**UNDP Management Response**

Date: August 2022

Prepared by:\_José De Gracia, Anarela Sánchez Position: Program Officer and Associate Unit/Bureau: RBLAC / Panama

Cleared by: Aleida Ferreyra Position: Deputy Resident Representative Unit/Bureau: RBLAC / Panama

Input into and update in ERC: Irina Madrid Position: Monitoring and Evaluation Unit/Bureau: RBLAC / Panama

**Overall comments:**

|  |
| --- |
| **Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 1:**Some activities have been reported as completed, however, during the field visit it was shown that they are not fully operational. For example, not all the installed biodigesters are working normally, despite the fact that they have been recently installed. It is recommended that the extended supplier liability are utilized to repair existing damage and reinforce the structure against rain and wind. |
| **Management Response 1:** Accepted.After the visit of the final evaluator to two farms with biodigesters installed, the contractor and the Project Coordination Unit visited both farms and the following was observed: Osvaldo Batista farm. Biodigester installed in Los Higos, Pedasi districtThis biodigester is functioning correctly and producing biogas. This biogas is used in the kitchen of the house that the farm assistants use. This biodigester had a water excess due to pouring rains from previous days. This water accumulated in the roof of the porcine barn and got to the biodigester’s feeding tube, causing an imbalance in the feeding and internal bacteria of the system. From the structural point of view, the system is functioning correctly, the imbalance or clean water/organic material relation was due to the pouring rain and this situation was fixed. These climatic situations are out of the scope of the project, but can be easily attended by the farmers. Miguel Ríos. Biodigester installed in Colan, Pocri districtThis biodigester is in optimal conditions, it doesn’t have any functioning issue. The final evaluator observed a rope tied to the gas reservoir, which is independent from the biodigester system, and it wasn’t included in the installation made by the contractor. This reservoir was donated by the contractor to the beneficiary. The purpose of this reservoir is to accumulate the methane gas excess produced by the biodigester, to be then utilized in the kitchen or water heater of the farm. Finally, it is important to mention that each one of the six producers with biodigesters installed signed an agreement with the Ministry of Environment that establishes the details of the system installed and the commitment of the producer to maintain the biodigesters. These agreements are available here: [https://undp-my.sharepoint.com/:f:/g/personal/monica\_mora\_undp\_org1/EjNTPqGKkolChlYkZjiJx2EBIlIpHd7dGRFHsOUIl13U4A?e=6Bb7ww](https://undp-my.sharepoint.com/%3Af%3A/g/personal/monica_mora_undp_org1/EjNTPqGKkolChlYkZjiJx2EBIlIpHd7dGRFHsOUIl13U4A?e=6Bb7ww)  |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| * 1. Define the actions and resources required by the Ministry of Environment and the Ministry of Agricultural Development to monitor the biodigesters installed.
 | August 2022 | Environment, Climate Change and Sustainable Development Cluster | An exit strategy and sustainability workshop were held on August 11th and 12th  with the participation of the Ministry of Environment the Project Coordination Unit and the UNDP Environment, Climate Change and Sustainable Development Cluster.  |  |
| 1.2 Deliver the Exit Strategy to the Ministry of Environment, including the monitoring actions related to the biodigesters installed. | October 2022 | Environment, Climate Change and Sustainable Development Cluster | In process |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 2:**An important milestone of the project was the creation of the National Oceans Policy. It is recommended to accompany the ministries involved in measuring the scope, resources and capacities required for its implementation. It is important to have a roadmap to take advantage of the momentum that Panama will have in 2022 as the venue for the XIX Latin American Congress of Marine Sciences - COLACMAR. |
| **Management Response 2:**Partially accepted.1. The [approved National Oceans Policy](http://gacetas.procuraduria-admon.gob.pa/29499-B_2022.pdf) has an implementation plan and a monitoring and evaluation framework, in addition to a cost estimation for the implementation plan proposed.
2. UNDP is working on a first year implementation actions that will be shared with the Commission created to implement the National Oceans Policy, established by [Executive Decree 431, October 2018](https://www.gacetaoficial.gob.pa/pdfTemp/28643_B/GacetaNo_28643b_20181029.pdf). This Commission is composed of ten representatives of governmental institutions and its objective is the design, implementation and monitoring of the National Oceans Policy. Article 3 of the decree establishes: the purpose of the Commission is to coordinate efforts of the public and private sector nationwide and internationally to implement the National Oceans Policy, ensuring the conservation of the marine resources, maintaining the competitiveness of sea related activities, and abiding to the international maritime rules.
