

**UNDP Management Response Template**  
**Mid Term Review – UNDP GEF Land Degradation Neutrality for mountain landscapes in Lebanon Project**

Prepared by: Jihan Seoud  
 Cleared by:  
 Input into and update in ERC:

Position: E&E UNDP Programme Manager  
 Position:  
 Position:

Unit/Bureau: RBAS  
 Unit/Bureau:  
 Unit/Bureau:

**Overall comments:**

**Evaluation Recommendations:**

- 1- The project has taken a fast pace in implementation and is moving forward into a proper direction, which is a pathway that is recommended to be continued.
- 2- The project should in general provide more opportunities to generate incomes for the poor, for instance, by establishing their own enterprises along value chains, as for instance supporting the establishments of nurseries, processing factories for fruits and legumines, establishing facilities for packaging, supporting marketing etc. as foreseen on the sustainable forest management documents for Jbeil and Akkar.
- 3- It seems to be recommendable to provide guidelines for tenderers on aspects which have to be highlighted in their proposals particular with regard to incomes of the poorer segments of society, such as costs versus activities, costs versus beneficiary groups, material cost categories and in particular water use efficiency calculations, calculations of the effectiveness of irrigation, and the economic benefits per beneficiary group. Furthermore, the guideline by UNDP should be followed, which could be addressed in the Inception meeting
- 4- The Project Objective should include a sub-objective related to poverty reduction and a related indicator. Also other indicators should be adjusted according to suggestions made in Chapter 4.

**Management Response:**

For recommendation 1, the project implementation should continue at the same pace or more to ensure targets are met.  
 For recommendation 2, the suggestions will be taken into consideration during the design of future income generating activities.  
 For recommendation 3, guidelines will be prepared by the project team and will be shared with the tenderers to be included in their work  
 For recommendation 4, the logframe will be changed accordingly.

Key Action(s)	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Tracking*	
			Due date/Status	Comments
2.1 Support the establishment of a nursery in Akkar	2.1 Sep 2022	UNDP CO		
2.2 Support the establishment of an agrofood plant in Akkar	2.2 Dec 2022			

2.3 Business plans including marketing plans for 6 products for the agrofood processing plant of Akkar 3 Guidelines sent to tenderers to abide by 4 Logframe change requested and granted	2.3 30 April 2022 3. Q1 2022 4. Q1 2022			
<b>Evaluation Recommendation :</b>  5- Conduct reseeding actions to promote palatable and high nutritious species in addition to melliferous, commonly wild harvested, medicinal/herbal, endangered and endemic species considering their multi-functional characteristics and conduct trials for instance with Medicago; Vicia; Trigonella; Lathyrus; Astragalus for instance in collaboration with the Lebanese Agriculture Research  6- Include degradation scoring into the current rangeland management plans to be used by communities				
<b>Management Response:</b>  For recommendation 5, reseeding actions will be planned in pilot sites identified based on the RMPs with a mix of species based on the recommendations of the RMPs and the MTR, and will be considered as trial plots  For recommendation 6, degradation scoring is taken into consideration and included into the current rangeland management plans to be used by communities, as per the national guidelines for rangeland management.				
Key Action(s)	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Tracking	
			Due date/Status	Comments
5. seeding actions in pilot sites 6. training on the use of degradation scoring of RMPs	5. Dec 2022 6. end of Dec 2022	UNDP		
<b>Evaluation Recommendation:</b>  7- The strategy for agriculture and SLWM should be further elaborated by focusing particularly on those SLWM techniques, which enhance yields most effectively, which is in particular a more advanced irrigation system. Given the scarcity of available water sources, it is important, to use irrigation in the most effective way wherever feasible, which is also confirmed in the Physical Master Plan by CDR. It would also be important to calculate future incomes for the time after the implementation of SLWM measures.  8- In abiding principles and practices of SLM, future SLM activities should include especially the intercropping of legumes and grasses to improve fertility of agricultural lands and in grazing areas while reducing pressures of overgrazing on natural rangelands.				

9- Monitor regularly sodicity and salinity with conductivity meters in improved irrigation systems, apply leaching when necessary

**Management Response:** For recommendations 7, 8 and 9, the pilot agricultural SLM and SLWM interventions will be initiated in summer 2022 to ensure the timely implementation of the scientific assessments and to give enough time for monitoring the impacts on soil characteristics.

