially for small and medium-sized municipalities. It is recommended to maximize and share best experiences (Standard Operating Procedures) and follow up on challenges identified during STAR 2. This will be a good way to identify progress and replicate best practice (peer to peer exchange, twining, internship) and continue to learn from each other.

**Management Response:**[Added: 2019/09/04]

Institutional development and capacity building will continue to be supported beyond finalization of STAR 2 project. The new STAR3 project will build upon successful experience and created models and extend to new themes and institutions. Different from STAR 2, an integrated and structured approach will be followed, addressing both individual and institutional needs. ASPA will be an actor and factor in this process.

**Key Actions:**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Key Action** | **Responsible** | **DueDate** | **Status** | **Comments** | **Documents** |
| Development of a tailored curricula including e-learning platform on local government matters, promoting the dissemination and development among different levels of local government officials. *[Added: 2019/09/04]* | UNDP CO Management | 2020/12 | Not applicable | Interaction and discussions with project partners and beneficiaries, led to not including a line of work with ASPA.  Furthermore, upon completion of STAR2 a full package of best practices, SOPs, and other relevant documents were delivered to all 61 municipalities. |  |

6. Recommendation:

The Project needs ***to continue consolidating “One Stop Shop” model*** of service provision in all municipalities, including the administrative units.  OSS model of service provision should be functional in all municipalities and should be extended to all administrative units. There is a need to identify the required resources, best method and adequate infrastructure for effective service delivery. Digitalization of services is needed in order to increase the efficiency, quality and coverage of services. Continuous cooperation with ADISA is also highly suggested.

**Management Response:**[Added: 2019/09/04]

Development and deployment of OSSIS in 49 municipalities has been one of the major activities of STAR 2.  The rollout started in 2018 and will be concluded by the end of 2019, an implementation timeline which is extremely tight, conditioned by various circumstances, especially the lack of local infrastructure. Considering this activity as of significant importance for improvement of administrative service delivery at local level, advancing support to ensure functional OSSIS in all administrative units is foreseen under the new project (STAR 3), including equipment with the necessary infrastructure. Consolidating the cooperation with National Agency for Information Society (NAIS) in its capacity of national ownership of IT databases and with ADISA, already initiated under STAR2, will be a priority throughout the intervention.

**Key Actions:**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Key Action** | **Responsible** | **DueDate** | **Status** | **Comments** | **Documents** |
| Prepare and implement a roll out plan of OSSIS deployment in all administrative units. *[Added: 2019/09/04]* | UNDP CO Management | 2019/12 | Completed | Included in STAR3. OSSIS deployment in AUs is an ongoing process. |  |
| Action plan for integration of local OSSIS with other central government delivery service platform led by ADISA and in cooperation with NAIS is prepared as part of new project *[Added: 2019/09/04]* | UNDP CO Management | 2020/12 | Completed | Included in STAR3. Cooperation with ADISA continues. |  |

7. Recommendation:

The Project needs to continue ***finalize and consolidate the “Benchmarking system” initiative***.  The Benchmarking system must be used to create a platform based on integrated indicators that will be used to contrast and compare standards within and among municipalities, as well as monitor and evaluate the service delivery process and overall municipality performance for municipality employees, citizens and partners.

**Management Response:**[Added: 2019/09/04]

This is a valid recommendation and corresponds with the commitment of the Ministry of Interior to advance decentralization process based on evidence of performance, During STAR 2, a thorough assessment of the municipal performance measurement systems is undertaken, through consultation with various stakeholders, but especially with senior level executives at the Ministry of Interior and Agency for Support Self-Local Governance about development of future approaches for performance measurement at local level. The information gathered is crucial to develop the performance indicators and the measurement system.

**Key Actions:**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Key Action** | **Responsible** | **DueDate** | **Status** | **Comments** | **Documents** |
| Following the identification of performance indicators, a platform will be developed within the current phase of the project including initial capacity building of municipal staff. *[Added: 2019/09/04]* | UNDP CO Management | 2019/12 | Completed. | An integrated outline and a set of data and performance indicators for local government designed. The Project contributed building consensus among stakeholders for an integrated system that benefits and can be used by all. Part of the approach, were technical consultations, which focused on standardizing and ensuring data quality, collaboration in developing the system and in field work and the creation of various interfaces as per stakeholders’ perspectives, where the Project has developed the content and indicators for the Ministry of Interior. |  |
| The platform and capacities on municipalities to manage their performance will be further consolidated in the subsequent phase of the project *[Added: 2019/09/04]* | UNDP CO Management | 2020/12 | Completed | The new project directed its efforts towards attempting to shape and expand the IPSIS system at the local level will be made along with the support provided for designing and establishing an integrated system of local government performance, of benefit to both local and central governments, accompanied by capacity building for using the system. |  |

8. Recommendation:

The Project needs to continue building capacities ***to strengthen local democracy***. It is recommended to contribute to the further consolidation of democratic governance practices at local level including transparency and openness, public engagement and consultation in local decision-making and most importantly the expansion of anti-corruption instruments such as integrity plans and codes of conducts.

**Management Response:**[Added: 2019/09/04]

Carrying forward the work regarding improvement and consolidation of local governance practices initiated by STAR2 (transparency, public consultation and engagement, integrity and fight against corruption), the new project will focus on implementation of effective processes of planning and running public consultations and expanding integrity and anticorruption measures to majority of municipalities.

**Key Actions:**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Key Action** | **Responsible** | **DueDate** | **Status** | **Comments** | **Documents** |
| Design an integrated package of activities improving local democracy through consolidation of participatory decision-making practices and expansion and monitoring of integrity instruments. *[Added: 2019/09/04]* | UNDP CO Management | 2020/12 | Completed | Included in STAR3 pro doc. |  |