 |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| * 1. Prepare a first-year implementation plan document for the National Oceans Policy and delivery to the Commission of the National Oceans Policy.
 | December 2022 | Environment, Climate Change and Sustainable Development Cluster, Ministry of Environment, Ministry of Foreign Affairs | In process |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 3:**The lobster and longoron co-management in La Candelaria community, in the Pocrí District, showed that the artisanal fishermen of the area use sustainable management techniques. However, it is not the same for large scale foreign fishermen who operate on a large scale. Although there is a Management Plan, it is necessary to strengthen capacities and resources for the environmental authority to exercise control over the ships, which are a few and are clearly identified**.** |
| **Management Response 3:**Partially accepted.The scope of the project does not include resource provision for patrol and control of boats in the area. This function is responsibility of the National Authority of Water Resources ARAP. However, the co-management document proposes a patrol and control committee composed of community members, ARAP’s collaborators and other authorities such as the Aeronaval National Service SENAN. This committee would allow to decentralize the patrol and control function and supports the sustainability of the co-management plan. The project can support ARAP with the sustainability strategy of the co-management zone in La Candelaria, Pocri, preparing an internal regulations document for the co-management committee.  |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 3.1 Prepare an internal regulations draft document for La Candelaria co-management zone and give it to ARAP.  | November 2022 | Environment, Climate Change and Sustainable Development Cluster, Ministry of Environment | In process |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 4:**The project financed a publication developed and published by Fundación Tortugas Pedasí in the framework of its project which is co-financed by SGP UNDP/GEF MiAMBIENTE Azuero Sostenible. In the version received by the evaluator, the publication had spelling mistakes, particularly pronunciation marks. Although the final corrected digital version has been presented to the evaluator, it is not recommended to take the paper version out of circulation. However, it is necessary for the project to correct the paper version for the public. |
| **Management Response 4:**Partially acceptedThe mentioned publication was developed by Tortugas Pedasi Foundation, as part of the activities of a co-financed by SGP UNDP/GEF MiAMBIENTE project. This publication is already printed and has been distributed in community spaces and local schools. This is an illustrated book and we found only two minor spelling mistakes. These mistakes will be informed to Tortugas Pedasi Foundation to be corrected in the digital version of the book.  |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 4.1 Communicate the minor spelling mistakes found in the publication to Tortugas Pedasi Foundation.  | September 2022 | Project Coordination Unit | To start |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 5:**Gas was generated through the biodigesters installed in pig farms in the Pocrí, Pedasí and Tonosí districts. However, it is being underutilized (used to supply hot water for a house). Additional efforts through studies or evaluations to manage and take advantage of this gas are key. |
| **Management Response 5:**  Not accepted The hot water is being used for tasks related to the cattle activity. Specifically, the hot water is used to clean the pigs once they are sacrificed. Before the biodigester was installed, the producer used firewood to heat the water in a remote place of the far, and then moved this water by foot to the work area. With the biogas produced by the biodigester the process of heating the water can be done directly in the work area and, the use of firewood is not necessary.   |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 6:**The project has had a demonstrative nature due to the implementation of the different pilots, so it has generated a lot of information (videos, studies, consultations, analysis, etc.), which are not available to the public. A knowledge management strategy is recommended that goes beyond the usual systematization of the project and ensures tools aimed at local actors to increase their appropriation and empowerment. |
| **Management Response 6:**  Accepted.The Project Coordination Unit is working on the systematization of the project and on the documentation to develop a project website hosted by the Ministry of Environment. This website will contain the results and achievements of the project.  |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 6.1. Hire a systematization specialist. | July 2022 | Project Coordination Unit | Individual consultant hired |  |
