

Report Title : Report on *Preliminary desk review and evaluation framework*

Gender Assessment : Prof. Ismi Dwi Astuti Nurhaeni

Consultant

Report Submission Date : 21 February 2022



CONSULTANT REPORT

A. BACKGROUND

United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) is supporting the Government of Indonesia i.e. the Ministry of Environment and Forestry (MoEF) and National Research and Innovation Agency (BRIN) to implementing the five-year Project called GOLD-ISMIA (Global Environment Facility – Global Opportunities for Long-term Development of Artisanal and Small-scale Gold Mining Sector (GEF-GOLD): Integrated Sound Management of Mercury in Indonesia’s ASGM). The objective of this project is to reduce/ eliminate mercury release from Indonesia's Artisanal and Small-Scale Gold Mining (ASGM) sector. UNDP places gender mainstreaming as one of the key elements of GOLD-ISMIA to ensure that project interventions will provide equal benefits for all individuals, male and female. Results of the study of gender analysis and mapping on the capacity and vulnerability of the roles of men and women in ASGM in the six target locations of the GOLD-ISMIA Project, indicated the presence of gender issues in the sector, and GOLD-ISMIA has endeavored to address them. By design, the GOLD-ISMIA project treats gender mainstreaming as a key element with the purpose of incorporating the concept of gender equality into ASGM policies and promoting equal and inclusive access to financial services and capacity building.

This research is designed for a part-time evaluation of the implementation of gender mainstreaming to achieve gender equality and sustainability in four project components, namely:

- 1) Component 1. Institutional strengthening and policy/regulatory frameworks for a mercury-free ASGM sector.
- 2) Component 2. Establishing financing loan arrangements/revolving funds to provide loans to approved ASGM miners/cooperatives, to enable miners to purchase mercury-free technology.
- 3) Component 3. Capacity building for a mercury-free ASGM sector through the provisioning of technical assistance and transfer of technology, by supporting the mining community in introducing BEP, BAT and ASGM practices that are socially and environmentally sound; supporting miners in their formalization process leading to more sustainable income opportunities and safer working conditions; and, establishing/improving routes to markets for mercury-free gold. This intervention will reduce the amount of mercury released into the environment, and lead to a sustainable reduction in mercury over the duration of the project and beyond.
- 4) Component 4. Monitoring and evaluation, awareness raising, capturing, and disseminating experiences, lessons learned and best practices.

CONSULTANT REPORT

B. OBJECTIVES

The main objective of the project gender evaluation is to assess whether the four project components contribute to achieving gender equality in ASGM communities to support the long-term sustainability of project outcomes and the environment. In particular, the objectives of the evaluation are to indicate the following substances:

- a) The strengthening of institutional capacities and policy/ regulatory frameworks for a mercury-free ASGM sector contributes to achieving **gender equality** in ASGM communities and whether this will support long-term sustainability of project outcomes and the environment.
- b) The arrangement of financing loans/ revolving funds extended to ASGM miners/ cooperatives to purchase mercury-free technology contribute to **achieving gender equality** in the ASGM community and whether this will support long-term sustainability of project outcomes and the environment.
- c) A strengthened capacity of a mercury-free ASGM sector through:
 - the provision of technical assistance and transfer of technology, by supporting the mining community in introducing BEP, BAT and ASGM practices that are both socially and environmentally sound;
 - formalization process leading to more sustainable income opportunities and safer working conditions; and,
 - establishing/improving routes to markets for mercury-free gold contributes to **achieving gender equality** in ASGM communities and whether this will support long-term sustainability of project outcomes;
- d) Monitoring and evaluation, awareness raising, capturing and disseminating experiences, lessons learned and best practices contribute to **achieving gender equality** in ASGM communities and whether these will support long-term sustainability of project outcomes.

C. METHODOLOGY:

1) Types of Evaluation:

There are four types of evaluation research and the use of any evaluation type depends on the availability of the data required and a control group which shares the same characteristics as the target group. The four types of evaluation research are displayed in table 1 below.

