TRACKING OF ATSEA-2 MTR MANAGEMENT RESPONSE AS OF 13 SEPTEMBER 2022

NOTE: Tracking and reporting of status will be done on a periodic basis based on completion dates identified. The same will be shared with UNDP COs periodically (particularly with UNDP IDN and TL).

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR OVERALL PROJECT:

Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 1. Re. Attainability of End of Project Targets Within the Project Timeframe – In accordance with UNDP and GEF policies, the UNDP CO in Indonesia as the Principal Project Representative should prepare and submit request for an extension of 12-18 months in order to recover the time lost due to the slow project start and COVID-19 restrictions. The start of implementation of the project was delayed due to the protracted negotiations for obtaining agreements and official signatures on documents for the project management arrangements and slow recruitment of the regional and national project teams. COVID-19 restrictions imposed in early 2020 caused further delays in implementation. Consequently, numerous project activities had to be postponed and/or modified. Despite several adaptive management actions of the project teams the delivery of several outputs was slower than originally expected. There is a risk that not all end-of-project (EOP) targets will be achieved by the original project completion date of June 2024.

Management Response: The Project welcomes the recommendation. In line with this, the ATSEA-2 Project Team initiated its assessment of the remaining multi-year work plan and budget to identify the most feasible timeframe for the extension for the project, which will be submitted to the Implementing Partners, Implementing Agency and Executing Agencies for further review. Based on the result of the assessment and discussions with relevant project partners, the Project Team, in collaboration with the IA and EAs, will seek further guidance and approval from the RSC as Project Board and to complete the required UNDP/GEF requirements for the proposed no-cost extension.

| Key Action(s) | Completion | Responsible | | Tracking | STATUS UPDATE |
|--|----------------|------------------|---|---|---|
| | Date | Unit(s) | Status (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country |
| 1.1 Complete a comprehensive work plan and budget assessment of available funding, forecast expenditures for the project, and develop scenario on most feasible timeframe for project extension. | 31 August 2022 | RPMU and NCUs | Initiated | The work plan and budget assessment are ongoing at per country and regional level to provide initial reference to the Project Team and Project Board. | Status: Completed Comment: Review of remaining deliverables and budget for 2022, draft AWP and Budget for 2023, and forecast deliverables and expenditures for 2024 presented by RPMU and NCUs at the Project Planning Workshop conducted in Bali on August 10 and 11, 2022. The assessment shows a |

| | | | | | project extension of 1 year for Indonesia component, 9 months extension for Timor-Leste component, and 6 months extension for the Regional and PNG component to end of 2024, based on their varying original end dates. The AWPs and Budget were further refined and are ready for submission to NPB meetings scheduled in September and the 4 th RSC scheduled in November 2022. Zoom Meeting with UNDP BRH, UNDP Indonesia, PEMSEA and RPMU was also conducted on August 26, 2022 wherein further guidance was provided on process requirements to facilitate request for project extension. |
|---|---|--|---------------|--|---|
| 1.2 Building on the assessment, complete the proposed Work Plans and Budget for 2023 and 2024 (including the most feasible no-cost extension period) and submit to UNDP, PEMSEA, NPBs and RSC. | 14 October 2022 | RPMU and NCUs | Initiated | Parallel to the assessment, the NCUs and RPMU are already developing draft AWPs and Budget for 2023 and 2024 with budget assessment on possible extension period. | Status: Initiated Comment: As part of ongoing preparation for NPB and RSC meetings, copies of proposed AWP and Budget will be shared by first week of October. |
| 1.3 Convene the NPBs per country to review the proposed work plans and budget for Country Components, and the RSC to review the regional component and overall proposal for project extension and | 30 September (NPBs) 05 November 2022 (RSC) | NCUs, RPMU, UNDP, PEMSEA Implementing Partners per country/NPBs, and RSC | Not initiated | To be scheduled and organized with NPBs and RSC. | Status: Initiated Comment: Preparation for NPB and RSC meetings ongoing wherein the proposed AWP and Budget will be submitted for review and approval. NPB meetings scheduled: |

| corresponding work plans and budget. | | | | | Indonesia (Sept.20-21) PNG (Sept. 22) TL (end of Sept.) RSC meeting (Nov. 2-3) |
|---|--|---------------------|---|---|---|
| 1.4 Upon final RSC approval, | 16 December | RPMU | Not initiated | The RPMU will seek further | Status: Initiated |
| RPMU will coordinate | 2022 | PEMSEA | | guidance from UNDP on the | |
| with UNDP and PEMSEA | | UNDP | | process. | Comment: Preparation for RSC |
| to formalize the extension | | | | | meeting ongoing wherein the |
| of the project based on the | | | | | proposed AWP and Budget will |
| agreed most feasible | | | | | be submitted for review and |
| timeframe. | <u> </u> | | | | approval. |
| | | | | roject Monitoring – The RPMU in a | |
| | | | | in order to identify early indicators | |
| | | | | he ATSEA-2 Project Document was | |
| | | | | dation of the 2^{nd} RSC meeting, a co | |
| | | | | and causal links between intermed | |
| | | | be particularly imp | ortant when the intended impacts are | e longer-term and information |
| about intermediate outcomes is no | | | | | |
| | | | | EF and UNDP M&E reporting requ | |
| | | | | lementation Report (PIR) are curren | |
| | | | | t was completed by the Project in 20 | |
| | | | | TS Strategic Action Plan (SAP) Mo | onitoring System as well the |
| updating of the Transboundary D | | | | | |
| existing SRF as part of its interna | al quarterly monitor | ring and reporting, | in order to ensure t | eam will take into account the elements of the ToC are already | |
| subsequent PAR and PIR reports | | | P and GEF. | Tuo alaina | STATUS UPDATE |
| Key Action(s) | Completion Date | Responsible | | Tracking | SIALUS UPDALE |
| | | | | Commonto | |
| | Date | Unit(s) | Status (initiated, not | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) |
| | Date | Unit(s) | (initiated; not | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) |
| | Date | Unit(s) | (initiated; not initiated; | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from |
| | Date | Unit(s) | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) |
| | Date | Unit(s) | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from |
| 1.1 Align the ToC with the | | | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country |
| 1.1 Align the ToC with the AWP and SRE-based | 30 September | RPMU and | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer | The RPMU and NCUs will | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from |
| AWP and SRF-based | 30 September 2022 (to be | | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | The RPMU and NCUs will ensure to reflect this starting | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country Status: Initiated |
| AWP and SRF-based internal quarterly M&E | 30 September 2022 (to be applied up to | RPMU and | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | The RPMU and NCUs will ensure to reflect this starting from the next internal quarterly | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country Status: Initiated Comment: Internal quarterly |
| AWP and SRF-based | 30 September 2022 (to be | RPMU and | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | The RPMU and NCUs will ensure to reflect this starting | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country Status: Initiated |

| and UNDP captures/includes ToC elements. | | | | | include some key indicators from the ToC. |
|---|---------------------|------|---------------|--|---|
| 1.2 Ensure that the ToC document is provided as a key reference document in the development of the ATS SAP Monitoring System. | 20 January 2023 | RPMU | Not initiated | The engagement of consultant for the ATS SAP MS is in process and is targeted to be formalized by November 2022 to align with SAP updating process. The ToC will be included as key reference for the consultant. | |
| 1.3 Ensure that the ToC document is provided as part of the key reference documents for the updating of the TDA, SAP and NAPs. | 30 December 2023 | RPMU | Initiated | The TDA updating process is already ongoing and the ToC was part of the reference documents provided to TDA consultants. The same will be shared to SAP and NAPs consultant once the updating process is initiated by end of 2022. | Status: Initiated Comment: ToC already part of key references in the ongoing TDA updating process. |

Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 3. Re. Attainability of Some End of Project Targets–*With guidance from UNDP and following consultative processes, the RPMU in cooperation with PEMSEA and the NCUs should conduct a critical revision of the actual indicators and targets in the project SRF, in particular for Outcomes 1.1 and 2.1, and prepare a proposal for revised/alternative indicators and/or targets for submission and approval of the NPBs and the RSC at its 4th meeting.* Few indicators and their end-of-project (EOP) targets contained in the project SRF were determined on basis of incomplete baseline data. Additional baseline data and information from the field sites collected from the project-supported studies suggest that those indicators and related targets in the SRF are not realistic and need to be reconsidered in order to ensure their attainability within the remaining timeframe of the project.

