

***“Addressing climate change vulnerabilities and risks in vulnerable coastal areas of Tunisia<sup>1</sup>”***

**Project Title:** Addressing climate change vulnerabilities and risks in vulnerable coastal areas of Tunisia

**Project PIMS #:** 4697

**GEF Project ID (PMIS) #:** 5105

**Midterm Review Mission Completion Date:** 09/08/2019

**Date of Issue of Management Response:** 31/08/2019

**Prepared by:** UNDP Tunisia Country Office, Project manager

**Cleared by:** UNDP GEF RTA

## **Context, background and findings**

This project proposes a risk-based approach to Climate Change Adaptation by enabling flexible adaptation pathways which will build resilience to climate change and provide maximum co benefits. As tourism is a dominate source of revenue for the region, a set of economic instruments will be devised to signal the existing risks and drive future hotel and private residence development, including investments, away from vulnerable areas. With such an approach, local development plans will be made more risk-based and climate compatible. Both the public and private sectors will serve as important catalysts for adaptation interventions and in supporting coastal monitoring.

The project proposes a risk-based approach to Climate Change Adaptation (CCA) by enabling flexible adaptation pathways, which will build resilience to climate change and provide maximum co-benefits. As tourism is a dominate source of revenue for the region, a set of economic instruments are proposed to be devised to signal the existing risks and drive future hotel and private residence development, including investments, away from vulnerable areas. With such an approach, local development plans are proposed to be made more risk-based and climate compatible.

The project was designed to support the Government of Tunisia in the design and implementation of baseline coastal adaptation measures on the ground in the northwest coast of the Gulf of Tunis and the Island of Djerba by strengthening (APAL's) capacity to consider a whole approach system for coastal management for medium and long -term impacts of climate change as well as vulnerabilities across key sectors (tourism, agriculture, fisheries, water) and to facilitate the implementation of appropriate soft solutions in other interventions by giving APAL the expertise to exploit existing coastal monitoring data, consider climate change scenarios, generate risk-based assessments and recommend appropriate soft protection measures and monitoring schemes).

To achieve these objectives, the project was to develop around the following main results:

- **Outcome 1:** Institutional capacity to plan for and respond to increasing climate change risks in coastal areas is improved;

---

<sup>1</sup> This template is in alignment with the [Management Response Template](#) for UNDP project-level evaluations in the Evaluation Resource Centre.

- **Outcome 2:** Climate change resilience of priority coastal areas enhanced through implementation and dissemination of innovative risk reduction measures covering 22 km of coast and 670 hectares of wetland and benefiting 150,000 inhabitants;
- **Outcome 3:** Innovative and sustainable economic instruments established to accelerate country-wide adoption and up scaling of proven coastal adaptation measures.

As pointed in the MTR, the project has achieved several expected outputs during the first 3 years of implementation while others are delayed.

Importantly, and on several fronts, the project has generated substantive results. Overall the project is more or less on the track when it comes to achieving Outcome 1 and 2, despite the delays and institutional challenges to coordinate between many stakeholders. Outcome 3.2, on the other hand, is significantly off-track, despite its importance and the project. The MTR evaluation of the Projects Results Framework/Strategic Results Framework has not found any significant weaknesses that impact upon final project delivery. Outcomes indicate change, since each one of the three project outcomes has, as the target, an altered future state. They are relevant as Tunisia still appears to be highly committed to the stated objectives of the project (which is equally reflected in the latest Tunisian NDC and Third National Communication).

The attainment of the Outcome 1's objective has made a relatively good progress, in spite of the difficulties and barriers to the project's implementation, particularly the political instability in Tunisia at the outset of the project. Basic studies have been completed though institutional resilience in the coastal and water sectors in Tunisia, coupled with difficulty in reaching out to other administrative stakeholders and institutions, in particular with regards to ICZM, still remain.

The objective of Outcome 2 focuses on the implementation of pilot projects. While the overall progress towards reaching that objective is marginal at present, bear conference and obstacles that have faced the project at the start, implementation of this outcome's activities is at the point where a major breakthrough in understanding and mainstreaming has yet to be made. Actual improvements (coastal resilience) on the ground cannot yet be seen because the interventions are only really demonstrated (1km of ganivelle) at pilot project only. However, the activities of the project have started to show some results at the institutional level, particularly with the growing conviction among the APAL management that adaptation to climate change may include "soft" engineering solutions, in addition to "hard" measures.

Regarding project budget disbursements, Outcome 1 has now spent 79% of allocated Outcome total spent). Outcome 2 has now spent 44% of allocated Outcome total spent whilst Outcome 3 has now spent 9% of allocated Outcome total spent. The above observations suggest that with the remaining time left for the project (up to 31 December 2019), there may need to be consideration over the reallocation of budget from remaining under spent budgets Outcome 2 over to Outcome 1. This would therefore amount to a re-allocation of nearly US\$200,000 from Outcome 2 to Outcome 1. This possibly re-allocation of funds are justified because there is a major risk that the good “on the ground” pilot work carried out in Component 2 may not be effectively realised as the actions are currently being undertaken within an ICZM policy “vacuum” in Tunisia unless the necessary legislative and policy tools are properly endorsed by Cabinet and decision makers.

Regarding communications, it is pleasing to report that direct beneficiaries reported satisfaction with the communication between them and the Project. The PMU appears to have worked very well together as a Management team and good communication feedback has been received from stakeholders and NGOs around Tunisia. The recent inclusion of the two Regional Coordination Assistants to help support PMU activities and to improve outreach and communication to the project pilot areas in Djerba and Ghar el Melh has certainly improved project messaging and delivery on the ground. There remains a continued need for project consultation processes to be improved upon at all levels. In particular it is evident that communication needs to better convey project output visibility as part of the CaVP.