CONSULTANT REPORT

Table 1. Evaluation Types

Evaluation Types	Measurement of the target group's condition		Control group	Information obtained
	Before	After		
<i>Single program after-only</i>	No	yes	none	condition of target group
<i>Single program before-after</i>	Yes	yes	none	change in the state of the target group
<i>Comparative after-only</i>	No	yes	present	Target and non-target states
<i>Comparative before-after</i>	Yes	yes	present	Program effect on target group

Source: Finsterbusch dan Montz, 1980: p140-141

Based on these existing evaluation types, the gender evaluation will use the ***single program before after*** evaluation type. The design requires data on the target group before and after the program is implemented without control group. According to this type, all changes after the project implementataion will be figured out.

In terms of the stages, there are four types of evaluation (see table 2).

Table 2: Types of evaluation by stage

Category	TYPES OF EVALUATION			
	Planning and Development Program	Evaluation through Monitoring	Evaluation by Assessing Impacts	Calculating the Cost-Benefit Ratio
(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
Purpose	To design a program commensurate to the desired goals	To test implementation of the program in accordance with its design	To test program effectiveness in relation to the attainment of the goals	To calculate the degree of the program's economic efficiency
Evaluation questions	1. To what extent have the issues and program distribution reached the target group?	1. Has program implementation addressed the desired target group?	1. Has the program been achieved effectively/ effected the desired changes?	1. How much has it cost to provide resources, services and benefits to the target group?

CONSULTANT REPORT

	2. Is the program designed in accordance with the objectives to be achieved and what are the opportunities for effective implementation?	2. Has implementation of the program provided a source of services and benefits to the target group as expected?	2. Have these changes substantively had a significant enough meaning?	2. How big is the ratio between the total costs that have been incurred and the benefits earned?
--	--	--	---	--

Source: Rossi et al. 1979: p 50.

By referring to the four types of evaluation, this research will evaluate the stages of (1) planning and program development, (2) evaluation by monitoring, and (3) evaluation by assessing the impact.

2) Research Locations

The research will be conducted in 6 (six) GOLD-ISMIA project locations e.g.: Kulonprogo District (DI Yogyakarta Province), Kuantan Sangingi District (Riau Province), West Lombok District (West Nusa Tenggara Province), North Gorontalo District (Gorontalo Province), North Minahasa District (Manado) , and South Halmahera District (North Maluku Province).

3) Key Informants

a. Community Level:

Female and male members of the ASGM community in each research location were selected purposively based on the consideration that they are engaged in ASGM activities facilitated by GOLD-ISMIA, both as administrators and as members. The proportion of the ratio of women and men as key informants is expected to be proportional to the ratio of the number of members of the ASGM community by gender. The number of informants was not determined at the beginning, but rather to fulfill the completeness of the required information.

b. The micro (Village) level:

Research informants are village officials engaged in the ISMIA Gold project, i.e. from project identification, design, planning, implementation to project monitoring and evaluation. If in the field there is no informants could be identified as required,

CONSULTANT REPORT

enumerators may select informants who meet either one of the engagement criteria as mentioned above, and proceed to obtain any information needed in order to paint a comprehensive picture of the application of the gender perspective under the GOLD-ISMIA Project implementation.

c. Mezzo Level (district/ city/ province):

Research informants are sourced from the local government that work in partnership with the GOLD-ISMIA project, notably Gender Mainstreaming driver agencies, i.e. Bappeda and the Agency of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection, as well as the agency that oversee local environmental and forestry activities, i.e. the Environmental Agency.

Aside from the local government, research informants are also expected to be sourced from financial institutions working in partnership with the Project for ASGM sector, specifically in terms of providing financial access for ASGM miners to purchase mercury-free gold processing equipment.

d. Macro Level (National):

Research informants comprise the Ministry of Environment and Forestry (MoEF), the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection (KPPA), National Research and Innovation Agency (BRIN) and National Development Planning Agency (Bappenas) which are in collaboration with the GOLD-ISMIA Project.

4) Data Sources

Primary Data Sources

There are 3 sources of primary data:

- a) In-depth interviews with key informants, specifically key informants on a local basis (community and village).
- b) Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) with key informants at the Mezzo and Macro levels.
- c) Questionnaires distributed online to key informants who could not be reached for either in-depth interviews or FGDs.

Secondary Data Sources

Secondary data are sourced by way of desktop studies which covering:

- a) Legal products or legislation related to gender integration in the GOLD ISMIA project for ASGM,
Preparatory GOLD ISMIA project for ASGM assessment documents, Project Design Documents, Planning Documents, Implementation documents, and monitoring and evaluation documents

CONSULTANT REPORT

5) Research Instruments

Research instruments are classified into 3 (three) types of evaluation stages, namely:

- a) Instruments at the planning and program development stages
- b) Instruments at the Evaluation stage with Monitoring
- c) Instruments at the Evaluation stage by assessing Impacts.

