

Final Management Response Template

Terminal Evaluation, CCR UNDP Somalia

December 10, 2019

| <p>Recommendation No. 1: Region-specific Programming Approach:</p> <p>The implementation context in the three project targeted regions is diverse. In particular, the lack of government capacity and security situation have significantly affected implementation in South Central region as compared to Somaliland and Puntland. Therefore, it is recommended that any future projects consider these realities in mind while determining implementation approaches. For instance, while partnership with government can in fact lead to positive results in Somaliland and Puntland, alternative strategies such as collaboration with local NGOs and CBOs are likely to be the more practical option in South Central.</p> | | | | |
|---|-------------|------------|--|--|
| <p>Management Response: Agreed</p> <p>The project activities were mainly oriented towards Puntland and Somaliland as per the approved project document. This was considering the ground realities and challenges of access to areas that had to be covered under the project. However, project design also included small number of community level interventions and setting-up of Agro-pastoral schools in South Central regions. These activities did suffer due to security situation resulting in either slow progress in implementation or inability to implement the activities. Based on the recommendations of Mid-term Review these activities were dropped in the second half of implementation phase of the project.</p> <p>Point on following alternative strategies such as collaboration with local NGOs and CBOs is well noted. This would be considered during the implementation of LDCF II project on Integrated Water Resources Management (IWRM). The vulnerability of communities in the South Central to the impacts of climate change is also very high. Partnerships with NGOs and CBOs for building resilience of rural population remains high and different implementation strategies can be used to reach out to these communities.</p> | | | | |
| Key Action | Responsible | Due Date | Status (Initiated, in progress, completed) | Comments |
| 1.1. Consideration for the region-specific Programming Approach. | Project | Q4 of 2020 | Initiated | Capacity building, Operational and Technical support for the newly formed states (Galmudug, Hir-Shabelle, South West and Jubaland) are part of the ongoing LDCF2 |

| | | | | | |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| | | | | | <p>Integrated Water Resource Management project. Also, the LDCF2 project will engage the water ministries of all states in the implementation of water related interventions to strengthen local ownership and the long-term sustainability.</p> |
| <p>Recommendation No. 2: SECTORAL FOCUS</p> <p>LDCF I design was focused on multiple sectors, including water resources, DRM, and livelihoods. While these issues are inter-related, the lack of inter-activity/inter-component linkages led to fragmented programming. This approach not only stretched the technical and M&E resources but also led to the dilution of project results. It is therefore recommended that future projects are designed using a Theory of Change, where the links between different outcomes and outputs are clearly defined.</p> <p>Moreover, instead of focusing on multiple activities, it is recommended that a particular activity is designated as the pivot around which the rest of the outputs and activities are built. In the context of Somalia, two such fundamental issues are water resources and livestock. For instance, improvements in water resources can be linked with diversified agricultural livelihoods, better health and hygiene, and reduced livestock stress. Similarly, a project focusing on livestock development can contribute to improved animal productivity through investments in water and feed resources, while support to processing and market linkages can result in improved incomes. In this regard, value addition activities such as livestock fattening to be undertaken with communities and export of frozen meat through support to private sector can be lucrative in the context of Somalia. As LDCF II is already designed to concentrate on water management, it is recommended that a similar project is designed around livestock resources.</p> <p>Another important consideration in such a scoping exercise would be defining the beneficiary group. In particular, it has been observed that while the effects of climate change and disasters are uniform for all, women are particularly vulnerable due to their extensive involvement in natural resource management, e.g. livestock rearing and caregiving responsibilities for the household. Further, in Somalia women are considered as savvy entrepreneurs having made their mark in all variety of local businesses. It is therefore recommended that instead of allocating specific activities to women development, women’s role as key project stakeholders is banked upon as this social group is likely to be the most responsive to any outside support due to their comparatively higher vulnerability.</p> | | | | | |

Management Response: Agreed

Theory of Change: Recently approved LDCF II/ Integrated Water Resource Management Project and (under formulation) Green Climate Fund (GCF) project have incorporated the recommendation. Theories of Change for these projects have been developed in consultation with the stakeholders and should provide focus and strategic direction during the implementation.

