**Mid Term Review Management Response**

**Project Title: Enhancing conservation of globally significant biodiversity through protected area system strengthening in Gansu (China-Protected Areas System Reform – C-PAR 2)**

UNDP PIMS ID: 5689

GEF ID: 9465

MTR Completion Date: November 17, 2021

**Date of Issue of Management Response: 23 Dec. 2021**

Prepared by: Ma Yan Position: Project Manager Unit/Bureau: PMO

Contributors: Fan Longqing Position: CTA Unit/Bureau: Project Management Office

Cleared by: Ma Chaode Position: Programme Director Unit/Bureau: UNDP CO

Bipin Pokharel Position: RTA Unit/Bureau: BRH

Input into and update in ERC: Position: Unit/Bureau:

**Overall comments:**

The project is rated as ‘Satisfactory’ through the Mid Term Review (MTR). The MTR team’s affirmation of Gansu project is much appreciated.

We agree with the conclusions of the MTR Report. This is a very objective and clearly thought-out report. For the affirmative part, the project team will continue to maintain and strive to improve. For problems and suggestions, the project team will carefully analyze, check for omissions, optimize the plan, and improve in time.

The project team look forward to our improvement proposals being approved by the Project Steering Committee and the Regional Technical Advisor. More importantly is the second half of the project, together with stakeholders, the project will not only be able to achieve the end-of-project target, but also will achieve better execution effect, and its impact will be sustainable.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Evaluation Recommendation 1:**  **Finalize the Environmental and Social Risk Assessment (ESIA), Environmental and Social Management Plan (ESMP) and Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM) as a matter of urgency, while ensuring that SES requirements for disclosure are adhered to** | | | | |
| **Management Response[[1]](#footnote-2):** Fully Accept | | | | |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Timeframe (Y.M.D)** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking [[2]](#footnote-3)** | |
| **Status[[3]](#footnote-4)** | **Comments** |
| 1.1 Modify and improve the Chinese version of the ESMP of C-PAR2 in accordance with the comments from the international consultant and UNDP | 2021.11. -2022.03(Estimated) | UNDP/CPAR1/PMO | Initiated |  |
| 1.2 Organize ESMP training on stakeholders of the C-PAR2 | 2022.01-08 (Estimated) | PMO/Demo. sites | Not initiated |  |
| 1.3 Include the implementation of the ESMP into the annual work plan of C-PAR2 | 2022.01-03(Estimated) | PMO | Not initiated |  |
| 1.4 Issue the C-PAR2 ESMP to PMUs through an official document to guide and supervise the long-term implementation of the ESMP in each project site | 2022.01-2024.01(Estimated) | PMO/ Demo. sites | Not initiated |  |
| 1.5 Monitor the progress of the ESMP annually and update accordingly | 2022.12-2024.1 (Estimated) | PMO | Not initiated |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation 2:**  **When the ESMP is finalized, review all project outputs and activities (including those completed, underway and future) against the ESMP to ensure risks are appropriately managed, make any necessary changes to the design of activities and identify any required remedial actions, and have the findings endorsed by the PSC and RTA** | | | | |
| **Management Response:** Fully Accept | | | | |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Timeframe (Y.M.D)** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking** | |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 2.1 Sort out the annual work plan from 2019 to 2021 and divide project activities into three categories: completed, ongoing and future | 2022.01-03(Estimated) | PMO | Not initiated |  |
| 2.2 Communicate with the social inclusion consultant (national) and identify the plans and reports requiring modification in accordance with the finalized ESMP | 2022.01-03(Estimated) | PMO | Not initiated |  |
| 2.3 Submit the list of plans and reports that need to be modified to the PSC and RTA for approval, if needed | 2022.01-12 (Estimated) | PMO/PSC/RTA | Not initiated |  |
| 2.4 Integrate the ESMP into the workplans and report | 2022.03-2023.12 (Estimated) | PMO/ Demo. Sites /Subcontractors/Consultants | Not initiated |  |
| 2.5 Report on the implementation of the ESMP on the annual PSC meeting | 2022.12-2024.01(Estimated) | PMO/PSC | Not initiated |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation 3: (to be answered by UNDP)**  **Provide enhanced technical oversight and support, including targeted capacity building, to UNDP Country Office and other stakeholders for the complex processes involved in managing high-risk safeguards projects** | | | | |
| **Management Response: fully accepted** | | | | |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Timeframe (Y.M.D)** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking** | |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 3.1 UNDP CO will appoint focal point for safeguard issues to ensure the full compliance with SES standards and procedures. | 2021.11 – 2022.02 | UNDP CO | Initiated |  |
