**UNDP MANAGEMENT RESPONSE FOR Review of**

**“Strengthened Disaster Risk Management in Papua New Guinea” Project**

**January 2019**

Prepared by: Gwen Maru Position: Programme Analyst (Environment) Unit/Bureau: RBAP/PNG//ECCDRM

Reviewed by: Khusrav Sharifov Position: Technical Specialist, DRM Project Unit/Bureau: RBAP/PNG/DRM

Cleared by: Edward Vrkic Position: Senior Climate Change Advisor Unit/Bureau: RBAP/PNG/ECCDRM

Input into and update in ERC: Momenat Al-Khateeb Position: Programme Specialist Unit/Bureau: RBAP/PNG/Management

**Overall comments:**

The “Strengthening Disaster Risk Management in PNG” was initiated in 2015 as a three-year project with a budget of USD$3,450,000. It was designed to be implemented by UNDP (United Nations Development Programme) in collaboration with the National Disaster Centre (NDC) and provincial government structures. Five provinces were selected for piloting disaster risk management (DRM) interventions including capacity building at the provincial level: Autonomous Region of Bougainville (ARoB), Central Province, Madang, Simbu and Western Highlands.

The outcome of the project is defined as: *Government and civil society at national and provincial level contribute to the reduced vulnerability of women, girls, men and boys to disaster risk.”* Four outputs contribute to this which can be summarized as (a) DRM capacity development (b) DRM mainstreaming (c) Support for early recovery and (d) Humanitarian coordination.

Due to delays caused by a number of major disasters (including El Nino induced draught of 2015-2016 and Highlands Earthquake of 2018) a no-cost extension was granted until December 2018. This was followed by another extension to 30 June 2019 to allow NDC and the project team to finalize deliverables under Phase I.

In September 2018, a review was commissioned by DFAT to assess progress of project implementation and develop recommendations as a way forward. The findings of the review are based on a review of project documentation, discussions with key stakeholders in Port Moresby and field work in four provinces.

**Overall comments:**

The “Strengthening Disaster Risk Management in PNG” was initiated in 2015 as a three-year project with a budget of USD$3,450,000. It was designed to be implemented by UNDP (United Nations Development Programme) in collaboration with the National Disaster Centre (NDC) and provincial government structures. Five provinces were selected for piloting disaster risk management (DRM) interventions including capacity building at the provincial level: Autonomous Region of Bougainville (ARoB), Central Province, Madang, Simbu and Western Highlands.

The outcome of the project is defined as: *Government and civil society at national and provincial level contribute to the reduced vulnerability of women, girls, men and boys to disaster risk.”* Four outputs contribute to this which can be summarized as (a) DRM capacity development (b) DRM mainstreaming (c) Support for early recovery and (d) Humanitarian coordination.

Due to delays caused by a number of major disasters (including El Nino induced draught of 2015-2016 and Highlands Earthquake of 2018) a no-cost extension was granted until December 2018. This was followed by another extension to 30 June 2019 to allow NDC and the project team to finalize deliverables under Phase I.

In September 2018, a review was commissioned by DFAT to assess progress of project implementation and develop recommendations as a way forward. The findings of the review are based on a review of project documentation, discussions with key stakeholders in Port Moresby and field work in four provinces.