Management Response:

The Project welcomes the opportunity to review the End of Project Targets for Outcome 1.1, which are highly contingent on the countries' political and financial commitments to support the operationalization of the regional governance mechanism (RGM) and implementation of the updated SAP and NAPs. With regard to the target on 'Regional governance mechanism established and functioning with at least 2 of 4 countries contributing dues', considering the iterative consultation process currently being undertaken with the countries on the design of the RGM, a project extension might be helpful to complete the consensus-building, adoption and initiation process for the agreed mechanism. Securing the financial contribution of 2 out of the 4 countries, would require more time considering the policies, priorities, and legal and administrative processes and requirements in each country. With regard to the target of '25% SAP implementation finance secured by governments and development partners', a project extension will enable the completion of the updated SAP and NAPs, preparation of a 5-year financing plan to support their implementation, and submission/presentation of the plans to the NIMCs and other partners for consideration/mainstreaming into their respective planning and budgeting processes.

The project notes that for Outcome 2.1 several EOPs and indicators need to be modified to better suit current conditions and interventions conducted so far. With regard to reduced fishing effort, for Aru Indonesia, the EOP is recommended to be modified to improved fishing fleet registration for shrimp and red snapper fishers, while for PNG, as the Project showed that the baseline was outdated, the EOP and indicator for dried fish maw production shall be re-examined and further revised. With regard to improved use of fish gear/techniques, as the practices and legislations may be different country by country, the

improved fish gear/techniques shall be defined better following existing national/local legislations for easier monitoring. For PNG, baselines in support of the EOPs and indicators will be updated based on planned assessments to be conducted as part of the South Fly Artisanal Fishery Management Plan (SFAFMP). The results arising from Outcome 2.1 interventions also contributes to achieving the Objective level target on ATS region's contribution to move globally over-exploited fisheries to more sustainable levels and in in this case it is important to set clear parameters that assessment and monitoring on fish stocks will focus on Red Snapper as key regional commodity and ATSEA-2 target.

Apart from Outcomes 1 and 2.1 cited above, the Project would like to provide further information that based on most recent discussions and confirmation from Indonesia and Timor-Leste, the Overall Project Objective on Landscapes and Seascapes (Indicator #3 with End of Project Target of 800,000 ha coverage on MPAs) would need further adjustment. Based on the final Marine Spatial Planning completed for the newly established Kolepom MPA in Indonesia, the coverage is only up to 353,287ha (lower than the 555,000 original target), whereas in the case of Betano-Klakuk in Timor-Leste, the assessment and boundary mapping, recently completed and currently undergoing stakeholder consultation, indicated that the coverage is only 20,906 ha (lower than the 90,000 original target). The assessment in Betano covers only up to 2 nautical miles outer boundary as the maximum allowed in MPAs in Timor-Leste as confirmed by MAF. While the support to existing MPAs in SE Aru in Indonesia (covering 114,000ha) and Nino Konis Santana in Timor-Leste (covering 55,660 ha) remains the same. In line with this, the new overall total coverage would amount only to 543,853ha (lower than the 800,000 target). Taking into consideration the results of country assessments the Project would like to seek further guidance from UNDP and to seek further feedback from the RSC on the revision of the EOP

| | ct would like to se | 0 | from UNDP and t | o seek further feedback from the RS | C on the revision of the EOP. |
|-----------------------------|---------------------|-------------|-----------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------------------|
| Key Action(s) | Completion | Responsible | | Tracking | STATUS UPDATE |
| | Date | Unit(s) | Status | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) |
| | | | (initiated; not | | |
| | | | initiated; | | Based on information from |
| | | | completed; no | | RPMU and NCUs per country |
| | | | longer | | |
| | | | applicable) | | |
| 1.1 For Outcome 1.1: The | 05 November | RPMU, NCUs, | Initiated | Concerns about the End of | Status: Initiated |
| RPMU, in cooperation | 2022 | PEMSEA | | Project Target has been raised in | |
| with the NCUs and | | | | internal project M&E meetings. | Comment: Preparation of |
| PEMSEA, will develop | | | | The project team will proceed to | document for RSC meeting |
| alternative target related | | | | formulate alternatives. | initiated |
| to RGM and submit the | | | | | |
| same for discussion in the | | | | | |
| 4 th RSC Meeting | | | | | |
| 1.2 For Outcome 2.1: On | 30 June 2023 | RPMU, NCUs | Initiated | The data collection in | |
| monitoring and reporting | | | | Probolinggo and Merauke is | |
| on regional Red Snapper | | | | ongoing as well as additional | |
| fish stocks, the RPMU | | | | primary data gathering are being | |
| will facilitate further | | | | conducted related to fisheries in | |
| assessment building on | | | | the 3 countries as part of the | |
| the completed regional | | | | ongoing TDA updating. Data | |
| baseline estimates on Red | | | | generated from these initiatives | |
| Snapper and the ongoing | | | | will be further used to update | |
| assessment in Probolinggo | | | | the regional baseline estimate | |
| and Merauke. RPMU will | | | | | |

| also continue coordination with NCUs in the completion of assessments to establish more updated baselines to facilitate better measurement of progress on reduced fishing effort and use of sustainable fishing gears and techniques (more specific proposed actions on this are provided under the country component recommendations below) | | | | on Red Snapper at the regional level. | |
|---|----------------------|--|---------------|--|---|
| 1.4 Related to the End of Project Target on the project's support to expanding and ensuring effectiveness of MPAs in the region, the NCUs will submit the final Marine Spatial and Zoning Plan of Kolepom MPA to NPB Indonesia, and the Final Assessment in Betano- Klakuk to NPB Timor- Leste for final review and confirmation of the hectare coverage. | 30 September 2022 | NCU Indonesia and Timor- Leste; and NPBs in Indonesia and Timor-Leste | Initiated | The Marine Spatial /Zoning Plan in Kolepom MPA has been completed and the final coverage has been confirmed. The reduction on coverage in Kolepom was also raised by Indonesia in the RSC meetings. While the Assessment in Betano-Klakuk has been completed and MAF has confirmed that measurement of up to 2 nautical miles outer boundary is the maximum allowable limit in the country, but stakeholder consultations is still ongoing. The results of these assessments were also reported in the PIR 2022. NPB meetings in both countries are targeted to be conducted in October, in preparation also for the RSC meeting in November. | Status: Initiated Comment: For Indonesia: Indonesia's NPB meeting is scheduled on September 20-21, 2022.All meeting documents are ready including MTR recommendations on targets for modification. For Timor-Leste: Preparation for NPB meeting in TL ongoing including development of meeting documents which will include MTR recommendations. TL's NPB meeting is scheduled in end of September 2022. |
| 1.5 The final decision arising from the NPBs will be submitted to the 4 th RSC Meeting in 2022 and | 05 November 2022 | NCU Indonesia and Timor- Leste; RPMU; RSC | Not initiated | The 4 th RSC meeting is targeted to be convened in November of 2022. This matter will be included as part of the meeting | Status: Initiated Comment: Preparation for RSC meeting initiated |

