**UN Management Response Template [Final Project Evaluation: “Tackling Air Pollution in the City of Skopje”**

**(Project number 00109164) Final Evaluation Report]**

Date: September 2022

Prepared by: Anita Kodzoman/ Position: Programme Officer Unit/Bureau: UNDP North Macedonia

Aleksandra Dimova Position: Project Manager Unit/Bureau: UNDP North Macedonia

Cleared by: Armen Grigoryan Position: Resident Representative Unit/Bureau: UNDP North Macedonia

Input into and update in ERC: Sami Bushi Position: Programme and M&E Associate Unit/Bureau: UNDP North Macedonia

|  |
| --- |
| **Evaluation recommendation 1.** Relevance**For future projects, foresee a more active role of the CSOs, especially in promoting their role in the articulation with the public sector. Evaluate the possibility of creating a complementary project planning and monitoring mechanism (Technical Committee) with a more active role for the target institutions and CSOs. Provide for the identification of alternatives to electric heating systems (biomass, photovoltaic energy) to minimise possible negative impacts caused by the cost of electricity. Carry out a gender analysis and thus strengthen the gender approach. The same is true for the population that lives in a situation of greater vulnerability.** |
| Management response: **The recommendation is partially accepted.**  |
| **Key action(s)** | **Time frame** | **Responsible unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Comments** | **Status** |
| * 1. For future projects, foresee a more active role of the CSOs
 | July 2022 | UNDP Project/ Environment Portfolio | In July 2022 Low-Value Grant Agreements were signed with 4 CSOs.  | Completed. |
| Mar 2024 | UNDP Project/Environment Portfolio | Collaboration with 10 CSOs is foreseen in the second phase of the project that is expected to start in October 2022 | Accepted. Initiated/included in the project document for the planned second phase of the project |
| * 1. Evaluate the possibility of creating a complementary project planning and monitoring mechanism (Technical Committee)
 | Sep 2022 | Government | Based on the experience and lessons learnt so far, such technical committees cannot function if established at a project level. | Not accepted. Such Technical Committee already exist and is established by the Government |
| * 1. Provide for the identification of alternatives to electric heating systems (biomass, photovoltaic energy) to minimize possible negative impacts caused by the cost of electricity
 | Mar 2024 | UNDP Project/Environment Portfolio | Included in the second phase of the project | Accepted. Initiated/included in the project document for the planned second phase of the project |
| * 1. Carry out a gender analysis and thus strengthen the gender approach
 | September 2022 | UNDP Project/Environment Portfolio | National consultant contracted to carry out gender specific analyses. Recommendation shell be taken into consideration in the implementation of the second phase of the project.  | Completed.  |
| **Evaluation recommendation 2.** Efficiency **Ensure constant monitoring of the activities that remain to be completed in the scheduled times (C 3). Properly consider climatic factors in the programming to measure pollution due to home heating during the summer. Pay attention to planning to prevent delays and bottlenecks for the implementation of the activities, to observe and measure the results and effects of the implemented activities before the end of the project.** |
| Management response: **The recommendation is accepted**. |
| **Key action(s)** | **Time frame** | **Responsible unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Comments** | **Status** |
| 2.1 Ensure constant monitoring of the activities that remain to be completed in the scheduled times (C3) | July 2022 | UNDP Project/Environment Portfolio | All activities are completed. The Supervising company constantly followed the work progress and on regular basis informed the project team. | Completed. |
|  Jan 2024 | UNDP Project/Environment Portfolio | Within the next project phase the project will also engage Monitoring associate on full time basis. | Accepted. Initiated/included in the project document for the planned second phase of the project |
| 2.2 Properly consider climatic factors in the programming to measure pollution due to home heating during the summer | Mar 2024 | UNDP Project/Environment Portfolio | The follow-up project activities will be implemented in longer period and there will be more time for implementation of out-door energy efficient activities and measures. | Accepted. Initiated/included in the project document for the planned second phase of the project |
| 2.3 Pay attention to planning to prevent delays and bottlenecks for the implementation of the activities, to observe and measure the results and effects of the implemented activities before the end of the project | June 2023 | UNDP Project/Environment Portfolio | The follow-up phase proposed two surveys on public awareness to be conducted – at the very beginning of the project period and at its end. | Accepted. Initiated/included in the project document for the planned second phase of the project |