|  |
| --- |
| **Evaluation Recommendation 1:** *The value of National Disaster Risk Reduction Framework will only be realized through practical implementation. The project should support the development of an action plan to prioritise and implement the commitments made in the framework.* |
| **Management Response: Agree.** This task is already incorporated in the Annual Work Plan (AWP) of the DRM Project for Jan-Jun 2019.  |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 1.1. Assist NDC prepare an Action Plan for the implementation of the National Disaster Risk Reduction Framework  | January – 30 Sep 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction | Ongoing | Draft Action Plan expected by 30 Sep |
| 1.2 Track development and implementation of the NDRRF Action Plan | July 2019- December 2022 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction | On-going | As part of DRM Phase II |
| **Review Recommendation 2: The project should assist NDC to prepare a monitoring and reporting plan for the framework.**  |
| **Management Response: Agree.** **This task is already incorporated in the Annual Work Plan (AWP) of the DRM Project for Jan-Jun 2019.** |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 2.1 Development of Sendai Framework Monitor and NDRRF Online tool to monitor and report on progress against the set targets and indicators | January – June 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction | Ongoing  | Included in AWP Jan-Jun 2019 |
| 2.2 Assist NDC to prepare a Monitoring Plan and Reporting Schedule for NDRRF  | January – June 2019 |  Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction | Ongoing | Included in AWP Jan-Jun 2019 |
| **Review Recommendation 3: Socializing and promoting the NDRRF at the sub-national level, should be a priority for the project. It should also support implementation in provinces in which it is active.** |
| **Management Response: Agree.****The project will support NDC to develop a national action plan for the implementation of NDRRF. Implementation of NDRRF in provinces will be supported during Phase II of the project.**  |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 3.1 Support NDC prepare a Communication and Stakeholder Engagement Strategy NDRRF in PNG | July-Dec 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | On going  | As part of DRM Phase II |
| 3.2. Support pilot provinces to develop their individual Action Plans and support roll out of these Action Plans at the Subnational level | July2019 – Dec 2022 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Ongoing  | As part of DRM Phase II |
| **Review Recommendation 4:** *Project staff should be co-located within the NDC offices, subject to issues with access, power supply etc. being resolved.* |
| **Management Response: Agree.** This task is already incorporated in the Annual Work Plan (AWP) of the DRM Project for Jan-Jun 2019. **Project Management Unit will be relocated to NDC first quarter of 2019.**  |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 4.1 Consultation and Agreement with NDC Senior Management  | January – February 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Completed  |  |
| 4.2 Mobilize office equipment for office space and set-up of PMU at NDC premises | February-March 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Completed |  |
| **Review Recommendation 5:** *The project should advocate more strongly for adequate resourcing for NDC, particularly for a full staffing complement* |
| **Management Response: Agree, UNDP has been advocating to NDC to fill all vacancies. This advocacy has also been undertaken by UNDP at senior levels with NDC host department and the minister responsible.**  |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
|  |  |  | **Status** | **Comments** |
| **5.1 UNDP will continue advocacy**  | **March 2020** | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction | **Ongoing** |
| **Review Recommendation 6:** *Subject to the development of a strategy to maintain it, the Disaster Loss Database should be established in all provinces so that consolidated national level data can be produced.**Potential linkages with other data sources such as the World Food Program’s mobile Vulnerability and Mapping (mVAM) should be explored.* |
| **Management Response: Agree.** The benchmarks (for national and provincial levels) should be developed and agreed with NDC and other key government departments, including Prime Minister’s Department, Finance, Treasury, Planning, as part of the development of proposal for Phase II. Follow up meetings with provinces will be required before Phase II proposal is finalized and agreed. Government at the national level and all provinces will need to provide written commitments to achieve the benchmarks |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 6.1 Finalize ongoing work on establishing database for five pilot provinces and launch the beta version.  | January – August 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Database for five pilot provinces available in advance version | Launch to be agreed with NDC and the relevant minister |
| 6.2 Establish Database Technical Working Group through partnership agreements with key stakeholders for data collection, analysis, reporting, storage and overall management of the database system | January – June 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Working group established and trained.  |  |
| 6.3 Develop and incorporate a simple strategy in Phase II proposal for the expansion of the database to other provinces.  | June-July 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction | Ongoing | Draft proposal expected end of June |
| **Review Recommendation 7:** *The project should work with the Multi Hazard Early Warning Centre to develop an effective early warning system. To do this it must create standard operating procedures for alerting authorities and broadcasters, find methods to formulate simple warnings and advisories and improve their transmission to all parts of the country.* |
| **Management Response: Agree.****Early Warning remains one of the major challenges in PNG. The Multi-Hazard Early Warning Center provides that opportunity. This shall be considered as part of the design process of phase II** |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 7.1 Develop SOPs on alerting authorities and broadcasters to formulate and issue warnings to the public.  | January – December 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Ongoing | To be incorporated into Phase II |
| **Review Recommendation 8:** *The project should review its approach to DRM mainstreaming at national and provincial levels. It must develop more effective strategies in the next phase of the project based not only on its integration into plans and budgets, but on the provision of training to those who must implement them. It must continue to support the implementation of DRM within MTDP III and build on the success of the Rigo district planning process.* |