| included in the subsequent | | 1 | | agenda (subject to further | |
|---|--------------------|----------------------|---|--|--|
| | | | | consultation with UNDP on | |
| PAR and PIR reporting to UNDP and GEF to serve | | | | | |
| as official basis for the | | | | process related to changing of $E(\mathbf{P}_{n})$ | |
| | | | | EOPs). | |
| reduction of the EOP on | | | | | |
| hectare coverage on | | | | | |
| MPAs. | 20 X 2022 | LUND D | XX | | |
| 1.6 UNDP will facilitate the | 30 June 2023 | UNDP | Not initiated | The results of the Kolepom and | |
| updating of the EOP. | (in time with | Indonesia | | Betano assessments have | |
| | next PIR | | | already been reported as part of | |
| | Reporting) | | | PIR 2022, but further | |
| | | | | confirmation on changing of | |
| | | | | EOPs are still subject to further | |
| | | | | discussion/confirmation as cited | |
| | | | | above. | |
| | | | | d NCUs should prepare an exit stra | tegy for the project with emphasis |
| on formalisation of financial com | | | | | |
| | | | | yond the time boundaries of the pro- | |
| | | | | ne original expectation of secured co | |
| | | | | nor funding for Phase-3 of the proje | |
| | | | | y and replicability which will mainl | |
| | | | | gement, and corresponding financia | |
| term regional collaboration and in | nplementation of t | he updated SAP an | d NAPs, as well as | country support to align and mains | tream updated SAP and NAPs |
| priorities in national development | | | | | |
| | | | | tion and is committed to continue ca | |
| activities in support of RGM, SAI | P and NAPs. The I | Project will work cl | losely with the cour | ntries and other project partners to s | ecure commitments and support, |
| | | | | tion of the updated SAP and NAPs | |
| | | ear Sustainable Fin | ancing Plan in sup | port of the SAP and NAPs impleme | ntation and RGM operations, |
| formalized through a Ministerial I | Declaration. | | | | |
| Key Action(s) | Completion | Responsible | | Tracking | STATUS UPDATE |
| | D 4 | | | | |
| | Date | Unit(s) | Status | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) |
| | Date | Unit(s) | Status (initiated; not | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) |
| | Date | Unit(s) | | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from |
| | Date | Unit(s) | (initiated; not | Comments | · · · · · · |
| | Date | Unit(s) | (initiated; not initiated; | Comments | Based on information from |
| | Date | Unit(s) | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no | Comments | Based on information from |
| 1.1 Secure RSC approval on | Date 05 November | Unit(s) | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer | | Based on information from |
| 1.1 Secure RSC approval on the preferred or most | | | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | Comments Building on country recommendations a | Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country |
| | 05 November | | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | Building on country | Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country |

| transition plan at the 4 th RSC Meeting. | | | | upon with National Advisers. Country consultations are ongoing. | consolidated RGM model conducted in Indonesia and Timor-Leste in August 2022, while the consultation in PNG is scheduled on September 21 and 22, 2022. While a zoom meeting is being scheduled with AUS. |
|---|---------------------|---------------------------------|---------------|---|---|
| 1.2 Roll out the transition plan at the regional and national level in cooperation with the countries, including developing the key elements of the RGM | 30 December 2023 | RPMU, NCUs, NPB and RSC | Not initiated | This will serve to test the operation of the RGM before the formal adoption through a Ministerial Declaration. | |
| 1.3 Complete the updated SAP and NAPs and secure country endorsements at NPB and RSC level. | 30 December 2023 | NCUs and RPMU NPB and RSC | Not initiated | | |
| 1.4 Complete the 5-Year cost estimate and Sustainable Financial Plan, conduct country consultations, and coordinate with countries to secure initial country commitments for financial support for RGM and the implementation of updated SAP and NAPs. | 30 December 2023 | RPMU | Initiated | Initial scoping and consultations were undertaken as part of the Financial Landscape Assessment | |
| 1.5 Secure high-level country commitment in all ATS countries to formally recognize the RGM as long-term regional collaboration mechanism by adopting the RGM with Financial Plan, as well as the updated SAP | 30 January 2024 | NCUs and RPMU NPB and RSC | Not initiated | • | |

| achievement of several outcomes finalised appears to be one of the Management Response: The A | s could exceed the funding sources for TSEA-2 Project T AP and NAPs may | lifetime of the AT or a follow-up pha eam is committed serve as basis in d | SEA-2 project and se of the project. to work closely with leveloping the Proje | otential preparation of ATSEA-3 p will require follow-up donor finance on UNDP and PEMSEA and the ATS ct Concept for ATSEA-3 with the P SAP and NAPs. | cing. GEF-8 that is currently being S countries in this endeavor. The |
|--|--|---|---|--|--|
| Key Action(s) | Completion Date | Responsible Unit(s) | Status (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | Tracking Comments | STATUS UPDATE (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country |
| 1.1 Under UNDP's guidance, secure country support and commitment to pursue the development of ATSEA-3 Project through discussion with NPBs and RSC. | 05 November 2022 | UNDP, PEMSEA RSC | Not initiated | The recommendation for Phase 3 will be first discussed at the Project Board meeting on 15 August 2022. It is expected that building from the meeting discussion, next steps will be further clarified. | Status: Initiated Comment: Zoom Meeting with UNDP BRH, UNDP Indonesia PEMSEA and RPMU was conducted on August 26, 2022 wherein further guidance was provided on process requirements to pursue the development of ATSEA-3. As part of the requirements, the same agenda will be included in all NPB meetings in September 2022 to explain the process, rationale and requirements and target securing of initial country support to pursue the development and submission of a project concept for ATSEA-3 The same will be tabled at the 4 th RSC in November 2022. |

| 1.2 In close consultation with | 28 February | UNDP, | Not initiated | | |
|-------------------------------------|--------------------|---------------------|-------------------|---|----------------------------------|
| the ATS member | 2023 | PEMSEA (with | | | |
| countries UNDP (and | | RPMU | | | |
| PEMSEA) to take the lead | | assistance) | | | |
| (with RPMU support) in | | | | | |
| facilitating the | | | | | |
| development of PIF and | | | | | |
| securing of country | | | | | |
| endorsements. | | | | | |
| 1.3 UNDP to facilitate | 31 May 2023 | UNDP, | Not initiated | | |
| submission of country | 2 | PEMSEA, | | | |
| endorsed Project | | RSC/RCC | | | |
| Identification Form (PIF) | | (with RPMU | | | |
| alongside with a Project | | assistance) | | | |
| Preparation Grant (PPG) | | , | | | |
| request for GEF's review | | | | | |
| and approval | | | | | |
| Evaluation Recommendation of | r Issue 6. Re. NIM | IC operationalizat | tion– The RPMU in | <i>i cooperation with PEMSEA and the</i> | NCUs in cooperation with the |
| | | | | nsuring permanent representation of | |
| | | 0 00 | U | nal sustainable development planni | |
| | | | | e national development policy and p | |
| | | | | 2 interventions to the needs and price | |
| | | | | an effective vehicle for mainstreamin | |
| actions into relevant national deve | | 5 1 | | | |
| | | clarify that the NI | MC in PNG has be | en established and has been operatir | ng since 2021, while the NIMC in |
| | | | | nally established through a Declaration | |
| | | | | been completed, however the formal | |
| operationalization of NIMC in Ind | | | | | |
| | | | | ul engagement and function of NIM | C to support mainstreaming of |
| | | | | lization of the NIMC in Indonesia w | |
| | | | | of relevant information and program | |
| | | | | r agenda of the NIMC meetings. Th | |
| | | | | at priority areas that will be identified | |
| submitted for consideration in sub | | | | | |
| Key Action(s) | Completion | Responsible | | Tracking | STATUS UPDATE |
| | Date | Unit(s) | Status | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) |
| | | | (initiated; not | | |
| | | | initiated; | | Based on information from |
| | 1 | | | | DDMU and NCU and soundary |