The LDCF I project aimed at building resilience to the impacts of climate change. Given Somalia’s exposure to droughts and floods, key interventions were to showcase innovative water management options in the context of changing climate. Project resources were not adequate to expand the activities to diversify agriculture-based livelihoods, livestock improvement and developing value chains around livestock products. Recommendations on these areas will be considered during implementation of LDCF II and Green Climate Fund (GCF) projects. Also, partnerships will be broadened to work closely with Food and Agriculture (FAO), USAID and others working on livestock improvement and markets development.

Strengthening women role as key stakeholders and ensuring that they are meaningfully represented is crucial and has been fully integrated in the LDCF II with a stand-alone outcome “Gender mainstreaming, knowledge management and M&E” along with the development of gender analysis and action plan based on a Vulnerability Assessment conducted in 2017 by the UNDP Somalia Office. LDCF II will also develop Integrated Water Resource Management strategy that will be gender-sensitive and will take into account the societal roles and responsibilities of women. This will ensure women are active in decision making on climate actions. Likewise, Women will be trained to have employment with water quality testing and monitoring. Women are often most susceptible to water-borne diseases, so role for women in ensuring good water quality is essential for sustainable management. LDCF II project will enable women to build an asset base that will make them more resilient to climate change through trainings and diversification of livelihoods. Furthermore, the National Women’s Union will continue to be involved and consulted in order to ensure women are properly trained and engaged. Gender-focused NGOs/CSOs will have the role of conducting gender-disaggregated surveys to ensure women develop skills to diversify their livelihoods and are involved in decision-making.

Furthermore, the LDCF II project will support agro-pastoralists, including women, to build resilience by diversifying their livelihoods (e.g., nursery establishment and hydroponic fodder production). LDCF II funds will be used to provide a gradual transition that allows time for adaptation with on-the-pasture, on-the-farm field demonstration sites. These sites will provide extensive training on how to exploit the value chain of livestock goods such as production of milk, yogurts and cheeses for both men and women. LDCF II will also promote women-based groups to have sustainable businesses focused on the production and sale of value chain products. Such an approach will build on the entrepreneurial spirit of Somali women, use existing women-based groups and provide women with alternate livelihoods and sources of income.

| Key Action | Responsible | Due Date | Status (Initiated, in progress, completed) | Comments |
|------------|-------------|----------|--|----------|
|------------|-------------|----------|--|----------|

| | | | | |
|---|----------------|-------------------|-----------------|--|
| <p>2.1. Re-designing future Projects theory of change an interlinking water, DRM, and livelihood interventions across all components and outputs.</p> | <p>Project</p> | <p>Q4 of 2019</p> | <p>Achieved</p> | <p>The theory of change of the current LDCF2/IWRM Project fully takes into account this recommendation and has fully reconciled water resources, DRM, and Livelihood interventions across all outcomes and outputs</p> |
| <p>Recommendation No. 3: Community Partnership</p> <p>While the LDCF I project developed strong partnerships with many important stakeholders, effective community partnership was seen to be lacking. For instance, despite being the primary beneficiaries of activities under Component 2, communities were only involved in the initial decision making regarding project site selection. Conversely, their role was non-existent or negligible when it came to contributing to the construction cost of infrastructure schemes. Similarly, although communities were to be the long-term custodians of the newly developed schemes, there has been a lack of discussion regarding the sustainability plans, e.g. financial requirements, ownership arrangements, and technical knowledge for operations and maintenance. As seen on the section on sustainability, all these factors adversely affect the continued operations of these schemes.</p> <p>It is therefore recommended that future similar programs develop a thorough community partnership strategy. In addition, sustainability plans need to be factored into the feasibility studies of infrastructure schemes while exploring different alternatives, e.g. community ownership, public-private partnership, and even support to private sector for generation of resilience-based businesses. Similarly, the communities need to be made aware of the concepts of water metering, rationing, and user fees, etc.</p> | | | | |
| <p>Management Response: Agreed</p> <p>In Somalia context, implementation capacities for multi-year climate adaptation projects is evolving. In the past, tendency had been towards short-term humanitarian response activities due to the recurring shocks and low capacities of institutions and local communities to absorb these shocks. LDCF I project was the first multi-year climate adaptation project that started engaging vulnerable communities to take actions to address root causes with medium to long-term perspective. As such, future projects will build on initial work of LDCF I. This will also ensure sustainability of investments. Ownership of communities is the starting point of infrastructure investments. As the communities mature and reduce their dependency on humanitarian support, stronger systems around community funds for O&M, public-private partnerships, scaling up resilience-based businesses and performance-based contracts with private contractor will be used to ensure sustainability.</p> | | | | |