Key Action(s)	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Tracking	
			Due date/Status	Comments
<p>7. Implementation of drip and sprinkler irrigation systems in pilot sites</p> <p>8. Training and implementation of intercropping techniques</p> <p>9. Monitor soil parameters in pilot sites where irrigation and intercropping are applied</p>	<p>7. Q3 2022</p> <p>8. Q4 2022</p> <p>9. Q3 2022 till Q3 2023</p>	UNDP		
<p><b>Evaluation Recommendation:</b></p> <p>10- To enhance effectiveness through diversification of incomes, it might be worth in addition to the foreseen activities to identify marketing mechanisms for the environmental services the project creates. Above all for carbon sequestration, for which the appropriate market mechanisms has to be identified, but also water services, biodiversity services etc. as also suggested in the ProDoc, Annex 20. This might also require to employ a consultant for the assessment of ecosystem services</p> <p>11- Follow the recommendation to focus on management rather than on reforestation (maybe reforestation more feasible in plains than on mountain tops), while attaining to issues of cost effectiveness.</p> <p>12- Encourage local stakeholders to form user groups for different items in the forest use plans to be developed, such as user groups for herbs, beekeeping, fuel woods, and provide trainings and training materials for them for sustainable harvesting</p> <p>13- For further income diversification, 1 – 3 value chains could be developed within the framework of SFM, which could be for instance pyrolysis as an energy source, new NTFP products etc.. herbs or spices.</p> <p>14- Some areas appear to be so fragile, that reforestation for their stabilization might take too long and not feasible, regarding the fact, that restoration has to follow the order social measures &lt; biological measures &lt; physical measures. One might therefore also consider wires, meshes, stone and earth bunds to protect against erosion, falling rocks and stones or even landslides. It might require a consultant to assess the vulnerability of mountain areas, particularly in Afqa. To apply the HIMA approach for restoration is highly recommendable.</p> <p>15- The law not to conduct thinning changed with respect to pinus brutia with regard to fire management, which the MoA is trying to change now should be accompanied by guidelines and advocacy by UNDP.</p> <p>16- In certain cases it might be more economically efficient, to support the establishment or improvement of local sustainable tourist accommodations, and integrate them systematically into other tourism activities, such as the Lebanon Mountain Trail than the planting of cedar trees. However, one might further take into account, that tourist numbers will rather decline in future, due to climate change considerations, pandemic etc.. It might therefore be</p>				

recommendable to calculate different scenarios

- 17- Put reasonable, but as little resources as possible into quarry rehabilitation. It is meant as a model for the private sector to imitate, who created quarries on private land and should cover the costs.
- 18- It might be recommendable to offer after the completion of the online trainings of GIS on-the-job trainings or visits on demand, as per experience major gaps in skills are only discovered during application and can be easily filled, if somebody is ready to assist, but training skills will get lost soon, if this assistance is not available.

#### Management Response:

For recommendation 10, a consulting firm will be hired to assess ecologic services and propose financing and marketing mechanisms.

For recommendations 11, the FMPs under elaboration cover an area of 1460 ha which exceeds the project target for reforestation and forest management.

For recommendation 13, 1 to 3 value chains will be identified based on the elaborated FMPs for Akkar and Jbeil sites, (such as the production of oreganum syriacum or salvia officinalis, or other herbs or spices, or the production of briquettes for household use from thinning products).

For recommendation 12 training for the use of the FMPs and sustainable harvesting of forest products will be implemented.

and will be supported and developed

For recommendation 14, a geotechnical consultant will be hired to assess the site in Afqa, and the appropriate stabilization measures will be implemented. HIMA approach will be proposed to the willing municipalities, in coordination with SPNL

For recommendation 15, UNDP is already engaged along with FAO and WFP in advocating these measures with the MOA as well as local authorities. MOA has already agreed not to give any permits without prior FMPs

For recommendation 16, support for tourist accommodations in Akkar and jbeil based on the assessment of the needs already performed by the tourism consultant.

For recommendation 17, the design of the rehabilitation of the selected quarry sites is low cost, with minimal excavation and construction works.

For recommendation 18, applications of the GIS training will be given to trainees such as the elaboration of the GIS maps for the municipality of Ehmej (where the training took place).

Key Action(s)	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Tracking	
			Due date/Status	Comments
10. Procurement of a consultancy firm to perform the assessment 11. Elaboration of FMP for a total area of 1460 ha 12. training on sustainable harvesting for various groups 13. Support the implementation of 2 value chains identified by the FMPs 14.1 Geotechnical assessment of the unstable site in Afqa and implementation of stabilization works 14.2 Implementation of HIMA approach in at least one site 15.1 Elaboration of guidelines for thinning in selected sites under the FMPs. 15.2 Advocacy by UNDP	10.Q4 2022 11.Q4 2022 12. Q4 2022 13. Q3 2023 14.1 Q3 2022 14.2 Q4 2023 15.1 Sep 2022 15.2 ongoing 16. Q3 2022 till Q3 2023	UNDP		

16. Support 2 accommodations, one in Akkar and one in Jbeil 17. Finalize the design of the quarry sites with priced BOQ 18. Application and on the job training for the trainees of Ehmej municipality	17. Q3 2022 18. Q4 2022			
<b>Evaluation Recommendation:</b> The project goes in a very good direction and should continue to move into this direction. It is therefore recommended, to extend project duration about 1.5 years.				
<b>Management Response:</b>				
Key Action(s)	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Tracking	
			Due date/Status	Comments
Request will be shared with RTA and corporate office	Q2	UNDP		

\* The implementation status is tracked in the ERC.