One major risk to the projects long term sustainability is linked to the current institutional structure and operation of APAL. The MTR believes there is a real risk to the final completion of the project unless a revision is made to its institutional structure soon. With regards to project management arrangements, a key element that requires attention is associated with the need to review the institutional structure of APAL to help deliver the remaining outputs of the project. For example, the current institutional structure of APAL is creating a heavy workload on the National Project Coordinator, the Project Manager and the remainder of the PMU team.

The missing piece of the ‘sustainability’ jigsaw in Tunisia, despite the efforts so far within Outcome 1, appears to be a weak and unenforceable planning system that now needs to be modernized. This is because without this in place, the Coastal Master Plans being produced will quickly become outdated (e.g. for Djerba). Coupled with this, the outputs of Outcome 3.2 are critical for GovT to embrace and convey to public, private and the insurance sector in Tunisia. The projects financial sustainability hinges on practical and implementable guidance that hopes to be produced from Component 3. APAL also need to better engage themselves in this topic.

The clear message from stakeholders is that the SCCF project funds have been useful to start the ICZM process, but now efforts to implement and upscale actions on the ground are needed. Whilst it can be strongly argued that the SCCF project has changed hearts and minds towards the need for long term delivery of ICZM and mainstreaming of CC adaptation into general development planning for the whole country, there now needs to be tangible activities in support of achieving this over the long term. From an adaptive point of view, the Grant process (Activity 1.1.5) has provided Tunisian Municipalities with good examples of the type of activities that could be supported with development funds for CC adaptation.

During the next PIR reporting period (2019), the project will need to embrace the Recommendations set out in Section 4.2 of this MTR to help step up implementation significantly and to help the PMU to focus on what is achievable in the revised timescale. It is of great importance that the PMU and PSC put in place the necessary monitoring framework, risk monitoring tools, and apply prudent adaptive management, when necessary, to help deliver the final stage of this project.

Finally, and based on the findings of the MTR, it is also clear that several of the envisaged results may not be achieved by the planned closure date of 31 December 2019 without support regarding budget re-allocation from Component 2 to Component 1 and at least a 12-month project programme extension.

As a general conclusion, it can be said that the MTR report highlights several important barriers and delays of the project. While many of these have already been addressed, with the consequence that the project has been making good progress during the first 3 years of his implementation,

The completion of the ongoing and planned activities will depend on an extension of the project. For this, a detailed request will be presented later.

## **Key MTR recommendations and management response**

### **Recommendation 1.**

#### *Corrective actions for the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the project*

APAL should act to urgently set out an institutional restructuring programme to enhance its mandate and internal capacities and from this to produce a new business plan and mandate (under the heading of a Strategic Action Plan incorporating a new Operations Manual). It is acknowledged that this process can take time (beyond the remaining project implementation programme) and so it is proposed that this recommendation is linked with upcoming climate finance related opportunities (donor funded) plus to link it to the new national 5 years development plan. A nominated staff member within APAL, on behalf of the Director General, should be given clearer decision-making mandates (within a revised re-organisation structure within APAL), in order to enable it to make decisions in between future PSC meetings.

**Management response:**

The support to APAL restructuring is crucial to enhance its mandate and internal capacities and interaction with other stakeholders in coastal management. This reform will enable APAL to fully assume its mission in the management of coastal areas fostering Climate Change Adaptation in the coastal zone. Furthermore, the project has already launched a reflection to better define the mandate and prerogatives of the APAL at the level of the study on the management of the Maritime Public Domain. This initiative will facilitate launching the APAL restructuring study.

The APAL restructuring will help NDC implementation in which Coastal adaptation is considered as a priority and will contribute to the achievement of sustainable development goals in line with the 2030 Agenda.

Hence, the preparation of the TORs of the study related to the structural, organizational and financial reform of the Coastal Protection and Planning Agency is ongoing in close collaboration with APAL. A new business plan and mandate (under the heading of a Strategic Action Plan incorporating a new Operations Manual) will be elaborated and suggested.

Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking <sup>2</sup>	
			Comment	Status <sup>3</sup>
1.1 Launching the study of restructuring the Coastal Protection and Planning Agency (APAL) (organizational and financial management reform)	October 2019	PM/PSC/APAL	The TORs related to “the structural, organizational and financial management reform of the Coastal Protection and Planning Agency” are under preparation and will be published by October 2019.	Partially Completed
1.2 : Finalizing the ongoing study “ Legal, institutional and technical adjustments to take climate risks into account in the integrated management of the Maritime Public Domain”	December 2019	PM/PSC/APAL	A reflection to better define the mandate and prerogatives of the APAL is ongoing in the framework of the study on the management of the maritime public domain.	Partially Completed

**Recommendation 2.***Corrective actions for the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the project*

There is also a need to improve the involvement of the current Director General (DG - the Project Director) in the project related activities. The management structure decision making process in APAL needs to be restructured to ensure that at the project level (although The UNDP country office may provide support services for assistance with reporting requirements and direct payment at the request of the National partner), improvements are undertaken by APAL regarding the streamlining and efficiency regarding the signature of any project financial payments. This is needed as currently this remains mostly centralized and the responsibility of the DG. Efficiency mechanisms also are needed in regards with the direct support and commitment in the preparation of ToRs for non-traditional works (e.g.: Beach Occupation Plans),

<sup>2</sup> If the MTR is uploaded to the ERC, the status of implementation is tracked electronically in the Evaluation Resource Centre database (ERC).

<sup>3</sup> Status of Implementation: Completed, Partially Completed, Pending.

which currently appears to be one reason for delays in the support of certain activities leading to reduced project efficiency. APAL also needs to become more accountable to the project by taking a stronger coordinating role with other initiatives taking place that affects the coastal zone of Tunisia (possibly linking to the future need for APAL to better embrace Integrated Marine Management in broaden the remit of ICZM in Tunisia).