| 3.2 UNDP Regional Office will enhance capacity building of CO and strengthen the technical oversight on safeguard compliance/ensurance | 2021.11-2023.12 | UNDP Regional Office | Initiated |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation 4: (to be answered by UNDP & GFGB)**  **Review the processes followed in environmental and social risk management in this project since CEO endorsement, identify lessons learned and opportunities to improve safeguards outcomes in future projects** | | | | |
| **Management Response[[4]](#footnote-5): fully accepted** | | | | |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Timeframe (Y.M.D)** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking [[5]](#footnote-6)** | |
| **Status[[6]](#footnote-7)** | **Comments** |
| 4.1 the lessons learned will be analyzed and included in the safeguard specialist report and project implementation report as important reference for other/future projects | 2022.01-2024.01 | UNDP CO, PMO, Safeguard Specialist | Not initiated |  |
| 4.2 Both UNDP and GFGB will take these lessons learnt into future formulation and implementation actions | 2022.01-2024.01 | UNDP， GFGB | Not initiated |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation 5: (to be answered by C-PAR 1)**  **Coordinate implementation of the recommendations on environmental and social risk management at a C-PAR programmatic level to maximize identification of systemic issues, opportunities for improvement and lessons learned** | | | | |
| **Management Response:** Fully Accept | | | | |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Timeframe (Y.M.D)** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking** | |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 5.1 Follow up with UNDP’s comments to the ESIA and ESMP reports and timely feedback to PMOs for improvement | 2021.11-2022.02 | C-PAR1 | Initiated |  |
| 5.2 Coordinate the international safeguards consultant and PMOs to finalize the ESIA and ESMP to guide the risk management activities of PMOs | 2021.12-2022.03 | C-PAR1 | Initiated |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation 6:**  **Prepare a revised results framework for approval by the PSC and RTA with all baselines and targets reviewed and confirmed and with clarity around how each will be measured and reported** | | | | |
| **Management Response:** Fully Accept | | | | |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Timeframe (Y.M.D)** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking** | |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 6.1 Sort out the indicators in the results framework that requires modification in accordance with the recommendations from the MTR report | 2021.11-2021.12 | PMO | Completed |  |
| 6.2 Analyze the gap in the indicators to be modified to identify the modification direction and content | 2021.11-2021.12 | PMO | Completed |  |
| 6.3 Submit the revised indicators to the PSC and RTA for approval | 2021.11-2022.03 | PMO/PSC/RTA | Initiated |  |
| 6.4 Design project activities in accordance with the approved indicators and complete in the second half of the project and ensure the adjusted activities fully incorporated into the workplans from 2022 | 2022.01-2024.01 | PMO | Not initiated |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation 7:**  **Develop and document a standard transparent process for data collection, analysis and reporting of species and threats and ensure that this is compatible with the methodologies that were used to establish the indicator baselines** | | | | |
| **Management Response[[7]](#footnote-8):** Fully Accept | | | | |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Timeframe (Y.M.D)** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking [[8]](#footnote-9)** | |
| **Status[[9]](#footnote-10)** | **Comments** |
| 7.1 PMO and stakeholders conduct survey to learn about the methodologies and approaches for ‘data collection, analysis and reporting of species and threats’ | 2021.10-11 | PMO/Demo. PAs/ Subcontractors | Completed |  |
| 7.2 In accordance with the comments from stakeholders, identify the methodologies and approaches for ‘data collection, analysis and reporting of species and threats’ | 2021.12-2022.12 | PMO/ Subcontractors | Initiated |  |
| 7.3 Analyze the methodologies that were used to establish the indicator baselines and develop a unified, effective, and compatible methodology for data collection based on current situation | 2022.01-2022.03 | PMO/ Subcontractors | Not initiated |  |
| 7.4 Organize training on survey and data collection regrading species population and threatening factors | 2021.12-2022.12 | PMO/ Subcontractors | Initiated |  |
| 7.5 Establish a procedure and platform to collect, analyze and report on species and threats data and test its effectiveness | 2022.01-2022.12 | PMO/ Subcontractors | Not initiated |  |
| 7.6 Promote the sustainable operation of the procedure and the platform, regularly compare and analyze data, and research on the change of species and threatening factors | 2022.01-2024.01 | PMO/ Demo. PAs | Not initiated |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation 8:**  **Establish baseline status and end-of-project targets for the KAP survey and have these approved by the PSC and RTA** | | | | |
