

Management response**Project Title: Sixth Operational Phase of the GEF SGP in Indonesia****UNDP PIMS ID: 5499****GEF ID: 9086****Terminal Evaluation Completion Date: 5 March 2022****Date of Issue of Management Response: March 2022**

Prepared by: Anton Sri Probiyantono

Position: Senior Programme Manager
Unit/Bureau: UNDP Indonesia, Environment Unit

Contributors:

1. Hugo Remaury (UNDP, NCE Regional Technical Advisor)
2. Catharina Dwi Hastarini (GEF-SGP6 National Coordinator)

Cleared by: Nika Saeedi

Position: Deputy Resident Representative a.i
Unit/Bureau: UNDP Indonesia

DocuSigned by:
Nika Saeedi
3AFB8E4677844C4...
24-Mar-2022

A. Project Design				
Terminal Evaluation recommendation A1.				
<p>The project design has been generally evaluated as weak; it was not an adequate navigation tool for SGP's implementation. Future designs should make a greater effort in terms of characterizing intervention areas, increased understanding of the ecosystems, providing quantitative data to justify targets and interventions using gender equality perspective. Larger meaningful stakeholder consultation and effective participation during project design could bridge information gaps and improve appropriation.</p>				
Management response:				
PARTIALLY REJECT				
<p>The project was designed based on experience from previous SGP operational phases which still relied on the global design of the GEF-SGP programme. It is important to note that the process was started at the country level involving multi-stakeholders representing various institutions and local needs, reviewed by regional and global levels, and endorsed by GEF Secretariat (and GEF Council). In this phase, the project was designed using a landscape/seascape approach for the first time.</p> <p>After evaluating the results of GEF-SGP6 around the world, the SGP Country Programme and UNDP have decided to continue working on a similar approach in the GEF-SGP Seventh Operational Phase (GEF-SGP7) and make a greater effort in terms of characterizing intervention areas, increasing understanding of ecosystem, providing quantitative data to justify targets and interventions using a gender equality perspective and in ensuring greater stakeholder consultation and effective participation to bridge information gaps and improve appropriations.</p>				
Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status
UNDP to make greater efforts in characterizing intervention areas, increased understanding of the ecosystems, providing quantitative data to justify targets and interventions using gender equality perspective and ensuring larger meaningful stakeholder consultation and effective participation as part of the design of the Seventh operational phase of the GEF-SGP in Indonesia	January 2022	UNDP CO, SGP Country Programme		Completed

<p>Terminal Evaluation recommendation A2. Failure and unsuccessful projects are perhaps more important to assess and analyze than successful ones. Key aspects behind failure and success should be analyzed to improve project preparation and selection process.</p>				
<p>Management response:</p> <p>Partially accept</p> <p>The SGP Country Programme did not only analyze only successful grant-funded projects but also unsuccessful ones. It summarized the results of analysis through interviews, focus group discussions (FGDs), and other relevant activities and compiled these findings in the Case Study entitled "Case Study: Experience of Implementation of the GEF SGP Indonesia – UNDP Phase-6 Project in Indonesia."</p> <p>This process for accessing and analyzing unsuccessful and successful projects will continue when implementing the seventh operational phase of the GEF-SGP.</p> <p>We disagree with the Ministry of Environment and Forestry being the responsible entity for this recommendation. In fact, the Responsible Party is the Implementing Partner/NGO, Yayasan Bina Usaha Lingkungan (YBUL). For information and clarification, GEF-SGP has been a project under NGO Execution. It has never been under a National Implementation Modality (NIM). The Responsible Party has been an NGO (in this case is <i>Yayasan Bina Usaha Lingkungan</i>) that signed a Project Cooperation Agreement (PCA) with the UNDP Country Office in Indonesia. The Project Document (ProDoc) has only been signed by UNDP Country Office in Indonesia.</p>				
Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status
1. The project will analyze successes and failures from OP6 grants and compile them into a Case Study "Experience of Implementation of the GEF SGP Indonesia – UNDP Phase-6 Project in Indonesia."	November 2021	SGP Country Programme		Completed
2. Lesson Learned from successful and unsuccessful SGP grants are fully integrated into the GEF-SGP OP-7 Project Design	January 2022	UNDP		Completed
<p>B. Stakeholder Participation</p>				
<p>Terminal Evaluation recommendation B1. Stakeholder’s involvement plan should not only list potential actors and organizations, but it should also describe them and analyze what concrete measures and activities will be carried out to ensure their involvement and participation from the benefits derived from project intervention.</p>				
<p>Management response:</p> <p>Partially accept</p> <p>In the seventh operational phase of the GEF-SGP, the SGP Country Programme and UNDP strengthened the stakeholder engagement plan to include potential actors/ organizations and explained their roles and analyzed what concrete actions and activities will be undertaken to ensure their involvement and participation.</p> <p>For this specific project, we do not agree with the Ministry of the Environment and Forestry being listed as entity responsible for this recommendation. Indeed, the GEF-SGP has been a project under NGO Execution. It has never been under a National Implementation Modality (NIM). The Responsible Party has been an NGO (in this case is</p>				