The recommendation is fully integrated into the future LDCF II project partnership strategy. The details of the activities and implementation structures will be designed, partnerships for action will be forged and stakeholder engagement will focus around these design processes. Private sector will be engaged, particularly as part of improving network of weather and climate forecasting equipment. Also, private sector, particularly related to the livestock industry and water supply will play an important in O&M for large water infrastructure through PPP structures and in creating opportunities for employment through value chain opportunities. As a general practice, large infrastructure will be maintained with government appointed companies through a Public Private Partnership while small infrastructure such as berkedes will be maintained by community Water User Associations (WUAs).

| Key Action | Responsible | Due Date | Status (Initiated, in progress, completed) | Comments |
|--|-------------|------------|--|--|
| 3.1. Developing a thorough community partnership strategy and public-private partnership, for the future similar projects to extend ownership and generation of sustainable resilience-based businesses | Project | Q3 of 2020 | Initiated | Part of recently approved IWRM project partnership strategy. |

Recommendation No. 4: Knowledge Management:
 The LDCF I has generated a vast amount of literature, often in subjects on which there is limited prior factual information available in the country. For instance, the project has drafted policies, generated disaster maps, developed CCA-based curriculum, produced district disaster plans, and undertaken baseline surveys, feasibility studies, and detailed infrastructure designs, etc. However, despite their general utility to a variety of audiences, these documents are presently available only to the direct stakeholders of the project. It is therefore recommended that the project ensures ready availability and access of this knowledge base to the general public. One method of doing this would be to establish a website for LDCF II project and upload these documents on a section of this website.

Moreover, while the impact of the project is readily visible in many instances, it is not easy to either quantify or collate this impact. It is therefore recommended that a systematic impact assessment is undertaken of different project activities, while quantifying results such as number of direct and indirect beneficiaries, impact on community survival, adoption of new resilience strategies due to enhanced knowledge, generation of alternative livelihoods, and increase in incomes, etc. Such an exercise will not only help quantify project results, it will help highlight the highest impact activities to inform future planning by UNDP-GEF, the Government of Somalia, and other donors in the country.

Management Response: Agreed:

LDCF II website will be developed by Q2 of 2020 and the knowledge products from LDCF I will be uploaded on this website. Also, UNDP's Adaptation Learning Mechanism (ALM) will be used as a dissemination and sharing tool that is accessible by all and regularly updated with most recent information from the projects.

During the baseline assessment of LDCF II, impact analysis of LDCF I will also be undertaken. The focus would be on impact of LDCF I interventions in reducing vulnerabilities to climate change, cost effectiveness and improvement from baseline situation of LDCF 1 to date.

| Key Action | Responsible | Due Date | Status (Initiated, in progress, completed) | Comments |
|---|-------------|----------|--|---|
| 4.1. Making project knowledge available and accessible to the public and undertaking a systematic impact assessment to document impacts. | Project | Q4 2020 | Initiated and supported by the LDCF2 follow up project | knowledge management and M&E part of the outcome 4 of the newly launched LDCF2 project. |

Recommendation No. 5: Project Management:

LDCF I implementation approach was based on partnership with a number of stakeholders. While a number of these stakeholders were seen to perform well in the respective area of work, the lack of active collaboration among them led the project to be implemented in silos. Consequently, the project was not able to generate synergies and complementarities which could have significantly contributed to organizational capacity building and implementation efficiency. It is therefore recommended that future projects devise mechanisms for proactive collaboration led by UNDP. This can take the form of regular, i.e. quarterly or biannual review meetings and information exchange workshops, etc.

Moreover, as the project was geographically widely spread, the M&E team in the field was stretched. Similarly, at times conflict on ground can hinder monitoring. Therefore, it is recommended that UNDP makes more frequent use of Third Party Monitoring arrangements.

With regards to financial management, as a number of partner agencies in Somaliland and Puntland now have stronger capacity, future interventions can pay funds for six months in advance as compared to the current practice of quarterly advances. This will give further freedom to the partners in planning their activities, build capacities for comparatively longer-term planning, and also reduce the transaction time involved in the higher frequency of transfers.

In addition, it is recommended that gender mainstreaming training and support is made an integral part of the organizational capacity building initiatives. This can potentially include recruitment of competent women staff at both the PIT and partner levels, and a strategy to systematically address gender concerns when working with communities.