#### **Management response:**

The Project Management Unit regularly organizes follow-up meetings with the Director General, who is also the national project director on a monthly basis to present the major implementation activities and progress and to discuss the bottlenecks encountered. This meeting is organized in collaboration with the national project coordinator at APAL and attended by all APAL executives involved in the implementation of the different project activities. A schedule of implementation with fixed deadlines is set up in these exchange meetings.

Regarding the coordination with the other ongoing projects at APAL and in relation to the Integrated Coastal Zone Management, it was proposed to the director general of the APAL, to coordinate a meeting for discussion and exchange between different projects, notably with the Tunisian Coastal Protection Project (PPLT) conducted with the German bank KFW.

Some coordination meetings had taken place between UNDP and KFW to ensure complementarity. the Project Management Unit held two meetings with the technicians/engineers in charge of the implementation of the PPLT project and the exchanges conducted has allowed to identify their axes of intervention and the possible complementarities between the two projects. The project has ensured the involvement of the technicians/engineers in charge of the implementation of the PPLT project in the monitoring of the SCCF project.

Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status
Organizing monthly follow-up meetings with the director general/national project director, send him monthly project progress reports and continue sending quarterly progress reports to PSC members	August 2019	APAL/UNDP	- Monthly meetings to be organized with the DNP. - 2 PSC meetings/year	Completed
Organizing a coordination meeting with APAL for all projects managed by the agency with its partners	January 2020	APAL/UNDP	In order to ensure transparency and coordination within the framework of the NDC, PMU/UNDP will propose to hold a workshop to present all the projects all the projects that APAL implements with the various partners	Pending

#### **Recommendation 3**

Corrective actions for the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the project

To assist with the recent delivery of the remaining project implementation, the current Project Director of APAL (with the PSC) should undertake a forward-looking review of staffing needs for the project spanning the current operational phase, reporting, closure period and “life after the SCCF project” period. The review should make a clear distinction between short-term technical deliverables and one-off tasks that can be assigned to consultants and on-going or core project management and representational roles that should be assigned to project staff. This intervention is needed as it is within APALs mandate to build their own capacity, hence it is their responsibility to review all technical needs to interpret report outcomes and actions, establish strategies to avoid any overlaps, and (using enhanced capacity improvements) to help steer the project in a direction that allows the intended impacts for Tunisia to be realised. Capacity improvements regarding staffs who better understand climate finance (for example to help the efficient implementation of Component 3) is proposed as currently APALs knowledge and implementation capacity for this is very weak. It is recommended that this staffing review should be completed within three months after the adoption of this MTR report and should be clearly linked to the budget revision and project extension proposals

**Management response:** staffing review should be completed within three months after the adoption of the MTR report and should be clearly linked to the budget revision and project extension proposals.

In addition, a capacity building program for the benefit of the APAL technicians will be produced and implemented in the activities related to the Economic Assessment of Adaptation and financing mechanisms. This program will also target the others stakeholders on the coast.

Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status
1.1 staffing review	December 2019	APAL	A discussion is to be held with the PND of APAL	Pending
1.2 Conducting Capacity Building Program in the Climate Finance Field	Novembre 2019	APAL/UNDP	This program will be identified by the Economic Assessment of Adaptation Study and the Financial Mechanisms Study.	Pending

**Recommendation 4.**

Corrective actions for the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the project

The official end date of the SCCF project is 31<sup>st</sup> of December 2019. To this end, a no-cost time extension should be pursued with GEF (through the UNDP and after approval of the PSC and under the direction of the DG of APAL) to allow more substantive achievement of project outcomes. The MTR evaluator believes that it is fully justified to request a no-cost extension of 12 months duration, at a minimum. The justifications that such an extension is needed are set out as follows: (1) there have been 4 changes of APAL DG (and hence Project Directorship) resulting in at least 3 months delay each time a new DG took position; and (2) the political situation in Tunisia affected the early period of the projects implementation. The extension request should be accompanied by bringing up to date the log-frame of the project (including updated GEF Tracking Tool – see Annex XI) as well as formalizing the streamlining and adaptive management that has taken place to date throughout the project. One proposal for consideration is that an additional 6 months is added to the no cost time extension (making it 18 months in total) if an indicator is created demonstrating that APAL (by 1 August 2019) have formally demonstrated their internal re-organisation structure and revised reporting process to UNDP

(see Recommendation 1 above) by 1st of October 2019 (demonstrated by submission of a Draft 5 year Strategic Action Plan (outlining revised mandate etc) and supporting Operations Manual. Such documents would also need to be formally endorsed (in principal at least) by the Ministry of Local Affairs and Environment.

**Management response:**

The MTR report sent to the Implementation Partner APAL. A meeting was held on the 2<sup>nd</sup> August 2019 with the Project Steering Committee to present the findings of the MTR and to discuss about the recommendations including the no cost extension of the project of 12 months at a minimum. The PSC proposed to extend the project period to 18 months and recommended the PMU to start the process of the extension with the UNDP-GEF unit.

Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status
APAL sends an official request with the steering committee meeting minutes and the planning	September 2019	APAL	Minutes of this meeting are being signed	Partially completed
The UNDP Country Office seeks the relevant internal authorization for an extension of 12 or 18 months as a priority	September 2019	PM/PSC	The steering committee discussed the MTR recommendations and validate the MTR report.  APAL sent an official request of the no cost extension of the project and will attach the updated timeline of the project. and the signed minutes of the Steering Committee meeting	Partially Completed

**Recommendation 5.**

Corrective actions for the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the project

Efforts are needed to fast track procurement and delivery of Component 3 activities which have not commenced at the time of writing the MTR. In tandem to this, it is very important that APAL and the Ministry of Finance show improved commitment to the technical input of this Component. Ownership and responsibility from APAL (on non-traditional APAL subject areas) needs to be improved by demonstrating their clear understanding of all technical reports and outputs produced (including Component 3 work – financing instruments). One positive activity to demonstrate this may be for the frequency of PSC meetings be changed to be every 3 months until the end of the project to ensure outputs are delivered and PSC members are fully on board with helping the PMU to deliver activities on time. In addition, the DG of APAL must take better ownership of the project through to completion, with more visible presence at meetings needed. One

idea is for the Ministry of Local Affairs and Environment (or directly from APAL) to formally provide a Chair Person for proposed Climate Finance related Workshops that may be held from July 2019 onwards (see Recommendation 13).