completed; no

RPMU and NCUs per country

| | | | longer applicable) | | |
|--|---------------------|---|-----------------------|---|--|
| 1.1 Conduct regular NIMC meetings to undertake collaborative planning, discussion, and reporting of progress, strategies and approaches in support of the ATSEA programme, SAP and NAPs. | 10 June 2024 | NCUs NIMCs | Initiated | Note that NIMC meetings in PNG and TL have already been undertaken and will continue on an annual or biannual basis. Subsequent NIMC meetings in all 3 countries will include regular agenda on SAP and NAP joint planning and reporting. | |
| 1.2 Engage the NIMCs in each country in the updating process of SAP and NAPs to identify areas of alignment and support, and secure inputs from the NIMC members in the updated SAP and NAPs and corresponding SAP and NAP Financial Plans. | 30 December 2023 | NCUs NIMCs | Not initiated | The updating of SAP and NAPs are targeted to commence by December 2022 up to 2023 | |
| 1.3 Upon completion and endorsement of the updated SAP and NAPs at NPB/NIMC and RSC/RCC level, secure country commitments to submit key priorities of the SAP and NAPs in their respective country or relevant Ministries development programs or plans. | 30 November 2023 | NCUs and RPMU NIMCs RSC/RCC | Not initiated | The updated SAP and NAPs are expected to be endorsed at least at NPB and RSC level by 2023 | |
| 1.4. Include country commitments to mainstream updated SAP and NAP priorities in their national development planning and programmes | 30 January 2024 | RPMU and NCUs NPBs ATS Countries | Not initiated | The Ministerial Forum is expected to be convened in 2024 | |

| as part of the 2 nd ATS | | | |
|------------------------------------|--|--|--|
| Ministerial Declaration. | | | |

Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 7. Re. RSC Meetings– *PEMSEA and RPMU in cooperation with the Implementing and Executing Agencies should more actively use options for holding ad-hoc intersessional meetings of the RSC to ensure timely approval of important documents, effective management of project risks and endorsement of critical decisions needed for implementation of the project.*

The MTR observed that the RSC has duly executed its oversight function for the project. However, several important documents were prepared and had to wait until the meeting of the RSC. Increased frequency of the RSC meetings will accelerate approval of important decisions for critical actions in the project implementation.

Management Response: The Project would like to clarify that as part of the adopted ToR of the RSC, ad hoc intersessional meetings may be convened upon request. In the past years, the Project has also organized thematic RSC discussion to secure RSC guidance and inputs on crucial regional reports or assessments. One intersessional RSC meeting was also organized in 2020 as part of management response to gauge impact and provide guidance in project implementation at the time of COVID.

Noting the value of accelerating approval and to ensure more effective project management, the ATSEA-2 Project Team concurs with the recommendation and will coordinate and secure RSC approval to put in place a mid-year RSC meeting (preferably virtual to save cost) as part of its regular meetings. The mid-year meetings are envisioned to mainly facilitate intersessional review of key progress as well as review and guide possible adjustment in annual work plan and budget as deemed necessary.

| Key Action(s) | Completion | Responsible | | Tracking | STATUS UPDATE |
|---|---------------------|-------------|---|--|--|
| | Date | Unit(s) | Status (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country |
| 1.1 Secure RSC approval on the inclusion of mid- year/intersessional RSC meeting in its annual activities/meetings, or to organize intersessional high-level thematic discussions as needed. | 05 November 2022 | RPMU | Not initiated | This may form part of the Project Board discussion on August 15, 2022 or may be tabled for further discussion and confirmation at the 4 th RSC Meeting in November 2022. | Status: Initiated Comment: Preparation for RSC ongoing. MTR recommendations and agreed management actions included in the meeting agenda. |
| 1.2 Upon concurrence from RSC, the RPMU to include convening of the mid-year RSC meetings as part of its annual work plan. | 05 November 2022 | RPMU | Not initiated | | |
| | | | | and Engagement of SAP/NAP Im ter information of the target comm | |

is protection and sustainable management of ATS marine and coastal resources through implementation of the regional SAP and related NAPs. More active involvement of target beneficiary communities could be ensured if the local leaders and community-based organisations fully understand the need for the SAP/NAPs actions particularly in cases of impacts of the actions on local livelihood and subsistence challenges.

Management Response: The Project concurs with the MTR recommendation and will pursue the inclusion of development of supporting information materials and conduct of awareness building activities as part of the SAP and NAPs implementation. In particular, local Communication Plan linked to specific target activities at the site levels will be developed and customized on their needs and priorities. Key products and activities to be pursued may include: brochures, posters, project sign boards, community environmental contests, local policy briefs which can serve as reference for public consultations and local strategic planning, targeted information materials and engagement of targeted stakeholders, etc.

| Key Action(s) | Completion | Responsible | | Tracking | STATUS UPDATE |
|---|---------------------|------------------|---|---|---|
| | Date | Unit(s) | Status (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country |
| 1.1 Support NCUs in developing local communication plans to guide information dissemination and stakeholder activities in support of SAP and NAPs implementation | 30 December 2023 | RPMU and NCUs | Not initiated | An ATSEA-2 Communications and Stakeholder Engagement Plan has been developed at the regional level and will serve as guide in further development of specific local communication plans | |
| 1.2 Develop different types of information materials or products and activities that would cater to specific target local stakeholders and beneficiaries | 30 December 2023 | RPMU and NCUs | Not initiated | | |
| 1.3 Tap media networks of ATSEA-2 to facilitate wider reach | 10 June 2024 | RPMU and NCUs | Not initiated | | |

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR INDONESIA COMPONENT

Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 9. Re. Relevance or Attainability of Some End of Project Target and Activities – *The RPMU in cooperation with the NCU Indonesia should conduct a critical revision and reassessment of the following elements of the project SRF which were observed to be either not relevant or not attainable:*

- Modify Activity 2.1.3-8 on IUU fishing through conducting a study to establish a baseline on IUU fishing in FMA 718 in Aru and Merauke areas as project sites
- Modify Activity 2.1.3-10 on improved provincial registration of vessel systems for a more specific definition of the target vessel systems in Maluku and Papua covering three commodities (red snapper, shrimp, and barramundi)
- Revise the EOP target for Indicator 16 through utilization of new MPA management effectiveness scoring of EVIKA and potentially adopt a new indicator for the Kolepom MPA to comply with Indonesian government requirements
- Reconsider relevance of Activity 2.3.2-16 on the feasibility study for ecotourism development in the Kolepom MPA
- Modify Activities 2.3.3-6 and 2.3.3-7 on conducting a feasibility study on alternate livelihood tourism opportunities for the communities in Aru Islands, Rote, and Merauke and possibly other sites through education for local communities on turtles' conservation while providing alternative nature-based livelihoods or capacity building options
- Reconsider relevance of Activity 2.4.3-4 on technical training for maintenance and repair of the solar-powered water desalination units and eventually replace with activities related to water, sanitation, and hygiene (WASH) projects, for access to safe and affordable drinking water
- Modify the EOP targets for under Indicators 13 and 14 to make them clearer and more specific and attainable

Management Response: The Project concurs with the MTR recommendation and will pursue the clarification of each the identified EOPs with concern. In particular, the Project would like to propose modification on the following two (2) targets related to Protected Area Management Effectiveness Score of SE Aru and Support to Water Desalination Plant in Nusa Manuk, for further confirmation with the NPB and RSC:

- (a) In compliance with both the MMAF requirement on the use of the EVIKA system and the ATSEA-2 Project requirement on the use of the METT system, the NCU will pursue assessment for both systems and report results at mid-term (within 2022) and end of project. It should be noted that the Project's end of project METT rating of 92 (from baseline of 39) was also deemed unrealistic taking into consideration that more mature MPAs in Indonesia have yet to reach the rating of 80 METT. Thus, a proposed target of not more than 70 METT (50-85% for EVIKA) will be submitted for consideration as new EOP.
- (b) For target output to provide capacity in maintenance and repair for Nusa Manuk's water desalination plant, it should be noted that the facility has been broken way before the start of the ATSEA-2 project and this was further confirmed in inspections of ATSEA-2. Given the remaining available limited time and resources, the ATSEA-2 Project Team proposes to drop the target and reallocate the intervention to Landu Tii of Rote Ndao which has the same issues as Nusa Manuk on access to clean water. Since the project team already have interventions in the location, there will be higher impact by providing a more comprehensive intervention in Landu Tii. This location was also identified as hotspot for oil spill and climate impact.
- (c) Note: The proposed change in hectare coverage in the newly established MPA in Kolepom is included as part of Management Response under Recommendation or Issue #3.

| Key Action(s) | Completion | | | Tracking | STATUS UPDATE |
|---------------|------------|---------|--------|----------|---------------------------|
| | Date | Unit(s) | Status | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) |
| | | | | | |

| | | | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | | Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country |
|---|----------------------|-----------------------------|--|---|--|
| 1.1 Submit the MTR recommendation and convene the NPB and RSC to secure their approval and to formalize the change of EOP and activity level, as follows: Activity level Baselining IUU fisheries in 718 with specific focus in Aru and Merauke area Improve fishing vessel registration at the provincial level for red snapper, shrimp and barramundi in Maluku and Papua Modify feasibility tourism assessment to feasibility for fisheries processing product or another relevant alternative livelihood Propose changing of location for WASH project from Nusa Manuk to Landu Tii End of Project (EOP) Target: Align EVIKA and METT tracking tools to support management effectiveness in SE Aru Specify the EOP of reduce fishing pressure and | 30 September 2022 | NCUs NIMCs NPB RSC | Initiated | This will be targeted for submission at the NPB meeting for early September 2022 and for further discussion and confirmation at the 4 th RSC Meeting in November 2022. The assessment on fishing vessel from 3 commodities has already been identified in the EAFM assessment and IUU assessment | Status: Initiated Comment: NPB meeting is scheduled on September 20-21, 2022. All meeting documents including targets with suggested modifications included in the agenda. |

| improve use fish/gear techniques based on further assessments 1.2 Collaborate with MMAF and Provincial Government of Maluku and Papua to escalate initiatives on fishing vessel registration | 30 December 2023 | NCUs NIMCs NPB | Initiated | The fisheries fishing vessel registration is already ongoing as part of the EAFM action plan implementation. NCU will further assist the Provincial Governments in the process | |
|--|---|-----------------------|---------------|--|---|
| 1.3 Conduct an assessment on EVIKA and METT for SE Aru to see how EVIKA aligns with the METT system and report both EVIKA and METT scores (at mid-term or within 2022 and end of project) to comply both with the ATSEA-2 project requirement on METT and the internal country requirement on EVIKA. | 30 September 2022 and 30 January 2024 | NCUs NIMCs NPB | Initiated | Expert to do the assessment has been engaged. Result for assessment this 2022 is expected to be available by end of September 2022. The second rating will be done by end of project. | Status: Initiated Comment: Method/guidance for the assessment covering both EVIKA and METT will be discussed at the NPB meeting scheduled on September 20-21, 2022. |
| 1.4 Conduct feasibility study on fisheries processing product or another relevant alternative livelihood | 30 December 2022 | NCUs NIMCs NPB | Initiated | The TOR has been developed and under procurement process from UNDP for Aru and Merauke. The implementation forms part of the EAFM action plan for Red Snapper, Shrimp and Barramundi Feasibility study in Rote Ndao is already available and is being implemented since 2021 | |
| 1.5 Collaborate with MMAF, local government and other partner to manage gap assessment related to water, sanitation, and hygiene (WASH) for access to safe and affordable drinking water in Landu Tii | 30 December 2023 | NCUs NIMCs UNDP | Not initiated | Actions will build on recommendations and will be aligned with ICM action plan that has already been developed | |

Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 10. Re. – Administrative and Procurement Procedures for Indonesia Component- *The UNDP CO in Indonesia in cooperation with the NCU should conduct a critical review of the procurement and other administrative assistance and identify causes of delays.* Several project stakeholders perceive the administrative and procurement procedures under UNDP CO Indonesia causing delays in the project implementation.

Management Response: The ATSEA-2 Project Team is committed to work closely with UNDP procurement unit to identify the gaps or aspects causing delays in the procurement process and to jointly identify strategic actions. The project team also seeks further guidance from UNDP to manage the procurement and financial process from field site locations where there are limited access and facilities.

| Key Action(s) | Completion | Responsible | | Tracking | STATUS UPDATE |
|--|----------------------|---------------------|--|---|---|
| | Date | Unit(s) | Status (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country |
| 1.1 Coordinate with UNDP to identify major issues or cause on delay of administration and procurement processes | 30 September 2022 | NCUs UNDP | Initiated | The issue has been raised and initially discussed at Senior Management Team level, further guidance from UNDP is needed | Status: Initiated Comment: NCU has raised the issues in PSM and PSM has already undertaken actions to speed up the process. A separate discussion is also being arranged to discuss other concerns that are coming from other team (FRMU) requiring a different modality for financial requirement. |
| 1.2 Conduct vendor registration for potential stakeholders that are or will be involved in project implementation and promote potential vendors from hotel, car rentals and other third party particularly in project sites | 30 December 2023 | NCUs NPB UNDP | Initiated | The registration in relation to current activities is already ongoing. More explanation of UNDP procedure will need to be provided to potential vendors in field sites | |
| 1.3 Identify an additional team to support administration and procurement staffing to further | 30 September 2022 | NCUs NPB UNDP | Initiated | The additional scope of work from administration staff from NCU has already been | Status: Initiated |