Yayasan Bina Usaha Lingkungan) that has a Project Cooperation Agreement (PCA) with UNDP Indonesia. The Project Document (ProDoc) has been signed by UNDP Indonesia only.				
Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status
Designing a stronger Stakeholder Engagement Plan that describe such stakeholders and analyze concrete measures and activities that will be carried out to ensure their full participation	January 2022	UNDP		Completed
<p>Terminal Evaluation recommendation B2. Communities and host organizations were not involved in project design. It is recommended to improve their participation, especially in setting goals and targets.</p>				
<p>Management response:</p> <p>REJECT</p> <p>From project design to evaluation process, the SGP County Program always invited and involved the community as evidenced by the fieldwork reports prepared during project design, monitoring reports, and internal evaluation reports. At that time, host organizations were not selected yet. Therefore, they were not considered involved in the project design by the evaluation. However, the SGP Country Program invited potential Host organizations to engage in the stakeholder consultation process. In accordance with SGP Operational Guidelines, the host organizations were selected after (1) the project document (prodoc) was endorsed by GEF CEO; (2) UNDP Indonesia received Delegation of Authority to sign the prodoc for implementation; (3) National Steering Committee (NSC) was established, and (4) Small grant mechanism was established and endorsed by the NSC. During the project design (preparation), accordance with GEF SGP Operational Guidelines, UNDP was not supposed to disburse any grant (funds) without proper mechanism.</p> <p>The SGP Country Programme and UNDP have decided to continue working on a similar approach in the seventh operational phase of the GEF-SGP and will involve communities and potential host organisation in project design, especially in setting goals and targets.</p>				
Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status
The SGP Country Programme invited and involved the community on project design of the Seventh operational phase of the GEF-SGP in Indonesia	January 2022	UNDP CO, SGP Country Programme		Completed
<p>Terminal Evaluation recommendation B3. The Ministry of the Environment and Forestry could have played a greater role in project implementation, especially in terms of dissemination of lessons learned and scaling up technologies and practices implemented by communities.</p>				
<p>Management response:</p> <p>Partially accept</p> <p>In future projects, the seventh operational phase of the GEF-SGP, the SGP Country Programme and UNDP will continue to collaborate with MoEF (or KLHK) through the active involvement of GEF Indonesia secretariat office, GEF OFP as co-chair of the NSC of GEF SGP, social forestry activities, and the ICCA registry (part of the Directorate General of Natural Resources and Ecosystem Conservation program under MoEF). the SGP Country Programme</p>				