| 6.2 Produce the systematization products. | October 2022 | Project Coordination Unit | To start |  |
| 6.3 Website of the project hosted by the Ministry of Environment. | November 2022 | Project Coordination Unit | To start |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 7:**The project implemented reforestation activities in livestock areas, which showed some resistance of farmer and cattle ranches. However, the pilots generated interest with other farms to expand the planting. In this sense, it is recommended that the project identify other mechanisms or funds to continue with the reforestation activities. |
| **Management Response 7:** Accepted.A workshop will be held with the Ministry of Environment to identify projects that could lever the reforestation activities in Los Santos province.  |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 7.1. Work session with the Ministry of Environment for the development of an exit strategy and lessons learned document. In this session the actions for monitoring the different interventions implemented by the project will be defined, including the reforestation of 30 hectares with native species in the Pocrí, Pedasí and Tonosí districts.  | August 2022 | Project Coordination Unit | An exit strategy and sustainability workshop were held on August 11th and 12th  with the participation of the Ministry of Environment the Project Coordination Unit and the UNDP Environment, Climate Change and Sustainable Development Cluster  |  |
| 7.2 Preparation of an exit strategy and lessons learned document. | September 2022 | Project Coordination Unit | To start |  |
| 7.3 Exit strategy outreach among key actors. | November 2022 | Project Coordination Unit | To start |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 8:**The project demonstrated that it is possible to add value and generate new ventures, such as business opportunities related to honey production and tourism on Caña Island, as well as women's ventures in Búcaro. It is recommended to draft project proposals aimed at state agencies and international funders to ensure that the beneficiaries can complete their learning curve, formalize their operations, and consolidate their launching to the market. |
| **Management Response 8:** Accepted.Project profiles for entrepreneur woman of Búcaro and the Bee’s Route at Cañas Island will be developed.  |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 8.1. Preparation of two Project profiles for entrepreneur woman of Búcaro and the Bee’s Route at Cañas Island.  | October 2022 | Project Coordination Unit | To start |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 9:**The project must develop an exit strategy to reduce the high uncertainty that exists regarding continuity of GEF investments. It is recommended to quickly start the process of bringing actors together, identifying resources and achieving clear commitments related to continuity and mobilization of additional resources to scale up carried out practices and activities. |
| **Management Response 9:** Accepted**.**  An exit strategy will be developed with the participation of the Project Coordination Unit, the Environment, Climate Change and Sustainable Development Cluster and collaborators of the Ministry of Environment.  |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 9.1. Work session. Development of an exit strategy and lessons learned document.  | August 2022 | Project Coordination Unit | An exit strategy and sustainability workshop were held on August 11th and 12th  with the participation of the Ministry of Environment the Project Coordination Unit and the UNDP Environment, Climate Change and Sustainable Development Cluster. |  |
| 9.2 Preparation of an exit strategy and lessons learned document. | September 2022 | To start |  |
| 9.3 Exit strategy outreach among key actors. | November 2022 | To start  |  |
| **Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 10:**It is recommended to hold a project-level closing event but also additional closing events in each municipality with the objective of giving back to the communities and outgoing local governments for everything that has been done and ensure the sustainability of successful activities. |
| **Management Response 10:**  Partially accepted.A closing event will be organized in Panama City with the participation of the mayors of three municipalities (Pocrí, Pedasí and Tonosí) and the beneficiaries of the programs implemented by the project. In this event will participate representatives of governmental institutions and potential allies (private sector and NGOs). An additional event in each municipality is not feasible.  |
| **Key Action(s)** | **Time Frame** | **Responsible Unit(s)** | **Tracking** |
| **Status** | **Comments** |
| 10.1. Closing event of the project in Panama City  | October 2022 | Project Coordination Unit | Organization in process |  |

\* The implementation status is tracked in the ERC.