#### **Management response:**

Currently, three studies related to the Component N°3 are launched and a progress is recorded.

The Project Management Unit has involved the Ministry of Local Affairs and Environment in the study on “Green Job Opportunities” at the level of Adaptation projects and has conducted several fruitful exchanges that led to the preparation of the TORs. The Sustainable Development Unit within the beforementioned ministry will lead the study.

APAL and the Ministry of Finance and members of the PSC will be widely involved in the different studies notably those related to the Economic Assessment of Adaptation and financing mechanisms of the Coastal Adaptation. The outputs and the main results will be discussed during exchange workshops chaired by them. The appropriation of the recommendations and the execution of the action plans will be the proof of their commitments in this component.

However, it is important to mention that an output will be undertaken for the benefit of APAL in relation with the analysis of the economic costs and the benefits of the coastal development. With such a document APAL could provide the public decision-maker with the elements essential to the economic and institutional plans that can guide public policy choices towards greater consideration of the impacts and risks expected from climate change.

The Project Management Unit raised significantly the day-to-day project monitoring and evaluation processes. An updated follow-up report each month is sent to APAL and UNDP.

UNDP Management will be involved to raise awareness and sensitize the APAL director general to be more involved in the project guidance. The lessons learned collected could also provide guidance for the implementation of the upcoming activities and the preparation of the eventual upscaling.

The PMU will increase the frequency of PSC meetings and will be held each 4 months until the end of the project. An updated follow-up report will be sent by mail each month to the PSC members.

Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status
Conducting Study and workshops on the potential of Palmivelles Green Employment	June 2019	PM/APAL/UNDP	Study launched in July 2019	Partially completed
Conducting study on the Economic and institutional assessment of coastal adaptation to climate change in Tunisia	June 2019	PM/APAL/UNDP	Study launched in March 2019	Partially completed
Conducting the study on the identification of the financing mechanisms for coastal adaptation to climate change Institutional and opportunities for Tunisia	June 2019	PM/APAL/UNDP	Study launched in July 2019	Partially completed



APAL will send a letter to the Ministry of Local Affairs and Environment to formally designate a Person to chair the Climate Finance workshops likely to be held in December 2019	December 2019	APAL	A concept note is being prepared for an international side event on climate finance to be held in December	Pending
-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	---------------	------	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	---------

#### **Recommendation 6.**

##### *Corrective actions for the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the project*

As the final selection of Component 2 feasibility study intervention sites are still pending, it is recommended to take a final decision on exact sites very soon (by end of July 2019), as a matter of the highest priority for the entire project. In the event of the project extension for 12-18 months (see Recommendation 4), the remaining total of 6 months of project's duration plus a possible 1.5 year project extension – see Recommendation 3), should be sufficient contractor selection processes contracting, implementation and some early monitoring of intervention results.

##### **Management response:**

Priority measures are dimensioned for Ghar el Melh at the level of the area of Boughaz and Lido expanding 600m Linear, which prose innovative techniques including the installation of wooden groins, the sand replenishment of the beaches and. implantation of the ganivelles.

The procurement selection process of a company to carry out this work is ongoing. For additional protection zones for the southern part from Ghar el melh to Kalaat el Andalous (900 ml) interventions are also dimensioned.

The installation of Ganivelles at the level of Djerba pilot site is finalized.

Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status
Conducting the Feasibility study for the identification of soft adaptation measures;	September 2019	PM/APAL/UNDP	Study is ongoing	Partially completed
Setting up of 900 ml of Ganivelles at the bottom of the arrow of Ras R'Mel is finalized and 1080 ml of Palmivelles (palm tree leaf) is finalized.	May 2019	PM/APAL/UNDP		Completed

#### **Recommendation 7.**

##### *Corrective actions for the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the project*

APAL need to ensure a strong advocacy so that the Government of Tunisia formally ratify the ICZM Protocol (Barcelona Convention) which still is currently awaiting authorisation. This is urgent as Tunisia (through the SCCF project) is

currently preparing an ICZM Strategy (divided into three separate Gulf areas of Tunisia) which is expected to be compliant with the expectations of the Barcelona Convention (Article 18 (1)). As per Article 30 of the Convention, a national Focal Point needs to be formally nominated (i.e.: APAL, though their role as an anchor to move ICZM forward still remains weak). One proactive action proposed for APAL to undertake would be to provide assistance to formulate the templates and guidance to form a series of Inter-Municipality Working Groups for ICZM. These could be prepared to help Municipalities on Djerba in particular to take forward such an initiative. Ghar el Melh Municipality are currently setting up a Committee that links to all Administrations to help inform of change (non-permanent committee of 6 members to take into account integrated matters).

#### **Management response:**

First, an advocacy work was already conducted through the legal department of the Ministry of Local Affairs and Environment for the ratification of the ICZM Protocol. Then, a strategy for this advocacy is established ensuring the involvement of all concerned actors intervening in the coast, the NGOs and the Assembly of the Representative of the People.

The process was finalized, and the complete file is at the level of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs since March 2019. The PMU is continuing the advocacy so that the file will be sent first to the Prime Ministry to be subject to a Council of Ministers and then to the Assembly of the Representatives of the People for ratification. However, it is important to note that Tunisia is in a period of institutional change with the legislative and presidential elections that will lead to the change of government and parliament.