and UNDP will encourage MoEF to get benefit from GEF SGP project and disseminate of SGP's lesson learned at national and global level.				
We disagree with the statement of Ministry of the Environment and Forestry as the Responsible Party. It is to clarify that GEF-SGP has been a project under NGO Execution. It has never been under a National Implementation Modality (NIM). The Responsible Party has been an NGO (in this case is Yayasan Bina Usaha Lingkungan) that has a Project Cooperation Agreement (PCA) with UNDP Indonesia. The Project Document (ProDoc) has been signed by UNDP Indonesia only.				
Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status
Formulation of Knowledge Management Strategy and Communication Strategy for the 7 th operational phase of the GEF SGP in Indonesia. During such development of these strategies, consultations will be made with the Ministry of Environment and Forestry for increased dissemination of lessons learned and scaling up.	March 2023	SGP Programme and Country	Will be implemented in the future GEF-SGP	Not initiated
<p>Terminal Evaluation recommendation B4. Involve the Ministry of Women Empowerment and Children Protection in the project design and implementation so that the project's outputs and outcomes and the data could be used by the MoWECP and at the same time it would also sensitize the ministry of Environment to gender-based natural resources management/governance discourses. The same recommendations also apply to other relevant ministries or governmental agencies</p>				
<p>Management response:</p> <p>Partially accept</p> <p>During the formulation of the seventh operational phase of the GEF-SGP project document, only certain government and other relevant government agencies at local level (village, sub-district, district, and provincial) were invited for consultation. This practice was conducted in the preparation of Sixth operational phase of the GEF-SGP and it continues in the seventh operational phase of the GEF-SGP. The SGP Country Programme will involve the MoWECP during implementation of the seventh operational phase of the GEF-SGP.</p> <p>We disagree with the statement that responsible entity is Ministry of Women Empowerment and Children Protection. GEF SGP is a project using an NGO Execution mechanism (and not a NIM). It has been focusing on activities that have been implemented at the grass root level. The project is meant to create a balance of international support to ensure sustainable development at local levels involving grass roots with National Implementation Modality (NIM) projects.</p>				
Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status
Involve the Ministry of Women Empowerment and Children Protection when developing and implementing landscape/seascape strategies	2022-2026	SGP Programme and Country	Will involve the MoWECP in the future GEF-SGP (GEF-SGP7)	Not initiated
<p>Terminal Evaluation recommendation C1. Report on project indicators should disaggregate between direct and indirect impacts derived from project intervention. There should be a clear indication about what has been achieved through GEF investments and what has been accounted as progress funded by other sources.</p>				
Management response:				

Fully accept				
The SGP Country Programme together with UNDP will develop a monitoring system that is easy to use by the local communities and relevant stakeholders to disaggregate between direct and indirect impacts derived from project interventions.				
Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status
Develop a monitoring system allowing to disaggregate direct and indirect impacts derive from the project interventions	July 2022	UNDP, SGP Country Programme	Will be conducted in the future GEF-SGP	Not initiated
Terminal Evaluation recommendation C2.				
Implementation should allocate sufficient time and facilitate dedicated spaces for PMU and host organizations to ensure a common understanding of project strategy, goals and targets. These spaces to share views and lessons learned should continue during implementation.				
Management response:				
Fully accept				
Since the implementation of the sixth operational phase of the GEF-SGP, the SGP Country Programme and host organizations have attended a series of workshops to ensure a common understanding of project strategy, goals and targets. In fact, the SGP Country Programme also opens a discussion session for each host organisations to conduct daily consultations. This space for sharing views and learning continues throughout implementation. It is even more often carried out during the COVID-19 pandemic by holding regular bi-monthly meetings between hosts and between implementing partners. The SGP Country Programme will continue to provide space to share views and lessons with grantees-partners and host organizations during the implementation of the seventh operational phase of the GEF-SGP.				
SGP Country Programme will develop work strategy better to host organisation therefore they have enough time to ensure common understanding of project strategy, goals, and targets.				
Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status
Continuous engagement with host organisations to ensure a common understanding of project strategy, goals and targets.	March 2023	SGP Country Programme, UNDP	Will be conducted in the future GEF-SGP	Not initiated
Terminal Evaluation recommendation C3.				
It is recommended that personnel or an organization is given a specific task to ensure the adoption of, or to link, the project outputs and outcomes in national level government.				
Management response:				
FULLY ACCEPT				
Yes, SGP Country Programme will select an organisation to conduct a specific task to ensure the adoption of, or to link, the project outputs and outcomes in national level government.				
Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status
Exploring the feasibility for a personal or an organization facilitating the adoption of, or to link, the project outputs and	February 2024	SGP Country Programme, UNDP	Will be implemented in the future GEF-SGP	not initiated

