

Management response

UNDP management response

[Energy Efficiency Improvement in Public Sector Buildings in China (PSBEE)]

Date: 25 January 2022

Prepared by: Li Chunyan

Position: Project Coordinator

Unit/Bureau: MOHURD

Cleared by: Lin Lanlan

Position: Division Director

Unit/Bureau: MOHURD

Input into and update in ERC: Sun Qian

Position: SPRIMME Officer

Unit/Bureau: UNDP China SPRIMME

Evaluation recommendation 1. Request UNDP and the GEF secretariat a 12-month no-cost extension of the project implementation period.				
Management response: Agree				
Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status
1.1 PMO will apply for extension for the project.	08/2022	PMO/IP, PSC, and UNDP		Initiated
Evaluation recommendation 2. Complete an urgent and comprehensive review of the scope, budget and monitoring procedures of each demonstration project selected under outputs 3.1.5. and 3.2.2.				
Management response: Agree				
Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status
2.1 PMO will arrange a comprehensive review of the scope, budget and monitoring procedures of each demonstration project selected under outputs 3.1.5. and 3.2.2 and make necessary corrections. An independent consultant will be hired to assist with the procedure.	05/2022	PMO and UNDP		Initiated
Evaluation recommendation 3. Formulate an updated project strategy to remove financial barriers for the adoption of EC&CC and LC technologies and practices in public buildings and present it to the PSC for formal approval.				
Management response: Partially agree				
Key action(s)	Completion date		Tracking	

		Responsible unit(s)	Comments	Status
3.1 PMO will formulate an updated project strategy on financial barrier removal. PMO will focus on activities delivering “output 3.1.4 Designed market-based financing of new EC&EE and LC technology (system and product) applications”, which will be used to record and verify the identified demonstrations of market-based financing mechanism.	06/2022	PMO		Not initiated
Evaluation recommendation 4. Prepare a detailed monitoring plan and submit it for approval by the PSC.				
Management response: Agree				
Key actions	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	Status
			comments	
4.1 PMO will formulate a detailed monitoring plan and submit it for approval by the PSC, including (1) the approach and methodology for the calculation of incremental GHG emissions and emissions reductions attributable to the demonstration projects and to their replication effects, (2) baseline and calculation method for the estimation of fuel savings to be reported under the first indicator of the project’s objective: “Cumulative fossil fuel savings due to project intervention”, (3) “No. of new jobs created with the application of EC&EE technologies and	03/2022	PMO		Initiated

techniques in the public buildings sector in China”				
Evaluation recommendation 5. Improve the process for proposing, approving, and documenting changes to the project scope.				
Management response: Partially agree				
Key actions	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	Status
5.1 PMO has been strictly following formal procedures on reporting and documenting on project implementation. PMO will continue to strengthen the communication with UNDP, PSC and all related parties to make sure all the stakeholders are on the same page with project implementation. For all the changes that have been agreed on mutually by PMO and UNDP but not well documented during the inception stage, a memo will be submitted to PSC for documenting.	12/2022	PMO		Initiated
Evaluation recommendation 6.	Improve the process for documenting and accounting for co-financing contributions from project partners, especially from private sector stakeholders.			
Management response:: Reject				
<p>PMO has made comments on co-financing conclusion in the draft of MTR report, as the following: (1) According to the ProDoc, the project activities are 100% financed by GEF grant, and the co-financing funds from government and private sector are not included in the consolidated project financial statements; (2) GEF requires to report the availability of co-financing contribution, but doesn't specifically require MTR team to investigate all accounting books and contracts related to non-GEF grant, or to take the investigation result as the sole evidence; (3) so, considering risks and project management cost, PMO has confirmed with relevant governments/private sector that the detailed list of co-financing contribution meeting GEF requirement could be regarded as the evidence of co-financing. Except for a few exceptions, PMO has not refused to provide co-financing evidence to MTR team with the excuse of confidentiality.</p> <p>Figure corrections which PMO has stated before but still not be corrected: Actual Expenditures recorded in Component 2 and Component 3 (P52) should be 549,472.39 and 474,446.33 respectively. (2) The accumulated expenditure until December 2020 (P51) should be “ 3737119.94 ” , and “ 93% ” should corrected to be “ 95% ” , “ 72% ” should corrected to be “77%”.</p>				
Key actions	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	Status