| **Evaluation recommendation 3.** Effectiveness **Strengthen the participation of citizens, government institutions, the private sector and CSOs in the web platform, spreading its use in social networks or providing specific activities and workshops. Support the articulation in existing/new coordination spaces between institutions and CSOs. Maintain and enhance the partnership with academia and science to enable a robust and comprehensive knowledge base for the informed design of policies and measures for tackling air pollution.** |
| Management response: **The recommendation is accepted.** |
| **Key action(s)** | **Time frame** | **Responsible unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Comments** | **Status** |
| 3.1 Strengthen the participation of citizens, government institutions, the private sector and CSOs in the web platform, spreading its use in social networks or providing specific activities and workshops. | August 2022 | UNDP Project/Environment Portfolio | The web platform is upgraded with 4 additional modules to enable better coordination of the interested parties and implementation of air quality plans. | Completed. |
|  Mar 2024 | UNDP Project/Environment Portfolio | The second project phase envisions strengthened participation of citizens, government institutions, the private sector and CSOs in the coordination activities and decision-making processes. | Accepted. Initiated/included in the project document for the planned second phase of the project |
| 3.2 Support the articulation in existing/new coordination spaces between institutions and CSOs. | Jan 2023 | UNDP Project/Environment Portfolio | The recommendation is accepted and found to be relevant. In the planned second phase specific activities and events for coordination among the key stakeholders are envisioned. | Accepted.Initiated/included in the project document for the planned second phase of the project |
| 3.3 Maintain and enhance the partnership with academia and science to enable a robust and comprehensive knowledge base for the informed design of policies and measures for tackling air pollution. | Jan 2023 | UNDP Project/Environment Portfolio | The recommendation is accepted and found to be relevant, hence the cooperation with University Goce Delcev as Responsible Party will continue in the second project phase.  | Accepted.Initiated/included in the project document for the planned second phase of the project |
| **Evaluation recommendation 4.** Impact **For future projects, extend the coverage of the subsidy model to other vulnerable municipalities, linking such initiatives to national policies promoted by the Ministry of the Environment with other funds, especially from the European Union, to achieve more impact and sustainability. Consider working with the Parliament and National Commissions on Energy and Environment to encourage the discussion and approval of new regulations and legislative changes. Once the impact of COVID-19 has ended or is limited, evaluate the possibility of working with schools and children and adolescents to sensitise them, incorporating the project issues into the educational curriculum.** |
| Management response**: The recommendation is partially accepted.** |
| **Key action(s)** | **Time frame** | **Responsible unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Comments** | **Status** |
| 4.1 For future projects, extend the coverage of the subsidy model to other vulnerable municipalities, linking such initiatives to national policies promoted by the Ministry of the Environment with other funds, especially from the European Union, to achieve more impact and sustainability**.** | Mar 2023 | UNDP Project/Environment Portfolio | The lessons learnt from the first project is that such activity should be incorporated into the ministries and municipal programmes to support energy efficiency and energy poverty, and implemented by the respective entities and not by the project itself. The study about subsidies developed within the first phase of the project, shall be used as a basis to open discussions about respective subsidy models for pilot municipalities. | Partially accepted. |
| 4.2 Consider working with the Parliament and National Commissions on Energy and Environment to encourage the discussion and approval of new regulations and legislative changes. | Sep 2022 | UNDP Project/Environment Portfolio | The first phase project provided support to the respective Ministries, which are responsible to further communicate the sub-law related improvements with the Parliament or other relevant institutions.The second project phase includes activities related to development of air quality plans for the pilot municipalities, and capacity building of inspection system for implementation of the Law on the Quality of Ambiental Air and other related laws.  | Not accepted. |