Also, the project Management Unit is already proactively engaged in supporting the creation of the ICZM inter-ministerial platform. All stakeholders on the coast as well as all concerned sectors are involved in the exchange for the finalization of the design of this platform. The platform will facilitate decision making on sustainable coastal development balancing decisions with potential socio-economic benefit.

A similar work is conducted at the level of Djerba within the framework of establishing Coastal Development Plans (PAC) and the three municipalities are largely involved this regional platform will facilitate decision making on the management the whole island in an integrated approach with a large concertation.

The project has adopted a participatory approach by conducting broad consultations and discussions with all involved stakeholders in Djerba Island and we will continue providing support to formulate the templates and guidance to form a series of Inter-Municipality Working Groups for ICZM and the Spatial Development Plan of Djerba Island (SDAZS). In particular, the project will continue working jointly with the department of Land Use and Spatial Planning (DGAT) relevant to the Ministry of Equipment, Housing and Land Planning to define needs and expected results regarding the new planning document.

Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status
Providing support to formulate the templates and guidance to form a series of Inter-Municipality Working Groups for ICZM. forward such an initiative	November 2019	PMU/DGAT	the project will continue working jointly with the department of Land Use and Spatial Planning (DGAT) under the Ministry of Equipment, Housing and Land Planning to define needs and expected results	Pending

			regarding the new planning document	
--	--	--	----------------------------------------	--

**Recommendation 8.***Corrective actions for the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the project*

The PMU needs to strengthen the day-to-day project monitoring and evaluation processes. The collection of lessons learned from specific activities could also help to provide guidance to the implementation of the upcoming activities. Recommended improvements may include, but are not limited to the following:

- Critically review the project results framework, rationalize and validate baseline figures and end targets.
- Develop an updated SCCF M&E plan and assign responsibilities among the project team, including the national coordinators.
- Integrate new data and information baseline findings (lessons learned) into the M&E plan (link to the 2019 Annual Work Plan).
- Review the baseline GEF IW tracking tool (2015) and carry out an additional midterm assessment version (2019 onwards). Where possible this should demonstrate progress links to SDG13 and 14.
- Integrate programmatic objectives into the project monitoring and evaluation systems as set out in the 2019 AWP.
- Improve mechanisms of delivery feedback times for the remainder of the project under the leadership of the Project Director (DG of APAL).
- Identify clear South-South Cooperation activities for already completed tasks and those about to be completed up to the end of the project.

**Management response:**

All mentioned tasks should be finalized within three months after the adoption of this MTR report and should be clearly linked to the monitoring and evaluation systems, to the budget revision and project extension proposals. The UNDP CO is waiting for more visibility on the project no cost extension to launch recruitment of a new M&E officer for the climate and environment cluster that will replace the former M&E officer who resigned. The project PMU will benefit from the support of a new M&E officer to update the project logframe.

Concerning South-South Cooperation activities, the project established contacts with UNDP Egypt, which is currently providing support to the Egyptian authorities in a similar project financed by the Global Environment Facility (GEF) in the Delta area.

Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status
Reviewing the project results framework, rationalize and validate baseline figures and end targets.	November 2019	PM/PSC	Following the finalization of the MTR, APAL and UNDP will take into consideration the results of this evaluation and review the end targets.	Partially completed

Developing an updated SCCF M&E plan and assign responsibilities among the project team, including the national coordinators.	November 2019	PM/PSC	Periodic meetings to follow up on the various project activities.  As a coordination and communication tool, a table will be prepared and shared to determine each team member's tasks, deliverables and timelines.	Partially completed
Integrating new data and information baseline findings (lessons learned) into the M&E plan (link to the 2019 Annual Work Plan).	November 2019	PM/PSC	Lessons learned have been summarized for 2018, the project continues this exercise in 2019	Partially completed
Reviewing the baseline GEF IW tracking tool (2015) and carry out an additional midterm assessment version (2019 onwards). Where possible this should demonstrate progress links to SDG13 and 14.	November 2019	PM/PSC	An expert has been recruited to support the integration of SDGs 11, 13 and 14	Pending
Improving mechanisms of delivery feedback times for the remainder of the project under the leadership of the Project Director (DG of APAL).	October 2019	PM/APAL	The project will send monthly reports to APAL the Project National Director & director general of APAL.	Partially completed
Integrating programmatic objectives into the project monitoring and evaluation systems as set out in the 2019 AWP.	November 2019	PM/PSC	Set up monitoring and evaluation procedures that allow all stakeholders to regularly draw clear lessons from their respective actions	Partially completed
Identifying clear South-South Cooperation activities for already completed tasks and those about to be completed up to the end of the project.	November 2019	PM/PSC	The project established contacts with UNDP Egypt  The project will organize a mission	Partially completed

			trip to exchange with Spain authorities about coastal management	
--	--	--	------------------------------------------------------------------	--

#### **Recommendation 9.**

##### *Corrective actions for the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the project*

The additional extension of the period of the project's implementation (see Recommendation 4) should be followed by the respective budget revision, transferring circa 10% of the spare Component 2 funds over to Component 1 with immediate effect. This recommendation can be substantiated as there is a need to conclude the Component 1 activities as without doing this, and having no authorised or agreed formal institutional protocols set out for the future, the work on the ground could be argued as being implemented within a mandatory ICZM policy "vacuum", hence a high risk strategy for ensuring a long term upscaling and replication in Tunisia. The budget revision should be detailed enough to show division of funds among components, outcomes, outputs and activities of the project.

##### **Management response:**

A budget revision, transferring circa of 20% instead of the spare Component 2 funds over to Component 1 with immediate effect is needed as there is a need to conclude the Component 1 activities as without doing this, and having no authorised or agreed formal institutional protocols set out for the future, the work on the ground could be argued as being implemented within a mandatory ICZM policy.

Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status
Detailing the budget revision to show division of funds among components, outcomes, outputs and activities of the project.	October 2019	PM/PSC	The budget revision should be detailed enough to show division of funds among components, outcomes, outputs and activities of the project	Partially completed

#### **Recommendation 10.**

##### *Actions to follow up or reinforce initial benefits from the project*

The PMU should urgently start demonstrating project advocacy by collecting coastal observatory data in Djerba (from wave buoys and tide gauges) and effectively demonstrate that this information is being used to design sustainable engineering schemes. The Djerba Wave Buoy (vandalised 20km offshore and now not in operation) must therefore be redeployed and APAL must do every effort to consult with the Ministry of Defence to allow satellite telemetry data transfer to occur for an agreed length of time (to support the pilot initiative). This data collection and use is a critical action to help improve project advocacy and to help with coastal adaptation intervention implementation (for example) as per the 1km ganivelle placement site at Sidi Hachani. Additional recommendations to improve advocacy may include the rapid commencement of specific activities of the project that can be embedded within the larger development initiatives e.g.: aspects of the specific Coastal Management Plans, Master Plans or Beach Occupation Plans for Djerba and Ghar el Melh.

**Management response:**

The project has procured three tide gauges and a buoy to strengthen the extreme weather forecast database of the APAL observatory. It is the first time that APAL has received real-time meteo-oceanographic data from the tide gauges installed on the coast.

Tide gauge data produced during the last 18 months were shared with the oceanographic and hydraulic marine services (CHOMN) to supplement their oceanographic information databases. Also, currently in collaboration with National Institute of Marine Science and Technology (INSTM), these newly acquired data are used to calibrate hydrodynamic and oceanographic models.

APAL held many meetings and conducting exchange with the ministry of defense to have the necessary authorizations for the reestablishment of the buoy in the sea on August 2019.

Following various exchanges and several working sessions held till July 2019, it is proposed that a cooperation agreement be signed between APAL and the Ministry of Defense to allow the launching of the buoys and the resumption of data collection

However, due to complications regarding administrative authorizations, the repaired buoy has not yet been re-established in the sea. The current speed data are no longer received at the level of the coastal observatory.

Currently, APAL continues the meteo-oceanographic data collection only by using the three tide gauges and meteorological stations. Raw data are controlled and analyzed and stored on SQL server at the National Coastal Observatory and can be used to feed vulnerability and protection studies of Tunisian coastal zones. These data will be used as inputs to the studies ongoing as the Coastal Management Plans and the study on climate risk assessment.

The UNDP CO exposed this situation through official letters sent to the Minister of Local Affairs and Environment and APAL director general in 2018 and 2019 requesting his intervention to resolve the issue. The new UNDP CO management will also be involved to monitor closely this situation.

Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status
Signature of an agreement APL / Ministry of Defense for the redeployment of the oceanographic data collection buoy from Djerba	October 2019	PM/PSC	The convention will allow APAL to redeploy the Buoy	Partially completed
Meteo-oceanographic data collection used to feed vulnerability and protection studies of Tunisian coastal zones	September 2019	PM/PSC	The data that are being collected tide gauge and the data that will be produced by the buoys as soon as they are deployed will be used as inputs to the studies ongoing as the Coastal Management Plans and the study on	Partially completed

			climate risk assessment	
--	--	--	-------------------------	--

### Recommendation 11.

#### *Actions to follow up or reinforce initial benefits from the project*

A challenge links to the fact there is no formal IT Knowledge Portal in existence whereby project outputs can be uploaded for others to refer to and learn from. Therefore, there is a need to formalise and launch the projects Information Management web portal, possibly housed on the APALs institutional IT hosting site platform. This is needed as access to all SCCF project documentation must be made easier by making the availability of documents as wide as possible. Some suggestions for inclusion are a page is needed to demonstrate progress monitoring of the project's activities per component. A separate effort to create a web-based GIS pilot focus for geographic areas such as on Djerba (to help all Municipalities and implementation of the Master Plan outputs) may also be considered. Efforts should be continued to have it regularly updated. It would be useful if the date were always placed when an update is being made

#### Management response:

The project proposes to set up a long-term information and data management system and will:

- Launch the development of a software solution (GIS) for the management of these data.
- Provide a training session for the benefit of the users of this system.

The data produced by the project is of major importance to a multitude of coastal users notably at the two project sites. The GIS has to be available to the different users taking into account the current as well as the future users. The GIS will include a page to demonstrate progress monitoring of the project's activities per component.

An additional effort will be made to create a GIS -web pilot focus for the geographic areas of Ghar El Melh and Djerba.

The exploitation of this data and information is necessary for further improvement of the intervention on the ground in relation with the Integrated Coastal Zone Management. Equipment and applications must be adapted to the needs. Data organization, preparation and development of advanced products have to satisfy different users.

Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status
1.1 Development of an SGBD and a GIS web for the management of the data produced within the project implementation	December 2019	PM/PMU	<p>The SGBD and GIS web to produce will be available to several users and it is essential to take into account current users and future users.</p> <p>TORs for this action are finalized and publication to follow soon in late November</p>	Pending



**Recommendation 12.*****Actions to follow up or reinforce initial benefits from the project***

Project study findings and interventions needs to be better communicated to all stakeholders. An improved and updated SCCF project “Communications and Visibility Plan - CaVP”, that is re-launched and effectively disseminated to all relevant parties is needed for the remaining project period.

**Management response:**

The project has:

- Launched the recruitment of a communications officer (in a cost-sharing arrangement with another UNDP-GEF project);
- Finalized the elaboration of a Climate Adaptation Communication Strategy and associated action plan. This will help to anchor the adaptation approach to climate change risks. Currently the action plan is being implemented.
- Produced Communication products:
  - A film related to CC adaptation know how of small farmer in Ghar El Melh
  - A video about the activities to be undertaken by NGO's within the framework of the small adaptation project financed by the SCCF project
  - A film on ganivelles as a soft technique implemented in Djerba island

A “photo roman” novel photo is being produced.

Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status
Recruitment of a Communications Officer	October 2019	UNDP/PMU	<p>The former communication officer resigned in August 2019. Recruitment is undergoing for an expert to support implementation of communication priority actions from the project communication plan.</p> <p>The UNDP CO is waiting for more visibility on the project no cost extension to launch recruitment of new communication officer for the project.</p>	Partially completed
Documentation of the implementation of the project and the preparation	July 2019	UNDP/PMU	Implementation of the climate adaptation communications	completed

of audio-visual media for the capitalization of good practices on coastal resilience			strategy and associated action plan developed by the project	
Implementation of the project's communication plan	March 2020	UNDP/PMU	Audio-visual communication products are being developed (awareness capsules, documentary film, ...°	Partially completed

### **Recommendation 13.**

#### *Actions to follow up or reinforce initial benefits from the project*

Increase efforts towards capacity building, especially with regards to climate financing. Implementation of the planned training workshops should start as a matter of priority, in particular for Component 3 (Climate Financing Workshop event by August 2019). Specific training and capacity development focal areas should consider training to Parliamentarians on the importance of ICZM to Tunisia and the implications on no action regarding DRM and CCA. Consideration should be given to the possibility of “twinning” with countries whom are better versed in this sector than those companies Tunisia. Conducting a more detailed pre-training and post training capacity or knowledge assessment would also be helpful to track the improvement in stakeholder’s knowledge and capacities regarding climate change, climate finance issues and Ecosystem based Adaptation.

#### **Management response:**

Trainings and capacity building were conducted successfully for the benefit of the representatives of the relevant ministries, regional and local actors for a better planning that takes into consideration CC risks. The different trainings sessions and capacity building have witnessed a good participation and a satisfactory assessment has been done by participants. Overall, from the beginning of the project 240 key decision makers and technical agents have benefited from training on adaptation tools in coastal planning and the capacity of 500 local partners, professional bodies and civil society at the project sites were strengthened in relation with ICZM, planning for development

Within the framework of the study related to the identification of Financing mechanisms for Coastal Adaptation to CC and the study of the economic and institutional assessment of coastal adaptation to climate change in Tunisia, it is expected that an action plan will be produced for capacity building to access to international adaptation funding and for the integration of the national financial sector into the climate dynamics. These training with pre-training and post training knowledge assessment will track the improvement in stakeholder’s knowledge and capacities regarding climate change, climate finance issues and Ecosystem based Adaptation.

Concerning the setting up of a training workshop in particular for Component 3 (Climate Financing Workshop) as a priority, the PMU is organizing an international side event to be held in the COP25 on the blue economy in an Integrated Coastal Management Context ICZM.

In order to establish “twinning” with the entities which has an in depth- experience and knowledge in ICZM and to accelerate the implementation of the ICZM strategy, the PMU tries to ensure the involvement of the Priority Actions Program / Regional Activity Center (PAP / RAC) that provides support to Mediterranean countries to ratify and implement the ICZM Protocol, as well as to implement the Mediterranean Strategy for Sustainable Development (MSSD) as part of their mission.

As part of the synergy with the Parliamentary Academy, it is proposed to conduct advocacy through trainings for the benefit of parliamentarians on the various aspects related to the ratification of the ICZM Protocol . A legal expert will present an assessment of the policy, legal and institutional frameworks in relation with coastal management for the parliamentarians.				
Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status
Conducting Capacity building training to access to international adaptation funding and for the integration of the national financial sector into the climate dynamics	November 2019	PMU/UNDP/APAL	The training will be identified at the level of the action plan to be produced for capacity building in the framework of the ongoing financial studies	pending
Organizing an international side event to be held in the COP25 on the blue economy in an integrated coastal management context ICZM	December 2019	PMU/UNDP/APAL	The recruitment of an international expert to design the side event and to elaborate the concept note is ongoing	Pending
Conducting a training for parliamentarians on the various aspects related to the ratification of the ICZM Protocol	February 2020	PMU/UNDP/APAL/ the Parliamentary Academy	it is important to take into account the institutional changes with the legislative elections and the change of parliament that will follow. So this action will start once the new parliament is place.  But as UNDP CO has set a very good partnership with the Parliamentarian Academy with the Tunisian Parliament the project will build on this ongoing partnership. It is also noteworthy to mention that the UNDP climate and environment cluster already organized training for the Parliament Academy on climate change	Pending

			concepts and challenges globally and in Tunisia. So a core team is already in place at the parliament.	
--	--	--	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--

#### Recommendation 14.

##### Proposals for future directions underlining main objectives

LiDAR capture for Djerba is recommended as part of a future upscaling project to help with taking forward a “whole island approach” to decision making. This could be used to help generate new information needed to pursue the Blue Economy aspects for Tunisia in a future GCF Concept Note application which may focus directly on the establishment of a Policy for Integrated Coastal and Marine Management as a natural progression for the SCCF project to take forward ICZM though to better embrace ocean related matters and hence pursuance of the “blue economy” in Tunisia. APALs SAP should embrace this opportunity where possible.

##### **Management response:**

LiDAR capture for Djerba will be recommended as a result of the upscaling expertise that the project is conducting. This could be used to help generate new information needed to continue the Blue Economy aspects for Tunisia in a future GCF Concept Note application.

Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status
Conducting an upscaling expertise of the project results	March 2020	PM/UNDP/APAL	The development of a feasibility study for the upscaling and the capitalization of climate change adaptation interventions and achievements in the Tunisian coastal areas is ongoing	Partially Completed

#### Recommendation 15.

##### Proposals for future directions underlining main objectives

There is an urgent need to finalise the design of follow on continuity project concept applications (i.e.: a GCF applications follow up) which will require more quantifiable information regards data disaggregated gender information achieve to date. Additional surveys may be required with immediate effect to capture this information ahead of any future GCF Concept Note preparation. In addition, there is a need to identify and operationalize strategic partnerships with complementary projects and programs overseas as there has been limited synergies with other complementary projects and programmes, at both regional and national levels. A review of relevant complementary international projects and program should be made by the PMU and UNDP, and specific strategic joint activities developed and implemented.