| **Management Response:** Fully Accept | | | | |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Timeframe (Y.M.D)** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking** | |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 8.1 During the MTR, the PMO has confirmed with the MTR consultants that it will use the 2020 KAP survey as baseline and the final KAP survey will be conducted in 2022 | 2021.9-2021.10 | PMO | Completed |  |
| 8.2 The KAP baseline and end-of-project target has been submitted to the MTR consultants during the MTR | 2021.09-2021.10 | PMO | Completed |  |
| 8.3 Submit the identified KAP baseline and end-of-project target to the PSC and RTA for approval | 2021.12-2022.03 | PMO/PSC/RTA | Not initiated |  |
| 8.4 In accordance with the approved end-of-project KAP target, update in the results framework | 2022.01-2022.03 | PMO/PSC/RTA | Not initiated |  |
| 8.5 Align knowledge management and awareness raising with the end-of-project KAP target to ensure the full realization | 2022.01-2024.01 | PMO | Not initiated |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation 9:**  **Clarify how the successful ‘establishment’ of the four corridors will be measured and reported and include this in the revised results framework** | | | | |
| **Management Response:** Fully Accept | | | | |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Timeframe (Y.M.D)** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking** | |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 9.1 Invite stakeholders to establish the EC Network Coordination Committee | 2021.12-2022.03 | PMO/GFGB/local government/township, town | Initiated |  |
| 9.2 Hold the first meeting of the EC Network Coordination Committee, establish its responsibilities and mechanism, etc. | 2022.03-2022.06 | PMO/GFGB/local government/township, town | Not initiated |  |
| 9.3 Identify the protection status of the EC | 2022.03-2022.12 | PMO/demo. NRs/ local government | Not initiated |  |
| 9.4 Hold the EC Network Coordination Committee meeting regularly, and monitor and report of the implementation progress of the EC implementation plan (written report) | 2023.01-2024.01 | PMO/GFGB/local government/township, town | Not initiated |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation 10:**  **Develop a clear ecological objective for each corridor, including simple diagrams showing the corridor in the landscape and the wildlife populations that will benefit** | | | | |
| **Management Response[[10]](#footnote-11):** Fully Accept | | | | |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Timeframe (Y.M.D)** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking [[11]](#footnote-12)** | |
| **Status[[12]](#footnote-13)** | **Comments** |
| 10.1 Publicize widely after the EC is legally protected | 2022.03-2024.01 | PMO/GFGB/Demo. NRs/local government /township, town | Not initiated |  |
| 10.2 Make diagrams indicating the location and the areas of the EC to be restored, managed, and controlled | 2022.03-2022.12 | PMO/ Subcontractors | Not initiated |  |
| 10.3 Update this information into the EC implementation plan | 2022.03-2022.12 | PMO/Consultants | Not initiated |  |
| 10.4 The relevant EC management agencies regularly monitor and report on the implementation progress of the EC implementation plan | 2023.01-2024.01 | PMO/GFGB/ Demo. NRs/ local government | Not initiated |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation 11:**  **Continue to refine the content of the PA management plans and sustainable financing plans to focus on practical and feasible measures, and provide ongoing support to the nature reserves for implementation** | | | | |
| **Management Response:** Fully Accept | | | | |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Timeframe (Y.M.D)** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking** | |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 11.1 Subcontractors to organize training on application of the management plan and financing plan, identify shortcoming and discuss about approaches to improve | 2022.01-2022.03 | Demo. NRs / Subcontractors | Not initiated |  |
| 11.2 Demo. NRs to analyze the shortcomings in its management plan and sustainable financing plan to strengthen its operability, and measure the workload to improve them | 2022.02.-2022.04 | Demo. NRs / Subcontractors /PMO | Not initiated |  |
| 11.3 Measure the budget required to improve the management plans and sustainable financing plans, reasonably adjust grant budget, and allocate additional fund to this work | 2022.04. -2022.05 | Demo. NRs / Subcontractors /PMO | Not initiated |  |
| 11.4 Target NRs sign complementary agreements with original subcontractors to modify and improve their management plan and financing plan in accordance with MTR consultants’ recommendation | 2022. 05-2022.06 | Demo. NRs / Subcontractors /PMO | Not initiated |  |
| 11.5 Review the modified management plans and financing plans | 2022.07. -2022.08 | PMO | Not initiated |  |
| 11.6 Go through administration procedures to get the management plans and financing plans re-approved. | 2022.09-2022.10 | Demo. NRs | Not initiated |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation 12:**  **Assess the role of the Yuhe NR management plan to inform management of the Giant Panda NP in accordance with the official approval and management plan for the Giant Panda NP** | | | | |