| **Management Response:** **Agree**.The work done in Rigo District sets a good example to be replicated in other districts and provinces. This work will be incorporated into the proposal for Phase II. |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 8.1 Document lessons from the first phase of the project with way forward for the development of new DRR mainstreaming strategy (as part of the Phase II design process).  | June - July 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Pending | As part of Phase II proposal |
| 8.2 Integrate DRM into Provincial and District development plans, and other Sectoral Plans to attract funding from PSIP and DSIP | July-Dec 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Pending  | To be incorporated into Phase II |
| ***Recommendation 9 (a)****: The MHRA already developed for existing provinces must be updated to address the concerns outlined. This includes better citation of data sources, acknowledging the limitations of the data available and used in the assessments and seeking peer review.* |
| **Management Response: Agree.**This task is already incorporated in the Annual Work Plan (AWP) of the DRM Project for Jan-Jun 2019. |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 9a-1. Conduct Peer Review of the Results of MHRA for 5 Provinces | January – December 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction | Ongoing | Incorporate into Phase II design |
| 9a-.2 Review and Finalize Provincial Risk Assessments to include better citation of data sources, acknowledging the limitations of the data available and used in the assessments | January – July 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction | Ongoing |  |
| ***Recommendation 9 (b)****: On the basis of recommendation 9 (a), the MHRA should be extended to all provinces in PNG to create a national risk assessment data base* |
| **Management Response: Agree.**During Phase I, the project has managed to successful established Multi-Hazard Risk Assessment Methodology and Assessment team, who have been trained to further lead this work. This team should be mobilized to conduct MHRA in other provinces to engrave their skills and knowledge, while at the same time developing a comprehensive/country-wide risk assessment.  |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 9b.1 Incorporate expansion of MHRA to other provinces into the design of Phase II.  | June - July2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Ongoing |  |
| **Review Recommendation 10:** *The project should promote disaster recovery more actively to ensure that it is better integrated into relevant government and DMT processes. This should include advocating for the approval of the frameworks it has produced and the provision of appropriate training and support at national and provincial levels.* |
| **Management Response: Agree.**The project supported design of National Early Recovery Framework and simultaneously guided formulation of two Provincial Recovery Frameworks (ARoB and WHP). The recovery frameworks provide the overarching guidance on key aspects of disaster response and recovery at the national and provincial levels. Approval of the national and provincial recovery plans was incorporated into the Project AWP for Jan-Jun 2019. |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 10.1 Project to further liaise with NDC to finalize internal review of the National Framework. NEC submission is expected to be developed by NDC for the formal approval of the National Early Recovery Framework by Govt of PNG.  | January –August2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Ongoing |  |
| 10.2 Finalize review and endorsement of Provincial Early Recovery Plans for Western Highlands Province and Autonomous Region of Bougainville  | January – June 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction | Ongoing |  |
| ***Recommendation 11 (a):*** *The Humanitarian Coordination Specialist position should remain as part of an ongoing DRM project* |
| **Management Response: Agree.****The HC Specialist is on board and will remain as part of the DRM project.** |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 11.1 Incorporate the role of the HC Specialist into the design of Phase II.  | Jun-July 019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Ongoing |  |
| **Review Recommendation 11b:** *The design for the next phase of the project should identify and incorporate measures to reduce the impact of disaster responses on other key aspects of the project. It should be a disaster risk management project – not a humanitarian coordination project* |
| **Management Response: Partially agree.****Major disasters (such as El Nino 2015-2016 and Earthquake of 2018) highlighted the fact that the whole government can shut down and divert all attention to the disaster event. These major disasters also provide an opportunity to test DRM-related tools developed by the project.** **UNDP and NDC will identify measures to reduce the impact of disaster response.** |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 11b-.1 As part of Phase II design process, identify risks related to impact of disasters at the national and subnational level and develop risk management options for the project to consider during the implementation.  | Jun-July 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Ongoing |  |
| **Review Recommendation 12:** *The next phase of the project should focus on provincial capacity development. It should consider the deployment of local staff to each target province and initiate a small projects fund to enable local DRM stakeholders to address their key priorities.* |
| **Management Response: Agree.** **A report on the Assessment of Disaster Risk Management capacities of NDC and the five pilot provinces found a common trend on limited capacity at national and subnational level that has informed UNDP’s dialogue on . partnership with other UN Agencies to address these capacity gaps at the provincial level. As a result of the assessment, a DRM Capacity Development Plan was drafted and shared with NDC for consideration. Implementation of this plan can be incorporated in the next phase of the project** |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 12.1 Review and Finalize DRM Capacity Development Plan based on findings from the capacity assessment report | January – Dec 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Ongoing |  |
| 12.2 Design a joint UNDP/IOM/WFP DRM programme focusing on developing provincial capacities on DRM. | May – Dec 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Ongoing | Draft proposal expected by end of June 2019. |
| **Review Recommendation 13:** *The steering committee should be reconstituted to include only the three key project partners: UNDP, NDC and DFAT. Meetings should be held on a quarterly basis and include discussions of progress and decision making on the basis of up-to-date narrative and financial information. A wider reference group which includes other current members of the steering committee should be formed if there is sufficient interest among these stakeholders****.*** |
| **Management Response: Agree, the steering committee will include UNDP.NDC and DFAT, other groups will be called to join the meetings as needed.** |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 13.1 Formal notification to key members of the project steering committee. | January 2019 |  Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Completed |  |