The list of reference questions for each type of evaluation stage is as follows:

1. Questionnaire at the Planning and Program Development Stage (referring to the 4th Harvard tools gender analysis model with adjustments).

a. Women's Dimensions in Project Identification

Assessing women's needs

- (1) What needs and opportunities does the GOLD-ISMIA Project provide to increase women's productivity in ASGM?
- (2) What needs and opportunities does the GOLD-ISMIA Project provide to improve women's access and control over resources in ASGM?
- (3) What needs and opportunities does the GOLD-ISMIA Project provide to increase women's access to and control over the benefits of ASGM?
- (4) Have women been consulted directly in identifying these needs and opportunities?

Defining general project objectives

- (1) Do the objectives of the GOLD-ISMIA project explicitly relate to the needs of women?
- (2) Do women participate in setting the objectives of the GOLD-ISMIA project in ASGM?
- (3) Has there been an attempt like this in a previous project?

Identify possible negative effects/project risks

- (1) Could the GOLD-ISMIA project potentially reduce women's access to control over ASGM resources and benefits?
- (2) Could the GOLD-ISMIA project potentially have an adverse impact on the situation of women in ASGM?
- (3) What is the effect of the GOLD-ISMIA project on women in ASGM in the short and long terms?

b. The Female Dimension in Project Design

Project impact on women's activities

- (1) Will the GOLD-ISMIA project have an impact on the production, reproduction and social **activities** of women in ASGM?
- (2) How can the design of the GOLD-ISMIA project be adapted to amplify the positive effect on women in ASGM?
- (3) How will the design of the GOLD-ISMIA project have a negative impact on women in ASGM?

CONSULTANT REPORT

Project impact on women's access and control

- (1) How does each component of the GOLD-ISMIA project affect women's access to and control over resources and benefits from the **production of goods and services in ASGM**?
- (2) How does each component of the GOLD-ISMIA project affect women's access to and control over resources and the benefits of **human reproduction and maintenance in ASGM**?
- (3) How does each component of the GOLD-ISMIA project affect women's access to and control over **resources and social** benefits in ASGM?

c. Dimensions of Women in Project Implementation

Personnel

- (1) Are the GOLD-ISMIA project personnel sensitive to women's needs?
- (2) Do the GOLD-ISMIA project personnel have the skills to provide the specific input that women need?
- (3) Are there opportunities for women to participate in the GOLD-ISMIA project management positions?

Organizational structure

- (1) Does the GOLD-ISMIA project form of organization increase women's access to resources in ASGM?
- (2) Does the GOLD-ISMIA project organization have sufficient power to obtain the resources needed for women in ASGM from other organizations?
- (3) Does the GOLD-ISMIA project organization have the institutional capability to support and protect women during the ASGM implementation process?

Operations and logistics

- (1) Are the operations and logistics channels of the GOLD-ISMIA project accessible to women in terms of personnel, location and time in ASGM?
- (2) Is there a control procedure for the GOLD-ISMIA project to ensure that the delivery of goods and services is actually received by women in ASGM?
- (3) Is there a GOLD-ISMIA's mechanism to ensure that project resources or benefits can actually be received by women in ASGM?

Finance

- (1) Is there a funding mechanism for the GOLD-ISMIA project to ensure that women in ASGM receive financial access and funds?

Flexibility

- (1) Does the GOLD-ISMIA project organization have sufficient flexibility to adapt its structure and operations to the changing situation of women in ASGM?

d. Women's Dimensions in Project Evaluation

Data Requirements

CONSULTANT REPORT

- (1) Does the GOLD-ISMIA project monitoring and evaluation system explicitly measure the project's effects on women in ASGM?



Data collection and analysis

- (1) Is data collected with sufficient frequency so that the necessary adjustments to the GOLD-ISMIA project can be made during the course of the ASGM project?
- (2) Is data fed back to the GOLD-ISMIA project personnel and beneficiaries in a comprehensible and timely form to enable project adjustment within ASGM?
- (3) Are women involved in data collection and interpretation?
- (4) Is the data analyzed to provide guidance for the design of other projects?