| **Management Response: Reject (Personnel has changed due to institutional reform. Therefore, this task cannot be completed.)** | | | | |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Timeframe (Y.M.D)** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking** | |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation 13:**  **Undertake a gap analysis of the alternative livelihoods training and capacity building and modify the training and support** | | | | |
| **Management Response:** Reject (Needs assessment has been conducted in pre-phase. Most trainings have not been conducted yet. No need to conduct gap analysis) | | | | |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Timeframe (Y.M.D)** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking** | |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation 14:**  **Implement research to identify the remaining fundamental barriers to adopting alternative livelihoods, develop recommended approaches to assisting beneficiaries with these barriers, and modify training and support where appropriate** | | | | |
| **Management Response:** Fully Accept | | | | |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Timeframe (Y.M.D)** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking** | |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 14.1 Re-assess community’s need on alternative livelihoods | 2021.10 -2022.11 | PMO/ Demo. NRs | Completed |  |
| 14.2 Collect documents and data regarding community’s need on alternative livelihoods | 2021.10-2022.11 | PMO/ Demo. NRs | Completed |  |
| 14.3 Analyze the assessment on community’s need on alternative livelihoods and plan for matching resources | 2021.10-2022.11 | PMO | Completed |  |
| 14.4 Provide substantive support to community alternative livelihoods | 2021.11-2022.08 | PMO/Demo. NRs /Subcontractors | Initiated |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation 15:**  **Develop provincial plans for conservation of other globally threatened species** | | | | |
| **Management Response:** Partially Accept | | | | |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Timeframe (Y.M.D)** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking** | |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 15.1 The giant panda conservation plan was executed in accordance with the National Giant Panda Conservation Program Planning (2016-2025) | 2016.12 | NFGA | Completed |  |
| 15.2 Develop Gansu Provincial Snow Leopard Conservation Strategic Plan | 2018.12 | GFGB | Completed |  |
| 15.3 Gap Analysis on Conservation of Gansu Provincial Endangered Species and PA Planning developed to inform the provincial conservation plan of other globally threatened species | 2021.12-2024.01 | GFGB/PMO/Subcontractors | Initiated |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation 16:**  **Develop a sustainability plan before the end of the third year of the project to identify how the project’s results can be continued beyond the GEF funding and use this to inform activities over the final two years of implementation** | | | | |
| **Management Response:** Fully Accept | | | | |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Timeframe (Y.M.D)** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking** | |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 16.1 Conceive the sustainability plan | 2021.10-2021.11 | PMO | Completed |  |
| 16.2 Draft the sustainability plan | 2021.11-2021.12 | PMO | Completed |  |
| 16.3 Discuss about the sustainability plan with stakeholders | 2021.12 | PMO/Stakeholders | Initiated |  |
| 16.4 Finalize the sustainability plan | 2021.12 | PMO | Initiated |  |
| 16.5 Advance the execution of the sustainability plan | 2022.02-2023.12 | PMO/Stakeholders | Not initiated |  |

*(Add tables, as needed)*

1. Select one: Fully Accept, Partially Accept, Reject [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
2. Status of implementation is tracked electronically in the Evaluation Resource Centre (ERC). [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
3. Select one: Not initiated, Initiated, Completed, Completed, No longer applicable [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
4. Select one: Fully Accept, Partially Accept, Reject [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
5. Status of implementation is tracked electronically in the Evaluation Resource Centre (ERC). [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
6. Select one: Not initiated, Initiated, Completed, Completed, No longer applicable [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
7. Select one: Fully Accept, Partially Accept, Reject [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
8. Status of implementation is tracked electronically in the Evaluation Resource Centre (ERC). [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
9. Select one: Not initiated, Initiated, Completed, Completed, No longer applicable [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
10. Select one: Fully Accept, Partially Accept, Reject [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
11. Status of implementation is tracked electronically in the Evaluation Resource Centre (ERC). [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
12. Select one: Not initiated, Initiated, Completed, Completed, No longer applicable [↑](#footnote-ref-13)