N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A
Evaluation recommendation 7. Prepare and adopt an exit strategy that contributes to reducing risks to the sustainability of project results.				
Management response: (“Agree”, “Partially agree”, or “Reject” with justification): Partially agree				
Key actions	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	Status
7.1 PMO has started to prepare the exit strategy, including: (1) apply for a second term of the project, improve strategy on barrier removal; (2) prepare and implement project promotion plan based on output 3.2.4; operation of training centers.	03/2022	PMO		Initiated
Evaluation recommendation 8. Recruit a part-time international chief technical advisor (ICTA) to provide strategic guidance and support to the PMO and key stakeholders. The ICTA could be a member of the PMO (ideally) or an international consultant tasked with providing ICTA services.				
Management response: Agree				
Key actions	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	Status
8.1 PMO will recruit a part-time international chief technical advisor (ICTA)	03/2022	PMO, UNDP		Initiated
Evaluation recommendation 9. Strengthen the oversight function of UNDP and their role supporting project teams monitoring and reporting project progress.				
Management response: (“Agree”, “Partially agree”, or “Reject” with justification): agree				
Key actions	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	Status
9.1 UNDP will continue to strengthen the oversight function of UNDP and their role supporting project teams monitoring and reporting project progress.	12/2023	UNDP, PMO		Initiated
Evaluation recommendation 10. Improve public access to project information and expand the scope and reach of activities to disseminate project products and information.				
Management response: Reject Actually PMO has regarded this as a key part of work and except for establishing training centers, already taken active actions including organizing seminars/workshops, posting excellent cases on wechat account and other social medias, making experience summary and publication plan, which could all help improve public access to project information.				

Key actions	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	Status
N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A
Evaluation recommendation 11. Enhance partnerships with local (provincial, county, and municipal) governments of jurisdictions where there are public buildings managed by MOHURD.				
Management response: (“Agree”, “Partially agree”, or “Reject” with justification): Partially agree				
Key actions	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	Status
11.1 Since the project inception, PMO has been committed to newly establishing partnership with local governments. Up to now, PMO has successfully developed partnership with relevant authorities of Qingdao and Tianjin. Next PMO will continue to develop partnership with local authorities where the demonstrations are based	12/2023	PMO		Initiated
Evaluation recommendation 12. Renew efforts to build partnership with line ministries and bureaus at central and local levels, especially education and health authorities.				
Management response:: Partially agree				
Key actions	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	Status
12.1 When MOHURD was identified as the new IP of PSBEE project, there was no adequate time to newly establish partnership with line ministries and bureaus at central and local levels. PMO will continue to reach out and develop partnership with relevant ministries and bureaus at all levels.	12/2023	PMO		Initiated
Evaluation recommendation 13. Ensure that adequate mechanisms (including institutional and financial arrangements) are in place to ensure that energy efficiency standards will continue to be updated periodically.				
Management response: Reject PMO has considered the sustainable updating and application of standards when selecting outsourcing institutes for this assignment. That’s why China Academy of Building Sciences was selected. Their rich experience in drafting standards and complete updating mechanism could ensure the standards could be kept updated.				

Key actions	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	Status
n/a	n/a	n/a		n/a
Evaluation recommendation 14. Prepare a comprehensive and well-written project completion report. .				
Management response: Agree				
Key actions	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	Status
14.1 PMO will summarize project results on time, promote excellent cases and successful experiences by reports or theme publication.	04/2022	PMO		Initiated

* Status of implementation is tracked electronically in the ERC database.