| 4.3. Once the impact of COVID-19 has ended or is limited, evaluate the possibility of working with schools and children and adolescents to sensitise them, incorporating the project issues into the educational curriculum. | Sep 2022 | UNDP Project/Environment Portfolio | By the end of the first project phase – in 2 schools and 1 kindergarten the in-door sets and out-door monitoring station were connected on TVs presenting real-time air quality data for these institutions. | Completed. |
| Mar 2023 | UNDP Project/Environment Portfolio | This approach is also considered for the second project phase, where the in-door pollution will be measured in schools/kindergartens and hence awareness raising activities developed.  | Accepted. At conceptual/planning level. Relevant activities will be initiated with the start of the Project’s upcoming phase. |
| **Evaluation recommendation 5.** Sustainability/Ownership **Encourage the municipal appropriation and diffusion of the technologies and policies of the project. To increase the financial capacities of the municipality of Aerodrom directly supported (C3) and of the possible municipalities supported with future projects, favour the appropriation of such municipalities to the benefits of projects that improve the municipal capacities of access to European, national (also of the private sector) and other international funds, as promoted by BMCPI project. Influencing municipal environmental policies by replicating and institutionalising the subsidy model (and others, such as tax incentives, loans with low-interest rates, cash or in-kind subsidies) in coordination with the Ministry of the Environment, the academy, the CSOs and the private sector.** |
| Management response: **The recommendation is partially accepted**. |
| **Key action(s)** | **Time frame** | **Responsible unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |  |
| **Comments** | **Status** |
| Encourage the municipal appropriation and diffusion of the technologies and policies of the project. To increase the financial capacities of the municipality of Aerodrom directly supported (C3) and of the possible municipalities supported with future projects, favour the appropriation of such municipalities to the benefits of projects that improve the municipal capacities of access to European, national (also of the private sector) and other international funds, as promoted by BMCPI project. Influencing municipal environmental policies by replicating and institutionalising the subsidy model (and others, such as tax incentives, loans with low-interest rates, cash or in-kind subsidies) in coordination with the Ministry of the Environment, the academy, the CSOs and the private sector. | Apr 2023 | UNDP Project/Environment Portfolio | Within the second project phase the study about subsidies, shall be used as a basis to open discussions about respective subsidy models for pilot municipalities.Both the Air Pollution project and the BMCPI project within the second phase period will work under the same framework, and hance exchange knowledge and good practices. This will be the case also with the other UNDP projects (e.g. GFF) working on similar issues.Municipality of Aerodrom is not directly targeted within the second project phase. | Partially accepted.At conceptual/planning level. Relevant activities will be initiated with the start of the Project’s upcoming phase. |
| **Evaluation recommendation 6.** Gender perspective**Based on the positive experience of targeting component 3, continue targeting this and other future interventions towards the most vulnerable population groups, including low-income women. Develop a gender analysis, with the participation of the target groups and beneficiaries, before the presentation of new proposals or as the initial activity of a new project, in such a way that the design of the intervention may have such an approach explicitly reflected in outputs, activities, and budget.** |
| Management response: **The recommendation is partially accepted**. |
| **Key action(s)** | **Time frame** | **Responsible unit(s)** | **Tracking\*** |
| **Comments** | **Status** |
| 6.1. Based on the positive experience of targeting component 3, continue targeting this and other future interventions towards the most vulnerable population groups, including low-income women. | Sep 2022 | UNDP Project/Environment Portfolio | As agreed with the project donor, the second project phase shall not continue the subsidy programme for most vulnerable categories of citizen for introducing more environmentally friendly means for household heating (e. g. replacement of old, inefficient stoves).  | Not accepted. |
| 6.2 Develop a gender analysis, with the participation of the target groups and beneficiaries, before the presentation of new proposals or as the initial activity of a new project, in such a way that the design of the intervention may have such an approach explicitly reflected in outputs, activities, and budget. | September 2022 | UNDP Project/Environment Portfolio | National consultant contracted to carry out gender specific analyses. Recommendation shell be taken into consideration in the implementation of the second phase of the project | Done. Accepted. |

\*Status of implementation is tracked electronically in the Evaluation Resource Centre database (ERC).