| **Review Recommendation 14*:*** *Project management should focus on more integrated project planning and better coordination with relevant UN activities during the next phase of the project.* |
| **Management Response: Agree.** **This will be considered during the design of Phase II. UNDP will enhance its coordination and collaboration with other UN Agencies** |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |  |
|  |  |  | **Status** | **Comments** |
| 14.1. Joint programing planned through the design of Phase II between UNDP, IOM and WFP | January – Dec 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Ongoing |  |
| **Review Recommendation 15:** *In collaboration with NDC, the project should strengthen interagency DRM coordination in its next phase and consider the establishment of a coordination platform for agencies engaged in DRM. National and provincial mapping should be included in the design phase as well as a ‘dashboard’ which makes DRM resources (SOPs, training materials, planning formats, lessons learned) available. The project should consider the appointment of a specific position to support this work.* |
| **Management Response: Agree.** **Collaboration and coordination between various stakeholders is important to avoid overlap, support each other and identify synergies at the national and sub-national levels.**  |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |  |
|  |  |  | **Status** |  |
| 15.1 Consultation with NDC and DMT members on best way forward to further enhance coordination of DRM in PNG. Incorporate findings and recommendations into Phase II proposal.  | July-Sep 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Ongoing |  |
| **Review Recommendation 16:** *The next phase of the project should make clear its expectations of government at a national and provincial level, with the active support of its key stakeholders. The project should establish benchmarks for provincial support for DRM. Where this commitment is lacking it should consider withdrawing from the province.* |
| **Management Response: Agree.** The benchmarks (for national and provincial levels) should be developed and agreed with NDC and other key government departments, including Prime Minister’s Department, Finance, Treasury, Planning, as part of the development of proposal for Phase II. Follow up meetings with provinces will be required before Phase II proposal is finalized and agreed. Government at the national level and all provinces will need to provide written commitments to achieve the benchmarks.  |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |  |
|  |  |  | **Status** | **Comments** |
| 16.1 Identify benchmarks at the national and provincial level as part of the Phase II development process.  | June-Dec 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Ongoing |  |
| 16.2 Seek written agreement from relevant government departments at the national level and provincial administrations on the agreed benchmarks.  | January – June 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Ongoing |  |
| **Review Recommendation 17:** *The project should not consider expansion to other provinces at this stage. Benchmarks for a successful provincial DRM model should be established and expansion considered when these have been attained in one or more provinces.* |
| **Management Response: Agree.** **While UNDP’s focus areas at the sub-national level will remain in the five pilot provinces, under the joint UN DRM Program, IOM and WFP have wider operating footprint in PNG. This matter will need to be addressed during the design of Phase II.**  |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 17.1 Benchmarks for the successful provincial DRM model to be developed and incorporated into design of Phase II.  | June – July 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Ongoing |  |
| **Review Recommendation 18:** *The project should strengthen its engagement with the private sector. Support from telecommunications and media companies in the transmission of disaster warnings is the most important need – but provision of geological and meteorological data and building relations with Chambers of Commerce should also be considered.* |
| **Management Response: Agree,** **A number of consultations have been carried out with Connecting Businesses Initiative, and a preliminary agreement has been achieved to include PNG as one of the program countries for PNG. More efforts will be required to identify lessons learned from recent El Nino and Earthquake on the role of the private sector and how this can further be supported under Phase II.**  |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 18 Stakeholder Engagement Plan will integrate options for communication and coordination with private sector  | January – Dec 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction | Ongoing | To be further incorporated into Phase II |
| **Review Recommendation 19:** *Gender equity should be a strong focus of the project. A gender specialist should contribute to the design of the next phase of the project and gender training should be provided to staff and partners. If a reference group is set up (see Recommendation 1) UN Women should be invited to participate. More active support for people with disability should also be prioritised.* |
| **Management Response: Agree.****The Gender Equity will be improved across different focused area in phase II.**  |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 19.1 Gender Mainstreaming Workshop/Training conducted with recommendations and way forward for mainstreaming gender across the project activities. These details will be considered during Phase II design.  | Jun-July 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Ongoing |  |
| ***Recommendation 20 (a):*** *The next phase of the project requires a more rigorous design process and document to guide the project and to which it can be held accountable. A theory of change/change model will support better understanding of the project. The process will require support and resourcing from UNDP and DFAT.* |
| **Management Response: Agree.****These recommendations are being considered during the design of Phase II.**  |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 20.1 A **rigorous design will be ensured during the phase II formulation process.** | January – June 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Ongoing |  |
| ***Recommendation 20 (b):*** *A Monitoring and Evaluation specialist should be assigned to the project to support the design process, to document project progress and capture and share lessons learned.* |
| **Management Response: Agree.****UNDP has put in place mechanisms to improve monitoring, evaluation and reporting on its projects’ performance.**  |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 20.1 A project monitoring and evaluation framework will be formulation as part of the project document | June – July 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Ongoing |  |
| 20.2 Annual monitoring schedules will be development  | January – June 2019 | Environment, Climate Change and Disaster Risk Reduction  | Ongoing |  |