Further, while the LDCF I project was focused on resilience, in the interest of expediency of response the 2016 drought response project was implemented through the umbrella of the LDCF I. While this initiative paid off in the short-run, it created confusion among the implementing partners and even the M&E team regarding the objectives and activities of LDCF I. It is therefore recommended that when implementing parallel projects, all stakeholders must be provided clear communication regarding the differences across the individual projects, while reporting should also be segregated in order to ensure clarity.

Management Response: Partially Agreed

Structural measures for proactive collaboration would be institutionalised for the LDCF II project. This was tried during the implementation of LDCF I project but had challenges due to formation of new administrative units in Somalia. For example, 4 new states were formed during implementation phase of LDCF I. This involved formation of new institutions with very basic capacities to interact at national level. As the institutions mature it would be possible to have systems in place of proactive collaboration for synergies and implementation efficiency.

UNDP Country Office has third party monitoring systems in place. More frequent use of TPM will be ensured in the implementation of LDCF II and pipeline projects.

The financial disbursements to the implementation partners depend on capacity assessment of each implementing partner. A risk rating is defined, and UNDP Country Office decide on payment modalities and duration of funding. Quarterly disbursement is considered safest with low or moderate level of risks. Also, this helps in ensuring that any reshuffle at political level minimise the chances of misappropriation of project resources.

The recommendation on clear communication while implementing parallel projects is well noted. However, UNDP enterprise resource planning system did ensure that funds for these projects are separately managed.

| | Key Action | Responsible | Due Date | Status (Initiated, in progress, completed) | Comments |
|--|---|-------------|------------|--|--|
| | 5.1. Building Proactive collaboration of future projects through quarterly or biannual | UNDP | Q3 of 2020 | Initiated and supported by the | Similar arrangements part of the the newly launched LDCF2 project. |

| | | | | |
|---|-------------|------------|--|---|
| review meetings and information exchange workshops, etc. | | | LDCF2 follow up project | |
| <p>Recommendation No. 6: Building on LDCF-I Outcomes</p> <p>Since LDCF I generated a number of outputs in the areas of policy, planning, and water resources, it is recommended that future projects build on this progress. For instance, the community need assessments and district level disaster plans must be used as a foundation for future programming in these areas. Similarly, water structures established by the project should now be capitalized upon to build longer term resilience by initiating agriculture and livestock-based livelihood and food security programming, as well as awareness on water-related health and hygiene practices, etc.</p> <p>Similarly, opportunities for linking LDCF I outcomes to other projects and funding sources should be explored. For instance, strengthened cooperatives can potentially be further linked to GEF Small Grants Program (GEF-SGP) funding.</p> | | | | |
| <p>Management Response: Agreed</p> <p>This is fully incorporated in the recently launched LDCF II project and soft pipeline Green Climate Fund project. The potential for replication of adaptation interventions is high under the recently launched LDCF II follow up project due to several actions: Firstly, the Integrated Water Resources Management strategy will guide water access initiatives strategically. Similarly, building national capacities for hydro-meteorological monitoring and alert dissemination rather than relying on donor agencies will enable warnings to be much more easily produced in a timely manner. By tailoring warnings, tens of thousands of agro-pastoralists will receive targeted early warnings and contingency plans via mobile phone. A field approach will provide an avenue to adapt traditional knowledge with new practices, which improves the chances of replicability due to the familiarity of the approach to other farmers. As part LDCF I and in the implementation of LDCF II, UNDP will ensure influencing other development partners, such as, World Bank, European Union, African Development Bank and GIZ.</p> <p>Federal Government of Somalia has expressed interest to initiate GEF Small Grants Programme. This expected to be launched in 2021. Linking LDCF I outcomes will GEF-SGP will be explored during the formulation phase of the later.</p> | | | | |
| Key Action | Responsible | Due Date | Status (Initiated, in progress, completed) | Comments |
| 6.1. Building on LDCF-I Outcomes especially water structures established by the | UNDP | Q4 of 2020 | Initiated | This is fully incorporated in the recently launched LDCF2 project and |

| | | | | |
|--|--|--|--|--|
| project for longer term resilience of the future projects including agriculture , livestock-based livelihood and food security programming, as well as awareness on water-related health and hygiene practices, etc. | | | | soft pipeline Green Climate Funds ``Resilient Rangelands in Somalia``. |
|--|--|--|--|--|