outcomes in national level government.				
D. Gender				
Terminal Evaluation recommendation D1.				
Add gender-based qualitative indicators to ensure the long-term changes by increasing stakeholders' knowledge/awareness on inclusive, if not specifically mentioned as gender mainstreamed natural resources management so that it will strengthen the overall gender responsive/sensitive approach of the project. An activity to achieve this target could be in form of gender equality and social inclusion training for the community members, men and women, grantees and government officials				
Management response:				
Partially accept				
A gender analysis action plan has been developed and defined in the project design of the seventh operational phase of the GEF-SGP (on annex 9 of the ProDoc) that included gender-based qualitative indicators to ensure the long-term changes by increasing stakeholders' knowledge/awareness on inclusive, and an activity to achieve this target could be in form of gender equality and social inclusion training for the community members, men and women, grantees and government officials.				
For this particular project, we disagree with the term of the Ministry of the Environment and Forestry and Ministry of Women Empowerment and Children Protection as the Responsible Parties. GEF SGP is a project using an NGO Execution mechanism (and not a NIM). It has been focusing on activities that have been implemented at the grass root level. The project is meant to create a balance of international support to ensure sustainable development at local levels involving grass roots with National Implementation Modality (NIM) projects.				
Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status
Developed a gender analysis and action plan, including gender-based qualitative indicators and gender-related trainings, when formulating for the seventh operational phase of the GEF-SGP	January 2022	UNDP		Completed
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Refine the project results framework to add gender-based qualitative indicators; and followed by b. Refine the gender action plan as part of the inception workshop to include gender-based qualitative indicators and gender-related trainings 	September 2022	UNDP, SGP Country Programme		Not initiated
Terminal Evaluation recommendation D2.				
Define indicators that qualitatively measure the changes of women and other marginalized groups, leadership in community-based landscape/seascape management. In addition to the gender-based quantitative indicators. For example, setting indicator on women or other marginalized groups' increasing capacities to speak in public (e.g. women's group, community's meeting, speaking to the authorities, depending on the context), in advocating for their rights fulfilment in landscape/seascape management, or increasing positive perception of men and women in regards with women's roles in landscape/seascape management. An example of activities to achieve this result could be exchange learning programme between community groups (women groups, youth groups, etc.) not only between the grantees				

Management response:**Partially accept**

During project design of the seventh operational phase of the GEF-SGP, a gender analysis action plan has been developed and defined (on annex 9 of the ProDoc). However, it is currently missing indicators that qualitatively measure the changes of women and other marginalized groups, leadership in community-based landscape/seascape management. It is proposed to include such indicators as part of the project inception workshop. Progress towards achievement of the gender mainstreaming targets will be monitored and evaluated on an annual basis, at a minimum. Results will be documented in project implementation review (PIR) reports and other progress reports. Gender mainstreaming results and lessons learned will be shared as part of the project's knowledge management strategy, and experiences on SGP project's will be input for project management.

We disagree with the term of the Ministry of the Environment and Forestry as the Responsible Parties. The GEF SGP is a project using an NGO Execution mechanism (and not a NIM). It has been focusing on activities that have been implemented at the grass root level. The project is meant to create a balance of international support to ensure sustainable development at local levels involving grass roots with National Implementation Modality (NIM) projects.

Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status
Revise the project results framework as part of the inception workshop to include indicators that qualitatively measure the changes of women and other marginalized groups, leadership in community-based landscape/seascape management.	September 2022	SGP Programme and UNDP Country and	Will be implemented in the future GEF-SGP	Not initiated