##### **Management response:**

The PMU is developing a feasibility study for the upscaling and the capitalization of climate change adaptation interventions and achievements in the Tunisian coastal areas. An international expert was recruited, and the mission is ongoing.

The overall objective of the study is to identify and document viable adaptation solutions for the Tunisian coast, with a particular focus on the ecosystem-based approaches to coastal resilience. The study is to contribute to the upscaling of such practices through consolidation of the existing results, identification of shortcomings and barriers to their implementation at scale, the lessons learned from the implementation processes, at the coastal level, of the climate change adaptation initiatives, in general, and of those recommended by the Coastal Resilience scheme, in particular.

The project is still stressing the importance of gender data at the level of the several studies both ongoing and carried out by the project (National ICZM Strategy, SDAZS of Djerba, Emergency Response Plan, Management of the MDP, management of the water resource and agro- fishery study, etc.). An important component has been devoted to the collection and analysis of relevant, quantitative (population, education, income, etc.) and qualitative data (economic participation at family and community level) of the population of the two pilot sites of the project (Djerba and Ghar El-Melh-Sidi Ali El Mekki) all these desegregated data will be used by the upscaling and the capitalization study.

Concerning the identification and operationalization of a strategic partnerships with complementary projects and programs overseas a review of relevant complementary international projects and program will be made by the PMU and UNDP, and specific strategic joint activities developed and implemented. As a first step and concerning South-South Cooperation activities the project established contacts with UNDP Egypt, which is currently providing support to the Egyptian authorities in a similar project financed by the Global Environment Facility (GEF) in the Delta area.

Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status
Conducting the Feasibility study for the upscaling and the capitalization of climate change adaptation interventions and achievements in the Tunisian coastal areas	March 2020	PMU/UNDP/APAL	An international expert was recruited, and the mission is ongoing	Partially completed
updating gender-disaggregated data for the scaling study	February 2020	PMU/UNDP/APAL	TORs are finalized to conduct an expertise to update the gender diagnosis established by the SCCF project in 2015 and to establish a short-term intervention plan for the remaining period so that the project can ensure the integration of the gender aspect in coastal adaptation. A narrative will be produced to highlight the role of the project in accelerating gender mainstreaming in the NDC, Agenda2030, the Paris Agreement, the ICZM Protocol..	Pending

Identifying clear South-South Cooperation activities for already completed tasks and those about to be completed up to the end of the project.	November 2019	PM/PSC	<p>The project will organize a mission trip to exchange with Spain authorities about coastal management.</p> <p>Field missions will be conducted to view some successful examples for potential replication and to establish cooperation and exchange relations with the Spanish institutions in charge of territorial planning and coastal zone management</p>	Partially completed
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	---------------	--------	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	---------------------

#### **Recommendation 16.**

##### Proposals for future directions underlining main objectives

A Sustainability Plan, Replication/Upscaling and Exist Strategy does not appear to have been developed. This is needed for sustaining products, outcomes and effects to be made explicit plus provide the guidance towards upscaling the results of the project as appropriate. This strategy or plan should make it clear which stakeholder(s) would assure sustainability and by what means (for example, through budget incorporations, work plan incorporations, hiring of staff, maintenance of infrastructure and other materials provided directly and indirectly by the Project. While the Project Document doesn't request this specifically, it may be necessary to prepare one with a view to making the sustainability of the project more likely and shall help to gain consensus on the activities required for a possible future GCF Concept Note application (for example). The strategy should be adopted by the PSC during its next meeting in 2019.

##### **Management response:**

An upscaling Strategy will be developed to ensure the sustainability of the project which also considers the restructuring of APAL. The strategy should be adopted by the PSC during its meeting in the early 2020 and will the new strategic vision of APAL.

A consensus on the activities should be reached for a possible future GCF Concept Note application

Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status
Developing the upscaling Strategy	March 2020	PM/PSC	This action will be carried on in the framework of the up scaling study	pending

#### **Recommendation 17.**

##### Proposals for future directions underlining main objectives

The above Recommendations should be followed by strengthening the narrative of the project to highlight its role in the acceleration of the NDC implementation in Tunisia along with a clear gender-mainstreaming plan. As part of this exercise, work is recommended that (where possible) inter-weave gender focused developmental issues (e.g.: NDC/Agenda 2030/Paris Agreement etc) as a priority in the products and outcomes that result and seek to result out of the Project. Themes that should be considered include issues of livelihoods, gender, prevention of natural resource use conflict with local communities, and the support that ICZM should sustain for development and wellbeing (tourism, fisheries, water sources) in the country. It is proposed that the PMU should start to consider (with immediate effect) undertaking new data disaggregated gender information of outcomes achieved to date. These additional surveys may be required with immediate effect to capture this information ahead of any future GCF Concept Note preparation.

**Management response:**

The PMU will strengthen the narrative of the project to highlight its role in the acceleration of the NDC implementation in Tunisia.

Furthermore, a study will be launched to produce a clear gender-mainstreaming plan.

Key action(s)	Time frame	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status
Producing a narrative of the project to highlight its role in the acceleration of the NDC implementation in Tunisia	June 2019	PM/PSC	TORs are being prepared to launch a study:  A study will be launched to update the first gender diagnosis established by the project in 2015, establish a short-term action plan for the remaining period so that the project can ensure the integration of the gender aspect in coastal adaptation and produce a well-established narrative of the project's results to highlight the project's role in accelerating gender mainstreaming in the NDC, Agenda 2030, the Paris Agreement, the ICZM Protocol...	Pending
Recruiting an expertise to produce a clear gender-mainstreaming plan	April 2019	PMU/UNDP/APAL	TORs are being prepared to launch a study	pending