(Source: Adapted from Overholt et al., in March & Mukhopadhyay, 2010).

2. List of Questions at the Evaluation Stage with Monitoring

(Referring to the fulfilment of the seven key components of Gender Mainstreaming Implementation)

a. Commitment

- 1) Is there a commitment from the GOLD-ISMIA project in supporting PUG towards ASGM?
- 2) In what document does the commitment to implement PUG in the GOLD-ISMIA project towards ASGM be applied?

b. Policy

- 3) Are there any regulations from the GOLD-ISMIA project for ASGM that are relevant to PUG and/or women's empowerment?
- 4) Is the regulation evenly distributed across all six locations of ASGM trials?
- 5) Who is the target of advocacy/socialization from the regulation products developed by the GOLD-ISMIA project?

c. Institutional

- 1) Is there a PUG Sub-Working Group on the GOLD-ISMIA project for ASGM?
- 2) Is there any action related to PUG in the GOLD-ISMIA Project against ASGM?
- 3) Can the GOLD-ISMIA Project PUG action plan for ASGM be related?
- 4) Does the implementation of the GOLD-ISMIA Project PUG work plan or action have an impact on ASGM?

d. Resources

Gender Responsive Human Resources

- 1) Are there any GOLD-ISMIA facilitators who comprehend gender in ASGM activities?
- 2) Has the GOLD-ISMIA facilitator ever provided gender-related facilitation to ASGM?
- 3) Is there any effort by the GOLD-ISMIA project to develop human resources who comprehend gender in the ASGM community? If so, what is the role of the HR in their community?

CONSULTANT REPORT

- 4) Does the GOLD-ISMIA project provide a budget for GM institutions in the ASGM sector?
- 5) If so, how much is the PUG institutional budget?
- 6) Is there a gender responsive infrastructure in place at the project site? If yes, please indicate.

e. Disaggregated Data

- 1) Is the GOLD-ISMIA project supported by gender profile data in ASGM?
- 2) Is the data used for the purpose of implementing PUG in ASGM?
- 3) What decisions does the GOLD-ISMIA project make based on sex-disaggregated data in ASGM?
- 4) Is disaggregated data used as the basis for the GOLD-ISMIA project in making Gender Analysis Pathway in ASGM?

f. Tools

- 1) What data or information does the GOLD-ISMIA project have to promote PUG in the implementation of ASGM?
- 2) To whom is the data or information disseminated or advocated?
- 3) How is the data or information used?
- 4) Through what media is CIE (Communication, Information, and Education) in ASGM published?

g. Community Participation

- 1) Does implementation of PUG GOLD-ISMIA for ASGM engage external parties? If so, please indicate.
- 2) Have external parties outside the GOLD-ISMIA project been effective in assisting the implementation of PUG in ASGM?
- 3) What is the role of external parties in assisting the implementation of PUG GOLD-ISMIA for ASGM?
- 4) What activities engage community institutions, academics, and the business world in the implementation of PUG the GOLD-ISMIA project for ASGM?
- 5) Are there studies or assessments involving community institutions, academics, and the business world that are used as input for the development of ASGM related regulations?

h. Innovation

- 1) Are there any the GOLD-ISMIA project innovative activities in ASGM that support accelerated PUG implementation? If so, please indicate.
- 2) Indicate the impacts innovations made under the GOLD-ISMIA project for ASGM have had in a before and after context.
- 3) Does the GOLD-ISMIA project already have thoughts on or innovative ideas for the development of PUG implementation in the ASGM sector for 2022?

CONSULTANT REPORT

3. List of Questions in Evaluation Phase By Assessing Impact

Gender analysis to identify project impact will make use of the Gender Analysis Matrix (GAM) model. There are two main components to the gender analysis under the GAM model, i.e. analysis of the four levels of community and analysis of the four types of impact.

GAM Tool 1: Analysis of the four levels of community

The first component of the GAM gender analysis is analysis of the four levels of community, i.e. women, men, households, and the community. The four main categories that appear vertically in the GAM matrix are:

- a) Women, i.e. women of all ages who are in the target group or all women in the community.
- b) Men, i.e. men of all ages who are in the target group or all men in the community.
- c) Households, i.e. all women, men, and children living together, even if they are not part of a nuclear family.
- d) Community, i.e. everyone in the program or activity.