| 1 C :1: | | | | I I I I NDD TI | Commente Dalata las status |
|---|--------------------|----------------------------|--|--|---------------------------------|
| support and facilitate more | | | | approved by the NPD. The | Comment: Related to status |
| efficient administration | | | | hiring process is ongoing. | under 1.1 above. |
| process and secure approval of | | | | | |
| the same in the NPB meeting | | | | Further process will be | |
| | | | | undertaken for the development | |
| | | | | of TOR for procurement | |
| | | | | support. | |
| Evaluation Recommendation or Is | sue 11. Re NPB | Indonesia Meeting | s- The NCU Ind | lonesia should intensify consultatio | ns with the NPB and UNDP |
| Indonesia for focusing more on perfo | ormance and achiev | ving results through | arrangement of | f the NPB meetings at least semi-ar | nnually (at the middle and the |
| end/beginning of the year). The once | | | | | |
| implementation of the planned activi | | Ð | | 6 | |
| Management Response: The Project | | commendation. In 1 | ine with this. the | ATSEA-2 Project Team has initia | ted in 2021 the convening of at |
| least 2 NPB meeting in a year to trac | | | | | |
| NPB to discuss more strategic issues | | | | | |
| technical meetings with resulting ma | | | | | identified and tackled at |
| Key Action(s) | Completion | Responsible | | Tracking | STATUS UPDATE |
| Key Action(3) | Date | Unit(s) | Status | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) |
| | Date | Umi(s) | | Comments | (as of 15 September 2022) |
| | | | (initiated; | | Based on information from |
| | | | not | | RPMU and NCUs per |
| | | | initiated; | | - |
| | | | | | |
| | | | completed; | | country |
| | | | no longer | | country |
| | | | no longer applicable) | | country |
| 1.1 Coordinate and facilitate | 28 January | NCUs | no longer applicable) Not | The formalization of NIMC | country |
| periodic meetings with NIMCs | 28 January 2024 | NPB | no longer applicable) | will be pursued within 2022. | country |
| | • | | no longer applicable) Not | will be pursued within 2022. Periodic meetings will be | country |
| periodic meetings with NIMCs | • | NPB | no longer applicable) Not | will be pursued within 2022. | country |
| periodic meetings with NIMCs or MMAF related to technical | • | NPB | no longer applicable) Not | will be pursued within 2022. Periodic meetings will be | country |
| periodic meetings with NIMCs or MMAF related to technical | • | NPB | no longer applicable) Not | will be pursued within 2022. Periodic meetings will be convened once NIMC is fully | country |
| periodic meetings with NIMCs or MMAF related to technical issues based on thematic issues | 2024 | NPB UNDP | no longer applicable) Not initiated | will be pursued within 2022. Periodic meetings will be convened once NIMC is fully operational. | country |
| periodic meetings with NIMCs or MMAF related to technical issues based on thematic issues 1.2 NCU to ensure and arrange at | 2024 28 January | NPB UNDP NCUs | no longer applicable) Not initiated | will be pursued within 2022. Periodic meetings will be convened once NIMC is fully operational. NCU will seek further | country |
| periodic meetings with NIMCs or MMAF related to technical issues based on thematic issues 1.2 NCU to ensure and arrange at least 2 (two) NPB meetings in a year focusing more on | 2024 28 January | NPB UNDP NCUs NPB | no longer applicable) Not initiated | will be pursued within 2022. Periodic meetings will be convened once NIMC is fully operational. NCU will seek further assistance from UNDP and consult further with the NPB in | country |
| periodic meetings with NIMCs or MMAF related to technical issues based on thematic issues 1.2 NCU to ensure and arrange at least 2 (two) NPB meetings in | 2024 28 January | NPB UNDP NCUs NPB | no longer applicable) Not initiated | will be pursued within 2022. Periodic meetings will be convened once NIMC is fully operational. NCU will seek further assistance from UNDP and | country |

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR TIMOR-LESTE COMPONENT

Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 12. Re. *Stakeholder Ownership of Project Interventions*– *The Timor-Leste NCU in cooperation with the UNDP CO* should ensure inclusion of additional stakeholders, in particular, local authorities at Suco level need to be more involved in the decision-making on implementation of projects in their areas for reinforcing their ownership of project interventions for community development, coastal management, and environmental protection, in particular with respect to IUU fishing in the Timor Sea

Management Response: The Project notes the findings and recommendations and is fully committed to ensure that key stakeholders are properly informed and engaged in the activities being or to be undertaken in their respective sites or areas, including in Suco as suggested by the MTR. This will be undertaken by ensuring proper identification, notification, and engagement of relevant stakeholders on the different activities as part of the roll out of ICM plan and other livelihood related initiatives in concerned communities. A pre- and post- activity simple survey will also be included as part of regular initiative to track stakeholder feedback and concerns.

| Key Action(s) | Completion | Responsible | | Tracking | STATUS UPDATE |
|----------------------------|------------|-------------|-------------|---------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| | Date | Unit(s) | Status | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) |
| | | | (initiated; | | |
| | | | not | | Based on information from |
| | | | initiated; | | RPMU and NCUs per country |
| | | | completed; | | |
| | | | no longer | | |
| | | | applicable) | | |
| 1.1 With support from site | 08 March | NCU | Initiated | The site mobiliser is already | Status: Initiated |
| mobilizer, identify and | 2024 | | | undertaking actions in mobilizing | |
| engage relevant | | | | relevant stakeholders to ensure that | Comment: Site mobilizer already |
| stakeholders at the site | | | | they are properly informed and | undertaking actions for more active |
| level in various project | | | | engaged in the activities being or to | stakeholder engagement. NCU also |
| activities | | | | be undertaken in their respective | plans to hire additional site |
| | | | | sites or areas, including in Suco | mobilizer. |

Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 13. Re. Measurement of Impacts of Livelihood Initiatives– *The NCU in cooperation with the RPMU should* strengthen the M&E system to reflect the activities more comprehensively as a 'bridge' between UNDP ATSEA 2 project and the Government of Timor-Leste, and to gather evidence on the impact of the community livelihoods support projects in the country.

Management Response:

The Project notes the findings and recommendations and is fully committed to ensure that the M&E system is strengthened to reflect the activities more comprehensively as a 'bridge' between UNDP ATSEA 2 project and the Government of Timor-Leste. The project is already monitoring and reporting impacts of various livelihood activities through the adopted ICM plan etc. and will further ensure extra effort to gather evidence on the impact of the community livelihoods support projects in the country as the ICM Plan implementation progresses. The project is also considering recruiting an M&E officer to support the NCU, with expertise in communication who will further assist the project in communicating its activities and results on the ground as well as their respective impacts on community livelihoods in the country. The M&E for the UNDP country office has also been providing support towards M&E related activities and will strengthen it in coordination with the project site mobilizers to collect all the relevant evidence on the impact of the community livelihood support projects in the country.

| Key Action(s) | Completion | Responsible | | Tracking | STATUS UPDATE |
|---|---------------------|--|--|---|---|
| Date | Date | Unit(s) | Status (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country |
| 1.1 Implement and monitor the impacts of the ICM Plan implementation for Posto Administrative Barique in Manatuto Municipality | 08 March 2024 | ATSEA-2 PMU and UNDP TL CO | Initiated | ATSEA-2 will support specific community-based activities in support of the ICM plan in PA Barique. The activities under the plan will be implemented by a selected NGO following the issuance of a call for proposals, where different NGOs have expressed interest. Final selection of appropriate NGO is expected by September. The community-based activities will include M&E to gather evidence on the impact of the community livelihoods support projects. | |
| 1.2 Recruit an M&E expert to support the NCU | 30 December 2022 | ATSEA- PMU/UNDP TL Country Office | Not initiated | The recruitment of the Communication Assistant/M&E will be initiated and finalized by early 2023 | |
| 1.3. Conduct a refresher training on M&E for relevant project staff | 30 March 2023 | RPMU UNDP CO | Not initiated | A briefing on M&E on basic M&E terminologies and process specific to the requirements of UNDP and GEF in support of ATSEA-2 M&E requirements were provided to the National Project Coordinator by the M&E Specialist of RPMU. However, a refresher training with additional elements on impact/results-based monitoring and reporting is further needed for the national project coordinator as well as other NCU staff. | |

Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 14. Re. Alternative Livelihood Tourism Initiatives – *The NCU in cooperation with the RPMU should conduct comprehensive planning for alternate livelihood support projects for communities in the targeted municipalities. Beneficiary community groups should be supported in development of business plans and sharing of success stories in order to identify opportunities for making the best possible use of their comparative advantages and optimize achievement of results.*

Management Response:

The project takes note of the recommendation and in coordination with RPMU, the beneficiary community groups will be supported accordingly to support sharing of success stories and identifying opportunities for making the best possible use of their comparative advantages and optimize achievement of results. The project is already doing this by offering financial and cooperatives management trainings etc. for the established cooperative and other beneficiary group members. The project will further continue to build on these to continue improving the ability of targeted beneficiary community groups for good and sustainable results.