GAM Tool 2: Analysis of the four types of impact

GAM identifies impacts in four areas, i.e. labor, time, resources, and socio-cultural factors.

- a) Labor – Is there any impact of ASGM on labor?
- b) Time – Is there a temporal impact to the carrying out of tasks related to ASGM projects or activities?
- c) Resources - Does ASGM have an impact on changes in access to resources and the level of control over changes in these resources?
- d) Socio-Cultural Factors - Does ASGM have an impact on changes in the social aspects of the participants' lives (including changes in gender roles or status) as a result of the project.

Table 3. GAM Matrix

Women				
Men				
Households				
Community				

Source: March & Mukhopadhyay, 2010.

The GAM matrix needs to be filled out to indicate the changes that occurred after the project was implemented, by marking it as follows:

- a) Use the plus sign (+) if the results are consistent with the project objectives
- b) Use a minus sign (-) if the results are inconsistent with the project's objectives

CONSULTANT REPORT

- c) Use a question mark (?) if the community is unsure whether the process is consistent or inconsistent with the project's objectives.

The markings serve to provide an overview of the different effects the interventions might have.

6. Data Analysis

Data collected will be analyzed qualitatively by focusing on the four components of the Project. A matrix of the analysis results will be classified based on the stages of the evaluation types as follow:

- a) The Planning and Program Development stage
- b) The Evaluation stage with Monitoring
- c) The Evaluation stage by assessing impacts.

The format for the analysis matrix is developed to be as follows:

A. The Planning and Program Development stage

Dimension of Women in the Planning and Development Stage of the GOLD-ISMIA project for ASGM	Project Components			
	Strengthening institutions and the policy/regulatory framework for mercury-free ASGM	Establishing financing lending arrangements to provide loans for mercury free processing equipment.	Increasing the capacity of mining communities for mercury-free ASGM through the provision of technical assistance, technology transfer and support for formalization	Monitoring and evaluation, raising awareness, capturing and disseminating experiences, lessons learned and best practices
a. Project Identification: - Assessing women's needs - Defining general project objectives - Identify possible negative effects/ Project Risks				
b. Project design: - Project impact on women's activities - Project impact on women's access and control				
c. Project implementation: - Personnel - Organizational structure - Operations and logistics - Finance - Flexibility				
d. project evaluation: - Data requirements				

CONSULTANT REPORT

- Data collection and analysis				
--------------------------------	--	--	--	--

B. The Evaluation stage with Monitoring

Compliance with the seven key components for Gender Mainstreaming Implementation	Project Components			
	Strengthening institutions and the policy/regulatory framework for mercury-free ASGM	Establishing financing lending arrangements to provide loans for mercury free processing equipment.	Increasing the capacity of mining communities for mercury-free ASGM through the provision of technical assistance, technology transfer and support for formalization	Monitoring and evaluation, raising awareness, capturing and disseminating experiences, lessons learned and best practices
a. Commitment				
b. Policy				
c. Institutional				
d. Resources				
e. Disaggregated Data				
f. Tools				
g. Community Participation				
h. Innovation				

C. The Evaluation stage by Assessing Impacts

Project Impact at the Four Levels of Community	Project Component			
	Strengthening institutions and the policy/regulatory framework for mercury-free ASGM	Establishing financing lending arrangements to provide loans for mercury free processing equipment.	Increasing the capacity of mining communities for mercury-free ASGM through the provision of technical assistance, technology transfer and support for formalization	Monitoring and evaluation, raising awareness, capturing and disseminating experiences, lessons learned and best practices
Impact on Women: - Labor - Time - Resources - Culture				
Impact on Men: - Labor - Time - Resources - Culture				

CONSULTANT REPORT

Impact on Households: <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Labor- Time- Resources- Culture				
Impact on the Community: <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Labor- Time- Resources- Culture				

6. Field Officers (Enumerators)

There are 6 (six) field officers involve in gender evaluation with the following criteria:

- KLHK employees assigned in the area around the research location, which ensures they have the flexibility needed to obtain as much data as possible and a familiarity with the local socio-cultural context
- A preparedness to be assigned as an enumerator
- One field officer will be located in one project site.

7. Contact Person

Ismi Dwi Astuti Nurhaeni

Phone: 081 2262 3959

Email: ismidwiastuti@staff.uns.ac.id