Four (4) calls for proposals have been issued and potential NGOs/CBOs/CSOs have expressed interest to facilitate the implementation of the specific livelihood activities related to marine turtles conservation, establishment of drought resilient home gardens and ICM plan implementation. The actions to be undertaken includes promotion of ecotourism and livelihood opportunities for the local communities—through the established local groups/cooperatives— while strengthening the management of marine coastal resources. Through these engagements, the selected NGOs will implement activities following a clear business framework and ensure more systematic execution of activities, including monitoring and reporting of impacts or benefits. The capacity of these NGOs/CBOs/CSOs will also be strengthened to further help in sustaining the results.

| Key Action(s) | Completion | Responsible | | Tracking | STATUS UPDATE |
|---|-------------------|---------------------------|--|--|--|
| | Date | Unit(s) | Status (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country |
| 1.1 Complete the process for Call for proposals | 31 August 2022 | UNDP CO ATSEA-2 PMU | Initiated | The review of proposals and contract awards to be finalized in August 2022 and activities implementation to start in September 2022 for a period not exceeding one year. | Status: Completed Comment: Contracts have already been signed by the selected NGO. Implementation of work has just been initiated. |
| 1.2 Coordinate with RPMU for a comprehensive planning to ensure more strategic and systemic design and implementation of targeted alternate livelihood support projects | 31 August 2023 | NCU RPMU | Initiated | Discussions and coordination are ongoing Key strategic points to be considered include: identification of the stakeholders, conduct of pre and post engagement surveys, development and stakeholder consultation and awareness building on a clear business plan for community-based alternative | |

| | | | | livelihoods, and inclusion of regular monitoring of impacts to beneficiaries. | |
|---|------------------|-------------|---------------|---|--|
| 1.3 Carry out and monitor the implementation and impacts of the agreed plans in close consultation with the targeted communities and supporting NGOs/CBOs/CSOs | 08 March 2024 | NCU RPMU | Not initiated | To be undertaken upon roll out of the plans | |

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PAPUA NEW GUINEA COMPONENT

Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 15. Re. Capacity Building for South Fly Artisanal Fishery Management Plan Implementation – *PEMSEA in cooperation with the NCU and RPMU should ensure provision of capacity building on AFMP management and enforcement to the local governments in the SFD communities.* The flagship deliverable for the Papua New Guinea component is the development of the Artisanal Fisheries Management Plan (AFMP for the South Fly District (SFD). It is expected that the Plan will be officially gazetted and will thus become a law to be incorporated into local legislation at the village level. Successful implementation of the Plan will require effective management of the AFMP by the fishing villages' authorities.

Management Response: The Project concurs with the recommendation. The draft SFAFMP which is currently undergoing stakeholder consultation includes an EAFM training to facilitate better understanding and support to the adoption and implementation of the SFAFMP. As part of long-term implementation of the SFAFMP, capacity building plan and support to strengthen enforcement of SFAFMP will be further developed together with NFA and the South Fly Stakeholder Committee once it is formally established by end of 2022/early 2023.

| Key Action(s) Completion Responsib | | | | Tracking | STATUS UPDATE |
|--|----------------|------------------------|--|--|---|
| | Date | Unit(s) | Status (initiated; not initiated; completed; | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country |
| | | | no longer applicable) | | |
| 1.1 Develop training and awareness materials on | 30 November | NCU PNG, Eco | Initiated | EAFM Training materials available, SFAFMP summary information | Status: Initiated |
| the SFAFMP | 2022 | Custodian Advocates | | poster generated as part of the plan development | Comment: SFAFMP summary information disseminated during the |

| 1.2 Conduct EAFM training(s) on the SFAFMP | 31 August 2022 and 31 March 2023 | NCU PNG, Eco Custodian Advocates | Not Initiated | An EAFM training is already targeted to be conducted in August 2022. Additional EAFM training is expected to be conducted by 2023 upon roll out of the SFAFMP | field activity conducted in August 29 to September 2, 2022. Key updates and next steps related to SFAFMP implementation will also be tabled for discussion at the Stakeholder Partnership Forum (SPF) meeting and National Project Board (NPB) meeting in PNG on September 21 and 22, 2022. Status: Completed for 2022 Comment: EAFM Training was conducted from 29 August to 2 September, concurrent with the management plan consultation with fisheries managers in South Fly |
|--|---|---|---------------|---|--|
| 1.3 Conduct Awareness on SFAMP in South Fly villages | 30 June 2023 | NCU PNG | Initiated | Some awareness building activities have been undertaken during the initial field work to collect data. It will be a continuing activity | |
| 1.4 Artisanal fishery data collection training | 31 March 2023 | NCU PNG | Not Initiated | Villagers will be trained on simple data collection so they can collect important data from the start of implementation to monitor effectiveness | |

Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 16. Re. The RPMU in cooperation with PEMSEA and the NCU PNG should conduct a critical revision and reassessment of the EOP targets for Output 2.1.1 in the project SRF:

• Reset the target for Indicator 13 on more sustainable production of dried fish maw to also cover production and use of fish maw carcass;

• Redefine the target for Indicator 14 on improved use of fishing gears by artisanal fisheries in line with the South Fly Fore-coast AFMP

Indicators 13 and 14 in the project SRF are poorly defined and there are no specific activities defined in the Project Document for achievement of the respective EOP targets for PNG. Assessments completed under the project proved that the EOP targets were determined based on outdated baseline data and therefore unrealistic and unclear.

Management Response: For supporting information, it should be noted that the production and trade of dried fish maw remains to be unregulated in PNG which makes monitoring and reporting difficult at this time. In line with this, NFA is in the process of developing a management plan for the fish maw fishery. As part of that process, NFA will be collecting data on fish maw harvest including in South Fly. This NFA work aligns with ATSEA-2 objectives for managing fish maw harvest. The project will collaborate with NFA on fish maw management in South Fly. The project therefore concurs with the recommendation. To address this, further surveys have to be conducted in South Fly communities to collect quantitative data on current fish maw harvest and the fishing gear used by the artisanal fishers to complement some baseline data collected for the artisanal fisheries management plan. Once the key fish maw target species have been identified and their populations have been estimated then their sustainable harvest rate can be determined and harvest quota set.

| fishing gear use and the gear res Key Action(s) | Completion Resp | Responsible | Tracking | | STATUS UPDATE |
|--|-------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|--|--|
| | | Unit(s) | - | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country |
| 1.1 Collaborate with NFA and develop a field work proposal for fish maw data collection | 30 September 2022 | NFA, NCU PNG | Initiated | NFA has started on the proposal in 2022 and the proposal is at review stage. | Status: Initiated Comment: Collection of fish maw harvest data has been initiated. Villagers who attended the EAFM training (Aug 29-Sept. 2, 2022) were asked to also complete the dataset on fish maw harvest. The same dataset is currently being validated by the National TDA updating team in PNG. Presentation and further discussion on the fish maw data collection is part of the agenda of the SPF and NPB meetings in PNG scheduled on September 20-21, 2022. |
| 1.2 Conduct quantitative data collection on fish maw harvest and the use of fish carcass | 31 March 2023 | NFA, NCU PNG | Not initiated | There will be primary data collected for the TDA updating process. Some of these data will be on fish maw harvest which will complement the data collected by NFA and ATSEA project for fishery management in South Fly. | |
| 1.3 Sustainable harvest assessment and fish maw harvest target setting 1.4 Confirm baseline data on | 28 April 2023 | NFA, NCU PNG NFA, NCU | Not initiated Not initiated | There will be further primary data | |
| fishing gear use and based on this set the targets for the SFAFMP | December 2022 | PNG | | collected for the TDA updating process to update or confirm baseline data on fishing gear use. | |

| 1.5 Assess/monitor | 10 June | NFA, NCU | Not initiated | | |
|--|---------------------------------------|------------------------|---|---|--|
| compliance of small- | 2024 | PNG | | | |
| scale fishers on the | | | | | |
| SFAFMP on the use of | | | | | |
| sustainable fishing gears | | | | | |
| and techniques | | | | | |
| Evaluation Recommendation | or Issue 17. F | Re. Other Resou | irces for Stren | gthening of Community Livelihood | Activities – PEMSEA and UNDP in |
| cooperation with the RPMU and | d PNG NCU sho | uld assess option | ns for re-allocati | on of the project funds to the PNG comp | ponent and consider reaching out to the |
| private sector (e.g. Ok Tedi De | velopment Four | ndation) for join | t activities and a | additional support to implementation o | f community level activities, including |
| linking with the GEF Small Gra | ants Programme | e in PNG and with | th the Australian | High Commission in PNG. Budget all | ocation for the PNG component in the |
| approved Project Document is | underestimated a | and lack of fundi | ing can negative | ly affect roll out of the South Fly AFM | IP and completion of the first NAP for |
| PNG. Implementation of comm | unity-level livel | lihood activities i | in the SFD will | be strengthened through attracting addit | tional resources from various available |
| sources of financing. | - | | | | |
| Management Response: The p | project concurs v | with the recomme | endation. The N | CU PNG will discuss the budgetary con | straints of the PNG component with |
| RPMU, PEMSEA, and UNDP a | and explore option | ons for making fu | unding available | to successful implementation and comp | bletion of projects in PNG. NCU PNG |
| will also conduct joint planning | as part of its per | riodic NPB and N | NIMC/SPF meet | ings to discuss with NFA and other dev | elopment partners potential |
| collaboration and co-financing s | | | | | |
| C C | | , | 1 | | |
| | 1 | | | | |
| Key Action(s) | Completion | Responsible | | Tracking | STATUS UPDATE |
| Key Action(s) | Completion Date | Responsible Unit(s) | Status | Tracking Comments | STATUS UPDATE (as of 13 September 2022) |
| Key Action(s) | Completion Date | Responsible Unit(s) | Status (initiated: | Tracking Comments | STATUS UPDATE (as of 13 September 2022) |
| Key Action(s) | - | | Status (initiated; not | | |
| Key Action(s) | - | | (initiated; not | | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from |
| Key Action(s) | - | | (initiated; not initiated; | | (as of 13 September 2022) |
| Key Action(s) | - | | (initiated; not initiated; completed; | | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from |
| Key Action(s) | - | | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer | | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from |
| | Date | Unit(s) | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country |
| 1.1 Develop 2023 AWP and | Date 31 August | | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer | Comments 2023 AWP and budgeted planning | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from |
| Develop 2023 AWP and budget (including a work | Date | Unit(s) | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | Comments | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country Status: Initiated |
| 1.1 Develop 2023 AWP and budget (including a work plan and budget | Date 31 August | Unit(s) | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | Comments 2023 AWP and budgeted planning | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country Status: Initiated Comment: The proposed AWP and |
| 1.1 Develop 2023 AWP and budget (including a work plan and budget estimation for 2024) and | Date 31 August | Unit(s) | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | Comments 2023 AWP and budgeted planning | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country Status: Initiated Comment: The proposed AWP and Budget for 2023 as well as |
| 1.1 Develop 2023 AWP and budget (including a work plan and budget estimation for 2024) and discuss with RPMU, | Date 31 August | Unit(s) | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | Comments 2023 AWP and budgeted planning | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country Status: Initiated Comment: The proposed AWP and Budget for 2023 as well as projections for 2024 have been |
| 1.1 Develop 2023 AWP and budget (including a work plan and budget estimation for 2024) and | Date 31 August | Unit(s) | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | Comments 2023 AWP and budgeted planning | (as of 13 September 2022)Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per countryStatus: InitiatedComment: The proposed AWP and Budget for 2023 as well as projections for 2024 have been developed and will be submitted for |
| 1.1 Develop 2023 AWP and budget (including a work plan and budget estimation for 2024) and discuss with RPMU, | Date 31 August | Unit(s) | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | Comments 2023 AWP and budgeted planning | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country Status: Initiated Comment: The proposed AWP and Budget for 2023 as well as projections for 2024 have been developed and will be submitted for review by PNG's NPB which is |
| 1.1 Develop 2023 AWP and budget (including a work plan and budget estimation for 2024) and discuss with RPMU, | Date 31 August | Unit(s) | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | Comments 2023 AWP and budgeted planning | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country Status: Initiated Comment: The proposed AWP and Budget for 2023 as well as projections for 2024 have been developed and will be submitted for review by PNG's NPB which is scheduled to meet on September 22, |
| 1.1 Develop 2023 AWP and budget (including a work plan and budget estimation for 2024) and discuss with RPMU, PEMSEA and UNDP | Date 31 August 2022 | Unit(s) NCU PNG | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) Initiated | Comments 2023 AWP and budgeted planning in progress | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country Status: Initiated Comment: The proposed AWP and Budget for 2023 as well as projections for 2024 have been developed and will be submitted for review by PNG's NPB which is scheduled to meet on September 22, 2022. |
| 1.1 Develop 2023 AWP and budget (including a work plan and budget estimation for 2024) and discuss with RPMU, PEMSEA and UNDP 1.2 Discuss and establish | Date 31 August 2022 31 March | Unit(s) NCU PNG | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) | Comments 2023 AWP and budgeted planning in progress As part of NFA's co-financing | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country Status: Initiated Comment: The proposed AWP and Budget for 2023 as well as projections for 2024 have been developed and will be submitted for review by PNG's NPB which is scheduled to meet on September 22, |
| 1.1 Develop 2023 AWP and budget (including a work plan and budget estimation for 2024) and discuss with RPMU, PEMSEA and UNDP 1.2 Discuss and establish formal arrangements | Date 31 August 2022 | Unit(s) NCU PNG | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) Initiated | Comments 2023 AWP and budgeted planning in progress As part of NFA's co-financing commitment to the Project, a more | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country Status: Initiated Comment: The proposed AWP and Budget for 2023 as well as projections for 2024 have been developed and will be submitted for review by PNG's NPB which is scheduled to meet on September 22, 2022. Status: Initiated |
| 1.1 Develop 2023 AWP and budget (including a work plan and budget estimation for 2024) and discuss with RPMU, PEMSEA and UNDP 1.2 Discuss and establish | Date 31 August 2022 31 March | Unit(s) NCU PNG | (initiated; not initiated; completed; no longer applicable) Initiated | Comments 2023 AWP and budgeted planning in progress As part of NFA's co-financing | (as of 13 September 2022) Based on information from RPMU and NCUs per country Status: Initiated Comment: The proposed AWP and Budget for 2023 as well as projections for 2024 have been developed and will be submitted for review by PNG's NPB which is scheduled to meet on September 22, 2022. |

| (e.g. Small Grants Programme, Australian High Commission, etc.) for in cash or in-kind support on specific ATSEA-2 PNG activities | | | | ATSEA-2 PNG AWP and Budget for 2023 and 2024 to facilitate targeted delivery of NFA's support. Moreover, talks of MOU or LOA with Australian High Commission have been initiated but further discussions need to be conducted to identify more concrete collaboration | Commission (AHC) with PNG wherein AHC expressed initial support to target activities related to South Fly. |
|--|---------------|-----------------|---------------|--|---|
| | | | | and actions. | |
| 1.3 Discuss with NFA to mainstream National | 31 March 2023 | NCU PNG, NFA | Not initiated | | |
| Secretariat role as part of | 2025 | | | | |
| a functional unit of NFA | | | | | |
